

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

1

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRANSCRIPT OF THE
NEW YORK CITY
TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION

Thursday, February 26, 2015
33 Beaver Street
COMMISSION HEARING ROOM, 19TH FLOOR
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543
(212) 95-DEPOS (953-3767) * (914) 381-2061
E-MAIL: Stenokath@verizon.net
FACSIMILE: 914.722.0816

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

2

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HEARING CONVENED AT 10:10 a.m.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Meera Joshi, Chair

Elias Arout

Edward Gonzales

Lauvienska Polanco

ALSO PRESENT:

Chris Wilson, General Counsel

Christopher Tormey, Director of Applicant Licensing

Staff

The Public

Reported by:
Jennifer Cassella

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKERS ON ANTI-ASSAULT AND DRIVER PROTECTION PAGE
AND HEARING LOOP STICKER RULES

Janice Schacter Lintz, CEO Hearing Access &
Innovations.....10

Jerry Bergman.....13

Erhan Tuncel, Managing Director of League of
Mutual Taxi Owners.....16

Bill Lindauer, New York Taxi Workers Alliance.....17

SPEAKERS ON FHV DISPATCH RULES PAGE

Richard Thaler.....21

Ed Clearly.....22

Christy Galvani.....29

Michael Arvanites.31

SPEAKERS ON SHL ROOF LIGHT RULES PAGE

Erhan Tuncel, Managing Director of League of
Mutual Taxi Owners.....34

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

4

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

THE CHAIR: Good morning. The time is 10:10 and we're going to get started with today's meeting. I want to just note, today we do not have a quorum. We'll be joined in a little bit by Commissioner Polanco, but even with Commissioner Polanco, we won't have a quorum. So today we'll do hearings on three proposed rules, but we will not take a vote because we don't have the required number of members necessary for a vote.

So let me just start the Chair's report with an update on our commuter van pilot. This is something we started in November, piloting for those vans that choose to put a decal on the side of their vehicle. It says NYC Commute, and it mirrors the branding that's on yellow taxis and green taxis. And the focus of the program was to elevate for passengers an awareness on what a legal commuter van is versus an illegal, and for those drivers and owners of legal licensed commuter vans, a sense of pride and being part of the TLC

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

5

1 Proceedings

2 licensed community. So they also have now
3 branding that looks a lot like the other
4 vehicles that we license. It's a voluntary
5 program and since we've started, we've had
6 amazing interest in it. There's now 34
7 licensed commuter van authorities who are
8 part of the program, and that means about
9 70 percent of our commuter vans now bear
10 this decal which is voluntary, and as you
11 can tell, is probably quickly going to
12 become a rule since we've got so much
13 overwhelming support for the pilot.

14 The other update is on February 5th,
15 TLC along with Cab Riders United on a very,
16 very cold morning stood outside Grand
17 Central and handed out fliers reminding
18 passengers about the 25-mile per hour speed
19 limit and what the passengers role is in
20 sort of encouraging everybody to adhere to
21 it. Drivers understandably are often
22 encouraged by their passengers to go
23 faster, go faster. So we were out there
24 with Cab Riders United to really let the
25 public know that we all play a role in

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

6

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

making our streets safer. We're drivers or we're passengers, and if we're passengers we should tip for safety. So give 25 percent tip to your cab driver for staying at the speed limit, 25 or under. And when you're talking about what you qualify as a good driver, remember it's safety, not speed, because the price of speed is just too high.

Now, some people were very interested and took fliers and I think it's an encouraging sign of awareness among passengers and people in general of the Mayor's Vision zero initiative. So we'll be out again, hopefully not quite as cold day, maybe we'll pick something a little warmer, but we'll be out again with fliers and anywhere where there's taxi stands to remind passengers of this important message.

And finally, on December 16th we received a petition for rule making which would seek to compel the in-taxi technology to be available for WiFi and include

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

7

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

charging ports. The Commission considered the rule making and has rejected it. We sent the proposals to all the Commissioners so they're aware of our decision, and that was done on February 4th, 2015.

With that, because we do not have a quorum, we will not do an adoption of the minutes or review base applications. We'll go straight to our hearings, and we have three rules today for a public hearing. One is, and Chris will give sort of the formal description of each, but the first one is a rule about stickers, would require on the inside of the taxi a sticker reminding riders of driver protections and the state criminal laws that protect drivers who are assaulted. And this has -- well, this is 2015, but 2014 was not a great year for drivers. There was two horrendous deaths and several attacks on drivers. So we're pleased that City Council passed a law requiring these in TLC licensed vehicles and we're pleased today to propose rules that will make it a

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

8

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

reality; an unfortunate reality, but a reality and an important reminder for everybody in be taxicabs, and liveries, and black cars, and limos, paratransits, and I think that's it -- commuter vans too and green cabs.

The next rule is FHV dispatch rule. It does two things. It clarifies that in cross-class dispatching, it would not be considered cross-class dispatch for a limo company to dispatch to a black car company and vice versa. They're members of the same workers' compensation fund and have traditionally been sort of lumped together in a class of vehicles. And then the second piece that that rule does, the proposal does, is to clarify that a binding fare quote is required for passengers who provide a destination in the livery world, whether or not that call or that request is initiated by telephone or by an app.

And then finally, it's a street hail livery roof light rule to clarify that if you take your meter out of your street hail

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

10

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

is equipped with that technology.

The first speaker for this rule is
Janice Schacter Lintz.

THE CHAIR: And I apologize, Janice,
in my introduction I spoke so much about
the driver protection, I did not mention
the important other purpose of the proposed
rule to raise awareness about the hearing
loop that's in every taxi of tomorrow.

MS. SCHACTER LINTZ: Thank you,
Meera. You knew I would do it anyway.

Hello. My name is Janice Schacter
Lintz, and I am the CEO of Hearing Access
and Innovations, formally known as the
Hearing Access Program which spearheaded
the hearing induction program with the Taxi
& Limousine Commission about 11 years ago.
I am also the mother of a now 20-year-old
daughter who is hard of hearing. I am
confining my comments solely to hearing
access, since I do not have the expertise
to weigh in on the other issues.

I applaud and I mean applaud the TLC
for installing induction loops for people

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

11

Proceedings

1
2 who are hard of hearing. New York City is
3 the very first city in this country to add
4 hearing induction loops to its taxis for
5 people who are hard of hearing and for-hire
6 vehicles such as taxis. I also fully
7 support the proposed rule, which I will not
8 read every single rule, to add hearing
9 induction loop signage both inside and
10 outside the taxis and other vehicles which
11 is consistent with the pilot project.

12 The above rules are critical.
13 Passengers are unaware of hearing induction
14 loops existence or even if a person is
15 aware of the loop presence, they don't know
16 which vehicle contains them. I was a
17 member of the Taxi of Tomorrow Committee
18 and even I had difficulty determining which
19 taxi had the loop on -- when NBC reporter
20 Contessa Brewer interviewed me.

21 The proposed rules recommend the
22 following signage of the ear with the slash
23 and the T in the lower right-hand corner
24 which we commend. This symbol was affixed
25 originally on the pilot program to the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

inside and the outside of the taxis and this symbol should be consistently added to the current taxis with hearing induction loops to both inside and outside the taxis. This is consistent with New York City Transit's subway information booth and call boxes. This symbol is used by museums, theaters, banks and retail shops that have hearing induction loops around New York City and the world. In my comments I submitted to the Commission, I document photographs with arrows to demonstrate those.

It is also the international symbol for hearing induction loops. Using the international symbol will benefit tourists who visit our city and who are familiar with the loop from their country or their travels. It is critical that the TLC use the globally recognized symbol for hearing induction loops.

We hope the Commission will support the proposed rules so that people who are hard of hearing will be aware of the

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

13

Proceedings

1
2 hearing induction loop's existence and
3 presence. The loops cannot be used if
4 passengers who are hard of hearing are
5 unaware it exists and do not know which
6 vehicle contains it. Otherwise it defeats
7 the purpose of installing the loop. It
8 will also benefit drivers who have a
9 hearing loss and allow them to continue
10 working, which we can all agree keeping
11 people employed is a good thing. Thank you
12 very much for your time.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

14 MR. WILSON: Thank you. And the
15 next speaker is Jerry Bergman.

16 MR. BERGMAN: Thank you for giving
17 me this opportunity today and especially
18 thanks to the Commission for taking this
19 initiative. I am a severe profoundly
20 impaired person with hearing loss. I wear
21 both a cochlear implant and a hearing aid
22 and I cannot tell you how enthusiastic the
23 Hearing Loss Association of America's New
24 York Chapter appreciates what you're doing.

