

## CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

---

December 19, 2012 / Calendar No. 6

N 130097 HKM

---

**IN THE MATTER OF** a communication dated October 19, 2012, from the Executive Director of the Landmarks Preservation Commission regarding the landmark designation of the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District, designated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission on October 9, 2012 (Designation List No. 460, LP No. 2491). The district boundaries are:

**Area I** of the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District consists of the property bounded by a line beginning at the northeast corner of Second Avenue and East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, extending westerly across Second Avenue and continuing westerly along the northern curbline of East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western side wall of 26 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, northerly along the western side wall of 26 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property line of 26 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street and a portion of the northern property line of 28 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 28 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 28 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street and the northern property lines of 30 to 36 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to the western curbline of Second Avenue, northerly along the western curbline of Second Avenue to its intersection with a line extending easterly from the southern property line of 43 Second Avenue, westerly along the southern property line of 43 Second Avenue, northerly along the western property lines of 43 to 45-47 Second Avenue, westerly along a portion of the southern property line of 30 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street to the northern curbline of East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern curbline of East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 7 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 7 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property line of 56 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street and a portion of the southern property line of 54 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 54 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along a portion of the southern property line of 54 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 54 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern curbline of East 4<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern curbline of East 4<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 57 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 57 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along a portion of the southern property line of 210-214 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 210-214 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern curbline of East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern curbline of East 5<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 207 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 207 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 207 to 223 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street and a portion of the northern property line of 225 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 226 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street to the southern curbline of East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the southern curbline of East 6<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 103 Second Avenue (aka 239 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street), northerly along the western property lines of 103 Second Avenue (aka 239 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street) and 105 Second Avenue and a portion of the western property line of 107-113 Second Avenue, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 107-113 Second Avenue, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 107-113 Second Avenue and the western property line of 46 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern curbline of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern property line of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with

a line extending southerly from the western property line of 11 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 11 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 11 to 39 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street and a portion of the northern property line of 41-43 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along western property line of 125 Second Avenue, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 125 Second Avenue, northerly along the western property lines of 127 Second Avenue to 131 Second Avenue (aka 36 St. Mark's Place) to the southern curblines of St. Mark's Place, easterly along the southern curblines of St. Mark's Place, southerly along the western curblines of Second Avenue to the southwest corner of Second Avenue and East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the southern curblines of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 49 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 49 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property line of 49 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 51 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 51 to 65 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 65 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 67 to 69 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 71 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 71 to 73-75 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 73-75 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property line of 77 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 79 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 79 to 85 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 85 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern curblines of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern curblines of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 84 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 84 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property line of 84 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 82 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street and the eastern property line of 341 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, continuing across East 6<sup>th</sup> Street and along the eastern property line of 340 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property lines of 340 to 306-308 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 92-94 Second Avenue, westerly along a portion of the southern property line of 92-94 Second Avenue, southerly along the eastern property line of 88-90 Second Avenue (aka 301 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street) to the southern curblines of East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the southern curblines of East 5<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 86 Second Avenue (aka 300 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street), southerly along the eastern property lines of 86 Second Avenue (aka 300 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street) to 72 Second Avenue (aka 91 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street) to the northern curblines of East 4<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern curblines of East 4<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 68-70 Second Avenue (aka 86 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street), southerly along the eastern property lines of 68-70 Second Avenue (aka 86 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street) to 64 Second Avenue, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 60-62 Second Avenue, southerly along the eastern property line of 60-62 Second Avenue, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 51-55 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 51-55 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 51-55 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street and the northern property line of 57 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 57 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street to the southern curblines of East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, easterly along said curblines to a point on a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 64 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 64 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, easterly along a portion of the northern property line of 52-74 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 52-74 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along a portion of the southern

property line of 52-74 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 80 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to the northern curblineline of East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along said curblineline to a point on a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 77 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, southerly along said line and the eastern property line of 77 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property lines of 77 and 75 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 67-69 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property lines of 67-69 and 59-63 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 59-63 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property line of 47-55 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 43-45 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street (aka 32-34 Second Avenue), westerly along the southern property line of 43-45 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to the eastern curblineline of Second Avenue, northerly along said curblineline, easterly along the southern curblineline of East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to a point on a line extending southerly from the western property line of 52-74 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, northerly along said line and the western property line of 52-74 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property lines of 54-56 and 50-52 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 50-52 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, westerly along the southern property lines of 48 through 40-42 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street (aka 50-52 Second Avenue) to the eastern curblineline of Second Avenue, and southerly along said curblineline to the point or place of beginning.

