



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
BOARD No. 4
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor
 New York, NY 10036
 tel: 212-736-4536
 fax: 212-947-9512
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

| | |
|------------------|--|
| Meeting Date | March 1, 2017 |
| Meeting Time | 6:30PM |
| Meeting Location | Hudson Guild Elliot Center 441 West 26 th Street Dan Carpenter Room A/B |

DELORES RUBIN
Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
District Manager

March 2017 Full Board Meeting Minutes

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| PUBLIC HEARING | <p>CB4's Response to Mayor's Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2018</p> <p>Lowell Kern, as Second Vice Chair of the Board representing CB4's Budget Task Force, invited the public to speak on issues relating to the FY2018 budget.</p> <p>Board member Inga Ivchenko mentioned that there is an imminent need to install more catch basins on CB4 street corners. Public member Pamela Wolff agreed.</p> <p>No one else signed up to speak. Hearing closed.</p> |
| PUBLIC HEARING | <p>BSA Special Permit for a PCE (Physical Culture Establishment) at 144 W 23 Street for Rumble</p> <p>Lee Compton, Co-Chair of CLU, explained the permit request and further clarified at constituent's request. No one signed up to speak. Hearing closed.</p> |

Public Session

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Tom Caylor | <p>Airbnb law: Mr. Caylor of the Westwide Neighborhood Alliance's Illegal Hotel Committee spoke about AM Linda Rosenthal's recent law that made it illegal for people to advertise illegal hotels. Mayor's Office for Special Enforcement is charged with the responsibility to enforce this law and the Office is looking to create an ad campaign with tenants and landlords who have been negatively impacted by illegal hotels in their buildings. Please contact Mr. Caylor if you want to participate or get in touch with Patricia at the CB4 office.</p> |
| Pamela Wolff | <p>Chelsea Indivisible: Ms. Wolff is a public member of CB4 and lives in Chelsea on West 21st Street. Ms. Wolff has been very disturbed by the election results and decided to organize her neighbors. 15 people from the neighborhood attended an organization of meeting of a newly formed group called "Chelsea Indivisible" and they are registered with the nationwide "Indivisible" movement. *Members of the group attended the meeting and were acknowledged.</p> |
| Italo Medelius | <p>Affordable groceries: Mr. Medelius is a representative of the Hudson Guild Neighborhood Advisory Committee's Community Access Task Force. His group has a new project on grocery accessibility and Mr. Medelius wishes for community members to fill out a survey on the issue. Link for the survey is: goo.gl/vCd6YR or please email make.chelsea.affordable@gmail.com.</p> |
| Dana Steer | <p>Riu Plaza New York Times Square Hotel liquor license application: Mr. Steer is a community resident for 17 years and is a member of both Actors' Equity Association and the New York Hotel Trade Council. Mr. Steer spoke about the fact that the \$100 million Riu Plaza New York Times Square Hotel is a non-union hotel. The parent company TUI Group reported earnings of over \$20 billion in 2015. The developer of the hotel in 2011 bragged</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p>about his ability to keep labor cost down and dodge unions. Mr. Steel asked the Board to update its stipulations with the Hotel’s management regarding the pending liquor license application to reflect concerns for the hotel’s non-union hiring practices. An independent company performs the hotel’s housekeeping service and this is very unusual in the industry.</p> |
| <p>Ryfua Soni & Karen Smith</p> | <p>Ms. Soni and Ms. Smith live at Penn South on West 25th Street and 8th Avenue and are representatives from its shareholder organization at Penn South, LEAPS (Limited Equity and Affordability at Penn South). They requested for CB4 to pass a resolution regarding a “Hate Free Zone” and read aloud the below proposed text:</p> <p>“Whereas: CB4 believes in the rights of all people to lead lives of peace and dignity free from fear, harassment, and violence; as stated in the February 7, 2017 letter issued by this Community Board on the immigration ban; and</p> <p>Whereas CB4 does not tolerate hate crimes and other expressions of hate and stands in strong opposition to the authoritarianism, policies, and rhetoric that engender hatred; and</p> <p>Whereas: CB4 acknowledges, respects, and values the diversity of its community; and believes in the rights of all people to lead lives of peace and dignity free from fear, harassment, and violence; and</p> <p>Whereas; CB4 is adamantly committed to protecting this community's residents from racist, Islamophobic, anti-Semitic, misogynistic, homophobic, transphobic, anti-immigrant, and anti-refugee sentiments and acts and all other targeting of residents based on their identities or perceived identities; and</p> <p>Whereas; CB4 supports respect for civil and human rights and recognizes that pursuant to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights adopted by the United Nations in 1948, Article 3, "Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person" and Article 5, "No one shall be subjected to...degrading treatment;"</p> <p>Therefore be it resolved that:</p> <p>CB4 goes on record as committed to the values of freedom, justice, and equality that bind us as a community, and to protecting those whose security and well-being may be threatened in the current political and social climate.</p> <p>Be it further resolved that we stand in solidarity with, and advocate for the civil liberties and human rights of, every CB4 resident regardless of race, ethnicity, religion, sexual and gender identity, national origin, or citizenship and immigration status.</p> <p>Be it further resolved that we recommit to working towards a community, country, and world that are non-discriminatory, welcoming, just, inclusive, and pluralistic.</p> <p>Be it further resolved that we vehemently condemn acts of vandalism, harassment, and violence that express hatred towards members of our community and beyond;</p> <p>Be it further resolved that Community Board #4 is a hate-free zone in which hate crimes and discriminatory actions will not be tolerated.</p> <p>Be it further resolved that we call upon all members of our community to engage in positive community-building and take the necessary and courageous steps to prevent and respond to discrimination and hatred whenever and wherever they see it.</p> <p>Be it further resolved that we are committed to holding our city, state and federal leaders accountable to the values and commitments expressed in this resolution.”</p> <p>*Ms. Delores explained that CB4 do not pass resolutions. She invited Ms. Soni & Ms. Smith to attend one of the committee meetings or Executive Committee meeting to further address their proposal in a public and transparent manner.</p> |
| <p>Ana Camadro</p> | <p>P.S. 51 Music Jam Night: Ms. Camadro, representing the PTA, invited all CB4 members and members of the community to attend P.S. 51 (The Elias Howe School)’s 3rd Music Jam Night on March 24th from 5:30 to 6:45pm at 525 West 44th Street (10/11). P.S. 51 has a diverse</p> |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| | <p>student body and is a unique asset of Hell’s Kitchen. Students will be sharing the stage with professional musicians, many of whom are parents at P.S. 51. This is a PTA fundraising effort; \$10 for adults; \$5 for children. Ms. Camadro asked everyone to come and support “the great American tradition of great free public school education for everyone no matter where they come from.”</p> |
| Michael Slater | <p>Mr. Slater is the Community Relations Coordinator at Ryan Chelsea-Clinton Community Health Center at 645 10th Avenue (46th and 10th). Mr. Slater started his remarks by thanking CB4 for its letter of support to the State. He reported that the school-based health center inside Park West Academy on West 50th Street is fully equipped and services will begin after the Center passes a pending state inspection. Regarding past events, the Ryan Chelsea-Clinton Health Center hosted a reception for the Sierra Club on February 8th and the Urban Nature photography exhibit will be up until June 2nd. On Monday March 13th, the Network is having an advocacy day in Albany to discuss the importance of community health centers with electeds’ offices because “everyone gets seen.” On March 25th, Ryan Chelsea is doing its first Kiki Ball, primarily focused on the LGBT Community for people of color from 6 to 10pm at Yotel Hotel. Flyers available. The Network is also hosting a 50th anniversary gala on June 7th celebrating 50 years of service. Flyers also available.</p> |

| Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives | |
|---|---|
| Andrew Lombardi for BP Gale Brewer | <p>Mr. Lombardi encouraged community board members who are reapplying for board membership to attend the group interview on March 2nd from 6-8pm at BP office, 1 Center St, 19th Floor. This year the interview is board specific and all members who are reapplying are strongly encouraged to attend the CB4 session on March 2nd. The make up session is March 14th from 6-8pm, same location. The make-up session will not be board specific. Members should also arrive early to get thru security as a guest.</p> <p>Mr. Lombardi reported that the Westside workshop re L-Train shutdown had 500 attendees. MTA, DOT, BP Brewer and other elected officials were present to hear the community’s concerns. Important takeaways: anticipated increased congestion on 13th and 15th Streets, seniors put at risk by increased bike usage, disabled community losing access to transportation and travel, delivery to small businesses being adversely affected. There is an upcoming Eastside L-Train workshop at Town and Village Synagogue 334 E 14th Street on March 9th 7-9pm.</p> <p>The BP and the Public Advocate and a few anti-violence grassroots organizations are working together to offer a bystander intervention (safety) training on March 13th at John Jay College, 524 W 59th Street, in response to the spike in hate crimes in NYC and around the country. The session will include information about how to safely intervene in situations and how to get the authorities involved when you are concerned about the safety of a “neighbor.”</p> <p>BP Brewer is involved in two bills: (1) Increasing construction site safety: BP Brewer and Councilmember Jumaane Williams have introduced a bill in NYCC to increase penalties and fines for major violations of the NYC Building Code’s site safety provisions on construction sites. The hope is that developers will stop viewing construction workers’ injuries as a cost of doing business. (2) Keeping affordable groceries affordable: BP Brewer and Councilmember Cory Johnson are working on a bill that proposes to exempt affordable supermarket from commercial rent tax. BP Brewer testified recently at a hearing on commercial rent tax and said that this proposed exemption will keep small businesses alive. Mr. Lombardi also explained further that the overall goal is to include as many affordable grocery stores as possible in the definition of “affordable.”</p> |
| Gaby Dann-Allel for Assembly | <p>Ms. Dann-Allel explained that AM Gottfried held two hearings, one in Manhattan and one in Albany, on home care workforce, which consists of providers and workers who perform in-home care services to the elderly, disabled, and chronically ill. Those who testified</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Member Richard Gottfried</p> | <p>include patients, providers, and workers regarding obstacles associated with training and recruiting of workers. The in-home care industry is facing major shortage in the workforce due to low pay rates. The low pay scale is a result of the inadequacy of Medicaid’s Managed Care Plan. AM Gottfried will be fighting for a significant increase of Managed Care Plan payments by Medicaid in this budget season, given that there will also likely be federal cuts.</p> <p>Ms. Dann-Allel also announced that AM Gottfried and SS Liz Krueger are sponsoring a town hall meeting titled “Fighting for Your Health – Protecting & Expanding Healthcare Access & Reproductive Freedom in the Era of Trump” on Saturday March 4th from 2:30 to 5pm at CUNY Graduate Center, Elebach Recital Hall at 365 Fifth Avenue (btw 34th & 35th). SS Krueger will be moderating a panel with AM Gottfried, Elisabeth Benjamin of Community Service Society, and Elizabeth Adams of Planned Parenthood of NY.</p> |
| <p>Edgar Yu for District Attorney</p> | <p>Mr. Yu told the Board that MDA Vance announced the investment of \$45.9 million to create and construction of five “Youth Opportunity Hubs,” a first-of-its-kind effort to knit together community-based providers and build new physical spaces for young people in target Manhattan neighborhoods, and an additional \$12 million investment to help existing organization specializing in family and youth development expand their capacity and develop innovative new services. In response to questions by board members, Mr. Yu explained that these monies were recovered by the MDA’s office as result of a settlement with a bank who violated U.S. sanctions and that the MDA Office used a RFP process to determine best use of the recovered monies and it is a part of the MDA’s Criminal Justice Investment Initiative (CJII).</p> <p>Mr. Yu also mentioned that the MDA office has a paid intern program for sophomore/juniors/seniors in high school and are accepting applications through March 15th. All residents and students who are sophomore/juniors/seniors in high school in Manhattan are eligible to apply. The 6-week intensive program gives young people clear understanding of how the MDA office works and how the criminal justice system works. Students will receive a stipend of \$150 per week.</p> |
| <p>Eric Holguin City Comptroller for Scott Stringer</p> | <p>Mr. Holguin announced that Comptroller Stringer and a coalition of 40 institutional investors (representing \$11 trillion in assets) stood up against TX’s transgender bathroom bill. Letters were sent to the Governor, LT Governor, and the Speaker in TX by the group to explain that the bill is bad for business and retention of talent in TX. Many TX LGBT organizations welcome the support from NY.</p> <p>Mr. Holguin announced that NYC Comptroller Stringer will host an Irish Community Breakfast at the Municipal Building in the Comptroller’s Board Room, 1 Center Street, 5th Floor.</p> |

