

- - - - - x
 PUBLIC MEETING
 FRANCHISE and CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE
 - - - - - x

22 Reade Street
 New York, New York

Monday, September 12, 2011
 2:47 p.m.

APPEARANCES:

- Mayor: Primary, Bill Heinzen
- Office of the Mayor: Alternate, Matthew Gordon
- Corporation Counsel: Primary, Sharon Cantor
- Office of Management and Budget: Primary, Yvonne Quintian
- Comptroller: Alternate, Tony Dell'Olio
- Bronx BP: (Not Present)
- Brooklyn BP: Primary, Jason Otano
- Manhattan BP: Primary, Jimmy Yan
- Queens BP: Primary, Marc McMillan
- Staten Island BP: Primary, Lee Covino
- Clerk: Primary, Adam Buchanan

FIVE STAR REPORTING, INC.
 90 John Street, Suite 411
 New York, New York 10038
 631.224.5054

1 Franchise Concession and Review Committee

2 MR. HEINZEN: We delayed the meeting
3 for a short while hoping that the Bronx BP
4 representative would arrive. He hasn't
5 arrived yet and we just want to get going with
6 the hearing. Will the Clerk please call the
7 roll.

8 THE CLERK: Mayor.

9 MR. HEINZEN: Here.

10 THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor.

11 MR. GORDON: Here.

12 THE CLERK: Comptroller.

13 MR. DELL'OLIO: Here.

14 THE CLERK: Office of Management and
15 Budget.

16 MS. QUINTIAN: Here.

17 THE CLERK: Bronx Borough President is
18 not here. President, Borough of Brooklyn.

19 MR. OTANO: Here.

20 THE CLERK: President, Borough of
21 Manhattan.

22 MR. YAN: Here.

23 THE CLERK: President, Borough of
24 Queens.

25 MR. MCMILLAN: Here.

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee

2 THE CLERK: Staten Island.

3 MR. COVINO: President, Borough of
4 Staten Island.

5 MR. HEINZEN: Office of the Mayor today
6 is represented by Matthew Gordon.

7 Welcome to this Public Hearing of the
8 Franchise and Concession Review Committee.
9 The hearing being conducted today has been
10 publicly advertised in accordance with the New
11 York City Charter and Concession Rules of the
12 City of New York.

13 We want to be sure that anyone desiring
14 to be heard has an opportunity to do so. All
15 persons wishing to speak must fill out a
16 request slip, which may be obtained from the
17 Clerk. Each speaker will be allotted
18 approximately three minutes. When you
19 testify, please state your name and
20 affiliation, if any. Will the Clerk please
21 call the first calendar item.

22 MR. BUCHANAN: In the matter of the
23 intent to award as a concession the operation
24 and maintenance of one interior food
25 concession at Icahn Stadium, the construction,

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee
2 operation and maintenance of three seasonal
3 cafes, and the operation and maintenance of
4 four mobile food units at Randall's Island
5 Park, Manhattan, for one ten-year term, to R
6 Cano Group, Inc.

7 MR. HEINZEN: Is there anyone who
8 wishes to testify in this matter? Can you
9 please come up.

10 MR. BUBBINS: Harry Bubbins. I'm the
11 Director of Friends of Bronx Park, an
12 environmental organization based in the South
13 Bronx since 1999. We've been here before with
14 a different component of the FCRC to stop the
15 Randall's Island Water Park Deal that went
16 down and numerous other issues that we've been
17 very concerned about with Randall's Island, as
18 it's our backyard. We don't even know who
19 this business is, but how are these businesses
20 being decided to use our public space? That's
21 an issue of great troubling concern. In the
22 aftermath of the attempt to give the ball
23 field to private schools which was shut down
24 by the courts and in numerous other
25 environmental issues of Randall's Island, a so

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee
2 called Randall's Island Task Force was
3 created. Have they been informed of this
4 concession? Has Community Board 11, East
5 Harlem been informed of this? Has Community
6 Board Number 1, in the Bronx, been informed of
7 this. Has anyone in the community had an
8 opportunity with their local businesses and
9 cultural relevance to be able to have this
10 kind of business?