25 The problem we have is not only

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

14

1 Proceedings

2 communicating in public, but being aware of
3 access for communicating when we have
4 hearing loss. We wear telecoils in our
5 hearing aids, but unless a facility is
6 looped as the taxis will hopefully be on
7 the streets, we have no way of
8 communicating in many situations.

9 I'd like to read you a letter
10 quickly that I just received via e-mail
11 which was sent to the Commission. "I'm
12 profoundly hard of hearing and wearing two
13 hearing aids with t-switches. Installing
14 audio loops in the taxis would make it
15 possible for me to hear and understand
16 drivers. Recently, I asked the driver to
17 take me to the East Side of Manhattan.
18 Although he repeated my instructions, I did
19 not hear him say West Side. I realized he
20 had not understood me, only when he stopped
21 at Amsterdam instead of Park Avenue. I
22 would have been able to hear him and
23 correct his mistake if there was an audio
24 loop in the car."

25 I want to add that there's an

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

15

Proceedings

1
2 estimated 1.6 million people in New York
3 City with hearing loss. Not all of them
4 have hearing aids, not all of them wear
5 t-coils in their hearing aids. There are
6 also 10.8 million people we estimate who
7 have hearing loss who come as visitors to
8 our city every year. The fact that you
9 will be putting decals, we hope, on the
10 outside and the inside of the vehicles will
11 not only help those with t-coils today to
12 communicate with the drivers, but will also
13 signal that this technology exists because
14 many people who are fitted for hearing
15 devices are not told about the telecoil and
16 how it works. So following the lead of the
17 New York City subway system, this is the
18 second major step for New York City in the
19 right direction for the invisible
20 disability, which hearing loss is. I
21 commend you all for that.

22 And the Hearing Loss Association
23 stands ready, I stand ready to consult and
24 assist in any way we can. I heard the
25 Commissioners -- the Chair, rather, speak

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

16

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

about your educational efforts. Anything we can help you do to get the word out about the accessibility of loop taxis as they come on the streets, we'll be more than happy to do. Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. And the next speaker is Erhan Tuncel.

MR. TUNCEL: Good morning, Chairwoman Joshi, Commissioners. My name is Erhan Tuncel. I'm the Managing Director of League of Mutual Taxi Owners. Thank you for allowing me to testify today.

I want to support all efforts to provide service to the hearing impaired public and inform that with hearing induction decals. And we want to also support to propose TLC rules to require stickers to inform passengers that assaulting a driver is punishable by up to 25 years in prison. It will help protect taxi drivers. There's no doubt about that.

I would like to take this opportunity once again, to thank

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

17

Proceedings

1
2 Councilmember Lancman and his colleagues in
3 the New York City Council for all their
4 efforts. New York City buses have similar
5 signs posted on the exterior of the buses.
6 We believe that the sticker should be
7 posted on the exterior of the taxis as well
8 as the interior. Exterior signs will reach
9 out to much bigger crowd, therefore have a
10 greater effect and inform the public of the
11 consequences of assaulting taxi drivers and
12 help change minds of those people who tend
13 to do harm even before they get into taxis.
14 We would like to see these stickers posted
15 on both the interior and the exterior of
16 the taxis. Thank you for your time.

17 MR. WILSON: Thank you. The next
18 speaker is Bill Lindauer.

19 MR. LINDAUER: I'm with the New York
20 Taxi Workers Alliance. Our Executive
21 Director, Bhairavi Desai wanted to be here
22 but she's in at Atlanta for the Executive
23 Council meeting of the AFL-CIO where she's
24 a member of the Executive Council. So I'm
25 speaking in her -- instead.

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

18

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Of course, it is the Alliance that should get the great credit for pushing, deceiving on this act and pushing the State Legislature and the City Council to finally pass it, and we want to thank Rory Lancman who, when he was in the State Legislature and now with the City Council, was the leader in pushing this great measure. And I want to thank the TLC, of course, which I don't have occasion to thank too often unfortunately, but for supporting this.

Now, my only objection, I guess I could support it on the outside, but it's not critical, I don't think, but of course the inside sticker now, you propose a 7 by 1 inch sticker. This is 7 by 1, kind of puny, huh, I don't think it would be effective. I think a larger one, like this is 3 by 4 on my right, and this is 5 by 5. I think a sticker that size, and I don't know if there's any iridescent type or paint that could be used because we want to make sure it's visible at night because that's when I think most of the crimes take

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

19

1 Proceedings

2 place and we want to make sure that
3 passengers clearly see this in a dark cab,
4 you know.

5 So that's all I want to say. And I
6 just think the implementation is important,
7 and this is too little. And you don't ask
8 for -- you don't say what the size of the
9 type will be or the font, and maybe that's
10 important too. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

12 MR. LINDAUER: I don't think my
13 colleagues are here to testify.

14 MR. WILSON: Mr. Simmons and
15 Mr. Akhter?

16 MR. LINDAUER: Right. They're not
17 here. Sorry.

18 MR. WILSON: Those were the only
19 other remaining speakers on this rule.

20 So I guess we can move forward to
21 public hearing for the next rule. Next on
22 the agenda is a rule clarifying several
23 points regarding bases dispatching
24 non-affiliated vehicles which were the
25 subject of rulemaking in November.

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

20

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Specifically, these rules clarify that black car bases can dispatch both black cars and luxury limousines, and luxury limousines bases can dispatch both black cars and luxury limousines. The provisions, only livery bases can dispatch livery based. Livery vehicles remain unchanged. And finally, as the Commissioner said, they also provide passengers and liveries who book their trips other than by telephone must be given the opportunity for a binding fare quote and at booking the trip a livery must permit passengers with an estimation and notify passengers that doing so guarantees them a binding fare quote and also provides them a binding fare quote.

These rules were published in the City record on January 20th, 2015 with a comment deadline of February 23rd. Two written comments were received, all of them distributed and sent out to the Commissioners. And the first speaker on this rule is Richard Thaler.

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

21

Proceedings

1
2 MR. THALER: Chair Joshi,
3 Commissioners, Counsel, my name is
4 Richard Thaler. As stated in the written
5 comments, regarding the proposed amendment
6 to Chapter 59B-17D permitting an FHV base
7 to dispatch a trip to a non-affiliated FHV
8 and allow the non-affiliated driver to
9 accept the trip, the terms of the amendment
10 should be modified to avoid conflicts with
11 longstanding TLC rules for dispatching and
12 franchising requiring exclusive dispatching
13 under franchise agreements.

14 As it stands, the affiliated base is
15 not notified that a dispatch will be sent
16 and could be accepted by an affiliated FHV
17 driver, since it is the non-affiliated base
18 that will be required to notify the
19 passenger of the base, names and the FHV
20 license. Accordingly, the non-affiliated
21 bases should be required to first notify
22 the affiliated bases of the intention to
23 send dispatch offers to FHVs affiliated
24 with the bases, and it should be the
25 affiliated bases' responsibility to deny or

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

22

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

approve the dispatch by sending the passengers the information required under the amendment before the dispatches are allowed to be sent. Since the non-affiliated bases are the dispatching bases, they should be responsible for submitting the trip data to the TLC with a copy to the affiliated bases.

I neglected to add to the written comments one other issue, and that is the passenger is a passenger of the non-affiliated base. So the non-affiliated base should charge the passenger for the trip. But in compliance with the affiliation and franchise agreements, the non-affiliated base should pay the affiliated base their rate, the affiliated bases's rate for that trip, and the affiliated base should pay their affiliated driver the rate for that trip. Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. The next speaker is Ed Cleary.

MR. CLEARY: Good morning, Commissioners. Hello. My name is

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Ed Cleary. I'm representing Avik Kabessa, the CEO of Carmel and a Board Member of the Livery Round Table with regard to the proposed rules relating to the fare quotations for livery bases and cross-class dispatch.

The proposed rule will require a livery base to provide passengers with an opportunity to receive a binding fare when receiving a dispatch from a method other than a telephone call. Our concern today is that the proposed language as written can be interpreted to require an app to provide a written notification to the customer about a binding fare quote, but not actually provide the binding fare when making a reservation outside the telephone call.

An app is just another means by which a passenger can reserve a car and the rule that currently exists for providing a binding quote when requesting a livery service should apply with apps as well. Having said that, if the Commission still

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

wishes to allow waiving that requirement when it comes to apps, the waiving of the right for binding quotes should be an opportunity and not the requirement to provide the binding quote.

In plain language, we believe that the app used to book livery service must come with a binding fare quotation as its primary feature. In regards to the cross-class --

THE CHAIR: I'm sorry. Can I just ask you one question on this?

MR. CLEARY: Sure.

THE CHAIR: Is the underlying -- because I read your -- I think you had a press release yesterday, and then we're getting your comments today.

MR. CLEARY: Yes.

THE CHAIR: Is the underlying base assumption that you're starting from, is that every livery customer must provide a destination, whether it's call, app, whatever method of communication they have with the base, they must include a

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

destination?

MR. CLEARY: I think what we're really saying is that if they do give a destination, they should get a binding fare.

THE CHAIR: They must. They must get a binding fare.

MR. CLEARY: They must get a binding fare, correct. If they don't give a destination, obviously then it would not be possible to give a binding fare, but we want to make it clear that as default, binding fare should be a necessary component if a customer puts a call through the app.

THE CHAIR: So how would, and I don't know if you've had a chance to look at the actual language of the rule, what is it about the actual language of the rule that you think would achieve that? Because I think under the rule it says that the app must provide an opportunity for the destination and make it clear that once you give a destination you're entitled to a

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

26

1 Proceedings

2 binding fare quote.

3 MR. CLEARY: I don't want to answer
4 it in too much particular on certain items
5 here because I'm speaking on behalf of the
6 Livery Round Table, so I would rather
7 someone else and maybe get back to you on
8 that answer.

9 THE CHAIR: Because it's helpful
10 especially on something like this where my
11 sense is we're actually not far apart. If
12 we get the comments earlier, you know, that
13 way we can actually have, you know,
14 productive conversation.

15 MR. CLEARY: I understand.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

17 MR. CLEARY: -- in regards to the
18 cross-class dispatch. On the issue of
19 allowing cross-class dispatch between black
20 car and luxury limousine, the Commission
21 uses the fact that both luxury limousines
22 and black car belong to the same workman's
23 comp fund as the justification for allowing
24 cross dispatch. We believe it to be a
25 gross misrepresentation to the riding

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

27

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

public as well as discriminatory to luxury limousines and black car bases that do not belong to the Black Car Fund.

First, not all black cars and not all luxury limousines belong to the Black Car Fund. So using the Black Car Fund as the criteria that will allow cross dispatch will leave a number of vehicles left in limbo. But even more important, allowing the riding public to be served by these two classes as if they are one is misleading because these two classes do not come with the same passenger insurance coverage.

While black car liability insurance coverages of \$300,000 and \$100,000, the luxury limousine coverage is of \$1 million, which is a requirement of the TLC for a luxury limousine coverage to be defined as a luxury limousine base.

A passenger that books a ride with a luxury limousine base pays the luxury limousine rates that are based on a \$1 million insurance coverage. But if this passenger is being dispatched to a black

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

car and it's involved in an accident, the passenger is only covered up to the \$300,000 insurance limit of the black car.

In summary, we believe that an app used to book livery service should have the binding fare quotation as its primary feature and not as an option, and that no cross dispatch between classes should be allowed, at least not under the very narrow scope of the driver's workman's comp fund similarity, which monopolizes the black car fund, discriminates against bases that do not belong to the fund, and most importantly it places unsuspecting passengers under lower insurance coverage.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. And I just wanted to point out that if that is as to the anticipation in the Black Car Fund, the rule doesn't distinguish between black cars are members of the fund or not, so they're not discriminated against in terms of their ability to dispatch other vehicles. I just wanted to clarify that.

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

29

1 Proceedings

2 MR. CLEARY: Thank you.

3 MR. WILSON: And the next speaker is
4 Tarek Mallah.

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He's running
6 late.

7 MR. WILSON: Okay.

8 Then the speaker after that is
9 Tweeps Phillips.

10 MS. GALVANI: I'm going to be
11 reading Tweeps's testimony on behalf of her
12 this morning. My name is Christy Galvani.

13 Good morning, Chair Joshi and
14 Commissioners. On behalf of the Committee
15 for Taxi Safety, we want to thank the
16 Commission for having this hearing on the
17 topic of cross dispatching. The Committee
18 would like to stress that if you permit
19 limousines and black cars to cross
20 dispatch, there must be very close
21 oversight and further tightening of
22 regulations.

23 It is not enough for the bases to
24 have a private agreement. It is imperative
25 for us to know which cars are being

1 Proceedings

2 dispatched to whom, which would require the
3 application of a realtime trip monitor or
4 portal into the existing TLC and black car
5 cross referencing data systems. With the
6 well capitalized and automated systems the
7 black car bases like Uber have, this should
8 not pose an issue. In fact, it would be
9 simple to require a portal so you, as our
10 regulators and consumers have realtime
11 access to important information when, for
12 example, property is lost or an accident
13 occurs.

14 And recent new stories have provided
15 that Uber has been quick to say that they
16 are not responsible when accidents occur,
17 claiming that they are a technology app,
18 not a transportation company. Of course we
19 know that the distinction is made only when
20 it suites their needs at a given time.
21 This leaves the consumer at a great
22 disadvantage.

23 Additionally, not all black car
24 services are the same. Different vehicles
25 may be utilized by different bases.

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

31

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Different levels of service may be both expected and provided. Passengers should not be uniformed as to changes in vehicles or which base is actually dispatching to -- sorry, passengers should not be uninformed as to changes in vehicles or which base is actually dispatching to them.

When consent across dispatch is requested from a passenger, the passenger should be informed as to these basic facts before making a decision to accept the cross base dispatch. Thank you again for the opportunity to testify on the rules before you today.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. The next speaker, I believe is Eugene Evans.

(No response.)

MR. WILSON: The next speaker is Michael Arvanites.

MR. ARVANITES: Good morning, Chair and Commissioners. My name is Michael Arvanites. I'll be reading this on behalf of Ira Goldstein and on behalf of

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

32

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Black Car Assistance Corporation and the
New York Black Car Operators Injury
Compensation Fund, Inc.

I want to thank the TLC for this
opportunity to comment on the proposed
amendments to the for-hire dispatch rules
and allow black car bases and luxury limo
bases to cross dispatch each others
categories vehicles. We agree and support
the proposed amendments on the same basis
of the TLC's legal analysis and the
statement of basis of purpose for the
proposed rules in that because of the
substantially similar regulations that
govern black cars and luxury limousines and
the fact that their drivers are covered by
the same workers' compensation scheme.
Black car bases and luxury limousine bases
should be allowed to dispatch each others
vehicles. In fact, today's proposed rule
properly reflect conversations with the
TLC's staff prior to the rules promulgated
by the TLC in November of 2014.

We'd like to thank Chairwoman Joshi

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

33

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

and General Counsel Christopher Wilson for taking prompt action when this oversight was brought to their attention.

Finally, there were some BCAC members that were concerned that rules as approved in November 2014 did not sufficiently shift liability to the dispatching base from the affiliated base. With the amendments that allow a vehicle to be dispatched by multiple bases, the TLC's legal department responded properly with a letter clarifying that the liability in all instances of a vehicle being dispatched in violation of the TLC rules would lie with the dispatching base. Attached to my testimony is a copy of the Assistant General Counsel Ryan -- I might mispronounce his name -- Rantanges (phonetic), a February 18th, 2015 letter clarifying the situation. On behalf of the BCAC and the Black Car Fund, I thank you for your time and consideration.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. I'll call again for Mr. Mallah. Is he here?

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

34

1 Proceedings

2 (No response.)

3 MR. WILSON: I think we'll move on
4 then to the next rule hearing. And the
5 last hearing -- the last set of rules today
6 are proposed rules that we require that
7 roof lights in green street hail liveries
8 be unlit whenever a taxi meter is detached.
9 These rules are intended to help passengers
10 more clearly identify vehicles available
11 for service.

12 These rules were published in the
13 City record on January 20th, 2015 with a
14 comment deadline of February 23rd. Two
15 written comments were received, all of
16 which were provided to the Commissioners.

17 We have one speaker for this rule.
18 Mr. Erhan Tuncel.

19 MR. TUNCEL: Good morning,
20 Commissioners, once again. My name is
21 Erhan Tuncel.

22 Some time ago, it came to our
23 attention that some SHL drivers had figured
24 out a way to bypass the geofencing
25 enforcement. I wanted to acknowledge this

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

35

Proceedings

1
2 and appreciate the efforts of TLC and staff
3 in coordinating a path to the solution and
4 fully expose the amendments to the
5 applicable TLC rules, which will stop SHL
6 drivers from being able to put their roof
7 lights on while in Manhattan exclusionary
8 zone. By detaching the meter from its
9 bracket, we're going to bypass the
10 geofencing enforcement.

11 However, we believe that in order to
12 make sure that an SHL roof light is giving
13 the correct message, the all hail
14 exclusionary zones, more needs to be done.
15 SHL hail exclusionary zone is extended
16 beyond Manhattan and includes the airports.
17 While SHLs are permitted to pick up at the
18 airports, they're limited to picking up
19 passengers on prearranged calls only and
20 since a lit roof light signals availability
21 to hail passengers, they do not need to
22 have their roof lights on at the airports.
23 The law requires that SHL roof lights are
24 turned off when occupied with passengers
25 destined for airports and when they are are

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

36

1 Proceedings

2 on their way to airports to answer
3 prearranged calls. However, nothing
4 prevents the roof light from coming on
5 after the SHL driver drops passengers off
6 at the airport.

7 Since instruction of the geofencing
8 enforcement prevents it from being applied
9 at the airports, we would like to see the
10 proposed changes to the rules which govern
11 the operation of SHL roof lights include an
12 additional change which would require all
13 unoccupied SHL drivers to dim their roof
14 lights after dropping passengers off at the
15 airports. This will ensure that all
16 unoccupied SHL roof lights get turned off
17 in all hail exclusionary zones.

18 Thank you. My testimony reflects my
19 comments that was sent to you,
20 Commissioner, earlier. And apparently
21 maybe we do have time to have a little
22 conversation on this, we can do something.

23 THE CHAIR: We're not having the
24 vote today, so we've got 30 days until
25 we'll probably vote on this, so we can

Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015

37

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

follow-up, we're available.

MR. TUNCEL: All right. Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. And let me
note for the record that
Commissioner Polanco joined the meeting at
10:40 a.m.

And I think that's all. And I think
that concludes the hearing since we don't
have a quorum.

THE CHAIR: So today's hearing ends
at 10:45.

(Time noted: 10:45 a.m.)

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

A		
a.m (3) 2:2 37:7,13	app (9) 8:22 23:14,20 24:8,23 25:16,22 28:5 30:17	Beaver (1) 1:11
ability (2) 28:24 38:13	apparently (1) 36:20	behalf (6) 26:5 29:11,14 31:25,25 33:21
able (2) 14:22 35:6	applaud (2) 10:24,24	believe (6) 17:6 24:7 26:24 28:5 31:18 35:11
accept (2) 21:9 31:12	applicable (1) 35:5	belong (4) 26:22 27:4,6 28:14
accepted (1) 21:16	Applicant (1) 2:11	benefit (2) 12:17 13:8
access (6) 3:3 10:14,16,22 14:3 30:11	application (1) 30:3	Bergman (3) 3:5 13:15,16
accessibility (1) 16:4	applications (1) 7:9	best (1) 38:13
accident (2) 28:2 30:12	applied (1) 36:8	beyond (1) 35:16
accidents (1) 30:16	apply (1) 23:24	Bhairavi (1) 17:21
achieve (1) 25:21	appreciate (1) 35:2	bigger (1) 17:9
acknowledge (1) 34:25	appreciates (1) 13:24	Bill (2) 3:7 17:18
act (1) 18:4	approve (1) 22:2	binding (18) 8:18 20:13,17,18 23:10,16,17,23 24:4,6,9 25:5,8,9 25:12,14 26:2 28:7
action (2) 33:3 38:15	approved (1) 33:7	bit (1) 4:6
action (2) 33:3 38:15	apps (2) 23:24 24:3	black (28) 8:5,12 20:3,3,5 26:19,22 27:3,4,5,6,7,15,25 28:4,12,20,21 29:19 30:4,7,23 32:2,3,8,16,19 33:22
actual (2) 25:19,20	Arout (1) 2:6	blood (1) 38:15
add (4) 11:3,8 14:25 22:10	arrows (1) 12:13	Board (1) 23:3
added (1) 12:3	Arvanites (4) 3:13 31:21,22,24	book (3) 20:11 24:8 28:6
additional (1) 36:12	asked (1) 14:16	booking (1) 20:14
Additionally (1) 30:23	assaulted (1) 7:18	books (1) 27:21
adhere (1) 5:20	assaulting (3) 9:20 16:21 17:11	booth (1) 12:7
adoption (1) 7:8	assist (2) 9:24 15:24	BOROUGH (1) 1:13
affiliated (11) 21:14,16,22,23,25 22:9,18,18,20,20 33:9	Assistance (1) 32:2	boxes (1) 12:8
affiliation (1) 22:16	Assistant (1) 33:17	bracket (1) 35:9
affixed (1) 11:24	Association (2) 13:23 15:22	branding (2) 4:19 5:3
AFL-CIO (1) 17:23	assumption (1) 24:21	Brewer (1) 11:20
agenda (1) 19:22	Atlanta (1) 17:22	brought (1) 33:4
ago (2) 10:18 34:22	Attached (1) 33:16	buses (2) 17:4,5
agree (2) 13:10 32:10	attacks (1) 7:21	bypass (2) 34:24 35:9
agreement (1) 29:24	attention (2) 33:4 34:23	
agreements (2) 21:13 22:16	audio (2) 14:14,23	C
ahead (1) 9:14	authorities (1) 5:7	C (2) 38:2,2
aid (1) 13:21	automated (1) 30:6	cab (4) 5:15,24 6:5 19:3
aids (4) 14:5,13 15:4,5	availability (1) 35:20	cabs (1) 8:7
airport (1) 36:6	available (4) 6:25 9:9 34:10 37:2	call (8) 8:21 9:14 12:7 23:12,19 24:23 25:15 33:24
airports (7) 35:16,18,22,25 36:2,9 36:15	Avenue (2) 1:21 14:21	calls (2) 35:19 36:3
Akhter (1) 19:15	Avik (1) 23:2	capitalized (1) 30:6
Alliance (3) 3:7 17:20 18:2	avoid (1) 21:10	car (23) 8:12 14:24 20:3 23:21 26:20,22 27:3,4,7,7,15 28:2,4,12 28:20 30:4,7,23 32:2,3,8,19 33:22
allow (6) 13:9 21:8 24:2 27:8 32:8 33:10	aware (4) 7:5 11:15 12:25 14:2	Carmel (1) 23:3
allowed (3) 22:5 28:10 32:20	awareness (3) 4:22 6:13 10:9	cars (8) 8:5 20:4,6 27:5 28:21 29:19,25 32:16
allowing (4) 16:14 26:19,23 27:10		Cassella (3) 2:19 38:7,22
amazing (1) 5:6	B	categories (1) 32:10
amendment (3) 21:5,9 22:4	back (1) 26:7	Central (1) 5:17
amendments (4) 32:7,11 33:10 35:4	banks (1) 12:9	CEO (3) 3:3 10:14 23:3
America's (1) 13:23	base (21) 7:9 21:6,14,17,19 22:13 22:14,17,18,20 23:9 24:20,25 27:20,22 31:5,8,13 33:9,9,16	certain (1) 26:4
Amsterdam (1) 14:21	based (2) 20:8 27:23	certify (2) 38:9,14
analysis (1) 32:12	bases (21) 19:23 20:3,5,7 21:21,22 21:24 22:6,7,9 23:6 27:3 28:13 29:23 30:7,25 32:8,9,19,19 33:11	
answer (3) 26:3,8 36:2	bases' (1) 21:25	
ANTI-ASSAULT (1) 3:2	bases's (1) 22:19	
anticipation (1) 28:20	basic (1) 31:11	
anyway (1) 10:12	basis (2) 32:11,13	
apart (1) 26:11	BCAC (2) 33:5,22	
apologize (1) 10:5	bear (1) 5:9	

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

2

Chair (21) 2:5 4:2 10:5 13:13 15:25
16:7 19:11 21:2 24:12,15,20 25:7
25:17 26:9,16 28:17 29:13 31:16
31:22 36:23 37:11
Chair's (1) 4:13
Chairwoman (2) 16:11 32:25
chance (1) 25:18
change (2) 17:12 36:12
changes (3) 31:4,7 36:10
Chapter (2) 13:24 21:6
charge (1) 22:14
charging (1) 7:2
choose (1) 4:17
Chris (4) 2:10 7:12 9:11,13
Christopher (2) 2:11 33:2
Christy (2) 3:12 29:12
city (17) 1:3 7:22 11:2,3 12:6,11,18
15:3,8,17,18 17:3,4 18:5,8 20:20
34:13
claiming (1) 30:17
clarifies (1) 8:9
clarify (4) 8:18,24 20:2 28:25
clarifying (3) 19:22 33:13,21
class (1) 8:16
classes (3) 27:12,13 28:9
clear (2) 25:13,24
clearly (3) 3:11 19:3 34:10
Cleary (11) 22:23,24 23:2 24:14,19
25:3,9 26:3,15,17 29:2
close (1) 29:20
cochlear (1) 13:21
cold (2) 5:16 6:16
colleagues (2) 17:2 19:13
come (5) 9:12 15:7 16:5 24:9 27:13
comes (1) 24:3
coming (1) 36:4
commend (2) 11:24 15:21
comment (3) 20:21 32:6 34:14
comments (9) 10:21 12:11 20:22
21:5 22:11 24:18 26:12 34:15
36:19
Commission (11) 1:4,12 7:2 10:18
12:12,23 13:18 14:11 23:25
26:20 29:16
Commissioner (5) 4:7,8 20:10
36:20 37:6
Commissioners (11) 2:4 7:4 15:25
16:11 20:24 21:3 22:25 29:14
31:23 34:16,20
Committee (3) 11:17 29:14,17
communicate (1) 15:12
communicating (3) 14:2,3,8
communication (1) 24:24
community (1) 5:2
Commute (1) 4:18
commuter (6) 4:14,22,24 5:7,9 8:6
comp (2) 26:23 28:11

company (3) 8:12,12 30:18
compel (1) 6:24
compensation (3) 8:14 32:4,18
compliance (1) 22:15
component (1) 25:15
concern (1) 23:12
concerned (1) 33:6
concludes (1) 37:9
confining (1) 10:21
conflicts (1) 21:10
consent (1) 31:9
consequences (1) 17:11
consideration (1) 33:23
considered (2) 7:2 8:11
consistent (2) 11:11 12:6
consistently (1) 12:3
consult (1) 15:23
consumer (1) 30:21
consumers (1) 30:10
contains (2) 11:16 13:6
Contessa (1) 11:20
continue (1) 13:9
CONVENED (1) 2:2
conversation (2) 26:14 36:22
conversations (1) 32:22
coordinating (1) 35:3
copy (2) 22:9 33:17
corner (1) 11:23
Corporation (1) 32:2
correct (3) 14:23 25:10 35:13
Council (6) 7:23 17:3,23,24 18:5,8
Councilmember (1) 17:2
Counsel (4) 2:10 21:3 33:2,18
country (2) 11:3 12:19
COUNTY (1) 38:5
course (4) 18:2,10,15 30:18
coverage (5) 27:14,17,19,24 28:16
coverages (1) 27:16
covered (2) 28:3 32:17
credit (1) 18:3
crimes (1) 18:25
criminal (1) 7:17
criteria (1) 27:8
critical (3) 11:12 12:20 18:15
cross (8) 26:24 27:8 28:9 29:17,19
30:5 31:13 32:9
cross-class (6) 8:10,11 23:6 24:11
26:18,19
crowd (1) 17:9
current (1) 12:4
currently (1) 23:22
customer (3) 23:16 24:22 25:15

D

dark (1) 19:3
data (2) 22:8 30:5
daughter (1) 10:20

day (2) 6:17 38:19
days (1) 36:24
deadline (2) 20:21 34:14
deaths (1) 7:21
decal (3) 4:17 5:10 9:25
decals (2) 15:9 16:18
deceiving (1) 18:4
December (1) 6:22
decision (2) 7:5 31:12
default (1) 25:13
defeats (1) 13:6
defined (1) 27:19
demonstrate (1) 12:13
deny (1) 21:25
department (1) 33:12
Desai (1) 17:21
description (1) 7:13
destination (7) 8:20 24:23 25:2,5
25:11,24,25
destined (1) 35:25
detached (1) 34:8
detaching (1) 35:8
determining (1) 11:18
devices (1) 15:15
different (3) 30:24,25 31:2
difficulty (1) 11:18
dim (1) 36:13
direction (1) 15:19
Director (5) 2:11 3:6,16 16:12
17:21
disability (1) 15:20
disadvantage (1) 30:22
discriminated (1) 28:23
discriminates (1) 28:13
discriminatory (1) 27:2
dispatch (25) 3:9 8:8,11,12 20:3,5
20:7 21:7,15,23 22:2 23:7,11
26:18,19,24 27:8 28:9,24 29:20
31:9,13 32:7,9,20
dispatched (4) 27:25 30:2 33:11
33:14
dispatches (1) 22:4
dispatching (10) 8:10 19:23 21:11
21:12 22:6 29:17 31:5,8 33:9,16
distinction (1) 30:19
distinguish (1) 28:21
distributed (1) 20:23
document (1) 12:12
doing (2) 13:24 20:16
doubt (1) 16:23
driver (12) 3:2 6:5,8 7:16 9:21 10:7
14:16 16:21 21:8,17 22:21 36:5
driver's (1) 28:11
drivers (15) 4:23 5:21 6:2 7:18,20
7:22 13:8 14:16 15:12 16:23
17:11 32:17 34:23 35:6 36:13
dropping (1) 36:14

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

<p>drops (1) 36:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <hr/> <p>E (2) 38:2,2 e-mail (2) 1:22 14:10 ear (1) 11:22 earlier (2) 26:12 36:20 East (1) 14:17 Ed (3) 3:11 22:23 23:2 educational (1) 16:2 Edward (1) 2:7 effect (1) 17:10 effective (1) 18:19 efforts (4) 16:2,15 17:4 35:2 elevate (1) 4:21 Elias (1) 2:6 employed (1) 13:11 encouraged (1) 5:22 encouraging (2) 5:20 6:13 ends (1) 37:11 enforcement (3) 34:25 35:10 36:8 ensure (1) 36:15 enthusiastic (1) 13:22 entitled (1) 25:25 equipped (1) 10:2 Erhan (6) 3:6,16 16:9,12 34:18,21 especially (2) 13:17 26:10 estimate (1) 15:6 estimated (1) 15:2 estimation (1) 20:15 Eugene (1) 31:18 Evans (1) 31:18 everybody (2) 5:20 8:4 example (1) 30:12 exclusionary (5) 9:5 35:7,14,15 36:17 exclusive (1) 21:12 Executive (3) 17:20,22,24 existence (2) 11:14 13:2 existing (1) 30:4 exists (3) 13:5 15:13 23:22 expected (1) 31:3 expertise (1) 10:22 expose (1) 35:4 extended (1) 35:15 exterior (4) 17:5,7,8,15 extinguish (1) 9:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>F (1) 38:2 facility (1) 14:5 FACSIMILE (1) 1:23 fact (5) 15:8 26:21 30:8 32:17,21 facts (1) 31:11 fair (1) 25:12 familiar (1) 12:18 far (1) 26:11</p>	<p>fare (15) 8:19 20:13,17,18 23:5,10 23:16,17 24:9 25:6,8,10,14 26:2 28:7 faster (2) 5:23,23 feature (2) 24:10 28:8 February (6) 1:10 5:14 7:6 20:21 33:20 34:14 FHV (6) 3:9 8:8 21:6,7,16,19 FHVs (1) 21:23 figured (1) 34:23 finally (5) 6:22 8:23 18:5 20:9 33:5 first (8) 7:13 9:15,17 10:3 11:3 20:24 21:21 27:5 fitted (1) 15:14 fliers (3) 5:17 6:12,18 FLOOR (1) 1:12 focus (1) 4:20 follow-up (1) 37:2 following (2) 11:22 15:16 font (1) 19:9 for-hire (2) 11:5 32:7 formal (1) 7:13 formally (1) 10:15 forward (1) 19:20 franchise (2) 21:13 22:16 franchising (1) 21:12 fully (2) 11:6 35:4 fund (12) 8:14 26:23 27:4,7,7 28:11,13,14,20,22 32:4 33:22 further (2) 29:21 38:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <hr/> <p>Galvani (3) 3:12 29:10,12 general (4) 2:10 6:14 33:2,18 geofencing (3) 34:24 35:10 36:7 getting (1) 24:18 give (6) 6:4 7:12 25:4,10,12,25 given (2) 20:12 30:20 giving (2) 13:16 35:12 globally (1) 12:21 go (3) 5:22,23 7:10 going (5) 4:3 5:11 9:10 29:10 35:9 Goldstein (1) 31:25 Gonzales (1) 2:7 good (8) 4:2 6:8 13:11 16:10 22:24 29:13 31:22 34:19 govern (2) 32:16 36:10 Grand (1) 5:16 great (4) 7:20 18:3,9 30:21 greater (1) 17:10 green (3) 4:20 8:7 34:7 gross (1) 26:25 guarantees (1) 20:16 guess (2) 18:13 19:20</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <hr/> <p>hail (8) 8:23,25 9:4 34:7 35:13,15</p>	<p>35:21 36:17 hand (1) 38:19 handed (1) 5:17 happen (1) 9:6 happy (1) 16:6 hard (7) 9:24 10:20 11:2,5 12:25 13:4 14:12 harm (1) 17:13 hear (3) 14:15,19,22 heard (1) 15:24 hearing (49) 1:12 2:2 3:2,3 7:11 9:16,23,24 10:9,14,16,17,20,21 11:2,4,5,8,13 12:4,10,16,21,25 13:2,4,9,20,21,23 14:4,5,12,13 15:3,4,5,7,14,20,22 16:16,17 19:21 29:16 34:4,5 37:9,11 hearings (3) 4:9 7:10 9:11 Hello (2) 10:13 22:25 help (5) 15:11 16:3,22 17:12 34:9 helpful (1) 26:9 hereunto (1) 38:18 high (1) 6:10 hope (2) 12:23 15:9 hopefully (2) 6:16 14:6 horrendous (1) 7:21 hour (1) 5:18 huh (1) 18:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <hr/> <p>identified (1) 9:25 identify (1) 34:10 illegal (1) 4:23 immediately (1) 9:3 impaired (2) 13:20 16:16 imperative (1) 29:24 implant (1) 13:21 implementation (1) 19:6 implements (1) 9:17 important (7) 6:20 8:3 10:8 19:6 19:10 27:10 30:11 importantly (1) 28:15 in-taxi (1) 6:24 inch (1) 18:17 include (3) 6:25 24:25 36:11 includes (1) 35:16 induction (11) 10:17,25 11:4,9,13 12:4,10,16,22 13:2 16:18 inform (3) 16:17,20 17:10 information (3) 12:7 22:3 30:11 informed (1) 31:11 initiated (1) 8:22 initiative (2) 6:15 13:19 Injury (1) 32:3 Innovations (2) 3:4 10:15 inside (6) 7:15 11:9 12:2,5 15:10 18:16 installing (3) 10:25 13:7 14:13</p>
--	---	--

