



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD No. 4
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor
 New York, NY 10036
 tel: 212-736-4536
 fax: 212-947-9512
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	October 5, 2016
Meeting Time	6:30PM
Meeting Location	Mt. Sinai West 1000 Tenth Avenue Conference Room B
Meeting Audio Recording	Link

DELORES RUBIN
 Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
 District Manager

October 2016 Full Board Meeting Minutes

PUBLIC HEARING/ PRESENTATION	<p>Public Hearing: 532 West 20th Street Garage Special Permit for 10 Spaces.</p> <p>Betty Mackintosh, co-chair of the Chelsea Land Use Committee, opened the hearing and asked for public comments regarding the special permit that is the subject of Agenda Item 20. No speakers came forward and the hearing was closed.</p> <p>Presentation: Pumpkin Smash by NYC Compost Project.</p> <p>A representative from the Lower East Side Ecology Center announced this year's Pumpkin Smash event that will be held on November 5th at P.S. 11, located at 320 West 21st Street, from 11 AM – 2 PM. All pumpkins, jack-o-lanterns and gourds that are collected at the event will be turned into compost by the NYC Compost Project for use at City parks and green spaces.</p> <p>Presentation: A Vision for Penn Station by Vishaan Chakrabarti.</p> <p>Mr. Chakrabarti, the former chair of the Department of City Planning and founder of the architecture firm Practice for Architecture and Urbanism, presented an alternative plan to that of Governor Cuomo for the revamping of Penn Station. His plan would, among other things, move Madison Square Garden to the west end of the Farley building and repurpose the remaining shell of the Garden into a glass pavilion. The full details of Mr. Chakrabarti's plan, including the slides shown at the meeting, can be found in an opinion piece that was recently published in The New York Times: http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2016/09/30/opinion/penn-station-reborn.html</p>
---	---

Public Session	
Lilly Pollack	Ms. Pollack spoke for herself and others in her neighborhood against the DOT proposal to change 11th Avenue into a one-way street starting at 52nd Street. She likes the idea of a one-way street, but wants it to begin at 57th Street instead because of anticipated congestion at the intersection of 52nd Street caused by vehicles turning onto 11th to access the Lincoln Tunnel. The presence of many horse stables and a Citibike docking station on the block only add to the problem. In addition, the park between 56th and 57th Streets generates its own set of traffic problems, and they would be exacerbated by the proposed change in traffic flow.
Ed Gilligan	Mr. Gilligan is the principal of P.S. 111 on West 53rd Street. He noted that the school currently has 330 students, but that it can accommodate as many as 750. He mentioned the many pre-school and after-school programs that they have and noted the improvement in test

	scores this year, especially in the gifted-student program.
Phil Rosenthal	Mr. Rosenthal introduced himself to the community as a candidate for Congress in the 10th Congressional District, which includes Chelsea and Hell’s Kitchen. He is a lawyer who has never run for public office. His interests as a politician are public safety, national security, education and affordable housing.
Marla Dufrey	Ms. Dufrey is a public advocate for people with disabilities. She voiced her dismay with the kind of affordable housing being offered to those with physical disabilities who are confined to wheelchairs, in particular, the small apartments that do not allow for easy navigation. She also complained of the small vehicles used by Access-a-Ride and asked for the board’s help in getting them upgraded. Ms. Dufrey would also like to have a center for people with disabilities built in the community.
Jeffrey LeFrancois	Jeffrey, who also happens to be a member of CB4, spoke on behalf of the Meatpacking BID to announce Harvest Fest, which is a free community festival to be held in Hudson River Park at 14th Street on October 9th at 11 AM.
Holly Raner	Holly spoke on behalf of the HK 50-51 Block Association against the wine and beer license application of Takoyaki Bar, Item 6 on the Agenda. Their objection stems from the fact that the applicant allows large groups of people to wait at the bar for a seat at its adjoining establishment, Tutto Ramen. This creates noise and sidewalk congestion depicted in pictures that were distributed to the board. Ms. Raner also objected to the opening of Mont Blanc 52, Item 5 on the Agenda. She specifically noted that the location, which was previously occupied by another bar, has been a source of numerous noise complaints for a period of ten years. Residents do not want another mid-block bar in that location, but have conceded to closing hours of 11 PM on Sunday and Monday and 12:30 AM on all other nights, with no open doors at any time.
Richard Martinez	Mr. Martinez is the deputy site manager of the Chelsea Recreation Center located at 430 West 25th Street. He reminded everyone that the facility has a swimming pool, gym, dance room, computer lab, fitness rooms and runs various boot camps. There are also afterschool programs and a summer camp for neighborhood children. He spoke of a number of upcoming programs and new enrollment categories for veterans and people with disabilities.

