



BURT LAZARIN
Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
BOARD No. 4
330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor
New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536
fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

| | |
|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Meeting Date | November 6, 2019 |
| Meeting Time | 6:30 PM |
| Meeting Location | Mount Sinai West 1000 Tenth Avenue 2nd Floor Conference Room B |

November 2019 Full Board Meeting Minutes

PRESENTATIONS / PUBLIC HEARINGS

Presentation:

Manhattan Community Board 4 Statement of District Needs and Budget Priorities for Fiscal Year 2021

Second Vice Chair Jeffrey LeFrancois, Chair of the Budget Task Force, offered a summary of his presentation before proceeding to discuss the following:

- An overview of the Budget Task Force functions and responsibility
- Fiscal Year 2020 successes
- Statement of District Needs
- Requests for Fiscal Year 2021
- Next steps

The work product of the Budget Task Force is contained in the Statement that is the subject of Agenda Item 31. It must be passed by a vote of the Board before being sent to the Department of City Planning.

Public Hearing:

The following people spoke during the public hearing:

- Christina Perry, the Director of Outreach for Chain Theatre on West 36th Street, wants an exemption from paying property taxes on its building that houses six nonprofit theatres. She is requesting funds to hire a government expert to explore the means for pursuing the exemption.
- Ginny Louloudes, Executive Director of the Alliance of Public Theatres, explained the reasons for the Chain Theatre tax exemption and the justifications for it.
- Porter Pickard of the York Theatre Company that is housed in the Chain Theatre building noted the benefits that his organization would gain from a tax exemption.
- Meghan Finn, the Artistic Director of The Tank, located on the first floor of the West 36th Street building, described her work with emerging artists whose works are performed at the venue and the opportunities that free space affords them. A tax exemption makes continued free space possible.
- Randi Berry, the Executive Director of Indie Space, is an advisor on the Chain Theatre project, and, also has its own budget request included in CB4's package. Her organization offers free advisory and consulting services to artists facing a real estate challenge, transition or opportunity.

Mr. LeFrancois thanked the speakers and indicated that their concerns should be brought before the Arts, Culture, Education & Street Life Committee so that they can be taken up by the Board for inclusion in next year's budget considerations. Other members added that it might be more appropriate to address the tax exemption outside of the budget process.

Public Session

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Joli Golden | Ms. Golden of the U.S. Census Bureau noted that the 2020 Census was going to begin in a mere 144 days with the database opening on March 12th followed by Census Day on April 1st. She stressed that the Census Bureau was continuing to recruit in Lower Manhattan because there were only 2,700 current applicants for that area and 7,000 more are needed. And because recruitment is done locally, she asked CB4 to increase its help by distributing cards and flyers in the neighborhoods in the district. |
| Dan Sheldon | Mr. Sheldon represents the tenants of 150 West 26th Street in its efforts to prevent the issuance of a liquor license to the applicant in Agenda Item 8. Their primary objection is that there are already 12 licensed establishments within 500 feet of the premises, 8 of which are on their block. The bar would be located on the ground floor of a 25-unit residential building where 24 units have signed a petition against the proposed license. The block is saturated with bars and restaurants, one of which has been a constant source of trouble. |
| Jennifer Mallicote | Ms. Mallicote is a frequent speaker at CB4 meetings where she tells of incidents in her neighborhood along the stretch of Eighth Avenue between 21st and 22nd Streets. This time she mentioned three violent incidents involving a slashing, shooting, and a robbery, along with a mysterious case of a person who was found dead on the street. She has worked with the NYPD but still sees conditions worsening. |
| Marni Halasa | Ms. Halasa is a member of the advocacy group Fight for NYCHA that has been working city-wide with residents to oppose RAD being adopted in NYCHA developments. She complained of being shut out of a meeting of the Mayor's working group, even though she had been promised a role earlier in the Summer by Borough President Brewer. She said other interest groups and stakeholders were shut out as well. She went on to state her belief that the working group is a sham and that it has violated the state Open Meetings Law. Her group has filed a complaint with the U.S. Attorney's Office. |
| Curley Santos | Ms. Santos is a community leader from the Elliott Chelsea Houses who also complained of being shut out of the Mayor's NYCHA working group. She asserted the claim that the meeting was a public meeting subject to the Open Meetings Law and that, as a member of the public who lives in public housing, she had a right to attend the meeting. |
| Doris Bachman | Ms. Bachman lives at West 46th Street and 10th Avenue. She complained about large amounts of litter on the sidewalks in her area and thinks the solution would be to install three trash cans for garbage, recycling, and food and compost. She also wants people to use different color bags to separate cans and bottles for the people who collect them privately for redemption. Ms. Bachman also complained about the shortage of M11 buses on Tenth Avenue. |
| Sean Reilly | Mr. Reilly is a researcher for the Service Workers International Union Local 32 BJ. The union represents janitors, security workers, airport workers, apartment workers, and others. There are 85,000 members in New York City – one in every 100 adult workers – with 3,300 members who either live or work in MCB4. Over the past year, the union has been collaborating with Chipotle workers to better their working conditions. Mr. Reilly came to the meeting to raise issues relating to practices in five Chipotle liquor license holders in MCB4. He claims that the company violates fair scheduling and minimum wage laws and, |

