



CITY OF NEW YORK  
**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY**  
**BOARD No. 4**  
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor  
 New York, NY 10036  
 tel: 212-736-4536  
 fax: 212-947-9512  
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	December 5, 2018
Meeting Time	6:30 PM
Meeting Location	Hartley House 413 West 46th Street

**BURT LAZARIN**  
Chair

**JESSE R. BODINE**  
District Manager

### December 2018 Full Board Meeting Minutes

<b>PRESENTATIONS / PUBLIC HEARINGS</b>	<p><b>Public Hearing:</b> Zoning Authorization for Contribution in Kind for Block 4 of Hudson Blvd. Park West (10/11 Aves and West 36th Street)</p> <p><b>Public Hearing:</b> BSA Application for a Physical Culture Establishment at 550 W. 41st Street – Silverstein MB LLC</p> <p>Board Chair Burt Lazarin opened the hearing and, with no speakers coming forward, declared the hearing closed.</p>
--	---

<b>Public Session</b>	
<b>Alice Truax</b>	Board President for Hartley House; Hartley House is a settlement house serving Hell’s Kitchen since 1897. They offer programming in after school, tutoring, arts, and senior services. Ms. Truax is grateful that they continue to operate out of the original Hartley House after a possibility of displacement. Thanked Speaker Corey Johnson and City Hall, Ken Jockers from Hudson Guild, and Joe Restuccia from Clinton Housing Development Corporation for helping Hartley House retain their space.
<b>Yesenia Zuniga</b>	Executive Director of Hartley House; thanked elected officials, Hudson Guild, and Clinton Housing Development Corporation. Ms. Zuniga announced that Hartley House will be hosting a holiday party on Tuesday December 18 <sup>th</sup> at 5 PM.
<b>Tristan Loanzon</b>	Parent of P.S. 111 students; asks the NYC Department of Education (DOE) to review their Educational Impact Statement (EIS) concerning the possible co-location of a middle school in P.S. 111. Mr. Loanzon asks DOE to delay the vote until the EIS is amended with an impact statement. Mr. Loanzon and other parents have circulated a petition on Change.org which 700 people have signed on to.
<b>Evelyn Choudhury</b>	Parent of a special needs student at P.S. 111; Ms. Choudhury’s child receives therapy at P.S. 111. She is concerned that the current therapy room would be used by the prospective middle school causing the current therapy room to be co-located to a small room in the basement.
<b>Tai Do</b>	Parent of a P.S. 111 student; Mr. Do asks DOE to amend the EIS with an impact statement. The current EIS does not consider the impact of time-slicing facilities like the gym, library, and playground.

<b>Zhanilla Bermes</b>	<p>Parent of a P.S. 111 student and PTA executive member; Ms. Bermes read an official statement from the P.S. 111 PTA Executive Board which asked for DOE to prepare an EIS which ensures that P.S. 111 parents have all of the crucial information regarding a middle school co-location. The PTA Executive Board stands firmly with parents to have this request met.</p> <p>Ms. Bermes, speaking from a personal viewpoint, is concerned that Pre-K students will be located right next to the cafeteria, where four-year-olds will share space with teenagers.</p>
<b>Grecia Piezzo</b>	<p>Parent of P.S. 111 student; Ms. Piezzo is grateful that her child's skills have grown due to P.S. 111's occupational therapy classrooms. The occupational therapy room is currently able to hold all necessary equipment for students and therapists. The growing reputation of P.S. 111 is drawing better therapists and educators. Ms. Piezzo believes the EIS should include an analysis which focuses on special needs children.</p>
<b>Chien Kwok</b>	<p>Mr. Kwok is concerned that the middle school that seeks co-location has had two recent addresses and this would be the third. He asks for due diligence from DOE.</p>
<b>Michael Girimonti</b>	<p>Parent of P.S. 111 student in the gifted and talented program; Mr. Girimonti stated that P.S. 111 was co-located with a middle school in the past. P.S. 111 has been improving each year after the removal of the middle school.</p>
<b>Julia Day</b>	<p>Parent of P.S. 111 kindergarten student; Ms. Day is concerned that the city's underutilized space list shows at least four schools which have space for co-location. Would like to know why P.S. 111 was chosen.</p>
<b>Sarah Noda</b>	<p>Parent of two P.S. 111 students; Ms. Noda worked with the principal and PTA to improve the school in recent years. She is concerned about the EIS not including an impact analysis and asks DOE to amend with EIS with more information around impact.</p>
<b>Marissa Redanty</b>	<p>Co-District Leader for Hell's Kitchen; is successfully working to help mitigate homelessness issues in her district. Ms. Redanty advocated for early voting and the regulation of pedicabs.</p>
<b>Biko Njoke</b>	<p>A staff member at Citizens Committee for New York; announced the West Side Community Fund which would give grants for community gardens, PTAs, and other small organizations of up to \$5000. Grants are exclusively for Chelsea and Hudson Yards.</p>
<b>Marni Halasa</b>	<p>Owner of Red Eye Coffee; they sell 500 cups of coffee a day to the Hudson Yards community. Announced that they are closing because they were unable to reach a deal with their landlord.</p>

