



Preservation Committee Meeting Minutes
Lenore Norman and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons
Transportation Committee
Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons
July 9, 2012

Nick Pettinati, Project Manager - Urban Design, for DOT & Maurice Bruet, of the Manhattan Borough Commissioner's Office - along with Barbara Adler, of the Columbus Avenue B.I.D. - gave a presentation on the proposed re-design of the west side of Columbus Avenue, between West 76th & West 77th Street. There will be plantings along both the fence of the M.S. 44 schoolyard, and the curb. The width of the sidewalk is currently 20 feet, where there are no tree pits. The proposed width of the sidewalk will vary from close to 20 feet to the narrowest point, at 9.3 feet wide. This will still leave the appropriate 9 feet of passage, the minimum CB7 advocates for passage, and the width of most sidewalks with enclosed cafes. The B.I.D. will pay for the upkeep of all plantings. A bioswale may be installed, which will preserve rainwater, and reduce the amount of water deposited in the catch basins. The cost of the Bioswale is estimated to be anywhere from \$15,000 to \$18,000. The B.I.D. may have to pay for it, although there's a chance that D.E.P. may use it as a demonstration project, as it will be the first one in Manhattan. A Bioswale may have to be rebuilt every 8 years, or so. In the proposed streetscape design, smart benches may also be installed. There will be 2 or 3 places in the block where the 9.3 foot width will exist.

Resolution: CB7 approves the Columbus Avenue B.I.D.'s streetscape design - phase one - for the west side of Columbus Avenue, between West 76th & West 77th Streets, and finds that it is not inappropriate to the landmark district.

Committee vote joined with Transportation: 10-0-0-0.

Non-Committee Board Members: 4-0-0-1.

Preservation Present: Gabrielle Palitz, Lee P. Kwan and Blanche E Lawton. **Transportation Present:** Andrew Albert, Dan Zweig, Ken Coughlin, Mark Darin, Marc Glazer, Ulma Jones, Lee Ping Kwan, Blanche Lawton and Roberta Semer. **Chair:** Mark Diller. **Board Member:** Linda Alexander.



**Transportation Committee Meeting Minutes
Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons
Joint with Youth, Education & Libraries Committee
Marisa Maack, Chairperson**

1. Department of Design and Construction school safety project at MS54, Ascension School, and Collegiate School.

It was discussed that although this proposal was not near perfect, it would provide additional safety not only for the school children but for all residents wherever the safety measures were implemented.

DOT had replied that in measures taken for the routes to the three schools, the curb extensions in 12 intersections would result in 18 parking spaces being lost. (In particular, 4 spaces at 80th St and Broadway).

The committees asked that CB7 take action to find out how to get more input earlier in the process of design for future safety solutions for this district.

A resolution to approve the project was presented and voted upon as follows:

Transportation Present: Andrew Albert, Dan Zweig, Ken Coughlin, Mark Darin, Marc Glazer, Ulma Jones, Lee Ping Kwan, Blanche Lawton and Roberta Semer. **Youth Education & Libraries Present:** Marisa Maack, DeNora Getachew, Stephen Vazquez and Cara Volpe.



Business & Consumer Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
Michelle Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons
July 11, 2012

Alteration application to Active SLA license #1256471:

1. **2170 - 2178 Broadway** (West 77th Street), NY 2178 Broadway Operating LLC & Highgate Hotels LP, d/b/a On The Ave Hotel, to include a newly constructed lobby bar.
Presenting: Eugenia Simons, GM, esimons@ontheave-nyc.com; Quincui Nixon, Project Architect, Stonehill & Taylor; Donald Bernstein, Attorney.
George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero reported that he visited the site, confirmed block's mixed-zoning. Attorney said the hotel has no in-house bar because previously approved terrace bar has not been implemented. Hotel would like to put in a lobby bar to accommodate the guests. Mark Diller wanted to know whether the new seating allocation would send guests waiting to check in into the sidewalk. GM said that there would be ample space, which was reiterated by the architect. Ulma Jones asked for clarification of the meaning of alteration, which was explained as referring specifically to the installation of the lobby bar. Committee **approves** the alteration as required for presentation to SLA, any issues relating to F.A.R. are not applicable. 6-0-0-0; 2-0-0-0

Applications to the SLA for two-year liquor licenses:

2. **127 West 72nd Street** (Columbus Avenue) Summer Sunshine Corporation, d/b/a To Be Determined. **APPLICATION WITHDRAWN.**

3. **2170-2178 Broadway** (77th Street) RF Broadway LLC, d/b/a RedFarm, includes sidewalk café.
Presenting: Alan Gardner, attorney; and Ed Schoenfeld, operating partner (ed@redfarmnyc.com).
Attorney and owner said they were not allowed to post near restaurant but submitted list of postings to committee, which included every residential lobby in the area. George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero pointed out that the owner of the building did not know that the license was being transferred. Mr. Schoenfeld spoke passionately about his standing in the community. Committee **approves** application subject to providing lease or operating agreement: 5-1-0-0; 2-0-0-0

New Unenclosed Café Application:

4. **483 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street.) New application DCA# 1432318 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Ephesus NYC Corp., d/b/a Bellini Restaurant, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 3 tables and 6 seats.

Presenting: Virgo Lee vlee365@yahoo.com, attorney and Operating partner, Yasin Varol.

Marc Glazer reported that they posted in the window and surrounding area. George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero suggested they convert the A-frames into a flush frame. MG said the current barrier conforms to board requirements.

Committee **approves** application: 5-1-0-0; 2-0-0-0

5. **2427 Broadway** (West 89th – 90th Street.) New application DCA# 1423581 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Candle West, LLC, d/b/a Candle Café West, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 15 tables and 32 seats. **APPLICATION WITHDRAWN.**

NEW BUSINESS

250 West 87th Street, New York, NY 10024
Phone: (212) 362-4008 Fax:(212) 595-9317
Web site: nyc.gov/mcb7 e-mail address: office@cb7.org



Discussion lead by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero of the launch of a new Business-to-Business initiative (B2B) on October 10, which would include a networking event between District business owners and service providers, e.g., banks, restaurants, Telecommunications companies, real estate agents, attorneys and contractors.

Discussion lead by Marc Glazer regarding an initiative to remove derelict news boxes. It will be a joint effort between BCI and Transportation Committees.

Paul Fisher expressed a need for commercial rent control and would like to follow it up at full board.

Present: George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Linda Alexander, Elizabeth Caputo, Paul Fisher, Marc Glazer, Joanne Imohiosen and Ulma Jones. **CB7 Chair** Mark Diller. **Board Member:** Ian Alterman. **Absent:** Michelle Parker, Anne Raphael, Suzanne Robotti and Eric Shuffler.



Preservation Committee Meeting Minutes
Lenore Norman and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons
July 12, 2012

1. **49 West 72nd Street** (Columbus Avenue.)

Presenter: John-Malek Ellis, Architect, 5 Stuyvesant Oval #4H, NY, NY 10009

Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for restoration of a canopy on a residential apartment building. It is one of only three buildings on the block without a canopy. Mr. Ellis presented context photos of other canopies in the neighborhood along with drawings of one canopy design option that is preferred by the LPC.

The building is neo-Gothic, with a pointed arch above the entryway containing a coat of arms cast in stone. There are two lanterns flanking the arch, and next to the lanterns are two pin brackets that are left over from an older canopy, now gone.

The proposed canopy sits within the arched recess and follows the shape of the pointed arch to extend 18' out into the 20' deep sidewalk. The street end of the canopy will be horse-shoe shaped to allow partial views of the coat of arms from across the street. The fabric is forest green, with white lettering on the sides, white numbers on the end; the poles have a brass finish. The canopy does not obstruct the lanterns or the coat of arms, and attaches to the building using the existing brackets.

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7/ Manhattan believes that the design of the new canopy is reasonably appropriate to the historic character of the building and of the Historic District.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/ Manhattan **approves** the new canopy. 4-0-0-0.

2. **136 West 73rd Street** (Columbus – Amsterdam Avenue.)

Presenter: Richard Allon, Architect, 246 W. 80th St, NY, NY 10024

Application # 13-1337 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a reconfigured rear-yard addition and façade restoration. Mr. Allon presented photos and drawings of his proposal. On the front, the windows will be replaced with more historically appropriate 1-over-1 windows, the modern metal stoop railing will be replaced with a more historically accurate design, the brownstone will be patched as needed, and the cornice and stoop railing will be painted black to match the adjacent buildings. A new stair bulkhead with skylight and garden terrace will be added on the roof, not visible from the street.

On the rear, the existing L-shaped bustle will be demolished and replaced with a three-story extension running the full width of the building and set 30' back from the property line. The remaining two stories will have their windows replaced with new aluminum-clad wood windows, with one window expanding down to accommodate a door to the extension's roof terrace. The extension will be red brick to match the original rear facade with large windows that are nearly full-width, framed in brick.

Decorative details from the existing rear façade that will be "re-created" on the new extension include: the brick dentil course underneath the eave of the bustle, and stone corbels to support the ends of the windows. Even though the old windows are narrow and framed in stone, and the new windows are much wider and framed in brick, the Mr. Allon felt that these details would appease the LPC.

The building was previously an SRO and is now empty.

**Questions and comments:**

- It was pointed out that the proposed brick corbel details supporting the new rear windows are awkward, and that the window surrounds should either follow a clean modern vocabulary or a more historically appropriate one instead of mixing the two as currently exists.
- Michael Barrett, 138 W. 73rd St #1, had questions about a wood structure on the roof that appeared and disappeared. Mr. Allon explained that it was a mock-up constructed so that LPC could verify that the new bulkhead would not be visible from the street.
- Jeff Eichenfield, 138 W. 73rd St #3, wrote a letter asking about the large amount of dust released during demolition that entered his apartment. He appeared in person asking how to get the client representative to follow through with promises of paying the cleaning bill, and it was recommended that he contact the CB7 District Manager. Mr. Allon explained that demolition will often loosen dust in exposed brick walls, and offered to help Mr. Eichenfeld put up protective sheeting. Mr. Barrow confirmed that he also had significant dust penetration in his apartment although he does not have exposed brick walls.
- The husband of the owner, Alan Lipkin, 58 W. 83rd St #4A, spoke and rebutted some of the claims raised by the neighbors, e.g. pointing out that they had only offered to clean Mr. Eichenfield's apartment, not pay for a professional cleaner. He and Mr. Allon promised to communicate better with the neighbors moving forward.

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7/ Manhattan believes that, because the “re-created” corbels and dentil molding seem tacked on to the new addition, the design of the reconfigured rear yard addition is only minimally appropriate to the historic character of the building and of the Historic District.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/ Manhattan **approves** the reconfigured rear yard addition and façade restoration. *3-1-0-0.*

3. **135 Central Park West** (West 73rd – 74th Street.)

Presenter: Peter Mullen, Architect, 165 Lexington Ave, NY, NY 10016.

Application # 13-1777 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for the installation of “bluestone” steps from the sidewalk to a new bluestone landing, cast iron railing returns, doors to the professional spaces, and gates in the areaway.

Mr. Mullen presented historic photos of the building's front stairs as well as current photos of the two side entries, which look like modern renovations and are out of character with the rest of the ground floor. He proposes that the side entries' current diamond-plate metal stairs be replaced with stone stairs to match the front entry, that the mismatching metal railings and gates be replaced with cast-iron to match the existing historic railing, and that the doors be replaced with new wood-and-glass doors to match the front entry.

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7/ Manhattan believes that the design of the renovated side entries is reasonably appropriate to the historic character of the building and of the Historic District.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/ Manhattan **approves** the steps, landings, railing returns, gates and doors. *4-0-0-0.*



4. **41 West 75th Street** (Columbus Avenue – Central Park West.)

Presenter: Mary Dierickx, Preservation Consultant, 125 Cedar St Suite 11S, NY, NY 10006.

Application # 12-4384 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for enlargement of rear windows, addition of balconies, new rear parapet fence and piers, and basement excavation.

Ms. Dierickx, speaking on behalf of the architect who was out of town, presented photos of existing conditions and proposed designs for: the restoration of the front façade, where existing through-wall A/C units will be removed and the brownstone patched, all the windows will be replaced with more historically appropriate 1-over-1 wood windows painted black, and the stoop and front door will be rebuilt; the new rooftop extension (not visible from the street) housing an elevator overrun and a stair bulkhead, which will require raising the flue of the neighboring building; the excavated cellar which will be deepened to allow for a more habitable space as well as an elevator pit; the excavation of 4' of the adjacent garden to expand the cellar and allow for a skylight; and renovation of the rear façade.

On the rear façade, the existing window openings will be enlarged, in one case causing the removal of a stone corbel detail. The windows will be replaced with new aluminum-clad wood windows and French doors. New balconies will project out from the top three floors, cantilevering from 4'-4" to 6'-3", with simple black metal railings modeled on the existing rear railings. The blank west façade of the existing rear extension will have new windows punched into it whose frames will use stone surrounds and brick corbels modeled on the existing "bay" windows. A new copper-clad parapet wall will be built at the top of the rear façade, its height aligning with the existing masonry parapet side walls.

The building currently consists of eight occupied, rent-stabilized apartments. It will be converted to a two-family home, where two siblings each get their own multi-level apartment with their own vertical circulation and kitchen facilities (with one shared elevator).

Questions and comments:

- It was pointed out that the section drawings for two of the proposed rear balconies did not look structurally sound, as they did not all follow a 1:8 cantilever ratio, and it was unclear how they attached to the building. Of particular concern was the proposed 6'-3" deep fifth-floor balcony.
- It was advised that the neighbors be contacted before commencement of any cellar excavation, which will be up to 8' deep in places.
- Margaret Hetley, 165 West End Ave, asked if the existing residents will be vacated before commencement of demolition and construction. Ms. Dierickx did not know the answer.
- Mary Anne Corrier, 107 W. 86th St, who formerly lived next door to the site, asked if there would be proper site supervision and construction management. Ms. Dierickx assured her there would be.

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7/ Manhattan believes that the design of the new and rear facade windows, new balconies, new rear parapet fence and piers, and basement excavation are reasonably appropriate to the historic character of the building and of the Historic District, but that the projecting balconies require more detailed structural analysis.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/ Manhattan **approves** the enlarged windows, new windows, new balconies with further structural analysis, new rear parapet fence and piers, and basement excavation. 3-1-0-0.



5. **101 West 87th Street** (Columbus Avenue.)

Presenter: Steven Mark, Lawyer with Amato Law Group PLLC, 666 Old Country Road Suite 901, Garden City, NY 11530.

Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to modify an existing wireless communication facility located on the rooftop. Mr. Amato presented on behalf of Verizon, who has stationed broadcasting equipment on the building since 1992. The building owner is currently adding two stories and a penthouse level, and has asked Verizon to conceal their equipment from view so that it will not adversely affect the sales price of the penthouse units. The equipment (16 antennae) are currently surface-mounted on the penthouse bulkhead.

LPC and CB7 have previously approved the building expansion and rooftop enclosure, however that process intentionally did not take into account Verizon's requirements. Verizon is now proposing that the rooftop structure be extended upward by 6' to accommodate their equipment. The extension will be clad in grey fabric to conceal the relocated antennae while allowing for radio transmission, and the grey will match the metal bulkhead below. The cables connecting the antennae to Verizon's basement equipment will be relocated from the exterior building surface to an interior chase.

Questions and comments:

- Barbara Parks, 100 W. 88th St, raised the issue of the prolonged stop-start construction, which has blocked her views with a fire-retardant shroud and generated considerable noise, dust, and gas fumes. It was suggested that she contact the CB7 District Manager.

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7/ Manhattan believes that the design of the relocated communication equipment enclosure is reasonably appropriate to the historic character of the building and of the Historic District.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/ Manhattan **approves** the modification of the existing rooftop communication facility. 4-0-0-0.

Present: Gabrielle Palitz, Brian Byrd, Lee Ping Kwan and Blanche E. Lawton. **Absent:** Miki Fiegel, Jay Adolf, Lenore Norman (on leave)



**Transportation Committee Meeting Minutes
Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons
July 17, 2012**

Co-Chairs Andrew Albert & Dan Zweig called the meeting to order at 7:05 P.M.

West End Avenue Loading Zones

Stacy Hodge, of DOT, presented DOT's assessment of the three "pilot" truck loading zones on West End Avenue. The pilot focussed on FedEx, UPS, and Time Warner trucks. Ms. Hodge stated that, in DOT's estimation, many others were utilizing the loading zones, causing even more double-parking, with many staying for hours at a time. She stated that DOT does not believe the pilot merits continuation. DOT will remove the signage within two weeks or so. Ms. Hodge stated that videos were taken of the three loading zones, showing a misuse of the zones. A resolution to end the pilot program, while urging DOT to continue to explore a way of reducing double-parking of trucks on West End Avenue.

Vote: Comm: 8-1-0-0
NCB : 1-0-0-0

25 West 88th Street

For the second time, the applicant was a no-show.

Newsstand - Amsterdam Avenue & 59th Street

Michael Joseph & Shish Rondn appeared before the committee. Hours of operation of the newsstand would be 8AM to 7PM. A resolution to approve the newsstand was offered. Member Mark Darin objected to the size of the newsstand, mentioning that in essence, newsstands have become "convenience stores", selling cigarettes, soda, candy, and other items. An amendment to make the newsstand 4 feet deep was offered. It was defeated, so a resolution to approve the stand as submitted was passed.

Vote: Comm: 8-1-0-0
NCB : 1-0-1-0

Newsstand - SE corner - 79th & Broadway

Ianto Roberts and Talat Mahmoud appeared before the committee. An employee representing the owner of the news store around the corner on Broadway (2 stores away from the proposed newsstand) spoke about the high rents they paid, and why was the Board considering a stand so close to his store? Co-Chair Albert stated that he wished the applicants had submitted their request to the Committee prior to going to Consumer Affairs, as they would have been told this location would likely not be approved. Co-Chair Albert offered a resolution to disapprove the proposed newsstand without prejudice, and suggested the applicant find two or three locations that would work for them, and let the Board office know prior to submitting them to Consumer Affairs. Mr. Albert said each location would be vetted and the applicant would lose no time, as the committee did not meet in August. The resolution to disapprove without prejudice was passed by the committee. Vote: Committee : 7-1-0-0 NCB: 1-0-1-0

Police Accident Statistics Report

250 West 87th Street, New York, NY 10024
Phone: (212) 362-4008 Fax:(212) 595-9317
Web site: nyc.gov/mcb7 e-mail address: office@cb7.org



A discussion of police accident statistics from the 20th & 24th precincts took place. The statistics were for the month of May, 2012. The purpose in requesting the statistics was to assess whether any particular intersection(s) could be pointed to as problem places and where specific solutions might be suggested in the interest of public safety. The statistics, while giving the type of accident (i.e. car/pedestrian, bicycle/pedestrian, bicycle/car, etc) do not give whether the accident resulted in a visit to the hospital, how many injured, etc. The Committee will try to get more detailed data.

District Needs Statement

The co-chairs will review the DNS in order to bring it up to date. The following will be added:

1. 20mph speed limit around schools
2. Speed cameras throughout the district
3. Countdown pedestrian timers at every intersection
4. More "stop here on red" signs for the Broadway Malls

New Business

Bob Weingarten brought the issue of the pedestrian time available at 79th & Amsterdam to the committee's attention. Mr. Weingarten said there was only 7 seconds available for pedestrians to cross 79th Street, as the advance left turn for northbound Amsterdam traffic stops pedestrians from crossing. It was suggested that perhaps pedestrian crossings should be first, followed by vehicular traffic. Additionally, it was suggested that after the advance left turn was done, there should be a red left-turn arrow, indicating that this movement was no longer permitted. The committee will study the intersection to see how it can be made more pedestrian-friendly. Mr. Weingarten also mentioned he felt the Columbus Avenue bike lane was dangerous at night - most bikes do not have lights, and while walking his dog, the dog often walks ahead of him, and has almost been hit by bikes not observing the traffic laws.

Dave Zelman brought the issue of West 73rd Street being re-surfaced between the hours of 6PM and 5AM. Mr. Zelman felt these were the wrong hours to do this work, as it disturbs residents sleeping. He also felt that the City may have to pay workers more by having this work done at night Mr. Zelman felt this work should be done during the day.

Ian Alterman suggested that new business be interspersed with the regular business of the committee, so members of the public would not have to wait so long to introduce their items.

It was suggested that the Committee invite someone from DOT to speak about the milling that is going on at 79th & Amsterdam, and 86th & Columbus.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 9:15 PM.

Present: Andrew Albert,

Dan Zweig, Ken Coughlin, Mark Darin, Mark Glazer, Ulma Jones, Lee Ping Kwan, Blanche Lawton, Anne Raphael and Roberta Semer. **CB7 Chair** Mark Diller. **Board Member:** Ian Alterman. **Absent:** Lillian Moore and Suzanne Robotti.



Youth, Education & Libraries Committee Meeting Minutes
Marisa Maack, Chairperson
July 19, 2012

Presentation and discussion of Central Library Plan with New York Public Library President Tony Marx.

CLP addresses three problems:

The deterioration of the Mid Manhattan Library - the largest circulating library in the country is in terrible shape and needs a complete overhaul

Long term conservation problem of research collection - Current stacks that house research books in Main 42nd st branch have been there for 100 yrs and are no longer state of the art for maintaining the integrity of the collection. There is a state of the art facility offsite in NJ where a part of the collection is already housed

Budget shortfalls – NYC provides funding for branch libraries but only 20% of funding for research section of libraries. Research funding comes from annual giving and endowments. Over the last 10 yrs, divisions have closed, staff cut and the libraries can't keep up.

The Plan itself consists of selling the Mid Manhattan Library Building and the Science Library building, and consolidating those collections fully into the 42nd st main branch creating a central circulating library. A renovation of the main branch will remove the current Stacks and move the 4 million research books to storage under Bryant Park and NJ. This will open enough space to create more research and program rooms for public use along with the circulating library. The Mid Manhattan Library will not be closed before the 42nd st renovation is complete so there will be continuous access to that collection. That is a major priority of the NYPL and will be negotiated into the sale of that building.

Cost will be approx \$350million and estimated that \$15million will be saved annually through consolidating the operating costs. Funding will come from the sale of two library buildings and private donations. City Council has pledged \$150 mill towards project.

The Plan will not affect the 3rd floor (Rose Reading room and Special Collections) or the Main floor. It will renovate and open the 2nd fl to the public (now mostly closed). The library will stay open until 11pm most evenings.

Committee Q&A:

Q. Re: public awareness of CLP.

A. Plan has been in the works for several years but was shelved in 2008. It has begun moving forward the last 1 ½ years. There have been several public meetings - NYU, City Council hearing, CB 5. Will hold more forums and attend more community meetings to spread the word and hear from the public.

Q. Re: moving Stacks to NJ.

A. 4m books and 1m other research items onsite. 4m books already housed offsite in NJ for last 50 yrs, a site shared with Princeton and Columbia. Expert librarians have been working for the last 6 months on what and how many more books should be moved offsite. Serious consideration being given to keeping more books than originally planned in Bryant Park storage. President Marx must take to Board of Trustees. This additional space has to be retrofitted which will cost more money. Just 1 out of 4m has been digitized so far. Committed to a 24hr turnaround process for book requests. Will add more trucks, deliveries and staff. Would like to develop system for requesting books online in advance, which would be an upgrade of current service.

**Q. Re: 2nd floor space**

A. A number of proposals being considered for public use of 2nd fl space. It has not been finalized.

Q. Re: provisions for transient population that use library

A. Library open to all members of public and no plans to restrict the library in any way even though it may be distracting for some users.

Q. Re: sale of Donnell branch as model

A. Donnell sale grossed approx \$50m and will spend \$20m to re-outfit. Will net \$30m, and will get Donnell branch back. Renovating Mid Manhattan would cost too much, \$150-190m, and does not solve the other problems of funding or deterioration of the main branch.

Q. Re: 15m projected savings

A. \$150m in capital budget from City Council and Mayor's budget; estimating \$200m from building sales; will raise \$100m privately. The consolidation of three buildings into one will save \$8m in annual operating costs just from staff attrition and the rest will come from general up keep savings. Cannot say how much will go specifically for what operating costs. Research libraries need more support as do individual branches. Separately would like to raise \$100m for branch programming. CC is a large supporter of the library and has given \$300m in capital contributions over the last 10 yrs. CM Brewer has led the way this year with a \$2m capital contribution for the Library of the Performing Arts.

Center for Urban Future is putting together an Economic Impact Study of libraries citywide. Libraries have been hit hard over the last years and have less programming are open less hours and have lost 500 employees.

Comments to see more \$ spent of local branches before 42nd st, Marx publicly committed to raising and spending saved dollars on both the individual braches and the main branch library.

Q. Re: concern on need to increasingly rely on private money for a gov't responsibility and one-time sale of buildings may undercut future financial stability

A. City does pay 90% of branch operations and the money from CC budget is reliant on the CLP with sale of those buildings as part of that plan.

CM Gale Brewer:

Re: Overcrowding at entrances

A. Agreed that another entrance is needed besides the one between the lions and the side entrance on 42nd st. Have asked architect for that design without impacting exterior of the building (perhaps creating a door from an existing window, for ex.). Inside, an enormous amount of sq footage will be made available for use through this plan.

Re: Coffee shop – would not like to see a coffee shop inside library

A. No decision on coffee shop although is one of the most requested items. If included it would be off to the side

Re: Architect – Lincoln Sq was so successful because of avant garde design. Please consider lots of outside opinion before finalizing design

A. Architect was chosen before Marx was with the library and chosen through a process.

**Public comment**

Jennifer Lee: stack demolition – major cost concern and inefficient way to re-house stacks

A. Plan requires demo of stacks and rebuild structure in their place to maintain structural integrity of building. It may not be cost effective but the alternative would mean deterioration and possibly unsafe conditions.

Re: SIBL (science Library) - sell and use that money to renovate MM

A. Not cost effective and does not solve our other problems.

Ralph Brown: Having 2mill more users at 42nd st is scary and doesn't like design. Don't trust math of CLP, would like to see more financial transparency. Would like to see an independent board of scholars set up to work with NYPL. We don't know who is on current Scholars Advisory Committee, can we get list of names?

A. Would have to ask them if OK to give out their names

James Besser: suggestion of Chamber music in one of 2nd fl rooms, what was Marx' understanding was of the scholars' objection to the CLP and why is there no longer at librarian in 3rd fl of performing arts library. Also should consolidate the three separate systems of Queens, Manhattan and Brooklyn into one to save money

A. Will consider music but it is a library and must be respectful of sound issues. Fundamental public concern of CLP seems to be moving of books offsite and can address that by amending plan. Also concern around process and having a circulating library at main branch. The CLP will address the loss of librarian at Performing Arts building. It is a priority to make sure that there are great research librarians available for all our research collections. The 3 systems of the NYPL are working more closely and the goal is to create greater alignment between the three. I don't have control over changing the system.

Jacob Morris: Economic Impact Study will not address CLP. Would like to see one that addresses CLP specifically and it is very important to have such a study before proceeding.

A tour of the main branch will be set up for committee members.

Adjourned 8:30pm

Present: Marisa Maack, Isaac Booker, Brian Byrd, Paul Fisher and Cara Volpe. **CB7 Chair** Mark Diller. **Board Members:** Mark Darin, Robert Espier and Lee Ping Kwan. **Absent:** DeNora Getachew, Haydee Rosario, Helen Rosenthal, Eric Shuffler and Stephen Vazquez.