| | |
|---------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | more importantly, requires underage workers to mix and serve alcoholic beverages. He wants CB4 to oppose the renewal of Chipotle’s liquor licenses because of this. |
| Lisa Wager | <p>Ms. Wager is the director of the Office of Government Relations at the Fashion Institute of Technology. She made the following announcements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>ChalkFIT</i> was first organized in 2013 by Professor of Illustration Dan Shefelman. As part of their curriculum, Illustration students create a temporary mural on FIT’s façade. This year, the mural has doubled in size to 82 panels and stretches along Seventh Avenue from 26th to 28th Street. This year, the theme is FIT’s 75th anniversary and are of iconic moments in FIT’s history and going forward. Eighty-four students used non-toxic, water-soluble chalk mixed with water to create bold, colorful murals. Blick Art Materials donated \$1,000 worth of supplies for the project. The murals will be on the facades for several months. • Yoko Katagi, assistant professor of Social Sciences and a breast cancer survivor, is working with Sidney Nobleza – who graduated last year with a bachelor’s degree in Technical Design – to manufacture and market a garment for post-op mastectomy patients to be worn both in the hospital and after they’ve been released. |
| Alex Wolaver | Mr. Wolaver represents the 350 West 51st Street Tenants Association in its efforts to combat the problems in the neighborhood caused by the residents of Stardom Hall, a supportive housing facility run by the Lantern Organization at 330 West 51st Street. He believes the facility poses a danger to the community because of numerous instances of violence against outsiders and staff and the inability of staff members to curtail such violence. He recited numerous instances of criminal activity over the past two years that have left members of the community in a state of fear. And while his Association is in favor of providing assistance to people like the residents of Stardom Hall, he believes that Lantern does not fulfill its duty to provide mental health support and supervision of its residents. He listed the many changes that he wants Lantern to make in its operation. |
| Julia Knight | Ms. Knight is the director of Poster House, located at 119 West 23rd Street, that opened in June. It is a museum dedicated solely to posters from all over the world. The museum will be offering more free events, including one on November 11th for military veterans. It is also working to provide at least one free community day for each exhibition cycle. The next one is on Saturday, November 23rd. |

| Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Assemblymember Dick Gottfried | <p>The Assemblymember made the following comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • He spoke about the Chelsea NYCHA Working Group – what gave rise to its creation and the most recent meetings that have been held to deal with the proposal to fund the NYCHA complexes in the district and the use of private management. He was happy to note that the Mayor has agreed to halt any action on his proposal that would lead to the demolition of buildings at the Fulton Houses. He stated that the Working Group would be holding public meetings to gather community input and that there should be some conclusions by the end of the year. • He mentioned the fact that, for the first time since the 1930s, New York now has a Democratic Legislature and Governor. This has led to the passage of a great deal of legislation, including environmental legislation. The environmental advocacy group known as Environmental Advocates keeps a score rating for members of the legislature in New York. Mr. Gottfried and some of his colleagues were given a |