| <p align="center">Board Reports & Business</p> | |
|---|--|
| <p>Adoption of Agenda and Minutes</p> | <p>The Agenda was amended and approved with Item 16 tabled and new business Item 22 added. The February minutes were approved unanimously.</p> |
| <p>District Manager Report</p> | <p>Highlights of the meetings attend by DM on behalf of the board and upcoming events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attended the roll out of the new Neighborhood Coordination Officers for the 10th Precinct (see its Facebook page) • CB4 held its “Office Hours” with NYC Business Solutions and helped over 12 groups get information and advice on how to start their small business. |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next Small Business Event will be a Commercial Lease Workshop on Thursday, March 16th at Hudson Yards/Hell’s Kitchen Alliance BID Office at 412 West 42nd Street. It is highly recommended that those interested RSVP for the event, 51 businesses have already signed up. • HDFC Forum held on Tuesday, March 7th at 6:30pm at Local 802, 322 West 48th Street. <p>Board Business</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Waterfront, Parks, and Environment - Thursday, March 9th – BACK TO OLD LOCATION – Friends of the Highline, 820 Washington Street • Business Licenses & Permits – Tuesday, March 14th at a NEW LOCATION – Yotel Hotel 570 10th Ave (41st), 4th Floor |
| Board Chair Report | <p>Ms. Rubin provided highlights of her activities on behalf of the Board:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-chairs of Waterfront, Parks, and Environment met with Vornado to discuss the recertification of Pier 92/94. • Hosted by Councilmember Corey Johnson’s office, Ms. Rubin and others met with HPD and DOB meeting re illegal demolition and loss of affordability housing within CB4. The meeting was productive and clarified some issues. The group together developed some proactive methods to avoid the problem in future. • Westside L-Train shut down meeting had 500 attendees. Our Transportation co-chairs attended an additional conversation on what our community can expect from the shutdown. • Ms. Rubin and members of the HKLU committee met with a developer who is interested in building affordable housing in our community. |

