

- - - - - x

PUBLIC HEARING
on the
Community Board 9 - Manhattan
Columbia University's 197-C Plan

- - - - - x

530 West 133rd Street
New York, New York

August 15, 2007
6:30 p.m.

Reported by: Judeen M. Denniston

A P P E A R A N C E S

JORDI REYES-MONTBLAN - CHAIR, COMMUNITY
BOARD 9

PATRICE JONES - CO-CHAIR of ULURP COMMITTEE,
CB9

ULURP COMMITTEE CB9

RESIDENTS and BUSINESS OWNERS
of COMMUNITY DISTRICT 9

LEE BOLLINGER - PRESIDENT OF COLUMBIA
UNVERISITY

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD #9

1. Sign-in and Open House (6:30 p.m.)
2. Presentation (7:00 p.m.)
3. Welcome & Introductions
4. ULURP Committee Vote (11:30 p.m.)

1 MS. JONES:

2 We will now begin tonight public hearing. I
3 assume if you want to speak I have a sheet
4 in front of me with your names on it. Okay.
5 Now, I will be calling names in groups of
6 five, I am going to ask that those five
7 peoples that I call, come here to my right,
8 so we don't loose time for people getting to
9 the microphone.

10

11 Each speaker will have three minutes, and
12 only three minutes, and if you have your
13 testimony in writing you can submit to us
14 tonight.

15

16 I really don't know in the back of the room,
17 what you don't understand about please be
18 quiet and respect the people that are in
19 this room tonight, who came out to voice
20 their opinions. If you can't be an adult
21 and have that kind of self-control, you
22 probably don't need to be here tonight.
23 It is going to be hot and we're going to be
24 here for several hours.

1 The first five speakers:

2 (Several names were called.)

3

4 Please state your name and spell your name
5 we do have a transcriber here and please
6 indicate whether or not you are resident or
7 a property owner in the Community District
8 9.

9

10 MR. REYES-MONTEBLANC:

11 My name is Jordi Reyes-MontebLANc and I am a
12 resident of this community. I am the
13 chairman of Community Board 9 and I am a
14 resident of this community.

15

16 First I would like to express my thanks to
17 all those attending this proceeding, not
18 matter how rude they may be and for
19 testifying tonight for and against the
20 Columbia University 197C Plan.

21

22 Personally I welcome the expansion of the
23 university into West Manhattanville. I
24 believe that Columbia University can be a

1 major benefit to our community and that our
2 community will be a great resource for
3 Columbia University.

4

5 Having said that, I will remind everyone
6 that Columbia University has been a member
7 of the Westside Harlem community for over
8 100 years, for those who do not know,
9 Morningside Heights is the southernmost
10 neighborhood of West Harlem.

11 However, I must say that although I have
12 great hopes for a close and fruitful
13 partnership between Columbia University and
14 West Harlem, there are many obstacles to
15 overcome on both sides. The community must
16 get over its suspicion and dread of the
17 Columbia expansion and Columbia must
18 overcome the feelings that they know better
19 what is good for West Harlem and our people.

20

21 The use of eminent domain or even the threat
22 of eminent domain must be removed.

23 Community Board 9 Manhattan stands firmly
24 and unequivocally on that principle. We

1 will support any owner of properties that
2 refuses to sell and stand with them against
3 eminent domain use for the private benefit
4 or another private entity.

5

6 Columbia's failure to meaningfully discuss
7 and negotiate with CB9M regarding the land
8 use issues that do not met CB9M's 197-A Plan
9 standards has been a lost opportunity to
10 help develop the trust and partnership
11 Columbia indicated was their objective.
12 The total lack of consideration for out 197-
13 A Plan is a great strategic and tactical
14 loss for the University.

15

16 I totally disapprove of the Columbia's 197-C
17 Plan. Unless Columbia revises its 197-C Plan
18 to more closely confirm with the goals and
19 objectives of CB9M's 197-A Plan.

20

21 NORMA RAMOS:

22 My name is Norma Ramos. I'm a long standing
23 environmental justice attorney and I am very
24 familiar with the contribution that

1 President Lee Bollinger has made for advance
2 affirmative action. I supported him -- I am
3 an beneficiary of that and I would like to
4 be that Lee Bollinger show up for this
5 community, the one who stood up for racial
6 justice for this community, we need that Lee
7 Bollinger here now.

8

9 In the past my comments have been focused on
10 specific environmental and other social
11 justice concerns that I have about the
12 Columbia University expansion plan, but this
13 evening my comments will address what I have
14 seen to be the poor conflicted underlying
15 failure on Columbia University part to work
16 with our community in a respectful
17 collaboration to achieve your goals. Over
18 and over again the community has invited
19 Columbia University to work in partnership
20 with us. In good faith to design a plan
21 that will address the university needs and
22 out needs, however, in opposition to come to
23 a rational reasoning, to respect for the
24 richly diverse community, for the

1 university inhabits and most of all out of
2 respect tacitly failure of a social justice
3 -- Columbia University has arrogantly
4 rejected such a collaboration. You have
5 recently financed consultants at the rate of
6 \$40,000 a month, which is the equivalent of a
7 year tuition paid to you by your student.

8

9 Intention to achieve what you have failed to
10 do in these last few years and that is to
11 appose your will on our community.

12 This is fail model, and you have caused even
13 greater distrust and resentment in this
14 community with your recent tactics.

15 What is striking to me is that you employ
16 some wonderful faculty members.

17

18 MS. JONES:

19 Ms. Ramos, your time is up.

20

21 MS. RAMOS:

22 I think you should take some leadership from
23 your staff and from this community, so that
24 we could be talking about what we are doing

1 with Columbia, instead of what Columbia
2 University is doing to us. So, I turn you
3 down. I support the 197A Plan.

4

5 Thank you.

6

7 MR. SOUTH:

8 My name is Walter South. I have lived here
9 for many years. I am acting appointee of
10 CB9 and I'm the co-chair of the housing and
11 resident committee and I'm a co-chair of the
12 197A Committee. I hold a graduate degree in
13 Sociology, graduate degree in urban planning
14 and I have done graduate work --
15 preservation and I have done graduate work
16 in Columbia University and Harvard
17 University. I'm speaking as an individual,
18 this application should be turned down.

19

20 MS. JONES:

21 Please hold your Applauded.

22

23 MR. SOUTH:

24 The reason your application should be turned

1 down is because of the use of eminent
2 domain. Eminent domain is the taking of one
3 person's private property and conveying it
4 to another private property, and at present
5 there are over 10,000 cases of eminent
6 domain pending in this country, and the
7 differences are always the same. The
8 differences are the weak, the weak, and the
9 small business owner and the losers are the
10 minorities in our community and the victors
11 are the same, the strong and the rich.
12 The winners are unjust. This practice is
13 unmoral, unethical, it is unfair. Simply,
14 blunt it is wrong.

15

16 An institution of higher learning of this
17 country has a responsibility to provide this
18 society with a moral compass. This
19 application is a perfect example of the
20 failure of this institution to its students.
21 This application needs to be voted down.
22 In addition I have here a list of 100 other
23 reason why you should vote this down.

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Applauded.)

3

4 MR. PALMER:

5 My name is Dennis Palmer. And I am the
6 executive director of Madame Alexander Doll
7 Company. Many of you might wonder who
8 Madame Alexander is, of what they are or
9 where they are. Well, we are located in the
10 Baker building, 615 West, 131st Street.
11 We have been there since 1955 and we have
12 been in that business since 1923, and what
13 does that all mean for us here okay. When
14 we first heard about this Columbia
15 expansion, we and many other people were --
16 and we're thinking, oh, no Columbia is
17 coming, but in the past few years Columbia
18 has shown to be a very strong partner with
19 us, and work with us through and ensuring
20 our benefits for being in this area in the
21 coming years.

22

23 We employed about 60 people many of which
24 lived in this area and the Greater Harlem

1 area. It is important that we support this
2 project moving forward.

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Loud booing responses.)

6

7 MR. PALMER:

8 Let's think about this project, we cannot
9 stop this project, we don't want to stop
10 this project, I support this project.

11

12 Thank you very much.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 (Several names were called.)

16

17 Please state your name and spell it and
18 indicate whether or not you are a resident
19 or property owner in Community District 9.

20 Thank you.

21

22 MR. WILLIAM:

23 I name is Mr. Levert William. Resident of
24 the Harlem Community and yes were impact

1 property owners.

2

3 (Whereupon, the speaker started to sing.)

4

5 Let me tell you why, statement from Mr.

6 Williams by the founding president of a

7 neighborhood artist Inc, Place To Lay Their

8 Heads Development, located here at 601 West

9 132nd Street. Our mission, goals and

10 objectives developing, providing, permanent

11 housing and support services for homeless

12 and immigrant families, including

13 professional artists.

14

15 This project started about nineteen years

16 ago --

17

18 MS. JONES:

19 Thank you Mr. Williams, your time is up.

20

21 THE AUDIENCE:

22 What is your position?

23

24 MR. WILLIAMS:

1 My position is -- Columbia we don't support
2 the plan.

3

4 MR. EDWARDS:

5 My name is Walter Edwards and I am the
6 chairman of the -- Okay, all right, thank
7 you can you hear me now?

8

9 THE AUDIENCE:

10 Yes.

11

12 MR. EDWARDS:

13 All right, I will rather see something done,
14 than nothing, which is the gateway to
15 Harlem. I prefer to see something different
16 than what we are seeing now. We have been
17 here working for Mr. Bollinger and the rest
18 of his staff trying to develop a
19 relationship, where we all would have some
20 equity on what's going on here.
21 This is not Community Board 9, this is
22 Harlem and we must realize that.

23

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Booing.)

3

4 MR. EDWARDS:

5 Okay, I will support this if you don't have

6 --

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 Thank you Mr. Edwards, your time us up.

10

11 MR. EDWARDS:

12 Thank you.

13

14 MS. LUNA:

15 Good evening everybody my name is Maria

16 Luna, I am a Democratic District Leader for

17 the 30th District, that means that I am part

18 of this community.

19

20 I reside at 838 -- I've been a district

21 leader for -- since 1981. I worked very

22 hard and I am very closely with Mayor

23 Dinkins, I am very proud that he was our

24 mayor and the disrespect that was shown to

1 him tonight is ashamed of our community of
2 color.

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
6 audience.)

7

8 MS. LUNA:

9 You should be ashamed of yourself. You
10 could boo all you want, but I support
11 Columbia's plan.

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
15 audience.)

16

17 MS. LUNA:

18 I know the institution has provided an
19 important clarity of life

20

21 THE AUDIENCE:

22 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
23 audience.)

24

1 MS. LUNA:

2 I know for a fact as a member of the
3 institution the proposal research of --

4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
7 audience.)

8

9 MS. JONES:

10 Ladies and gentleman you are taking time
11 away from the speaker and is taking time
12 away from yourselves. Please keep your
13 comments to yourself. I'm sure you don't
14 want to be disrespect like this when you are
15 up speaking.

16

17 MR. MARMOLEJO:

18 My name is Antonio Marmolejo and I am a
19 security officer working at Columbia
20 University. Columbia has tried hard to
21 convince everyone that the number of jobs
22 created by its expansion would benefit the
23 West Harlem community, but I am concerned
24 about the type of jobs Columbia currently

1 offers the community.

2

3 I work for a contractor called Summit
4 Security Services that the university uses
5 in dormitories located off of its
6 Morningside heights campus. I've worked at
7 Columbia for eleven years and yet Summit
8 pays me only \$12.45 an hour. Many of my co-
9 workers make even less, as little as \$10.70.
10 Is this the kind of work that Columbia is
11 going to offer on its new campus? \$12.45 an
12 hour is not enough to make ends meet in New
13 York City.

14

15 Now Columbia is saying hat its expansion
16 will create thousands of new jobs, but
17 that's not enough -- Columbia needs to
18 commit to creating good jobs and stop doing
19 business with irresponsible contractors like
20 Summit Security.

21

22 Thank you.

23

24

1 MR. KAPPNER:

2 My name is Tom Kappner. I am here to say in
3 the strongest possible term that we must
4 send a message an overwhelming objection of
5 Columbia's Plan.

6

7 THE AUDIENECE:

8 (Applauded.)

9

10 MR. KAPPNER:

11 There is absolutely no positive benefits
12 whatsoever and -- economic development,
13 economic growth, economic growth of the
14 community, the most -- homogenous --
15 necessary to --- 6000 non-construction graph
16 over the next thirty years. I do not
17 support Columbia's Plan.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21

22 MR. CHAMBERS:

23 My name is Levine Chambers. I really
24 appreciate the fact of being here. We have

1 got over 150 people here tonight. I
2 understand that if you want -- two thirds of
3 my workers are people of color. I have got
4 over a 1000 members who live in Harlem and
5 about 150 people who lives in this district.