| | |
|------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | score of 100 by the group, with the Assemblymember being labeled an “Environmental Champion.” |
| Brian Lewis for Borough President Gale Brewer | <p>Mr. Lewis provided the following updates and announcements on behalf of the Manhattan Borough President:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The BP has been active in the Chelsea NYCHA Working Group, having attended its two most recent meetings. She looks forward to a thorough investigation of all possible options to meet the needs of Chelsea’s NYCHA complexes. In response to an earlier statement by a member of Fight for NYCHA, Mr. Lewis confirmed that Ms. Brewer had indeed recently appointed a resident of Fulton Houses who is a member of that group to the Working Group and the speaker might not be aware of it. • The BP has also been active in the Chelsea Quality of Life/Public Safety Working Group and has been closely following the public meetings held by Speaker Johnson. She is aware of the concerns related to the LinkNYC kiosks on Eighth Avenue and looks forward to working on those concerns with Speaker Johnson’s office. • The BP is working with the Garment District Alliance to allocate \$2.5 million to programs that will support garment manufacturers in the district because she knows the importance of taking steps to ensure that garment manufacturers remain in the Garment District. • The Community Board application process will begin earlier this year than last with the BP’s website going live at the end of this week or next week. The application itself has been tweaked in a way to make it easier to complete. Members should check to see whether it is time to re-apply. • There have been recent concerns about community boards that have more than 25% of its members employed by the City. The BP will not remove anyone during their term if their board’s membership rises above the 25% limit. Instead, during appointment time, efforts will be made to reduce the City employee percentage below 25% by making necessary adjustments. • The BP has commissioned a comprehensive study of residential parking plans in seven cities worldwide. This was done in contemplation of congestion pricing to get an idea of what parking schemes work best. • The BP’s Budget unit is holding four informational workshops for Manhattan’s public schools and not-for-profits. One for public schools was for tonight and the other on the 13th from 4 – 6 pm. One for not-for-profits will be held on the 14th from 4 – 6 pm. All meetings are at 1 Centre Street. • The Religious Facilities Task Force is holding a public hearing to get community input on strategies that would support the longevity of religious congregations while upholding historic preservation and the economic and cultural vitality of neighborhoods. The hearing will take place at 1 Centre Street on Monday, November 25th from 6 – 8 pm. It will also be streamed live on the BP’s Facebook page. |
| Robert Atterbury for Congressman Jerry Nadler | <p>The Congressman joined with other local electeds to ban non-essential helicopter use in the City and made sure that the Hudson River was part of the legislation. The bill does not cover drones, as they are governed by separate statutes.</p> <p>He also joined Rep. Velazquez in a bill to appropriate \$70 billion in capital funding to public housing nationwide, \$32 billion of which would be designated for NYCHA. The large portion going to NYCHA reflects its massive size compared to other housing authorities in the nation.</p> <p>Last week the House approved specific procedures that would be used in the impeachment proceeding now underway in Washington. Those resolutions lay out what would be regarded regular order in the four separate committees now considering their own lists of</p> |

| | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | <p>articles of impeachment. They also set out the procedures to be used on the House floor after the final preparation of articles by the Judiciary Committee, if deemed called for by the Committee.</p> |
| <p>Maia Berlow for State Senator Brad Hoylman</p> | <p>The Senator recently introduced the Adult Survivors Act which opens a one-year window giving people over the age of eighteen the right to file a civil suit against their sexual abusers. This legislation would cover people like Harvey Weinstein and Jeffrey Epstein.</p> <p>In response to a request from Local 32 BJ, the Senator has written a letter to the SLA opposing the renewal of Chipotle’s liquor licenses because of their violations of worker’s rights.</p> <p>The Governor signed into law a bill that Mr. Hoylman co-sponsored with Assemblymember Glick that requires the SLA to create and maintain a public database of information related to on-premises liquor licenses.</p> |
| <p>Erica Overton for Assemblymember Linda B. Rosenthal</p> | <p>Ms. Rosenthal is hosting her annual mammogram event on Monday, November 25th from 1:30 – 4:00 pm. Those who are interested in having the procedure should call the office for an appointment.</p> <p>The Assemblymember has been working on e-cigarettes for over a decade and has recently introduced five new bills against e-cigs: the first one would place a moratorium on the sale of e-cigarettes until the F.D.A. has deemed them safe; another would prohibit the use of toxic metals and a disclosure of materials in the vaping product and the hardware used to smoke it.</p> <p>In response to a threat by the Trump Administration to cut SNAP benefits to recipients around the country, Ms. Rosenthal submitted testimony against such action. The proposed guidelines would limit income to \$16,000 per year and would affect about 230,000 people in New York.</p> |
| <p>Carl Wilson for Speaker Corey Johnson</p> | <p>The Council last week passed the Streets Master Plan to improve safety and street use by adding 50 miles of new bike lanes, 30 miles of bus lanes, more pedestrian plazas, and other design innovations.</p> <p>During the past month, the Speaker’s office was involved in several quality-of-life meetings dealing with drug issues, homelessness and public safety. He is focused now on finding legislative solutions to combat some of those problems, including altering the functionality of LinkNYC kiosks in the district.</p> <p>The TIL Program buildings at 201-207 Seventh Avenue are now vacant so the developer, Asian Americans for Equality, and HPD can begin environmental tests. A nine-month pre-demolition process is expected, with completion sometime in late 2020.</p> <p>A Medicare enrollment event will take place tomorrow at the Hudson Guild on West 26th Street from 1:00 – 2:00 pm.</p> |
| <p>Luke Wolf for Comptroller Scott Stringer</p> | <p>Mr. Wolf highlighted two reports that were recently released by the Comptroller:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Creative Economy Report provides an up-to-date look at the City’s creative economy. The creative sector, as defined in the Report, “ includes any industry the primary output of which is creative or cultural – from museums and art galleries, to film and television production, theater and dance companies, fashion, publishing, advertising, and more.” The creative sector employees 293,000 people and, in 2017 paid \$30 billion in total wages. The sector accounts for 13% of the City’s economic output with \$110 billion in economic activity that can be traced directly or indirectly to it. The Report can be downloaded at https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/the-creative-economy/ |

| | |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Retail Vacancy Report addresses concerns about retail that has grown since the time of the Great Recession of 2008-2009. Data from multiple sources used to create the report reveal that retail vacancy rates have risen by 50% over the past decade. In the Hell’s Kitchen/Clinton area the rate is 8.6% compared to 5.8% citywide. There are three major causes for this increase: 1) the rise of Amazon and internet shopping; 2) higher rents; and 3) City regulations that make it onerous to move into a newly vacant space. <p>The Report offers three recommendations to reduce the vacancy rate: 1) the City should provide tax incentives to businesses that move into high-vacancy areas; 2) there should be a more streamlined path for businesses seeking regulatory action that would include a single-point-of-contact customer service; and, 3) retail vacancy and the future of retail in a district should be much more ingrained in the city planning process so that the community is aware and can move forward over the coming years and decades to prevent temporary high vacancy rates from becoming permanent. The Report can be downloaded at https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/retail-vacancy-in-new-york-city/</p> |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

| Board Reports & Business | |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Adoption of Agenda and Minutes | The Agenda and October minutes were unanimously approved. |
| Nominating Committee | <p>Wendy Gonzalez, Chair of the Nominating Committee, announced that the following members were interviewed by the committee and are recommended for election:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lowell Kern – Chair 2. Jeffrey LeFrancois – 1st Vice Chair 3. Jessica Chait – 2nd Vice Chair 4. Michael Noble – Secretary 5. Maria Ortiz – Secretary <p>There were no further nominations during the meeting. Ms. Gonzalez stated that members would vote on the nominees at the general meeting of the Board in December.</p> |
| District Manager Report | <p>Highlights of events the District Manager or Staff attended on behalf of the board and upcoming events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CB4 co-sponsored its third 2020 Census Employment Event on October 23 • CB4 held its member 101/102 Land Use Training this past Monday and a good number of new members attended. • The District Manager attended the awards breakfast for the Manhattan Paper Challenge <p>November Committee Updates and Board Reminders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Arts, Culture, Education & Street Life Committee will not be meeting in the month of November • The Housing, Health and Human Services Committee will not be meeting in the month of November |