11 Just looking at the numbers, \$50,000 in
12 the first year, very loosely, they're doing
13 eight things on Randall's Island which might
14 be alienating parkland as well since they're
15 building more stuff after taking over the
16 natural fields. So that's eight things at
17 \$50,000 a year, very loosely, \$6,000 a year
18 each thing. Let's say six months, they're
19 seasonal, some of them, some of them are not,
20 so that's a \$1,000 each year to the City,
21 about \$40 a day. Who wouldn't want to bid on
22 that? I'd love to run a cafe and have to give
23 the City \$40 a day. That's the kind of
24 decisions that the FCRC has to -- I know this
25 is going on -- every one knows this is going

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee

2 on throughout the City. When are we, Borough
3 President, when are we, Comptroller's Office,
4 going to stand up to this? That's what we're
5 here today to say. Obviously not a lot of
6 people care, but it's a widely prevalent issue
7 throughout the City and we in the South Bronx
8 are sick and tired of not being consulted,
9 people of East Harlem are sick and tired of
10 not being consulted, and this a very small
11 aspect of the whole thing.

12 The South Bronx Greenway to Randall's
13 Island still isn't open. It's like a decade
14 EDC and Randall's Island Sports Foundation and
15 the Mayor's Office is dragging that along.
16 People from the South Bronx still can't get
17 there. The East Harlem Bridge is closed most
18 of the year, people can't walk there.
19 Everyone knows who goes there to go use the
20 new tennis stadium, it's rich people from the
21 upper east side of Riverdale predominantly.
22 That's who these cafes are meant to cater to
23 and I think at some point some of us have to
24 take a stand to all of this and bring all
25 these entities to the table to the Randall's

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee

2 Island Task Force, to the community boards, to
3 the community organizations that used to use
4 the parks that are now cut out from it.

5 I'll also say there's other issues
6 coming up in the Borough President's office of
7 the Bronx, who's not here, with the FCRC and
8 the parks. Mill Pond Park, and I see a
9 representative from the park is here, Building
10 J as part of the Yankee Stadium replacement
11 parks, they're trying to give away space there
12 to another politically connected group and we
13 are going to oppose that. So I want everyone
14 at FCRC to know, especially the Comptroller's
15 Office, and other people at Citywide
16 Ambitions, that we do not support a sole
17 source concession at Mill Pond Park, Building
18 J in the Bronx which --

19 MR. HEINZEN: Are you done testifying
20 on the Randall's Island matter?

21 MR. BUBBINS: Which has already
22 circumvented --

23 MR. HEINZEN: Sir, are you done
24 testifying on the Randall's Island matter?

25 MR. BUBBINS: Sorry, there are so many

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee

2 people lined up to talk and you won't give me
3 an extra minute to talk.

4 MR. HEINZEN: Sir, are you done
5 testifying on the Randall's Island matter?

6 MR. BUBBINS: No, I'm not.

7 MR. HEINZEN: Would you please direct
8 your time to that.

9 MR. BUBBINS: Well, I'm letting you
10 know -- and there's not a lot of people here.
11 I mean, that's the kind of sentiment that's
12 been prevalent around Randall's Island that
13 allows companies like our group -- we tried to
14 contact them before this hearing. Do you know
15 what we asked; are there any local job
16 guarantees? Are there any local employment
17 guarantees as part of this deal? Is that
18 something that the FCRC could consider before
19 awarding this? What would the wages be? What
20 would the benefits be to those people?
21 There's a big controversy in Central Park with
22 unionized workers being cut out of things.
23 That's something that should be considered by
24 Randall's Island as well.

25 Those are the main issues, I guess,

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee

2 that we wanted to talk about, and I think you
3 ought to look more closely at the deal and not
4 just go along with whatever the Mayor's Office
5 wants to bully people into. Thank you.

6 MR. HEINZEN: Thank you for your
7 testimony. Does any other member of the
8 public wish to testify?

9 (No response.)

10 MR. HEINZEN: Would the Parks
11 Department like to make a statement?

12 MR. KLOTH: Yes. I'm Charles Kloth.
13 I'm the Director of Concessions for the Parks
14 Department. The Randall's Island falls within
15 Manhattan Community Board 11 and as per the
16 concession rules we have to give notice to the
17 affected community board that we are issuing
18 an RFP. They get a minimum of 40-day notice
19 and they also get a 15-day notice that we're
20 bringing this to the Public Hearing. That
21 said, we also understand that Bronx Community
22 Board 1 is in very close proximity to
23 Randall's Island, even though Randall's Island
24 doesn't officially fall under Bronx's
25 jurisdiction, so the Randall's Island Sports

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee
2 Foundation and the Parks Department reach out
3 to Bronx Community Board 1 on many, many
4 issues including all the planning for the
5 island.