6

7 MS. JONES:

8 Please let the speaker speak without any
9 interruptions.

10

11 MR. CHAMBERS:

12 I understand that you may not support this
13 plan, but we need as many jobs as
14 possible --

15

16 Thank you.

17

18 THE AUDIENCE:

19 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made by the
20 audience.)

21

22 MR. STAR:

23 My name is William Star. I am an Apostical
24 priest and for 37 years I have been campus

1 minister at Columbia University. I was at
2 the gym site with students in 1968 and --
3 was organized out of my office, out of my
4 campus ministry office and I have lived in
5 this area since 1965, which makes me about
6 eighty-nine.

7

8 I want to do some -- about the bathtub,
9 because I don't think there is -- will
10 protect any body for anything. Columbia's
11 environmental impact statement ignores the
12 dawning reality to -- the university has
13 shown to disregard the advice of -- The
14 denial on the part of the university, the --
15 protects their power to define reality for
16 their version of it, but the little to very
17 --

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Thank you, your time is up.

21

22 MR. INNIS:

23 Good evening. My name is Darrell Inniss. I
24 am a resident of Harlem. I am not a property

1 owner --

2

3 MS. JONES:

4 Please, sir. Could you please state your
5 state your name and spell it for our
6 transcriber.

7

8 MR. INNIS:

9 Darrell Inniss, D-A-R-R-E-L-L I-N-N-I-S-S.
10 I have been in the union for ten years. I
11 have been around, you can trust me. Over
12 the last ten years I have been in the union
13 and it has changed my life because before I
14 was in the union I was running the streets.
15 You saw me on the corner selling drugs to
16 your family, but I took an opportunity to
17 change my life and do some things by working
18 in the union. And now we have an
19 opportunity for other brothers and sisters
20 to come up and do the same thing I'm doing,
21 support my family legally, honestly.

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Applauded.)

1 MR. INNISS:

2 You talk about the science I'm not smartest
3 guy in the door, but one thing for sure I go
4 to work every day. And I am able to support
5 my family, because as long as I work and I
6 could live in Harlem.

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 (Applauded.)

10

11 MR. INNISS:

12 And hopefully, you will take the opportunity
13 to put your brothers and sisters in the same
14 place so that they can have the same
15 advances.

16

17 Thank you.

18

19

20 MR. NEGRON:

21 My name is Herman Negron, I live in Harlem
22 for many years. I work with the Harlem
23 youths. My concern is how affordable West
24 Harlem would be when the university expands

1 into our neighborhood. Even with a well-
2 paying job I have been feeling the pressure
3 of raising costs, lately on my family.
4 The jobs that Columbia University is
5 offering you are not paid enough to afford
6 to live here. My colleagues that work at
7 Columbia Summit Security are having
8 difficult times in 2007, they make as little
9 as \$10.70 an hour with minimum benefits.
10 Our neighborhood that takes jobs like me at
11 Columbia have a difficult time staying here
12 in 2015, 2030 --

13

14 If Columbia wants to move into our
15 neighborhood that hard working Harlem
16 families created, it must demonstrate good
17 job with decent wages.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21

22 MS. JONES:

23 (Several names were called to speak.)

24

1 MS. SCHUBINER:

2 My name is Lindsay Schubiner. I am a
3 resident of Community District 9 and a
4 recent graduate of -- College.

5 I oppose Columbia's 197C Plan because it
6 will displaced at least 10,000 residents --

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 (Applauded.)

10

11 MS. SCHUBINER:

12 (Due the audience loud cheering, the
13 reporter was unable to transcribe her
14 speech.)

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 I'm sorry, we cannot hear the speaker for
18 the record. So please be quiet.

19

20 MS. SCHUBINER:

21 Columbia's Plan will only displace business
22 and a community of color all about New York.
23 Since Columbia really does not care about
24 the --

1

2 (Reporter was unable to transcribe speakers
3 speech due to the audience loud cheers.)

4

5

6 MR. MCINTYRE:

7 My name is Lionel McIntyre. The Urban
8 Technical Assistance Project is an urban
9 extension program at Columbia University in
10 the Graduate School of Architecture,
11 Planning and Preservation. UTAP provides
12 planning and design services to distressed
13 communities, and I am its founding director.
14 Over the past twelve years, UTAP has
15 provided its services to the Greater Harlem,
16 Washington Heights and Inwood communities.
17 This statement is presented in support of
18 Columbia University's efforts --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
22 the reporter was unable to transcribe
23 speaker's speech.)

24

1 MS. JONES:

2 I'm sorry, we cannot hear the speaker,
3 please be quiet.

4

5 MR. MCINTYRE:

6 -- to build an extension campus in the
7 designated section of the Manhattanville
8 community of West Harlem. It also supports
9 the objective of a community/university
10 partnership that can bring lasting benefits.

11

12 Generally, the physical expansion of
13 institutions of higher learning today is
14 driven by fundamental changes taking place
15 in this society. These changes are the
16 direct results of scientific invention and
17 the transformation of economic behavior.
18 This dynamic change in society and education
19 was witnessed once since the Enlightenment
20 period --

21

22 THE AUDIENCE:

23 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
24 the reporter was unable to transcribe

1 speaker's speech.)

2

3 MR. MCINTYRE:

4 -- to expand educational opportunities
5 through land grant universities to advance
6 the new techniques.

7

8 Today the digital revolution has been the
9 same transformative impact on society -- a
10 radical change in human behavior for
11 example, how we do things and knowledge. So
12 the building of additional educational and
13 administrative spaces is a result of the
14 irreversible trend and an obligation the
15 university has to its students, its faculty,
16 its communities and society in general --

17

18 THE AUDIENCE:

19 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
20 the reporter was unable to transcribe
21 speaker's speech.)

22

23 MR. MCINTYRE:

24 -- the proposed site for the expansion is

1 one that UTAP is quite familiar with, we had
2 operated out offices in the middle of it for
3 ten years. We are well aware of its
4 obsolescence and its under-utilization --

5

6 MS. JONES:

7 Sorry, sir, your time is up.

8

9 MS. MCKISSACK:

10 My name is Cheryl McKissack, M-C-K-I-S-S-A-
11 C-K. Basically the oldest African-American
12 owned construction company in the country.

13

14 THE AUDIENCE:

15 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
16 the reporter was unable to transcribe
17 speaker's speech.)

18

19 MS. MCKISSACK:

20 We are part of the construction team that
21 works with Columbia -- I am here as a
22 personal reference to talk about the
23 relationship or Columbia's relationship in
24 the community with respect to construction.

1

2 THE AUDIENCE:

3 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
4 the reporter was unable to transcribe
5 speaker's speech.)

6

7 MS. MCKISSACK:

8 -- in construction as you know is a well
9 very much -- the only way getting an
10 opportunity is when a client says this is
11 what we want. Columbia has always had as a
12 part of their construction division, the
13 focus to include and diversify with the
14 firms that they use. They have some of the
15 highest goals with respect to construction
16 as fair as employment, and as well as black
17 people --

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 MS. MCKISSACK:

1 What this has done for a company like
2 McKissack, it allows us to work with your
3 community and make sure that are proper jobs
4 available in construction. So, this project
5 is a win-win --

6

7 Thank you very much.

8

9 THE AUDIENCE:

10 (Whereupon, loud outbursts were made that
11 the reporter was unable to transcribe
12 speaker's speech.)

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 (Several names were called to speak.)

16

17 DR. GOLDMAN:

18 Good evening. I'm Dr. Lee Goldman -- to the
19 many thousand physicians, nurses in the
20 public health professional who practices
21 with Columbia University.

22

23 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
24 the reporter was unable to transcribe

1 speaker's speech.)

2

3 DR. GOLDMAN:

4 These people come to Columbia for two
5 reasons, one is their commitment to the
6 community and their desire to be here. The
7 second, is their commitment to advancing --

8

9 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
10 the reporter was unable to transcribe
11 speaker's speech.)

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Ladies and gentlemen, you have to be quiet.
15 We cannot hear the person speaking.

16

17 MR. SCHLEY:

18 Good evening everybody could you hear me?

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 Yes.

22

23 MR. SCHLEY:

24 I am a union member. I have been the member

1 for 31 years and I have a tee-shirt to prove
2 it right here, okay. I understand that
3 Columbia's Plan here is make every effort to
4 prey on desperation of the black community,
5 our community -00:49:06- against this plan.

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Applauded.)

9

10 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
11 the reporter was unable to transcribe
12 speaker's speech.)

13

14 MR. SCHLEY:

15 A community which has a unemployment rate of
16 50 percent, but I am also wearing another
17 tee-shirt and that is a tee-shirt that says
18 "Harlem Unites Against This Plan". The
19 reason we unite against this plan, because
20 we are against eminent domain, because we
21 are against biotech labs in our community.

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Applauded.)

1

2 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
3 the reporter was unable to transcribe
4 speaker's speech.)

5

6 MR. SCHLEY:

7 -- the jobs that Columbia has given in the
8 past, you have to think about what they are
9 promising, you all have to look at their
10 history. They promise 6,000 jobs --

11

12 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
13 the reporter was unable to transcribe
14 speaker's speech.)

15

16 MR. SCHLEY:

17 Look at the number of jobs that they say --
18 218 jobs for people above 125th Street and
19 127th. Do you think their intentions are
20 that much different? Do you think we are
21 going to really get those jobs that only
22 good union people, desperate people out
23 there who needs their job -- you have to
24 remember that this is an eviction plan, this

1 a plan --

2

3 THE AUDIENCE:

4 (Applauded.)

5

6

7 MR. SCHLEY:

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 Please support the 197A Plan, they don't
13 have to build a bathtub, they can share this
14 community, they don't have to make it all or
15 nothing. But they are greedy. This
16 institution only serves a very specific
17 group of people in this country and the vast
18 majority of people in Harlem will never be
19 in that group, blacks, Hispanic, you will
20 not be in that group. I am against this
21 plan. Thank you.

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,

1 the reporter was unable to transcribe
2 speaker's speech.)

3

4 MS. JONES:

5 Please, when you come up to the mic, please
6 state your name and spell it for the
7 transcribe.

8

9 MR. SCHMY:

10 My name is Craig Schmy. I am going to admit
11 whether or not I am a resident, whether I am
12 a home owner I think that is so important as
13 to what's going on. Because after all we
14 have to -- culture and the dynamic of
15 Harlem.

16

17 However, I do want to say that the
18 individuals that are representing Harlem,
19 had done things for people of color and for
20 people in the past. I'm very much aware.
21 I'm very much aware of the impact that Mr.
22 Bollinger had in his lawsuit for affirmative
23 action, but I am also very much aware of the
24 fact that the point is not we have done

1 yesterday and not what we promise to do
2 tomorrow, what we solidify between us here
3 and now and what we're going to do together.

4

5 From what I see, and what I have understood
6 the plans to be. The plan does not consider
7 that it is taking from people something that
8 they cannot make them whole again with,
9 their property, their interest, their
10 neighbors, their friends.

11

12 They also respond to produce more jobs by
13 taking jobs. Now, I don't see where
14 anything in the history where an institution
15 such as this can cite they actually made
16 good on the things that they say in the
17 past.

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 MR. SCHMY:

1 However, I encourage the institution, I
2 encourage the people to stay visual, to
3 continue to communicate, to at this point
4 vote down this offer and bring them back to
5 the table of meaningful exchange of
6 dialogue, care and consideration that he had
7 for the people and that he was representing
8 when he supported affirmative action,
9 because they don't change. It's one of the
10 same. The same individual applying for law
11 school, are fighting for to keep their homes
12 and their property.

13

14 So, as I close, I state to each and everyone
15 of you. Calm yourself, be compose of your
16 thinking, think through your thoughts and
17 understand that in the name of all things,
18 all the things that are peaceful, and are
19 dear to folks, such as your property,
20 friends and future, you will see at the
21 stands, at the stands, that they are not
22 making good to the individuals who are
23 planning to take the property from. Make
24 them do right, I know you can do right.

1 Don't vote for the 197-C plan.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 SPEAKER:

6 Good evening, I have three minutes to speak
7 and I am going to apply one minute, because
8 I would like everyone to here to take a
9 minute to just think. So I am not going to
10 speak for a minute, just think.

11

12 MS. JONES:

13 What's your name?

14

15 MR. HAYES:

16 Sorry, my name is Derrick Hayes. What I
17 would like for you to do, is take a look
18 around this room --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 Is this the Twelve Step Program?

22

23 MR. HAYES:

24 No, it is not the Twelve Step program. I

1 would like for you

2

3 THE AUDIENCE:

4 Excuse me, you should up there saying

5 whether you support or don't support

6 Columbia's Plan.

7

8 MR. HAYES:

9 I have two minutes left. I would like for
10 you to take a look around the room and ask
11 yourself where are the youth?

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 We are right here.

15

16 MR. HAYES:

17 We need more, just not two. We need more.

18 So, in closing --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
22 the reporter was unable to transcribe
23 speaker's speech.)

24

1

2 MS. JONES:

3 (Several names were called to speak.)

4

5 REV. MANNING:

6 Peace everybody.

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 Peace.

10

11 REV. MANNING:

12 It is good to be here. I am Rev. James
13 David Manning, pastor of the Atlah World
14 Missionary Church on 123rd Street and Lenox
15 Avenue. Someone ask me a few moments ago
16 if I was Bill -- I told them I wouldn't be
17 Bill -- for Ten million dollars.

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24

1 REV. MANNING:

2 I am here to express my great love for the
3 people of this community, Harlem that God
4 has called from his heart -- to raise my
5 voice against the planned genocidal and
6 surgical invasion of Columbia University and
7 all their investors in this community.

8 However, I need to know I am here against my
9 best judgment, because I'm convinced that
10 Columbia University will spare no mercy, nor
11 money in its efforts to steal this land and
12 it's heritage from our people.

13

14 THE AUDIENCE:

15 (Applauded.)

16

17 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
18 the reporter was unable to transcribe
19 speaker's speech.)

20

21 REV. MANNING:

22 It is their money that prohibits them from
23 acting merciful or neighborly. Politically,
24 they have co-opted the morals and exploit

1 fears of many leaders and vices that should
2 be here tonight defending our community and
3 the inheritance of our children.

4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Applauded.)

7

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 REV. MANNING:

13 The act of land grabbing throughout history
14 is proceed only in age and decadence by the
15 act of prostitution. It is accurately and
16 historically reported that Columbia's
17 forefathers first grabbed this land by
18 offering some beads and mirrors to the
19 unsuspecting indigenious and inherent land
20 owners many years ago. Not much has
21 changed, like father, like son.

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Applauded.)

1 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
2 the reporter was unable to transcribe
3 speaker's speech.)

4

5 REV. MANNING:

6 Finally, I wish to announce that this
7 invasion of Columbia along with the banks,
8 big business and deep pocket entrepreneurs
9 for the past ten years in this community
10 will be met with most vigorous economic,
11 political --

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Thank you Rev. Manning.

15

16 REV. MANNING:

17 Spiritual defense since the intifata of
18 Israel and the Palestinians -- We will no
19 longer rollover and give this land to the
20 rich --

21

22 MS. JONES:

23 Thank you Rev. Manning, your time is up.

24

1 REV. MANNING:

2 -- and privilege under the guise of progress
3 while dining our children and propensity the
4 right to happiness.

5

6 THE AUDIENCE:

7 (Applauded.)

8

9 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
10 the reporter was unable to transcribe
11 speaker's speech.)

12

13 REV. MANNING:

14 This land is our land and I will defend it
15 to the death, so help me God.

16

17 THE AUDIENCE:

18 (Applauded.)

19

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 MS. JONES:

1 (Several names were called to speak.)

2

3 MS. EISENBERG:

4 Hi, that is a hard act to follow. My name
5 is Ruth Eisenberg. I am urging everyone to
6 vote NO, on the Columbia's 197-C Plan.

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 (Applauded.)

10

11 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
12 the reporter was unable to transcribe
13 speaker's speech.)

14

15 MS. EISENBERG:

16 Columbia's plan propounds the environmental
17 injustice already taking place in
18 Manhattanville. Columbia says they need all
19 seventeen acres of Manhattanville in order
20 to build a two million square foot
21 underground bathtub, seven stories deep,
22 which will contain two natural gas -- power
23 plant and the MTA bus terminal.

24

1 Its proposed bathtub will inquire ninety
2 thousand truck loads of land removal in a
3 community with a highest asthma rates in the
4 nation. It will take all the land beneath
5 city streets, require cutting off sewage and
6 electricity in the process and close roads
7 for years.

8

9 It plans does not acknowledge scientific
10 fact. If this bathtub, like the World Trade
11 Center will have no earth -- protected from
12 hurricane and --

13

14 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
15 the reporter was unable to transcribe
16 speaker's speech.)

17

18 We know that, what one day of rain did the
19 city last week. No city or state emergency
20 management study has been on this plan and
21 City Planning has deemed Columbia's DEIF
22 complete.

23

24 And if the university -- can not be built,

1 we will have permitted a land drought and
2 allowed the force removal community
3 residents, businesses and commercial --

4

5 In its flood -- Columbia wants to build
6 level three biotech laboratories. These
7 laboratories will be using organism such as
8 Anthrax, Mad-cow Disease, West Nile virus,
9 Sars, small pox and yellow fever.

10

11 Virtually all medical researches are done at
12 level two. Columbia talk only about the
13 medical and health research it will do, so
14 why level three, because money from the
15 national institute of -- is drying up and
16 instead money is coming from the Department
17 Defense for research in bio-defense.

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Thank you, your time is up.

21

22 THE AUDIENCE.

23 No, keep going.

24 (Applauded.)

1

2 MS. EISENBERG:

3 Thank you.

4

5 MR. MALLTY:

6 My name is Fred Mallty. I lived for over 30

7 years in this neighborhood at 3657 Broadway.

8 I'm a community activist for over 30 years.

9 I am the president of the -- Tenants

10 Association.

11

12 My main purpose it to continue -- against

13 nonprofit landlords such as Columbia

14 University, most nonprofit are rip off

15 mechanism. Columbia University is the

16 number three wealthiest landlord in New

17 York. The -- real estate developers and

18 all the landlords such as George -- owner

19 of the _____ Group, Columbia Biotech --

20 you have in your possession engineering and

21 harder economic study, why don't you go and

22 set-up your biotech lab in rich

23 neighborhoods

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Applauded.)

3

4 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
5 the reporter was unable to transcribe
6 speaker's speech.)

7

8 MR. MALLTY:

9 Do not go north, go south of Broadway and
10

11 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
12 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
13 rest of the speaker's speech.)

14

15 MS. JONES:

16 (Several names were called to speak.)

17

18 SPEAKER:

19 Good evening all, my name is Marta -- and I
20 am very glad to be here this evening. I
21 have come in front of you as an employee of
22 Columbia University.

23

24 I was born in the Dominic Republic, a non-

1 English speaking country. I immigrated here
2 seventeen years ago. It was my goal to
3 provide -- informing to the United States I
4 faced limitation with respect to my
5 communication to speak in English, however,
6 I was not going to let that stop me. I was
7 -- to find employment at Columbia, I join in
8 1995. I was responsible for helping to keep
9 the university clean. I am very proud to be
10 an employee of Columbia and I support --

11

12 THE AUDIENCE:

13 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
14 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
15 rest of the speaker's speech.)

16

17 MS. JONES:

18 Ladies and gentleman, you are not being fair
19 to the speakers who are speaking. Could you
20 please control yourself.

21

22 MR. MAZZONI:

23 My name is Mario Mazzoni. I am a resident
24 of this community I am glad that Mr.

1 Bollinger is here today and if you are
2 uncomfortable I am glad you are
3 uncomfortable, because you are talking about
4 our community, our home, our livelihood, our
5 jobs

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 MR. MAZZONI:

13 -- Columbia's Plan is an all -- , I would
14 like to ask you questions and answer it from
15 what I understand. When an institution
16 wants to come into a neighborhood, but if
17 only wants to come in and if every resident,
18 every business owner, every worker is gone -
19 -

20

21 THE AUDIENCE:

22 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
23 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
24 speaker's speech.)

1

2 MR. MAZZONI:

3 -- to us, who live here what it indicates is
4 if you do want to be a part of this
5 community once we are gone from it. We know
6 that Columbia wants to move in once we are
7 moved out.

8 The final point I would like to make, no I
9 am going to end this on a chant. If
10 everybody can do this one for me, "Hey, hey,
11 ho, ho, on Columbia's Plan we say No."

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 "Hey, hey, ho, ho, on Columbia's Plan we
15 say, No."
16 Hell no we wont go, Hell no we wont go, Hell
17 no we wont go.

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Ladies and gentlemen, we have a speaker who
21 has the floor, please be quiet.

22

23 MS. LEVINE:

24 Good evening my name is Joan Levine, I live

1 at 100 North South Street in Morningside
2 Gardens. I have lived in this community for
3 fifty years. As an acted member of the
4 community I'm a co-chair of the Morningside,
5 West Harlem Sanitation Coalition as well as
6 chair of the Morningside Community Relations
7 Committee.

8

9 I along and many others helped write parts
10 of the community 197A Plan. This plan is
11 the unanimous choice of this community and
12 it should be adopted. I am troubled by
13 Columbia's 197-C plan for a number of
14 reasons and I will state just a few.

15

16 I am against the use of eminent domain and
17 force displacement --

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 MS. LEVINE:

1 I feel that is dangerous and wrong for
2 support for Columbia to have another level
3 three biotech labs in our densely populated
4 area.

5

6 THE AUDIENCE:

7 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
8 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
9 speaker's speech.)

10

11 MS. LEVINE:

12 They own property out of the city and that's
13 where these labs belong. I object to the
14 scales of proposed buildings in the 197-C
15 plan there are too large and not contextual
16 with the residents Manhattanville
17 neighborhood. I'm troubled by Columbia's
18 bulldozer approach that they will -- along
19 with the buildings, the history of this very
20 special 19th century town. And --
21 approach using the parameters and the
22 restrictions of the 197-A will help this
23 conflict between -- as well as for
24 commercial manufacturing and retail

1 business.

2

3 I am not a great fan of the expansion
4 approach of NYU, but in this case they were
5 example about our an urban community and
6 urban university can exist side by side.

7

8 I vote no for the 197-C Plan and yes for the
9 197-A. Thank you.

10

11 THE AUDIENCE:

12 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
13 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
14 speaker's speech.)

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 (Several names were called to speak.)

18

19 MR. LEVINE:

20 Hello my name is Norman Levine. I am a
21 fifty years resident for this area.

22

23 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
24 the reporter was unable to transcribe the

1 speaker's speech.)

2

3 I am against the 197-C and for the 197-A
4 Plan that CB9M have worked on for many
5 years.

6 Thank you.

7

8 MR. MALGA:

9 Good evening, my name is Boubacar Malga. I
10 just want to share as a present employer
11 what Columbia can do for you --

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
15 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
16 speaker's speech.)

17

18 MR. MALGA:

19 -- Columbia's have me the opportunity to go

20 --

21

22 THE AUDIENCE:

23 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
24 the reporter was unable to transcribe the

1 speaker's speech.)

2

3 MR. MALGA:

4 I support Columbia's Plan, I am standing
5 here a graduate of Columbia University --

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 MS. JONES:

13 (Several names were called to speak.)

14

15 SPEAKER:

16 I am a resident, home owner and a worker
17 here in Harlem. I just want to bring you
18 back realities and facts.

19

20 First of all, how many people here have
21 displaced from their houses because -- how
22 many commercial people have been displayed
23 or relocated because of eminent domain? How
24 many people present here today who spend

1 billion of dollars of infrastructure
2 buildings that are unsafe?

3

4 My brothers and sisters look at what's going
5 on in Manhattanville now. How many of you
6 want it stay the way it is? How many of you
7 --

8

9 THE AUDIENCE:

10 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
11 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
12 speaker's speech.)

13

14 SPEAKER:

15 Well, you can shout all you want, there is
16 going to be change. Let me talk to the
17 other side --

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 SPEAKER:

1 Support 197-C, Support 197-C, Support 197-C.

2 I Support 197-C.

3

4 MS. JONES:

5 (Several names were called to speak.)

6

7 MS. KENT:

8 Good evening, I will introduce myself as
9 president of the Preservation landmark
10 Committee on Board 9. Our Committee and the
11 Board have landmarks new district -- and the
12 residents of West Harlem to spend hard
13 earned dollars keeping up the care of their
14 historic property and they have answered,
15 yes. This is a knowledgeable historical
16 area.

17 Columbia has not given us enlightened or a
18 respectful planning. Columbia presents a
19 demolition plan, it launches a demolition
20 plan into a well cared -- historic sector of
21 historic New York and we cannot accept it
22 and of course we will vote that 197-C Plan
23 down --

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
3 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
4 speaker's speech.)

5

6 MS. JONES:

7 (Several names were called to speak.)

8

9 SPEAKER:

10 (Speaker had a deep accent and due to the
11 loud outbursts by the audience, the reporter
12 was unable to transcribe the speaker's
13 speech.)

14

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 (Several names were called to speak.)

18

19 MR. TAIT:

20 My name is Eric V. Tait, Jr. I am a
21 resident of Board 9, I am the vice president
22 of the Harlem Preservation Foundation and I
23 am still a practicing broadcast journalist
24 and documenting, so I do know a little about

1 the history of this community. I oppose the
2 197-C Plan.

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Applauded.)

6

7 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
8 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
9 speaker's speech.)

10

11 MR. TERRELL:

12 My name is Julien Terrell. Hello everybody,
13 I worked with the WE ACT I am a housing and
14 health coordinator and a lifelong resident
15 of West Harlem.

