

DELORES RUBINChair

JESSE R. BODINE District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD No. 4

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036 Tel: 212-736-4536 Fax: 212-947-9512

www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	February 3, 2016	
Meeting Time	6:30PM	
Meeting Location	Fulton Center Auditorium 1199 th Avenue (17/18 St)	
Meeting Audio Recording	<u>LINK</u>	

February 2016 Full Board Meeting Minutes

Pier 57 Presentation by Hudson River Park Trust, Youngwoo & Associates, RXR Realty:

PUBLIC HEARING/ PRESENTATION

- (1) Noreen Doyle Executive Vice President of HRPT explained that Pier 57 is in a "significant action period." Information about the proposed development plan and draft leases are available at https://www.hudsonriverpark.org. A public hearing on the proposed plan was held on 1/20/16 and was well attended. HRPT continues to seek and will accept written public comments re the proposed plan until 2/16/16.
- (2) Young Woo Founder and Principal of Youngwoo & Associates, developer of the Pier 57 project said that his firm has been working on this proposed plan since 2008 when HRT gave them opportunity to develop the project. He explained that the firm has spent 8 years working with 28 agencies to arrive at the proposed plan. He appreciates the community's input.
- (3) Seth Pinsky Executive Vice President and Investment Manager of RXR Realty, co-developer of the Pier 57 project. Using a PowerPoint presentation, Mr. Pinsky explained that:
- (a) Pier 57 was a wooden structure and was burned down in the 1940s. The Pier has been vacant for many years and requires a full gut renovation to function properly.
- (b) Pier 57 stands 65 ft. above the water: its current concrete base (caisson) was manufactured Upstate and floated down the Hudson River to the current site. Pier 57 is the only pier in NY with a usable basement.
- (c) Pier 57 is a historically protected site and cannot be changed due to legal protections. The sole architectural addition to Pier 57 is the proposed public green rooftop.
- (d) There will be less construction in the water around Pier 57 than any other NYC pier project. A flood wall will be implemented per code requirements.
- (e) Developers' hope is to reactive Pier 57 and take capital liability of the Pier off of the community and local government by investing more than \$350 million of private money (via developers' equity and bank loans) and turning the vacant Pier 57 into usable space.
- (f) Pier 57 has a mixed-use development plan with 4 floors in 3 different structures. Besides 250,000 sq ft of new office space on the third and fourth floors, there will be a public amenity of 80-90,000 sq ft of brand new outdoor green space on the roof (financed and maintained by historic tax credits and by the developers) and 140,000 sq ft a unique and unprecedented New York themed public food market on the ground floor (with kiosks, food stands, restaurants, and other retail businesses related to food, maybe a fish market, and maybe an Asian night market tailored to NY). There is also around 34,000 sq ft of new exterior esplanade space will be open to the public.
- (g) Pier 57 will provide jobs via retail and office spaces.
- (h) The office space, as envisioned by the HRP Act on Pier 57 has been leased to Google (this is additional office space for Google, not a replacement from its other location in CB4). The developers has signed a LOI with Anthony Bourdain, who will curate the food hall on the ground floor and a

lease will soon be executed; the middle section and first floor retail continues to seek tenants.

- (i) Services for the building will be provided on the land side.
- (j) Deliveries will arrive through 16th Street and occur on the indoor ramps and stay out of sight. An extension of the esplanade will be built with internal roadways for deliveries. Any delivery overflow will enter via 17th Street.
- (k) 75 parking spaces in the caisson will be available for tenants only, not for the general public.
- (1) Tribeca Film Festival will show outdoor films on the roof on annual basis.
- (4) Greg Clancy VP of Development at RXR Realty answered some community and board members' questions:
- (a) Developers hope to establish relationship with community to make jobs available to people living in CB4 and make Pier 587 a NYC-focused institution.
- (b) Deliveries will happen during off hours but the traffic will be OFF the street. Walkway will be brand new and extend into the river and will become available to public.
- (c) Pier 57 as planned has a tight program and lots of amenities for the public, there is no additional community facility as defined by DOB.
- (d) Lease with HRT has a requirement for cultural educational and entertainment space. The developers are bound by the lease with the Trust to comply with the terms. Anticipated tenants, Google and Mr. Bourdain, both have education as part of their program.
- (e) Developers believe that the transit system is sufficient to support the increased traffic flow and may decide to add ferry service to provide direct access to Pier 57 in the future. Lease with HRT has option to build a marina both on the north and south sides but they have not decided whether to do so.

