



Public Hearing & Regular Meeting Minutes

December 17, 2025, 6pm

Hope Gardens Older Adult Center (195 Linden Street) and Zoom

Chairperson: Robert Camacho | District Manager: Celestina León

Meeting Start: 6:07pm

Public Hearing

- 1) Public Comment (2 minutes per person or group)** – the public is invited to speak on neighborhood concerns and other matters affecting Bushwick. The Board Chairperson and District Manager will facilitate this item.

Mr. Camacho (Facilitator/Board Chair):

- Welcomed the public, explained the sign-in procedure for board members and visitors, and set the rules for public comments (two minutes per person or group, comments on neighborhood or Bushwick issues).
- Invited public speakers and helped manage the flow of the session.

Lacey Tauber (Brooklyn Borough President's Office):

- Shared announcements: community board applications are live; invites members to apply or reapply.
- Introduced "Divine Dwellings," a housing development program for Brooklyn houses of worship and promotes a yearlong technical assistance cohort for faith-based organizations.
- Announced a community board application workshop at Brooklyn Public Library and provides flyers.
- Announced she is stepping down as CB4 representative; introduces Maddie as her successor and briefly mentions a backup role.

Maddie (New CB4 Rep for Brooklyn Borough President's Office):

Briefly introduces herself, expresses excitement to work with the board and the community.

Mr. Camacho (Facilitator):

- Thanked Lacey for her commitment and remarks on her perfect attendance and service to the board.
- Invited further public comments.

Felix Ceballos (community board member):

Raised two main concerns in the Bushwick community:

- Ongoing issue of cars blocking fire hydrants, which he warns is dangerous to the neighborhood.
- Increasing rat activity and attacks, urges organizations to address this public health issue.

Mr. Camacho (Facilitator):

- Responded to Felix's concerns by advising use of NYC 311 for fire hydrant blockage, explains how evidence (photos) can lead to fines and towing.
- Mentioned "rat academies"—community organizations can attend trainings to learn how to mitigate rodent problems; shares practical advice on trash handling to reduce rat activity.

Kumar Gayle (NYC Department of Veteran Services):

- Introduced himself and department; encourages any veterans present (or those with veteran family/friends) to connect for help with VA claims, housing, education, and grant assistance.
- Offered business cards and program information for public distribution.

Anne (CB4 Member):

Publicly thanked Lacey Tower for her years of service, consistent presence, and support for the community board.

Darwin Sealy (Soul Work Yoga Studio):

- Introduced himself as owner of Soul Work Studio.
- Announced the studio's one-year anniversary and offers \$1 community classes until the 21st to welcome locals, with a focus on wellness and flexibility.
- Provided studio address (78 Saratoga Avenue), Instagram (@soulworkstudio), and website (letsoulwork.com).

After these contributions, Mr. Camacho closed the public comment portion.

Regular Meeting

1) First Roll Call

Present: Isa Abney, Stephanie Anderson, Jo-Ena Bennett, Robert Camacho, Felix Ceballos, Freddy Fowler, Alan Gamboa, Jason Gers, Christopher Graham, Anne Guiney, Elaine Hamilton, Zachary Hendrickson, Courtney Henley, Barbara Jackson, Tara Jones-Thomas (did not sign in), Luisa Jose, Nancy Keith, Cindy Lebron, Kristine Malden, Romicka Nichols-Barnes, Cirilo Nuñez, Shray Richardson, Eliseo Ruiz, Milagros Sandoval, Juan Serra, Bee Spiderman, James Steward II, Christian C. Tate, Ben Tocker, Linda Whitfield

Present via a remote waiver: Tanesha Honeygan, Virgie Jones, Giovannies Justiniano, Zulma Novoa, Jerry Valentin

Excused: Elvena Davis, Joanna Fuentes-Singh, Annette Spellen

Absent: Tiany Belliard, Tevin Campbell, Andrew Choi, Deborah Hicks, Freddie Mattison, Alex Móreno, Pablo Rivera, Raul Rubio (Zoom – no waiver), Savannah Thais, Ben Tocker, Linda Whitfield

Only 24 members were present, which did not constitute quorum. Other members arrived later and quorum was achieved. Mr. Camacho moved on to the Parliamentarian's note due to the lack of quorum before later returning to the order of the agenda.

2) **Parliamentarian's Note – Jo-Ena Bennett**

Role of Parliamentary Procedure & Inclusion

- The Parliamentarian reminded attendees that parliamentary procedures are established to ensure diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI), meaning every board member has a voice and meetings are conducted fairly.
- Reminded members to identify themselves when speaking, address the chair, and avoid personalizing issues. The aim is to keep meetings moving efficiently and respectfully.

Point of Order on Motions

- During the motion/discussion about E-bike criminal summonses, the Parliamentarian issued a point of order: Before making a counter proposal (to table or block a committee recommendation), the proper procedure is for the committee to first present its recommendation. Only afterward can motions to table, amend, or counter be made.
- This correction ensures the board follows established sequence, preventing premature or procedurally invalid actions during debate. The board chair and others acknowledged that the Parliamentarian was correct.

Voting Procedure & Transparency

There were reminders about properly recording who makes and seconds motions, the distinction between regular and roll call votes, and the necessity (in contentious or major votes) to hold a roll call so each member's vote is on record.