16

17 I did prepare a testimony to speak today,
18 but I am going to answer to the last comment
19 by the speaker about where the youths, I am
20 here to state for the record, we are the
21 youth of this community. There was a
22 gentleman out there who said -- community
23 and we are here to save this community and
24 we are here say this is not going to happen

1 with this 197-C Plan.

2

3 What we want for everybody to understand --

4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Applauded.)

7

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 MR. TERRELL:

13 Since the university announces its expansion
14 addition, landlords have increased
15 harassment of residents in an oft-unhidden
16 attempt to induce tenants to leave and make
17 room for the unexpected high-income Columbia
18 population. As part of their strategy to
19 drive out low income tenants usually in rent
20 stabilized units landlords have also
21 neglected routine maintenance and ignored
22 repair requests --

23

24 MS. JONES:

1 Thank you, sir.

2

3 MR. TERRELL:

4 My time is up. Vote no for the 197-C Plan.

5

6 MS. HAYES:

7 Good evening everybody my name is Susan
8 Hayes. I am the president and CEO of -- a
9 construction company. I am also the Board
10 Chair of -- employment of woman. We have a
11 organization that trains, place and
12 advocates to get union jobs for --

13

14 THE AUDIENCE:

15 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
16 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
17 speaker's speech.)

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Ladies and gentlemen, you will have to calm
21 down and be respectful to the speakers. We
22 cannot hear what they are saying. We will
23 be hear all night until we get through each
24 and ever speaker.

1

2 SPEAKER:

3 I am going to ask everyone to be respectful
4 for one minute. There are a lot of people
5 here who wants to speak and we want to give
6 everyone an opportunity to be heard, so it
7 is really important that we really keep down
8 the outbursts and allow the person speaking
9 to speak. I noticed that this is a very
10 emotional subject, but I going to ask you to
11 please be respectful to the speaker. We are
12 trying to get to everyone, so if everyone
13 would be a little quieter, we will be able
14 to move along quicker.

15

16 MS. DUKES:

17 Good evening my name is Hazel Dukes. I'm
18 here to tonight to express the reason I
19 support Columbia University Expansion --

20

21 THE AUDIENCE:

22 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
23 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
24 speaker's speech.)

1

2 MS. DUKES:

3 I recommend that -- (Due to the loud
4 outbursts by the audience, the reporter was
5 unable to transcribe the speaker's speech.)

6

7 SENATOR PERKINS:

8 Hello everyone, I am Senator Bill Perkins.

9 I have the privilege of representing this
10 neighborhood. I am going to be very brief.

11 Two weeks ago I was here out here for a
12 similar kind of meeting with respect to the
13 197-A Plan that was being sponsored by the
14 community board and I indicated my support
15 for that plan.

16 With respect to this plan be very clear, I
17 do not support any plan that has eminent
18 domain in it.

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Applauded.)

22

23 SENATOR PERKINS:

24 It is very, very important that not only

1 does the plan not have eminent domain in it,
2 but it does not it does not include
3 negotiations with the city to take homes
4 from people in housing --

5

6 THE AUDIENCE:

7 (Applauded.)

8

9 SENATOR PERKINS:

10 -- without their involvement in those
11 decisions and it is my understanding now
12 that I have expressed it to Columbia -- that
13 the negotiations going on with respect to
14 those tenants, who wants to move them out
15 because somebody wants their property and
16 that's not right.

17 So, I will not be supporting this 197C Plan

18 --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Applauded.)

22

23 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
24 the reporter was unable to transcribe the

1 speaker's speech.)

2

3 SENATOR PERKINS:

4 We would like the state to recognize that
5 this is not the role of the community, we
6 would like the state to really think the
7 report that found, that suggested that
8 eminent domain, because based on a firm
9 decision there seems to be a conflict of
10 interest between Columbia and the same
11 consultant who -- eminent domain report.
12 So like I stated before, this is my position
13 and I will continue to support my decision
14 to another plan comes up that makes sense
15 for the community.

16

17 THE AUDIENCE:

18 (Applauded.)

19

20 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
21 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
22 speaker's speech.)

23

24 MS. JONES:

1 (Several names were called to speak.)

2

3 THE AUDIENCE:

4 Why don't you give our councilman a chance
5 to speak?

6

7 MS. JONES:

8 I asked councilman if he would like to say
9 a few words and he decline.

10

11 THE AUDIENCE:

12 (Whereupon, there was loud outbursts by the
13 audience.)

14

15

16 MS. MESA:

17 My name is Milda Mesa. I am a resident of
18 Harlem since 2001. I am a single mother
19 with two kids, a Harvard lawyer, practicing
20 environmental law since 1988. I am here to
21 talk to you about environmental issue. Let
22 me also tell you in the interest of full
23 disclosure that I have been around sine 2001
24 and last year I was hired as a Director of

1 Environmental -- Columbia University.

2

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
6 audience, the reporter was unable to
7 transcribe the speaker's speech.)

8

9 MS. PARKS:

10 Good evening everybody. My name is Ana
11 Parks and I am with WE ACT Housing and
12 Health outreach manager. I have lived in
13 Harlem for the past twenty years and I have
14 worked in this community to help out for
15 twelve years.

16

17 In my discussion with West Harlem community
18 members I have learned that the major
19 concerns about the expansion proposal is
20 that would add to the health problems that
21 already effecting the community.

22

23 First, housing lead exposure is a leading
24 cause of the lead poisoning in the West

1 Harlem Community, the Federal, State and
2 City health officials have all prioritized
3 the prevention of this major public health
4 threat. New York City is a pioneer in
5 enacted the strongest anti-lead poisoning
6 legislation of any other municipality --

7

8 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
9 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
10 speaker's speech.)

11

12 MS. JONES:

13 Excuse me, we are going to give her more
14 time and I am going to call back somebody
15 else, because we cannot hear. So we will
16 just wait until you are ready to be quiet
17 and let the person who is speaking get on
18 the record. Thank you very much. That just
19 mean we will not get to some of you and will
20 be here until eleven o'clock.

21

22 MS. PARKS:

23 To add insult to injury, while the expansion
24 is under construction, residents will not

1 only have to endure the harassment from
2 their landlord and the unhealthy pollution
3 from noise and particular matter, they will
4 face garbage and infestations of roaches and
5 rats that will also be escaping the
6 construction area.

7

8 The University claims it will bait for
9 rodents around the area with "approved"
10 chemical pesticides. However, baiting
11 around the project areas insufficient to
12 control pests that have so thrived in urban
13 environments precisely because they are good
14 at evading human barriers, even chemical
15 pesticides.

16

17 However, the University needs to provide
18 pest control services for residents whose
19 pest burden will be increased by
20 construction activity.

21 Columbia should not be allowed to go forward
22 with its expansion.

23

24

1 SPEAKER:

2 (Due to the loud outbursts by the audience,
3 the reporter was unable to transcribe the
4 speaker's speech.)

5

6 MS. JONES:

7 People you need to be quiet and allow the
8 speakers to get onto the record.

9

10 (Several names were called to speak.)

11

12 MR. GERETY:

13 Hello my name is Rowan Gerety, I would like
14 to say that there has been a lot of problems
15 this side tonight about the compromise about
16 partnership and respect, but I don't think
17 that any plans that says to go forward when
18 the 3,500 people will all likely be
19 displaced in the very near future is a plan
20 that -- compromise I think that that is a
21 plan --

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the

1 audience, the reporter was unable to
2 transcribe the speaker's speech.)

3

4

5 MS. POWELL:

6 Good evening. Hi, my name is Stephanie
7 Powell and I live in the Village of Harlem.
8 We the people especially the senior citizen,
9 we love our Harlem just the way it is. The
10 old buildings, the afternoons and the
11 streets are full of good and bad memories
12 and for some of us that all we have left.
13 If you are truly here to help and concerned
14 for the people then please, please don't
15 destroy and tear down the memories just help
16 us to repair, fix, and renovate them. In
17 doing this way the Village of Harlem and the
18 mighty Columbia, yes we do recognize can all
19 vote together.

20

21 We are asking you with all the strengths we
22 have left to take our pleadings and concerns
23 back to the men in black and ask them to
24 please help us. The real people of Harlem

1 to rebuild not tear down Harlem, if not then
2 please leave our residential alone.

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Applauded.)

6

7 MR. FRISBY:

8 Good evening, my name is Shelton Frisby. I
9 am here tonight, I'm with the Harlem Tenants
10 Council, to strongly urge the Community
11 Board 9 to vote no against Columbia's 197-C
12 Plan, because it does not confirm with the
13 197-A Plan with the Community Board 9.

14 The community have many questions for
15 Columbia. How formally are you that this
16 expansion is about needing more space --

17

18 (Due the audience loud outbursts, the
19 reporter was unable to transcribe the
20 speaker's speech.)

21

22 Columbia needs to be sent back to the
23 drawing board to come up with a 197-C Plan
24 that is consistent with the 197-A Plan of

1 Community Board 9 and the community
2 resident. This plan has been unanimously
3 adopted by the Board and the local residents
4 and I stand here tonight with full support
5 for this community.

6

7 Again, I strongly urge the members of the
8 Community Board 9 to reject the Columbia's
9 197-C Plan because it does not perform to
10 the community 197-A Plan.

11

12 Thank you.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 (Several names were called to speak.)

16

17 MR. SHAW:

18 Good evening. My name is Theodore Shaw. I
19 am the director counsel and president of the
20 NAACP, but I speaking in my personal
21 capacity. I have represented people who
22 have challenged eminent domain as their
23 lawyer, I know what it means to do that. In
24 fact, I will tell that the use of eminent

1 domain should be restricted to instances of
2 which there can be a resolution of the
3 dispute by some kind of agreement on the
4 terms, of whatever conflicts is in play.
5 I really came here tonight to say something
6 though as I sat that I want all to
7 understanding. I know Lee Bollinger from
8 Michigan. I went to the Supreme Court with
9 him in the affirmative action case, that was
10 yesterday and this is today I understand
11 that, but when you talk about this in terms
12 the institution racism, I understand the
13 power of that because I represent black and
14 brown people everyday. This is what I have
15 to go through my career to do. But I have to
16 tell you while me must disagree with Lee
17 Bollinger --

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
21 audience that the reporter was unable to
22 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

23

24

1 MR. SHAW:

2 Sir, sir, my time. This is a good man. So
3 here is what I suggest, there is a better
4 way to resolve this.

5

6 One, there should not be any net loss of
7 housing opportunity for people in Harlem. I
8 started out in Harlem, I live in Harlem and
9 with God willing I will end in Harlem.

10 There should not be a net loss of housing
11 opportunity --

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Thank you sir, your time is up.

15

16 MR. SHAW:

17 -- anybody who is displaced should be
18 compensated --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
22 audience that the reporter was unable to
23 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

24

1 MR. SHAW:

2 -- but there should be a negotiation about
3 this that resolve this is a way where it's a
4 win-win.

5

6 Thank you. Thank you for your time.

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
10 audience that the reporter was unable to
11 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

12

13 MS. PAIN

14 Good evening everyone. My name is Marlene
15 Pain. I live at 3333 Broadway. I am a vice
16 president of New -- Tenants Association. I
17 am here today to speak to Columbia about the
18 displacement. I live in 3333, we have 1,190
19 units, people are already been displaced
20 because of Columbia, people are being
21 displaced ever single day. Vote down
22 Columbia's 197-C Plan, and vote for the 197-
23 A Plan.

24

1 Thank you.

2

3 THE AUDIENCE:

4 (Applauded.)

5

6 MS. BAILEY:

7 Good evening. My name is Nellie Bailey. I
8 am the director of the Harlem's Tenants
9 Council. I'm here tonight to urge Community
10 Board 9 to vote no at this Columbia
11 University's 197-C proposal, because this is
12 not confirmed with the 197-A Plan of
13 Community Board 9. This plan was adopted
14 unanimously by the Board with the full
15 participation of the community. Columbia
16 University's Plan is the biggest land
17 grabbing institution in Harlem --

18

19 (Whereupon, the speaker began to scream and
20 there were loud outbursts by the audience
21 that the reporter was unable to transcribe
22 the speaker's speech accurately.)

23

24 MS. WEEKS:

1 Good evening. My name is Akwa Weeks and I
2 am a Board Member of Harlem Tenants Council.
3 We oppose to Columbia University's Plan.
4 This plan will lose housing and I am also
5 very concerned about the biotech aspect of
6 their plan.

7

8 Everybody knows that there is a fork line at
9 125th Street, when that things go off we
10 don't have to dealing with a bunch of
11 biochemical's hazards stuff coming out in
12 addition to all the other problems that
13 we're going have.