Public Session	
Julie Lawrence	Harborview: Ms. Lawrence is the Deputy Director of Clinton Housing Development Company. She asked for board members' support of the proposed Harborview plan on the agenda. Ms. Lawrence explained that the process was led by HV tenant association beginning in 2014, and included input from CB4 members, CHDC coordinators, and electeds (BP Gale Brewer, AM Linda Rosenthal, CM Helen Rosenthal, SS Brad Holyman). The interest group participated in workshops and proposed a list of priorities with cover for the safety, health, and comfort for seniors, disabled, youth, adults, and children alike as outlined in the proposed plan.
Maria Guzman	Harborview: Ms. Guzman is the President of Tenant Association of HV Houses. She asked for board members' support of the proposed Harborview plan (as is with all the included changes) on the agenda. She was thankful to all the elected, HV tenants, and CB members' input and felt that the group came up with a "great plan" that would function well for everyone.
Melvin Stevens	Pier 57: Mr. Stevens has been a community resident for 50 years. "HANDS OFF OUR HUDSON" – Mr. Stevens asked the Board to deny the proposed 97-year lease to develop Pier 57. Mr. Stevens believes that NYC has caved into developers and that HRT is making available NYC's waterfront to highest bidder, that electeds and advocates are allowing the developers' decision to ignore the community's safety and allowing a selected view to share the Hudson River view. In Mr. Stevens' opinion, these proposed plans will ruin our natural resources and our river's aquatic natural system. The cooling breezes on the waterfront will be taken away. Mr. Stevens said that these establishments will pay no property taxes and use city funds to ignore our already disabled infrastructure, health and education needs, and transit system.
Janet Liff	6 th Avenue Bike Lane: Ms. Liff works and lives in the Village and represents Transportation Alternatives. She spoke in support of the proposed bike lane from 8 th to 34 th Streets on 6 th Avenue. Currently, 10% of traffic on 6 th avenue is made up of bikes and 30% of bike traffic is Citibike – so the