| Action Items | Motions, Amendments, & Comments | Result |
|---|---|---------------------------|
| Business License and Permits Committee (BLP) | | |
| Item 1: Letter to SLA re 1 Pier 76, Hudson River Park (36/12) – CCC NFP, Inc | Items 1-4, 6-11 were bundled. | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 2: Letter to SLA re 206 9 th Avenue (22/23) – Aroka Hospitality, LLC d/b/a Aroqa | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 3: Letter to SLA re 587 9 th Avenue (42/43) – Panatha Chicken LLC | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 4: Letter to SLA re 400 W 23 rd Street (9 th) – The Rail Line Diner | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 5: Letter to SLA re 305 W 46 th Street (8/46) – Riu Plaza New York Times Square Hotel | Amendment suggested and accepted to change the letter to say “ deny until ” as related to hotel owner’s violation of a deed restriction, which was agreed to as part of a CURE | Passed Unanimously |

| | | |
|---|---|---------------------------|
| | negotiation with HHHS. A factual history will be included as amendment. | |
| Item 6: Letter to SLA re 826 10 th Avenue (54/55) – Catered by Pergola d/b/a Gardenia Terrace | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 7: Letter to SLA re 603 W 45 th Street (11/12) – Imperial Club LLC d/b/a Executive Club | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 8: Letter to SLA re 329 W 51 st Street (8/9) – 329 Bleecker Corp. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 9: Letter to SLA re 750 9 th Avenue (50/51) – Hell’s Kitchen Thai, Inc. d/b/a Esanation | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 10: Letter to SLA re 165 W 23 rd Street (6/7) – Excellent Dumpling House, Inc. | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 11: Letter to SLA re 830 9 th Avenue (56) – Thong Sook Corporation | | Passed Unanimously |
| Arts, Culture, Education, and Street Life Committee (ACES) | | |
| Item 12: Letter to School Construction Authority re Outstanding Items of Concern for Five Year Capital Plan | Items 12 and 13 were bundled. Friendly amendments suggested | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 13: Letter to CEC District 2 re Collaborating with Neighboring Community Boards on School Based Initiatives | | Passed Unanimously |
| Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (C/HKLU) | | |
| Item 14: Letter to HPD re 317-319 West 35 th Street | Items 14 and 15 were bundled. | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 15: Letter to HPD and DCP re 646-666 11 th Avenue | | Passed Unanimously |
| Transportation Committee (TRANS) | | |
| Item 16: Letter to PANYNJ re Bus Staging on 11th Avenue btw 40th and 41st Streets – TABLED | | - |
| Item 17: Letter to PANYNJ re study of additional transit options in relation to replacement of bus terminal | Name of item amended. | Passed Unanimously |
| New Business | | |

| | | |
|---|------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Item 18: CLU letter to BSA re PCE application for Rumble gym located at 144 W 23 rd Street | | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 19: CLU letter to Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer re Planning for Penn Station redevelopment | Friendly amendment suggested | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 20: CLU letter to NJ Transit re Hudson Tunnel project | Friendly amendment suggested | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 21: Letter to Mayor deBlasio re CB4 response to Mayor's Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2018 | Friendly amendment suggested | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 22: Letter to HPD re lack of compliance by RIU Plaza New York Times Square Hotel for Clinton Special District CURE Agreement | | Passed Unanimously |

| Meeting Resolution | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| Adjournment | 8:38 PM Meeting Adjourned |
| Next Meeting Date and Location | 6:30 PM April 5, 2017 Mount Sinai West 1000 10 th Avenue |

As recorded by Co-Secretary, Lily Fan

