

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Business Integrity Commission  
July 22, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

NEW YORK CITY  
BUSINESS INTEGRITY COMMISSION  
COMMISSION MEETING

PROPOSED RULES FOR  
CWZ AND RATE CAP ADJUSTMENT

July 22, 2024  
2:10 P.M.

-----X

HELD AT 100 CHURCH STREET, 20TH FLOOR  
BUSINESS INTEGRITY COMMISSION  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10007

Transcribed by:  
Vanessa Walker

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ATTENDEES:

=====

1. Olga Statz, General Counsel, Business Integrity Commission
2. Osvaldo Nunez, Inspector, NYPD
3. Christopher Ryan, Deputy Commissioner Department of Investigation
4. Griselle Baret, Chief of Staff, Department of Consumer and Worker Protection
5. Leemor Rozen, Senior Deputy General Counsel Department of Small Business Services.
6. Elizabeth Crotty, Commissioner/Chair Business Integrity Commission

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. STATZ: Good afternoon. We are now on the record. Today is July 22, 2024. The time is 2:10 P.M. We are in 100 Church Street in New York City on the 20th floor. Welcome to today's meeting of the New York City's Business Integrity Commission. This is a public meeting which was duly noticed for today's date at this location at for 2:00 P.M. We have a court reporter here taking down what is being said and this meeting is being videotaped. The video recording will be posted on BIC's website following the conclusion of this meeting.

I am Olga Statz, General Counsel of the Commission and I'm joined by the Commission members. Elizabeth Crotty, Commissioner and Chair of the Business Integrity Commission; Department of Investigation Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives Christopher Ryan representing DOI Commissioner Jocelyn Strauber; Department of Consumer and

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Worker Protection Chief of Staff  
Griselle Baret representing DCWP  
Commissioner Vilda Vera Mayuga;  
Department of Small Business Services.  
Senior Deputy General Counsel Leemor  
Rozen representing SBS Acting  
Commissioner and Executive Deputy  
Commissioner Dynishal Gross; and  
inspector Osvaldo Nunez representing  
Police Commissioner Edward Caban.

Thank you all for being here.

Today the Commission will consider a  
Proposed Final Rule regarding Commercial  
Waste Zones Implementation and Maximum  
Rate Cap. Pursuant to these prepared  
rules, the Commission proposes to modify  
a number of its rules effecting trade  
waste licensees once particular waste  
zones are implemented. Specifically, in  
these rules, the Commission identifies  
which sections of the BIC rules will no  
longer apply to carters within  
designated Commercial Waste Zones.

The Commission further proposes to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

modify traffic safety reporting rules that effect trade waste and licensees and registrants. These rules are no longer necessary since the Commission's authority was expanded to include traffic safety requirements for vehicles used in the collection, removal transportation or disposal of trade waste.

The Commission is also proposing to require the surrender of Commissioner-issued trade waste license plates upon the disposition of a vehicle that has been issued such plates. The proposed rules also clarify the recycling requirements for self-hauler registrants.

The final the Commission is proposing to an increase in the maximum rate that a licensee may charge for the collection, removal, disposal or recycling of trade waste to \$26.87 per cubic yard and \$17.64 per 100 pounds.

On July 9, 2024, the Commission held

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

a public hearing on the proposed rules. The Commission considered the public's comments and determined that no changes to the rules as originally proposed were necessary.

The proposed rule change is now up for a vote as to whether it should be adopted. If the Commission votes yes to adopt the proposed change, the final rule will be published and will go into effect 30 days after application.

Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments regarding the proposed final rule?

(No response.)

MS. STATZ: Seeing none. The Commission will now vote on these rules.

If the Commission votes yes, the rules will be adopted. If the Commission votes no, the rules will not be adopted. If there is a motion from the Commissioners to adopt the proposed rules?

MR. NUNEZ: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. BARET: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Thank you very much. I will be calling on each Commissioner and designatee to collect the votes at this time. Commissioner Crotty?

MS. CROTTY: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Deputy Commissioner Ryan?

MR. RYAN: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Chief of Staff Baret?