	bike lane is a much-needed improvement. Bike lane is good for pedestrians and makes it safer with shorter crossing distance. It is also better for retail because numbers prove that a protected bike lane increases sales more quickly for retail. TA has collected 14000 supporting signatures from individuals and also signatures from at least 150 businesses. The proposed bike lane is also good for drivers because they will be better divided from the bikes and be less likely to be involved in accidents with bikes.
Bill Borock	Fulton Houses Parks & QOL issue: Mr. Borock spoke on behalf of the Council of Chelsea Block Associations to make the community aware of a meeting at NYCHA on Friday 2/5/2016 re fixing up park space in Fulton Houses. He encouraged CB4 members to attend. He also spoke about an item on the BLP agenda for 2/9/2016. He believes that Il Bastardo at 191 7 th Avenue is pushing for a culture of young all-day drinking and he wishes for the board members to be aware that the restaurant has faced many complaints and had been an item of discussion at QOL and has made their lawyer tell the public that all complaints have been taken care of but that is in fact not the case. The restaurant is said to be advertising Happy Hour from 8-11pm.
Lal Bahcecioglu	Community Art Project: Ms. Bahcecioglu is an art curator from Istanbul, Turkey. She is looking for community volunteers to participate in her proposed community art project. For two weeks in April 2016, she hopes to find volunteers or interested block associations to assist her in displaying video artwork by artists on provided TV screens from their homes' windows, preferably btw West 21 st and 23 rd Streets btw 8 th and 10 th Avenues. This street art project is titled "Sneak A Peak." No one will come into the apartments to see the works; it will be a first of its kind open-air exhibition. Participants will receive a signed print from Ms. Bahcecioglu. More info at: http://www.labahcecioglu.com/upcoming-projects/ and she can be reached at lbahcecioglu@sva.edu
Miguel Acevedo	CB4 Jobs: Mr. Acevedo is the President of the Tenant Association at Fulton Houses. As the Governor announces the rebuilding of Penn Station, Javits Center, and the new proposed sky line across CB4, Mr. Acevedo requested that the Board works hard with elected officials to get access to the associated jobs (construction jobs, doorman jobs, maintenance jobs) for residents at Fulton Houses and other tenement housing in the district. He believes that it is not fair that people from outside of the district are getting the jobs in CB4 and he hopes that board members will remember members of our own community and asks for jobs as they participate in meetings relating to projects.
Randall Klitz	6 th Avenue Bike Lane: Mr. Klitz is a public school teacher on the UWS and has lived in NYC for over 20 years. He bikes to work every M-F from LES to UWS. He said that everyday his wife is worried that he wouldn't come home because biking on NYC streets is dangerous. Many modern cities have made their cities safer by implementing bike lanes. Dedicated bike lines promote safety for cyclists and also for pedestrians and car drivers. He has seen head trauma and leg injury among friends as result of bike accidents. He believes that it is time for NYC to implement dedicated bike lines and make bikes a viable mode of transportation. He hopes that the board members will all vote for bike lanes and make safety a priority.
Andy Hyatt	6 th Avenue Bike Lane: Mr. Hyatt has lived in NYC for 12 years. He echoes Mr. Klitz's comments. He agrees that protected bike lines are much better than unprotected bike lines where bikers have to deal with double parking and people opening car doors into bikers. He thinks protected bike lanes are also safer for drivers. He asks the board members to vote for protected bike lanes.
Jeffrey LeFrancois	2/29 Food Event in MPD: Mr. LeFrancois represents the Meatpacking District and promoted a food event on 2/29, which celebrates NYC food culture. The event is called "A Battle of the Breakfasts" – 17 restaurants in the MPD will serve breakfast for dinner. On a personal note, Mr. LeFrancois also supports 6 th Avenue bike lane.
Mik Farkas	HK Flea Market Update: Mr. Farkas is a vendor at the 39 th Street HK flea market. Mr. Farkas and his fellow vendors are working on designing a solution with help of CB to bring a vibrant market to the space on 39 th Street and the community. There are fewer and fewer vendors and customers so the group is racing against time. He thanked the CB for its support.
Virginia Seidel	HK Flea Market Update: Ms. Seidel is a former vendor and customer at the flea market and also

	resident on W43 rd and 10 th Ave. She is grateful for the CB4's support to monitor the situation and make movement for the community.
David Bros	HK Flea Market Update: Mr. Bros is a vendor at the flea market. He is amazed and very thankful for the attention, time and resources that CB4 has spent on addressing the situation at the flea market. There are detailed and long stipulations, which will take a long time to implement. Mr. Bros thinks there are large and small ongoing violations, especially monetary issues, committed. The Market is supposed to contribute 25% of its income to the Foundation since 2006 and the amount contributed is not believable because the amount contributed (\$25,000) would suggest that the Market is only making \$200-400 per day. Heads up to QOL. And hope to have a better situation at the Market a year from now.
Jose Martinez	Job Search: Mr. Martinez has been living in the community for many years and has been looking for a construction job for two years. He feels like there have been a lot of construction projects around the district but he has been unable to land an opportunity despite his constant attempts to apply and visits to job sites. He is currently only working three days a week and he is sad about his future prospects.
Tsipi Benheim	CityArts: Ms. Benheim is the Executive and Creative Director of CityArts and invites families with kids to come together with professional artists and create mosaics and murals in the community this summer. The project aims to celebrate nature and raise awareness of global warming and climate change. Ms. Benheim is working with the Parks Department to implement the murals at two proposed public park locations: Gegrude Kelly Park on 8 th Avenue and W17 th Street and Clemen Clark Moore Park on 10 th Avenue and W22 nd Street. She welcomes ideas, thoughts and participation from the community.
Lisa Wager	FIT: Ms. Wager is Director of Government and Community Relations at SUNY's FIT and promoted two ongoing exhibits at FIT: (1) Denim – Fashion's Frontier, a showcase of denim as a fabric, will run until 5/9/2016. (2) Fairy Tales Fashion – which includes works by many high-end fashion designers and explore their relationship with fairy tales – will run until 4/16/2016. A private tour of (2) will be provided to CB4 community members on Monday 2/21/16 and will be led by curator of the exhibition. If you want to attend the private tour or have your name added to FIT's e-blast, please contact Ms. Wager.
Tom Goger	Community Safety and f/u re police activity: Mr. Goger lives at 450 W 17 th Street with his wife. His apartment is about 40-50 yards from the entrance to the Highline Ballroom and faces W16 th Street. On 1/6/16 at around 2am, a customer was ejected from the Highline Ballroom and responded by firing 5-7 rounds from his handgun on the street. Mr. Goger believes that stray bullets and drive by shootings are too common in Manhattan. He wishes to know how he can find out what the police is doing about this discharge.
Mark Monchel	6 th Avenue Bike Lane: Mr. Monchel lives in the community. He thanked CB4 for what it is doing about bike lanes. He thinks that bike lanes keep the community safe; no one should die or get injured because of the lack of bike lanes.
Bill David	QOL issue: Mr. David lives at 313 W 36 th Street and represents some of his neighbors regarding a night club, Vodka Soda / Bottoms Up at 315 W 43 rd Street that opened in recent months. Mr. David reported that there has been extremely loud noise, vibration and smoke coming from the club/bar. At the February QOL meeting, it came to light that the owners are running their business illegally because they do not have the proper cabaret license. The business also often exceed their Public Assembly capacity. Mr. David wishes for CB4 to uphold the licensing and zoning limitations for the establishment.

•

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives Mr. Lomobardi thanked CHDC and electeds for their work on the Harborview proposed plan and Andrew Lombardi for hoped that the plan will pass. He discussed ongoing work by the office surrounding 497 9th Avenue. Gale Brewer a building that was scheduled for demolition in the Special Hudson Yards district. A letter was sent to DOB by electeds and DOB has responded that it will look into the building's structural integrity. The office hopes to be able to save the building and retain the regulated units in the building. He also discussed ongoing meetings with DOB re construction safety working group. CB4 is represented by Christine Berthert and next week's (meeting #5) topic will be building code enforcements and site safety monitoring with industry experts. Regarding tenant protection plans, after months of pressure from electeds, DOB finally announced last week that they will post these plans on their website effective 2/1/2016. He also reported that the State of the Borough held on the past Sunday was successful. He reminded the community that the Capital Grant Funding application process is still open and the BP's office will be taking applications until 2/12/2016. Questions should be directed to Mr. Lombardi. He also mentioned that Youth Council funding application will be available on Friday 2/5/2016 and the process will close on 3/4/2016. Those who work with youth should apply. **Erik Bottcher for** Mr. Bottcher explained that Councilmember Johnson is hosting a SCRIE and DRIE workshop on **Corey Johnson** 2/25/2016. He also reported on an incident at Elliot Chelsea Houses this month where the tenants were living without heat and hot water during and after the snowstorm and CM Johnson had to call the Mayor's office in order to get NYCHA to address the issue. It turned out that the heat and hot water issue at Elliot Houses had been ongoing since December/January and tenants' calls and repair requests went unanswered by NYCHA. CM will continue to stay on top of this upsetting issue and would ask NYCHA at a meeting at Elliot Houses on 2/4/2016 about the process of taking tenant complaints and how these complaints are addressed. Gabriel Dann-Allel for Ms. Dann-Allel reported that Mr. Gottfried's office is looking forward to working with the community on the proposed expansion projects of Penn Station and Javits Center. The Assembly's Richard Gottfried Committee on Health had favorably recorded 22 bills, ranging from requiring every hospital to have CAB to safe workplace for nurses. She also expressed the Office's support to redevelopment of Pier 57 and hoped that public spaces can be maximized in the project. Teresa Rack for The Congresswoman is extremely happy to report that Congress has voted to extend the World Trade Carolyn Maloney Center Health program to 2090 and provide full compensation to survivors and first-responders through the September 11 Victim Compensation Fund after a long fight. The Congresswoman has unveiled a report on the discrimination against women in corporate boardrooms. The Report found that only 16% of board members are women and there are a lot of inequalities. The Congresswomen is working with SEC on strategies to increase women on boards and require gender reporting for all boards and company leadership. Congresswoman introduced a bill on 2/3/2016, which would require states to receive disclosure of true owners of all real estate purchases because it is found that foreign wealth, shielded by off shore corporations, is purchasing 50% of NYC's properties. Such disclosure would make sure this information is available to law enforcement so illegal activities of anonymous transactions can be stopped. **Ed Sullivan for** Mr. Sullivan reported that there had been accusations that NYC charter schools are not educating

