

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

ADAM COHEN
ALAN DUBROW
ANNA CALI
AVI GREENSTEIN
AVROHOM WOLFSON
CHESKY BLAU
DAVID FRIEDLANDER
EDGAR GLUCK
JACOB DASKAL
JACOB EISDORFER
JACQUE FRIEDMAN
JOHN TALMADGE
JULES FLEISCHER
MAMNUNUL HAQ
MAYER WEBER
MENDEL REINER
MORDECHAI KATZ
MORRIS SENDEROVICH
MORTON PUPKO
NAFTALI TESSLER
PETER REBENWURZEL
ROCHELLE ZAMI
SHARON FUCHS
SOL WAHBA
YAAKOV KAPLAN
YIDEL PERLSTEIN
YONAH MOSES

STAFF PRESENT

BARRY SPITZER – DISTRICT MANAGER
GITTEL FEKETE- COMMUNITY
COORDINATOR

LIASON'S PRESENT FROM 66th PCT

PO. PANTELEO
PO. JAIMAN

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

ABUL HASNAT
ANNIE FERDOUS
BERNARD FREILICH
DAVID SHLOMOVICH
DOUGLAS JABLON
ELLIE KASTEL
JACOB ASKAL
JACOB HASS
JOSEPH GROSS
JEFFREY DWECK
LARRY JASON
LILY MARINELLI
MIRIAM HERSKO
MONIQUE WALLACE
SAM STOBBER
SHLOMIE RIEGER
YAAKOV SCHAPIRO
YECHIEL MALIK
YERUCHIM SILBER

ELECTED OFFICIALS

TONYA CANTLO, REP. BP ERIC ADAMS
PINNY RINGEL REP. MAYOR DE BLASIO
PINNY HIKIND REP. COMPTROLLER
STRINGER
JOSEPH LANGSAM, REP SEN. FELDER
SHARON FUCHS, REP. SENA. FELDER
ALEXANDER GURVICH, REP. DA GONZALES
VALERIE LEVEILLE, REP CONGRESSWOMAN
YVETTE CLARKE
DEPUTY CHIEF IMBRIALE AND CAO
CARUSO, REP DSNY

COMMUNITY RESIDENTS

APPROXIMATELY 30 RESIDENTS

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

PUBLIC SESSION:

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman:

- The chairman reminded the attendees that would be speakers are required to sign in and will be allotted a maximum of three minutes.
- He advised of the long standing Community Board 12 rule that any subject that was addressed at a public hearing cannot be brought up for comment by non-board members at the general board meeting. There were two public meetings addressing the rezoning matter on the agenda. Only board members can discuss and debate that issue. The public was asked to remain calm and advised that disrupters will be asked to leave.

Richard Navas- Resident:

- Mr. Navas thanked the NYPD for the work done help out at Ft. Hamilton Parkway. Two years back he spoke about the parking problem resulting from buses that park where cars should park. It took two years to get the police to issue summonses to buses, which temporarily resolved the matter, but the problem is back. Each bus takes up parking space that would be enough for two cars. Reporting to 311 doesn't help because when the police come hours later the buses are gone.
- Mr. Navas requested a permanent repair to the broken fire hydrant at 3904 10th Ave. that he reported to the Community Board. The city repaired the hydrant with asphalt, which is only a temporary remedy and the hydrant is sinking again. It needs to be fixed with cement for it to hold properly.
- He wished everyone who celebrates a Happy Purim, and requested consideration from celebrants. Everyone should enjoy Purim but they need to think about neighbors and not play music late at night.

Morton Pupko- Board Member:

- Mr. Pupko thanked DSNY for their service. He had a sanitation problem so he reached out to the Community Board. Ann Marie said she would report it and just 10-15 minutes after the call. Chief Imbriale came down himself to make sure the matter is taken care of. He thanked Deputy Chief Imbriale for his exemplary service. When DSNY does a good job, they do an excellent job and he wanted to recognize that.

Avi Greenstein- Board Member and CEO of Boro Park JCC:

- Mr. Greenstein reminded everyone of the importance of participating in Census 2020. The results of the Census directly determines billions in funding allocations. There is a lot of funding that the community is entitled to because of population. Census 2010 saw a 49% participation rate this is not acceptable and Census 2020 must be different.
- The Boro Park JCC partnered with the city to work on getting to full participation. BPJCC is a Census pop up site and anyone can walk in and fill out the census.

Jacques Friedman- Board Member:

- Mr. Friedman observed something disturbing at Ave L and Coney Island Avenue the previous Thursday night. A fire truck with sirens on wanted to pass through the intersection- but cars continued to drive across. And though the Board generally doesn't encourage tickets, if drivers don't stop for emergency vehicles they should be fined. The police should head to where they hear sirens and issue violations for offenders.
He urged the NYPD to strictly enforce laws that mandate drivers make room for emergency vehicles.

Abe Fuchs- Resident:

- Mr. Fuchs resides at 59th Street. The 66 precinct leaves cars for months at a time taking up parking spaces. Removing the cars could clear up at least ten spaces. The police have a parking lot, but they don't use it. The police should either use the lot, or allow the residents to use it.

Yitty Kish- Resident:

- Ms. Kish resides at 59th Street and has been observing a problem for two years: loose trash flying around. It creates a problem when dirt accumulates at the corner catch basins. The dirt gets matted down and leads to flooding. Residents end up with black trash all over.

Miriam Schwinder- Resident:

- Ms. Schwinder resides at 59th Street. She advised there is a street light out for eight months in front of 1520 59th Street. Numerous calls to 311 did not result in any repair. The foundation for the light is in place, but there is no pole and no light.
- The garbage truck collection on Wednesday mornings creates a traffic fiasco for riders of the Williamsburg-Boro Park bus. Rerouting the buses to accommodate the sanitation trucks creates a half hour delay.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager:

- The district manager addressed the sanitation concern Ms. Schwinder raised. When Councilman Greenfield and Assemblyman Hikind were in office DSNY agreed to do most collections in Boro Park on Wednesday and Shabbos. This means that there is only one day of Sanitation traffic instead of two. Furthermore, DSNY tries to collect regular trash collection as early in the day as possible and the recycling in the afternoon so the collections are not together. DSNY tries picking up trash as early as possible, but they are not always able to.
- He wanted to add on to Mr. Pupko's comment on Sanitation. Since Deputy Chief Imbriale became chief in Brooklyn South, the response has been phenomenal. Yesterday the two missed pickups were resolved the same day. The line of communication with DSNY is remarkable.

DSNY COMMUNITY AFFAIRS- PLASTIC BAG BAN:

Stephen Caruso of DSNY citywide community officer community Assistance Unit:

- Mr. Caruso is working with the community board to improve the cleanliness within Community Board 12. He may be seen knocking on doors, it's not a reason for alarm, DSNY has been on 55th St. and along 13th Ave. to inform residents and businesses of their responsibilities. Everyone needs to work together on identifying problems and then fixing it. It's important to work together to keep the streets clean. Residents were urged to help identify problems so they can be fixed.
- Mr. Caruso joined the board in recognizing the good work and dedication by Chief Imbriale.
- He brought flyers and handouts to distribute for educational purposes, these were left at the front desk.
- The plastic ban law was enacted by NYS, and as such is a State law which is enforced by the DEC, not DSNY. DSNY came to present the facts of this law. The law is a new one and there are probably a lot of questions DSNY hopes to address.
- Businesses will only be able to provide paper bags for a 5 cent fee. Customers who pay with EBT funds will be exempt from this fee. DSNY is hoping to promote reusable bags which was brought to the Board Meeting to distribute. The bags are good quality and are washable. There are several hundred billion bags that end up in landfills, and this ban aims to change it.
- There are three sorts of business that are exempt from the single use plastic bag ban. Carry out stores that sell ready to eat foods, fish and meat stores are able to provide single use bags with no handles, and pharmacies can use plastic bags for prescriptions only. However, non-prescriptions cannot be put into those bags.