14

15 So I am against this. I do want to say that
16 Donald Trump in his book, he says "that he
17 will tell Bollinger that he is fired for the
18 way he is handling this proposition. He
19 says that Al Learner a close friend of his
20 was on Columbia's Board for some time and he
21 had a fantastic -- he thought Columbia
22 should have occupied fifteen existing acres
23 of unobstructed land from 69 to 62nd Street
24 -- They would have brought part of

1 Columbia's campus into the heart of
2 Manhattan and made the campus more
3 accessible to New Yorkers.

4

5 As it is now, Columbia is in a horrible
6 location and thanks to Bollinger it will
7 stay that way for ever. Columbia deserves
8 the best location, not the worse. By the
9 way Donald Trump owns the land that Columbia
10 should be buying. This says that he open to
11 you buying it and I think that you should
12 revisit that plan.

13

14 Thank you.

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 (Several names were called to speak.)

18

19

20 MR. MERCER:

21 My name is Bryan Mercer and I am a student
22 at Columbia University and I have a youth
23 who would like to speaker.

24

1 SPEAKER:

2 Once again, I would like to say as a youth
3 member in this community, we don't support
4 your plan and we again do not support the
5 plan to displace members of this community.

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Applauded.)

9

10 MR. MERCER:

11 The plan that Columbia has put forward to
12 you is not economical to this community. It
13 is the plan sets to display hundreds of
14 jobs, thousands of residents and leave the
15 West Harlem priers unusable to the community
16 that created over twenty, twenty-five years
17 of work.

18

19 Because of these impacts, I am against the
20 seventeen acre land grab for a single
21 private developers. I am against the
22 rezoning of an additional seventeen acres
23 surrounding the campus with usage that
24 served the university needs above the

1 community needs. Four years ago, I came to
2 a school called Columbia University in the
3 city of New York to live in the City of New
4 York and its greatest neighborhood Harlem,
5 not to be a part of making the City of New
6 York more like Columbia.

7

8 Therefore, I am against the creation of a
9 second middle class and white enclave in
10 Harlem by Columbia.

11

12 MS. BRADLEY:

13 My name is Deborah Bradley, owner of Bradley
14 Construction. We are a local construction
15 contractor in this community. We've been
16 here for 14 years, we started out very, very
17 small and we currently -- on 231st Street in
18 the proposed Manhattanville area.

19

20 So we too would likely be moved in a couple
21 of years. But I am here in full support of
22 Columbia University's 197-C Plan --

23

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
3 audience that the reporter was unable to
4 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

5

6 MS. BRADLEY:

7 Let me tell you why. I have been working
8 with the University for over the past
9 fourteen years. They were my first client
10 and they will continue to be one of my best
11 clients, but there has been a serious change
12 going on in the last year or so. Ever since
13 Manhattanville has been on the board to come
14 about Columbia has actually reached out all
15 the local business including mine and a lot
16 of yours.

17

18 MS. JONES:

19 Excuse me, excuse me. She will be here
20 until she finishes her statement. So, I
21 suggest that you sit down and you calm down.

22

23 Thank you.

24

1 MS. BRADLEY:

2 Lastly, I would like to say I've needed more
3 people to come work for us, because we work.
4 So I reached out to the Harlem Community for
5 people who needed work and guess what? And
6 I got some great employees from Harlem.

7

8 Thank you. And thank you to the University
9 for all your support.

10

11 MS. JONES:

12 (Several names were called to speak.)

13

14 MR. ANDERSON:

15 My name is Peter Anderson, you always have
16 to tell information about yourself.

17 My point is, white people use to say on the
18 campus, well my parents came to this country
19 and they did so well. But they're trying to
20 say why can't your people do it.

21

22 I didn't know the history of my people, I
23 only knew my people from Bedsty and they
24 were the greatest people I have met because

1 I went from an all black Catholic school and
2 they taught as well --

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
6 audience that the reporter was unable to
7 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

8

9 MR. ANDERSON:

10 -- you have the nerve to call Columbia an
11 university, a university supposed to teach
12 people and make them more human and
13 understanding, okay --

14

15 THE AUDIENCE:

16 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
17 audience that the reporter was unable to
18 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

19

20 Ms. DABBY:

21 My name is Laura Dabby. I am a graduate
22 student of public health at Columbia and I
23 do not support 197-C Plan.

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Whereupon, there were loud outbursts by the
3 audience that the reporter was unable to
4 transcribe the speaker's speech accurately.)

5

6 Ms. DABBY:

7 -- I am against displacement, 5,000 people
8 who wants to live and you think about each
9 and every single person, each and every
10 person is a vital part of the part of the
11 community, if you knew that community, you
12 are destroying the homes of the entire area,
13 there are plenty of research that some of
14 our best professor, have demonstrate that
15 when the community is destroyed and how the
16 beautiful -- not just the community but all
17 around, it will be --

18 I just want you to think personally about
19 what you are doing to this community.

20 I have a second question, I have notice that
21 there are a lot of people from a drug rehab
22 center who is in support of Columbia's plan.

23 I'm curious who brought them here and how
24 they forced them to be here. I find that

1 morally wrong. I have been so frustrated in
2 my life. Columbia you are taking advantage
3 of the people tonight to show support for
4 the Columbia's plan.

5 Once again, I do not support Columbia's
6 plan.

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 (Several names were called to speak.)

10

11 MR. ADAMS:

12 Good evening ladies and gentlemen. My name
13 is Michael Henry Adams and I live in Harlem
14 and I am educated from Columbia University.

15

16 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
17 the reporter was unable to hear the
18 speaker.)

19

20 -- everything that I learned at Columbia
21 University about how you should not have
22 Robert Moses like plan that seems to be for
23 some period, that destroyed everything --
24 We live in a very strange country with some

1 very strange history. There are women who
2 believes that they are paid, that they have
3 a job they are making money, that is good
4 for all women. There are black who believes
5 if they are being paid, if they have some
6 money that is good for all black people, but
7 that's not true, that's not true.

8

9 THE AUDIENCE:

10 (Applauded.)

11

12 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
13 the reporter was unable to hear the
14 speaker.)

15

16

17 MR. ARCOLEO:

18 I am Fred Arcoleo. I am a high school
19 teacher and many of my students live in this
20 neighborhood. And I was just imagining
21 something off to the side here. I was
22 imagining that Columbia University and the
23 people that run this society will sit down
24 and come to the people of Harlem and say,

1 "Wow, we see the problems that you are
2 dealing with, we see the high unemployment,
3 we see the lack of healthcare, we see the
4 high incidents of disease, we see the
5 homelessness, we see the dirt that you were
6 saying was poison. We see all these things
7 and we would like to sit down and come up
8 with a plan so we can meet your needs. I
9 was kind of imagining that, but then I
10 thought that's a bad dream, because that's
11 not what happening here at all. And that's
12 never what happens, they never come and ask
13 us what we need, because they just care
14 about what they need and Columbia University
15 --

16

17 THE AUDIENCE:

18 (Applauded.)

19

20 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
21 the reporter was unable to hear the
22 speaker.)

23

24

1 MR. ARCOLEO:

2 These are the people that run our society,
3 these are the people that go to Columbia
4 that are going to run the big corporations,
5 these are the people that are going to the
6 plan the next war. These are the people
7 that are going to prepare the rules for what
8 happens after 9/11, when they have another
9 terrorist attack, they are going to plan the
10 laws that are going to be put into place to
11 protect the people that run the country and
12 attack the people that lives in the country.
13 Those are the people that goes to Columbia
14 and those are the people that they train.
15 We've heard some of that here tonight.

16

17 THE AUDIENCE:

18 (Applauded.)

19

20 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
21 the reporter was unable to hear the
22 speaker.)

23

24

1 MS. JONES:

2 (Several names were called to speak.)

3

4 MR. WHITE:

5 My name is Jim White. I am the member of
6 St. Mary's Apostical Church Manhattanville
7 and the congregation for justice and peace.
8 Tonight is in creditable inspiring, it is
9 100 times more obvious to me that ever we
10 got to sharpen the struggles to fight back
11 against Columbia.

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 (Applauded.)

15

16 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
17 the reporter was unable to hear the
18 speaker.)

19

20 MR. WHITE:

21 Let's thank Mr. Bollinger's word for making
22 us anger in doing that. Lee Bollinger, how
23 dear you? You should realize the
24 institutional racism is destroying the lives

1 professional training and claiming that your
2 training program, your institution is an
3 answer to what the corporate structure that
4 you represents is false. Shame on you Lee
5 Bollinger, shame on Columbia.

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Applauded.)

9

10 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
11 the reporter was unable to hear the
12 speaker.)

13

14 MS. ROSS:

15 My name is Dorothy Ross. I am the resident
16 of West Harlem for twenty-four years and I
17 am here to speak against Plan 197-C and I am
18 opposed the use of eminent domain against
19 any resident or business. It is wrong for
20 one company to use that against another
21 company that is an abuse of the legal
22 process and eminent domain should be reserve
23 for public need, not private greed.

24

1 THE AUDIENCE:

2 (Applauded.)

3

4 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
5 the reporter was unable to hear the
6 speaker.)

7

8 MS. ROSS:

9 I am also opposed to any construction of any
10 bio safety level three labs in Manhattan. A
11 biotech level three is using microorganism
12 that cause death or serious illness and are
13 a airborne threat.

14 So according to the Center for Disease
15 Control, it should not be place in any heavy
16 populated or heavy traffic area.

17

18 Thank you.

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Applauded.)

22

23 MS ISSACS:

24 My name is Dr. Ella Isaacs and there are

1 several people who came before me, Columbia
2 is an institution of the rich, by the rich,
3 and for the rich.

4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Applauded.)

7

8 MS ISSACS:

9 If you look who their Board of Trustees are
10 three quarters of them are officers in major
11 bank corporation and they represent the
12 arrogant and the racism about the
13 institution where they carry on the policies
14 of Columbia.

15

16 Columbia College and medical centers
17 straddle a community with the highest
18 poverty, unemployment, cancer, AIDS, and
19 death rate of the New York City.

20 Now medical research is all well and good,
21 but it doesn't very often trickle down to
22 the people who are suffering from those
23 health problems just the opposite.

24

1 Columbia interested in the residents of this
2 community because they have provided
3 subjects for their experimentation and drug
4 money.

5

6 THE AUDIENCE:

7 (Applauded.)

8

9 DR. ISSACS:

10 Only a few years ago, Columbia carried out
11 commission of experiments, where they were
12 looking in the brains of six to ten year old
13 African boys for chemical abnormalities that
14 were supposed to explain the source of
15 violence. Currently, they are taking
16 millions in drug money to experiment --
17 looking for youngster in the community to
18 experiment the dangerous -- drugs on
19 children as young as three.

20

21 This is the kind of racism that Columbia is
22 guilty of and when student have stood up to
23 fight racism like they did in '68, like they
24 did in '92, and like what they are doing

1 recently to fight the --

2

3 THE AUDIENCE:

4 (Applauded.)

5

6 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
7 the reporter was unable to hear the
8 speaker.)

9

10 DR. ISSACS:

11 For this reason we must appose this plan
12 until Columbia becomes an institution that
13 serves the people, instead of exploiting the
14 people, we shouldn't give them one foot.

15

16 THE AUDIENCE:

17 (Applauded.)

18

19 MS. DOTY:

20 Good evening. My name is Cynthia Doty and I
21 am with Morningside Heights West Harlem
22 Sanitation Coalition and I am also
23 Democratic District leader.

24 And I'm here in opposition to the Columbia's

1 197-C Plan, because it does not conform to
2 the Community's 197-A Plan.
3 You know, I have been to a lot of meetings
4 many of us now over the last few years and
5 when we working on the 197-A Plan you didn't
6 get this kind of tension and division,
7 people came together and we had different
8 opinions and different agendas, but we work
9 together because the ultimate goal was a
10 community. We were out for protecting,
11 preserve, and enable the community to
12 economically improve, to protect and improve
13 the quality of life, to improve the
14 environment. We all came out and work
15 together. Whenever since the 197-C Plan has
16 been introduce -- and I think that's the
17 responsibility and the failure of the
18 university.

19

20 The university is suppose to be a leaner in
21 this City, and in the world and be able to
22 bring people together and this 197-C in the
23 process of going for have been destroying
24 our community. It has divided and we have

1 racism, we have economic injustice being
2 discussed here and that's not what this
3 should be about. I think that the
4 university should be doing much more sum to
5 the table and to work with the community.
6 If Columbia has taken eminent domain off the
7 table, we have a lot more cooperation and a
8 lot more good feeling and we want to be able
9 to include more people and grow and this
10 whole community could grow and I think this
11 is a disgrace of this of the university.

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 (Several names were called to speak.)

15

16 MS. SIMMONS:

17 Good evening. I am Elizabeth Simmons, a
18 Harlem resident, activist, tenants
19 association et cetera, et cetera.
20 I'm here tonight because Columbia 197-C plan
21 should not go through. Harlem right now has
22 a high asthma rate. What new health hazards
23 will be introduced having this lab and this
24 power plant. It will be another biotech

1 ready to explode.

