

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

ALAN DUBROW
ANA CALI
ARTURO ENAMORADO III
AVROHOM WOLFSON
BETH SLEPIAN
BERNARD FREILICH
CHAIM SCHNEIDER
CHESKY BLAU
DANIEL KERADNAM
DAVID FRIEDLANDER
DAVID SHLOMOVICH
DOUGLAS JABLON
EDGAR GLUCK
ELLIE KASTEL
JACOB HASS
JACQUE FRIEDMAN
JEFFREY DWECK
JOHN TALMADGE
JUDITH OJO-DIAZ
JULES FLEISCHER
MAMNUNUL HAQ
MARIA ARETTINES
MIRIAM HERSKO
MORRIS SENDEROVICH
MOSHE FRIDMAN
NAFTALI TESSLER
SHARON FUCHS
SOL WAHBA
WIL FISHER
YAAKOV KAPLAN
YERUCHIM SILBER
YIDEL PERLSTEIN
YONAH MOSES

STAFF PRESENT

BARRY SPITZER – DISTRICT MANAGER
GITTEL FEKETE – COMMUNITY
COORDINATOR

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

ADRIANA VINK
AAMAH KHAN
ALEXI SHALOM
ELLIOT SIDDIQUI
JACOB ASKAL
JOSEPH GROSS
LOUIE LIE
MORDECHAI KATZ
NICK BERGHALL
PETER REBENWURZEL
ROCHELLE ZAMI
ROMINA FERNANDEZ
SAM STOBBER
SHLOMIE RIEGER
YAAKOV SCHAPIRO
YITZCHOK MOSKOWITS

COMMUNITY RESIDENTS

APPROXIMATELY 10 RESIDENTS PRESENT

ELECTED OFFICIALS AND REPRESENTATIVES

COUNCILMEMBER KALMAN YEGER
MUS LAMIA, REP. CM SHAHANA HANIF
PINNY HIKIND, REP. COMPTROLLER BRAD
LANDER
ROSLYN JOINVIL, REP. CM RITA JOSEPH
SHARON FUCHS, REP. SENATOR FELDER
RABBI YECHIEL LANDAU, REP. SENATOR
KEVIN PARKER
MARY KAY SEERY, REP. AM BOBBY CARROL
SOYA RADIN, REP. AM LESTER CHANG
JACK PLUSHNICK, REP. CM DAN GOLDMAN
SOL REIGER, REP. AM. EICHENSTEIN
CHAIM SCHNEIDER, REP. AM EICHENSTEIN

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ATTENDANCE

ADOPTION OF MAY MINUTES

The May minutes were adopted.

CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS –Delivered by First vice chair Yakov Kaplan

- Good evening. I am excited to see all of you here for our last meeting before the summer.
- I hope you were able to take advantage of the bike registration event on June 4th. Thank you Shomrim, Simcha Eichenstein and Kalman Yeger for this event.
- Congressman Dan Goldman held a Jewish Heritage event. Chairman Perlstein was sorry that he couldn't make it, but really appreciated and thanked the congressman for honoring him. Lt. Ira Jablonsky was also well deservedly honored.
- Speaking of, we thank the mayor for creating the first ever NYC Jewish Advisory Council. We have many familiar faces on the council, including former councilmember David Greenfield and our very own Joel Eisdorfer, who is chairing the advisory council. As the mayor said, the council would "ensure that Jewish New Yorkers in every community have a seat at the table and have access to the support and resources the city offers." We look forward to working with the council and seeing the positive impact it will surely bring.
- We have a lot on the agenda so I will end my remarks here. Poll sites are until 9pm tonight- if you did not vote yet, please do so. We only count if we vote.
- Happy Eid to all who celebrate.
- Our next board meeting will be in September.

DOT Presentation on Open Streets

Presented by Kyle Gorman, Kaaring Patterson, and Leroy Branch.