6 I would also point out that this was
7 done through a public solicitation. What that
8 means is that we not only looked at all
9 proposals but we encouraged as many proposals
10 as possible, and the contract is available for
11 public review. That's it.

12 MR. HEINZEN: Okay, thank you. Does
13 any member wish to ask a question or make a
14 comment?

15 (No response.)

16 MR. HEINZEN: Does any other member of
17 the public wish to testify today?

18 (No response.)

19 MR. HEINZEN: Okay, thank you for
20 coming down to testify today, we appreciate
21 it. If no one else wishes to speak that
22 concludes today's hearing. We ask that the
23 Reporter make the entire Public Hearing
24 Agenda, which was made publicly available and
25 distributed at this hearing, as well as any

1 Franchise and Concession Review Committee
2 written submissions, part of the final record
3 of the proceeding. This hearing is now
4 closed. Thank you very much.

5 (Time noted: 2:55 a.m.)

6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, MICHAEL MCINTOSH, a shorthand
reporter and Notary Public within and for
the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness(es) whose testimony
is hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn by
me, and the foregoing transcript is a true
record of the testimony given by such
witness(es).

I further certify that I am not related
to any of the parties to this action by blood
or marriage, and that I am in no way
interested in the outcome of this matter.

MICHAEL MCINTOSH

	PAGE/LINE	CORRECTION
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

ERRATA SHEET

A	Bubbins 4:10,10 7:21,25 8:6,9 Buchanan 1:21 3:22 Budget 1:17 2:15 building 5:15 7:9,17 bully 9:5 business 4:19 5:10 businesses 4:19 5:8	6:1 7:1,17 8:1 9:1,16 10:1 11:1 Concessions 9:13 concludes 10:22 conducted 3:9 connected 7:12 consider 8:18 considered 8:23 construction 3:25 consulted 6:8,10 contact 8:14 contract 10:10 controversy 8:21 Corporation 1:17 CORRECTION 13:3 Counsel 1:17 courts 4:24 Covino 1:20 3:3 created 5:3 cultural 5:9 cut 7:4 8:22	environmental 4:12,25 ERRATA 13:2 especially 7:14 extra 8:3
able 5:9 action 12:12 Adam 1:21 advertised 3:10 affiliation 3:20 aftermath 4:22 Agenda 10:24 alienating 5:14 allotted 3:17 allows 8:13 Alternate 1:16,18 Ambitions 7:16 APPEARANCES 1:15 appreciate 10:20 approximately 3:18 arrive 2:4 arrived 2:5 asked 8:15 aspect 6:11 attempt 4:22 available 10:10,24 award 3:23 awarding 8:19 a.m 11:5	C	D	F
B	C 12:2,2 cafe 5:22 cafes 4:3 6:22 calendar 3:21 call 2:6 3:21 called 5:2 Cano 4:6 Cantor 1:17 care 6:6 cater 6:22 Central 8:21 certify 12:5,11 Charles 9:12 Charter 3:11 circumvented 7:22 City 3:11,12 5:20,23 6:2 6:7 Citywide 7:15 Clerk 1:21 2:6,8,10,12 2:14,17,20,23 3:2,17,20 close 9:22 closed 6:17 11:4 closely 9:3 come 4:9 coming 7:6 10:20 comment 10:14 Committee 1:5 2:1 3:1,8 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 community 5:4,5,7 7:2,3 9:15,17,21 10:3 companies 8:13 component 4:14 Comptroller 1:18 2:12 Comptroller's 6:3 7:14 concern 4:21 concerned 4:17 concession 1:5 2:1 3:1,8 3:11,23,25 4:1 5:1,4	day 5:21,23 deal 4:15 8:17 9:3 decade 6:13 decided 4:20 decisions 5:24 delayed 2:2 Dell'Olivo 1:18 2:13 Department 9:11,14 10:2 desiring 3:13 different 4:14 direct 8:7 Director 4:11 9:13 distributed 10:25 doing 5:12 dragging 6:15 duly 12:7	environmental 4:12,25 fall 9:24 falls 9:14 FCRC 4:14 5:24 7:7,14 8:18 field 4:23 fields 5:16 fill 3:15 final 11:2 first 3:21 5:12 FIVE 1:23 food 3:24 4:4 Force 5:2 7:2 foregoing 12:8 forth 12:7 Foundation 6:14 10:2 four 4:4 Franchise 1:5 2:1 3:1,8 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 Friends 4:11 further 12:11
backyard 4:18 ball 4:22 based 4:12 benefits 8:20 bid 5:21 big 8:21 Bill 1:16 blood 12:12 board 5:4,6 9:15,17,22 10:3 boards 7:2 Borough 2:17,18,20,23 3:3 6:2 7:6 BP 1:18,19,19,20,20 2:3 Bridge 6:17 bring 6:24 bringing 9:20 Bronx 1:18 2:3,17 4:11 4:13 5:6 6:7,12,16 7:7 7:18 9:21 10:3 Bronx's 9:24 Brooklyn 1:19 2:18	E	G	H
	E 12:2,2 east 5:4 6:9,17,21 EDC 6:14 eight 5:13,16 employment 8:16 encouraged 10:9 entire 10:23 entities 6:25	give 4:22 5:22 7:11 8:2 9:16 given 12:9 go 6:19 9:4 goes 6:19 going 2:5 5:25,25 6:4 7:13 Gordon 1:16 2:11 3:6 great 4:21 Greenway 6:12 group 4:6 7:12 8:13 guarantees 8:16,17 guess 8:25	Harlem 5:5 6:9,17 Harry 4:10 heard 3:14 hearing 2:6 3:7,9 8:14 9:20 10:22,23,25 11:3