<b>Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives</b>	
<b>Sgt. Stefanovich</b>	<p>Community Sergeant for Hell's Kitchen; Sgt. Stefanovich and his team of Neighborhood Coordination Officers who patrol the neighborhood introduced themselves. Neighborhood Coordination Officer program in Hell's Kitchen started in October 2018.</p>
<b>Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal</b>	<p>Assemblymember Rosenthal is hopeful that the next legislative session in the assembly will pass the following pieces of legislation: Child Victims Act, Gender Expression Non-Discrimination Act (GENDA), an update to the Reproductive Health Act; NYS DREAM Act, increase education funding, and enact tougher rent control laws.</p>
<b>Senator Brad</b>	<p>Senator Hoylman expressed appreciation to be in Hartley House for the board meeting</p>

<b>Hoylman</b>	and thanked all of those who helped save the building. He listed the new State Senate priorities for 2019, some which include: passing an updated Reproductive Health Act; voting reform by enacting early voting, automatic voter reg, same day voter reg, and allowing 16-year-olds to vote; strengthening gun laws; passing the Child Victims Act; outlawing conversion therapy; finding alternative revenue for the MTA.
<b>Brian Lewis for BP Gale Brewer</b>	<p>Mr. Lewis made the following announcements on behalf of the Borough President:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The office is continuing to work with the EDC and stakeholders to ensure that we preserve as much garment manufacturing square footage as possible through the building acquisition and IDA program.</li> <li>• The BP continues to support 100% affordable units with no additional market-rate housing for the proposed new construction at Harborview. She stands with NYCHA tenants and community members in their demands.</li> <li>• The newly-imposed community board term limits affects those who are appointed on or after April 1, 2019 by limiting them to four consecutive two-year terms starting on April 1, 2019, regardless of how many years they have already been on the Board.</li> <li>• The office is now accepting applications for new and returning community board members. The applications can be found online as well as in paper format. The submission deadline is 5 pm on February 8th.</li> <li>• The office coordinated an inter-Community Board taskforce to discuss the L train shutdown and held a meeting on November 27th with NYPD, MTA and the Mayor’s Office to discuss issues of traffic and parking permitting and enforcement during the L-Train Tunnel reconstruction. Issues surrounding blockage and enforcement of the 12th and 13th Street bike lanes were also discussed.</li> <li>• The NYC Department of Education has been awarded close to 400 million dollars thanks to the Smart Schools Bond Act. The office has collected data from more than 80 co-located schools on their broadband speeds, the results of which will be released shortly.</li> <li>• The BP funds grants for capital projects for schools, libraries, parks, street improvement projects and non-profits that contract with the City. One should contact the Budget team to arrange a one-on-one meeting.</li> <li>• The Manhattan Cultural Tourism program opened on December 3rd.</li> <li>• This year’s diaper drive is now active to help low-income parents acquire diapers. Donations can be made through Amazon or directly at the BP office at 431 West 125th Street.</li> <li>• Monthly workshops will begin on December 12th at the 125th Street office with partners from the Teen Relationship Abuse Prevention Program.</li> <li>• The 125th Street will have partners from the Department of Finance available on December 11th to assist seniors and the disabled apply for property tax exemptions.</li> </ul>
<b>Robert Atterbury for Congressman Gerald Nadler</b>	With Democrats taking the majority in the House of Representatives, Congressman Nadler will become chair of the House Judiciary Committee. Congressman Nadler hopes to focus on: immigration issues (namely asylum reform and family separation), the Affordable Care Act, expanding the enforcement of hate crimes, civil rights, and defense of civil liberties. He also advocates for 9/11 victim’s compensation, the Equality Act, and ending forced arbitration for workers.
<b>Carl Wilson for Council Speaker Cory Johnson</b>	Mr. Wilson announced that the City Council passed 18 bills to protect rent-regulated tenants. He thanked CB4 for their partnership in strengthening zoning language against illegal demolitions. The Speaker’s office is inspecting intense rodent activity which will lead to a larger sanitation discussion. There were heat and hot water disruptions at the Elliot-Chelsea Houses on Thanksgiving Day, which the office deemed unacceptable.

	<p>They are meeting with other elected officials and NYCHA staff to resolve these issues and ensure no future disruptions. The Mayor’s Office for People with Disabilities is working to make buildings more accessible. The Speaker’s Office is working with Holy Apostles for a holiday toy drive; there will be a pop-up District Office at Penn South to learn about district services, events, and issues.</p>
--	---

<b>Board Reports &amp; Business</b>	
-------------------------------------	--

<b>Adoption of Agenda and Minutes</b>	<p>The Agenda, as amended to include Item 22, was unanimously approved. The November minutes, as amended, were also approved unanimously.</p>
---------------------------------------	---

<b>District Manager Report</b>	<p>Highlights of events the District Manager or Staff attended on behalf of the board and upcoming events:</p> <p>Meetings/events attended by CB4 staff on behalf of the board:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District Manager provided testimony at City Council hearing on Garment Center District Rezoning</li> <li>• Three Planning Fellows continue to work on their Committee projects</li> </ul> <p>December Committee Updates and Board Reminders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Executive Committee meeting scheduled for December 24th has been canceled.</li> <li>• Next month’s general meeting will be held at a new venue: The Church of the Holy Apostles on 9th Avenue on January 2nd.</li> </ul> <p>Mr. Bodine thanked Nelly Gonzalez and Janine Pretente for their help keeping the board running so smoothly.</p>
--------------------------------	--

<b>Board Chair Report</b>	<p>We had several small meetings during the previous month:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Construction noise off-hours were the main issues around 415 Tenth Avenue and 441 Ninth Avenue. At 415, excavation work was originally permitted by DOB to be performed 24/7. Working with Speaker Johnson's office, we got the DOB to pull the permits. At 441, the developers agreed not to do any Saturday work until the New Year.</li> <li>• The CB4 PABT Working Group continues to work with all the stakeholders as the bus terminal replacement project moves forward.</li> <li>• HHHS/CLU had a conference call with HPD and the sponsor of the Till Buildings on Seventh Avenue and West 22nd Street, AAFE, about the proposed building's façade. The ULURP will begin sometime in the first two months of 2019.</li> <li>• The Chair, the co-chairs of CLU and one committee member, and the DM met with the developers of a project between West 23rd and West 24th Streets incorporating the deconsecrated French St. Vincent de Paul church. The developers presented details of their currently as of right (zoning is part commercial and part manufacturing) hotel/residential project. We considered the design respectful of the church and contextual with its surroundings. The issue is the imminent new hotel zoning and the vote at the City Council, the timing of which prevents a</li> </ul>
---------------------------	---

	<p>full Board review. The project is consistent with the Board's previous positions on the church's restoration and mixed-use developments on West 24th Street.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Chair announced the appointment of Brett Firfer to lead a working group on the latest NYC charter review. Each committee in December is being asked to consider items covered by the charter that it would like changed and send them to Brett. The Charter Review Working Group will then sift through the suggestions and create a document to bring before the full Board. Eventually we will send our adopted resolution to the Charter Review Commission.</li> <li>• Also, the Chair asked for volunteers to work with him on creating a small business of the month program. This would go towards implementing one of the recommendations of the MCB4 Business Diversity Task Force. Chris LeBron volunteered.</li> </ul>
<b>Election of Board Officers</b>	Frank Holozubiec, Chair of the Nominating Committee, read the list of members who were nominated for office, noting that all were uncontested. Each officer was elected by a majority of the votes cast by the 35 members in attendance.

<b>Action Items</b>	<b>Motions, Amendments, &amp; Comments</b>	<b>Result</b>
<b>Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee (CHKLU)</b>		
Item 1: Letter to BSA re PCE Application for 550 W. 41st Street (10/11)		<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 PNE</b>
Item 2: Letter to Tishman Speyer re Application for Contribution in Kind for Block 4 of Hudson Blvd. Park		<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 PNE</b>
Item 3: Letter to Speaker Johnson re Intro 1058 – Mandating the Development of a Comprehensive Urban Agriculture Plan	Friendly amendment accepted	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)</b>		
Item 4: Letter to DCA re 717 9th Avenue (48/49) – Viv Thai Restaurant	Items 4-16 were bundled	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 5: Letter to SLA re 717 9th Avenue (48/49) – Viv Thai Restaurant		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 6: Letter to SLA re 88 9th Avenue (16/17) – 88 Ninth Avenue Hospitality LLC		<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 PNE</b>

Item 7: Letter to SLA re 480 9th Avenue (36/37) – Aiyara Thai Inc. d/b/a Aiyara Thai		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 8: Letter to SLA re 312 W. 58th Street (8/9) – CC West 58 Corp. d/b/a Gleason’s Bar & Restaurant		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 9: Letter to SLA re 683 9th Avenue (47/48) – Down the Road Pub LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 10: Letter to SLA re 622 10th Avenue (44/45) – The Prive Hospitality Group LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 11: Letter to SLA re 35 Hudson Yards a/k/a 560 W. 33rd Street – ERY North Tower RHC Tenant LLC, ESQ Hotel Management LLC, 210 the G LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 12: Letter to SLA re 20 Hudson Yards a/k/a 500 W. 33rd Street – The Drug Store Hudson Yards LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 13: Letter to SLA re 20 Hudson Yards, RU220 a/k/a 500 West 33rd Street – Fendi North America		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 14: Letter to SLA re 500 W. 33rd Street a/k/a 20 Hudson Yards – Fuku Hudson Yards LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 15: Letter to SLA re 131 W. 14th Street (6/7) – 131 W LLC d/b/a Bonchon		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 16: Letter to SLA re 172 8th Avenue (18/19) – Grand Sichuan 8 Inc.		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Waterfront, Parks &amp; Environment Committee (WPE)</b>		
Item 17: Letter to Diamond Generating Co. re North Bergen Liberty Power Project	Items 17-19 were bundled	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 18: Letter to Meatpacking BID re New Tree Pits and Planters along West 14th Street (9/10)	Two friendly amendments were accepted	<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 abstention</b>
Item 19: Letter to OSL Concrete re Concrete Distribution via Hudson River Park		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Housing, Health &amp; Human Services Committee (HHHS)</b>		
Item 20: Letter to HPD re 601 West 29th Street – Inclusionary Housing Application		<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 PNE</b>

<b>New Business</b>		
Item 21: Letter to Related and Google re West Side Community Fund Boundaries		<b>Passed with 33 in favor, 1 abstention and 1 PNE</b>
Item 22: Letter to DOE and PEP re Postponement of PEP vote on proposed temporary co-location of City Knoll School to P.S. 111 Building at 440 West 53rd Street		<b>Passed with 34 in favor and 1 PNE</b>

<b>Meeting Resolution</b>	
<b>Adjournment</b>	8:45 PM Meeting Adjourned
<b>Next Meeting Date and Location</b>	6:30 PM January 2, 2019 Church of the Holy Apostles 296 9th Avenue at 28th Street

As recorded by I. Medelius and M. Noble