Board Reports & Business	
Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	Agenda was adopted with removal of Item #30 and January 2016 minutes were approved.

treated as second-class citizen.

handicapped students. In the investigation, the PA has also found that NYC DOE is also lacking in its duties to help students who are handicapped. The PA is about to start a lawsuit to make sure that handicapped students' entitlement to an education is respected and enforced and that they are not

Latisha James

District	Manager
Report	

Mr. Bodine, with other board representatives, attended a meeting at Avenues School regarding its scholarship program. Mr. Bodine, along with other DMs, also met with OMB to discuss revising the budget consultation process and the new budget request process.

Board Business:

QOL Committee has a new meeting location: Hotel Trades Council.

Chelsea Land Use Committee will meeting on Tuesday 2/16 (SEC NOTE: this meeting has subsequently been canceled)

Budget Task Force is meeting on Monday 2/8 at CB4 offices at 6:30pm.

Education Working Group will meet on Thursday 2/25 at 8:30am at CB4 offices.

Good news:

Echoing Mr. Lombardi: 497 9th Avenue has been saved from demolition and grateful for participation by elected and CB4 members.

After the storm, CB4 is first district to get to "black top" and all of our side streets are first to be plowed.

Board Chair Report

Ms. Rubin thanks all the electeds and board members for their hard work to save 497 9th Avenue. Ms. Rubin announces that 42 (out of 49) board members responded to the board member survey. Majority of people (close to 80%) did not want committee reassignments. Some members have requested additional training beyond what is offered by BP office, a guide to short hand used by the Board, and workshops on letter writing, and potentially meetings with the public re 500 foot rules/explanation on sidewalk obstruction protocols etc. Ms. Rubin also mentioned that the new member application process for CB has ended. CB4 has 2 vacancies only and new members will be announced in April. There are some new ideas for full board meeting agenda. The new proposal will be discussed at EXEC and eventually proposed to full board in the future. There is an initiative to activate CB4's presence on social media and adapt to how community members communicate. Board member Ernest Moderelli jumpstarted this initiative and there will be a think tank that board member Oscar Pagoada will run.

This has been a very busy month for Ms. Rubin. She attended many committee meetings and block association meetings. She had a very productive meeting with Javits Center re history and expansion plan. She had a meeting with the Women's Group who will be using the Bayview facility and Ms. Rubin got familiarized with the players and issues. Ms. Rubin reemphasized the importance of the upcoming Budget Task Force meeting. She hopes that the committees will have the budget process in mind so CB4 stays in front of the process and receives proper funding for all priorities and initiatives.