Heinzen 1:16 2:2,9 3:5
4:7 7:19,23 8:4,7 9:6
9:10 10:12,16,19
hereinbefore 12:7
hoping 2:3

I

Icahn 3:25
including 10:4
informed 5:3,5,6
intent 3:23
interested 12:14
interior 3:24
island 1:20 3:2,4 4:4,15
4:17,25 5:2,13 6:13,14
7:2,20,24 8:5,12,24
9:14,23,23,25 10:5
issue 4:21 6:6
issues 4:16,25 7:5 8:25
10:4
issuing 9:17
item 3:21

J

J 7:10,18
Jason 1:19
Jimmy 1:19
job 8:15
John 1:24
jurisdiction 9:25

K

kind 5:10,23 8:11
Kloth 9:12,12
know 4:18 5:24 7:14
8:10,14
knows 5:25 6:19

L

Lee 1:20
letting 8:9
Let's 5:18
lined 8:2
local 5:8 8:15,16
look 9:3
looked 10:8
looking 5:11
loosely 5:12,17
lot 6:5 8:10
love 5:22

M

main 8:25
maintenance 3:24 4:2,3
Management 1:17 2:14
Manhattan 1:19 2:21 4:5
9:15
Marc 1:20
marriage 12:13
matter 3:22 4:8 7:20,24
8:5 12:14
Matthew 1:16 3:6
Mayor 1:16,16 2:8,10
3:5
Mayor's 6:15 9:4
MCINTOSH 12:3,17
McMillan 1:20 2:25
mean 8:11
means 10:8
meant 6:22
meeting 1:4 2:2
member 9:7 10:13,16
MICHAEL 12:3,17
Mill 7:8,17
minimum 9:18
minute 8:3
minutes 3:18
mobile 4:4
Monday 1:11
months 5:18

N

name 3:19
natural 5:16
new 1:9,9,24,24 3:10,12
6:20 12:5
Notary 12:4
noted 11:5
notice 9:16,18,19
Number 5:6
numbers 5:11
numerous 4:16,24

O

obtained 3:16
Obviously 6:5
office 1:16,17 2:10,14
3:5 6:3,15 7:6,15 9:4
officially 9:24
Okay 10:12,19

open 6:13
operation 3:23 4:2,3
opportunity 3:14 5:8
oppose 7:13
organization 4:12
organizations 7:3
Otano 1:19 2:19
ought 9:3
outcome 12:14