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives	
Andrew Lombardi for Gale Brewer	<p>Andrew noted MBP Brewer’s involvement in the efforts to give the community a say in the plans for re-designing the Port Authority Bus Terminal. She will be similarly involved with any plans for Penn Station. He mentioned that the quality of life issues associated with the WiFi kiosks in the district have been mitigated, but that there are still issues going forward and discussions are in progress with LinkNYC and DoITT.</p> <p>MBP Brewer has given testimony in the previous week with respect to: 1) the deed restriction process utilized by the City; 2) low-income tenants right to counsel; 3) visible house numbers on buildings; and, 4) limiting sightseeing buses idling on the streets. She sent a letter to SAPO regarding its proposed street fair rule changes seeking an extension of the public comment deadline.</p> <p>Andrew mentioned a number of upcoming events that can be found on the MBP website at http://manhattanbp.nyc.gov/html/home/home.shtml</p>

Robert Atterbury for Jerrold Nadler	<p>Robert discussed the Congressman’s work in ensuring that the community is allowed more involvement in the proposals for the new Port Authority Bus Terminal. He noted that the Congressman led a walkout from a Republican panel that he believed was designed to concoct evidence to suppress women’s issues and Planned Parenthood. Mr. Nadler joined other House Democrats in a request to the Department of Justice for an investigation of the Trump Foundation’s political contributions in the Florida attorney general political race.</p>
Eli Szenez-Strauss for Brad Hoylman	<p>Eli spoke of the Senator’s continued efforts to prevent a new Port Authority Bus Terminal from destroying parts of Hell’s Kitchen. He announced the free flu shot program that is available in his office and that the State Department of Financial Services would be covering the costs associated with the recent bombing in Chelsea that are not covered by insurance.</p>
Gabriel Dann-Allel for Richard Gottfried	<p>Gabby acknowledged the crucial role that CB4 played in the new planning process for the Bus Terminal. She noted that the Assemblyman testified before the City Council in favor of a bill to provide legal assistance to low-income tenants in Housing Court. She announced a public forum that will address the impact of the Mt. Sinai-Beth Israel downsizing that will be held on October 27th at the Beth Israel site.</p>
Erica Overton for Linda Rosenthal	<p>Erica announced that the Assemblymember won re-election on September 13th and is in step with the other elected officials in the district on Bus Terminal issues. Ms. Rosenthal wrote a letter to the Department of Buildings opposing amnesty for landlords who have outstanding ECB violations. She asked the DOB to answer her questions as to why they would allow such a thing in view of the amount of effort that went into obtaining violations in the first place.</p>
Matt Green for Corey Johnson	<p>Matt referred to Councilman Johnson’s monthly board report that can be found on his website http://www.coreyjohanson.nyc/</p> <p>The Councilman, along with MBP Brewer and Senator Brad Hoylman, organized a “Small Business Crawl” along West 23rd Street in response to the bombing that occurred on September 17th. The event was intended to assure the businesses in the area that the City was working to restore their environment and wellbeing.</p> <p>Matt went on to highlight developments regarding the Bus Terminal. He announced the kick-off of this year’s Participatory Budgeting Program on September 17th that was held on the High Line. More events have been scheduled, so he asked that we sign up to attend. He noted the Councilman’s bill to expand the licensing requirements of sightseeing buses to include a requirement that they submit their schedules to the Department of Consumer Affairs. He also noted that Mr. Johnson had a bill pasted to require reports on people leaving the correctional system who are in need of mental health services.</p>
Eric Holguin for Scott Stringer	<p>After a review of anti-discrimination laws by the Comptroller, he found that City and State agencies are not expressly prohibited from discriminating against women, minorities and LGBTQ individuals when considering bids on procurement contracts. This led to his collaboration with various City and State elected officials to introduce legislation that would expand anti-discrimination protections to every business owner in New York.</p> <p>The Comptroller also proposed tripling the City’s earned income tax credit contribution from 5% to 15% of the Federal tax credit. He estimates that this will lift 15,000 families out of poverty and inject millions of dollars into the local community. This increase requires changes in State law and action by the City.</p>