2 Eminent domain needs to be done away with,
3 because you don't pay them for the money
4 that they put into. I should say
5 inhabitants put into their houses, so
6 eminent domain needs to be done away with
7 New York State.

8

9 Finally, stop over development under the
10 guide of community -- and how long would it
11 take for you to go from this part of Harlem,
12 make a U-turn and come around to the other
13 side of Harlem. Enough is enough, you have
14 enough land hold onto that. We the
15 inhabitants would like to have some land
16 too.

17

18 Thank you.

19

20 MR. LEVINE:

21 Hello everyone. I am Mark Levine. I am a
22 volunteer with the Coalition for the
23 community and I want to remind everyone that
24 Columbia's real estate already extends all

1 they way up to 218th Street, the very tip of
2 Manhattan and that's why we demand their
3 environmental impact statement take into
4 account all three of its campuses including
5 the medical center on 168th Street, which is
6 expanding itself at a rapid pace. Instead
7 their analysis only looked at a quarter
8 mile, five blocks around --

9

10 THE AUDIENCE:

11 (Applauded.)

12

13 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
14 the reporter was unable to hear the
15 speaker.)

16

17 MR. LEVINE:

18 I support the 197-A Plan and do not support
19 the 197-C Plan. Thank you.

20

21 MS. JONES:

22 (Several names were called to speak.)

23

24 THE REPORTER:

1 (Several speakers spoke, but due to the loud
2 outbursts by the audience it was difficult
3 to transcribe their speeches.)

4

5 SPEAKER:

6 Queen Mother Dr. Blakey. I am here tonight
7 asking President Bollinger to have some of
8 the students to come 477 West 142nd Street,
9 which affordable housing, which one was
10 abandoned thirty years ago and -- for the
11 community. I was able with the help of our
12 nonprofit to turn it around for affordable
13 housing.

14

15 Thirty years later now is eminent domain
16 enters in terms of the City of New York.
17 This administration model empowers with
18 Columbia University apart of vanguard of our
19 community to show good faith, and look at
20 some human right interest of our people. We
21 have a right to have a home.

22

23 I am 65 years old and I have a handicapped
24 daughter who is 28. She has to be watched

1 24-7 and I know being a student at Columbia
2 University, which I received my decorate
3 from the Columbia that those students could
4 be a part of the solution to one of the
5 property concerns for the community.

6 I have lived and worked as advocate for
7 about fifty years not only in Harlem, but
8 around the world and especially at the
9 United Nations and I ask that you and your
10 business -- it is important that Columbia
11 University to change the condition of our
12 community in which you are part of this
13 community for over a 100 year and show good
14 faith based on human rights and based on
15 your own background years ago of your
16 interest at large for those who are in need
17 and not in greed and I thank you.

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Applauded.)

21

22 MS. THOMAS:

23 My name is Desiree Carter-Thomas. I am a
24 student at Columbia University and I would

1 have to say that the expansion plan that
2 Columbia created makes me ashamed to say
3 that I am a Columbia University student
4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Applauded.)
7

8 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
9 the reporter was unable to hear the
10 speaker.)
11

12 MS. THOMAS:

13 And if I had known before applying that this
14 is what Columbia University was doing to the
15 people in the community I would have never
16 had applied.
17

18 I promise to do everything in my power to
19 stop this happening from happening and I
20 know that I am one person who don't have
21 that kind of power, but I know that in this
22 room there is so much anger, there is some
23 much anger that if we funnel it into
24 something productive, and first thing that

1 we have to do is to stop this plan from
2 happening.

3

4 THE AUDIENCE:

5 (Applauded.)

6

7 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
8 the reporter was unable to hear the
9 speaker.)

10

11 MS. THOMAS:

12 I think that it wouldn't be so difficult and
13 there is a plan, the 197-A Plan and I don't
14 understand how the an institution could
15 invited itself to someone else's home and
16 then create rules. You need to be a good
17 houseguest and that's what we are. Columbia
18 is a guest in Harlem. We are not the
19 owners, we are the guest.

20

21 Columbia you must obey the rules of the
22 community sets down for us. We cannot be
23 creating rules and so we need to accept the
24 197-A Plan that the community has already

1 created.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 THE AUDIENCE:

6 (Applauded.)

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 (Several names were called to speak.)

10

11 MS. MATTHEW:

12 Good evening everyone. My name is Yvonne
13 Matthews. I am the resident association
14 president of Manhattanville Housing and you
15 are enjoying. I live in this West Harlem
16 for 48 years and I am very concerned about
17 Columbia and it's 197-C Plan. We here at
18 Manhattanville are very concerned about the
19 displacement and the homelessness that we
20 will be faced f this Community Board 9 pass
21 for the 197-C Plan.

22

23 We are very concerned about all of the
24 little stores and the business that are

1 across from our buildings. We have lived
2 together for all of these years and we had
3 no problem, but now with Columbia trying to
4 come in we have a problem.

5

6 I would like to know if Columbia University
7 can ensure that health wise and
8 environmental we will not be endangered by
9 the bio research labs and what level will
10 their labs be and I say labs with an s,
11 because it is not just going to one.

12

13 And it is time as we as residents and
14 community people realize that Columbia is a
15 big liar --

16

17 THE AUDIENCE:

18 (Applauded.)

19

20 (Due to the loud outbursts from the audience
21 the reporter was unable to hear the speaker
22 clearly.)

23

24

1 MR. BODY-LAWSON:

2 Good evening my name is Victor Body-Lawson.

3 I am a resident of Harlem. I went to

4 Columbia and I have fought and worked in

5 this community for the past twenty years.

6 I have a questions for you, okay let's fast

7 forward fifty years, where do we see

8 ourselves? Fast forward a 100 years, where

9 do we do see ourselves?

10

11 THE AUDIENCE:

12 Dead.

13

14 MR. BODY-LAWSON:

15 Dead, yes. That is right, but each person

16 here is responsible for their lives and

17 their children's lives. Columbia University

18 has the right to be a part of this

19 community, I will tell you why, okay, I

20 decided to set up my firm in Harlem for a

21 specific reason, and that reason is to

22 deliver the best possible architectural

23 services that we could for this community

24 and we have been very lucky, and we have

1 done a lot of work in Harlem and we are
2 working with Columbia University now on this
3 plan.

4

5 Where do we see ourselves a hundred years from
6 now? Where do we see your children a hundred
7 years from now? I think from an
8 architectural standpoint, from a social
9 standpoint, from a spiritual standpoint, we
10 need to work together with the institution
11 that are in our community so that we can
12 grow.

13

14 So I tell you, we can either stay the same,
15 we can either get educated, we can either
16 grow and work with the institutions that we
17 have and move on.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21 MS. JONES:

22 Please listen for your name.

23

24 (Whereupon, several names were called to

1 speak.)

2

3 SPEAKER:

4 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

5

6 INTERPRETER:

7 My name is -- Silva, I am the president of
8 the building 610 Riverside Drive.

9

10 SPEAKER:

11 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

12

13 INTERPRETER:

14 I do not support the Plan 197-C.

15

16 SPEAKER:

17 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

18

19 INTERPRETER:

20 I want to raise many questions to see if the
21 people from Columbia answer.

22

23 SPEAKER:

24 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

1 INTERPRETER:

2 He want to find out how many leaders from
3 Columbia live in this neighborhood.

4

5 SPEAKER:

6 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

7

8 INTERPRETER:

9 How many people that have business, how many
10 people that have construction company live
11 in this neighborhood.

12

13 SPEAKER:

14 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke in Spanish)

15

16 INTERPRETER:

17 To finish my speech I just want to say,
18 Latino's together united, we can join
19 together to fight again anyone.

20

21 THE AUDIENCE:

22 (Applauded.)

23

24 MS. LEE:

1 Good evening my name is Christina Lee. I am
2 twenty-nine years a resident of the North
3 East Corner of Community Board 9 -- be a new
4 comer there. I am here to speak against the
5 197-C Plan, but I am going to limit myself
6 to one subject which is housing.

7 I am mindful of saying when I say the two
8 facts that are a long history in this
9 community board.

10

11 First, we went underwent urban renewal in
12 1960's and just south 125th Street, where
13 100 homes were demolished people were forced
14 to build buildings that has since given
15 houses to different people. There are many
16 people in this community never got over what
17 happened, the people were traumatized.

18

19 The second, is the fact that as a member of
20 Community Board 9 for which I am not
21 speaking tonight, I have listen for all my
22 years on that board of endless struggles of
23 Columbia's inability to manage the residents
24 rights of tenants in buildings they own. We

1 have been years of brawls about whether or
2 not there were improperly pushing out or
3 locking out or otherwise doing wrong to
4 tenants, that other landlords get to do
5 because they go straight to housing court.
6 When I look at this plan I see that they
7 were once where they had eight houses
8 intentionally, but now they are going to
9 have six, but they have not provided
10 anything useful and meaningful in the way
11 the housing court would guarantee that we
12 are not going to pay the price in the
13 Community Board 9.

14

15 I am therefore suggesting that no plan of
16 197-C can even be considered and let us just
17 contain a specific provision requiring
18 Columbia to establish and permanently
19 maintain and carry in effect an anti-
20 displacing program until it voluntarily agree
21 that in Community Board 9 above 125th
22 Street, because that it is the only remains
23 which is not a threat. They voluntarily
24 agreed that they will not sell or affiliate,

1 acquire by purchase, by lease, by some other
2 means any other residential units that are
3 there, so they will remain available at
4 least through the private market, for the
5 people who already lived there.

6

7 And I am recommending that the Board
8 consider in requirement that Columbia itself
9 in location other than Community Board 9
10 affirmatively stand up and provide board for
11 the students and the employees who are going
12 to be coming to our neighborhood to work in
13 our campus, the housing of those people so
14 they will not find themselves rushing into
15 the market to displace our folks privately
16 because Columbia brought all those jobs into
17 the place that they didn't provided any
18 housing for.

19

20 I love my neighborhood, I love my neighbors,
21 many of my neighbors are vulnerable to the
22 economics of the private market, because
23 they are renters --

24

1 MS. JONES:

2 Thank you, your time is up.

3

4 MS. GAYER:

5 Hi my name is Tamara Gayer and I am an
6 artist and I am also a commercial renter in
7 Manhattanville in the expansion zone. I
8 have been there for ten years with so
9 thirty-four friends of mine, we share
10 artists in music studios and we also do kind
11 of free shows for the people who are in our
12 genre the people who like to do shows.

13

14 We are also about the end of our lease so my
15 story basically one where even though people
16 have been saying that Columbia have been
17 really fair with the tenant businesses, I
18 lease is yet up and we've been trying to
19 negotiate with the University and all we get
20 is stonewall.

21

22 We are invited to talk to people in meetings
23 and then we call them, we call them, we call
24 them repeatedly they don't return our phone

1 calls and they don't return our E-mails, and
2 you know our history is one where we came to
3 the last ten years -- people who wanted to
4 say these are the demands not only for our
5 craftsman who would be really happy based in
6 Manhattan, but also from cross coalition
7 between lets say artist and auto mechanics
8 who built equipment for us and also some
9 other very fruitful collaborations happened
10 over the last decade.

11

12 All of this is ending and we are really,
13 because they have managed tactfully expel
14 most of the commercial tenants in the area.
15 The second aspect is if someone who comes
16 from a different -- with great respect to
17 the community in this area with the
18 geological geographic weather condition and
19 give them the development of the history and
20 containment of this point, to put level
21 three or higher in a residentially populated
22 urban community. There is a lot of work,
23 very profitable work which can be done at
24 level two --

1 MS. JONES:

2 Thank you.

3 (Whereupon, several names were called to
4 speak.)

5

6 MS. GOLDSON:

7 Vicky Goldson, I would like you to speak
8 first and foremost to my neighbors and say
9 we have got a sad situation here. There is
10 a time to be angry, there is a time to be
11 passionate, but there is also time to put a
12 plan on the table, which is worthy of the
13 emotions that are being stirred. The games
14 that are being played here with the people
15 in this community is no a laughing matter,
16 it is not a -- and don't use communities
17 meetings to do the negotiating and -- that
18 you should have done before you bring the
19 community in anger and situation. The game
20 is being played wrong by the elected
21 officials and by Columbia and also by the
22 Community Board.

23

24 Let me state first clearly, I am a member of

1 the Community Board the communication and
2 the information of what is being done, you
3 have to make some adjustments, those
4 adjustments had not been publicly stated.
5 They have been adjustments made from the
6 Community Board side and the coalition side
7 and has not been publicly stated, you need
8 to start now, you are getting to go into the
9 fall of the year and clearly I don't think
10 the majority of the people here understand
11 just how angry this community is and just
12 how furious they are when those are put
13 before them looked like this.

14

15 If you are in a situation that took place
16 here tonight anybody that knows this city
17 and knows what David Dinkins did those from
18 the old school are pissed off --

19

20 THE AUDIENCE:

21 (Applauded.)

