



Antonio Reynoso
Borough President

**THE CITY OF NEW YORK
COMMUNITY BOARD 12**

**5910 13th Avenue
Brooklyn, N.Y. 11219**
Phone: (718) 851-0800 • Fax: (718) 851-4140
Email: bk12@cb.NYC.gov

Yidel Perlstein
Chairperson



Barry Spitzer
District Manager

**COMMUNITY BOARD 12
APRIL MINUTES**

**HELD ON
TUESDAY,
APRIL 25, 2023**

**VIA ZOOM
& IN-PERSON
AT AMICO SENIOR CENTER
5901 13TH AVE. 3RD FLOOR
BROOKLYN, NY 11219**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

ALAN DUBROW
ARTURO ENAMORADO III
ANA CALI
AVROHOM WOLFSON
BERNARD FREILICH
BETH SLEPIAN
CHAIM SCHNEIDER
CHESKY BLAU
DANIEL KERADNAM
DAVID FRIEDLANDER
DAVID SHLOMOVICH
DOUGLAS JABLON
EDGAR GLUCK
ELLIOT SIDDIQUI
ELLIE KASTEL
JACQUE FRIEDMAN
JACOB ASKAL
JACOB HASS
JEFFREY DWECK
JOHN TALMADGE
JOSEPH GROSS
JUDITH OJO-DIAZ
JULES FLEISCHER
LOUIE LIE
MAMNUNUL HAQ
MIRIAM HERSKO
MORDECHAI KATZ
MORRIS SENDEROVICH
NAFTALI TESSLER
NICK BERGHALL
SAM STOBER
SHARON FUCHS
SHLOMIE RIEGER
SOL WAHBA
WIL FISHER
YAAKOV KAPLAN
YERUCHIM SILBER
YIDEL PERLSTEIN
YONAH MOSES

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

ADRIANA VINK
AAMAH KHAN
ALEXI SHALOM
MARIA ARETTINES
MOSHE FRIDMAN
PETER REBENWURZEL
ROCHELLE ZAMI
ROMINA FERNANDEZ
YAAKOV SCHAPIRO
YITZCHOK MOSKOWITS

COMMUNITY RESIDENTS

APPROXIMATELY 25 RESIDENTS PRESENT

STAFF PRESENT

BARRY SPITZER – DISTRICT MANAGER
GITTEL FEKETE – COMMUNITY
COORDINATOR

ELECTED OFFICIALS AND REPRESENTATIVES

JACOB EISDORFER, REP. BP ANTONIO
REYNOSO
PINNY HIKIND, REP. COMP. BRAD LANDER
ALEX GURVICH, REP. DA GOLNZALES
JAMES NEIMEISTER, REP. CM ALEXA AVILES
ROSLYN JOINVIL, REP. CM RITA JOSEPH
MUS LAMIA, REP. CM SHAHANA HANIF
LENNY MARKH, REP. SEN. IWEN CHU
SOL REIGER, REP. AM. EICHENSTEIN
CHAIM SCHNEIDER, REP. AM EICHENSTEIN
SHARON FUCHS, REP. SEN. SIMCHA FELDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ATTENDANCE

ADOPTION OF MARCH MINUTES

The March minutes were adopted.

CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS –YIDEL PERLSTEIN

- Good evening. It is great to see all of you here.
- Pesach went by beautifully. I must thank all our partners for helping with Yom tov: FDNY, DSNY, NYPD and all our local organizations. Shomrim, Hatzalah, Chaveirim and more.
- We all know that we live in an amazing district, but now everyone else knows this as well. The NY Department of Health reported statistics and we have a lot to be proud of. Our crime rate is among the lowest. We are a vibrant young district. So we can give ourselves a round of applause.
- I am sorry to report the passing of former DSNY commissioner John Doherty. He was an outstanding public servant and a mensch.
- I want to take a moment to welcome our newly appointed board members:

Adriana Vink	Daniel Keradnam
Arturo Enamorado III	Elliot Siddiqui
Chaim Schneider	Moshe Fridman
- Thank you to our former board members for their service:

Avi Greenstein	Sahibzada Shabir Ahmad
Benjamin Theodore	Yechiel Malik

ZONING & VARIANCE COMMITTEE REPORT

Delivered by: DAVID SHLOMOVICH- Zoning and Variance Committee Chair

- On Thursday, April 20, the Zoning & Variance Committee held a committee meeting and public hearing on 2 items.
The first was a variance renewal for 4420-15th Ave.
The second is for a rezoning application for 1233-57th St.

4420 15th Avenue – Bais Yaakov Variance Renewal

- Bais Yaakov BP received a variance in 2000 to build a 5th floor on top of their existing building for additional space to meet the needs of the school. The 5th floor required height and setback waivers from BSA. The 5th floor was approved by our board in 2000 and by BSA. That approval was never acted upon. In 2007, Bais Yaakov asked for more time to complete the project. Again the Community Board and BSA approved the application in 2007. Unfortunately, that was also not acted upon. Since the last BSA approval was more than 10 years ago, it needs to be reinstated before it can be acted upon.
- Currently, the school needs additional dormitory space to house its seminary students. They are currently asking to reinstate the 5th-floor approval. They are also proposing to put a partial 6th floor on top of the 5th floor. The 5th-floor approval requires the same height and setback waivers that were previously approved. The 6th floor, because it is setback from the two street frontages, is technically as-of-right, and does not need any special approvals from the CB or BSA. However, since the 5th floor does, they are required to bring them all in as one proposal.
- There were no objections at the committee meeting, so the committee voted unanimously to approve the application.
- The Zoning Chairman opened the floor to questions.
Joe Gross- Board Member asked what the school wanted to do with the space.

David Shlomovich- Chairman of the Zoning and Variance Committee advised the space would be used as classrooms, offices and dormitories.

- The committee proposed a motion to approve the variance.
- Passed with unanimous consent.

1233 57th Street – Rezoning Application

- The Applicant seeks to rezone the Project Area from R5 to R6A. The Proposed Actions would apply to Block 5690, Lots 51, 53, 54, 58, and 62. This is a total of 290 feet of frontage between 12th Avenue and 13th Avenue. This would allow them to build 8 stories and a cellar and sub cellar. When they heard the opposition to this project, they agreed to cut the proposal down to 5 stories.
- The Applicant’s original proposal was to develop an eight-story, 130,595-gsf residential building at 1233 57th Street on Lots 54, 58, and 62, containing 60 Units and 94 enclosed accessory parking spaces on Projected Development Site 1. The building would contain 95,389 GSF of residential use and 35,206 GSF of accessory parking. It would have several setbacks for private terraces and building articulation and would rise to a roof height of 83 feet. The building would rise to a maximum height of 93 feet including a 10-foot-tall bulkhead. Vehicle access and egress would occur from a new curb cut on 57th Street near the eastern lot line.
- The amended plan proposes a 79,330 GSF residential building with 46 Dwelling Units and 52 parking spaces.
- Projected Development Site 2 (Lots 51 and 53) is not Applicant-owned, and there is no specific development proposal for this site. Although there is no proposal at this time, with the Proposed Actions, this site could be developed with an eight-story 22,464 GSF residential building containing 22 units.
- The applicant was represented by the law office of Sheldon Lobel, PC. There were around 200-250 residents present at the public hearing. About 20 residents spoke. All participating residents opposed the application. The reasons for opposition were primarily the change in the neighborhood’s character, residents chose to live in an area where the standard housing was 1-3 family homes. This is drastically different from the current character. There were also concerns about the impact such a project would have on parking and an increase in traffic congestion to the area. There were also concerns this would have on the public safety of the area. And the environmental impact of the increased population added to an already concerning combination of overcrowded school busing and children playing. There were also concerns about the decrease in home values and the disruptions a probable years-long construction project would bring.
- There is also the issue that they are rezoning another 2 lots that are not part of this proposal and not owned by them. So if those owners decide to build up 8 floors, there is no stopping them.
- In addition to the in-person testimony, there were over 270 written comments. Only 2 comments were in support of the project, but by people who do not live close to this project.
- Because of the overwhelming opposition to this project, the committee voted unanimously on a motion to deny the application.
- The Zoning Chairman opened the floor to questions.
- There were no questions.
- The motion to disapprove the application passed with one dissenting vote.

PUBLIC HEARING

Anthony Loum-Branch Manager at the Mapleton Branch of the Brooklyn Public Library

- NYC Libraries are facing significant cuts in the city budget.

- The city is proposing a \$56 million cut to NYC libraries which will severely impact on our ability to maintain regular hours and provide critical services, resources, and programs to our patrons.
- National Library Week is April 23-29; this is a good time to tell City Leaders how library budget cuts would impact you.
- You can visit bklynlibrary.org/standup to send a note.
- I have been asked to send a message to the Community Board on behalf of the Ryder Branch Library located at 5902 23rd Ave. A patron complained that the branch has been closed for some time and will remain closed for a time due to renovations. They said the community is really feeling it because the branch is looking derelict. Some people have set up shop and are doing drugs in front of the closed branch which is also near a large school.

Vina Scantlebury- CCRB Brooklyn Community Coordinator

- The CCRB is the agency tasked with investigating allegations of police misconduct.
- There are bills in both state chambers advocating for CCRB authority to see sealed court records.
- They also have an upcoming Brooklyn Board meeting on May 10. This is an opportunity to engage in conversation about police accountability.

Karsten Beling- Grow NYC

- She came to advise of the Chinese American Fresh Food Box Site
- Grow NYC holds Farmers Market year-round and provides 50% off for SNAP users. The vegetables they provide change each week. The site they are announcing takes place every Wednesday from 12-3 at the intersection of 8th Avenue and 41st Street, where bags can be purchased for \$14 or \$7 for SNAP users.

Richard Navas- Resident

- Mr. Navas has concerns relating to the fire safety committee meetings. Several residents have spoken about reckless drivers, but there is no type of enforcement. Which is why it was upsetting to hear of a special committee meeting pertaining to holidays to discuss safety during holidays. If the committee can have a meeting for holiday prep, why can't we have meetings to discuss the safety of the community with reckless driving.
- He is also concerned that the mayor is looking to take away retirees' benefits. He proposed that the Chairman could make a motion to not take away retirees' benefits. Changing medical benefits is going to hurt millions of retirees. Retirees worked 20-30 years for pensions and need support from the community board to send a message to the mayor and the comptroller not to take this action.

DISTRICT MANAGER'S REPORT:

Delivered by District Manager Barry Spitzer

- He also wanted to express thanks to all the city agencies who helped over Passover. DSNY had 95 trucks in our district rolling around. And the police and fire department. Everything went off without a hitch. Thank you to the police, FDNY, Shomrim, Hatzalah and Chaveirim who all played a big part in making sure things went smoothly.

There are a few items that may be of interest:

- **Parking Tickets Payment Plans**

The New York City Department of Finance is now offering online payment plans for parking tickets that have not been paid for and are in default – known as judgment debt. Those with \$350

and more in parking ticket judgment debt can now enter an online payment plan with DOF to make payments over time instead of paying all at once, which can prevent enforcement actions such as having a vehicle booted or towed.

Enrollment and eligibility details can be found at: nyc.gov/finance in the parking tickets section.

- **DEP Amnesty Program**

The City's Dept. of Environmental Protection Amnesty Program ends on April 30th. Your accrued interest can be reduced or forgiven by paying the principal balance. Contact DEP at (718) 595-7000 Monday–Friday (8 am–7 pm) and Saturday (9 am–2 pm) or amnesty@dep.nyc.gov.

People call us when it's too late to do anything about liens that were sold, this is the time to take care of outstanding DEP bills.

- Please note: DSNY will begin reinforcing the new set out times for garbage. As a reminder, garbage in bags can only be put curbside at 8, garbage in containers can be put out at 6. Businesses can also only put out bags at 8, but if the garbage is in a container, they can put it out 1 hour before closing time. There are options for condo buildings with 9 or more units to opt into a program to be able to set out garbage on a different schedule, but enrollment opens in 2024, so we will notify you when that time rolls around.
- Our office held an E-waste event before Pesach. This is the second time we held such an event and we have gotten great feedback. DSNY does not collect electronic waste like computers and printers. We filled up around 3 pallets with items collected. This program is here to stay we will consider doing this every half year as it looks like people don't have where to throw out their waste.
- Lag B'omer preparations are underway. As usual FDNY will know which fires are sanctioned and will not allow any other fires. The location and map will be publicized.
- DOT started compiling their list for street repaving. As usual, please let us know if you know of any streets that require repaving. Please send recommendations to our office at bk12@cb.nyc.gov We have good news; 16th Avenue will be repaved. A lot of people called last year and we got it on the list for this year.
- Just to note, we started getting calls from outside of the district due to the success of our pre-Passover planning, so next year we will also take care of Passover issues for residents outside our district.

Yeruchim Silber-Board Member- complimented the bread burning he saw in his neighborhood. Shomrim was there the entire time making sure it was safe, and then when he got there at night, he saw that it was completely cleaned up. DSNY did an amazing job.

REPORTS FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS, REPRESENTATIVES & AGENCIES

Pinny Hikind, representing Comptroller Brad Lander.

- The Comptroller announced that as climate crisis is one of the great risks facing NYC, and the comptroller's office is tasked with identifying risk, the comptroller is committed to working toward divesting from fossil fuel and working toward reducing carbon emissions. Information on this is available on the Comptroller's website.

Alex Gurevich, representing District Attorney Eric Gonzales.

Mus Lamia, representing Councilmember Shahana Hanif.

- She was reporting from the Eid celebration at City Hall.
- The councilmember sends her regards from a very successful Eid weekend.

- The budget votes and hearings are in full flux in the CB12 area, and they have been hearing about Fresh Incentives and that several food markets in the area are in opposition to it.

James Neimeister, representing Councilmember Alexa Aviles.

- DOT is holding an upcoming meeting on Thursday to discuss safety improvements on 3rd Avenue. Improving the safety of 3rd Ave. under the BQE which is often dark. CB12 requests a lot of traffic studies, this 3rd Ave. is an example of a study that took decades to happen, but persistency is the key.
- There was a joint hearing on lead poisoning, and he learned that Boro Park is one of the zip codes with the highest rate of kids who have tested positive for lead exposure, likely due to lack of safe and affordable housing.
- This is his last board meeting as he is moving out of the city. Someone from the councilmember's office will be attending meetings as they really care about the issues that affect the community.

Jacob Eisdorfer, representing Boro President Antonio Reynoso.

Roslyn Joinvil, representing CM Rita Joseph.

- Started partnership with Flatbush Development Corporation every Wednesday will have representative for helping with all sorts of housing issues and will help with SNAP issues to get assistance.
- They are also working with CUFF to do more affordable housing applications every Thursday.

Sharon Fuchs, representing State Senator Simcha Felder.

Lenny Marks, representing Senator Chu.

- The senator sends regards and is working hard for everyone in Albany getting the budget passed.
- He hopes everyone had a wonderful Passover and whoever will be celebrating will have a Happy Mother's Day
- The senator will be opening a new district office soon and he will share the information when it is available.

Sol Rieger and Chaim Schneider, representing Assemblymember Simcha Eichenstein.

- Chaim Schneider introduced himself as a new addition to the board.
- He shared that the Assemblymember just had 2 successful events on Chol Hamoed, one on 18th Ave. and one on Ave. M. He is glad there was such a large turnout indicating so many enjoyed.

OLD BUSINESS / NEW BUSINESS:

No Old Business

No New Business

MEETING ADJOURNED

Respectfully submitted by: Gittel Fekete