Inclusiveness in Deliberation and Decision-making

- Parliamentarian input stressed that all recommendations, debates, and votes must reflect the full board's will, not just committees or individuals.
- When committee recommendations are revised (such as including e-bikes in a traffic resolution), PAR officials clarified these changes were made in response to broad feedback and should thus represent the majority.

Fairness in Enforcement—Parliamentary Perspective

As related to the main debate about criminal versus traffic summonses for bikers/e-bikes, the Parliamentarian, along with other officials, underscored that similar offenses (red light running) should be treated equitably regardless of vehicle.

3) **83rd Precinct Report — Deputy Inspector Thomas Maffei, Commanding Officer**

Presenter/Introduction:

- Deputy Inspector Maffei, the new Commanding Officer for the 83rd Precinct, was introduced to the community board. This was his first meeting with the group, and he expressed enthusiasm about working with the community.

Recent Crime Incident:

- He reported a significant incident of firearm violence over the past weekend: on Sunday at around 11:45 AM, a male was shot at 254 Wyckoff inside the parking

lot of the Food Bazaar. The victim was expected to recover, and the investigation was ongoing. Due to the open nature of the case, further specifics were withheld.

Crime Overview and Statistics:

- Analysis revealed that 63% of major crimes were occurring in sectors "Charlie" and "David" within the precinct's coverage.
- The busiest times for crime were "third platoon" hours—3:00 PM to midnight—with 38% of crimes occurring during this period.
- There was a "hot" time block between 11:00 PM–3:00 AM, responsible for 23% of reported crimes.
- Over the past month, the 83rd Precinct responded to approximately 7,800 911 emergency calls and nearly 2,000 311 non-emergency (quality-of-life) calls.
- The only major crime category with an increase for the year was grand larcenies.

Key Crime Patterns Identified:

Grand Larcenies:

- These were occurring in a few dominant settings: bars and clubs (due to unattended property), from stolen cars (especially overnight) often without video evidence, and package theft (notably heightened during the holidays).
- The precinct identified a package theft repeat-offender (7 incidents so far) and is seeking to share a wanted flyer with the community when possible.

Car-related Crimes:

- Auto break-ins and thefts were frequently during overnights and difficult to solve without footage.
- Catalytic converter thefts: These are executed quickly (2-3 minutes), with thieves using tools to extract parts. Community-provided video led the precinct to identify a suspect vehicle used in these crimes.
- Suggested that blocks/associations document who has security cameras to help with neighborhood investigations.

Community and Quality-of-Life Initiatives:

Q Teams:

- Each neighborhood sector has a dedicated set of "Q team" (Quality-of-Life) officers who respond to non-emergency issues like parking, noise, and garbage. Residents are encouraged to get to know their sector officers for direct communication, supplementing official 311 complaints with photos or more details when possible.
- The precinct plans to publish the Q Team members' names, phone numbers, and emails for public accessibility.

Fire Hydrants, Parking, and Quality-of-Life Issues:

Response teams and enforcement measures (including fines and towing) can be instigated if residents report violations (such as blocked hydrants) with evidence.

Package Thefts and Scams:

The precinct is investigating patterns and communicating prevention strategies to the community, such as being cautious with property in bars and clubs and not handing phones to strangers, as a new scam involves asking to borrow phones and stealing them.

Forward-Looking Statements:

The inspector encouraged continuous communication with the community, reinforced the value of reporting, and stressed procedural fairness in operating the precinct.

Q&A/Community Discussion

Halsey and Wilson Avenue Drug Bust

Jo-Ena Bennett, Community Board 4

Query: Asked whether the Deputy Inspector could provide any information about a drug bust that supposedly occurred at Halsey Street and Wilson Avenue during the month.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Indicated he was not familiar with that specific incident but promised to look into it and share whatever information could be made public.

ICE (Immigration and Customs Enforcement) Activity

Courtney Henley, Community Board 4

Query: Expressed concern about reports of "illegal ICE situations," specifically people being taken away without warrants, and asked about the Inspector's stance and policy.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Stated his understanding was that the NYPD does not collaborate or communicate with ICE. Affirmed that since being hired (2006), he has never received instructions or had reason to coordinate with ICE.

Quality-of-Life Officers and Sector Assignments

Juan, Community Board member

Query: Asked about the structure of "quality-of-life officers"—whether they are divided by zone and how this functions.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Explained that the precinct is divided into sectors (Adam, Boy, Charlie, David), each staffed by approximately three officers who handle ongoing quality-of-life issues (parking, noise, etc.) that are not readily resolved through 911 responses.

Follow-up:

It was clarified that community affairs officers can provide contact details for Q team members; residents can reach out to the command or use the published phone/email list.

Vehicle Safety Checkpoints

Felix Ceballos

Query: Suggested reintroducing vehicle safety checkpoints in certain neighborhoods for safety.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Confirmed that the precinct still conducts vehicle safety checkpoints, focusing on high-accident areas or following serious incidents. Stated that checkpoints are still actively used.

Shooting at Food Bazaar

Yefim, Resident

Query: Sought clarification regarding which Food Bazaar location the recent shooting occurred at (there being two within a block of each other) and whether the perpetrator had been apprehended.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Confirmed the address (454 Wyckoff) and stated that, as of the meeting, no arrest had been made.

