ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The primary author of this report is Ronnie Kauder, senior associate of the New York City Labor Market Information Service (NYCLMIS). Lesley Hirsch, director of the NYCLMIS provided analytical and writing support; research associates Jonathan DeBusk and Lee Hachadoorian provided additional analytical support.

NYCLMIS expresses its gratitude to the many people who participated in this study through interviews and focus groups (listed in Appendix B). The NYCLMIS also wishes to thank NYC & Company for their assistance in contacting representatives from labor and management and other industry experts. We are grateful to the New York City Employment & Training Coalition for polling its members and arranging the logistics for the training provider focus group. Additionally, NYCLMIS would like to acknowledge the comments and feedback from members of the Deputy Mayors’ Workforce Collaborative, with special appreciation to Urvashi Kaul, former Assistant Director of the Center for Economic Transformation at the NYC Economic Development Corporation and Nnenna Lynch, Senior Policy Advisor to the Deputy Mayor of Economic Development. Thanks also to the New York State Department of Labor for responding to our various, special data requests.

*Any references to trademarks, proprietary products, or company names in this report are intended for description only and do not constitute or imply endorsement or recommendation by the NYCLMIS or by the Deputy Mayors’ Workforce Collaborative.*
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

New York City is an increasingly popular destination for business and leisure travelers. In 2012, the City hosted 52 million visitors—up 44 percent from ten years earlier. Most visitors stay at hotels and other types of lodging places, making traveler accommodation an important segment of travel and tourism in New York City.

The New York City Labor Market Information Service, housed at the Center for Urban Research at the CUNY Graduate Center, undertook this research on the traveler accommodation industry on behalf of the Deputy Mayors’ Workforce Collaborative, a committee of several New York City agencies responsible for local education, workforce and economic development policy. The research is intended to inform workforce preparation and encourage demand-driven programs and practices that align with the staffing needs of the industry.

Through an analysis of available statistical information, a review of business literature, and interviews and focus groups with industry experts (business owners, trade association and labor union representatives, and education and training providers), this research:

- Reviews the nature and dynamics of the industry as it operates in New York City so that workforce professionals can anticipate employment opportunities;
- Presents, in the context of these business dynamics, where jobs are located and how much they have grown or contracted in the recent past;
- Details the types of occupations that are available to jobseekers, the education and training these jobs typically require, how much they pay, and the number of people working in each;
- Describes how people get jobs in the industry, where and how they are trained, and once employed, how they advance; and
- Presents the demographic characteristics of the workforce in 2000 and 2010 to help readers understand important educational and age-related trends that may affect future demand.

The final section of the report includes key findings and their implications for various actors within the workforce system. They are summarized in this executive summary.

Key Findings

About the Industry

- Traveler accommodation is a thriving industry in New York City that has grown in recent years. Hotel room inventory increased by 22 percent between 2006 and 2011, and is projected to grow by another seven to 10 percent between 2012 and 2014, with new hotel construction projects already underway. The industry’s growth has been fueled by an increase in visitors to the City, favorable conditions for commercial real estate development, and zoning regulations that
allow hotel construction in commercial and light manufacturing districts. Much of the increase in travel can be credited to the perception of New York City as a safe, fun place to visit, combined with efforts by the Bloomberg Administration to bring attractions to New York City and market its distinctive features.

- The hotel industry is heavily concentrated in Manhattan; however, in recent years, there has been more development than ever in Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island. Job growth has been strong and is expected to continue into the next few years.

- The hotel industry in New York City is highly unionized, most notably in Manhattan and in full-service hotels. This workforce enjoys good pay and benefits, and the union rates influence pay and benefits in some non-union hotels.

- There are more limited-service hotels and boutique hotels. Within these types of hotel, the employment profile is different. There may be fewer types of jobs, and because many limited-service hotels are non-union, employees may be asked to help out in almost any area.

- There is more contracting out of certain functions, such as food and beverage services, and laundry services. Some opportunities for work in hotels can be found with firms that provide these types of contracted services.

Employment and Wage Trends

- During the period between 2006 and 2011, employment in the traveler accommodation industry grew by 15 percent, a much higher rate than for the overall private sector in New York City, but slightly lower than the increase in hotel room capacity.

- Largely because of the degree of unionization, average pay, at $53,045, is above the citywide median of $45,540. Average pay is highest for jobs in Manhattan, at $55,390, and lowest for jobs in Staten Island at $21,287. Average pay has not kept pace with inflation over the past 11 years except in Manhattan.

- Turnover is low, especially in the unionized jobs. This is because pay is relatively good for jobs that do not require high levels of education, such as room attendant. Low turnover has resulted in a workforce that is older. In 2010, more than 50 percent of the traveler accommodation industry workforce was over the age of 45 versus 40 percent of the total employed workforce in New York City.

- There are employment opportunities in many different kinds of jobs, from room attendants to maintenance to front desk positions to all types of management jobs. These jobs are held by people with all levels of education, although recent trends point to higher levels of education in all types of jobs.

Recruitment, Retention, Training, and Advancement

- To recruit and screen applicants, hiring managers use methods and organizations that have been effective for them in the past. Current hiring practices described by both hoteliers and training providers involve extensive employee selection.
efforts. In addition to online tests, candidates commonly go through several interviews to be considered for work, and hoteliers often interview several candidates for each position.

- In addition to listing positions on-line (or, for unionized positions, with the union in case there are people on layoff from these positions), hoteliers report a variety of recruitment relationships—with community colleges, universities, private and nonprofit organizations—that they believe work well for them.

- To fill vacancies, employers often recruit through their existing employees. Word-of-mouth and networking play a role in learning about jobs in the industry.

- Appearance can be very important. By all accounts, personal appearance and grooming is highly valued, especially for customer-facing jobs.

- Employers can afford to be selective. Because of the relatively good pay and benefits at unionized hotels, competition is strong. The selection process appears to be extensive, even for the most entry-level job.

- Employers do not report having difficulty filling positions that require less education but do report having moderate difficulty finding managers of all types, especially those with experience in the industry in New York City. Based on a review of “real time” labor market information, the greatest employment demand in the industry is for managers and guest service agents, jobs that typically require higher levels of education and, in the case of managers, experience. Several hoteliers mentioned the need for people to work in revenue management, as hotels are now updating prices and meeting market demands on a daily basis through advanced market analytics.

- It appears that there is upward mobility in the industry—both in terms of increased levels of responsibility and pay—for people who are ambitious, flexible, and customer-service oriented.

- The employers interviewed as part of this study had little past experience with and expressed little current need to create new partnership arrangements beyond those they already have with public sector agencies for recruitment and screening. That being said, New York State Department of Labor officials report that the industry used to work with the agency to recruit individuals for the union positions. Also, the Department of Small Business Services, through NYC Business Solutions, often works with new hotels that are recruiting.

**Education and Training**

- There is a broad range of education and training programs at all levels to prepare people for work in this industry. These range from top hotel management schools such as Cornell and NYU, to two- and four-year hospitality, travel/tourism and culinary arts degree programs at several colleges within CUNY and other local universities, training programs run by non-profit organizations, and hospitality-career-themed academies operated by the New York City Department of Education. In general, these institutions are well-informed about the industry and
make every effort to engage students in internships or work assignments in the industry before graduation. Internships are more common among college students, but more difficult to arrange with adults who are not in college and with high school youth.

**Characteristics of the Current Workforce**

- The industry’s workforce is diverse. Most (67 percent) are foreign-born. They reside in all five boroughs, with the greatest proportion living in Queens. The proportions of white, black, Hispanic and Asian workers are all in the 21 percent to 27 percent range. There are more men than women working in the industry. More than half the workforce is 45 years of age or older.

**Implications for Workforce Development**

The following are the major implications of the research findings for different groups of professionals that help people secure jobs and meet employer demands in the industry.

**For Career Counselors and Jobseekers**

- Counselors should advise jobseekers that people who like a fast pace and enjoy dealing with customers/guests thrive best in the “front-of-the-house” occupations in the industry, such as food servers and guest service agents.
- There is no central clearinghouse or “cookie-cutter” way to land a job in the industry. Jobseekers need to hone their job search and networking skills to find opportunities and land a job.
- In general, industry hiring picks up in the weeks before peak demand, in early fall and during winter holidays. Job searches in summer and early fall are likely to yield more openings than during other times of year.
- Opportunities for jobs that require comparatively less education—e.g., room attendants and wait staff—are highly competitive. Jobseekers should be prepared to make multiple efforts to “get their foot in the door,” and possibly undergo rigorous vetting during the interview process.
- Entry-level jobseekers should be coached to expect to work different jobs or off-hours/holidays until they have gained experience or seniority in the industry.
- Jobseekers and counselors should regularly visit industry and employer-specific online job boards, such as hcareers.com, highgatecareers.com careers.hershahotels.com and hotel websites. LinkedIn is also a popular site for employers to advertise for office and management positions.

**For Program Managers and Job Developers**

- At the time of this report, there is uncertainty about future economic conditions in Europe and Asia. Providers should keep track of these conditions and how they influence consumer demand for hotels in New York City.
- Workforce providers should expect to spend more time and effort to establish
trust and cultivate strong working relationships with human resources managers in the traveler accommodation industry than they do in other industries.

- When new lodgings open, multiple positions have to be filled. Job developers should stay current about industry conditions and identify upcoming hotel construction projects.

For Policy Makers

- Postsecondary programs in hospitality and culinary arts arrange credit-bearing externships and internships with the industry. Opportunities for adults who are not in higher education—and for younger people—are much more uncommon. Agencies can be helpful by working with industry leaders to find ways of expanding internship opportunities.

- According to employers consulted in the course of this research, the industry’s current recruitment, screening and hiring practices are effective at finding qualified candidates. Sector-specific workforce programs will likely have to mount convincing arguments that their services can improve upon the industry’s existing practices.
Introduction & Industry Overview

How big is the industry and how is it distributed geographically within New York City?

New York City has long been a popular destination for both business and leisure travelers. Under the Bloomberg Administration, officials have made concerted efforts to increase the number of travelers to New York City. In 2012, the City broke all previous records by hosting more than 52 million visitors from all 50 states and more than 100 countries. As noted in an article in the December 5, 2011 issue of New York magazine, “Tourism is the city’s fastest economic-growth sector and a major reason the post-Lehman recession wasn’t much worse here.” In early 2013, when this report was written, the hotel industry’s reliance on tourism is both a source of optimism and concern, as discussed below.

Most of those who visit New York City will stay at hotels and other types of private accommodations. There are many different types of hotels, from luxury to budget to youth hostels; from name-brand national chains to boutique hotels. In 2011, New York City had 597 hotels and other accommodations establishments, employing 44,029 individuals. Figure 1 displays the number of hotels and other accommodations by New York City borough from 2000 to 2011. Both chart and accompanying table show that the number of hotels increased in all five boroughs. More than two-thirds of the establishments (409 out of 597) are in Manhattan. Queens has the next largest number, mostly because Kennedy and LaGuardia airports are located in the

Definition of the Traveler Accommodation Industry

According to the 2012 North American Industrial Classification System (NAICS), the traveler accommodation industry includes establishments that primarily provide traditional types of lodging services. It includes hotels, motels, bed and breakfast inns, and other short-term lodging such as guesthouses and youth hostels. In addition to lodging, these establishments may provide a range of other services to their guests, such as food and beverage service and laundry service. The traveler accommodation industry (NAICS 7211) is classified within the accommodation subsector (NAICS 72) of the larger accommodation and food services sector (NAICS 72).