| | |
|---------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The entire 2020 Committee Schedule is up on the CB4 website. • The January full board meeting will be held on Thursday, January 2nd. |
| Board Chair Report | <p>The Chair announced that CB4 was awarded the Compassionate Communities Award by the Coalition for the Homeless which cited the Board’s work with the nonprofit Care for the Homeless in opening a new shelter for single women on 52nd Street.</p> <p>CB4 was also a winner in the Borough President’s Manhattan Paper Challenge last quarter, coming in third place among the Borough’s 12 community boards. This was a result of an increase in recycling participation over previous levels. CB4’s prize money of \$2,000 will go to the High School Environmental Studies and the Metro Baptist Church.</p> <p>The Fund for the City of New York granted funds to CB4 that made it possible to hire three new planning fellows for the coming year – 2 from Columbia and 1 from Pratt. They will be working with the Chelsea Land Use Committee, the Port Authority Working Group, and the Hell’s Kitchen South Coalition.</p> <p>Tina DiFelicianantonio and David Holowka spoke at the Landmarks Preservation Commission regarding the application for a certificate of appropriateness for 418 West 20th Street. Christine Berthet attended MTA Bus Coalition meetings on behalf of the Board and will attend future DOT hearings on the use of advertising on sight-seeing busses. Elzora Cleveland, one of the four members of the Chelsea NYCHA Working Group, attended a recent meeting of the group. Brian Weber, a public member of the Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee, is now representing the Board on the Garment Center Alliance. David Warren now represents the Board on the 34th Street Partnership. Brian and David both attended their group’s meetings last month.</p> |

| Action Items | Motions, Amendments, & Comments | Result |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (CHKLU) | | |
| Item 1: Letter to BSA re PCE Application for 555 10 th Avenue (40/41) – NFC Amenity Management | | Passed Unanimously |
| Transportation Planning Committee (TRANS) | | |
| Item 2: Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Improvements around Hudson Blvd and Bella Abzug Park | Items 2 – 7 were bundled | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 3: Letter to DOT re Staypineapple Hotel Request for Loading Zone – 337 W. 36 th Street (8/9) | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 4: Letter to DOT re Proposed Sight-Seeing Bus Permit Rule | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 5: Letter to DOITT re LINK Removals on 8 th Avenue (20-22) | | Passed Unanimously |

| | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Item 6: Letter to DOT re 29 th Street Safety Improvements | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 7: Letter to DOT re Construction Safety for Pedestrians | | Passed Unanimously |
| Business License and Permits Committee (BLP) | | |
| Item 8: Letter to SLA re 150 W 26th Street (6/7) – CKBA LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 9: Letter to SLA re 766 9th Avenue (51/52) – Pure Thai Restaurant | Items 9 – 25 were bundled | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 10: Letter to SLA re 364 W 46th Street (8/9) – Hold Fast | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 11: Letter to SLA re 360 W 46th Street (8/9) – E A K Ramen | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 12: Letter to SLA re 410 W 43rd Street (9/10) – Adella | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 13: Letter to SLA re 783 9th Avenue (52) – Ocean Foods NY Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 14: Letter to SLA re 826 9th Avenue (54/55) – Kubera Mulki Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 15: Letter to SLA re 235 9th Avenue (24/25) – Boilery Hospitality Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 16: Letter to SLA re 450 W 33rd Street (9/10) – Whole Foods Market Group Inc. & Jajaja Hudson Yards LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 17: Letter to SLA re 636 11th Avenue (46/47) – Guckenheimer Services LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 18: Letter to SLA re 735 9th Avenue (50) – SC LIC LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 19: Letter to SLA re 474 9th Avenue (36/37) – Camapa Ltd. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 20: Letter to SLA re 312 W 34th Street (8/9) – American Multi-Cinema Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 21: Letter to SLA re 59 Chelsea Piers Golf Lounge – Konkapot Entertainment Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 22: Letter to SLA re 435 W 31st Street, 1st Floor (9/10) – 435 W 31st Street A LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 23: Letter to SLA re 435 W 31st Street, 2nd & 3rd Floors (9/10) – 435 W 31st Street B LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 24: Letter to SLA re 651 9th Avenue (45/46) – Zac 45 Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 25: Letter to SLA re 200-202 7th Avenue (21/22) – Ivanka Catering LLC | | Passed Unanimously |