22

23 MS. GOLDSON:

24 -- if you know anything about this city you

1 know that this meeting is not the meeting
2 for the exchange of information, it is not
3 the meeting to play the games and how many
4 people are speaking from Columbia and how
5 many people are speaking from the community.
6 It is not the place to play the games so
7 that people who have not been involved in
8 this process, do not get the information
9 that they need to hear.

10

11 People from all the community they need to
12 stand up, yes if you are from Columbia and
13 you are siding with Columbia this is forum
14 for the community to see who all are on
15 Columbia's tab and who is not, so there is a
16 time and place to interrupt and there is a
17 manner by which they interrupt and there is
18 a manner by which they pay people to fill
19 the room so that the place is stacked, at
20 some point all of you especially the ones in
21 charge are going to stop playing a game.

22

23 You have to be this way so the people in
24 this community that you are operating a good

1 thing because the interest of this situation
2 of a legacy where there was no trust between
3 institution and community, we have to act
4 accordingly.

5

6 MS. JONES:

7 (Whereupon, several names were called to
8 speak.)

9

10 MS. SHEPARD:

11 Good evening everyone my name is Peggy
12 Shepard. I lived in West Harlem for about
13 thirty years and I have been your district
14 leader and I have worked with WE ACT
15 Environmental action to reduce pollution and
16 improve environmental health in this
17 community. We are asking that the Columbia
18 plan and the decided plan, we recommend the
19 Community Board 9 disapproves of the zoning
20 of the places until and unless the
21 university makes fundamental changes to its
22 current plan. Changes that reflect the 197-
23 A Plan changes that reflect the vision, the
24 aspiration and the realities of this

1 community.

2

3 The changes must address West Harlem needs
4 in the following way:

5

6 First, to ensure availability of high
7 quality housing that is affordable for our
8 low-income community members whose family
9 income is about \$23,000.

10

11 Second, to provide skilled training in jobs
12 and economic opportunity for residents and
13 workers who will be displaced.

14

15 Three, implement measures that would ensure
16 the public health and safety of West Harlem
17 Community members in case of any containment
18 breach that may result in the University's
19 conduct of biotech research in an urban area
20 that is densely populated in West Harlem.

21

22 Four, incorporate campus design changes that
23 would promote easy public access to the
24 waterfront park and other communities

1 amenities such as Fairway market.

2

3 Five, commit to using best available
4 technology and emission controls and clean
5 alternate fuels on all its emission sources
6 including the planned power generators and
7 campus vehicle fleets.

8

9 Six, use best available technology and best
10 practices on all aspects of construction
11 including noise and vibration reduction
12 limit construction activity during the day,
13 using constructions curtains, like those
14 used in the Deutsche Bank deconstruction, in
15 order to minimize health impacts of
16 construction in the West Harlem community.

17

18 Seven, ensure infrastructure needs of the
19 project and that associated increase in
20 population density will be met so that
21 additional pollutions sources will not be
22 brought to bare on the West Harlem
23 community.

24

1 Without the message described above, the
2 expansion will increase the pollution
3 loading of West Harlem and our communities
4 is already disproportionately impacted.
5 Board 9 should not make the mistake of
6 replacing disinvestment with bad investment.
7 One that is intended to replace our
8 community with a Columbia community.

9

10 THE AUDIENCE:

11 (Applauded.)

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 (Whereupon, several names were called to
15 speak.)

16

17 MR. LOVEDAY:

18 Good evening, I'm Charles Loveday, retired
19 medical psychologist and professor and I
20 have been a resident of West Harlem for
21 about twenty-five years.

22

23 I equivocally appose to Columbia's
24 University 197-C Plan.

1 Unlike the 197-A Plan which includes input
2 and contention from diverse discrepancy
3 representative of this community, Columbia
4 University 197-C is exclusionary, arrogant,
5 and self-servant, ignoring the economical,
6 environmental, housing, health, and
7 educational impact on our community over the
8 next 20 to 25 years I will urge you all not
9 to vote for the 197-C Plan.

10

11 Thank you.

12

13 THE AUDIENCE:

14 (Applauded.)

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 (Whereupon, several names were called to
18 speak.)

19

20 MR. CASTRO:

21 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke with a deep
22 Spanish accent it was hard to transcribe him
23 for the record.)

24

1 Just for the record we are going to talk.
2 Let me now talk about why we are here
3 tonight and first thing I want to say is
4 that as always we -- Columbia University is
5 treating our people. Today we have an
6 example of white people thinking like a
7 white people because there are white people
8 who pick at the white for their justice.
9 White people don't speak about justice, they
10 speak as a white. Well they have -- white
11 people they bring another people they pay
12 money to some of the those people and well
13 they bring black against black and Latino
14 against Latino that is what they do.

15

16 THE AUDIENCE:

17 (Applauded.)

18

19 MR. CASTRO:

20 (Whereupon, the speaker spoke with a deep
21 Spanish accent it was hard to transcribe him
22 for the record.)

23

24 My brother and sister black and Latino are

1 being displaced. We don't have to be here
2 to know about this, just walk around Harlem
3 and you can see it for yourself. We don't
4 have to know what displacement means we
5 would have to see it and go for ourselves.
6 I never about him but I know he gets \$40,000
7 from Columbia because as a white, I am
8 talking -- talk about this, when they have
9 black people to do the same work that is how
10 they do it, they have a racist attitude.
11 And I am against Columbia's Plan and I call
12 all those people here to really put pressure
13 on people who haven't speak, like some
14 Politian's here, who haven't spoke against
15 this plan. This plan that is going to
16 displaced our people. So power to the
17 people.

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Applauded.)

21

22 MS. JONES:

23 (Whereupon, several names were called to
24 speak.)

1

2 MR. ORTIZ:

3 Hi ladies and gentleman my name is Anthony
4 Ortiz, I am nineteen years old I have been
5 living in this community for over eight
6 years now in 619 West 142nd Street in
7 Broadway. I am here today to go against
8 Columbia University's Plan of expansion. I
9 oppose this plan because they want certain
10 acres just for their gain not for the
11 community gain.

12

13 I oppose the lab that is going to form more
14 harm to our environment and more harm than
15 we already had.

16 Since you want a lab so bad, why don't you
17 go to time Square and put a lab there.

18

19 THE AUDIENCE:

20 (Applauded.)

21

22 (Whereupon, made loud outburst that made
23 difficult to transcribe the speaker for the
24 record.)

1

2 TIME KEEPER:

3 Thank you, sir, your time is up.

4

5 MR. ORTIZ:

6 I know three minutes is not up.

7

8 THE AUDIENCE:

9 (Applauded.)

10

11 (Whereupon, several names were called to
12 speak.)

13

14 SPEAKER:

15 I am sorry that President Bollinger left,
16 because I wanted him to here this. First of
17 all, the points that Peggy Shepard and Mr.
18 Loveday are basically my points but I want
19 to add a couple of things to them.

20

21 First of all my position is that I do not
22 support Columbia's 197-C Plan until they
23 come back to the table with Community Board
24 9 and reconcile it with our 197-A Plan.

1 And secondly, to this brother over here who
2 asked where do I see myself 100 years from
3 now, I have been living in this community
4 since 1968, I was first in an apartment
5 rental and then I brought a home in 1975.

6

7 THE AUDIENCE:

8 (Applauded.)

9

10 SPEAKER:

11 And as I walk around in my community today
12 where I stay when other people were leaving
13 to go to the places they thought were better
14 I stayed and worked with other community
15 people to make it a place where now
16 everybody wants to come. As I walk around
17 and I walk up on certain streets and going
18 certain buildings, I am feeling a stranger
19 in my own community that I got to build and
20 I have to maintain when crack vales are
21 along the trees and all over the sidewalks
22 in Manhattanville. So fifty years or 100
23 years from now I may not even be here. Okay
24 if we don't fight to have a place in this

1 community and then comes the poor up to the
2 rich of all the ethnic group that here now
3 we should and Columbia's expansion sure they
4 have a right to expand, but in their
5 expansion they need to be positive of the
6 community around them and they should do not
7 displace people who still want to be here
8 and in terms of Manhattanville those
9 apartments over there are the best ones --
10 okay.

11

12 Thank you.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 (Whereupon, several names were called to
16 speak.)

17

18 MR. CORBIN-MARK:

19 My name is Cecil Corbin-Mark and I am the
20 director of program WE ACT Environmental
21 justice. I have some of my other
22 credentials, I am also certified president
23 of the leads design professionals from the
24 US -- Council and I am a life long resident

1 of Harlem.

2

3 I want to talk about my deep concerns one of
4 the about Columbia's attack on the
5 community's municipal infrastructure, but
6 before I even get started on I want to make
7 it absolutely clear, that our heritage is
8 the same at this time without significant
9 changes that the community board should vote
10 no on the Columbia's 197-C Plan.

11 I am deeply concerned about Columbia's
12 impact on the community's municipal
13 infrastructure and particularly its air and
14 water pollution loading.

15

16 First, the expansion of the planned causes a
17 tremendous threat to the local air quality
18 because of it's need for electricity, as
19 well as fuel, and transportation uses.

20 Columbia's encloses in their draft
21 Environmental Impact Statement that it plans
22 to two energy plants on the expansion campus
23 and hints that they could be fitted to
24 become cogeneration plants as a potential

1 mitigation measures to decrease the
2 pollution per day on the community.
3 The University demands on New York City
4 power grid. Such facilities are only as
5 clean or polluting as the fuel that is used
6 to run them. The University states that the
7 description of the fuel source for one of
8 the plants is natural gas but they do not
9 disclose what the other fuel source is for
10 the other. Nor does the University discuss
11 the range of powers sources such as
12 geothermal energy, fuel cells, and other
13 clean technologies that could be used to run
14 this power plant or energy plant what we
15 call them.

16

17 Further more the seventeen acre campus will
18 be to put very energy and materials
19 intensive uses, including biological
20 research and performance basis. Although
21 the University describes design measures
22 that will somewhat decreased energy use
23 missing from the discussion of conformation
24 strategy. The University energy needs will

1 certainly not being limited to electricity.
2 Therefore, it will need to educate
3 University affiliates as well as contractors
4 that come onto site about how to decrease
5 their energy footprint through, among other
6 things including electricity and their
7 professional and personal spaces, decrease
8 dependence on disposal products on dining as
9 well as administrative facilities and choose
10 locally produced materials and avoid foreign
11 imports whenever possible to decrease
12 shipping and delivery demands.

13

14 Government regulators and project applicants
15 the world over are giving increasing
16 consideration and contributions to their
17 actions about climate change and are working
18 to reduce their energy and emission quickly,
19 indeed this report earlier this year ruled
20 that the government has the authority to
21 regulate carbon dioxide, the principal
22 pollutant responsible for global warming and
23 climate changes. Yet nowhere in the DEIS
24 does Columbia home to the world renowned

1 expert in climate change and it's associated
2 environmental and health impacts consider
3 this a vital issue.

4

5 Second, by adding more than 10,000 Columbia
6 affiliated users into -- so there is a lot
7 more, so please vote no on Columbia's 197-C
8 Expansion Plan.

9

10

11 MS. RODRIGUEZ:

12 My name Daisy Rodriguez I do not speak
13 English well, but she is talking for me.

14

15 INTERPRETER:

16 I totally oppose the discrimination or the
17 abuse by the abusive plan of expansion of
18 the -influential political entrusting the
19 participation of Columbia. Columbia is
20 qualified does not benefit from eminent
21 domain. Columbia is the number one violator
22 of all the rules of the state of New York
23 and its country. Further more, the civil
24 rights law, building law, health law, Fire

1 Department and many other laws. -- Columbia
2 has monopolized illegally Morningside and
3 neighborly communities removing families
4 illegally thousand of families are black,
5 Hispanic, and low-income.
6 Columbia is covered by political influences
7 in judging of distinction in court by
8 successfully continue displacing many
9 families -- small businesses illegally in
10 this area. It is not easy -- in this
11 powerful corporation as Columbia uses
12 influential persons to cover their crime,
13 displacing like millions of families and
14 crime and is done by the administration of
15 Columbia, for the last 15 years and continue
16 to the present.

17

18 MR. BURK:

19 Good evening my name is Carolyn Burk and I
20 live in the area since 1976 I have had two
21 children in this area. I remember the
22 police being called in by the same --
23 character I believe the and just wandering
24 why the students will be called who are not

1 registered yet with Columbia. I will
2 strongly urge Columbia to think about the
3 past history and look at what is going on
4 now probably we should have started in the
5 beginning, the 197-A Plan the Community's
6 plan work on that why is Columbia refusing
7 to work with the Community's Plan.

8

9 There are a lot of reasons why not to trust
10 Columbia I just making one of them and that
11 happens to be question of trust and
12 construction. I watched the development on
13 110th Street and the school where Columbia
14 promised all sort of jobs, it turned out
15 however that in fact the jobs were
16 outsourced, the jobs were given to
17 contractors and subcontractors -- about the
18 job but we were told we couldn't have that
19 because -- no money there was no obligation
20 just tell us anything about how many people
21 had left how many of them how many of them
22 are any other day, this is none of our
23 business from the that was privilege
24 information and we could not find out

1 anything so we know in terms of construction
2 and jobs that is just one of the many issues
3 and I will submit it in writing.

4

5 MS. ROLLEY:

6 Hi I am Lumi Michelle Rolley and I am here
7 to provide a citywide prospective on the
8 issue of eminent domain use.

9

10 New York City Urban planning in 1960 to 1970
11 was characterized by large scale public
12 property but the government swept the entire
13 neighborhood to reside in -- only to build
14 largely -- with the project in Brooklyn,
15 Columbia Universities expansion plan and
16 their numerous plan in North Queens. Today
17 our city stands on the threshold of another
18 era in city planning again define by use of
19 eminent domain private development, both of
20 the years are divided by -- incredible
21 benefit the fact is that is that people that
22 have been never, ever and I don't even want
23 to hear the Columbia University of expansion
24 of the public benefit. University officials

1 at present had told people in Columbia
2 University is a private institution and not
3 a public view, along side that you always
4 here this is --

5
6 One thing that I am concerned taking of
7 private property is for private institution
8 unconstitutional, unfair, and it is un-
9 American. Most important public property at
10 US constitution which derives a strength to
11 safe guard the right of individuals to get
12 the _____, the goal support of this plan
13 is to vote against the constitution, vote
14 against our individual right and vote
15 against all wealth management and sabotage
16 their life, I am sorry not --

17

18 MS. JONES:

19 Thank you, your time is up.

20

21 MS. ROLLEY:

22 All right I just want to say, that from a
23 urban planning prospective you can't --
24 again thank you.

1 MS. CHIN:

2 Yuien Chin. Hamilton Heights, it is
3 difficult to support a plan which threaten
4 eminent domain on any level create primary
5 and second displacement for local businesses
6 and resident and bring to the West Harlem
7 community a projects that completely on a
8 scale -- neighborhood.

9

10 Columbia's 197-C Development Plan must be
11 within the frame work of CB9 197-A Plan, and
12 I particular they support the creation of
13 the West Harlem Special District as proposed
14 by Borough President Stringer. This West
15 Harlem Special District would give the
16 neighborhood surrounding the propose
17 Columbia expansion new zoning laws to
18 protect its social and physical character.
19 It will also litigate some of the
20 displacement impact the environmental impact
21 statement to this area, a special district
22 plan as proposed by -- could also be used
23 as a support and prevention by 197-A
24 provision as recommended by Community Board

1 9. I urge the Community board members not
2 to support the Columbia University 197-C
3 plan that received under issues of plan
4 commemorate.

5

6 Thank you.

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 Good evening, we have over three hundred
10 people attending this public hearing this
11 evening and that is based on those who
12 signed in and I am sure there are other who
13 did not.

14

15 Over 90 individuals I'm trying to get the
16 count right now, gave public testimony this
17 evening. 92 individuals gave public
18 testimony. Based upon the public testimony
19 this evening 22 individuals spoke in favor
20 of the Columbia's 197-C Plan and 73 spoke in
21 opposition of the plan.

22

23 THE AUDIENCE:

24 (Applauded.)

1 MS. JONES:

2 At this point in time we ULURP Committee of
3 Community Board 9 is going to vote on a
4 resolution, only the ULURP Committee of
5 Community Board 9 will be voting, the full
6 board of Community Board 9 on Monday August
7 20th.

8

9 I will start with the roll call of the ULURP
10 Committee.

11 Pat Jones, I'm here.

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Carolyn Thompson?

15

16 MS. THOMPSON

17 Present

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Walter South?

21

22 MR. SOUTH:

23 Here.

24

1 MS. JONES:
2 Kally Ranch?
3
4 MS. RANCH:
5 Here.
6
7 MS. JONES:
8 Michael Palmer?
9
10 MR. PALMER:
11 Here.
12
13 MS. JONES:
14 Ernestine Welch?
15
16 MS. WELCH:
17 Here.
18
19 MS. JONES:
20 Christina Lee?
21
22 MS. LEE:
23 Present.
24

1 MS. JONES:
2 Carolyn Kent?
3
4 MS. KENT:
5 Here.
6
7 MS. JONES:
8 Diane Wilson?
9
10 MS. WILSON:
11 Here.
12
13 MS. JONES:
14 Tamara Gayer?
15
16 MS. GAYER:
17 Here.
18
19 MS. JONES:
20 Savona Bailey McClain?
21
22 MS. MCCLAIN:
23 Here.
24

1 MS. JONES:

2 John Reddick?

3

4 MR. REDDICK:

5 Here.

6

7 MS. JONES:

8 Patricia Lewis?

9

10 MS. LEWIS:

11 Yes.

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Carlotta Damanda?

15

16 MS. DAMANDA:

17 (No verbal response.)

18

19 MS. JONES:

20 Brad Taylor?

21

22 MR. TAYLOR:

23 Here.

24

1 MS. JONES:
2 Francis Mack?
3
4 MR. MACK:
5 Here.
6
7 MS. JONES:
8 Charles Loveday?
9
10 MR. LOVEDAY:
11 Here.
12
13 MS. JONES:
14 Norma Ramos?
15
16 MS. RAMOS:
17 Here.
18
19 MS. JONES:
20 Carol --
21
22 SPEAKER:
23 (No verbal response.)
24

1 MS. JONES:

2 Brenda Faust?

3

4 MS. FAUST:

5 Here.

6

7 MS. JONES:

8 Okay, eighteen of the twenty members of the
9 197-C ULURP Committee are present. It is
10 very long, but I will read the resolution:
11 Whereas Manhattan Community Board 9 has
12 developed a plan for Community District 9
13 under section 197-A of the New York City
14 charter including the Manhattanville area
15 that is the subject of Columbia University
16 proposed 197-C and academic mixed used
17 development plan, and whereas the Columbia
18 197-C proposal is not consistent with the
19 goal objectives and recommendations set-
20 forth in CB9 197-A Plan and whereas the
21 Columbia 197-C proposal will lead to the
22 displacement of the CB9 low, moderate and
23 middle African-American and Hispanic
24 residents resulting in significant and

1 adverse impact on the community among other
2 significant and adverse impacts, and whereas
3 the liability of the Columbia proposed seven
4 story continuous separate construction is a
5 serious question due to the risks of storm
6 and floods extent, and whereas the majority
7 of the private property identified in CB9
8 197-A Plan are not afforded to start
9 protection under Columbia's 197-C proposal,
10 and whereas the neighborhood's dynamic
11 richly layered historic, ethnic, and
12 cultural character that will be preserved
13 under the 197-A Plan, will be eliminated
14 under Columbia's 197-C proposal, and whereas
15 CB9 is an environmental justice community
16 due to the existing high level of the
17 environmental burdens in the area, and
18 whereas the questionable use of eminent
19 domain demolishing of viable distinct
20 building, massive earth removal, requiring
21 over 98,000 trucks, displacement of low and
22 moderate income residents, particularly
23 people of color, development of two power
24 plant and relocation of the bus terminal in

1 low grade in the New York City that calls
2 for emergency national evacuation zone, high
3 intensity development at the equivalent of
4 FAR9 in an area where the context is FAR6,
5 disregard of -- and hypostatic pressure and
6 non-participatory planning all are against
7 Columbia proposed academic mixed use
8 development plan being socially,
9 economically, and environmentally
10 sustainable, and whereas Columbia has not
11 entered into a respectable full faith
12 collaboration of the community in developing
13 its proposal and alternative developing
14 scenario under the 197-A Plan, and whereas
15 as CB9 welcomes Columbia's into the
16 community as part of sustainable mixed
17 ownership development scenario that includes
18 commercial, manufacturing, academic, and
19 residential uses. Is compatible with the
20 existing neighborhood character of all
21 residential and business displacement
22 provide a diverse a long range of employment
23 opportunity for local resident and promote
24 the development of affordable housing set

1 forth in the 197-A Plan. Now therefore
2 resolve that the ULURP Committee of the
3 Community Board 9 recommends that Community
4 Board 9 vote to oppose Columbia's proposed
5 rezoning action and academic mixed use
6 development plan, unless Columbia agrees to:

7

8 One, withdrawal the proposal for eminent
9 domain, cease to use a threat of eminent
10 domain to intermediate owners to sell and
11 abandon the process of opposing gang orders
12 on those who has entered into agreements.

13

14 Two, withdraw the proposal to build a seven
15 story below structured and to request the
16 bill under 33 to -- area all of the way to
17 the university.

18

19 Three, bill on property owned by the
20 university and obtain through negotiation
21 with the owners without the threat of
22 eminent domain.

23

24 Four, guarantee that all housing developed

1 directly by Columbia as a result of the
2 proposed action with requirements of 197-A
3 Plan and that in all Columbia development
4 home housing and equal amount of housing for
5 the university and the community will be
6 created both on site and off site and that
7 no direct displacement in the seventeen acre
8 area.

9

10 Five, Columbia must -- housing immediately
11 developed and hereafter carry out an
12 affective housing and anti-displacement
13 program, commit not buying self or through
14 any affiliation through purchase or lease or
15 net lease any residential units from CB9
16 above 125th Street and provide efficient
17 additional housing in areas outside CB9 that
18 have all the students and employees
19 inspected to used the proposed north campus.

20

21 In addition, not interfere with the transfer
22 of 132 units from HPD to the residents of
23 those units as previously agreed to by the
24 City.

1
2 Six, -- of any other property within the
3 proposed academic mixed used development
4 area found allegeable by New York State
5 Historical Preservation Office and non-
6 opposed LTC landmark designation of any site
7 herein, also rebuilding a historic and
8 cultural character throughout the proposed
9 special Manhattanville mix used zoning
10 district and in CB9 as a whole in a 197-A
11 Plan.

12
13 Seven, -- power sources such as power plant
14 and co-generation facilities or research
15 facility or above bio safety level II or --
16 that will contribute to -- of this
17 community.

18
19 Eight, engage in a single design and
20 construction practices with the equivalent
21 of a lead standard of platform prior to the
22 commencement of construction. Nine, engage
23 in good faith negotiation with Community
24 Board 9 to achieve a mutual -- compromise

1 that will permit the construction of
2 academic facilities needed by Columbia on
3 property owned by the university through
4 technical amendments in a manner that is
5 consistent with the underlying goal of 197-A
6 Plan.

7

8 Do you rule to vote?

9

10 SPEAKER:

11 Second.

12

13 MS. JONES:

14 Motion move to a vote. A yes vote means you
15 support the resolution which says the ULURP
16 Committee does not the 197-C Zoning Proposal
17 of Columbia University unless those ten
18 conditions are met. Okay.

19 Pat Jones says, yes I do support the
20 resolution.

21 Carolyn Thompson?

22

23 MS. THOMPSON

24 Yes.

1

2 MS. JONES:

3 Walter South?

4

5 MR. SOUTH:

6 Support.

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 Kally Ranch?

10

11 MS. RANCH:

12 Yes.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 Michael Palmer?

16

17 MR. PALMER:

18 I support the resolution.

19

20 MS. JONES:

21 Ernestine Welch?

22

23 MS. WELCH:

24 Support.

1

2 MS. JONES:

3 Christina Lee?

4

5 MS. LEE:

6 Support the resolution.

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 Carolyn Kent?

10

11 MS. KENT:

12 Support.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 Diane Wilson?

16

17 MS. WILSON:

18 Yes.

19

20 MS. JONES:

21 Tamara Gayer?

22

23 MS. GAYER:

24 Yes.

1

2 MS. JONES:

3 Savona Bailey McClain?

4

5 MS. MCCLAIN:

6 Yes.

7

8 MS. JONES:

9 John Reddick?

10

11 MR. REDDICK:

12 Yes.

13

14 MS. JONES:

15 Patricia Lewis?

16

17 MS. LEWIS:

18 Yes.

19

20 MS. JONES:

21 Carlotta Damanda is not present.

22 Brad Taylor?

23

24

1 MR. TAYLOR:

2 No.

3

4 MS. JONES:

5 Francis Mack?

6

7 MR. MACK:

8 Yes.

9

10 MS. JONES:

11 Charles Loveday?

12

13 MR. LOVEDAY:

14 Yes.

15

16 MS. JONES:

17 Norma Ramos?

18

19 MS. RAMOS:

20 Strongly support the resolution.

21

22 MS. JONES:

23 Brenda Faust?

24

1 MS. FAUST:

2 Yes.

3

4 MS. JONES:

5 The motions passes, 17 to 1 to zero.

6 Thank you.

7

8 (Time noted 11:35 p.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JUDEEN M. DENNISTON, a reporter and Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the within transcript is a true and accurate record of the statement taken by me.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

JUDEEN M. DENNISTON