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

instances (1) 33:14
instruction (1) 36:7
instructions (1) 14:18
insurance (5) 27:14,15,24 28:4,16
intended (1) 34:9
intention (1) 21:22
interest (1) 5:6
interested (2) 6:12 38:16
interior (2) 17:8,15
international (2) 12:15,17
interpreted (1) 23:14
interviewed (1) 11:20
introduction (1) 10:6
invisible (1) 15:19
involved (1) 28:2
Ira (1) 31:25
iridescent (1) 18:22
issue (3) 22:11 26:18 30:8
issues (1) 10:23
items (1) 26:4

J

Janice (4) 3:3 10:4,5,13
January (2) 20:20 34:13
Jennifer (3) 2:19 38:7,22
Jerry (2) 3:5 13:15
joined (2) 4:6 37:6
Joshi (5) 2:5 16:11 21:2 29:13
 32:25
justification (1) 26:23

K

Kabessa (1) 23:2
keeping (1) 13:10
kind (1) 18:17
knew (1) 10:12
know (10) 5:25 11:15 13:5 18:22
 19:4 25:18 26:12,13 29:25 30:19
known (1) 10:15

L

Lancman (2) 17:2 18:6
language (4) 23:13 24:7 25:19,20
larger (1) 18:19
late (1) 29:6
Lauvienska (1) 2:8
law (3) 7:23 9:18 35:23
laws (1) 7:17
lead (1) 15:16
leader (1) 18:9
League (3) 3:6,16 16:13
leave (1) 27:9
leaves (1) 30:21
left (1) 27:9
legal (4) 4:22,24 32:12 33:12
Legislature (2) 18:5,7
letter (3) 14:9 33:13,20

levels (1) 31:2
liability (3) 27:15 33:8,13
license (2) 5:4 21:20
licensed (6) 4:24 5:2,7 7:24 9:18
 9:22
Licensing (1) 2:11
lie (1) 33:15
light (7) 3:15 8:24 9:2,7 35:12,20
 36:4
lights (7) 34:7 35:7,22,23 36:11,14
 36:16
limbo (1) 27:10
limit (3) 5:19 6:6 28:4
limited (1) 35:18
limo (2) 8:11 32:8
limos (1) 8:5
limousine (9) 1:4 10:18 26:20
 27:17,19,20,22,23 32:19
limousines (8) 20:4,5,6 26:21 27:3
 27:6 29:19 32:16
Lindauer (5) 3:7 17:18,19 19:12,16
Lintz (4) 3:3 10:4,11,14
lit (1) 35:20
little (4) 4:6 6:17 19:7 36:21
liveries (4) 8:4 9:4 20:11 34:7
livery (15) 8:20,24 9:2 20:7,8,8,14
 23:4,6,9,23 24:8,22 26:6 28:6
Local (1) 9:18
longer (1) 9:9
longstanding (1) 21:11
look (2) 9:7 25:18
looks (1) 5:3
loop (9) 3:2 10:10 11:9,15,19 12:19
 13:7 14:24 16:4
loop's (1) 13:2
looped (1) 14:6
loops (9) 10:25 11:4,14 12:5,10,16
 12:22 13:3 14:14
loss (8) 13:9,20,23 14:4 15:3,7,20
 15:22
lost (1) 30:12
lot (1) 5:3
lower (2) 11:23 28:16
lumped (1) 8:15
luxury (15) 20:4,4,6 26:20,21 27:2
 27:6,17,19,20,22,22 32:8,16,19

M

major (1) 15:18
making (5) 6:2,23 7:3 23:18 31:12
Mallah (2) 29:4 33:25
MAMARONECK (2) 1:21,21
Managing (3) 3:6,16 16:12
Manhattan (4) 1:13 14:17 35:7,16
March (1) 38:19
marriage (1) 38:16
matter (2) 38:11,17

Mayor's (1) 6:15
mean (1) 10:24
means (2) 5:8 23:20
measure (1) 18:9
Meera (2) 2:5 10:12
meeting (3) 4:4 17:23 37:6
member (3) 11:17 17:24 23:3
members (4) 4:12 8:13 28:22 33:6
mention (1) 10:7
message (2) 6:21 35:13
meter (4) 8:25 9:7 34:8 35:8
method (2) 23:11 24:24
Michael (3) 3:13 31:21,24
million (4) 15:2,6 27:17,24
minds (1) 17:12
minutes (1) 7:9
mirrors (1) 4:19
misleading (1) 27:12
mispronounce (1) 33:19
misrepresentation (1) 26:25
mistake (1) 14:23
modified (1) 21:10
monitor (1) 30:3
monopolizes (1) 28:12
morning (8) 4:2 5:16 16:10 22:24
 29:12,13 31:22 34:19
mother (1) 10:19
move (2) 19:20 34:3
multiple (1) 33:11
museums (1) 12:8
Mutual (3) 3:6,17 16:13

N

name (9) 9:14 10:13 16:11 21:3
 22:25 29:12 31:23 33:19 34:20
names (1) 21:19
narrow (1) 28:10
NBC (1) 11:19
necessary (2) 4:12 25:14
need (1) 35:21
needs (2) 30:20 35:14
neglected (1) 22:10
new (17) 1:3,21 3:7 11:2 12:6,10
 13:23 15:2,17,18 17:3,4,19 30:14
 32:3 38:4,8
night (1) 18:24
non-affiliated (9) 19:24 21:7,8,17
 21:20 22:6,13,13,17
Notary (1) 38:7
note (2) 4:4 37:5
noted (1) 37:13
notification (1) 23:15
notified (1) 21:15
notify (3) 20:16 21:18,21
November (4) 4:16 19:25 32:24
 33:7
number (2) 4:12 27:9