Nightlife, Noise, and Quality of Life

Stephanie Anderson, Chairperson of Arts, Culture, and Technology Committee

Query: Raised the issue of persistent noise complaints, nightlife nuisances, and asked whether the precinct plans to address these problems more actively.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Confirmed that noise is a top community complaint, just after parking. Explained process: clubs/bars have permitted sound levels, but violations (measured with a sound meter) can result in summons. The challenge is that many complaints are anonymous, limiting enforcement options, but mediation or enforcement is pursued when possible. Chronic locations are targeted for operations.

Follow-up:

Anderson or other board members brought up that if officers can't enter premises to measure noise, little can be done; Maffei agreed, noting that without access, enforcement is limited but readings can still sometimes be taken from public spaces.

Publishing Q Team and Sector Information

Multiple board members, including Mr. Camacho, requested updates to the precinct website, including the Q Team roster by sector/location, so residents can more easily reach responsible officers with concerns.

Response:

Deputy Inspector Maffei

Agreed that updates are overdue and committed to updating the precinct information online soon.

General Notes:

Throughout the Q&A, Maffei encouraged ongoing communication, addressed further clarifying questions, and reinforced NYPD's policy on non-cooperation with ICE, quality-of-life enforcement, and transparency.

4) Introduction of Elected Officials and Other Representatives

Fran (Council Member Sandy Nurse's Office)

Introduced as: Representative from City Council Member Sandy Nurse's office (District 37).

Content of remarks:

- Extended thanks to the community board members and the broader community for their collaboration and hard work in the district.
- Announced that there were two Christmas tree lighting events in the district: at Irving Square Park and Knickerbocker Plaza and thanked those who attended.

- Wished everyone a happy and safe holiday season and noted her excitement to work with the board and see everyone in the coming year.

Contact Info Provided: 718-642-8664

Debbie Villanueva (Assemblywoman Maritza Davila’s Office)

Introduced as: Representative from the office of NY State Assemblywoman Maritza Davila.

Content of remarks:

- Extended holiday greetings on behalf of the Assembly Member.
- Notified the board that Assemblywoman Davila would return to Albany in January to work on legislation, including the state budget.
- Reassured constituents that their office will continue to work closely with the executive board and remains accessible for assistance.
- Encouraged attendees to reach out with any questions or needs.

Contact Info Provided: 718-443-1205

Maria Valdez (State Senator Julia Salazar’s Office)

Introduced as: Representative from NY State Senator Julia Salazar’s office.

Content of remarks:

- Extended happy holiday wishes (Merry Christmas, Happy New Year).
- Appreciated the board and community’s hard work and commitment to the district.
- Announced:
- The office’s Tenant Support Unit is available the first Tuesday of every month, 10 AM–12 PM.
- NYC Housing Connect applications support event scheduled for January 6, 11 AM–5 PM, at their office (12 Evergreen Avenue).
- Shared the office’s phone number for follow-up or questions.

Contact Info Provided: 718-573-1726

Louisa Lebwhol (DeKalb Library)

Introduced as: Staff member from the DeKalb Library, 790 Bushwick Ave.

Content of remarks:

- Provided greetings and holiday wishes.
- Described programming at the library:
- Financial counseling on Thursdays (available by appointment or walk-in).
- English language class for adults starting Mondays in the new year.
- Various children’s programs.
- Invited community members to ask about programs at DeKalb or other neighborhood branches.

Contact Info Provided: 718-455-3898

5) Acceptance of the Agenda

Motion: Courtney Henley made a motion to amend the agenda to move the introduction of elected officials and other representatives after the 83rd Precinct Report.

Second: Felix Ceballos

All in favor, motion carried.

6) Acceptance of Previous Meeting Minutes

Motion: James Steward made a motion to accept the previous meeting minutes.

Second: Christian C. Tate
All in favor, motion carried.

7) Committee Reports

Permits and Licenses (PLC) – Kristine Malden

Kristine Malden, Committee Chair

Liquor License Applications:

- 1. El Nuevo Caribe (214 Central Avenue at Myrtle and DeKalb)**
Type: New wine, beer, cider license.
Issue: Missing documentation (temporary certificate of occupancy).
Decision: Applicant did not appear at the meeting; committee voted NOT in favor due to failure to appear.
Next steps: Opportunity to appear again in January.
- 2. Monday Diner (195 Wyckoff Avenue at Harman)**
Type: New liquor license (primarily a diner; formerly "Marie's").
Decision: Committee voted in favor.
- 3. Extra Sauce Bushwick (1495 DeKalb, between Knickerbocker and Irving)**
Type: New liquor license (burgers and sandwiches).
Decision: Committee voted in favor.
- 4. Baby Sips (425 Troutman between Wyckoff and St. Nicholas)**
Description: Restaurant (Portuguese tapas, natural wine), already operating elsewhere.
Issue: Concerns about heavy liquor-license saturation in area, but primarily functions as a restaurant.
Decision: Committee voted in favor, stipulating missing documentation must be provided.