This report was prepared by the New York City Labor Market Information Service (NYCLMIS) at the CUNY Graduate Center on behalf of several New York City agencies responsible for education, workforce, and economic development policy collectively known as the Deputy Mayors’ Workforce Collaborative. The report’s audience includes policy makers and practitioners. Its goal is to inform workforce preparation and encourage demand-driven programs and practices that align with the current needs of business and improve employment outcomes.

In recognition of the importance and success of the travel and tourism industry in New York City, the Collaborative decided to focus on one well-defined and important segment of this growing industry: traveler accommodation.

This profile is designed to provide a thorough understanding of:
- The industry’s business context, including market and policy drivers and the role of labor unions;
- Recent employment and wage trends and current employer demand;
- Key occupations of people employed in the industry and employers’ educational and experience requirements and preferences;
- Demographic trends that may influence future hiring; and
- How employers recruit, train, and select employees, and common career paths in the industry.

New York City’s Traveler Accommodation Industry
New York City's Traveler Accommodation Industry

 borough. Brooklyn is third, although it has seen the largest percentage increase in the last ten years.

Since 2008, 42 percent of new hotel properties have been built outside of Manhattan. In 2011, the majority of these outer-borough hotel openings were in Queens (22%), followed by Brooklyn (15%), the Bronx (3%) and Staten Island (2%).

Citywide, there were 36 projects in the pipeline with openings slated in 2013 – 2014.

How is the industry organized?

There are several different types of hotels. Full-service hotels offer a variety of services for their guests, but they almost always include at least one or more restaurant and beverage service options other than self-service—from coffee bars and lunch counters to cocktail lounges and formal restaurants. They also usually provide room service. Larger, full-service hotels generally have a variety of retail shops on the premises, such as gift boutiques, newsstands, and drug and cosmetics counters. Some full-service hotels offer guests access to laundry and valet services,
swimming pools, beauty salons, and fitness centers or health spas.

The largest hotels often have banquet rooms, exhibit halls, and ballrooms to accommodate conventions, business meetings, wedding receptions, and other social gatherings. Conventions and business meetings are major sources of revenue for these properties. Some commercial hotels are known as conference hotels; these are fully self-contained entities specifically designed for large-scale meetings. In addition to flexible and large format meeting rooms and ballrooms, they also provide physical fitness and recreational facilities for meeting attendees, state-of-the-art audiovisual and technical equipment, a business center, and banquet services. Examples in New York City include the Mandarin Oriental, the New York Hilton, the New York Marriott at the Brooklyn Bridge, and the Four Points Sheraton in Queens. Most full-service hotels are in Manhattan.

**Limited-service hotels** are free-standing properties that do not have on-site restaurants or most other amenities that must be provided by a staff other than the front desk or housekeeping. They usually offer continental breakfasts, vending machines or small packaged items, Internet access, and sometimes, unattended game rooms or fitness rooms in addition to daily housekeeping services. The number of limited-service properties in New York City has been growing. These properties are less costly to build, maintain, and operate. They appeal to budget-conscious family vacationers and travelers who are willing to sacrifice amenities for lower room prices. Examples include the Ramada Bronx, Comfort Inn Long Island City, Hampton Inn Times Square North, and the Aloft Hotel in Brooklyn.

**Extended-stay hotels** typically provide rooms or suites with fully equipped kitchens, entertainment systems, office space with computer and telephone lines, fitness centers, and other amenities. Typically, guests use these hotels for a minimum of five consecutive nights, often while on an extended work assignment, lengthy vacation, or family visit. All-suite hotels offer a living room or sitting room in addition to a bedroom. Examples include Affinia Gardens and AKA Times Square in Manhattan, Fairfield Inn and Suites in Brooklyn, and Extended Stay America LaGuardia.

In addition to hotels, **bed-and-breakfast inns** and **youth hostels** provide lodging for overnight guests and are included in this industry. Examples of youth hostels in Manhattan include Equity Point, Chelsea International, International Student Center, Hostelling International, Jazz, and Broadway Hotel & Hostel. There are also the New York Loft, New York Moore, and the Yoav Lodgehouse in Brooklyn; and the AAE Super Eight Hostel in Queens.

Across the country, the hotel industry is dominated by a few large national hotel chains. Many of these have expanded the range of lodging options offered under one corporate name to include a full range of hotels, from limited-service, economy-type hotels to boutique and luxury hotels. In New York City, the largest of these entities are:

- **Hilton Worldwide**—includes the Waldorf Astoria, Hilton, Doubletree, Embassy Suites, Hilton Garden Inn, Hampton Inn, and Homewood Suites.
- **Starwood**—includes Westin, Sheraton, W Hotels, St. Regis, Aloft, and Element.
- **Marriott**—includes Marriott, Ritz Carlton, Renaissance, Courtyard by Marriott, Fairfield Inn, Springhill Suites, and Residence Inn by Marriott.
- **Intercontinental Hotels Group**—includes Intercontinental, Crowne Plaza, Hotel Indigo, Holiday Inn, Holiday Inn Express, and Candlewood Suites.
- **Hyatt Hotels and Resorts**—includes Park Hyatt, Andaz, Grand Hyatt, Hyatt Regency, Hyatt House, and Hyatt Place.

While these national corporations own some of their own hotels, many hotels are independently owned but affiliated with chains through franchise agreements or management contracts. Increasingly, hotel chains are moving away from owning properties to managing them.

There are also a number of small and independent hotels in New York City. Some of these are boutique hotels, which are becoming more popular for those who prefer more personalized service and a unique experience. Some of the larger hotel chains also operate boutique hotels. Examples of boutique hotels include the Flatiron Hotel and the Hotel Giraffe in Manhattan, the Hotel Le Jolie in Williamsburg, Brooklyn, and the Z Hotel in Long Island City, Queens.

Within New York City, there has been a trend towards smaller, more limited-service hotels, a number of which are in the outer boroughs. Table 1 lists selected New York City hotel openings.

**Who are the major industry players?**

There are several important organizations that together promote and influence the traveler accommodation industry in New York City.

- **NYC & Company** ([www.nycgo.com](http://www.nycgo.com)) is a private, non-profit member-based organization, and the official marketing, tourism and partnership organization of the City of New York. It currently

### TABLE 1. Selected 2012 Hotel Openings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hotel</th>
<th>Rooms</th>
<th>Borough</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wyndham Garden Long Island City Manhattan View</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>Queens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The OUT NYC</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>Manhattan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRYP by Wyndham NYC Times Square South</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>Manhattan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Vetiver</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Queens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holiday Inn Midtown</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>Manhattan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wythe Hotel</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*SOURCE | NYC & Company*
Many industry experts interviewed for this research refer to the *union* and *non-union* sectors of the hotel industry. The non-union hotels are generally but not always smaller and many are limited-service hotels without restaurants. The wage rates and benefits are generally lower than in the unionized hotels. Everyone interviewed for this research acknowledged the benefits of the union contract for workers in covered positions – good wages and benefits, health and dental centers for the entire family, and protections for workers, including both safety concerns (e.g. two-way pagers for room attendants) and protection from arbitrary actions by management. Unionized hotels also have lower turnover, which offers stability for the hotel, which some believe is a benefit for management. The relatively high wage rates make lower skilled positions very desirable and therefore competitive for job seekers, and unionized hotels can choose from among many good candidates. Some employers interviewed feel that some of the union work rules are “archaic,” although others have found the union to have some flexibility in this area. A few managers with whom we spoke questioned whether the current labor and benefits model in the unionized hotels is sustainable for the foreseeable future.

What are the current trends in the industry?

Based on interviews with industry experts and a reading of trade publications there are a number of trends worth noting:

- **Hoteliers are increasingly focused on service quality and preventive maintenance.** While service has always
been extremely important in this business, by all accounts hotel guests have become more discerning and demanding. One hotelier interviewed in connection with this research said, “It’s a transparent world.” With travel booking sites like TripAdvisor, Expedia and others, millions of people are making and reviewing comments about service at hotels. Hotels must treat the customer differently, with a greater level of attention. Many hotel owners and managers mentioned the extensive customer service training provided to all employees in all areas.

- **There are more limited-service hotels**, which appear to require less staff per hotel room. Limited-service hotels typically do not provide food beyond a self-service continental breakfast, and usually do not offer bell or concierge services.

- **There is more contracting out of functions**, such as food, beverage, and laundry services.

- **Revenue management is growing.** Like the airline industry, hotels are now able to update prices and meet market demands on a daily basis through advanced market analytics.

- **Online booking continues to increase.** Most travelers make reservations through the Internet, and the “booking window” is much shorter now. The typical reservation used to be from one week to one month before arrival; now it can be as short as one day. Also, people comparison shop. There are fewer corporate travel departments, as people make their own reservations, even for business travel.

- **There is a “shakeout” in distribution channels.** While many people reserve rooms online through hotel or hotel chain websites, many others make arrangements through websites like Travelocity, Expedia, Orbitz and Hotels.com. These “wholesalers” buy hotel rooms in bulk at a reduced price. In addition, websites like Groupon and LivingSocial have daily “flash sales.” The myriad of new booking options have had an effect on tax receipts for government. One hotelier interviewed for this research estimated that these alternate booking options account for at least 40 percent of the market.

- **There is more use of mobile devices for bookings and research.** More and more travelers are turning to their mobile devices to research lodging and travel options, book and communicate room preferences directly with hotels, and rate service on websites such as TripAdvisor and others.

- **Customer priorities have changed.** Hotel guests want their technology devices to work at all times, and hotels must provide high speed Internet service. One hotelier said that guests want a fitness area although only a small core of guests uses it. Another said that the younger generation of visitors wants everything “here and now.”

- **There is an informal accommodation sector**, represented by AirBNB and others. Despite a 2010 State law banning short-stay room rentals and hostels in strictly residential zones, one industry expert interviewed for this research estimates that there may be as many as 20,000 illegal hotel rooms in New York City. Although they are against the law, and represent a loss of tax revenue to the City,
it is difficult and expensive for the City to police.

- **The outlook for the industry is generally positive, but the industry must be able to quickly adjust to economic changes.** Industry analysts, experts and managers all feel that the industry has performed well and has not retrenched, even in the face of the recent recession. They believe that New York City is a strong marketplace, with a diversity of different markets—business, leisure, domestic, and international. One hotelier raised the issue of the “massive new supply” of hotel rooms, and hoped that demand will keep pace with supply. For its part, NYC & Company predicts an increase in visitors to New York City to 55 million by 2015.

**What are the main drivers of business activity in the industry?**

Industry experts agree that the major driver of the traveler accommodation industry is the number of travelers visiting New York City, for both leisure and business, from both domestic and international points of origin. The annual number of visitors to New York City increased from 36 million in 2000 to 52 million in 2012, or by 44 percent. **Figure 2** displays the total number of visitors to New York City for the period 2000-2011 and shows the breakout between travelers from the U.S. (domestic) and travelers from foreign countries (international).

As shown, the overall trend was up, although there were two short periods during which the number of visitors declined. Travel to New York City dipped in 2001 and 2002, in all likelihood related to the events of September 11, 2001, a national recession, and the global SARS outbreak. The number of visitors also decreased in 2009, correlating with the deeper national recession.

NYC & Company tracks the countries from which visitors travel. As **Table 2** illustrates, more visitors come to New York City from Canada than from any other country in 2011. Within the Americas, travelers from Brazil have increased at the greatest rate, and now represent a very large market. From Europe, the United Kingdom represents the largest number of travelers, although it has been decreasing since 2000. The rate of increase for travelers from Italy, Spain, Ireland and Russia is notable.

Travel from Asia/Pacific has increased dramatically, especially from China/Hong Kong, Australia, South Korea and India. One industry expert interviewed in connection with this research believes that China is the biggest emerging market of the near future. Another said that travel from Japan is coming back. Although the international segment represents 20 percent of the visitors, NYC & Company estimates that foreign travelers account for 50 percent of all tourism-related revenue, as international tourists tend to stay longer and spend more per capita.

Business travel is a big part of the market, especially for certain full-service hotels. While business travel has declined as a proportion of total travelers, it is still approximately 22 percent of the market; it is higher at hotels like the New York Hilton. Several industry experts said that many people who visit for business travel extend their stays and blend leisure with business travel. Corporate and convention travel fell off in 2009 and 2010 in response to the recession. Many
corporations are trying to reduce their spending on travel. Leisure travel has grown the most and is strong.

At the time of this report, there are concerns about the state of the economies in Europe, which are coping with the sovereign debt of some European Union member nations, and Asia, where economic growth has slowed considerably in recent months. If either or both of these conditions worsen, New York City tourism could be adversely affected. Efforts to increase domestic tourism would soften some of the blow; however, foreign tourists stay longer and spend more. The City could also compensate by attracting additional foreign visitors from other regions. In fact, NYC & Company has made concerted efforts in the past two years to increase the number of visitors from South America.

A second industry driver is the availability of capital to buy, build and renovate hotels. New York City is the most active hotel investment market in the country. Approximately 50 percent of the acquisition volume in 2011 in the City was driven by Real Estate Investment Trusts (REITs), which are bought and sold like stocks in major exchanges. Private equity funds and institutional investors have also been active. Hotel transaction volume has been increasing in Manhattan since 2004, with
## TABLE 2. Total International Travelers by Origin, 2000 to 2011 (in 1,000s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL INTERNATIONAL</strong></td>
<td>6,780</td>
<td>10,250</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Americas</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>920</td>
<td>1,033</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>159%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>283%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>102%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal</strong></td>
<td>1,364</td>
<td>2,343</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Europe</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>1,138</td>
<td>1,014</td>
<td>-11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>636</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>461</td>
<td>604</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>506</td>
<td>107%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scandinavia and Finland*</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>464</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>416</td>
<td>130%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium, Netherlands, and Luxembourg</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Europe*</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>108%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia*</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>518%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal</strong></td>
<td>2,683</td>
<td>4,614</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Asia Pacific &amp; Middle East</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>533</td>
<td>330%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China and Hong Kong</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>327</td>
<td>454%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>-37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>122%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>141%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel*</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal</strong></td>
<td>1,229</td>
<td>2,173</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data not collected in 2000, figure is from first year collected (varies by origin).

**NOTE** | 2011 figures are preliminary

**SOURCE** | Office of Travel and Tourism industries, Tourism Economics, NYC & Company
less volume during the recessionary period of 2008 to 2010.\textsuperscript{xiv}

The effect of this trend is that over the last eight years, the ownership structure of the hotel industry has changed. Figure 3 illustrates the current ownership distribution of hotels in Manhattan. As shown, only 22 percent of Manhattan hotel room inventory is owner-operated. The rest is owned by other types of entities. Under agreements, some may carry brand names such as Hilton, Marriott or Sheraton but are not owned by these corporations.

There was relatively little increase in hotel room capacity between 1986 and 2006, but NYC & Company reports that between 2006 and 2011, New York City experienced the most rapid and successful hotel building boom on record. At its start, the boom coincided with the national construction boom, but persisted even through the credit crunch that negatively affected other private sector construction. The hotel room inventory in New York City grew 35 percent, from 64,699 in 2000 to 87,503 in 2011.
In 2013 and 2014, the City is expected to reach 96,000 rooms in active inventory. This includes hotels in all five boroughs, with the vast majority in the range of 75-200 rooms. As noted, NYC & Company projects an increase in travelers to 55 million by 2015.

The major business measures used by the hotel industry are hotel occupancy rate, average daily room rate and revenue per available room (RevPar). Figure 4 displays the NYC room inventory and the average daily room rate from 2000 to 2011. The bar chart shows the year-by-year growth in the number of hotel rooms. The blue line shows the nominal average daily room rate (i.e., not adjusted for inflation). The average daily room rate was at its highest in 2008, before the recession and the steady increase in hotel room inventory. Even without adjusting for cost of living increases, the annual average daily room rate has not reached pre-recession levels. This is a reflection of the economy, the overall increase in availability, and the fact that many of the newer hotel rooms are in limited-service hotels, which are lower-priced for the consumer. Whether lower rates are an effect of a larger supply or an influx of cheaper rooms to the market, the cost of accommodation in New York City has become more affordable for a variety of different types of travelers.

Aside from tourism and real estate investments, City and State policies influence the industry. This includes zoning regulations, policies that may encourage the construction and renovation of hotels, and policies and actions that have the effect of making New York City a “go-to” place. One industry expert interviewed for this research pointed out that New York City is perceived to be a safer place than it once was, and visitors are staying in Harlem, Brooklyn, Flushing, and Long Island City—places they may not have visited even 10 years ago. Zoning regulations provide incentives and disincentives for the building of hotels and in this way influence the location, type, and number of hotels that are built. Zoning regulations have had the effect of encouraging hotel construction in areas zoned for commercial but not residential use, especially in the outer boroughs.

The tourism industry in New York City is also seasonal. As Figure 5 illustrates for 2011, occupancy and room rates are lowest in January and February. The lowest average room rate was $202 in February 2011—coinciding with seasonally low occupancy—and the highest was $341 in September 2011. An industry expert interviewed in connection with this research indicated that February 2012 was worse than 2011, and that New York City needs to have a special “draw” during January and February to encourage larger numbers of people to overcome the cold weather and visit the City. An example of such an event was when Christo and Jeanne-Claude’s “The Gates” exhibit was on display in Central Park in February 2005.

What impact does zoning regulation have on hotel development?

New York City’s 1961 Zoning Resolution separates residential from industrial and commercial areas to insulate residents from industrial traffic and environmental irritants, and shield industry from nuisance-generated complaints. There are many different types of
industrial and commercial zones; residential construction or building conversions to residential use are not permitted in industrial zones. Hotels, which are considered commercial, may be built in many zones that permit commercial activity. In addition to commercial districts, commercial enterprises are allowed as of right in light manufacturing districts.

As travel to New York City increased, and with it the demand for additional hotel room capacity, real estate developers began to identify under-used locations in commercial and light manufacturing areas that might be suitable for hotels. Locations that were unsuited for new residential buildings or where new residential construction was prohibited were developed for new hotels.

In high-density districts, developers built tall buildings, sometimes 20 or more stories. Examples of such development include the Meatpacking District and Hudson Square in Manhattan. In lower-density districts such as around City airports, in Williamsburg and Gowanus, Brooklyn, and Long Island City, Queens, smaller hotels were constructed.

Zoning regulations in certain commercial districts, like the Bowery and the Lower East Side, allow higher “floor area ratios” for commercial properties. As a result, developers have built hotels in these districts as opposed to residential properties.

The most extreme example of zoning regulations driving hotel development is in Dutch Kills, Queens, where 15 to 20 hotels were recently built. Developers decided to take advantage of comparatively high floor area ratios before the City rezoned the area.

Some hotel development in the outer boroughs has been controversial for neighborhood residents who are concerned about increased foot and automobile traffic, lack of aesthetic appeal, or that, as a result of insufficient demand, the properties would be used for illegal activity or be taken over by the City for other uses such as homeless shelters.
New York City's Traveler Accommodation Industry

Employment and Wage Trends

How many people work in traveler accommodation and where do they work? Has employment grown in the past 10 years?

Hotels and other accommodations employed 45,600 people as of May 2012, a 15 percent increase from 2000.\textsuperscript{14} Table 3 illustrates employment by borough comparing annual average employment in 2000 and 2011, the most recent year for which borough-level information is available. As of 2011, more than 90 percent of the employment was in Manhattan, the location of almost all of the large hotels. Employment in Brooklyn, although smaller than in Manhattan, increased by almost 60 percent and employment in Staten Island almost tripled in the eleven-year period.

As shown in Figure 6, more than half of the employment in the traveler accommodation industry (53 percent) is concentrated in establishments with more than 250 employees-large hotels. Almost all employment (98 percent) is with employers that have more than 10 employees. This is different from private employment in the City as a whole, where 84 percent of employment is with employers with more than 10 employees and the rest work for smaller employers.

As illustrated in Figure 7, employment in the traveler accommodation industry generally followed the business cycle from 2000 to 2011 but outperformed the overall private sector. The traveler accommodation industry gained about 3,400 jobs between 2000 and 2011, or an eight percent increase, while the overall private sector economy had a job gain of less than one percent.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Borough</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2011(p)</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>626</td>
<td>986</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>35,297</td>
<td>39,755</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>2,363</td>
<td>2,671</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>298%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>40,628</td>
<td>44,029</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(p) Preliminary

FIGURE 6. Share of Establishments and Employment in New York City by Size Class

As Percent of Employment
- 251 or more: 19%
- 101 to 250: 13%
- 51 to 100: 2%
- 11 to 50: 13%
- 1 to 10: 7%

As Percent of Establishments
- 251 or more: 40%
- 101 to 250: 31%
- 51 to 100: 13%
- 11 to 50: 13%
- 1 to 10: 9%

FIGURE 7. Comparison of Employment in the Traveler Accommodation and Total Private Sector, New York City 2000 - 2010

SOURCE | NYSDOL, QCEW, 2000-2010
Figure 8 displays the geographic distribution of establishments and jobs in New York City. While there are hotels and hotel employment in every borough, the map illustrates the concentration of employment in midtown and lower Manhattan, near the airports in Queens and, to a lesser degree, in downtown Brooklyn and the western section of Staten Island. Table 4 displays the five largest hotels in Manhattan, Brooklyn, and Queens, respectively.
How much does employment in the industry change over the course of the year?

Figure 9 displays occupancy rates and employment by month for 2011. It shows that while employment is lower during the months when occupancy rates are lower (January and February) and higher when occupancy rates are higher, the monthly changes in employment fluctuate less than the occupancy rates. Employment is fairly stable throughout the year varying by less than 10 percent from low season to high.

Industry experts report that turnover in the industry appears to be relatively low, especially in the jobs covered by the union agreement. These experts estimate that turnover is at three to four percent in the unionized positions, seven percent in the line-level non-union positions, and about 15 percent for the management positions. Based on interviews in the non-union sector, turnover appears to be highest in front desk and restaurant positions, jobs in which people are on their feet all day.

According to the Quarterly Workforce Indicators program from the Census Bureau, overall turnover in the industry fluctuated between six and 11 percent between Q1 2007 and Q1 2011 (most recent data), and shows more seasonal variation than in the private sector as a whole (Figure 10).

What else affects employment levels in the industry?

With growth in hotel room inventory has come growth in employment. Figure 11 displays the hotel room inventory and employment in New York City from 2000 to 2011.

An examination of the figures underlying this chart show that in recent years room inventory has grown by a greater percentage than employment. Hotel room inventory grew by 22 percent between 2006 and 2011 while employment during this period grew by 16 percent. The number of employees per hotel room has declined slightly but steadily. Based on discussions with industry experts, possible explanations for this include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manhattan</th>
<th>Rooms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hilton New York</td>
<td>1,980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York Marriott Marquis</td>
<td>1,949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheraton New York</td>
<td>1,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York’s Hotel Pennsylvania</td>
<td>1,705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waldorf Astoria</td>
<td>1,416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriott at the Brooklyn Bridge</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheraton Brooklyn</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aloft</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairfield Inn &amp; Suites</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holiday Inn Express Downtown</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York LaGuardia Marriott</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LaGuardia Plaza</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtyard by Marriott LaGuardia</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hilton Garden Inn/JFK Airport</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarion Hotel at LaGuardia</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE | NYC & Company

Table 4: Largest Hotels in Manhattan, Brooklyn and Queens
**FIGURE 9. New York City Occupancy Rate and Traveler Accommodation Industry Employment, 2011**

![Occupancy Rate and Employment Chart](chart1.png)

**FIGURE 10. Turnover in the New York City Traveler and Accommodation Industry (Q1 2007 - Q1 2011)**

![Turnover Chart](chart2.png)

**SOURCE** | Occupancy rates from PKF Consulting; Employment from New York State Department of Labor, Current Employment Statistics

**SOURCE** | Bureau of the Census, Quarterly Workforce Indicators Online
### Increases in the number of limited service vs. full-service hotels

Limited-service hotels generally have no restaurant, less meeting space, and usually do not offer concierge or bell service. Thus, their “employment profile” is different than full-service hotels.

### More third-party operation of certain functions

The two most often mentioned were food and beverage services and laundry service, both of which are frequently contracted out by hotels. Other services sometimes contracted out are security and parking, although these are smaller. Any increased employment in these functions would not be reflected in the traveler accommodation industry, but in food services or dry cleaning and laundry services, for example. In fact, New York City employment in food services increased by 26 percent from 2006 to 2011. However, the extent to which this increase was due to services contracted by hotels is not known.

### Less demand for bell service, even in full-service hotels

Several hoteliers mentioned that suitcases have wheels and people travel lighter.

### Self-check-in at kiosks

Some hotels are making extensive use of self-check-in at kiosks, and have devised other ways to provide individual attention to guests; at

---

**Figure 11. Hotel Room Inventory and Employment in New York City, 2000 to 2011**

![Graph showing hotel room inventory and employment in New York City from 2000 to 2011.](source)

**Source:** Room inventory from NYC & Company, Employment from New York State Department of Labor, QCEW, 2000-2011.
other hotels, guests prefer to check-in in person, with the attendant individual attention. This may be having a small effect on staffing patterns now, but could have a greater impact in the future.

Even though employment may not have grown as much as increases in hotel room capacity, there has been and is currently a demand for workers in the industry.

What is employer demand right now?

The NYCLMIS conducted an analysis of current traveler accommodations job openings in New York City using Wanted Analytics, a producer of real-time labor market information drawn from current online listings of job advertisements. Table 5 shows the results of this analysis by occupation. Lodging managers and food service supervisors topped the list, followed by guest service agents (also known as front desk clerks), sales managers and room attendants.

The top employers advertising for these jobs (not shown) were Marriott, Morgans Group, Intercontinental Hotels, Hilton Worldwide, and Highgate Hotels. Morgans Group owns or operates boutique hotels including the Hudson, Mondrian Soho and others. Highgate owns or operates both “brand name” and independent hotels in New York City like the Doubletree Times Square and the Paramount Hotel. (Marriott, Intercontinental Hotels and Hilton Worldwide are described in more detail on pages 3 and 4 of this report.)

Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a hiring scale, which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find workers in all categories listed in Table 5 except guest service agents, which they rated as fairly difficult, and lodging managers, which they rated as difficult to hire. This is consistent with information offered by industry experts who were interviewed in connection with this research.

What do people in the industry earn on average?

Table 6 displays the average annual wage earned in the traveler accommodation industry by borough of employment for 2000 and 2011. This information is expressed as real 2011 wages, adjusting for inflation. There is a disparity between the earnings of workers in Manhattan hotels, most of which

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Ads*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lodging Managers</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors of Food Preparation and Serving Workers</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Service Agents</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Managers</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Room Attendants</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiters and Waitresses</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors of Housekeeping and Janitorial Workers</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dining Room Attendants</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant Cooks</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing Managers</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Count of unduplicated new ads by direct employers

SOURCE Wanted Analytics Hiring Demand Dashboard
are union, and workers in hotels in the outer boroughs, many of which are non-union hotels.

People who worked in Manhattan, who represent the vast majority of those employed in the industry, earned the highest wages, an average of $55,390 per year in 2011. This is presumably related to the concentration of large, unionized hotels in Manhattan. Also, some of the larger hotels in Manhattan that are non-union match the union pay rates. Employees working in other boroughs earned less, with those in Staten Island and the Bronx earning between $21,000 and $22,000 that same year. Many if not most of the hotels in these boroughs are non-union. After adjusting for inflation, the average annual wage of traveler accommodation industry employees declined by one percent between 2000 and 2011. Only those employed in Manhattan earned slightly more in real dollars in 2011 than they had in 2000.

Recruitment, Retention, Training, and Advancement

How do hotels find qualified applicants? Where should jobseekers go to obtain employment?

For positions in hotels covered by the collective bargaining agreement, all vacancies must be posted with the Hotel & Motel Trades Council for 48 hours to allow the union time to refer any qualified members that are on layoff or worked for a hotel that closed. The hotel must consider these referrals first. If no one is referred within the 48 hours, or if the candidates are not suitable for the position (with documentation and union sign-off), the employer can hire
from the general public. The union does not maintain a hiring hall for non-members. The employer makes all hiring decisions. New hires in union-covered positions become union members after 90 days of employment. There is a seniority system in unionized hotels, and new employees usually start with less desirable shifts.

Recruitment methods differ between start-up and existing hotels. For a new hotel, especially a large one, recruitment is broad-based. In addition to the union, if it is a unionized hotel, the new hotel may reach out to many public, non-profit and private entities. For example NYC Business Solutions (operated by the Department of Small Business Services), along with community partners, often works with hotels in start-up mode. Some of the organizations utilized by hotels are non-profit organizations that receive public funding. Hotels will also generally list jobs on their own websites and industry-specific websites as well as LinkedIn, Facebook, Craigslist, Monster and other job sites. Human resource managers and higher management choose their own recruitment methods.

The New Labor Management Agreement

In early 2012, negotiations were concluded for a new industry-wide agreement between the Hotel Association of New York City (representing 142 “labor” hotel members) and the Hotel and Motel Trades Council that covers 21,000 union members. The agreement took effect on July 1, 2012 and runs for 7 years. An agreement for the Hilton brand operated by Blackstone Group and covering another 3,000 – 4,000 employees has also been concluded. In total, more than 150 hotels are under contract. The union estimates that these agreements cover 80 percent of full-service hotels and 65 to 80 percent of hotel employment in Manhattan.

The industry-wide agreement includes employer-funded full family medical and dental coverage for the entire seven-year contract. It should be noted that most healthcare services are provided through jointly-operated Health & Dental Centers in Manhattan (2), Queens (1) and Brooklyn (1). These Centers are primarily staffed with salaried doctors, dentists, nurses, counselors and others.

Sample pay rates at the start of the new agreement, July 1, 2012 (assumes a 35 hour work week):

- Room Attendant: $923/week ($26.35/hour)
- Dishwasher: $897/week ($25.62/hour)
- Food Server: $477/week ($13.63/hour) + tips
- Painter: $959/week ($27.39/hour)
- Front Desk Clerk: $924/week ($26.39/hour)
- Operating Engineer: $996/week ($28.47/hour)
methods and tend to use those methods and organizations that have provided qualified candidates in the past.

In filling vacancies, recruitment may be less broad-based. Hotels welcome referrals from existing employees and industry colleagues for all positions. Based on interviews with hoteliers and other industry experts, there are few if any problems finding qualified candidates for positions such as room attendant. While some of these positions are advertised, interviews and focus groups conducted for this study suggest that many positions are filled through word-of-mouth, networking and/or direct applications to the employer. For line-level customer service positions and management positions, many hotels have relationships with colleges and universities, and many hotels utilize interns as a pipeline to regular employment.

Internships are somewhat circumscribed by the union agreement, but are often utilized in management positions and in non-union hotels. Industry employers report more difficulty finding talented middle and upper-level management people with experience in New York City in areas such as human resources, finance and sales.

Many hotels list vacant positions on their own websites, on the websites of the companies that own or manage the hotels, or on industry websites (e.g., www.hcareers.com). For example, Highgate Hotels, which owns a dozen hotels in Manhattan of different brands, maintains a job website dedicated to recruitment (www.highgatecareers.com). Similarly, Hersha Hospitality Management has a recruitment website (http://careers.hershahotels.com). One hotelier said that there is word-of-mouth entry into the industry at every level. Hotels are always looking for people who are service-oriented.

Many hotels do not accept paper applications and require that applications be submitted online. One hotelier said that this is a proxy for a comfort level using computers. Given the volume of applications received, some advise candidates to follow up to pursue the opportunity.

A focus group, co-sponsored with the NYC Employment & Training Coalition, was held with education and training providers to glean their experiences with recruitment, retention and advancement of their customers in the traveler accommodation industry. According to these agencies and organizations, it is critical to have personal contacts with human resources people or managers at hotels in order to secure internships and place students in the industry. The job developers must be able refer the types of employees when they are needed or risk damaging their employer relationships. To be successful at placing their customers, the providers find that the placement process should begin three to four months in advance to be in sync with hotel hiring schedules. According to the providers, hotels typically staff up in anticipation of their “spring rush” and “September rush.”

The providers also note that the internships/externships that are a part of some of their education and training programs are crucial to securing a job in the industry. That being said, many providers have found it difficult to get their students internships or jobs in the larger Manhattan, predominantly union hotels,
and consequently they often work with the smaller and outer-borough non-union hotels, which seem to be more receptive to their students. Some believe that unionized hotels hire people who already have experience. They also commented that people who do get a union job are usually expected to work a lot of “off shifts” and holidays. Education and training providers commented on the low turnover in unionized hotels, and some feel that the larger, more prominent Manhattan hotels are looking for candidates that are more highly educated or from more privileged backgrounds than their students may be.

In general, the education and training providers find the industry more difficult in which to place candidates than other industries; although they spoke of having had success placing students in the boutique and smaller hotels, and with larger food service establishments such as school and corporate cafeterias.

The Career Academies in the New York City public schools have noted that increasingly fewer of their graduates continue employment or education in the industry. It is difficult to secure internships for those under 18 years of age so students have not had enough of a chance to experience the industry. One training provider commented that sometimes jobs in hotels are seasonal, and because of “last-in-first out” principles, new employees can be laid off after just a few months, which has an impact on agencies’ ability to achieve their job retention goals.

What type of traits and skills do employers prefer?

Every hotelier interviewed discussed the qualities they look for in new candidates and said that they would train people with these attributes. While the qualities they look for are somewhat different depending on the position, they often include:

- **Service orientation.** Above all else, hoteliers say that they want people who want to be of service to others and who have the ability to handle people. This was alternatively referred to as “excellent attitude and great customer service skills” and as “people who want to interface with the guest.” Some upscale or preferred hotels look for people with three to five years of customer service experience.
- **Intellectual curiosity and problem-solving ability.** They want people who are interested in understanding why things work the way they do, and who are able to be creative and responsive in solving problems.
- **Presentation, drive and personality.** This was also referred to as “composure, demeanor, and work ethic.”
- **Tech-savvy.** Hoteliers want people who can “move around a computer quickly” and understand smartphone technology. The newer positions, such as revenue management, also require an understanding of “distribution channels” as well as a strong grasp of sophisticated analytics.
- **The ability to read and speak English fluently.** Also, second and multiple languages are a plus. With the large number of international visitors, facility with another language is desirable. In addition to language, some experts mentioned that they look for people
who can relate to guests with cultural sensitivity.

- **People who have traveled and enjoy travelling.** Hotels especially value individuals who have travel experience in common with their clientele.

- **Flexibility.** In order to get ahead in the industry, people working within it must be willing to move around and sometimes take jobs they might not prefer. In all cases, working in the hotel industry is not a typical “9 to 5, Monday to Friday” job, as guests stay at hotels in the evening and on weekends and holidays. Because everything in the unionized hotels is based on seniority, newer employees will typically work the less desirable shifts.

The education and training providers were in sync with the industry and echoed most of these traits. They added a few that they believed to be valued by employers, including knowledge of industry computer applications, such as Opera, Aloha, and Open Table, extroversion, perseverance (because it often takes three to four interviews to land a position at a hotel), and a well-formed ego, which can gracefully withstand whatever customers may do or say.

**What types of education do employers prefer?**

With regard to education, some of the newer hotels prefer a Bachelor’s degree, or at least an Associate’s degree, for every position, which gives the hotel greater flexibility in promoting employees from within who already know the hotel’s culture and are part of the team. Some hotels emphasize choosing the right person. One hotelier said that they interview five to six people for every person hired and put a lot of effort into selection.

For management positions, although some hotels will hire people with a high school degree or an Associate’s degree, most say they look for a Bachelor’s degree. For specialized jobs, such as maintenance, they look for the particular skill set and vocational training. One mentioned that watch engineers (individuals who maintain stationary engines, boilers and other mechanical equipment) must have certain licenses. They may also look for a chef from particular institutions, such as the Culinary Institute of America. For senior leadership positions, some look for a Master’s degree in their area of expertise and a minimum of seven to 10 years of work experience.

The education and training providers expressed some frustration with employers in the industry and would like the industry to be more communicative about its needs; this would foster greater success on the part of education and training providers. They believed that they could improve the efficiency of hotels’ recruitment processes if they had a closer working relationship and could anticipate their needs with greater accuracy. For example, they might be able to help hotels reduce the number of people they have to interview for each position.

**How long do people stay at their jobs? What are the possibilities for advancement?**

Most hotels do not appear to have a problem with retention in the positions that do not require extensive education. All
agreed that turnover is low in union jobs. One hotelier said that retention in all positions is related to how well employees are treated, whether they feel empowered, and whether management listens to them. This includes such details as employee locker rooms and restrooms. One hotelier mentioned that his company surveys its own employees twice each year and that it has committees of employees to recommend improvements. Some believe that there is a connection between the way hotel managers treat their employees and the way these employees treat the hotel’s guests.

Employee empowerment is felt to be very important. Many hotels believe that their employees should be able to solve a problem for a guest immediately rather than having to run problems up a chain of command. Especially in larger hotels, managers feel that they cannot micromanage or control everything, so they need people with sound judgment who can solve problems effectively.

In terms of advancement, everyone interviewed in connection with this research said that there is mobility in the industry and that people can advance. In union hotels, there are career ladders within departments, and someone may advance, for example, from room attendant to floor supervisor. Unionized banquet server positions are relatively high-paying and are virtually always promoted from within. There is seniority within departments in union hotels, which sometimes discourages movement to other departments. There may also be reluctance on the part of some union workers to move into management positions, as they lose certain protections and have a different benefit package.

Several people interviewed mentioned the importance of being flexible, and virtually everyone in the upper management positions appeared to have moved from one hotel to another and/or from one city to another. Several industry experts said that in order to advance, people must sometimes be willing to do different types of jobs. All agreed that people who succeed in the industry work hard and enjoy the business. One person said that the most valuable employees are those who work their way from the ground up – who know every single job.

Career tracks can start in different occupations and take different routes. The manager of a major hotel said that he started in banquet services and worked through event services, sales and marketing, the rooms division and finally operations management. Another said he started in food and beverage and worked his way up. Another track begins with the front office or reception and moves to supervisory and then department director roles. Some careers begin with room attendant positions and move up to management from there. According to several employers, advancement can occur in a matter of just a few years, especially for those employees with the right skills and experience.

The education and training providers emphasized the importance of simply “getting your foot in the door,” especially because they believed that most hotels promote from within. Several providers also believed that housekeeping was the best entry point into the industry because it exposes employees to all of the “back of the house” operations and processes.
What are the relevant education and training programs in the industry?

In general, education and training for the traveler accommodation industry includes culinary arts and food preparation, security, hospitality and customer service, hotel management, and travel and tourism. Education and training programs are offered at many levels and for varying durations. For example, the following university programs were mentioned and highly regarded by the interviewed industry experts:

- NYU Tisch Center for Hospitality, Tourism, and Sports Management
- Cornell University, School of Hotel Administration
- Michigan State, School of Hospitality Business
- Penn State School of Hospitality Management
- Niagara University College of Hospitality and Tourism Management
- Pace University Hospitality and Tourism Management

These programs focus mainly on hotel management and prepare individuals to own and/or operate hotels.

Industry experts mentioned that graduates of the NYU and Cornell programs often go into finance, real estate asset management and venture capital, as opposed to hotel operations. This reflects the changing nature of ownership and management of hotels, and the higher perceived earning potential in real estate compared to hotel operations.

Other regional private colleges and universities offer related programs. These institutions include St. John’s University, New York Institute of Technology, and DeVry University. Johnson & Wales, in Rhode Island, was also mentioned as an option for four-year programs in culinary arts. At CUNY, the New York City College of Technology offers both a four-year and a two-year degree in Hospitality Management; Kingsborough Community College, Department of Tourism and Hospitality, operates two-year degree programs in Tourism and Hospitality and Culinary Arts; LaGuardia Community College offers a two-year degree program in Travel, Tourism and Hospitality Management, and Borough of Manhattan Community College offers a concentration in Travel & Tourism within its two-year degree program in Business Management.

Certificate programs are offered by some of the colleges and universities mentioned above. For example, NYU offers Certificate programs in Hotel Operations, Meeting and Conference Management, Restaurant Operations, and Meeting, Conference and Event Management. Also, many non-profit and private organizations offer programs that prepare people for the hospitality industry. Examples of such organizations, obtained from a poll of New York City Employment and Training Coalition members, include CAMBA, Star Career Academy, AHRC of New York City, Fedcap, the HOPE Program, the DOE Fund, the Institute for Culinary Education, and the Manhattan, Brooklyn and Queens Educational Opportunity Centers.

Finally, the New York City Department of Education operates 12 hospitality career-themed academies, including the High School for Hospitality and Tourism. They have a total of about 1,000 students, 90 percent of whom graduate, and most go on to higher education.
What types of training do people who are already employed in the industry typically receive? Where do they get their training?

Based on the interviews with industry experts, it appears that many hotels invest in their employees by providing professional development. Training is often focused on service quality and preventive maintenance. One hotelier said that they are trying to drive down “problem incidence” and are stepping up quality assurance. Another large hotel has a Director of Training and provides training from “on-boarding” through all job disciplines. Some, such as Hilton, also have substantial web-based training. Several hoteliers offer training such as Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliance, security, anti-terror, fire safety, OSHA, and CPR. In the current security environment, hotel staff must be trained to recognize dangers. Many hotels have a special emergencies person. Some hotels mentioned “serve-safe” training for kitchen and culinary staff, including certificates and licenses. Some hotels use online training (e.g. E-Cornell) for managers. There also appears to be a fair amount of on-the-job training, where new employees shadow more experienced ones. The industry organization, the Hotel Association of New York City, Inc., has held seminars for its member hotels in such areas as fire safety, security, and compliance with ADA regulations. There is also an Industry Training Center, located in Long Island City, operated through the joint union-management Training & Scholarship Fund. These training programs are open on a voluntary basis to union members. The Center offers training in three areas:

- Food and beverage department programs, such as a la carte server, banquet server, and tournant;
- Engineering department programs, such as air conditioning and refrigeration mechanic, boiler mechanic, electrical mechanic and plumbing mechanic; and
- Computer skills programs at two different levels.

Most of the employees who take the Center’s programs are housekeeping employees, most of whom want to move into other areas of the industry. One popular course leads to the banquet server credential. By the terms of the labor agreement, banquet server jobs must be posted internally. While hotels do promote union members with this credential into banquet server jobs, there is low turnover in these positions and consequently there are many more qualified and credentialed candidates than there are available openings.

Occupations and Characteristics of the Current Workforce

Table 7 displays information about the most common occupations in the traveler accommodation industry according the New York State Department of Labor.

While the occupation with the largest employment is room attendants, the occupation with the highest number of annual openings, presumably due to higher turnover, is waiters and waitresses (often called food servers in New York City). None of the most common occupations requires a degree from a higher education institution according to national records. In practice, however, more than half of the lodging
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Estimated 2011 Industry Employment</th>
<th>Projected Change 2008 - 2018</th>
<th>Annual Average Openings*</th>
<th>Median Wage*</th>
<th>Typical Education/Training Requirement*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Room Attendants</td>
<td>12,020</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1,020</td>
<td>$36,460</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Service Agents</td>
<td>4,667</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>$36,810</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiter and Waitresses</td>
<td>3,082</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>2,970</td>
<td>$19,540</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooks, Restaurant</td>
<td>2,157</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>1,700</td>
<td>$27,630</td>
<td>M/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance and Repair Workers, General</td>
<td>1,998</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>$41,740</td>
<td>M/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baggage Porters and Bellhops</td>
<td>1,717</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>$27,610</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and Cleaners, Except Maids and Housekeeping Cleaners</td>
<td>1,673</td>
<td>-1%</td>
<td>1,030</td>
<td>$32,500</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Servers- (Non-Restaurant)</td>
<td>1,233</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>$35,210</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-Line Supervisors of Housekeeping and Janitorial Workers</td>
<td>1,013</td>
<td>-3%</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>$51,440</td>
<td>Related exp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dining Room and Cafeteria Attendants and Bartender Helpers</td>
<td>969</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>$18,550</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartenders</td>
<td>925</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>490</td>
<td>$20,220</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security Guards</td>
<td>837</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>$27,500</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishwashers</td>
<td>837</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1,520</td>
<td>$18,830</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers</td>
<td>793</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1,120</td>
<td>$61,590</td>
<td>Related exp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookkeeping, Accounting, and Auditing Clerks</td>
<td>748</td>
<td>-1%</td>
<td>710</td>
<td>$42,950</td>
<td>M/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-Line Supervisors of Food Preparation and Serving Workers</td>
<td>704</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>$37,760</td>
<td>Related exp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lodging Managers</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>$67,300</td>
<td>Related exp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laundry and Dry-Cleaning Workers</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>$22,170</td>
<td>M/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Preparation Workers</td>
<td>488</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1,440</td>
<td>$25,010</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switchboard Operators, Including Answering Service</td>
<td>444</td>
<td>-18%</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>$36,020</td>
<td>S/T OJT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Across all industries - i.e., not specific to traveler accommodation.  
S/J OJT: Short-term on-the-job training;  M/T OJT: Moderate-term on-the-job training.
managers and more than one-quarter of the hotel, motel and resort desk clerks in New York City have a Bachelor’s degree or more.

The highest median wages are earned by lodging managers, followed by first-line supervisors and maintenance and repair workers. It should be noted that individuals in some types of jobs receive cash tips that may not be included in the median wages listed. These would include room attendants and baggage porters and bellhops.

Hoteliers that were interviewed group these jobs into two broad categories:

- **Line-level service positions.** These are jobs such as guest service agents (also known as front desk clerks), lobby assistant, bell persons, and housekeeping.
- **Management positions.** These are jobs such as finance, marketing, technology, facilities, e-commerce, revenue/analytics, and human resources.

Several hoteliers mentioned that there is very slow growth in food and beverage. Often, hotels lease out space to another entity that runs a restaurant. The one new occupation mentioned by several hoteliers was the revenue manager. This function was previously part of marketing or sales, but is now an occupation in its own right. This type of position requires both some experience in the hotel industry, especially reservation systems, and also good analytical skills and expertise in “yield management.”

Table 8 displays the characteristics of the workforce in the traveler accommodation industry in 2000 and 2010, and compares these with the total employed workforce in New York City.

For the most recent period (2010), the vast majority (86%) of those working in the industry in New York City also resided in New York City. Of these, 42 percent lived in Queens, and 25 percent lived in Brooklyn. There are more men than women in the industry, and the industry became more male-dominated between 2000 and 2010. A large proportion of the workforce (71%) is foreign-born, and this percentage increased over the decade. The top countries of birth for the foreign-born are the Dominican Republic, China, and Jamaica.

The proportion of Asian workers in the industry increased from 11 percent in 2000 to 23 percent in 2010. The percentage of Blacks and Hispanics employed in the industry is on par with their representation in New York City’s employed workforce, while Whites are underrepresented and Asians are overrepresented. With the high level of unionization and relatively low turnover, it is not surprising that the industry’s workforce is older than New York City’s overall employed workforce. This may present opportunities for younger workers, as some of the older people currently employed in these occupations retire from the workforce.

Those employed in the industry had higher levels of education in 2010 than they did in 2000, mirroring a similar trend in the overall workforce. There was a notable decrease in the proportion with less than a high school diploma from 25 percent to 14 percent, but the accommodation industry workforce has a higher proportion of people with a high school education than the overall employed labor force in New York City.

A large proportion of the workforce (71%) is foreign-born, and this percentage increased over the decade.
### TABLE 8. Demographic Characteristics of the New York City Traveler Accommodation Industry Cluster Workforce and Total Employed Workforce, 2000 and 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2000 Industry</th>
<th>2000 All</th>
<th>2010 Industry</th>
<th>2010 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Workforce*</td>
<td>34,903</td>
<td>3,729,475</td>
<td>45,248</td>
<td>4,217,881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York City Residents</td>
<td>29,587</td>
<td>2,902,068</td>
<td>38,917</td>
<td>3,307,236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-New York City Residents**</td>
<td>5,316</td>
<td>827,407</td>
<td>6,331</td>
<td>910,645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US-Born</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign-Born</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 18 - 24</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 - 34</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - 44</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 - 54</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55+</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than high school or GED</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school or GED</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college/Associate’s degree</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA or More</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NOTE** | Data is restricted to those 18+ in the non-institutionalized population who are employed in the civilian labor force.

*Workforce estimates do not match earlier employment figures because they are from a different data source. The differences between the Census on the one hand and the Current Employment Statistics and Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages have been documented but never addressed.

**The remaining percentages that appear in the table are of people who both live and work in New York City.

**SOURCE** | Public use Microdata Samples from the 2000 Census and 2010 American Community Survey
Key Findings and Implications for Workforce Development

Key Findings

The principal findings of the research and recommendations for workforce professionals are as follows:

- **Hotel room inventory along with hotel employment have increased substantially in the last ten years and are projected to grow further into the future**, with multiple construction projects already under way. The industry’s growth has been stimulated by an increase in visitors to the City, favorable conditions for commercial real estate development, and zoning regulations that allow hotel construction in many commercial and light manufacturing districts.

- **The hotel industry is heavily concentrated in Manhattan**; however, in recent years, there has been more development than ever in Brooklyn, Queens and Staten Island. Job growth has been strong and is expected to continue into the next few years.

- **There are more limited-service hotels, boutique hotels, and more contracting out of certain functions**, such as food and beverage service and laundry service. There are also many new, smaller boutique hotels. Smaller and limited-service hotels employ fewer people, making “wholesale” job development more difficult. Some opportunities for work in hotels can be found outside of the industry itself, with firms that provide contracted services to hotels.

- **There are employment opportunities in many different kinds of jobs**, from room attendants to maintenance to front desk positions to a full range of management jobs, from supervising hotel operations to analyzing trends and maximizing revenue. These jobs are held by people with all levels of education, although trends point to higher levels of education in every job.

- **There is upward mobility in the industry** for people who are ambitious, flexible and customer-service oriented.

- **The hotel industry in New York City is highly unionized**, with a large portion of the workforce covered by a collective bargaining agreement. The unionized workforce is concentrated in the larger, full-service hotels and in Manhattan. This workforce enjoys good pay and benefits, and the union scale influences pay and benefits in some non-union hotels as well. Turnover in the unionized jobs is low, resulting in a workforce that is somewhat older.

- **The industry’s workforce is diverse**. Most (71 percent) are foreign-born. They reside in all five boroughs, with the greatest proportion (42 percent) living in Queens. The proportions of white, black, Hispanic and Asian workers are all in the 21%-27% range. There are more men than women working in the industry. More than half the workforce is 45 years of age or older.

- **Employers do not report having difficulty filling positions that require less education but do report having moderate difficulty finding managers of all types**, especially those with experience in the industry in New York City. Several mentioned the need for people to work in revenue
management, as hotels are now updating prices and meeting market demands on a daily basis through advanced market analytics.

- There is a broad range of education and training programs at all levels to prepare people for work in this industry. These range from top hotel management schools such as Cornell and NYU to two- and four-year hospitality, travel/tourism and culinary arts degree programs at several CUNY colleges and other local universities, as well as programs run by non-profit organizations and hospitality-career-themed academies operated by the New York City Department of Education. In general, these institutions are well-informed about the industry and make every effort to engage students in internships or work assignments in the industry before graduation.

Implications for Workforce Development

The main audience for this report is people and organizations that help individuals prepare for, find, and keep jobs in this industry. These include City agencies, education and training institutions, labor exchange agencies and staffing services. The following are the major implications of the research findings for their practice:

For counselors and jobseekers:

- Counselors should advise jobseekers that people who like a fast pace and are outgoing thrive best in the “front-of-the-house” occupations in the industry, such as food servers and guest service agents.
- There is no central clearinghouse or “cookie-cutter” way to land a job in the industry. Jobseekers need to hone their job search and networking skills to find and land job opportunities.
- In general, industry hiring picks up in the weeks before peak demand, in early fall and during winter holidays. Job searches in summer and early fall are likely to yield more openings than during other times of year.
- Opportunities for jobs that require comparatively less education – e.g., room attendants and wait staff – are highly competitive. Jobseekers should be prepared to make multiple efforts to “get their foot in the door,” and possibly undergo rigorous vetting during the interview process.
- Entry-level jobseekers should be coached to anticipate that they might be asked to work in different jobs or off-hours/holidays until they have gained experience in the industry.
- Jobseekers and counselors should regularly visit industry and employer-specific online job boards, such as hcareers.com, highgatecareers.com, hershacareers.com, and hotel websites. LinkedIn is also a popular site for employers to advertise for office and management positions.

For program managers and job developers:

- At the time of this report, there is uncertainty about future economic
conditions in Europe and Asia. Providers should keep track of these conditions and how they influence consumer demand for hotels in New York City.

- Workforce providers should expect to spend more time and effort to establish trust and cultivate strong working relationships with human resources managers in the traveler accommodation industry.

- When new lodgings open, multiple positions have to be filled. Job developers should stay current about industry conditions and identify upcoming hotel construction projects.

For policy makers:

- Postsecondary programs in hospitality and culinary arts arrange credit-bearing externships and internships with the industry. Opportunities for adults who are not in higher education—and for younger people—are much more uncommon. Agencies can be helpful by working with industry leaders to identify ways of expanding internship opportunities that are amenable and beneficial to both labor and management.

- According to employers consulted in the course of this research, the industry’s current recruitment, screening and hiring practices are effective at finding qualified candidates. Sector-specific workforce programs will likely have to mount a convincing argument that their services can improve upon existing practices.
ENDNOTES

i. See Appendix B for a list of the individuals interviewed, consulted, and that participated in focus groups.


iii. 2011 QCEW, New York State Department of Labor.


xi. NYC & Company.


xiii. Ibid.

xiv. Ibid.


xvi. Examples of districts where hotels are restricted or prohibited include some light commercial areas outside of the Manhattan core and further than 1,000 feet from an arterial entrance, and certain amusement and waterfront districts.

xvii. CES, 2000-2012.

xviii. An example of this offered by several industry experts is the Marriott Marquis.

xix. A detailed analysis of age, residence, sex, education, race/ethnicity and nativity by occupation is available upon request.
APPENDIX A. METHODS

Wherever possible in this report, the NYCLMIS combined and synthesized multiple sources to address the research questions. The research methods and sources of data used in this study are listed below and cited throughout the document in references, source notes, and the narrative itself.