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

<p>NYC (1) 4:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <hr/> <p>objection (1) 18:13 obviously (1) 25:11 occasion (2) 9:5 18:11 occupied (1) 35:24 occur (1) 30:16 occurs (1) 30:13 offers (1) 21:23 Okay (1) 29:7 once (3) 16:25 25:24 34:20 operation (1) 36:11 Operators (1) 32:3 opportunity (8) 13:17 16:25 20:13 23:10 24:5 25:23 31:14 32:6 option (1) 28:8 order (3) 9:7,12 35:11 originally (1) 11:25 outcome (1) 38:17 outside (7) 5:16 11:10 12:2,5 15:10 18:14 23:18 oversight (2) 29:21 33:3 overwhelming (1) 5:13 owners (4) 3:6,17 4:24 16:13</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <hr/> <p>PAGE (3) 3:2,9,15 paint (1) 18:23 paratransits (1) 8:5 Park (1) 14:21 part (2) 4:25 5:8 particular (1) 26:4 parties (1) 38:15 pass (1) 18:6 passed (1) 7:23 passenger (11) 21:19 22:12,12,14 23:21 27:14,21,25 28:3 31:10,10 passengers (29) 4:21 5:18,19,22 6:3,3,14,20 8:19 9:8,24 11:13 13:4 16:20 19:3 20:11,15,16 22:3 23:9 28:16 31:3,6 34:9 35:19,21 35:24 36:5,14 path (1) 35:3 pay (2) 22:17,20 pays (1) 27:22 penalties (1) 9:20 people (10) 6:11,14 10:25 11:5 12:24 13:11 15:2,6,14 17:12 percent (2) 5:9 6:5 permit (2) 20:15 29:18 permitted (1) 35:17 permitting (1) 21:6 person (2) 11:14 13:20 petition (1) 6:23 Phillips (1) 29:9 phonetic (1) 33:20</p>	<p>photographs (1) 12:13 pick (2) 6:17 35:17 picking (1) 35:18 piece (1) 8:17 pilot (4) 4:15 5:13 11:11,25 piloting (1) 4:16 place (1) 19:2 places (1) 28:15 plain (1) 24:7 play (1) 5:25 pleased (2) 7:22,24 point (1) 28:19 points (1) 19:23 Polanco (4) 2:8 4:7,8 37:6 portal (2) 30:4,9 ports (1) 7:2 pose (1) 30:8 possible (2) 9:9 14:15 possibly (1) 25:12 posted (3) 17:5,7,14 prearranged (2) 35:19 36:3 presence (2) 11:15 13:3 PRESENT (2) 2:4,9 press (1) 24:17 prevents (2) 36:4,8 price (1) 6:9 pride (1) 4:25 primary (2) 24:10 28:7 prior (1) 32:23 prison (1) 16:22 private (1) 29:24 probably (2) 5:11 36:25 problem (1) 13:25 proceedings (37) 1:15 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:10,12 productive (1) 26:14 profoundly (2) 13:19 14:12 program (6) 4:21 5:5,8 10:16,17 11:25 project (1) 11:11 prompt (1) 33:3 promulgated (1) 32:23 properly (2) 32:22 33:12 property (1) 30:12 proposal (1) 8:18 proposals (1) 7:4 propose (3) 7:25 16:19 18:16 proposed (15) 4:10 10:8 11:7,21 12:24 21:5 23:5,8,13 32:6,11,14 32:21 34:6 36:10 protect (2) 7:17 16:22 protection (2) 3:2 10:7</p>	<p>protections (1) 7:16 provide (9) 8:20 16:16 20:10 23:9 23:15,17 24:6,22 25:23 provided (3) 30:14 31:3 34:16 provides (1) 20:17 providing (1) 23:22 provisions (1) 20:7 public (12) 2:14 5:25 7:11 9:16,20 14:2 16:17 17:10 19:21 27:2,11 38:7 published (2) 20:19 34:12 punishable (1) 16:21 puny (1) 18:18 purpose (3) 10:8 13:7 32:13 pushing (3) 18:3,4,9 put (2) 4:17 35:6 puts (1) 25:15 putting (1) 15:9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <hr/> <p>qualify (1) 6:8 question (1) 24:13 quick (1) 30:15 quickly (2) 5:11 14:10 quite (1) 6:16 quorum (4) 4:5,9 7:8 37:10 quotation (2) 24:9 28:7 quotations (1) 23:6 quote (8) 8:19 20:13,17,18 23:16 23:23 24:6 26:2 quotes (1) 24:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <hr/> <p>R (1) 38:2 raise (1) 10:9 Rantanges (1) 33:19 rare (1) 9:5 rate (3) 22:18,19,21 rates (1) 27:23 reach (1) 17:8 read (3) 11:8 14:9 24:16 reading (2) 29:11 31:24 ready (2) 15:23,23 reality (3) 8:2,2,3 realized (1) 14:19 really (2) 5:24 25:4 realtime (2) 30:3,10 receive (1) 23:10 received (4) 6:23 14:10 20:22 34:15 receiving (1) 23:11 recognized (1) 12:21 recommend (1) 11:21 record (4) 20:20 34:13 37:5 38:12 referencing (1) 30:5 reflect (1) 32:22 reflects (1) 36:18</p>
---	--	---

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

regard (1) 23:4
regarding (2) 19:23 21:5
regards (2) 24:10 26:17
regulations (2) 29:22 32:15
regulators (1) 30:10
rejected (1) 7:3
related (1) 38:14
relating (1) 23:5
release (1) 24:17
remain (1) 20:8
remaining (1) 19:19
remember (1) 6:8
remind (1) 6:20
reminder (1) 8:3
reminding (2) 5:17 7:16
repeated (1) 14:18
report (1) 4:14
reported (2) 2:19 38:10
reporter (1) 11:19
REPORTING (1) 1:20
representing (1) 23:2
request (1) 8:21
requested (1) 31:10
requesting (1) 23:23
require (8) 7:14 16:19 23:8,14 30:2
30:9 34:6 36:12
required (5) 4:11 8:19 21:18,21
22:3
requirement (3) 24:2,5 27:18
requires (2) 9:22 35:23
requiring (3) 7:23 9:18 21:12
reservation (1) 23:18
reserve (1) 23:21
responded (1) 33:12
response (2) 31:19 34:2
responsibility (1) 21:25
responsible (2) 22:7 30:16
retail (1) 12:9
review (1) 7:9
Richard (3) 3:10 20:25 21:4
RICHMOND (1) 38:5
ride (1) 27:21
riders (3) 5:15,24 7:16
riding (2) 26:25 27:11
right (5) 15:19 18:20 19:16 24:4
37:3
right-hand (1) 11:23
role (2) 5:19,25
roof (12) 3:15 8:24 34:7 35:6,12,20
35:22,23 36:4,11,13,16
ROOM (1) 1:12
Rory (1) 18:6
Round (2) 23:4 26:6
rule (30) 5:12 6:23 7:3,14 8:8,8,17
8:24 9:12,13,15,16,21 10:3,9
11:7,8 19:19,21,22 20:25 23:8,22
25:19,20,22 28:21 32:21 34:4,17

rulemaking (1) 19:25
rules (26) 3:2,9,15 4:10 7:11,25
11:12,21 12:24 16:19 20:2,19
21:11 23:5 31:14 32:7,14,23 33:6
33:15 34:5,6,9,12 35:5 36:10
running (1) 29:5
Ryan (1) 33:18

S

safer (1) 6:2
safety (3) 6:4,9 29:15
saying (1) 25:4
says (2) 4:18 25:22
Schacter (4) 3:3 10:4,11,13
scheme (1) 32:18
scope (1) 28:11
second (3) 8:17 9:21 15:18
see (3) 17:14 19:3 36:9
seek (1) 6:24
send (1) 21:23
sending (1) 22:2
sense (2) 4:25 26:11
sent (6) 7:4 14:11 20:23 21:15 22:5
36:19
served (1) 27:11
service (6) 16:16 23:24 24:8 28:6
31:2 34:11
services (2) 1:20 30:24
set (2) 34:5 38:18
severe (1) 13:19
shift (1) 33:8
SHL (10) 3:15 34:23 35:5,12,15,23
36:5,11,13,16
SHLs (1) 35:17
shops (1) 12:9
side (3) 4:17 14:17,19
sign (1) 6:13
signage (2) 11:9,22
signal (1) 15:13
signals (1) 35:20
signed (1) 9:13
signs (2) 17:5,8
similar (2) 17:4 32:15
similarity (1) 28:12
Simmons (1) 19:14
simple (1) 30:9
simply (1) 9:3
single (1) 11:8
situation (1) 33:21
situations (1) 14:8
size (2) 18:21 19:8
slash (1) 11:22
solely (1) 10:21
solution (1) 35:3
somebody (1) 9:6
sorry (3) 19:17 24:12 31:6
sort (3) 5:20 7:12 8:15

speak (1) 15:25
speaker (12) 10:3 13:15 16:9
17:18 20:24 22:23 29:3,5,8 31:18
31:20 34:17
speakers (4) 3:2,9,15 19:19
speaking (2) 17:25 26:5
spearheaded (1) 10:16
Specifically (1) 20:2
speed (4) 5:18 6:6,9,10
spoke (1) 10:6
ss (1) 38:4
staff (3) 2:13 32:23 35:2
stand (1) 15:23
stands (3) 6:19 15:23 21:14
start (1) 4:13
started (3) 4:3,15 5:5
starting (1) 24:21
state (5) 7:17 18:4,7 38:4,8
stated (1) 21:4
statement (1) 32:13
staying (1) 6:6
STENO-KATH (1) 1:20
Stenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:22
step (1) 15:18
sticker (7) 3:2 7:15 9:19 17:6
18:16,17,21
stickers (3) 7:14 16:20 17:14
stood (1) 5:16
stop (1) 35:5
stopped (1) 14:20
stories (1) 30:14
straight (1) 7:10
street (5) 1:11 8:23,25 9:4 34:7
streets (3) 6:2 14:7 16:5
stress (1) 29:18
subject (1) 19:25
submitted (1) 12:12
submitting (1) 22:8
substantially (1) 32:15
subway (2) 12:7 15:17
sufficiently (1) 33:8
suites (1) 30:20
summary (1) 28:5
support (7) 5:13 11:7 12:23 16:15
16:19 18:14 32:10
supporting (1) 18:12
sure (4) 18:24 19:2 24:14 35:12
symbol (6) 11:24 12:3,8,15,17,21
system (1) 15:17
systems (2) 30:5,6