**Area II** of the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District consists of the property bounded by a line beginning at the northeast corner of First Avenue and East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, extending northerly along the eastern curblineline of First Avenue to its intersection with a line extending westerly from the northern property line of 122 First Avenue, easterly along the northern property line 122 First Avenue, northerly along a portion of the western property line of 95 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 95 to 109 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 109 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property line of 111-115 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along a portion of the eastern property line of 117-119 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 117-119 to 129 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 129 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the northern curblineline of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern curblineline of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 122 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, southerly along the eastern property line of 122 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street, easterly along the northern property lines of 439 to 441 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street and 101 Avenue A to the western curblineline of Avenue A, southerly along the western curblineline of Avenue A to the northern curblineline of East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, westerly along the northern curblineline of East 6<sup>th</sup> Street to its intersection with a line extending southerly from the western property line of 405 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along said property line, easterly along the northern property line of 405 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, northerly along the western property line of 94 East 7<sup>th</sup> Street and across East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to its northern curblineline, and westerly along the northern curblineline of East 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the point of the beginning.

---

Pursuant to Section 3020.8(b) of the City Charter, the City Planning Commission shall submit to the City Council a report with respect to the relation of any designation by the Landmarks Preservation Commission, whether of a historic district or a landmark, to the Zoning Resolution, projected public improvements, and any plans for the development, growth, improvement or renewal of the area involved.

On October 9, 2012, the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) designated the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District (Designation List No. 460, LP-2491). The Historic District encompasses part or all of 15 blocks located between the Bowery/Third Avenue and Avenue A, and between East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street and St. Mark's Place in Manhattan, Community District 3. It consists of approximately 325 buildings.

Development in this area of Manhattan began to take shape during the 1830s when unprecedented growth pushed the limits of the city northward and briefly made these and other nearby blocks one of New York's most prestigious residential neighborhoods. Second Avenue in particular became a favored location for fashionable residential construction, and many speculatively-built, single-family homes were commissioned along its lower lengths. By the 1850s large numbers of immigrants began to settle in the area as wealthier residents moved farther uptown. Row houses were increasingly converted to multiple-family dwellings and boardinghouses, and, later, new, purpose-built tenements began to replace the earlier building stock. These buildings, known as "pre-law" tenements because they predated the Tenement House Act of 1879, were often designed in a simplified version of the Italianate style. Later structures from the early 1870s show the growing influence of the neo-Grec style.

People began to regularly refer to the area as the Lower East Side in the 1890s, when many of the area's established German residents and institutions began to move to other neighborhoods in the city. Newer immigrant groups settled in their place, and the area evolved into a polyglot enclave representing a complex array of national, regional, ethnic, linguistic, and religious identities. This cosmopolitan make-up was reflected in the institutions established during the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. These institutions were recognized by such monuments including the Congregation Adas Yisroel Anshe Mezeritz synagogue on East 6<sup>th</sup> Street in 1910; the Saint Stanislaus Bishop and Martyr Roman Catholic Church, at East 7<sup>th</sup> Street; the First Hungarian Reformed Church also on East 7<sup>th</sup> Street; the New York City Mission and Tract Society's Olivet Memorial Church on East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, the Middle Collegiate Church on Second Avenue; and the Society of the Music School Settlement on East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street.

As the Lower East Side's population continued to grow throughout the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, tenement construction also endured. These buildings were governed by the Tenement House Act of 1879, which mandated the so-called dumbbell plan typical of most "old-law" tenements. At

this time, and through the 1880s, the neo-Grec style remained popular, while architects also began using elements of the Queen Anne style. Facades were typically clad in fine red brick with light sandstone ornament. By the 1890s tenement design had reached its pinnacle of flamboyance. In addition to the Queen Anne style, the organic Romanesque Revival and the Classically-inspired Renaissance Revival also gained favor.

The early 20<sup>th</sup> century saw another significant change to the area. New tenements, many of the “new-law” variety built following the Tenement House Act of 1901, began to be built, along with apartment houses, and other commercial and institutional buildings. In the early 1910s Second Avenue became the most important entertainment district for the city’s Jewish immigrant community—leading many to call the area the Yiddish Rialto. Vestiges of that era can be seen in the facades of the Public Theatre and the Lowe’s Commodore.

The early 1930s and the Great Depression widely halted building activity, and most of the structures within the historic district from that period have remained largely intact. In the following decades, however, neighborhood demographics underwent a dramatic transformation. Latin American immigrants, especially those from Puerto Rico, established a large community in the East Village during the mid 20<sup>th</sup> century. The area was also being discovered by artists and bohemians moving eastward from Greenwich Village, leading realtors to call the neighborhood the Village East, and eventually, the East Village.