Cannabis (Adult-Use Retail Dispensary) Applications:

- 1. Buzzwick (1271 Broadway, between Green and Lexington)**
Application: Adult-use retailer, hours 10am–9pm.
Location concerns: Proximity to shelters and transitional housing; committee members raised issues about access by minors, safety, and potential advertising near shelters.
Applicant's response: Committed to security, ID scanning, and limiting advertising.
Arguments in favor: Provides legal, regulated alternative to illegal sales; contributes to economic development in corridor lacking businesses.
Board/Committee decision: No consensus or clear recommendation reached (split opinions; required full board vote).
- 2. The Emerald Dispensary (85 Suydam; not the same as the Broadway location)**
Application: Moving from provisional to permanent license; operating for two years with strong community support.
Issue: Very long hours (9am–2am); questions about compliance with community saturation and regulations.
Board/Committee decision: No consensus or clear recommendation reached (as above).
Additional context: Board/committee members expressed a variety of perspectives, including:

- The need for cautious consideration because of proximity to sensitive community sites (shelters, youth centers).
- Arguments that legal businesses should not be excluded when illegal alternatives persist regardless.
- Some abstentions motivated by personal conflicts, location concerns, and the balance between economic development and public safety.

Policy/Procedural Issues & Recommendations

Handling of Incomplete Applicants:

- **Several prior applicants (Danger Danger, 101 Wilson, Patricia Nunez Restaurant, Botanist Corp) were reviewed.**
 - Common issue: Failure to provide required documentation or continued lack of response/follow-up.
 - Committee action: Voted not in favor after repeated, unsuccessful contact attempts to secure materials.
 - New policy: Committee will enforce stricter cut-off for application completeness. Late/incomplete submissions may not be considered, to prevent repeated, time-wasting cycles and ensure fairness for all applicants.

Committee/Board Workflow:

- Board Chair and committee stressed that applicants are responsible for delivering all materials and appearing as required; staff should not chase them for compliance.
- Committee members are volunteers, and excessive late updates or lawyer involvement burdens the process.
- Committee aims for greater efficiency, transparency, and timely review—applicants not ready by deadline will not be scheduled for review.

Board Chair/General Feedback

- The Board Chair reiterated that it is not the job of staff to collect missing paperwork. Applicants (and their attorneys) must comply with committee processes and deadlines.
- Frustrations were voiced at applicants who repeatedly submit incomplete paperwork, only to blame the board when their applications are denied or delayed.

Q&A/Discussion

Question about Emerald Dispensary: Is this a Second Location or a Move?

Courtney Henley (CB4 member)

Question: Asked whether the Emerald Dispensary application is for a new (second) dispensary or if they are moving an existing location.

Response:

Kristine Malden (Permits & Licenses Committee)

Explained that this is not a second location but formalizing a provisional license into a permanent one. The Emerald Dispensary has operated two years at 85 Saddam with a temporary license.

Concern about Proximity/Saturation of Cannabis Businesses

Multiple committee members and CB4 Chair

Comment/Question: Raised concerns about how close some applicant locations are to shelters, youth centers, and other sensitive sites. Asked whether this proximity should disqualify or limit sales/licensing, and whether such a business presents additional risks.

Response:

Speakers: Kristine, Mr. Camacho, Gio Justiniano, others

Stated that proximity concerns were major discussion points. Some noted that safety and access for minors are “not an issue with the business” but about the appropriateness of the location, especially where there are shelters and youth programs nearby. Others stressed economic development arguments, emphasizing regulated access is safer and supports the community. Ultimately, the committee could not come to a consensus and deferred to the full board.

Clarification on Committee Abstentions

Zachary Hendrickson (CB4 member)

Question: Asked why multiple committee members abstained on cannabis license votes.

Response:

Speakers: Zachary (question/comment), Gio Justiniano (Permits & Licenses Committee member), Mr. Camacho

Zachary offered his own rationale: believes the board should support legal access and economic development unless the law is broken. Giovanni explained his abstention, citing personal conflict—supporting community development but having reservations due to location and potential for neighborhood concern. He said abstaining was the fairest way to balance his competing concerns.

Committee Process/Procedures—Late or Incomplete Applications

Mr. Camacho, Kristine

Question/Comment: Raised frustration about applicants repeatedly submitting late/incomplete materials, asking whether the committee can set stricter policies.

Response:

Speakers: Kristine, Mr. Camacho

Answer: Affirmed a new, strict cut-off: applicants will be denied agenda placement or recommendation if they do not comply on time or after reasonable staff effort. This protects volunteer time and ensures only prepared applicants proceed.

Point of Order and How Recommendations Should Flow

Anne Guiney, CB4 member

Question: Questioned the correct order for motions—should committee recommendations be presented first, with alternative or tabling motions after.

Response:

Speakers: Jo-Ena Bennett, Parliamentarian, Mr. Camacho

Answer: Correct process affirmed: committee recommendation must be received and discussed before alternative motions (tabling, amendments) can be made.

Environmental Protection/Transportation/Sanitation + Parks and Recreation – Ben Tocker

Presenter:

Ben Tocker, Chair, Committee on Environmental Protection, Transportation, Sanitation, Parks and Recreation

Committee Meeting Date:

Last met Monday, November 24

Agenda Items & Committee Discussions

1. Streetscape Regulation: Wyckoff Avenue Fence Adjustment

- Topic: 49 Wyckoff Avenue: Existing business (Absolute Power Fitness) requested committee support to obtain a revocable consent from the NYC Dept. of Transportation.
- Issue: Their exterior stairway fence is currently 4'8", but city regulation is 4'. They propose to reconstruct it to legal height, promising minimal sidewalk disruption and a 6-week timeline.
- Committee Recommendation: Supported the revocable consent petition, noting the applicant's commitment to timely and non-disruptive construction.

2. Sanitation & Alternate Side Parking

Community feedback:

Some residents requested a loosening of alternate-side parking/street cleaning rules due to inconvenience.

Sanitation Department:

- Said it is very difficult to change or reduce frequency (needs much more momentum); Dpt. of Sanitation itself is not in favor of softening cleaning requirements.

Committee sentiment/outcome:

- Broadly opposed easing parking/cleaning rules—recognizing that more trash would accumulate and property owners would ultimately face greater burdens.
- Noted that Bushwick's sanitation "score" is improving citywide, although it's not among the very top-performing districts. Residents are responsible for sidewalk maintenance near their property.
- Invited residents to contact the Department directly with individual concerns.

3. Parks Capital Improvement Projects

Major Capital Project Updates:

- **Irving Square Park:** Renovation of the dog run and playground has been delayed; construction now scheduled to begin in fall 2026.
- **Maria Hernandez Park:** Planned dog run turf installation is delayed due to required underground pipe repairs by the Department of Environmental Protection (DEP); upgrades are meant to help reduce area flooding.
- **General Issues:** Stressed that NYC Parks covers 14% of city acreage but gets less than 1% of the overall city budget, so capital funding is limited and competitive.
 - Many projects for local parks rely on special allocations from elected officials rather than core budget funds.
 - Community members are encouraged to stay informed and contribute to shaping parks priorities by participating in committee meetings (with caveat to "temper expectations" given persistent underfunding).

Public Restroom Pilot:

- Portland Loo at Irving Square Park: NYC Parks is piloting these steel, semi-permanent bathrooms (one per borough); early reports indicate it is both popular and low-maintenance, with very few 311 complaints.
- Committee recommended expanding these restrooms to other parks if results remain positive.

"Mail Review" (Correspondence Digest)

The committee reviewed mail from the Independent Budget Office (IBO) and other sources, gathering insights and reports on municipal operations and environmental policy.

Committee Recommendation (Controversial):

NYPD Policy on Criminal Summonses for Bicycles and E-Bikes

Background:

- NYPD recently began issuing criminal court summonses (instead of just traffic violations) to cyclists and e-bike riders for running red lights.
- Previously, such infractions were adjudicated in traffic court (similar to car drivers).

Discussion:

The committee spent several meetings debating the fairness and public policy implications.

Arguments:

Committee and many community members felt strongly that it is unfair for e-bike/bike violations to receive harsher treatment than car drivers committing similar offenses—especially since cars are responsible for the overwhelming majority of serious injuries and deaths.

- Others expressed concern about reckless behavior by e-bike riders (including delivery personnel and rideshare drivers), and the implications of the policy for immigrants (who may be targeted or placed in jeopardy by court summonses).
- Some residents suggested e-bike drivers should be required to hold insurance and be subject to registration like car owners; others highlighted that true criminal behavior (e.g., hit-and-runs or injury) should remain subject to criminal prosecution, but minor violations should not have such harsh consequences.

Committee Recommendation:

Reaffirmed opposition to NYPD's criminal court summons policy for bicycle and e-bike traffic violations; instead, recommend traffic (not criminal) summonses for these infractions.

Called for:

- NYPD to provide a data-driven justification for any continued need for criminal court summonses over traffic tickets.
- Parity with motorists in severity of consequences for similar offenses.
- Delivery companies to be held accountable for their contractors' reckless conduct on the roads.
- Greater investment in safer street infrastructure for all users (pedestrians, cyclists, drivers).

Additional Notes and Q&A:

- The report section sparked a lengthy debate among board and community members, some supporting the committee's recommendation and others raising objections or calling for further policy refinements. These included discussions about statistics on bike versus car collisions, the adequacy of insurance requirements, and fairness in traffic law enforcement.
- The committee chair emphasized that any recommendation should strive for broad board consensus and reflect the feedback collected from the full board.

Q&A/Discussion

1. Reflecting Board Consensus in Policy Recommendations

Speaker: Christian Tate (First Vice Chair)

Asked if the updated recommendation on NYPD's e-bike summons policy truly reflects the majority opinion of the board after the committee sent out a poll.

Response:

Speaker: Ben Tocker (Committee Chair)

Confirmed the recommendation was revised based on substantial feedback from a majority of board members, ensuring it better reflects broad board sentiment.

2. Inclusion of Community Voices in Policy Changes

Robert Camacho (Chair)

Emphasized that the NYPD policy shift was not developed with meaningful community input; raised concerns about fatalities caused by e-bike riders and the lack of public engagement.

Response:

General committee/board discussion

Affirmed the need for quality-of-life issues to be addressed by the board and highlighted the role of community organizations and advocacy groups.

3. Equity in Enforcement—Car vs. Bike Statistics

Juan Serra (CB4 Member)

Stressed that cars are responsible for the vast majority of traffic deaths. Sought clarification that the recommendation is simply calling for bicycle/e-bike violations to be treated equally to auto violations—not for reducing accountability.

Response:

Ben Tocker & committee

Affirmed: Any vehicular action causing injury would be treated as a crime, but the policy is about disproportionate criminal punishment for minor bike violations compared to car violations.

4. Bail, Accountability, and Insurance for E-Bikes

Romicka Nichols (CB4 Member)

Concerned that e-bike riders can cause death/injury and still be out quickly on bail, lacking sufficient accountability.

Response:

Ben Tocker (Committee Chair)

Acknowledged this concern but clarified that bail/bond policies are beyond the committee's domain; emphasized the committee's focus on fair and effective enforcement.

5. Insurance Requirements for E-Bikes

Rodney Trujillo (Resident/Public Attendee)

Suggested that insurance/registration requirements for e-bikes could address some concerns, since motorists are required to have insurance and can receive points on a license.

Response:

Speaker: Ben Tucker & others

Noted that similar proposals (e.g., Councilmember Robert Holden's legislation) have been discussed but are separate from the main issue of unequal criminal charging for minor bike infractions.

6. Pedestrian Experience & Unreported Incidents

Margaret Noldon (Neighborhood resident)

Suggested pedestrians have become skilled at avoiding e-bike/bike collisions, which is why injury statistics are not even higher.

Response:

Ben Tocker (Committee Chair)

Agreed, noting that walking in NYC has become increasingly dangerous and many reckless drivers (cars and bikes) ignore red lights.

7. Reckless E-Bike Riders

Courtney Henley (CB4 Member)

Stated frequent near-misses with reckless and wrong-way e-bike riders. Supported licensing/insurance for e-bikers but opposed criminalization due to potential targeting of immigrant and delivery workers.

Response:

Speaker: Ben Tucker & committee

Noted that the recommendation also calls for holding delivery companies accountable for their contractors' conduct.

8. Delivery Company Accountability

Ben Tocker, Jason Gers (CB4 Member)

Discussion addressed how companies like DoorDash and Uber avoid responsibility for their riders' unsafe conduct, in contrast to, e.g., FedEx for truck drivers.

Response:

General agreement

The board and committee emphasized that real accountability should rest with these employers, not just individual gig workers.

9. Fairness of Enforcement Statistics (“Idaho Stop” and Frequency)

Pablo Rivera (CB4 Member), John Stanesco (Resident)

Questioned the claim that cars are much more dangerous, advocated counting actual red-light violations for bikes and cars on the same intersection, and asked whether stopping and looking before “Idaho stop” makes a difference.

Response:

Ben Tocker & committee

Noted public data exists (NYC Open Data, crashmapper.com, red light camera tickets) and that policy efforts have tried to legalize the “Idaho stop,” but equitable enforcement is the overarching concern.

10. Economic Equity and Policy Recommendations

Savannah Thais (CB4 Member)

Asked if the board could focus exclusively on delivery rider accountability as a first step, considering tech/policy options.

Response:

Ben Tocker

Affirmed that was addressed in recommendation, but there's a broader equity issue—delivery companies' influence over policy and lack of local political action.

11. Sidewalk Safety

Stephanie Anderson (CB4 Member)

Raised the issue of e-bikes and bikes on sidewalks as a major resident complaint and suggested seeking a broader community petition on safety issues.

Response:

Ben Tocker

Agreed, recognizing sidewalk riding as a persistent problem and welcoming more structured community feedback.

12. Policy Fairness for Immigrants, Delivery Workers, and the Community

Giovannies Justiniano (CB4 Member)

Emphasized immigrants and delivery workers are often the ones impacted by enforcement.

Response:

General board/committee consensus

Called for balanced, fair solutions that do not criminalize vulnerable populations but still demand safe roadway conduct.

Summary:

- The committee report led to a wide-ranging, thoughtful debate about fairness in traffic/criminal summonses, insurance requirements, delivery company accountability, the effectiveness of e-bike enforcement, policy's impact on marginalized workers, and statutory/statistical justification for changes.
- Responses generally aimed to clarify the committee's position: advocating for equity between car and bike enforcement, data-driven policy, and shifting accountability to employers, while involving the broader board and community in final recommendations.

Economic Development + Housing and Land Use – Anne Guiney

Presenter:

Anne Guiney, Chair of Housing and Land Use and Economic Development Committee

Meeting Date:

Committee met on Tuesday, November 25 (the week before Thanksgiving)

Main Topic: Citywide Industrial Plan

Background:

- The City Council passed a comprehensive citywide industrial plan in 2024, with the final version reportedly to be released the day after the board meeting.
- The plan affects industrial zones across the city, including several in Bushwick and neighboring districts.

Key Points Covered:

The city is undertaking a broad review of industrial zones, classifying them into three categories:

- Primary Industrial: Large, essential infrastructure (ex: "mountains of salt"/massive multi-block factories) – strictly protected, no housing allowed.
- Secondary Industrial: Still important, but less intensive; intention is to keep residential/housing use out.
- Other: The majority of Bushwick's industrial properties fall here. These zones would allow new uses (nightlife, housing, non-industrial uses), subject to conditions.

The committee drilled down on questions such as:

- Why Bushwick (and adjacent districts like East Williamsburg, Maspeth, Ridgewood, and much of the North Brooklyn Industrial Zone) is lumped into the "Other" (less protected) category despite a history and need for industrial activity.
- Concerns that "Other" category allows for rezoning away from industrial, which undermines potential for manufacturing and related jobs; this pressure is exacerbated by developer interest in low-rise industrial buildings.

The committee’s feedback to city planners:

- Bushwick and similar areas need more robust protection for industrial uses—committee members recall lessons from the pandemic showing renewed need for active industrial/manufacturing capacity.
- Frustration that the city’s presentation (“slideshow”) was not fully coherent.
- The committee asked pointed questions about the plan’s long-term effect on Bushwick’s zoning, and whether it truly balances economic development, jobs, and housing needs.

Cathedral of Joy and Zoning Issue

Cathedral of Joy:

- Located at Evergreen and George Knoll (the old Rheingold Brewery cafeteria, currently a church).
- The congregation is shrinking and potentially selling the space, which is currently zoned for heavy/intensive (M3-1) industrial use.
- There’s concern that loss of this site to non-industrial or residential development would further erode remaining industrial spaces in Bushwick.
- A broader discussion was held regarding pressures faced by church properties and potential strategies (“not getting into real estate, but need to watch this”), and implications for affordable housing or nonprofit use.

Committee Mail Review

Committee noted that mail review is the “first shot fired” in new/reconsidered issues—always worth reviewing.

- Digest and links appear in the committee notes for follow-up.
- This portion also highlighted the importance of staying updated and participating even if formal votes aren’t always taken at committee level.

Q&A/Discussion

Community Board’s Formal Role in the Citywide Industrial Plan

Jason Gers (CB4 Board Member)

Query: Do we specifically weigh in on the city industrial plan? What is our role in giving feedback?

Response:

Anne Guiney (Committee Chair)

- Explained that the committee had indeed provided feedback during the city’s information session and via the committee notes, detailing community priorities and concerns.
- Asserted that the board’s detailed questions and issues were officially “duly noted” by city planning representatives and that the plan’s final version was expected imminently.

Lacey (Brooklyn Borough President’s Office)

- Clarified further that, currently, the board has no “formal role” during the drafting or informational phase of the citywide industrial plan.
- However, if the city plan results in specific zoning text amendments or map changes for Bushwick, those proposals will require community board review, feedback, and potentially a formal board vote in the future.

8) Chairperson's Report – Robert Camacho

Community Thanks, Food Distributions, and Holiday Support

Recognition of volunteers, community organizations, and local partners:

- Extended thanks to “stash master” and others for hosting turkey distributions and supporting local food access:
- Nov 20: 125 turkeys distributed on Broadway.
- Nov 23: 600 turkeys given away at 480 Knickerbocker (thanks to Willie).
- The same afternoon, Edwin Delgado's restaurant at 97 Jefferson Street gave away 130 turkeys.
- That evening, Dive Ball provided 100 turkeys; local pastors and faith communities also participated, along with RiseBoro and other area organizations.
- On Nov 24, at 221 Central Avenue, Emerald's Ray gave 125 turkeys to seniors and people in need.
- Emphasized the collective effort of local businesses, faith organizations, and community leaders, noting the overall total exceeded 1,000 turkeys distributed to Bushwick residents over several days.
- Reiterated gratitude for the spirit of giving and volunteerism, encouraging all to reflect on those who contributed and participated.

Board and Community Meeting Participation

Attendance and board involvement in city and agency meetings:

- Nov 24: Participated in Environmental Protection and Parks committee meeting.
- Nov 25: Attended Economic and Housing Development committee meeting.
- Dec 2: Joined Councilmember Julia Salazar's town hall between 6–8 pm; credited Millie for organizing.
- Dec 3: CB4 Executive Board session.
- Dec 4: Attended town hall with Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez on housing issues (Wavecrest, Hope Gardens), and thanked Evelyn from her office for attention to tenant concerns regarding rent increases and Section 8 vouchers.
 - Noted that large numbers of Bushwick tenants currently pay very high rents—some over \$3,500–\$4,000 monthly.
 - Emphasized the ongoing need for cross-referencing and continued engagement between community, public officials, and tenants' associations.

Housing, Land Use, and Infrastructure Concerns

Affordable housing, urgent repairs, property management:

- Noted persistent issues at local buildings (e.g., 1420 Bushwick), including the need for affordable housing, proper management, and general building improvements.
- Reported on property manager and tenant meetings designed to coordinate solutions and advocate for resident needs.
- Discussed a challenge at Hope Gardens: cell or landline calls to emergency services (911/311) are sometimes blocked for residents on the first floor, possibly due to the configuration or placement of new boilers/structures, which is an ongoing investigation.
- Highlighted the unique property at Cathedral of Joy (old Rheingold Brewery cafeteria, Evergreen & George/Knoll):
- Uncertainties about legal status and transfer/ownership rules, especially if the church is sold.

- Encouraged the board and community to examine legal avenues and options to maintain community, nonprofit, or affordable uses, rather than see the space lost to pure development.
- Suggested creative approaches might result in a community center (like a YMCA) or other vital programming for Bushwick.