Board Reports & Business

Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	The Agenda and September minutes were approved unanimously.
District Manager Report	<p>Jesse Bodine gave his thanks to all of the agencies and officials who quickly responded to the needs of the community after the bombing in Chelsea, and he noted in particular the wonderful job done by the Office of Emergency Services.</p> <p>With respect to board business, he asked everyone to check the CB4 website for a number of date and place changes of committee meetings in October so as to avoid any quorum issues. He noted that the full board would be voting at the November meeting on the statement of district needs and budget requests for FY2018. All members should refer to the documents that he provides via email if they have any questions or wish to add more items. He also noted that two fellows from Columbia and Hunter College were at work now, one on the Bus Terminal project and the other on a special building demolition project. He announced a new John Jay College fellow who is working on the affordable housing section of the CB4 website.</p>
Board Chair Report	<p>Delores Rubin indicated that most of her work during the past month had to do with the Port Authority Bus Terminal “reset.” She noted that the working group and fellow have been active on the project with a view to preparing something by December that will be presented to the community at a public forum or other mechanism seeking its input for inclusion in further discussions.</p> <p>Delores commended the members of the Transportation Committee for proposing a solution to a problem presented by Mt. Sinai West having to do with its ambulances facing delays due a change in traffic patterns. The proposal is the subject of Agenda Item 17.</p>

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 1: Letter to SLA re 353 W. 57th Street (8/9) – 58th Street Bar Company LLC & Hudson Leaseco LLC d/b/a Hudson Common; Henry; Tequila Park; Hudson Lodge	All matters 1-4 & 7-12 bundled.	Passed Unanimously
Item 2: Letter to SLA re 353 W. 57th Street (8/9) – Hudson Leaseco LLC d/b/a Hudson; Good Units		Passed Unanimously
Item 3: Letter to SLA re 401 W. 53rd Street (9/10) – Saint Neot LLC d/b/a Gloria Restaurant		Passed Unanimously
Item 4: Letter to SLA re 501 W. 51st Street (NWC 10th Ave) – Il Melograno LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 5: Letter to SLA re 344-346 W. 52nd Street (8/9) – Montafon LLC d/b/a Mont Blanc 52		Passed Unanimously

Item 6: Letter to SLA re 366 W. 52nd Street (8/9) – Mission 52 Inc. d/b/a Takoyaki Bar		Passed Unanimously
Item 7: Letter to SLA re 346-354 W. 40th Street (8/9) – NYHK West 40th LLC/346 West 40th Restaurant LLC d/b/a Doubletree by Hilton Magnolia Lounge/Lovage Rooftop		Passed 36; 1 Opposed
Item 8: Letter to SLA re 320 W. 36th Street (8/9) – The Great American, LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 9: Letter to SLA re 318 W. 51st Street (8/9) – GBCB LLC d/b/a The Washington Jefferson Hotel		Passed Unanimously
Item 10: Letter to SLA re 261-271 11th Avenue, Building #9 (27) – NY Farm Brew LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 11: Letter to SLA re 536 W. 30th Street (10/11) – Trenta LLC d/b/a Via Trenta Pizzoteca		Passed Unanimously
Item 12: Letter to SLA re 210-212 10th Avenue (22/23) – 210 Empire LLC		Passed Unanimously
Arts, Culture, Education and Street Life (ACES)		
Item 13: Letter to SAPO re Women’s Building Block Party (September 24 th) – For Ratification		Passed Unanimously
Housing Health and Human Services (HH&HS)		
Item 14: Letter to HPD regarding 517-525 West 45th Street Cure – For Ratification		Passed Unanimously
Transportation (TRANS)		
Item 15: Letter to DOT re 8th and 9th Ave. Split Leading Pedestrian Intervals	Friendly amendment accepted.	Passed Unanimously
Item 16: Letter to DOT re 11th Avenue Changes – West 34th-West 57th Streets		Passed Unanimously
Item 17: Letter to DOT re Ambulance only lane on 59th Street (9/10 Avenues)		Passed Unanimously
Item 18: Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Safety at 56th Street and 12th Avenue		Passed Unanimously
Item 19: Letter to DOT/DCA re Sightseeing Bus Legislation	Friendly amendment accepted.	Passed Unanimously
New Business (NB)		
Item 20: Letter to BSA re 532 West 20th Street Garage Special Permit for 10 Spaces – For Ratification		Passed 26; 10 Opposed; 1 Abstained
Item 21: Letter to Meatpacking BID re Accepting Invitation to join Westside Coalition	Motion to table.	Tabled
Item 22: Letter to SAPO re Proposed rule changes to street events	Friendly amendment accepted.	Passed Unanimously