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Quality of Life (QOL)		
Item 1: Letter to owners of Vodka Soda-Bottoms Up, 315 West 46 Street re complaints about noise	Friendly amendments were received.	PASSED
Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 2: Letter to DCA re 607 10th Avenue (44) – Meme Mediterranean	Bundled items Nos. 2, 4-	PASSED
Item 3: Letter to SLA re 290 8th Avenue (24/25) – Top Brass LLC	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Item 4: Letter to SLA re 409 8th Avenue (30/31) – Pad Thai		PASSED

Asian Kitchen Inc. d/b/a Pad Thai		
Item 5: Letter to SLA re 626 10th Avenue (44/45) – Hell's Kitchen Salt & Pepper Inc.		PASSED
Item 6: Letter to SLA re 400-402 W. 44th Street (9/10) a.k.a. 621 9th Avenue - Gallo Nero		PASSED
Item 7: Letter to SLA re 610 W. 56th Street (11/12) – Terminal 5		PASSED
Item 8: Letter to SLA re 163 W. 23rd Street (6/7) – Three A Plus Inc. d/b/a Malibu Diner		PASSED
Item 9: Letter to SLA re 667 10th Avenue (46/47) – Zeren LLC d/b/a Kahve Coffee		PASSED
Item 10: Letter to SLA re 470 W. 42nd Street (9/10) – Treehaus		PASSED
Item 11: Letter to SLA re 302 W. 38th Street (8/38) – 302 Cafes LLC d/b/a Café Tarantin		PASSED
Item 12: Letter to SLA re 660 12th Avenue (48/49) – The Glasshouses		PASSED
Item 13: Letter to SLA re 409 W. 15th Street a.k.a. 75 9th Avenue (15/16) – Los Mariscos		PASSED
Item 14: Letter to SLA re 314 W. 53rd Street (8/9) – TR5 Group Inc. d/b/a Hide-Chan Ramen		PASSED
Item 15: Letter to SLA re 500 W. 30th Street (10/11) – Whitmans		PASSED
Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land		
Item 16: Letter to Port Authority re: Bus Terminal Expansion Plan	Bundled items Nos. 16-18 Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Item 17: Letter to Jacob Javits Convention Center re: Expansion		PASSED
Item 18: Letter to Penn Station/Moynihan re: Renovation	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Waterfront, Parks & Enviro	onment (WPE)	
Item 19: Letter to Friends of the High Line re: The Spur Concept Design	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Chelsea Land Use Comm	ittee (CLU)	
Item 20: Letter to LPC re 601 West 26th Street, Starrett-Lehigh Building		PASSED
Item 21: Letter to LPC re 180 Tenth Avenue, High Line Hotel LPC Application	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Item 22: Letter to DOB re 559 West 22 Street re potential illegal demolition		PASSED
Transportation Committee	ee (TRANS)	
Item 23: Letter to DOT re: 6th Avenue Bike Lane		PASSED
Item 24: Letter to DOT re: Parking Regulation Change on 26 St. between 6 th and 7 th Ave.		PASSED
Item 25: Letter to DOT re: Traffic Light Issues at 23rd St. and 11th Ave.	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED
Housing Health & Human Services	s Committee (HHHS)	

Item 26: Letter to HPD re Harborview Open Space	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED	
Executive Committee (EXEC)			
Item 27: Letter to HRPT re: Pier 57		PASSED	
Item 28: Letter to Mayor's Office re Lack of Demo and Harassment Protections in Special Districts	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED	
Item 29: Letter re Amendments to Covenant House-Hunter College RFP – RADIFICATION	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED	
New Business Item 30: Letter to EDC re: Response to Covenant House RFP	WITHDRAWN		

Meeting Resolution		
Adjournment	8:42 PM Meeting Adjourned	
Next Meeting Date and Location	March 2, Wednesday 6:30 p.m Mount Sinai West 1000 Tenth Avenue (58/59)	