T

T (3) 11:23 38:2,2
t-coils (2) 15:5,11
t-switches (1) 14:13
Table (2) 23:4 26:6
take (5) 4:10 8:25 14:17 16:24

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

<p>18:25 takes (1) 9:6 talking (1) 6:7 Tarek (1) 29:4 taxi (16) 1:4 3:6,7,17 6:19 7:15 10:10,17 11:17,19 16:13,23 17:11,20 29:15 34:8 taxicabs (1) 8:4 taxis (15) 4:19,20 9:22 11:4,6,10 12:2,4,5 14:6,14 16:4 17:7,13,16 technology (5) 6:24 9:23 10:2 15:13 30:17 telecoil (1) 15:15 telecoils (1) 14:4 telephone (4) 8:22 20:12 23:12,18 tell (2) 5:11 13:22 tend (1) 17:12 terms (2) 21:9 28:23 testify (3) 16:14 19:13 31:14 testimony (3) 29:11 33:17 36:18 Thaler (4) 3:10 20:25 21:2,4 thank (34) 10:11 13:11,13,14,16 16:6,7,8,13,25 17:16,17 18:6,10 18:11 19:10,11 22:21,22 26:16 28:17,18 29:2,15 31:13,16,17 32:5,25 33:22,24 36:18 37:3,4 thanks (1) 13:18 theaters (1) 12:9 thing (2) 9:21 13:11 things (2) 8:9 9:17 think (16) 6:12 8:6 18:15,18,19,21 18:25 19:6,12 24:16 25:3,21,22 34:3 37:8,8 three (2) 4:10 7:11 Thursday (1) 1:10 tightening (1) 29:21 time (9) 4:2 9:14 13:12 17:16 30:20 33:23 34:22 36:21 37:13 tip (2) 6:4,5 TLC (17) 4:25 5:15 7:23 9:18 10:24 12:20 16:19 18:10 21:11 22:8 27:18 30:4 32:5,24 33:15 35:2,5 TLC's (3) 32:12,23 33:11 today (13) 4:5,9 7:11,24 9:16 13:17 15:11 16:14 23:12 24:18 31:15 34:5 36:24 today's (3) 4:4 32:21 37:11 told (1) 15:15 tomorrow (2) 10:10 11:17 top (1) 9:2 topic (1) 29:17 Tormey (1) 2:11 tourists (1) 12:17 traditionally (1) 8:15 transcript (3) 1:2,15 38:12 Transit's (1) 12:7 transportation (1) 30:18</p>	<p>travels (1) 12:20 trip (8) 20:14 21:7,9 22:8,15,19,21 30:3 trips (1) 20:12 true (1) 38:12 Tuncel (9) 3:6,16 16:9,10,12 34:18 34:19,21 37:3 turn (1) 9:10 turned (2) 35:24 36:16 Tweeps (1) 29:9 Tweeps's (1) 29:11 two (8) 7:20 8:9 9:17 14:12 20:21 27:11,13 34:14 type (2) 18:22 19:9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <hr/> <p>Uber (2) 30:7,15 unaware (2) 11:13 13:5 unchanged (1) 20:9 underlying (2) 24:15,20 understand (2) 14:15 26:15 understandably (1) 5:21 understood (1) 14:20 unfortunate (1) 8:2 unfortunately (1) 18:12 UNIDENTIFIED (1) 29:5 uniformed (1) 31:4 uninformed (1) 31:7 United (2) 5:15,24 unlit (1) 34:8 unoccupied (2) 36:13,16 unsuspecting (1) 28:15 update (2) 4:14 5:14 use (1) 12:20 uses (1) 26:21 utilized (1) 30:25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">V</p> <hr/> <p>van (3) 4:14,22 5:7 vans (4) 4:16,24 5:9 8:6 vehicle (6) 4:18 9:25 11:16 13:6 33:10,14 vehicles (18) 5:4 7:24 8:16 9:19,23 11:6,10 15:10 19:24 20:8 27:9 28:24 30:24 31:4,7 32:10,21 34:10 versa (1) 8:13 versus (1) 4:23 vice (1) 8:13 violation (1) 33:15 visible (1) 18:24 Vision (1) 6:15 visit (1) 12:18 visitors (1) 15:7 voluntary (2) 5:4,10 vote (4) 4:11,12 36:24,25</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">W</p> <hr/> <p>waiving (2) 24:2,3 want (13) 4:4 14:25 16:15,18 18:6 18:10,23 19:2,5 25:13 26:3 29:15 32:5 wanted (4) 17:21 28:19,25 34:25 warmer (1) 6:18 warning (1) 9:19 way (6) 14:7 15:24 26:13 34:24 36:2 38:16 we'll (10) 4:5,9 6:15,17,18 7:9 9:11 16:5 34:3 36:25 we're (12) 4:3 6:2,3,3 7:22,24 24:17 25:3 26:11 35:9 36:23 37:2 we've (4) 5:5,5,12 36:24 wear (3) 13:20 14:4 15:4 wearing (1) 14:12 weigh (1) 10:23 West (1) 14:19 WHEREOF (1) 38:18 WiFi (1) 6:25 Wilson (18) 2:10 9:11,15 13:14 16:8 17:17 19:14,18 22:22 28:18 29:3,7 31:17,20 33:2,24 34:3 37:4 wishes (1) 24:2 within-entitled (1) 38:11 WITNESS (1) 38:18 word (1) 16:3 Workers (2) 3:7 17:20 workers' (2) 8:14 32:18 working (1) 13:10 workman's (2) 26:22 28:11 works (1) 15:16 world (2) 8:20 12:11 written (6) 20:22 21:4 22:10 23:13 23:15 34:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <hr/> <p>year (2) 7:20 15:8 years (2) 10:18 16:22 yellow (1) 4:19 yesterday (1) 24:17 York (16) 1:3,21 3:7 11:2 12:6,10 13:24 15:2,17,18 17:3,4,19 32:3 38:4,8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Z</p> <hr/> <p>zero (1) 6:15 zone (3) 9:5 35:8,15 zones (2) 35:14 36:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p>
---	---	--

**Taxi and Limousine Commission
February 26, 2015**

<p>1 (4) 18:17,17 27:17,24 1.6 (1) 15:2 10 (1) 3:4 10.8 (1) 15:6 10:10 (2) 2:2 4:3 10:40 (1) 37:7 10:45 (2) 37:12,13 100,000 (1) 27:16 10543 (1) 1:21 11 (1) 10:18 13 (1) 3:5 139 (1) 1:21 16 (1) 3:6 16th (1) 6:22 17 (1) 3:7 18th (1) 33:20 19TH (1) 1:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>20-year-old (1) 10:19 2014 (4) 7:19 9:18 32:24 33:7 2015 (7) 1:10 7:6,19 20:20 33:20 34:13 38:19 20th (2) 20:20 34:13 21 (1) 3:10 212 (1) 1:22 22 (1) 3:11 23rd (2) 20:21 34:14 25 (3) 6:5,6 16:22 25-mile (1) 5:18 26 (1) 1:10 29 (1) 3:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3 (1) 18:20 30 (1) 36:24 300,000 (2) 27:16 28:4 31 (1) 3:13 33 (1) 1:11 34 (2) 3:17 5:6 381-2061 (1) 1:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4 (1) 18:20 4th (1) 7:6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>5 (2) 18:20,20 55 (1) 9:18 59B-17D (1) 21:6 5th (2) 5:14 38:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7 (2) 18:16,17 70 (1) 5:9</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <hr/> <p>914 (1) 1:22 914.722.0816 (1) 1:23 95-DEPOS (1) 1:22 953-3767 (1) 1:22</p>	
--	--	--