| Arts, Culture, Environment & Street Life Committee (ACES) | | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Item 26: Letter to SCA re School Renovation Project at High School for Fashion Industries - 225 West 24 Street (7/8) | | Passed Unanimously |
| Waterfront, Parks & Environment Committee (WPE) | | |
| Item 27: Letter to Electeds re Congressional Legislation for Non-Essential Helicopter Flights over NYC | Items 27, 28 and 30 were bundled | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 28: Letter to Electeds re West 30 th Street Heliport | | Passed Unanimously |
| Housing, Health and Human Services Committee (HHHS) | | |
| Item 29: Updates to MCB4 Affordable Housing Plan | | Passed Unanimously |
| Executive Committee (EXEC) | | |
| Item 30: Letter to Mayor de Blasio and NYPD re Relocation of Pier 76 Tow Pound | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 31: MCB4 Statement of District Needs and Budget Priorities for Fiscal Year 2021 | As amended to include language requesting the DCP to conduct a city-wide study to explore exempting cultural nonprofits from paying property taxes | Passed Unanimously |

| Meeting Resolution | |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Adjournment | 8:45 PM Meeting Adjourned |
| Next Meeting Date and Location | 6:30 PM December 4, 2019 Hudson Guild Elliott Center 441 West 26th Street 9/10 Dan Carpenter Room |

As recorded by M. Noble and J. Chait

| VOTING KEY Y=Yes N=No A=Abstain PNE=Present, not eligible 'A-- = No vote ATTENDANCE KEY P=Present Ab=Absent E=Excused | ATTENDANCE | 1. Letter to BSA re PCE Application for 555 10th Avenue (40/41) - NFC Amenity Management | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| | | 2. Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Improvements around Hudson Blvd and Bella Abzug Park | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 3. Letter to DOT re Staypineapple Hotel Request for Loading Zone - 337 W. 36th Street (8/9) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 4. Letter to DOT re Proposed Sight-Seeing Bus Permit Rule | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 5. Letter to DOT re LINK Removals on 8th Avenue (20-22 Sts.) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 6. Letter to DOT re 29th Street Safety Improvements | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 7. Letter to DOT re Construction Safety for Pedestrians | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 8. Letter to SLA re 150 W. 26th Street (6/7) - CKBA LLC | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 9. Letter to SLA re 766 9th Avenue (51/52) - Pure Thai Restaurant | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 10. Letter to SLA re 364 W. 46th Street (8/9) - Hold Fast | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 11. Letter to SLA re 360 W. 46th Street (8/9) - E A K Ramen | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 12. Letter to SLA re 410 W. 43rd Street (9/10) - Adella | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 13. Letter to SLA re 783 9th Avenue (52) - Ocean Foods NY Inc. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 14. Letter to SLA re 826 9th Avenue (54/55) - Kubera Mulki Inc. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 15. Letter to SLA re 235 9th Avenue (24/25) - Boilery Hospitality Inc. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 16. Letter to SLA re 450 W. 33rd Street (9/10) - Whole Foods Market Group Inc. & Jajaja Hudson Yards LLC | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 17. Letter to SLA re 636 11th Avenue (46/47) - Guckenheimer Services LLC | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| P / Y | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 36 | 37 | 37 | 36 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 |
| Ab / N | 12 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| E / A | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| PNE | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| A'-- | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Christine Berthet | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Gwen Billig | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Leslie Boghosian-Murphy | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Yoni Bokso | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Viren Brahmbhatt | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Patricia Carnevale | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Jessica Chait | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| T. Elzora Cleveland | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Lee Compton | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Dale Corvino | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Judith Dahill | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Maarten de Kad | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Paul Devlin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Pete Diaz | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Tina DeFelicantonio | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jeffrey Ellis-Lee | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Brett Firfer | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Wendy Gonzalez | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| David Holowka | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Frank Holozubiec | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Inge Ivchenko | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Lowell Kern | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Blake Kurisu | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Burt Lazarin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Christopher LeBron | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jeffrey LeFrancois | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Bruce MacAffer | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Betty Mackintosh | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Morgan McLean | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sarah Mills | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Michael Noble | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| J.D. Noland | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Maria Ortiz | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Allen Oster | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Brad Pascarella | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Rhonda Patillo | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Joe Restuccia | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Sabrina Reveron | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Delores Rubin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Brian Sokal | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| David Solnick | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Kit Tollerson | E | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Martin Treat | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Hector Vazquez | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Rob Walker | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| James Wallace | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| David Warren | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Leslie Williams | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| Sandra Williams | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Colin Wright | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |

| VOTING KEY Y=Yes N=No A=Abstain PNE=Present, not eligible A-- = No vote ATTENDANCE KEY P=Present Ab=Absent E=Excused | ATTENDANCE | Item Description | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| | | 18. Letter to SLA re 735 9th Avenue (50) - SC LIC LLC | 19. Letter to SLA re 474 9th Avenue (36/37) - Camapa Ltd. | 20. Letter to SLA re 312 W. 34th Street (8/9) - American Multi-Cinema Inc. | 21. Letter to SLA re 59 Chelsea Piers Golf Lounge - Konkapot Entertainment Inc. | 22. Letter to SLA re 435 W. 31st Street, 1st Floor (9/10) - 435 W 31st Street A LLC | 23. Letter to SLA re 435 W. 31st Street, 2nd & 3rd Floors (9/10) - 435 W 31st Street B LLC | 24. Letter to SLA re 651 9th Avenue (45/46) - Zac 45 Inc. | 25. Letter to SLA re 200-202 7th Avenue (21/22) - Ivanka Catering LLC | 26. Letter to SCA re School Renovation Project at High School for Fashion Industries - 225 W. 24th Street (7/8) | 27. Letter to Electeds re Congressional Legislation for Non-Essential Helicopter Flights over NYC | 28. Letter to Electeds re West 30th Street Heliport | 29. Updates to MCB4 Affordable Housing Plan | 30. Letter to Mayor de Blasio and NYPD re Relocation of Pier 76 Tow Pound | 31. MCB4 Statement of District Needs and Budget Priorities for Fiscal Year 2021 | |
| P / Y | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 37 | 35 | 35 | 36 | 37 | 36 | |
| Ab / N | 12 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | |
| E / A | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| PNE | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| A-- | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | |
| Christine Berthet | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Gwen Billig | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Leslie Boghosian-Murphy | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Yoni Boksor | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Viren Brahmabhatt | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Patricia Carnevale | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Jessica Chait | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| T. Elzora Cleveland | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Lee Compton | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Dale Corvino | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Judith Dahill | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Maarten de Kadt | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | |
| Paul Devlin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Pete Diaz | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Tina DeFelicantonio | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jeffrey Ellis-Lee | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Brett Firfer | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Wendy Gonzalez | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| David Holowka | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Frank Holozubiec | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Inge Ivchenko | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Lowell Kern | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Blake Kurisu | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Burt Lazarin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Christopher LeBron | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jeffrey LeFrancois | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Bruce MacAffer | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Betty Mackintosh | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Morgan McLean | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sarah Mills | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Michael Noble | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| J.D. Noland | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Maria Ortiz | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Allen Oster | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Brad Pascarella | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | A | Y | Y | Y | |
| Rhonda Patillo | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Joe Restuccia | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | A-- | Y | Y | |
| Sabrina Reveron | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Delores Rubin | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | |
| Brian Sokal | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| David Solnick | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Kit Tollerson | E | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Martin Treat | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Hector Vazquez | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Rob Walker | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| James Wallace | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| David Warren | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Leslie Williams | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |
| Sandra Williams | A | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Colin Wright | P | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | |