MINUTES OF COMMUNITY BOARD #16 – NOVEMBER 24, 2015

<u>Attendance</u>

David Alexander

Carolyn A. Benjamin-Smith

Margaret Brewer

Rev. Mark Broomes (A) Aaron Brown (A)

Dr. Cleopatra Brown (E)

Anthony Clark Adrainer Coleman Carlos Diaz Brenda Duchene

Christopher Durosinmi (A)

Norman Frazier Danny Goodine Rose Graham Chanel Haliburton

Sarah Hall Jessie Hilliard Michael Howard (E) Prince Issachar (A)

Daisy Jackson (E)

Carl Joseph Pamela Junior (E)

Eula Key Danny King

Bettie Kollock-Wallace

Charles Ladson Carolyn Lee

Quardean Lewis-Allen (A)

Albion Liburd Deborah Mack (E) Yolanda Matthews John McCadney, Jr. Andrea McCullough Genese Morgan

Marie Pierre Mattie Pusey (A) Linda Rivera (E)

Wendy Rutherford (A)

Celina Trowell Ernestine Turner

Rev. Dr. Miran Ukaegbu Yvette Williams-Lawson (A)

Pat Winston Sylvester Yavana

Viola D. Greene-Walker, District Manager Jimmi Brevil, Community Assistant

Hon. Latrice Walker Hon. Rafael Espinal, Jr.

Toni Bennett for Hon. Darlene Mealy Charles Jackson for Hon. Yvette Clarke Shelton Jones for Hon. Kenneth Thompson Malcolm McDaniel for Hon. Eric Adams Richard Nelson Hon. Jesse Hamilton, III

MEETING HELD AT BROWNSVILLE MULTI-SERVICE CENTER, 444 THOMAS S. BOYLAND STREET, BROOKLYN

Chairperson Bettie Kollock-Wallace called the meeting to order at 7:07 p.m. and requested a moment of silence in lieu of an invocation.

There was a roll call of the Board members and a quorum was not present.

Chairperson Kollock-Wallace recognized representatives from the Department of City Planning.

Ms. Koren Manning of the Department of City Planning stated that last month they presented information on the East New York Rezoning Proposal and a public hearing was held. This is a community plan on which City Planning has worked with various other city agencies over the past few years to respond to the need for affordable housing, economic development and the need for community facilities in East New York, Ocean Hill, and Cypress Hills. They are present this evening to answer questions on the East New York Rezoning proposal as well as two citywide text amendment proposals. The Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Text Amendment will require that any new development in areas that have been rezoned include at least 25% affordable housing units. The Zoning for Quality and Affordability Text Amendment will make it easier to develop such facilities as senior residences – allowing seniors to remain in their communities as they age. It would also allow flexibility for buildings which include affordable housing and allow for less parking.

Someone asked why are only 25% of the units being set aside as affordable units? The income level of many families in the community are much lower than the figures presented to us. She opined that they should set aside 75% for affordable units.

Mr. Winston Von Engel of City Planning stated that this is addressed in the Department of Housing Preservation and Development's (HPD) new Extremely Low and Low Income Affordability (ELLA) program which will mandate that 100% of HPD subsidized units developed in the East New York Rezoning area be affordable. The Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Text Amendment, which the Board will vote on this evening, will cause any new

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 2 of 14

development (citywide) to have at least 25% of the units be affordable in perpetuity, regardless of use of subsidies.

The questioner asked whose standards of affordability will they use?

Mr. Von Engel stated it will be based on HPD's standard for affordability. One option is 25% of the units be affordable to families earning up to 60% of the Area Median Income (AMI) which is about \$43,000 for a family of three. A second option is that 30% of the units be affordable to families whose incomes are no more than 80% of AMI which is approximately \$60,000 for a family of three.

In the East New York Rezoning area, any new development which is subsidized by the city will be 100% affordable housing, provided the three proposals being voted on by the Board this evening are passed. One of the first developments that could take advantage of the changes would be at the site of the former Blue Ridge Farms buildings that was purchased by a non-profit organization that seeks to develop it as affordable housing.

The questioner stated that Mr. Von Engel mentioned that HPD will ensure 100% affordability in the first few years. What happens in the out years?

Mr. Von Engel stated that it could go longer depending on market conditions.

The questioner asked if this could be made permanent?

Mr. Von Engel stated that he cannot realistically state that it would be made permanent. At some point, the market in the area may be strong enough that the developers can say that they do not need subsidies. They also want to allow for those persons who are successful and can pay market rates to able to remain in the community.

Mr. Thaddeus Talbot asked why are the text amendments necessary, considering the implementation of HPD's ELLA?

Mr. Von Engel stated that this HPD special housing strategy is one that the agency and current administration is committed to, however, a future administration might not be. The text amendments would be a tool that would mandate affordability as opposed to the current voluntary system. Mayor de Blasio, during his tenure as a Councilmember, as Public Advocate, and during his candidacy, has always maintained that the voluntary system is not sufficient. With a mandatory system, developers cannot wiggle their way out of developing affordable units. The amendments are intended for use throughout the city. As city planners, they expect that there will be a time when developers will not need subsidies in the East New York Rezoning area. If and when that happens, the text amendments will still cause 25 to 30% of the units that will be developed will remain affordable for the life of the building. The units have to be within the same building or nearby and be affordable.

Someone asked if there is an option for the developers to opt out of the plan?

Mr. Von Engel stated that for the Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Text Amendment, developments of 10 units or less are not subject to the requirement. If there are to be between 10 and 25 units, there is a payment in lieu option which will allow developers to choose to provide affordable housing or pay into a fund dedicated to the community district in which the development is placed, which will then be used for construction of new housing or preservation of housing within that district.

Ms. Lisa Kenner stated that the so-called affordable housing that is being spoken about for the East New York Rezoning area is not really affordable for current residents. The rents that are based on 60% of AMI will only serve to force the current residents out of their neighborhoods.

Mr. Von Engel stated that aside from new construction, HPD's housing plan also includes preservation of existing housing stock. Much of the housing stock in East New York is not regulated; meaning that rents can rise at the landlord's whim. HPD, along with other agencies are going out and to work with landlords to bring those units into regulation so that rents can only rise in accordance to the Rents Guideline Control Board rulings. They are also working with tenants to inform them of the rights as tenants. This is a concerted effort by the city to preserve housing with a goal of no displacement of tenants and to have everyone who wants to stay in their community have ability to do so. They want to build housing in the community that

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 3 of 14

is affordable to the residents of the community. Yes, AMI includes areas around New York City that are more affluent; this is why HPD lowers the income range for eligibility to as little as 50% of AMI.

Ms. Kenner stated that she is hearing what is being offered but there are no promises being made.

Mr. Von Engel stated that there are no promises, however, there is commitment that is in writing. Under current rules, there are no requirements for affordable housing. There are no privately built housing that are going up that include affordable units. What is being proposed is a zoning tool that brings developers into HPD and lets them know that if they are to develop housing in these communities they must develop affordable housing. They will not subsidize any project that is not 100% affordable. If we do nothing, there will be no affordable units built. The proposal is comprehensive and is built on ideas and concerns that they heard from the community over the last two to three years.

Ms. Carolyn Lee stated in previous meetings with the Community Board, City Planning heard from members of this community and others who expressed concern about the numbers that are being mentioned. The incomes mentioned are not incomes being earned by members of this community. Despite what the agency is saying, the community believes that people will be forced out of their homes. These same promises were made in Bedford-Stuyvesant and in Williamsburg and people were forced out of those neighborhoods. What will be different about these proposals that keep gentrification from taking place?

Mr. Von Engel stated that these are important concerns that were expressed by Mayor de Blasio while he held the office of Public Advocate. The difference now is that the administration has funded the infrastructure - the schools, parks and thoroughfare improvements have all been funded.

Ms. Lee stated it still remains that people in the community will not be able to afford to live here anymore.

Mr. Von Engel stated that another major difference from the previous plans is that Mayor de Blasio has set aside \$37 million for a defense fund to help any tenant whose landlord has harassed or has made attempts to force them out of their apartments. There are already legal aid workers assisting tenants being harassed by landlords in the Cypress Hills area of the proposal. Additionally, in this proposal, affordable housing is mandatory not optional as in previous plans in Bedford-Stuyvesant, Greenpoint and Williamsburg.

Someone asked what makes this community so special that what happened in the other communities will not happen here?

Mr. Von Engel stated that the administration is trying to act preemptively as opposed to being reactive. The proposals have measures to protect low-income renters such as the requirement to build affordable housing and protections for tenants against harassment.

The questioner stated that the other communities mentioned were low-income areas as well; where was HPD then? Why were they not able to stop the displacement of people?

Mr. Von Engel stated that Mayor de Blasio has put housing as one of his priorities. Besides pre-k, Housing New York was one the first initiatives of his administration. He selected East New York and Ocean Hill based on the fact that some work had already been done.

Ms. Marie Pierre stated that she takes offense to being told that if the Board does not pass the proposals, no affordable housing will be built. Members of the Board are intelligent individuals. If they should decide to turn down the proposals it is because they feel that the actions are not suitable for the community.

Mr. Von Engel stated that he apologizes for giving the impression that the Board should not vote at their discretion. However, the truth of the matter is if the current zoning were to remain as it is, there will be no requirement for private developers to build affordable housing.

Mr. Mohamed Barrie stated that we need assistance in being able to obtain loans for businesses. As a business owner, he has gone to the bank for a loan and been denied because they feel he has insufficient cash flow. If he had cash flow, why would he need a loan? If community businesses

are given the opportunity to grow their businesses, they can hire from the community and help determine their own destinies.

Mr. Von Engel stated that as part of this plan and at the behest of Councilmember Espinal, Jr., the city is studying the IBZ (Industrial Business Zone) to see how it can be made to perform better. The IBZ currently has about 4,000 jobs and the Economic Development Corporation has already invested in new signage along with other infrastructure improvements. The Department of Small Business Services (SBS) is also working with small businesses in the zone. (He offered to link Mr. Barrie with the agency for assistance.) SBS is collaborating with the Cypress Hills, and the East New York Local Development Corporations to assist businesses along the Fulton Street and Pitkin Avenue commercial corridors.

The city has also committed to bringing a WorkForce1 Center to the area. This will bring employment services directly to the community.

Someone asked if anything is being done to make sure that bad landlords are prevented from developing additional units.

Ms. Manning stated that they cannot receive subsidies and have open violations.

Mr. Von Engel stated that HPD has gotten very aggressive in pursuing property owners who have large amounts of violations in their buildings. The agency has hired a number of legal aid lawyers, many of whom were once adversaries who sued the city and are now working with the city in behalf of tenants who are being taken advantage of by landlords.

Ms. Manning stated that HPD has also increased the number of Code Inspectors so that they can better enforce code violations. They are also working with the State in bringing criminal charges against some landlords.

Someone stated that as property values rise so will property taxes. These tax increases are often passed on to tenants. Will there be any subsidies or programs to help landlords deflect tax increases?

Mr. Von Engel stated that HPD works with landlords, especially those whose buildings are unregulated, by offering programs for building repairs or improvements such as making their building more energy efficient, in return for the landlord agreeing to submitting to rent regulations.

The questioner asked how does this help with taxes?

Ms. Manning stated that often tax rates on larger buildings are not as high as single family buildings. Operating cost such as heating tend to be the greater concern. HPD is introducing their new Green Housing Preservation Program to assist owners of small- to mid-sized multifamily properties across the city in undertaking energy efficiency and water conservation improvements as well as moderate rehabilitation to improve building conditions and preserve affordability. Landlords will save on heating costs and can then pass the savings onto their tenants. In order to receive the assistance to make the improvements, landlords must agree to keep rents stable.

Mr. Danny King stated that he has been around to see a number of these plans come about. We need to slow this process down a bit. There is more to it than meets the eye. It smells of gentrification.

If the true goal was to provide affordable housing, why not turn the homeless shelters along Junius Street into affordable homes? The plans that are being proposed are about assisting developers in making money. The units that will be built will not be affordable to a vast majority of the residents of the community.

Mr. Von Engel stated the shelters emphasize the problem of housing the homeless. It is shameful that people without homes are placed in an area where there are no other residences around. The homeless population of the city is nearly 60,000 people, more than half of whom are families with children. Mayor de Blasio has made it his priority to build homes to prevent people from entering into homelessness and building new affordable housing to reduce the number of homeless. Ideally, we can return those families to permanent homes and have those

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 5 of 14

building that are now used as shelters return to their original use as places of employment. That is their plan, not to make developers rich.

Mr. King stated that the reality is there are people living in those shelters for over 3 ½ years.

Mr. Von Engel stated that is how dire the situation is. Our mayor is seeking to improve this condition, one step at a time through actions such as these proposals.

A motion was made by Rev. Dr. Miran Ukaegbu, seconded by Mr. David Alexander to waive the reading of the minutes.

District Manager Greene-Walker highlighted the following items found in her report:

- 1. The City's Housing Maintenance Code and the State Multiple Dwelling Law require building owners to provide heat and hot water to all tenants. Building owners are required to provide hot water 365 days per year at a constant minimum temperature of 120 degrees Fahrenheit. Between October 1st and May 31st, a period designated as "Heat Season", building owners are also required to provide tenants with heat under the following conditions:
 - Between the hours of 6:00 a.m. and 10:00 p.m., if the temperature falls below 55 degrees, the inside temperature is required to be at least 68 degrees Fahrenheit; and
 - Between the hours of 10:00 p.m. and 6:00 a.m., if the temperature, outside falls below 40 degrees, the inside temperature is required to be at least 55 degrees Fahrenheit.

Tenants who are cold in their apartments should first attempt to notify the building owner, managing agent or superintendent. If heat is not restored, the tenant should call the City's Customer Service Center at 311 or the Community Board office at (718) 385-0323.

2. As of November 16, 2015, low-income New York City homeowners and renters can apply for assistance paying their utility or heating bills through New York State's Home Energy Assistance Program (HEAP).

Regular HEAP season runs from November 16, 2015 to March 15, 2016. The Regular HEAP benefit is based on income, household size, primary heating source, and whether a vulnerable household member is included.

Emergency HEAP opens January 4, 2016 and is scheduled to close March 15, 2016. HEAP emergency benefits provide additional assistance to:

- Households whose utility service is scheduled for shut off or has been shut off or
- Households that have less than one quarter tank of oil, kerosene, or propane or less than a 10-day supply of other deliverable fuel.

Heating Equipment Repair or Replacement (HERR) opened on November 9, 2015, and will close when funding runs out. HERR benefits provide assistance for repair or replacement of essential primary-home heating equipment that is owned by the applicant.

All HEAP programs' closing dates depend on available funding.

For more information on HEAP, you may call (800) 692-0557. Homebound individuals can request HEAP information or a home visit by calling (212) 331-3150.

You may also call the info line at (718) 557-1399 to have an application mailed to you.

HEAP applications are available online at the NYS Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance (OTDA) website at otda.ny.gov/programs/heap/apply and through ACCESS NYC at www.nyc.gov/accessayc.

New York City residents CANNOT apply online. They must submit their competed and signed application by mail or in person at a HEAP office. The nearest HEAP office is located at 1535 Pitkin Avenue.

3. The BMS Family Health and Wellness Center has been selected to be an ID-NYC "Pop UP" Enrollment Site. The BMS POP-UP will be held at 592 Rockaway Avenue (corner of Blake Avenue) from November 23rd to December 23rd)

Appointments can be booked by calling 311 or going online: idnyc.appointment-plus.com.

4. BEGIN AGAIN - District Attorney Ken Thompson has announced that a Begin Again event will be held on Saturday, December 5, 2015 from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. at the Mt. Lebanon Baptist Church, located at 228 Decatur Street in Bedford-Stuyvesant. The Begin Again program can help you take care of old warrants. Over 1200 warrants were cleared at the two previous events; everyone who attended was helped and no one was arrested. Court and defense attorneys will be on hand to help resolve outstanding warrants including those for: consumption of alcohol in public, unlawful possession of marijuana, disorderly conduct, riding a bicycle on the sidewalk, littering, loitering, being in the park after closing, trespass, unleashed dog, spitting, making unreasonable noise, and more.

At the December 5th Begin Again event, you can resolve your New York Police Department summons that is dated before November 7, 2015 and information on how to pay a Transit summons. For additional information, call (718) 250-3888 or visit www.brooklynda.org/Begin-Again, @beginagainbklyn, or facebook.com/brooklyndathompson.

5. JOB OPPORTUNITIES - Early registration has begun for emergency snow laborers for the upcoming snow season. Snow laborers are per diem workers who are called upon to remove snow and ice citywide from bus stops, crosswalks, fire hydrants, and step streets in the city after heavy snowfalls.

Individuals interested in registering with the Department of Sanitation can do so at the district garage located at 922 Georgia Avenue, weekdays between 7:00 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. Snow laborers will be paid \$13.50 per hour, and \$20.25 per hour after 40 hours are worked in a week.

Applicants must bring:

- Two (2) small photos (1 ½" square)
- Original and copy of two forms of identification
- Social security card
- 6. The following positions are open at the Brownsville Multi Service Family Health Center:
 - 1) Temporary Patient Care Associate BMS@Main 592 Rockaway Avenue
 - 2) Patient Service Representative BMS@Ashford 650 Ashford Street/Dental Department
 - 3) Temporary Clerk/WIC Associate WIC Program 408 Rockaway Avenue

For more information, please contact Coreen London-Mitchell, Human Resources Manager, via email at clondon@bmsfhc.org or Lewis Bond, Human Resources Generalist, at lbond@bmsfhc.org.

The report also contains a list of available grants and a list of complaints received by the District Office for resolution.

A motion was made by Ms. Marie Pierre, seconded by Mr. David Alexander to accept the report of the District Manager.

Rev. Dr. Miran Ukaegbu, Chairperson of the Health & Human Services Committee, reported that Ms. Linda Rivera, Vice Chairperson of the Committee, attended the CAMBA Advisory Council meeting on November 18, 2015 where the Committee was informed that additional security has

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 7 of 14

been provided by the Department of Homeless Services for the Atlantic Men's Shelter and Magnolia Women's Shelter.

In an effort to address and resolve quality of life issues raised at the Novtember CAMBA Advisory Council meeting, the Committee will meet with CAMBA, DHS Security, and the 73rd Precinct on December 9th and provide a report to the Board at our December 22, 2015 meeting.

Someone asked if the meeting was open to the public?

Rev. Dr. Ukaegbu stated that it was a meeting held by the Committee and CAMBA as a service provider with which there are specific issues that needed to be addressed. It was an Advisory Board meeting, not a general meeting. The Committee wanted to be there in-person to ask questions of CAMBA and offer resolutions to the issues.

A motion was made by Mr. David Alexander, seconded by Ms. Eula Key, and carried to accept the report of the Health and Human Services Committee.

Ms. Bettie Kollock-Wallace, Chairperson of the Land Use, Planning and Zoning Committee, reported that the Committee met on November 10, 2015 with Lucas Denton, Executive Director at The Melting Pot Foundation, who is proposing to open a culinary center at 69 Belmont Avenue where there will be a training kitchen, a full-service kitchen, a 40-seat eatery, and bakery.

Initially, they propose to train 50 students from Brownsville before they can operate in the restaurant. They would like to hire 2 sous chefs from Brownsville to run the day-to-day operation of the kitchen.

She requested Mr. Denton to come forward and elaborate further on the proposal for the Brownsville Culinary Center.

Mr. Denton stated that they have leased the space at 69 Belmont Avenue (the former GEMS Store). They will operate a culinary training program which will have 45 students at the end of 2016. The first cohort in the year-long program will consist of 15 students. The program will be free to residents of Brownsville and consist of four semesters. Students will earn certificates for each completed semester. Upon successful completion of all four semesters, students will receive job placement. After the first three months of training, students will continue their training at the adjoin restaurant and be provided a stipend of \$10.50 per hour. The Student Chef Program consists of advanced culinary training as well as restaurant management training and will be conducted through collaborative project-based exercises in culinary entrepreneurship facilitated through the restaurant.

The restaurant will offer low-cost meals developed in collaboration with elders in and around the Van Dyke Houses senior center, to identify, cook, and remember Brownsville's unique cuisine with a cookbook project. The goal is to prepare traditional diasporic foods with an emphasis on healthiness and providing them to the community through the restaurant. The restaurant will be a sit down eatery with table service. Pricing will be similar to an Applebee's. There will be a 50% discount for anyone receiving SNAP benefits.

The goal is to create an incubator which they will use their resources to get the business started and at a point, cede the operation to Brownsville entrepreneurs. The idea to place the program in Brownsville came from a chance meeting with a Danish chef by the name of Claus Meyer. Chef Meyer and his family recently moved to New York and he operates a food hall and restaurant in Grand Central Station. He has experience in non-profit work with schools and prisons, in his native Denmark and in Bolivia, South America. Chef Meyer spoke of his desire to open a nice restaurant in a poor neighborhood. Mr. Denton informed Chef Meyer that if he were to do this in New York, it would likely end up ruining the neighborhood with everyone getting pushed out. They began reaching out and talking with different people to find a location where this idea would benefit the community. Brownsville was suggested because it is an area of high need. There is a lot of public health complications with issues such as diabetes and hypertension being prevalent. There is also a spirit of innovation and work ethic not found in all neighborhood that is specific to Brownsville. They came to the realization that this is a community where the program could have a strong chance at success.

They hope to start their first cohort in February 2016. They expect to open the restaurant in May. In addition to the restaurant and training kitchen, they will have a demonstration kitchen

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 8 of 14

where they show community residents how to prepare healthy meals and make it an intergenerational experience. Anyone having any questions about the program can speak to him later this evening or email him at ld@meltingpot.org.

Mr. David Alexander stated that Mr. Denton mentioned discounts for persons receiving SNAP benefits. Will there also be discounts for senior citizens?

Mr. Denton stated that they will also offer a 50% discount for all senior citizens.

Mr. Danny King asked for more information regarding the cookbook.

Mr. Denton stated that the cookbook will be a collection of recipes inspired by the seniors that they have had conversations regarding the food and the roles they have had with food.

Mr. King asked if they would be profiting from the sale of the cookbooks?

Mr. Denton stated that it would be a non-profit book. They do not intend to sell the books; they would be given away. If they were to sell the books they would give a portion to the seniors with the remainder going back into the program; no one will profit from it.

Mr. King expressed a concern over outside entities coming into the Brownsville community, using the community's resources without the community receiving the financial benefits.

Mr. Denton stated that he wholeheartedly agrees. Any profit made from the sale of cookbooks will be returned to the community.

Someone requested edification on the certificates mentioned earlier.

Mr. Denton stated that the certificates will be issued by their organization. While it will not be a certificate from Culinary Institute of America, their curriculum will be developed through a collaboration with the Institute which will endorse the certificates. Students who complete the year-long program will also receive a Food Handler's License which enable them to accept a position of greater responsibility in a kitchen. Chef Meyers cofounded a restaurant called Noma, in Copenhagen which was classified as one of the best in the world for four consecutive years. He is a renowned chef and has cultivated many connections in the industry. Anyone completing the program should be able to obtain employment at one of Chef Meyer's venues in Grand Central or at one of the many restaurants that he has connections with throughout the city. For the initial class, they are looking to accept applications from young people ages 18 to 24 years old.

One of the things that they realize in putting the program together is that they are foreign to this community. They look forward to input from the community to help make it a success.

Someone asked if they are accredited?

Mr. Denton stated that they are not.

Someone asked if fresh fruits and vegetables will be part of their menu?

Mr. Denton stated that they absolutely will be part of their menu. Part of mission is to provide fresh healthy food at reasonable cost to the community. They will try to source as much of the produce as possible from local community gardens.

Ms. Kollock-Wallace continued her report by stating that the Committee also met with Ms. Kerensa Wood from the Department of City Planning who informed the Committee about two new strategies that have been introduced as part of the planning process. The MTA has committed to installing 4 elevators at the Junius Street Station on the IRT—line at Livonia Avenue. There will also be a free transfer connection to the "L" train.

SBS has put together a strategy called HIRE NYC that requires any new housing project which receives \$2 million or more of City subsidies must register jobs associated with the housing project with the WorkForce1 Center which will be located in the Ocean Hill/East New York area. The location of the Center has not been finalized.

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 9 of 14

Ms. Wood spoke about the map amendment to change the zoning in the Ocean Hill area of the East New York Zoning proposal to map mandatory inclusionary housing, create enhanced commercial districts, and create special use districts to allow industrial and residential to co-exist. She also presented two citywide proposals: Mandatory Inclusionary Housing and Zoning for Quality and Affordability.

The area in Ocean Hill proposed for rezoning is presently mapped manufacturing and does not match the existing character of the neighborhood. The proposed zoning will allow for residential and retail uses.

The Committee offers the comments attached to her report (found in each member's folder) in response to the East New York Rezoning, Mandatory Inclusionary Housing, and Zoning for Quality and Affordability Text Amendments.

District Manager Greene-Walker read the comments in Response to the East New York Rezoning (Ocean Hill), Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Text Amendment, and Zoning for Quality and Affordability Text Amendment.

A motion was made by Mr. David Alexander, seconded by Rev. Dr. Miran Ukaegbu, and carried to accept the report of the Land Use, Planning, and Zoning Committee.

Margaret Brewer, Chairperson of the Public Safety Committee, reported that on November 4, 2015, the Committee met to discuss the following:

Reactivating the District's Community Emergency Response Team (C.E.R.T.) - The Committee is looking for volunteers for the upcoming course. Please contact the District Manager's office for more information.

NYS Prepares - A workshop being offered by the State to educate and prepare the community for weather related emergencies. The Committee is currently looking for an appropriate location to host the event.

Homeless Shelters in the District - Following up from last month's report, the Committee discussed the various strains on the District's resources caused by the number of shelters. These concerns will be discussed at an upcoming meeting with the Department of Homeless Services and local service providers.

Public Safety Announcements - The idea of circulating simple messages throughout the District to encourage courtesy, respect and humanitarian efforts.

East New York Rezoning - The Committee has its reservations about pedestrian safety and crime. Both were influenced by the influx of people and needs versus the currently weak support structure for the current District residents.

On November 18, 2015, CAMBA held its monthly advisory meeting wherein she, Ms. Linda Rivera, Vice Chair of the Health and Human Services Committee, and District Manager Greene-Walker were in attendance. The Committee is pleased to have learned that the organization has been allocated additional personnel to better handle the social and security issues that negatively affect both the program attendees as well as the surrounding community.

Earlier today, the Mt. Ollie Baptist Church held its Annual Community Thanksgiving Dinner with a special invitation to the Glenmore Houses. She thanks Mt. Ollie for continuing to reach out to our community.

She reminds the audience to check in on their senior neighbors, not to go to sleep with food cooking in the oven, and to do good things on purpose.

As the holiday shopping season officially gets underway, the FBI would like to take this opportunity to warn shoppers to be aware of the increasingly aggressive techniques of cyber criminals who want to steal your money and your personal information.

For example, watch out for online shopping scams—criminals often scheme to defraud victims by offering too-good-to-be-true deals, like brand name merchandise at extremely low discounts or gift cards as an incentive to buy a product. Beware of social media scams, including posts on social media sites that offer vouchers or gift cards or that pose as holiday promotions or contests.

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 10 of 14

Always be careful when downloading mobile applications on your smartphone—some apps, disguised as games and offered for free, maybe be designed to steal personal information. And if you're in need of extra cash this time of year, watch out for websites and online postings offering work you can do from home—you may actually become the victim of an advance fee, counterfeit, or pyramid scheme, or become an unknowing participant in criminal activity.

Here are some additional steps you can take to avoid becoming a victim of cyber fraud this season:

- Check your credit card statement routinely, and ensure websites are secure and reputable before providing your credit card number;
- Do your research to ensure the legitimacy of the individual or company you are purchasing from;
- Beware of providing credit card information when requested through unsolicited emails;
- Avoid filling out forms contained in e-mail messages that ask for personal information;
- Never click on links contained within unsolicited e-mails;
- Verify any requests for personal information from any business or financial institution by contacting them directly;
- Be cautious of e-mails claiming to contain pictures in attached files, especially unsolicited e-mails—the files may contain viruses; and
- Be leery if you are requested to act quickly or told there is an emergency (fraudsters often create a sense of urgency).

If you suspect you have been victimized, contact your financial institution immediately, contact law enforcement, and file a complaint with the FBI's Internet Crime Complaint Center (IC3).

The next Public Safety Committee meeting will be held on December 2, 2015 at 6:00 p.m. at 444 Thomas S. Boyland Street in Room 103.

A motion was made by Mr. David Alexander, seconded by Ms. Eula Key, and carried to accept the report of the Public Safety Committee

District Manager Viola Greene-Walker, in behalf of Ms. Genese Morgan, Chairperson of the Economic Development Committee, reported that the Committee held a meeting on Thursday, November 19, 2015. The meeting was attended by Nadia Busseuil of Old MacDonough, Inc. d/b/a MacDonough Cafe.

The Committee reviewed one new liquor license application regarding MacDonough Cafe for a retail liquor or wine license. The business is a coffee shop/café located at 83 Saratoga Avenue. The business owner is seeking to expand operating hours from a closing time of 6:00 p.m. to a new closing time of 9:00 p.m. and add wine to the variety of menu items which includes fresh baked pastries, sandwiches, coffee, tea and beverages. The owner has also implemented several community events such jazz and comedy shows, children's reading events and knitting classes. The owner hires local residents to work in the café, requires all workers to obtain their food handling certification, and trains workers to prepare fresh baked goods for sale.

The business is not located within 200 feet of a place of worship The business is not located within 500 feet of a school house The business has submitted to a tour of business

The Committee is recommending that the Board support the application.

The Committee also discussed the East New York Rezoning plan and reviewed in detail the map of the rezoning plan to pinpoint impacts that the proposed changes that the re-zoning will have on the Ocean Hill and Brownsville community.

Members of the Committee raised the following concerns:

1. There has not been mentioned in the presentations of the re-zoning plan any potential plan to mitigate the increased property tax burden that could follow increased area development. Though it was stated that increases to property taxes are capped at 6% annually, Committee members are concerned that property taxes will increase at greater

rates than in the past years. The Committee would like tax exemptions for fixed income/low income residents such as seniors be introduced to this re-zoning plan.

- 2. There is not a clear understanding of the type of businesses that will be targeted or which businesses are being considered to operate in the proposed rezoned area.
- 3. There is not a clear understanding of the benefits to the East New York Industrial Business Zone including the city's plans for the Business Incubator located near Liberty Avenue and Powell Street.
- 4. The location of the new proposed Workforce1 Center has not been disclosed; other than stating it will be located in either Brownsville or East New York. It should be noted that Community Board #16 requested a local Workforce1 center in Brownsville several years ago to address high unemployment rates in the community and serve as an anchor for business attraction.
- 5. The Committee is concerned that the Area Median Income being proposed as part this rezoning plan will cause existing residents to be displaced at alarming rates.
- 6. The Committee is concerned that giving housing developers the option to "opt-out" of Mandatory Inclusionary Housing will decrease the number of affordable units available to existing residents, cause displacement at alarming rates and there is no guarantee that additional affordable units will be created through the fund created with opt-out funding.

The purpose of the Economic Development Committee is to identify and respond to issues related to existing or proposed economic opportunities for the district, and make recommendations to the Board regarding the same. Members of the community with interests in Economic Development are invited to attend the Committee's next meeting which will be held on Thursday, December 17, 2015 at 6:30 p.m.

Anyone having questions or comments regarding the contents of this report please feel free to contact Genese Morgan at bk16@cb.nyc.gov

A roll call vote on the liquor license application resulted in a tie with 13-in favor, 13-in opposition, and 2-abstentions.

A motion was made by Mr. Charles Ladson, seconded by Mr. David Alexander and carried to accept the report of the Economic Development Committee.

Ms. Pat Winston, Chairperson of the Seniors Citizens Committee, reported that on November 18, 2015, members of the Committee met with Mr. Shelton Jones of the Kings County District Attorney's Office who presented information about services provided by the District Attorney's Elder Fraud Unit. The Unit prosecutes crimes committed against people age 60 and older.

Mr. Jones informed the Committee of several scams involving the lottery and Green Dot money cards which are used to defraud the elderly by asking them to send money to an unknown party.

For assistance regarding elder fraud, contact the District Attorney's Action Center at (718) 250-2340.

A motion was made by Mr. David Alexander, seconded by Mr. Charles Ladson, Sr. and carried to accept the report of the Senior Citizens Affairs Committee.

Mr. David Alexander, Chairperson of the Youth Services Planning Committee, reported that the Committee met on November 12, 2015 and analyzed their findings concerning the school performances for each school in Ocean Hill-Brownsville; year ending June 2015, which included the charter schools. The Committee found that a majority of the public schools were not performing at the citywide average level. However, the charter schools performed much better. In addition to collecting the data concerning the school's performance, the Committee acknowledged that multiple schools were located in each building, which included the charter schools as well.

Some school locations had as many as 4 different schools at the same site where the school ages varied from Pre-Kindergarten aged children to high school aged youth such as Kappa V, located

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 12 of 14

at 985 Rockaway Avenue. Other school sites had a mixture of Pre K and middle schools alongside the charter schools all in one location, and the study also found a few standalone schools with no other schools at that particular site.

Overall, a majority of the schools were underperforming, with just a few exceptions of well performing schools. The Committee decided to reach out to the Community Education Council, headed by Ms. Melanie Mendonca, principals and superintendents to address the challenges that the schools may be facing and how to improve the underperforming school's performance.

The Committee also discussed how Ocean Hill-Brownsville was over saturated with homeless shelters, the impact that it may have on children whose families had become displaced, the effects of homelessness may have the family units as they transitioned from a secure environment to a homelessness setting, and how this may impact on a child's ability to learn efficiently. Many schools in Brownsville have a high volume of children that live in homeless shelters. This is not to imply that the children who are displaced and now living in homeless shelters are the cause of why many schools in Ocean Hill-Brownsville are underperforming, however, all things are being considered in an effort to improve the student's ability to learn and bringing up the effected schools performance.

On November 6, 2015, he and District Manager Greene-Walker met with Ms. Page Best-Hardy, the Leadership Coordinator of elementary and middle schools in School District #23, who was very supportive and informative, to discuss concerns pertaining to how we could work together to improve the quality of education for the school aged children. She recommended that workshops for parents and their children be explored at future dates. She also recognized that the schools are not age appropriately structured to ensure that the children achieved their academic potential. He will meet with Ms. Best-Hardy to collect more data and continue to explore ways to bring the school levels up by working with district superintendents, principals, parents and children. The Committee will keep the community abreast of the outcomes at future meetings.

On Monday, December 21st, from 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., School Chancellor Carmen Farina, will have a Town Hall Meeting – entitled: "Math Night" with the Title I District Parent Advisory Council and the Community Education Council at P.S./I.S. 165-the Ida Posner School, and P.S. 446-the Riverdale Avenue Elementary, and M.S. 668-the Riverdale Avenue Middle Community School – all located at 76 Lott Avenue between Thomas S. Boyland and Amboy Streets.

Catholic Charities' Man Up - Fatherhood Program, located at 440 Watkins Street in the Community Center, helps fathers ages 16-24 years of age reconnect and strengthen their parental bond with their children.

Out of School Time for Middle School Academic Enhancement Programs are located as follows: P.S. 137 –121 Saratoga Avenue, Riverdale Avenue Middle School-76 Riverdale Avenue, Mott Hall Bridges Middle School-210 Chester Street, P.S. 41-411 Thatford Avenue, Elementary school children at the Brownsville Recreation Center, located at 1555 Linden Boulevard and Van Dyke Community Center-392 Blake Avenue are just a few. GED Programs for youth ages 16 ½ and up at 444 Thomas Boyland Street, Room 206. Educational Support for High School aged students at 1150 East New York Avenue.

The next meeting will be held on December 10th at 5:30 p.m. in the Conference Room at 444 Thomas Boyland Street. If you are interested in joining the Committee or would like to share your experience with the Department of Education, please attend the meeting.

A motion was made by Rev. Dr. Miran Ukaegbu, seconded by Ms. Eula Key and carried to accept the report of the Youth Services Planning Committee.

In a roll call vote, members voted to disapprove the application number C160035ZMK- East New York Rezoning submitted by the Department of City Planning pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for an amendment of the Zoning Map, by a vote of 1-in favor, 23-against, and 4-abstentions.

In a roll call vote, members voted to disapprove with modifications/conditions the application submitted by the Department of City Planning number N160051ZRY - Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Text Amendment by a vote of 0-in favor, 23-against, and 5-abstentions.

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 13 of 14

In a roll call vote, members voted to disapprove with modifications/conditions the application submitted by the Department of City Planning number N160049ZRY - Zoning for Quality and Affordability Text Amendment by a vote of 0-in favor, 24-against, and 4-abstentions.

Chairperson Kollock-Wallace recognized Councilmember Rafael Espinal, Jr.

Councilmember Espinal stated that he represents portions of the area covered in the East New York Rezoning and the text amendments proposals discussed this evening and hears clearly the resounding no vote by the Board on these proposals. He understands the skepticism of the community. They are concerns that people will be forced out of their home. He also wants the community to hear about what he has witnessed in Bushwick where there were no plans for rezoning. There were no protections in place for tenants and they are being pushed out in droves. He fears the same thing will happen in Brownsville, East New York, and Ocean Hill within the next five years. He says this because if you go to the area of Broadway Junction you can see that changes to the demographics have already begun. This is happening because rents are continuing to rise in other neighborhoods. What is left are our neighborhoods. He speaks as someone who was born and raised in this community. While he is not endorsing the plan, he is also not ready to oppose it. He believes that we need to have a plan in place that addresses our needs.

The process does not end here. He encourages the community to continue working with the Department of City Planning to come up with a suitable plan. The proposal still needs to go through the Borough President and will ultimately be voted upon by the City Council some time next spring. There is time to make this work for our communities.

Assemblywoman Latrice Walker stated that an IDNYC has opened a temporary site at the Brownsville Multi Service Family Health Center, located 592 Rockaway Avenue. They will accept applications at the location through December 23, 2015. She encourages everyone in the audience to apply for one, especially youths who are 14 years old or older. The card not only works as valid identification, it also gives the holder benefits at cultural institutions around the city as well as discounts at stores such as Food Bazaar.

In collaboration with the Community Affairs Unit of Police Service Area #2 (PSA #2), she will host a Thanksgiving Day dinner at Mt. Ararat Senior Center from 11:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.

The New York Recovery Community Coalition will host a town hall entitled: Navigating the Criminal Justice System and Its Impact on the Community. Amongst the subjects to be discussed, will be K2 (a synthetic marijuana), a product that is causing great harm to our youth.

Mr. Charles Jackson, representing Congresswoman Yvette Clarke, stated that there will be no automatic increase to social security payments this year, however, Congresswoman Clarke has signed on to a bill that would allow for a 2.9 percent cost of living increase.

December 15th (Extended to December 19th) is the deadline to sign up for a Health Insurance Marketplace plan (so that your coverage can start on January 1st). Be sure to apply and enroll before that date, so you do not miss a day of being covered. For additional information or to enroll, you may call New York State's Insurance Marketplace at (855) 355-5777. You may also visit nystateofhealth.ny.gov.

Congresswoman Clarke's office can be reached by calling (718) 287-1142, Extension 17. Her District Office is located at 123 Linden Boulevard, Fourth Floor. Constituents may also email him with their concerns at charles.jackson@mail.house.gov.

Mr. Malcolm McDaniel, representing Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams, reported that Borough President Adams is very concerned about the gun violence that is affecting our City. He is calling on stakeholders, community leaders, and community organizations to meet with him to discuss the problem.

The Borough President's Office will host a Thanksgiving Day dinner at Boys' and Girls' High School on November 26th, from 11:30 a.m. to 2:30 p.m.

Groups interested in obtaining toys should contact Ms. Eileen Newman at enewman@brooklynbp.nyc.gov. He strongly encourages interested parties to contact her at the earliest possible time.

Minutes of Community Board #16 – 11/24/2015 – Page 14 of 14

The Borough President's Office can be reached by calling, (718) 802-3700, (718) 802-2681 for Constituent Services, and (347) 942-1692 (cell) or (718) 802-3777 (office) to reach Mr. McDaniel.

Mr. Anthony Drummond, also representing Borough President Adams, announced that Borough President Adams will sponsor a free legal clinic to fight residential displacement on Tuesday, December 15th at 6:00p.m. Informational flyers are available on tonight's distribution table.

Borough President Adams' website is in operation and is user friendly. He encourages the public to visit the site.

Mr. Cory Provost, representing New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer, announced that Comptroller Stringer will host a Brooklyn Town Hall at the Brooklyn Music School, located at 126 St. Felix Street in Fort Greene, on December 3rd at 6:30 p.m. All are invited to attend the event.

Chairperson Kollock-Wallace recognized Mr. Thaddeus Talbot of Abundant Life Christian Center.

Mr. Talbot stated that he is a proud resident of East New York, but he is also vested in the Brownsville community through Abundant Life Christian Center. The church is located at 32 East 98th Street near the Sutter Avenue – Rutland Road station of the IRT #3 train. The church has been involved in many services in the community including food drives, turkey giveaways, GED training classes, fitness classes, and many other events.

He is here this evening to request the support of the community and feedback on how they may be more engaged with the community.

Chairperson Kollock-Wallace next recognized members of Brownsville Builders.

The youth collaboratively stated that Brownsville Builders is a youth advisory board whose members live or attend school in the Brownsville community where they help reimagine space in the community. They work with residents, businesses, and stakeholders to help create safer, cleaner, and family friendly spaces through neighborhood planning. Their area of focus is Belmont Avenue between Rockaway Avenue and Mother Gaston Boulevard. They are working in this area because it it is an important part of Brownsville that currently has a high vacancy rate, high crime rate, and does not feel safe. They are looking to impact the area in such a way as to bring in new merchants and business to the corridor as well as improve the life and conditions, reduce the rate of criminal activity, and provide positive activity for the young people of the neighborhood.

Their next steps is seeking the assistance of the audience by completing the surveys that were placed on their seats this evening. They would like the support of the community with ideas, opinions, concerns, and recommendations that will help them plan for our neighborhood and help them be a part of this revolution.

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.