MS. BARET: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Senior Deputy General Counsel Rozen?

MS. ROZEN: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Inspector Nunez?

MR. NUNEZ: Yes.

MS. STATZ: Thank you all for the votes. The Department of Sanitation representative or Commissioner is not here today. I note that all of the other Commissions who are here voted yes. Let the record reflect therefore a majority of the members have voted in favor and that the rules have passed.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

This concludes the matters before the Commission. I thank all the Commissioner members for their participation and to the members of the Commission staff for their hard work on these matters. And I thank any other members of the public or from other agencies or counsels who are here today as well. We are off the record. It is now 2:15 P.M. Thank you.

(Time noted: 2:15 P.M.)



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK )

ss:

COUNTY OF KINGS )

I, VANESSA WALKER, a shorthand reporter within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify that the within is a true and accurate transcript of the statement taken on 07/22/2024.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or by marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 22nd day of July, 2024.

Vanessa Walker  
Vanessa Walker

<p><b>\$1764</b> 5:24</p> <p><b>\$2687</b> 5:23</p> <p><b>07222024</b> 9:12</p> <p><b>20th</b> 14 3:6</p> <p><b>22nd</b> 9:18</p> <p>=====</p> <p>=====</p> <p>=====</p> <p>==== 2:3</p> <p><b>accurate</b> 9:11</p> <p><b>acting</b> 4:7</p> <p><b>action</b> 9:14</p> <p><b>adjustment</b> 8</p> <p><b>adopt</b> 6:10,23</p> <p><b>adopted</b> 6:9,20,22</p> <p><b>after</b> 6:12</p> <p><b>afternoon</b> 3:2</p> <p><b>agencies</b> 8:9</p> <p><b>also</b> 5:11,16</p> <p><b>am</b> 3:17 9:13,15</p> <p><b>application</b> 6:12</p> <p><b>apply</b> 4:23</p> <p><b>are</b> 3:2,4 4:20 5:4 7:22 8:9,10 (7)</p> <p><b>attendees</b> 2:2</p> <p><b>authority</b> 5:6</p> <p><b>baret</b> 2:11 4:3 7:2,11,12 (5)</p> <p><b>before</b> 8:2</p> <p><b>being</b> 3:12,13 4:12</p>	<p><b>bic</b> 4:22</p> <p><b>bic's</b> 3:14</p> <p><b>blood</b> 9:14</p> <p><b>business</b> 4,15 2:4,14,16 3:7,20 4:5 (8)</p> <p><b>c</b> 9:2,2</p> <p><b>caban</b> 4:11</p> <p><b>calling</b> 7:4</p> <p><b>cap</b> 8 4:16</p> <p><b>carters</b> 4:23</p> <p><b>certify</b> 9:11,13</p> <p><b>chair</b> 3:20</p> <p><b>change</b> 6:7,10</p> <p><b>changes</b> 6:4</p> <p><b>charge</b> 5:21</p> <p><b>chief</b> 2:11 4:2 7:11</p> <p><b>christopher</b> 2:9 3:23</p> <p><b>church</b> 14 3:5</p> <p><b>city</b> 3 3:5</p> <p><b>city's</b> 3:7</p> <p><b>clarify</b> 5:16</p> <p><b>collect</b> 7:5</p> <p><b>collection</b> 5:8,22</p> <p><b>comments</b> 6:4,14</p> <p><b>commercial</b> 4:14,24</p> <p><b>commission</b> 4,5,15 2:5,16 3:8,18,19,21 4:13,17,21,25 5:11,19,25 6:3,9,18,19,21 8:3,6 (23)</p>	<p><b>commission's</b> 5:5</p> <p><b>commissioner</b> 2:7,9 3:20,22,24 4:4,8,9,11 7:4,6,8,20 8:4 (14)</p> <p><b>commissionerchair</b> 2:15</p> <p><b>commissionerissued</b> 5:13</p> <p><b>commissioners</b> 6:13,23</p> <p><b>commissions</b> 7:22</p> <p><b>concludes</b> 8:2</p> <p><b>conclusion</b> 3:15</p> <p><b>consider</b> 4:13</p> <p><b>considered</b> 6:3</p> <p><b>consumer</b> 2:12 3:25</p> <p><b>counsel</b> 2:4,13 3:17 4:6 7:14 (5)</p> <p><b>counsels</b> 8:9</p> <p><b>county</b> 9:7</p> <p><b>court</b> 3:11</p> <p><b>crotty</b> 2:15 3:19 7:6,7 (4)</p> <p><b>cubic</b> 5:24</p> <p><b>cwz</b> 8</p> <p><b>date</b> 3:10</p> <p><b>day</b> 9:18</p> <p><b>days</b> 6:12</p> <p><b>dcwp</b> 4:3</p> <p><b>department</b> 2:7,10,11,14 3:21,25 4:5 7:19 (8)</p> <p><b>deputy</b> 2:9,13 3:22 4:6,8 7:8,13 (7)</p>
---	---	--

<p><b>designated</b> 4:24</p> <p><b>designatee</b> 7:5</p> <p><b>determined</b> 6:4</p> <p><b>disposal</b> 5:9,22</p> <p><b>disposition</b> 5:14</p> <p><b>doi</b> 3:24</p> <p><b>down</b> 3:12</p> <p><b>duly</b> 3:9</p> <p><b>dynishal</b> 4:9</p> <p><b>e</b> 9:2,2</p> <p><b>each</b> 7:4</p> <p><b>edward</b> 4:11</p> <p><b>effect</b> 5:3 6:12</p> <p><b>effecting</b> 4:18</p> <p><b>elizabeth</b> 2:15 3:19</p> <p><b>executive</b> 4:8</p> <p><b>expanded</b> 5:6</p> <p><b>f</b> 9:2</p> <p><b>favor</b> 7:25</p> <p><b>final</b> 4:14 5:19 6:10,15 (4)</p> <p><b>floor</b> 14 3:6</p> <p><b>following</b> 3:15</p> <p><b>further</b> 4:25 9:13</p> <p><b>general</b> 2:4,13 3:17 4:6 7:13 (5)</p> <p><b>go</b> 6:11</p> <p><b>good</b> 3:2</p>	<p><b>griselle</b> 2:11 4:3</p> <p><b>gross</b> 4:9</p> <p><b>hand</b> 9:18</p> <p><b>hard</b> 8:6</p> <p><b>has</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>hearing</b> 6:2</p> <p><b>held</b> 14 5:25</p> <p><b>here</b> 3:11 4:12 7:21,22 8:9 (5)</p> <p><b>hereby</b> 9:10</p> <p><b>hereunto</b> 9:17</p> <p><b>i'm</b> 3:18</p> <p><b>identifies</b> 4:21</p> <p><b>implementation</b> 4:15</p> <p><b>implemented</b> 4:20</p> <p><b>include</b> 5:6</p> <p><b>increase</b> 5:20</p> <p><b>initiatives</b> 3:23</p> <p><b>inspector</b> 2:6 4:10 7:16</p> <p><b>integrity</b> 4,15 2:5,16 3:8,21 (6)</p> <p><b>interested</b> 9:15</p> <p><b>into</b> 6:11</p> <p><b>investigation</b> 2:10 3:22</p> <p><b>is</b> 3:3,4,8,12,13 5:11,19 6:7,22 7:20 8:10 9:11 (12)</p> <p><b>issued</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>its</b> 4:18</p> <p><b>jessica</b> 2:7</p>	<p><b>jocelyn</b> 3:24</p> <p><b>joined</b> 3:18</p> <p><b>july</b> 10 3:3 5:25 9:18 (4)</p> <p><b>kings</b> 9:7</p> <p><b>leemor</b> 2:13 4:6</p> <p><b>let</b> 7:23</p> <p><b>license</b> 5:13</p> <p><b>licensee</b> 5:21</p> <p><b>licensees</b> 4:19 5:3</p> <p><b>location</b> 3:10</p> <p><b>longer</b> 4:23 5:5</p> <p><b>majority</b> 7:24</p> <p><b>marriage</b> 9:15</p> <p><b>matter</b> 9:16</p> <p><b>matters</b> 8:2,7</p> <p><b>maximum</b> 4:15 5:20</p> <p><b>may</b> 5:21</p> <p><b>mayuga</b> 4:4</p> <p><b>meeting</b> 5 3:7,9,13,16 (5)</p> <p><b>members</b> 3:19 7:24 8:4,5,8 (5)</p> <p><b>modify</b> 4:17 5:2</p> <p><b>motion</b> 6:22</p> <p><b>ms</b> 3:2 6:17 7:2,3,7,8,11,12,13,15,16,18 (12)</p> <p><b>much</b> 7:3</p> <p><b>my</b> 9:18</p>
---	--	---

<p><b>necessary</b> 5:5 6:6</p> <p><b>new</b> 3,16,16 3:5,7 9:5,10 (7)</p> <p><b>no</b> 4:22 5:4 6:4,16,21 9:15 (6)</p> <p><b>none</b> 6:17</p> <p><b>note</b> 7:21</p> <p><b>noted</b> 8:12</p> <p><b>noticed</b> 3:9</p> <p><b>now</b> 3:3 6:7,18 8:11 (4)</p> <p><b>number</b> 4:18</p> <p><b>nunez</b> 2:6 4:10 6:25 7:16,17 (5)</p> <p><b>nypd</b> 2:6</p> <p><b>off</b> 8:10</p> <p><b>olga</b> 2:4 3:17</p> <p><b>once</b> 4:19</p> <p><b>originally</b> 6:5</p> <p><b>osvaldo</b> 2:6 4:10</p> <p><b>other</b> 7:22 8:7,8</p> <p><b>outcome</b> 9:16</p> <p><b>participation</b> 8:5</p> <p><b>particular</b> 4:19</p> <p><b>parties</b> 9:14</p> <p><b>passed</b> 7:25</p> <p><b>per</b> 5:23,24</p> <p><b>plates</b> 5:14,15</p> <p><b>pm</b> 11 3:4,11 8:11,12 (5)</p> <p><b>police</b> 4:11</p>	<p><b>posted</b> 3:14</p> <p><b>pounds</b> 5:24</p> <p><b>prepared</b> 4:16</p> <p><b>proposed</b> 7 4:14 5:16 6:2,5,7,10,15,23 (9)</p> <p><b>proposes</b> 4:17,25</p> <p><b>proposing</b> 5:11,20</p> <p><b>protection</b> 2:12 4:2</p> <p><b>public</b> 3:8 6:2 8:8</p> <p><b>public's</b> 6:3</p> <p><b>published</b> 6:11</p> <p><b>pursuant</b> 4:16</p> <p><b>questions</b> 6:14</p> <p><b>r</b> 9:2</p> <p><b>rate</b> 8 4:16 5:21</p> <p><b>record</b> 3:3 7:23 8:10</p> <p><b>recording</b> 3:14</p> <p><b>recycling</b> 5:17,23</p> <p><b>reflect</b> 7:23</p> <p><b>regarding</b> 4:14 6:14</p> <p><b>registrants</b> 5:4,18</p> <p><b>related</b> 9:13</p> <p><b>removal</b> 5:8,22</p> <p><b>reporter</b> 3:11 9:9</p> <p><b>reporting</b> 5:2</p> <p><b>representative</b> 7:20</p> <p><b>representing</b> 3:24 4:3,7,10 (4)</p>	<p><b>require</b> 5:12</p> <p><b>requirements</b> 5:7,17</p> <p><b>response</b> 6:16</p> <p><b>rozen</b> 2:13 4:7 7:14,15 (4)</p> <p><b>rule</b> 4:14 6:7,11,15 (4)</p> <p><b>rules</b> 7 4:17,18,21,22 5:2,4,16 6:2,5,18,20,21,24 7:25 (15)</p> <p><b>ryan</b> 2:9 3:23 7:9,10 (4)</p> <p><b>safety</b> 5:2,7</p> <p><b>said</b> 3:12</p> <p><b>sanitation</b> 2:8 7:19</p> <p><b>sbs</b> 4:7</p> <p><b>sections</b> 4:22</p> <p><b>seeing</b> 6:17</p> <p><b>selfhauler</b> 5:17</p> <p><b>senior</b> 2:13 4:6 7:13</p> <p><b>services</b> 2:14 4:5</p> <p><b>set</b> 9:17</p> <p><b>shorthand</b> 9:9</p> <p><b>should</b> 6:8</p> <p><b>signature</b> 9:21</p> <p><b>since</b> 5:5</p> <p><b>small</b> 2:14 4:5</p> <p><b>specifically</b> 4:20</p> <p><b>ss</b> 9:6</p> <p><b>staff</b> 2:11 4:2 7:11 8:6 (4)</p> <p><b>state</b> 9:5,10</p>
---	--	---

<p><b>statement</b> 9:12</p> <p><b>statz</b> 2:4 3:2,17 6:17 7:3,8,11,13,16,18 (10)</p> <p><b>strategic</b> 3:23</p> <p><b>strauber</b> 3:25</p> <p><b>street</b> 14 3:5</p> <p><b>such</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>surrender</b> 5:12</p> <p><b>t</b> 9:2,2</p> <p><b>taken</b> 9:12</p> <p><b>taking</b> 3:12</p> <p><b>thank</b> 4:12 7:3,18 8:3,7,11 (6)</p> <p><b>their</b> 8:4,6</p> <p><b>therefore</b> 7:23</p> <p><b>these</b> 4:16,21 5:4 6:18 8:7 (5)</p> <p><b>time</b> 3:4 7:6 8:12</p> <p><b>tisch</b> 2:7</p> <p><b>today</b> 3:3 4:13 7:21 8:9 (4)</p> <p><b>today's</b> 3:6,10</p> <p><b>trade</b> 4:18 5:3,9,13,23 (5)</p> <p><b>traffic</b> 5:2,7</p> <p><b>transcribed</b> 23</p> <p><b>transcript</b> 9:12</p> <p><b>transportation</b> 5:9</p> <p><b>true</b> 9:11</p> <p><b>up</b> 6:7</p> <p><b>upon</b> 5:14</p>	<p><b>used</b> 5:8</p> <p><b>vanessa</b> 24 9:9</p> <p><b>vehicle</b> 5:14</p> <p><b>vehicles</b> 5:7</p> <p><b>vera</b> 4:4</p> <p><b>very</b> 7:3</p> <p><b>video</b> 3:13</p> <p><b>videotaped</b> 3:13</p> <p><b>vilda</b> 4:4</p> <p><b>vote</b> 6:8,18</p> <p><b>voted</b> 7:22,24</p> <p><b>votes</b> 6:9,19,21 7:5,19 (5)</p> <p><b>walker</b> 24 9:9</p> <p><b>waste</b> 4:15,19,19,24 5:3,10,13,23 (8)</p> <p><b>way</b> 9:15</p> <p><b>website</b> 3:15</p> <p><b>welcome</b> 3:6</p> <p><b>well</b> 8:10</p> <p><b>what</b> 3:12</p> <p><b>whereof</b> 9:17</p> <p><b>whether</b> 6:8</p> <p><b>which</b> 3:9 4:22</p> <p><b>who</b> 7:22 8:9</p> <p><b>will</b> 3:14 4:13,22 6:11,11,18,20,21 7:4 (9)</p> <p><b>within</b> 4:23 9:10,11</p> <p><b>witness</b> 9:17</p>	<p><b>work</b> 8:6</p> <p><b>worker</b> 2:12 4:2</p> <p><b>x</b> 2,12</p> <p><b>yard</b> 5:24</p> <p><b>yes</b> 6:9,19,25 7:2,7,10,12,15,17,23 (10)</p> <p><b>york</b> 3,16,16 3:5,7 9:5,10 (7)</p> <p><b>zones</b> 4:15,20,24</p> <p><b>210</b> 11 3:4</p> <p><b>215</b> 8:11,12</p> <p><b>2024</b> 10 3:4 5:25 9:18 (4)</p> <p><b>10013</b> 16</p>
--	---	--