Holiday Events and Cultural Activities

Holiday tree lightings and youth engagement:

- Dec 6: Joint event with Councilmember Sandy Nurse at Irving Square Park for the annual tree lighting.
- Dec 8: Tree lighting at Myrtle Avenue and Knickerbocker Plaza, followed by music and caroling at Maria Hernandez Park (with Councilmember Gutierrez and local schoolchildren).
- Dec 10: Wyckoff Avenue lighting—credited a community leader/mother for bringing kids to perform and called for continued youth arts engagement.
- Dec 11: CB4 District Service Cabinet meeting (all city agencies)—emphasized collaboration and partnership.

Public Space and Neighborhood Initiatives

Quality of life and public space management:

- Ongoing work at Wyckoff Plaza addressed illegal food sales, public health/sanitation, and safety (collaborating with NYPD, sanitation, and health department).
- Alerted the board to persistent property issues (especially parking lot conditions and building maintenance), calling for organized community response and property owner accountability.

Community Building, Partnerships, Calls to Action

Encouraged broader engagement:

- Urged board members and community partners to continue attending meetings, remain informed, and participate in committees (including Economic Development, Housing & Land Use).
- Stressed the importance of collaborative, cross-organizational problem-solving to ensure funding, programming, and legal changes reflect Bushwick’s needs.
- Highlighted opportunities for intervention, e.g., advocating with the Attorney General and electeds if/when properties like Cathedral of Joy are at risk.

Closing Thanks and Forward-Looking Remarks

Final appreciation and reflection:

- Thanked the entire board, city agency partners, and local community organizations for their hard work and perseverance, especially during the holiday season.
- Emphasized the importance of giving back, recognizing both struggles and successes, and staying united in pursuit of better outcomes for all Bushwick residents.

9) District Manager’s Report — Celeste León

Mr. Camacho made a motion to table the district manager’s report as Celeste was out sick. James Steward seconded the motion. All were in favor, motion carried.

10) Recommendations

Environmental Protection/Transportation/Sanitation/Parks & Rec Recommendation:

Oppose NYPD's policy of criminal court summonses for bicycle/e-bike traffic violations and advocate for the use of traffic summonses instead, alongside other traffic safety recommendations.

Motion to Accept Committee Recommendations (as stated by Jo-Ena Bennett):

Made by: Jo-Ena Bennett

Seconded by: Christian Tate

All in favor, motion carried.

Special Note: Discussion over whether to take a roll call or regular vote; ultimately, a regular vote was taken.

Permits & Licenses Committee Recommendations

SLA (Liquor) Applications

Blanket acceptance of all SLA (State Liquor Authority) applications reviewed by the committee (excluding cannabis-related items), with stipulated requirements as discussed.

Motion for Blanket Support:

Made by: Isa Abney

Seconded by: Jo-Ena Bennett (per Celeste's later record request)

All in favor, motion carried.

Cannabis Applications

Approval of both OCM (Office of Cannabis Management) cannabis retail applications (Buzzwick and Emerald Dispensary).

Motion for Blanket Support:

Made by: Courtney Henley

Seconded by: Isa Abney

Opposed: Jo-Ena Bennett, Stephanie Anderson

Special Note: Some members specifically requested the cannabis license vote be separated or tracked via roll call, but the vote was ultimately blanket and regular.

Executive Committee Recommendations:

Administrative Items

Increase Adelina's weekly hours from 25 to 28.

Made by: Christian Tate

Seconded by: Stephanie Anderson

All in favor, motion carried.

Approve \$2,500 Board Expense for Strada Training (Conditional: proceeds only if 25 or more register)

Made by: Jo-Ena Bennett

Seconded by: Courtney Henley

All in favor, motion carried.

11) Old Business

None

12) New Business

None

13) Announcements

Mr. Camacho

Noted, "Announcements, 1.5 I think everybody made earlier," indicating that most announcements were already delivered in earlier sections as part of reports or during public comments.

14)Second Roll Call

Present: Linda Whitfield, Ben Tocker, Savannah Thais, Christian C. Tate, James Steward II, Bee Spiderman, Juan Serra, Milagros Sandoval, Eliseo Ruiz, Pablo Rivera, Shray Richardson, Cirilo Nuñez, Romicka Nichols-Barnes, Kristine Malden, Cindy Lebron, Nancy Keith, Luisa Jose, Tara Jones-Thomas (did not sign in), Barbara Jackson, Courtney Henley, Zachary Hendrickson, Elaine Hamilton, Anne Guiney, Christopher Graham, Jason Gers, Alan Gamboa, Freddy Fowler, Felix Ceballos, Robert Camacho, Jo-Ena Bennett, Stephanie Anderson, Isa Abney

Present via a remote waiver: Jerry Valentin, Zulma Novoa, Giovannies Justiniano, Virgie Jones, Tanesha Honeygan

Excused: Annette Spellen, Josue Salazar, Pablo Rivera, Joanna Fuentes-Singh, Elvena Davis

Absent: Raul Rubio, Alex Móreno, Freddie Mattison, Deborah Hicks, Andrew Choi, Tevin Campbell, Tiany Belliard

15)Adjournment

James Steward motioned to adjourn. It was seconded by Ben Tocker. All in favor, motion carried.

Meeting Adjourned: 8:35pm