Mr. Caruso highlighted a few DSNY programs of interest:

- The Adopt a Basket program is for businesses located at intersections. Such businesses can get a basket, bags and other supplies. They are asked to remove the bags and place it beside the basket for collections. This leaves a space for passersby to place their trash so it doesn't end up on the streets in front of businesses.
- The Volunteer Cleanup program is for volunteer groups to clean up certain areas. DSNY provides the tools and the volunteers leave the bags for DSNY to collect when they are done.

Jacob Daskal- Board Member:

- In the past DSNY trucks were equipped with brooms and shovels and the employees would clean up spillage they caused. The DSNY trucks create 90% of the littering in the streets when they carelessly through trash. The wind then blows the dirt around to people's homes and they are ticketed for littering they shouldn't be responsible for.

Nick Caruso- DSNY:

- Advised that every truck is supposed to have a broom and shovel on it. And sanitation employees are supposed to clean up spillage. If they don't, residents should report to 311.
- Chief Imbriale has been stepping up and constantly reminding sanitation workers of their responsibility to clean up spillage. Mr. Caruso will stick around after the board meeting to address any questions non-board members may have.

Mayer Weber - Chair of CB12 Sanitation Committee:

- Mr. Weber said that when residents complain to 311 they are asked to provide ruck numbers, which you can't know if you come to a street that is full of DSNY truck spillage.
- Chief Imbriale advised that residents can give the street information to the Community Board to forward to DSNY to clear up.

Adam Cohen – Board Member:

- Another problem that needs to be addressed is DSNY throwing cans all over after dumping the trash into the truck. Cars swerve to avoid hitting cans and this becomes a safety concern.

CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS:

- Mr. Perlstein congratulated the board members who had perfect attendance in 2019: Avrohom Wolfson, Jacque Friedman, Jules Fleischer, Miriam Hershko, Naftali Tessler, Yaakov Kaplan, and Yonah Moses.

It is appreciated that volunteers not only sign up to serve on the board, but also show up to meetings.

JANUARY MINUTES ADOPTED: With no changes.

- Day Light Savings starts Sunday, March 8th and everyone is reminded to turn clocks ahead one hour and change their batteries in smoke and carbon monoxide detectors. There were batteries available for free at the front desk.
- He wished everyone who celebrates a Happy Purim. Purim is a joyous holiday, but the dangers of drinking and driving cannot be stressed enough. The Board is working together with the NYPD, Hatzolah and Shomrim to ensure a safe and happy Purim. Everybody must be careful and watch out for their friends and family. If anyone has special concerns please let the board know.
- Community Board is forming an ad hoc committee in an effort to get to full participation for Census 2020. Board members are an instrumental tool in communicating with the greater community, and therefore are being called to serve and help in engaging the community. Anyone interested in serving on this committee should see the chairman after the board meeting.
- The chairman wished everyone who celebrates a Peaceful Ash Wednesday.

NOMINATING COMMITTEE APPOINTMENT:

- The Chairman announced the members of the nominating committee: Miriam Hersko as chair, Naftali Tessler, Chesky Blau, John Talmadge, and Yonah Moses. The committee will meet to nominate the executive committee and the slate will be presented at the next Board Meeting, in March.

ELECTED OFFICIALS AND REPRESENTATIVES:

- **Comptroller Scott Stringer was represented by Pinny Hikind.**

- **Mayor Bill de Blasio was represented by Pinny Ringel.**
- **Boro President Eric Adams was represented by Tonya Cantlo.**
 - Ms. Cantlo advised of the Borough Hall Rezoning Hearing scheduled to address the 59th street and 15th Ave. project. The public hearing was scheduled at Borough Hall on March 10th at Borough Hall- 209 Joralemon, at 7:00 pm.
 - The crowd objected to the timing of the scheduled hearing because it is Purim Night and the residents wouldn't be able to go.
Ms. Cantlo said she would work on trying to accommodate this conflict.
- **Brooklyn District Attorney Eric Gonzales was represented by Alex Gurvitch.**
 - Mr. Gurvitch gave a brief synopsis of 2019:
2019 had some of the lowest crime rates in Brooklyn South. Homicides were down 40%, from 54 shootings to 34 shootings. Though every shooting is still unfortunate and the optimal number is zero crime, this is a marked improvement. The low numbers are thanks to the efforts of NYPD and the community.
These shootings were also largely gang related. Gang members were hunting each other. The DA's office came out with a 122 count indictment involving 34 individuals from rival gangs. This large gang crackdown will lead to a decrease in shootings in Brooklyn North in the coming years.
 - Despite the overall reduction in crime, there has been an uptick in hate crime, disturbingly the trend is in anti-Semitic crimes. 121 reports have been filed when NYPD responded to reports on anti-Semitism. It is important that the community needs to continue to report crimes. Brooklyn has a dedicated Hate Crimes Bureau as opposed to other Boroughs with a Unit. There are ADA's that go out to the crime scenes to make observe in person.

Adam Cohen- Board Member:

- He asked to hear the DA's opinion on the bail reform and on the requirement to share witness and victim personal information with opposing attorney.

Alex Gurvitch- representing DA Gonzales:

- He stated the bail reform is a hot button item. One of the items in the bill eliminated cash bail for a variety of offenses. The District Attorney was not hoping for that specific change, he believes there should be additional criteria for remand. An example would be someone who is a danger to the community. The DA believes additional discretion from judges should not be taken away.
- Sharing personal information with opposing attorney was always required in the process of discovery and speedy trial. The new law requires that this information is shared within the 15 day timeframe of discovery. This was signed into law and a part of that includes some form of contact information for witnesses and victims need to be provided.
- Happy holidays to all who celebrate Purim.
- **Congresswoman Yvette Clarke was represented by Valerie Leveille:**
 - Ms. Leveille informed of the policy change that would require every air traveler to have an acceptable form of REAL ID by October 1, 2020. Any questions can be directed to the State ID issuing agency.
 - The Congresswoman was working on implementing laws to improve the climate. She is a cosponsor of the 100% Clean Economy Act, which sets a national goal of achieving economy-wide net-zero greenhouse gas emissions by 2050.
She recently introduced the FEMA Climate Change Preparedness Act to better protect communities from the short and long term threats that climate change poses to homes and critical infrastructure.
- **Senator Simcha Felder was represented by Sharon Fuchs and Joseph Langsam.**
- **The NYPD was represented by Officers Jaiman and Officers Ponteleo.**
- **The DSNY was represented by John Imbriale and Nathan Caruso.**

VOTE ON THE RE-ZONING OF 1501-1555 60th Street:

Presented by Chairman Yidel Perlstein for Zoning Committee Chair David Shlomovich:

- The Chairman briefed the board members on the public hearing and committee meetings. There was a public hearing on February 12th attended by over 30 residents and the builders where the application was presented and the public had an opportunity to comment.
- The application was to convert the addresses from an M1-1 zoning to an R7A/C2-4. The original plan by the builders was to build 3 buildings consisting of 7 floors each totaling 102 units and would include 31 parking spaces.
- The overwhelming response from residents was concern that the proposed changes would negatively impact the area. It would make an already tough parking situation much worse when the units are filled. The garbage that would be placed out for trash in front of the building would create an eyesore and a sanitation concern. And the height of the building would impact the sunlight and nature of the vicinity. Due to these concerns the Zoning Committee voted 6-1 to deny the application. And that is the motion that was sent to the General Board to be voted on at the board meeting.
- The project owner asked for another meeting with the residents to see if some concessions can be worked out. The builders agreed to: Add 40 parking spots to the project, and reduce the unit count to 88. This would mean that there would be an indoor spot for almost all units. The garbage would be kept indoors. The building height would be reduced from 7 floors to 6 floors.
- After the second meeting the neighbors were still opposed to the project. The Chairman asked board members if they have anything to add or any questions to ask before the board votes on the application.
- The chairman responded that the rest of the block is commercial in response to a question posed by a board member.

John Talmadge- Board Member:

- Mr. Talmadge pointed out that from his experience being around the neighborhood for over 32 years, the concessions seem more than fair. The area is a commercial one and bound to change. And the builders came back 2-3 times to try to accommodate the neighbors, this is something that the neighbors wouldn't get anywhere else.

Jacques Friedman-Board Member:

- Mr. Friedman expressed concern with the concessions. His experience is that after coming to a board agreement builders go to the BSA and get agreed on parking requirements removed. The accommodations stated sound very good, but not if they don't remain in the permanent plans.
- There is no reason the builders can't get equipment to dig deeper into ground to add more parking. Any increased demand for parking will add to the parking burden of the surrounding streets.
- The neighbors bought their property years ago and will now lose the air and light they had.

Yidel Perlstein-Chairman:

- Applications sent to the BSA with specific conditions added by the Community Board are not changed. Changes to BSA application are only for general conditions.

Adam Cohen- Board Member:

- Clarified that the owners are providing 71 spots for 88 units, which means there will be a spot for almost every unit.

Sol Whaba- Board Member:

- Iterated that he was at both meetings. The builders and board members heard the contentions of the neighbors at the first meeting, which is why a second meeting was called for. At the second meeting the builder was willing to make changes to accommodate the neighbors. He wants to improve the neighborhood. He wants to get rid of paint booths spewing toxic air into neighbors' backyards. He is from the area and wants to work with the neighbors.
- Mr. Whaba wanted to introduce a motion with the new adjusted plans.

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman:

- Advised that a new motion cannot be introduced since there is a motion pending. If that motion is denied only then a new motion can be introduced.
- The chairman asked if any board members had additional questions or comments before voting on the motion recommended by the zoning committee.

Sharon Fuchs-Board Member:

- Ms. Fuchs prefaced her comments with a disclaimer that she is a resident of the street in question for 35 years. But she will not recuse herself and will vote on the motion.
- She has been a board member for years and never speaks about her issues. The builders say they will clean up shmutz, so they should. There are things they could do. For example, while she feels safe with the police station on her block, there are two shifts of NYPD officers and there is never any parking.
- The Maple Lanes project has not opened yet, but will surely impact parking. That project has no parking of their own. This new project will take away more parking and will worsen the sanitation conditions.
- Additionally, there are two projects being considered. So shmutz will get worse.
- People in the neighborhood know what is going on and strongly object to it. The committee therefore voted against the project. The board is a volunteer group and should be listening to and voting according to the community.

Yidel- Perlstein- Chairman:

- Presented the motion on the floor recommended by the zoning committee to deny the developer the right to continue the project based on the initial unaltered application presented on February 12th.
- He clarified that the vote taking place is a vote to deny the application. Voting yes on the motion means a vote to deny the project. Voting no means defeating the motion to deny the project. If the motion is defeated then the board may have an opportunity to vote on a motion with concessions.
- He reminded that only board members can vote on motion.

MOTION TO DENY REZONING APPLICATION:

Jacque Friedman and Sharon Fuchs voted yes on the motion to deny the application.

Mendy Reiner recused.

All other Board Members voted not to deny the application.

Motion defeated.

Rabbi Edgar Gluck- Board Member:

- Presented a motion to approve the application the builders presented with the changes and concessions.

Anna Cali-Board Member:

- Requested that should the motion carry, the approval clearly stipulate that parking can't be reduced further, eliminating the option of going to the BSA and asking for a reduction.

Barry Spitzer- District Manager:

- All these stipulations are included. Except for the amount of apartments which is an approximation at this point.

MOTION TO APPROVE REZONING APPLICATION WITH AMENDMENTS:

Sharon Fuchs and Jacques Friedman voted to deny.

Mendy Reiner recused.

All other Board Members voted yes.

Motion carried.

Anna Cali-Board Member:

- Ms. Cali made a statement in response to the booing of the attendees. There was a hearing on February 12th. The Board agreed with all the complaints the residents had and told the builders the application would be denied. The owner's understood the complaints of the neighborhood and requested a meeting to negotiate and compromise. This meeting was held on February 20th. The Committee and the project owner sat and listened as the residents screamed for hours. The board tried to control the meeting in order to have a productive conversation. The board sided with the residents and their concerns tried to facilitate a positive outcome. They were sympathetic to everything the residents said. The second meeting was called by the board because they wanted to help. They didn't have to call this meeting. At the meeting the board members were disrespected. The residents wouldn't allow them to speak. They could have negotiated and compromised more with the builders, but there was not enough decorum. To have the residents present at the general board meeting say things like 'who paid you off' is completely unacceptable. This is the third time the residents are attacking the board members. The board is upset by what is happening in the neighborhood. Ms. Cali lives on 60th street so this project impacts her as well. The board urged the owners to increase parking. The builder don't have to follow the board's request, they can bypass the community board and go straight to the BSA with the original application. The residents still have a fight ahead of them to improve conditions. They can still go to the BSA with complaints and ask for changes.
- The board members are volunteers. They don't need this headache. They could have walked out from the negotiations with the residents. The board went above and beyond their duty in this case, more than anyone would have done.

DISTRICT MANAGER'S REMARKS:

Barry Spitzer- District Manager:

- The Board is already working on Passover. As everyone knows, Passover is a big project with a lot of agencies involved. The board is already working with FDNY, NYPD, DSNY, Shomrim and Chaverim to make sure this year, like previous years, is smooth sailing. In the near future there will be a meeting with all the agencies.
- A final list of pre-Pesach container permits is being compiled. The full list will be available in March. Container placement takes into account the conflicting needs of parking space and storage space for businesses. If you think a container is out without a permit, please call the office to verify.
- The Alternate Side Parking fine change will go into effect on Thursday, February 20, 2020. The new rule will increase parking fines across the entire city at \$65.00.
- There were some inquiries from Board members and residents on the status of COVID-19. As of now, there are no confirmed cases of coronavirus in New York City. DOH is on top of this and closely monitoring the situation. It's important to remain calm. Don't accept everything you hear as fact, it can save you a lot of grief.
- In light of the time the tradition of highlighting a constituent case will be skipped. But they all involved DSNY and the amazing responses Chief Imbriale provides.
- A reminder to everyone: the plastic bag ban goes in effect March 1. Only paper bags will be available, for a 5 cent fee. Thank you to DSNY for providing the reusable bags.
- The district manager followed up on a matter raised by Sam Stober last month regarding a confusing sign. The Police were issuing tickets because the sign incorrectly stated no left hand turns. Pinny Ringel from the mayor's office got involved and got the sign removed. So thank you to Pinny Ringel.

- Pinny Ringel pointed out that although no one came forth with actual tickets the sign was anyways removed.
- The MTA is modernizing the signaling system of the Culver Line between Church Av and W 8th St. in Brooklyn. This initiative will solve the ongoing delays caused by old signals by fully replacing them with modern signaling. Starting in March 2020, the next phase of the project is starting. During this phase, there won't be weekend subway service at 12 stations in Brooklyn. Additionally, Car and pedestrian traffic also will be temporarily limited in some areas. During the Culver Line improvements, there will be no local or express F train service From Ditmas Ave. through Stilwell Ave. most weekends:
The MTA has dedicated buses to connect you when F subway service is disrupted on weekends.

OLD BUSINESS / NEW BUSINESS: No Old or New Business.

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman:

- In the interest of transparency the Chairman is disclosing that he approved a merit increase for the district manager last June. Some issues that needed to be addressed by Borough Hall were cleared this week. Therefore, he is now reporting this increase to the board.
- The next board meeting will be Tuesday, March 24th

MEETING ADJOURNED

Respectfully submitted by: Gittel Fekete