- Review of literature, primarily business association reports and journals for market and policy drivers and current trends;
- Secondary data analysis for employment and wages, including:
  - U.S. Bureau of the Census’ 2000 Decennial Census public use microdata sample and American Community Survey, public use microdata sample, 2010 for demographic trends in the general and occupational workforce; and
- NYC & Company’s trends in hotel occupancy rates, room capacity, and travel by type and origin for business trends;
- Jones Lang LaSalle Hotels’ Hotel Intelligence New York June 2012;
- Wanted Analytics’ monthly online ad volume, skills in demand, online advertisers (employers) for information about “real-time” demand in late 2012 and early 2013;
- Interviews with hoteliers, corporate chain owners, labor union leadership and hotel association members; and
- Focus group with education and training providers.

APPENDIX B. INDUSTRY EXPERTS INTERVIEWED*

Babette Audant
Director, Center for Economic and Workforce Development
CUNY Kingsborough Community College

Vijay Dandapani
President
Apple Core Hotels

Barry Dinerstein
Deputy Director, Housing, Economic and Infrastructure Planning
New York City Department of City Planning

Regina Flannery
Director
NYC NAF Academies Career & Technical Education

Ernesto Freire
Director, Government Affairs
NYC & Company

Dzemal Hamzic
Program Manager Workforce Development
CAMBA

Odetta N. King
Business Transient Sales Manager
Sheraton JFK Airport Hotel
APPENDIX C. OCCUPATIONAL SPOTLIGHTS AND REAL-TIME JOBS REPORTS

Amelia Lim
Executive Vice President
Jones Lang LaSalle Hotels

Geoffrey Mills
Managing Director
Yotel New York

Eileen F. Reilly
Director Workforce Development and Refugee Services
CAMBA

Kimberly Spell
Chief Communications Officer
NYC & Company

Victoria Spitalere
Director of the Training & Scholarship Fund
NY Hotel Trades Council & Hotel Association of NY, Inc.
Employee Benefit Funds

John Turchiano
Communications Director
NY Hotel Trades Council, AFL-CIO

*Additional individuals were interviewed but declined permission to list their names in the report.
**What do cooks in hotels do?**

Cooks, also advertised as Sous Chef, Line Cook, Banquet Cook, Cook Intermediate Line, Banquet Tournant and Cook Tournant, work in restaurants in hotels. They prepare, season, and cook dishes such as soups, meats, vegetables, or desserts in restaurants. They may order supplies, keep records and accounts, price items on menus, or plan menus.

**What qualifications do they need?**

The amount of experience needed depends on the level of the job. Virtually all employers require a high school diploma and prefer a culinary degree. Some previous work-related skill, knowledge, or experience is usually needed.

**How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following were found in recent listings:**

- Cooking experience in all stations in a NYC high volume faced paced upscale restaurant
- Management of station production and effective product cost control to meet set food cost budgets
- Works closely with Chef on all production
- Hands-on cooking for all services
- Must be able to work effectively under pressure with limited time to accomplish multiple deadlines
- Familiar with a variety of concepts, practices and procedures in the Culinary Department
- Practice and be familiar with sanitation and prevention of food-borne illness
- Familiar with general safety regulations

**What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?**

- Must be physically able to lift and handle heavy loads
- Immaculate grooming and hygiene
- Attentive to detail
- Team player
- Work quickly while maintaining high standards of quality in performance
- Effective listening skills, willing to follow direction and team building knowledge
- Flexibility to work an open schedule, i.e. mornings, nights, weekends and holidays
- Ability to handle multiple tasks and prioritize tasks in a deadline driven demanding environment

**How many restaurant cooks are there in New York City and what do they get paid?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Experienced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cooks</td>
<td>20,110</td>
<td>21,820</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>$20,610</td>
<td>$27,630</td>
<td>$35,280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
<td>$45,540</td>
<td>$80,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SOURCE** | New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find cooks.

Employers
All employers that advertised for cooks online from October 5, 2012, to February 1, 2013, are listed in the table to the right. Hilton Hotels Corporation (11), Embassy Suites Hotels (7), Conrad New York (3), Starwood Hotels & Resorts Worldwide (3), and Marriott International (3) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
The skills, tools and technologies most commonly mentioned in job ads were food preparation, adaptability, dependability, self-starting/self-motivation, and organizational skills.

Certifications
There were no certifications listed in online job advertisements for cooks.

Ad Volume
Since December 2008, a monthly average of 7 new jobs has been posted online for cooks in the traveler accommodation industry. Online advertising for cooks is very low, reflecting two trends in the industry: a) hotels are contracting with other companies for food service; and b) the growth in the number of limited-service hotels that offer no food service at all.

Job Location
Of the 43 jobs advertised in New York City in the four-month period from October 2012 to January 2013, 40 were in Manhattan, 2 in Queens, and the location of one job was not specified.

Top Employers Advertising for Cooks
October 5, 2012 to February 1, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer</th>
<th>Jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hilton Hotels Corporation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embassy Suites Hotels</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conrad New York</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starwood Hotels &amp; Resorts Worldwide</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriott International</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York Athletic Club, Inc.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance New York Times Square Hotel</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highgate Hotels</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyatt Hotels &amp; Resorts</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hersha Hospitality Management</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pierre</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandarin Oriental, New York</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheraton JFK Airport Hotel</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgans Group, LLC</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soho House New York</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interstate Hotels and Resorts</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>43</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Wanted Analytics Hiring Demand Dashboard NYC
What do guest service agents do?
Guest Service Agents, also called Front Desk Agents or Clerks, provide service to guests during check-in, throughout their stay, and at checkout. They register and assign rooms to guests, issue room keys or cards, transmit and receive messages, keep records of occupied rooms and guests’ accounts, make and confirm reservations, and present statements to and collect payments from departing guests.

What qualifications do they need?
Employers generally require a high school diploma or equivalent and prefer college course work in a related field. In New York City, more than 25 percent of guest service agents have a Bachelor’s degree and another 50 percent have some college. Previous work-related skill, knowledge, or experience is often needed. Customer service experience is usually required.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:
- Provide attentive, courteous and efficient service in checking in and out hotel’s guests
- Assist and respond to guests, offering information regarding the hotel services and local attractions
- Handle cash; complete daily shift paper work and balance cash drawer
- Have complete knowledge of all hotel rates and brand promotions
- Be available to work a varied schedule including weekends, nights, and holidays
- Professionally direct telephone calls and accurately make reservations
- Have knowledge of emergency procedures and assist as needed
- Fully comprehend and able to operate all relevant aspects of the front desk computer system

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?
- Professional and organized; good communication skills
- Multi-lingual highly preferred
- General knowledge of front office operations
- Computer experience/excellent computer skills
- Excellent people skills/exceptional customer service skills
- Neat appearance, pleasant and hospitable attitude

How many guest service agents are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Experienced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guest Service Agents</td>
<td>3,030</td>
<td>3,290</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>$24,970</td>
<td>$36,810</td>
<td>$42,690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
<td>$45,540</td>
<td>$80,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source**: New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Ad Volume
Since December 2008, a monthly average of 30 new jobs has been posted online for guest service agents in the traveler accommodation industry. Employer demand has been seasonal with lower demand during winter months. Although demand has been somewhat volatile since 2008, the trend-line shows that it has been growing in general, although weaker than expected in the latter half of 2012.

Job Location
Of the 72 jobs advertised in New York City in the four-month period from October 2012 to January 2013, 58 were in Manhattan, eight in Queens, and three in Brooklyn. The rest did not specify location.

Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it slightly difficult to find guest service agents.

Employers
All employers that advertised for guest service agents online from October 27, 2012, to January 24, 2013, are listed in the table to the right. Marriott International (12) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
The skills, tools and technologies most commonly mentioned in job ads were adaptability, dependability, oral and written communication skills, property management system, and detail-orientation.

Certifications
The only certification requested in ads seeking GSAs was first aid certification.
What do janitors and cleaners do?
Janitors and Cleaners (except maids and housekeeping cleaners), also advertised as House Person, keep buildings in clean and orderly condition. They perform heavy cleaning duties, such as cleaning floors, shampooing rugs, washing walls and glass, and removing rubbish. Duties may include tending furnace and boiler, performing routine maintenance activities, notifying management of need for repairs, and cleaning snow or debris from sidewalk.

What qualifications do they need?
Little or no previous work-related skill, knowledge, or experience is needed for these occupations. Employees in these occupations need anywhere from a few days to a few months of training. Usually, an experienced worker can show new employees how to do the job.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:
- Clean designated areas including lobbies, vestibules and corridors, stairwells and landings, elevator cabs, restrooms, common areas, offices and banquet/meeting/conference rooms, loading and storage areas
- Perform tasks including dusting and polishing furniture and fixtures, vacuuming, mopping, sweeping, shampooing carpets, washing windows, cleaning/waxing floors, removing and disposing of trash, complying with all recycling mandates
- Identify and report maintenance deficiencies and items in need of repair
- Stock and maintain supply rooms as needed; empty room attendant carts of soiled linen and trash
- Perform deep cleaning tasks and special projects, e.g. flip mattresses, move furniture

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?
- Courteous, friendly, polite; good people skills; able to communicate in English
- Ability to lift, bend, stoop, walk, push or pull heavy equipment, and stand for extended periods of time.
- Lifting may include equipment or furniture weighing up to 100 pounds
- Familiar with basic tools and grounds-keeping equipment
- Hard working, energetic, comfortable in a busy and physical work environment
- Janitorial or landscaping background can be helpful

How many janitors and cleaners are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Annual Wages, 2012 Q1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and Cleaners, Except Maids and Housekeeping Cleaners</td>
<td>90,190</td>
<td>89,120</td>
<td>1,700</td>
<td>Entry: $20,080; Median: $32,500; Experienced: $38,540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>Entry: $22,810; Median: $45,540; Experienced: $80,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
**Hiring Difficulty**

Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find janitors and cleaners.

**Employers**

Only Starwood Hotels & Resorts Worldwide advertised for two positions in the past four months.

**Skills, Tools and Technologies**

Dependability, adaptability, dusting, vacuum cleaners, and cushions were mentioned as skills, tools and technologies for janitors and cleaners.

**Certifications**

 Employers did not request any certification for janitors and cleaners.

---

**Ad Volume**

Since December 2008, there has been a monthly average of one new job posted online for janitors and cleaners in the traveler accommodation industry. Online advertising for janitors and cleaners is very low, suggesting that hotels use other methods for finding new employees or contract with other companies for cleaning services.

**Job Location**

Both jobs advertised in New York City in the four-month period from September 2012 to January 2013 were in Manhattan.