P

PAGE/LINE 13:3
park 4:5,11,15 7:8,9,17
8:21
parkland 5:14
parks 7:4,8,11 9:10,13
10:2
part 7:10 8:17 11:2
parties 12:12
people 6:6,9,16,18,20
7:15 8:2,10,20 9:5
persons 3:15
planning 10:4
please 2:6 3:19,20 4:9
8:7
point 6:23 10:6
politically 7:12
Pond 7:8,17
possible 10:10
predominantly 6:21
Present 1:18
President 2:17,18,20,23
3:3 6:3
President's 7:6
prevalent 6:6 8:12
Primary 1:16,17,17,19
1:19,20,20,21
private 4:23
proceeding 11:3
proposals 10:9,9
proximity 9:22
public 1:4 3:7 4:20 9:8
9:20 10:7,11,17,23 12:4
publicly 3:10 10:24
p.m 1:12

Q

Queens 1:20 2:24
question 10:13
Quintian 1:17 2:16

R

R 4:5 12:2
Randall's 4:4,15,17,25
5:2,13 6:12,14,25 7:20
7:24 8:5,12,24 9:14,23
9:23,25
reach 10:2
Reade 1:8
record 11:2 12:9
related 12:11
relevance 5:9
replacement 7:10
reporter 10:23 12:4
REPORTING 1:23
representative 2:4 7:9
represented 3:6
request 3:16
response 9:9 10:15,18
review 1:5 2:1 3:1,8 4:1
5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1
10:11 11:1
RFP 9:18
rich 6:20
Riverdale 6:21
roll 2:7
rules 3:11 9:16
run 5:22

S

schools 4:23
seasonal 4:2 5:19
see 7:8
sentiment 8:11
September 1:11
set 12:7
Sharon 1:17
SHEET 13:2
short 2:3
shorthand 12:3
shut 4:23
sick 6:8,9
side 6:21
Sir 7:23 8:4
six 5:18
slip 3:16
small 6:10
sole 7:16
solicitation 10:7
Sorry 7:25

source 7:17
South 4:12 6:7,12,16
space 4:20 7:11
speak 3:15 10:21
speaker 3:17
Sports 6:14 9:25
stadium 3:25 6:20 7:10
stand 6:4,24
STAR 1:23
state 3:19 12:5
statement 9:11
Staten 1:20 3:2,4
stop 4:14
Street 1:8,24
stuff 5:15
submissions 11:2
Suite 1:24
support 7:16
sure 3:13
sworn 12:7

T

T 12:2,2
table 6:25
take 6:24
talk 8:2,3 9:2
Task 5:2 7:2
tennis 6:20
ten-year 4:5
term 4:5
testify 3:19 4:8 9:8 10:17
 10:20
testifying 7:19,24 8:5
testimony 9:7 12:6,9
thank 9:5,6 10:12,19
 11:4
thing 5:18 6:11
things 5:13,16 8:22
think 6:23 9:2
three 3:18 4:2
time 8:8 11:5
tired 6:8,9
today 3:5,9 6:5 10:17,20
today's 10:22
Tony 1:18
transcript 12:8
tried 8:13
troubling 4:21
true 12:8

trying 7:11

U

understand 9:21
unionized 8:22
units 4:4
upper 6:21
use 4:20 6:19 7:3

W

wages 8:19
walk 6:18
want 2:5 3:13 5:21 7:13
wanted 9:2
wants 9:5
Water 4:15
way 12:13
Welcome 3:7
went 4:15
we're 6:4 9:19
we've 4:13,16
widely 6:6
wish 9:8 10:13,17
wishes 4:8 10:21
wishing 3:15
witness(es) 12:6,10
workers 8:22
wouldn't 5:21
written 11:2

X

x 1:3,6

Y

Yan 1:19 2:22
Yankee 7:10
year 5:12,17,17,20 6:18
York 1:9,9,24,24 3:11,12
 12:5
Yvonne 1:17

\$

\$1,000 5:20
\$40 5:21,23
\$50,000 5:11,17
\$6,000 5:17

1

1 5:6 9:22 10:3
10038 1:24

11 5:4 9:15
12 1:11
15-day 9:19
1999 4:13

2

2:47 1:12
2:55 11:5
2011 1:11
22 1:8

4

40-day 9:18
411 1:24

6

631.224.5054 1:25

9

90 1:24