- DOT presented plans for the permanent transformation of Beverley Street into an Open Street Plaza. The plan is modeled after the Kensington Plaza in front of Walgreens. The plan is to permanently open South Beverley, which was originally opened on a temporary basis the summer after the pandemic.
- The street opening first involved DOT engaging in extensive Public Outreach. This was essential to make sure this was something the public wanted. The outreach was done by both DOT and Columbia University students. They did outreach to street vendors, merchant associations, and the public, to understand how people use and want to use the open streets. The design proposal includes plans to close the street connecting Church Avenue to Beverley Road. The plaza will have the typical features of open streets including umbrellas, planters, granite blocks and movable furniture. There will be asphalt art on the street.
- This will bring 6,580 square feet to the public. The plaza will maintain an emergency access. In the process they will be removing a total of 15 parking spots. Traffic patterns were studied, and it was determined that this change would have minimal traffic impact. DOT typically partners with various programs to maintain the plazas, including maintaining the horticulture and snow clearing.
- SAPO permits can be obtained to use the plaza.
- Codes of conduct for the plaza that are to be enforced by NYPD.

DOT opened the floor to questions.

Alan Dubrow- Board Member: Mr. Dubrow wanted to know the feedback of the merchants on Church Ave. as these changes will impact them. He also pointed out that there is already always truck on the street that take up a de facto loading zone. Mr. Dubrow suggested DOT check out

the location and see for themselves that the proposed location for the loading zone will not be usable as there is always a parked truck at the location. There is also a Citi bike docking zone. These changes would increase the amount of parking space removed.

- **Kyle Gorman-DOT:** There was significant engagement with the public and the merchants. And DOT was mindful of that; they added loading zones so merchants can get deliveries.

Arturo Enamorado III- Board Member: respectfully disagreed with Mr. Dubrow and had a question regarding the art installation with the asphalt. He wanted to know what it would be like and if there are cultural and religious aspects that would be considered.

- **Kyle Gorman- DOT:** Advised that they have RFP's every year where artists can get onto the registry and propose a project and a plan on how they will work with the community to work on a proposal to reflect the community. When DOT has a firmer plan in place, they will reach out to the community board.

Mamnun Haq-Board Member: He is in support of this project; this turn has always been dangerous, and it is great that it will be eliminated. He foresees a problem with citibikes, which can be very dangerous, and the location of the Citi bike parking needs to be moved to a better and safer space. In addition, parking in the area will be affected and there is already a very limited amount of parking.

- **Kyle Gorman- DOT:** Citi bike is a component of this project, and it is a part of what DOT is looking at and they would consider moving things around, if it helps and makes sense.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager: He wanted to know how many parking spots would be eliminated.

- **Kyle Gorman-DOT:** There will be 9 permanent spots removed from Beverley Road and 5 daytime spots removed on a temporary basis for daytime loading zones.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager: He questioned why the loading zone needs to be put right there when more spaces are going to be removed. It should be moved farther away where it will have less impact. Another problem is that trucks don't use the loading zone, so the program doesn't even work so DOT is just taking spots away from an area that is already a parking desert. Mr. Spitzer also wanted to know how traffic will and has been impacted during the pilot program.

- **Kyle Gorman- DOT.** The traffic will be minimally impacted, DOT worked with the traffic engineer division on this.

Shloimy Reiger- Board Member: DOT keeps putting the loading zones into places where the zones are not needed. DOT puts the zones on residential streets and the zones are not used by trucks at all. He is unsure why the program was rolled out so quickly when it is not used.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager: He explained that DOT is putting in the loading zones pursuant to law passed by the city council, however the site selection has been horrendous, and this is a law that was passed in city council so it must be placed. But the site selection has been horrendous and is making the traffic and parking matters worse, not better.

- **Leroy Branch- DOT:** He thanked the board for allowing DOT to make this presentation, if anyone has any more questions, please let the DOT know.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager: He made a quick introduction and welcomed Hunter Rabinowitz who accepted an offer to join Community Board 12 staff.

ZONING & VARIANCE COMMITTEE REPORT

Presentation by Chairman of the Committee, David Shlomovich.

Community Board 12 held a public hearing on June 20th and presented two items:

- The first item before the board was **534 Coney Island Avenue** rezoning application.

- The Applicant, Remica Property Group Corp., applied for a zoning map and zoning text amendments that would affect the eastern portion of Brooklyn Block 5343, Lots 13, 19, and p/o 11 and p/o 26 at a depth of approximately 100 feet west from Coney Island Avenue coterminous with the existing C8-2 zoning district bounded by Hinckley Place to the north and Beverley Road to the south. The Proposed Actions would facilitate the development of an approximately 75,902-gross square foot (GSF) mixed-use residential and commercial building with up to 11-stories (110-feet tall) above grade and a single below-grade cellar level at 534 Coney Island Avenue. FAR 6.0.
- The proposed zoning changes would affect a portion of a single block and would map R7X with a C2-4 commercial overlay, as well as establish a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) area coterminous with the proposed R7X/C2-4, along the west side of Coney Island Avenue between Hinckley Place and Beverley Road. This means that they applied to change the zoning for the four properties on the small street that is on Coney Island Avenue between Hinckley Place and Beverly Road. The Applicant intends to build a new 11-story, 110-foot tall mixed-use residential and commercial building with a floor area ratio (FAR) of 6.0, which would consist of approximately 59,634-gsf of residential space for a total of 43 dwelling units, and approximately 3,547-gsf of local retail space that would occupy a portion of the ground floor. Nineteen accessory parking spaces would be provided in a single below-grade level (approximately 9,849-gsf), which would be accessible via a ramp entrance from an existing curb cut on Hinckley Place.
- The building development plan includes: 43 dwelling units, of which 11-13 would be affordable. The affordable units are part of the Mandatory Inclusionary Housing requirement and would be priced for residents at an average of 60-80% AMI depending on the basic MIH Option selected. For the purposes of Early Childhood Programs analysis, 20% (9 DUs) of residential floor area is assumed to be affordable at or below 60% AMI. As such, the Proposed Project would result in approximately 11-13 affordable DUs. The proposed mixed-use commercial and residential development would replace an existing fast-food restaurant occupying approximately 10,160-sf Projected Development Site 1. 19 parking spaces- which is the minimum required.
- There were many community member who attended the public hearing. 3 attendees testified in support of the proposed changes, and 5 testified in opposition. There were 14 written comments to the board, 13 of those were in opposition, and only 1 written comment was in favor of the amendment.
 - The complaints can be grouped into a few categories.
 - The zoning change includes the gas station and other property not owned by the developer and this change would allow whoever owns it to build 11-14 floors without any restrictions. While it was explained that there is a process involving the Department of City Planning and the City Council to remove the other properties from the zoning change, the gathered wanted it removed from the entire application.
 - The negative impact of blocking the light and the shadow on the neighborhood in general and the school children in particular. The height of the building is out of character with the neighborhood. While some were not summarily opposed to development, they objected to 11 floors when the other tall buildings in the area are only 6-7 floors.
 - The infrastructure cannot support such a large development. This includes the impact it would have on traffic. The 19 added parking spaces, the minimum required for the project, would do nothing to help the added vehicles such a large project is bound to bring.

- Other complaints were the removal of old trees that would need to facilitate the project. That the building is proposed to be built with gas and not with electricity, which would harm the environment.
- The comments that were submitted in favor highlighted the importance of additional housing, especially affordable housing. As well as noting the proximity to public transportation via buses and the subway.
- After hearing all the testimony and reading the comments, the committee asked the attorney to let them know the responses to questions on the light and shadow impact. Because the community input was not singular, the committee voted to put the matter to the full board without a recommendation.

The Zoning Chair opened the floor to questions.

Yeruchim Silber- Second Vice Chair: He explained that they always try to consider the community sentiment in proposing a recommendation. This was difficult because people were in favor and opposed. This project on Coney Island Avenue is a tricky one, the board does not want to set a new precedent for allowing such a tall structure without involving more people. The board would want to collaborate with more stakeholders, including elected officials and residents in the area, to get input from all who would be affected to determine what would be the best forward for this area.

Beth Slepian- Board Member: Agreed that the building as proposed is too tall and 7 stories sounds more reasonable. She wanted to know if there is a way to limit the zoning change to one that would only allow 7 stories.

Adam Rothkrug, attorney at Eric Palatnik PC, attorneys for the developer: He explained that while the tallest portion of the building is 110 feet, only a small portion of the building would go up that tall. The zoning law requires that there are setbacks. The real impression of the building is more like 7 stories with step ups so that only a small portion of the building goes up to 11 flights. He also explained that the developer can only control their site, they don't own the Shell Station, but there does not seem to be any plans to develop the site. The developer's goal was to develop this property in a way that can provide affordable housing and that is architecturally interesting. They kept that in mind with the height of the building so as not to set shadows.

Yeruchim Silber- Second Vice Chair: Explained that while this building may be limited, if the zoning is changed and the Shell station is included, could there be a way to implement a change that would only allow for 7 flights.

Adam Rothkrug- attorney for developer: The proposal they are considering is for more than 7 stories- there are taller buildings in the area and in today's market it is not economical to do construction at a lower height.

Beth Slepian- Board Member: Wanted to make a point that it is a little disingenuous to market this project as affordable when they only include the absolute minimum required. This project doesn't really solve the housing process, it should not be talked about as an affordable housing project.

Will Fisher-Board Member: He emphasized that while this is not solving the housing crisis, it will be adding 11 affordable unit, which is not something in the abstract. We have to start somewhere, and these 11 units will add 11 units that will now be available as affordable units; therefore, he supports the application with no modification.

Yeruchim Silber- Second Vice Chair: He said the building needs more than 19 parking spots.

Anna Cali- Secretary: Agreed with Mr. Silber, 43 units with 19 parking spaces is just not enough.

Councilmember Rita Joseph: Asked if studies were done on the infrastructure. And how the first floor would be used, since the community could use supermarkets and childcare centers.

Adam Rothkrug- Attorney for developer: He said that the commercial space that would permit such usage. The project was not large enough to generate an environmental review- to require them to do a study of sewer and traffic. The 19 spaces were calculated based on this area being in a transit zone, and they are not required to calculate parking for the affordable units. The developers met the parking requirements imposed for the other market rate units.

Yeruchim Silber- Second Vice Chair: Proposed a motion to allow whichever zoning category would limit the project to 7 stories, this is R6A, but will be clarified with City Planning.

The motion carried with 2 oppositions.

David Shlomovich- Chairman of the Zoning Committee:

The second item before the board was a revised application for **1233 57th Street** for an R6B rezoning:

- This project was presented to the board a month ago when the developers asked to change the zoning from an R5 to an R6A zoning. They proposed to develop a huge project on a residential street where the houses are all 1- or two-family houses. The community board listened to the feedback of the community and opposed this project.
- The developers asked for another chance to alter their plans and present them again to the Board. Their new proposal was for an R6B rezoning that would limit the project to 75,000 sf of residential area, or 36 units, and include 58 parking spaces. After discussions and compromises, the applicant offered the committee that they are willing to enter into a Community Benefits Agreement in writing requiring them to stick with the plans they proposed to the Board. However, a couple of days before the board meeting, they said they would not sign anything and further decided that the amended plans are not feasible. The developers did not bother showing up to the meeting today.
- Therefore, the committee suggests continuing with the motion that was already passed last month by the board denying community board support for the R6A. This means the process will continue with the previous recommendation. CB12 is on record as denying their request for R6A rezoning and commenting that their plan for 4 stories could have been approved.

Anna Cali- Secretary: Proposed a motion to go on the record in opposition of the R6B rezoning especially considering their renegeing on signing a Community Benefits Agreement.
The motion carried.

PUBLIC HEARING

Evangelist Barbie-

- Resident: she is a concerned citizen and is concerned about our democratic government and constitutional rights. She is concerned with the AI movement stealing intellectual property having to do with religious principle.
She needs help making a formal police report and representing her problem to the mayor and the governor.

Anthony Loum- Branch Manager at the Mapleton Branch of the Brooklyn Public Library

Mr. Loum provided some Library Updates:

- The library has summer reading programs for children for children and teens to stay engaged while school is out. The library will have game boards for children and teens to track their reading and activities as well as win a prize. There will be activities and special program, and free books all summer long.

The library also provides a free book advisory called Book Match that can cater a booklist just for you based on your likes. Anyone can use this, even without a library card.

- Libraries are still facing significant cuts. The mayor is still proposing to cut the library budget by \$36 million, so if want the library to stay open on Sundays and evenings, we need that funding. We ask you to advocate with your councilmembers and elected officials.

DISTRICT MANAGER'S REPORT:

Delivered by District Manager Barry Spitzer

- Since the meeting was running very long, he did not deliver his report, but wished a happy birthday to the Chairman.
- He also thanked DSNY for installing cameras to catch dumpers.
- He wished everyone and happy and healthy summer.

REPORTS FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS, REPRESENTATIVES & AGENCIES

• Councilmember Kalman Yeger

- He thanked the members of the zoning committee and the whole Community Board for their hard work. He reiterated his commitment to support and stand by whatever recommendation the board puts forth in regard to zoning and variance requests. The Board does the hard work of investigating the applications and he will stand by whatever the outcome is. He always tells applicants that they need to get a yes from the community board in order to get his support. At the end of the day, the 57th Street developers were not willing to put their representations in writing and so the board, and therefore he, cannot back the amended project.
- The DSNY camera that was put up to catch dumpers is a result of a meeting in the Community Board with the commissioner, she said she would put cameras in the district, and she did. Thank you to the DSNY and especially to Commissioner Tish.
- Thank you to the community board for your commitment every year. And though the board doesn't meet over the summer, the board is still open for business.
- *A Gezinte Zimmer* (healthy summer).
- If anyone did not vote yet, both parties have primaries so everyone can go vote.

• Pinny Hikind, representing Comptroller Brad Lander.

• Roslyn, representing Councilmember Rita Joseph.

• Mus Lamia, representing Councilmember Shahana Hanif.

- She advised that budget negotiations are underway. They anticipate the budget will be voted on soon, though no date was set yet.
- The Councilmember is heading on a neighborhood tour over the summer, so you might see her.
- The councilmember is please that Beverly Road will become a permanent open street.

• Roselyn Joinvil, representing Councilmember Rita Joseph.

- She reiterated that the office would continue having housing services every Wednesdays and Thursdays. They will also continue with immigration services on Tuesdays and Thursdays. immigration services.
- The office is getting ready for summer programs and will keep everyone posted.
- Saturday, August 12, the councilmember will have a rain barrel distribution from DEP, please reserve.
- All services will continue over the summer.

• Sharon Fuchs, representing State Senator Simcha Felder.

- She advised the Senator will be doing license check to see if have valid driver's license.

- Have a great summer.
- **Rabbi Yechiel Landau, representing State Senator Kevin Parker.**
- **Mary Kay Seery, representing Assemblymember Bobby Carroll.**
- **Soya Radin, representing Assemblymember Lester Chang**
 - A happy summer to all.
- **Sol Reiger, representing Assemblymember Simcha Eichenstein**
- **Chaim schneider, representing Assemblymember Simcha Eichenstein.**
 - Happy summer.
- **Jack Plushnick, representing Congressman Dan Goldman.**
 - He wished a happy birthday to the Chairman.
 - He thanked the Community Board for their services.
 - He wished all a happy July Fourth and a great summer.

OLD BUSINESS / NEW BUSINESS:

Old Business. No old business

New Business. No new business.

MEETING ADJOURNED

Respectfully submitted by: Gittel Fekete