**Top Employers Advertising for Janitors and Cleaners**

September 26, 2012 to January 23, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Starwood Hotels &amp; Resorts Worldwide, Inc.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source**

Wanted Analytics Hiring Demand Dashboard NYC
What do lodging managers do?
Lodging managers make sure that guests on vacation or business travel have a pleasant experience, while also ensuring that a hotel or other lodging establishment is run efficiently and profitably. They plan, direct, or coordinate activities of an organization that operates hotels, motels, and other accommodations. There are different types of lodging managers. The General Manager has full responsibility for the hotel. There are also managers for different functions within a hotel, such as Front Office manager and Housekeeping manager.

What qualifications do they need?
Managers must have related experience in the industry, with the amount of experience dependent on the type and level of management. Most employers prefer that managers have a four-year degree and experience. For some types of management positions, one to two years of on-the-job experience and informal training with experienced workers may be sufficient.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:
■ Manage daily activities of front desk team members, to ensure quality service is maintained in accordance with hotel standards
■ Hire, train, evaluate, counsel, schedule and supervise front desk staff including ensuring compliance with procedures and overall performance issues
■ Conduct staff meetings including a review of hotel standards, departmental procedures and operating issues
■ Prepare schedules for staff to ensure adequate coverage and effectively control labor costs
■ Manage resolution of guest complaints

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?
■ Effective communication skills, both verbal and written
■ Ability to multi-task and prioritize
■ Effectiveness at listening to, understanding, and clarifying concerns raised by employees and guests
■ High standards of personal appearance and grooming
■ Ability to understand and evaluate complex information and data from various sources to meet objectives

How many lodging managers are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Experienced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lodging Managers</td>
<td>820</td>
<td>920</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>$53,600</td>
<td>$67,300</td>
<td>$97,260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
<td>$45,540</td>
<td>$80,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE | New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it moderately difficult to find lodging managers.

Employers
Employers that advertised for lodging managers online from September 26, 2012, to January 23, 2013, are listed in the table to the right. Marriott International (21), Interstate Hotels and Resorts (17), the InterContinental Hotels Group (15), and Hilton Worldwide (11) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
The skills, tools and technologies most commonly mentioned in job ads for lodging managers were adaptability, dependability, quality audits, restaurant management, and oral and written communication skills.

Certifications
The fire safety certificate was the only certification mentioned in job ads by employers seeking for lodging managers.

Ad Volume
Since December 2008, an average of 34 jobs per month has been posted online for lodging managers. Hiring peaked in May 2010 and was also high the same time of year in 2011 and 2012. The lowest hiring season is in the first quarter of the year (January – March). Accounting for seasonal variation and in spite of the recession, demand for lodging managers has been growing since 2008.
What do maintenance and repair workers do?
These workers, also called Watch Engineers, General Mechanics, Mechanics, Engineers, Maintenance Engineers, and Maintenance Mechanics perform work involving the skills of two or more maintenance or craft occupations to keep machines, mechanical equipment, or the structure of the physical facility in repair. Duties may involve pipe fitting; boiler making; insulating; welding; machining; carpentry; repairing electrical or mechanical equipment; installing, aligning, and balancing new equipment; and repairing buildings, floors, or stairs.

What qualifications do they need?
Previous work-related skill, knowledge, or experience is required for these occupations. This could be in construction, electrical, HVAC, boilers and mechanical systems and their maintenance and repair, or another discipline. Generally, a high school diploma or equivalent and experience in a related field are required. Some employers may require apprenticeship, several years of vocational training, and/or evidence of passing the licensing exam.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:
- Maintain all mechanical items in guest rooms, public and back of house areas
- Fix minor plumbing problems such as unclogging drains, plunging toilets, and repairing leaky faucets
- Perform miscellaneous minor repairs such as tightening loose toilet seats, changing light bulbs, and patching holes in walls
- Perform preventative maintenance on tools and equipment, including cleaning and lubrication
- Maintain daily logs of operation, maintenance, and safety activities
- Communicate with guests/customers when necessary to resolve maintenance issues
- Report maintenance problems, safety hazards, accidents, or injuries; and complete safety training and certifications
- Have understanding of fire alarm procedures and other emergencies

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?
- Effectiveness in handling, anticipating, preventing, identifying and solving problems as necessary
- Knowledge of codes, laws and regulations including those associated with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)
- Able to work non-traditional hours and shifts
- Ability to handle stress when dealing with upset guests

How many maintenance and repair workers are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Annual Wages, 2012 Q1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance and Repair Workers</td>
<td>47,950</td>
<td>50,830</td>
<td>1,030</td>
<td>$27,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE | New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find maintenance workers.

Job Location
Of the 16 traveler accommodation industry maintenance and repair jobs advertised in New York City in the four-month period from October 2012 to February 2013, 15 were in Manhattan and one in Brooklyn.

Employers
All employers in the traveler accommodation industry that advertised for maintenance workers online from October 5, 2012, to February 1, 2013, are listed in the table to the right. Marriott International (8) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
The skills, tools and technologies most commonly mentioned in job ads were preventive maintenance, preventive maintenance inspections, vacuum cleaners, troubleshooting, and air conditioning systems.

Certifications
There were no certifications included in jobs listings for maintenance workers.

Ad Volume
Since December 2008, a monthly average of 8 new jobs has been posted online for maintenance and repair workers in the traveler accommodation industry. Demand for maintenance workers is seasonal with lower demand during winter months. The trend-line shows that demand for maintenance workers was relatively stable until late 2011 when it began a period of weakening.
What do room attendants do?
Room attendants maintain clean and attractive guestrooms while providing courteous and efficient service to all guests. They perform general cleaning tasks such as making beds, replenishing linens, cleaning rooms and halls, and vacuuming.

What qualifications do they need?
Most employers in New York City prefer candidates with a high school diploma or equivalent and/or experience in a hotel or a related field. Many employers note that the job may involve working on weekends and holidays.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:
- Thoroughly clean guestrooms and bathrooms according to standards
- Complete all pre-cleaning duties, including filling cart with supplies and transporting to assigned area
- Replace dirty linens and towels with clean items; make beds and fold towels
- Remove all trash and dirty linen from guestrooms and hallways
- Vacuum carpets and perform floor care duties
- Report all missing items from room to Housekeeping Supervisor/Manager
- Report any maintenance repairs needed to Housekeeping Supervisor/Manager
- Be attentive, helpful and courteous to all guests, managers and fellow employees

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?
- Physical capability to lift, carry, push, pull or otherwise move objects, sometimes up to 50 pounds
- Ability to communicate in English and communicate well with guests
- Effectiveness in handling, anticipating, preventing, identifying and solving problems as necessary
- Ability to maintain a professional appearance, which often includes wearing the proper uniform
- Ability to scrub and scour surfaces
- Knowledge of cleaning agents and operation of cleaning equipment
- Ability to function as part of a team

How many room attendants are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Room Attendants</th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Experienced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>49,620</td>
<td>50,890</td>
<td>1,020</td>
<td>$22,450</td>
<td>$36,460</td>
<td>$42,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
<td>$45,540</td>
<td>$80,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE | New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find room attendants.

Employers
All employers that advertised for room attendants online from October 5, 2012, to February 1, 2013 are listed in the table to the right. Hilton Hotels Corporation (24) and Marriott International (13) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
The most frequently mentioned skills were vacuum cleaners, dusting, and customer service orientation.

Certifications
There were no certifications listed for room attendants.

Ad Volume
Since December 2008, a monthly average of 25 new jobs has been posted online for room attendants in the traveler accommodation industry. Demand is seasonal, with lows in January and February. Overall, demand for room attendants has been growing since 2008. Demand weakened somewhat in the latter half of 2012.
What do security guards at hotels do?
Security guards, also advertised as Loss Prevention Officers, Security Officers, and House Officers ensure the safety of all guests and staff at a hotel. They guard, patrol, and monitor premises to prevent theft, violence, or infractions of rules. They may observe security monitors for unusual activity and investigate reported incidents.

What qualifications do they need?
Employers in New York City generally require a high school diploma or equivalent. Some previous work-related skill, knowledge, or experience is usually needed.

How do employers who are hiring describe the job? The following are listed in recent job postings:

- Patrol all areas of the property
- Monitor Closed Circuit Televisions, perimeter alarm system, and fire safety system
- Lock property entrances when required. Conduct daily physical hazard inspections
- Investigate and document accident, injury and property loss reports
- Respond to accidents, contact EMS or administer first aid/CPR as required
- Assist guests/employees during emergency situations
- Defuse guest/employee disturbances. Call for outside assistance if necessary
- Escort any unwelcome persons from the property without interrupting the orderly flow of property operation
- Actively participate within hotel's emergency response team

What are employers looking for in candidates for this position?

- Excellent oral and written communication skills
- Excellent observation, communication, guest service and report writing skills
- Strong PC skills

How many security guards are there in New York City and what do they get paid?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NYC Jobs 2008</th>
<th>Expected Growth to 2018</th>
<th>Average Openings Per Year</th>
<th>Annual Wages, 2012 Q1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security Guards</td>
<td>67,070</td>
<td>68,480</td>
<td>1,520</td>
<td>$19,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All NYC Occupations</td>
<td>4,103,340</td>
<td>4,257,300</td>
<td>106,000</td>
<td>$22,810</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE | New York State Department of Labor, Occupational Employment Statistics
Ad Volume
Since December 2008, a monthly average of 8 new jobs has been posted online for security guards in the traveler accommodation industry. Peak demand occurred in August 2010, and the lowest was in November 2012. The trend-line shows that demand for security guards has been flat since 2008. The downward trend in 2012 may in part be caused by hotels contracting out security services.

Job Location
Of the job ads directly posted by establishments in the traveler-accommodation industry from October 2012 to January 2013, eight were in Manhattan and three in Queens. The other two adds did not specify location.

Hiring Difficulty
Wanted Analytics scores occupations according to a “hiring scale,” which takes into account the number of current workers in the occupation, the number of employers hiring, local unemployment rates, and pay that is offered, among other factors. According to this scale, employers find it very easy to find security guards.

Employers
All traveler accommodation employers that advertised for security guards online from September 26, 2012, to January 23, 2013, are listed in the table to the right. Marriott International (9) had the most jobs posted.

Skills, Tools and Technologies
Listening devices, dependability, and adaptability were among the skills, tools, and technologies most desired by employers.

Certifications
Many hotel employers required First Aid certification.
New York City’s policy makers and practitioners engaged in workforce development, education, and economic development operate within a dynamic and complex labor market. NYCLMIS develops research and tools and provides strategic consultation to help them make sense of the labor market and make informed decisions that align with it for the benefit of their constituents and the City’s economy as a whole. NYCLMIS is housed within the Center for Urban Research at the City University of New York Graduate Center.

Working with the City University of New York Graduate Center’s faculty and students, the Center for Urban Research organizes basic research on the critical issues that face New York and other large cities in the U.S. and abroad; collaborates on applied research with public agencies, nonprofit organizations, and other partners; and holds forums for the media, foundations, community organizations, and others about urban issues.