The East Village/Lower East Side remains one of the most storied neighborhoods in New York City, and in the nation. It is synonymous with the American immigrant experience, and more recently, with social activism and the artistic avant-garde; it has served as a nationally-recognized cultural center for more than a century and a half. The blocks within the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District traditionally contained the area’s most substantial structures and its finest architecture, as well as many of its most important institutions. To this day they exhibit a dense layering of historic and cultural significance, and collectively the buildings within the district tell this enduring, vibrant neighborhood’s rich story—from its early history as a fashionable residential neighborhood, to its subsequent identities as the tenement districts of Kleindeutschland and Lower East Side, through its heyday as the entertainment center of the Yiddish Rialto, and during its more recent evolution into the East Village of Bohemians and punks, Off-Broadway theaters and community activist groups.

The Historic District is within the area of Community District 3 in Manhattan. This Historic District is zoned R8B in the midblocks between Third Avenue/the Bowery and Avenue A; C6-2A on Second Avenue between East 1<sup>st</sup> and East 2<sup>nd</sup> Streets; R7A/C1-5 on Second Avenue, First Avenue and Avenue A between East 7<sup>th</sup> Street and St. Mark's Place; and R7A/C2-5 on Second Avenue, First Avenue and Avenue A between East 7<sup>th</sup> Street and East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street. Both R7A and R8B zoning districts allow residential and community facility uses with a maximum FAR of 4.0. R7A districts are contextual districts with required streetwall bases between 40 and 65 feet, with maximum overall building limits of 80 feet. R8B districts are contextual districts with required streetwall bases between 55 and 60 feet, with maximum overall building height limits of 75 feet. C6-2A districts are contextual districts with required streetwall bases between 60 and 85 feet, with maximum overall building height limits of 120 feet; C6-2A districts allow commercial FAR up to 6.0, residential FAR up to 6.02 and community facility up to 6.5.

On June 26, 2012, the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the Historic District (Item No. 1). The hearing had been duly advertised in accordance with the provision of law. Thirty-seven witnesses spoke in favor of the designation as proposed, including the Manhattan Borough President, local City Councilmember, and representatives of elected officials from the New York State Senate and Assembly. Representatives of the Bowery Alliance of Neighbors, City Lore, Cooper Square Community Development Committee and Businessmen's Association, East Village Community Coalition, the Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation, the Historic Districts Council, Lower East Side Preservation Initiative, Metropolitan Chapter of the Victorian Society in America, New York Landmarks Conservancy, the Society for the Architecture of the City and several residents also spoke in support of the designation. Sixteen people spoke in opposition to designation or in opposition to including their property within the historic district, including several property owners, as well as representatives of the Cathedral of the Holy Virgin Protection (four representatives), Catholic Worker Movement, Real Estate Board of New York, Saint Stanislaus Bishop and Martyr Roman Catholic Church (two representatives), and St. Mary's American Orthodox Greek Catholic Church. The Commission received hundreds of letters, petitions and electronic correspondence, both in support of, and in opposition to, the proposed designation.

Pursuant to Section 74-79 of the Zoning Resolution, no transfer of development rights is permitted from any structure within an historic district. All landmark buildings within historic districts are eligible to apply for use and bulk waivers pursuant to Section 74-711 of the Zoning Resolution.

### **CITY PLANNING COMMISSION PUBLIC HEARING**

Pursuant to Section 3020.8(a) of the City Charter, the City Planning Commission held a public hearing on November 28, 2012, (Calendar No. 9). There were three speakers in favor of the designation and none opposed. Speakers in favor included representatives of the Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation and of the Lower East Side Preservation Initiative, and one unaffiliated neighborhood resident.

### **CONSIDERATION**

The City Planning Commission has evaluated the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District in relation to the Zoning Resolution, projected public improvements and plans for the development, growth and improvements in the vicinity of the area involved. The subject Historic District does not conflict with the Zoning Resolution. In addition, the Commission is not aware of any conflicts between the subject Historic District designation and projected public improvements or any plans for development, growth, improvement, or renewal in the vicinity of the Historic District.

**AMANDA M. BURDEN, FAICP, Chair**  
**KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, Esq., Vice Chairman**  
**ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, RAYANN BESSER, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E.,**  
**ALFRED C. CERULLO, III, BETTY Y. CHEN, MICHELLE R. de la UZ,**  
**MARIA M. DEL TORO, JOSEPH I. DOUEK, RICHARD W. EADDY,**  
**ANNA HAYES LEVIN, ORLANDO MARÍN, Commissioners**