Item 23: Letter to Letter to City Speaker re need for oversight hearing on LPC – Referred back to Committee		N/A
--	--	-----

Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU), Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (C/HKLU), Waterfronts, Parks and Environment Committee (WPE), and Executive Committee (EXEC)		
No items to report.		

Meeting Resolution	
Adjournment	9:10 PM Meeting Adjourned
Next Meeting Date and Location	6:30PM November 2, 2016 Fulton Center Auditorium, 119 9 th Avenue

VOTING KEY																									
Y=Yes																									
N=No																									
A=Abstain																									
PNE=Present, not eligible																									
- = No vote																									
ATTENDANCE																									
Key																									
P=Present																									
Ab=Absent																									
E=Excused																									
		ATTENDANCE	1. Letter to SLA re 353 W. 57th Street (8/9) - 58th Street Bar Company LLC & Hudson Leaseco LLC d/b/a Hudson Common; Henry; Tequila Park; Hudson.Landco	2. Letter to SLA re 353 W. 57th Street (8/9) - Hudson Leaseco LLC d/b/a Hudson; Good Units	3. Letter to SLA re 401 W. 53rd Street (9/10) - Saint Neat LLC d/b/a Gloria Restaurant	4. Letter to SLA re 501 W. 51st Street (NWC 10th Ave) - Il Melograno LLC	5. Letter to SLA re 344-346 W. 52nd Street (8/9) - Montafon LLC d/b/a Mont Blanc 52	6. Letter to SLA re 366 W. 52nd Street (8/9) - Mission 52 Inc. d/b/a Takoyaki Bar	7. Letter to SLA re 346-354 W. 40th Street (8/9) - NYHK West 40th LLC/346 West 40th Restaurant LLC d/b/a Doubletree by Hilton Magnolia Lounge/Lowage Rooftop	8. Letter to SLA re 320 W. 36th Street (8/9) - The Great American, LLC	9. Letter to SLA re 318 W. 51st Street (8/9) - GBCB LLC d/b/a The Washington Jefferson Hotel	10. Letter to SLA re 261-271 11th Avenue, Building #9 (27) - NY Farm Brew LLC	11. Letter to SLA re 536 W. 30th Street (10/11) - Trentia LLC d/b/a Via Trentia Pizzoteca	12. Letter to SLA re 210-212 10th Avenue (22/23) - 210 Empire LLC	13. Letter to SAPO re Women's Building Block Party (September 24th) - RATIFICATION	14. Letter to HPD regarding 517-525 West 45 Street Cure - RATIFICATION	15. Letter to DOT re 8th and 9th Ave. Split Leading Pedestrian Intervals	16. Letter to DOT re 11th Avenue Changes - W34-W57 Streets	17. Letter to DOT re Ambulance only lane on 59th Street (9/10 Avenues)	18. Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Safety at 56th Street and 12th Avenue	19. Letter to DOT/DCA re Sightseeing Bus Legislation	20. Letter to BSA re 532 West 20th Street Garage Special Permit for 10 Spaces - RATIFICATION	21. Letter to Meeting BID re Accepting Invitations to join Westside Coalition - TABLED	22. Letter to SAPO re Proposed rule changes to street events	23. Letter to City Speaker re need for oversight hearing on LPC - REFERRED BACK TO COMMITTEE
P / Y	37	37	37	36	37	36	36	36	36	37	37	37	37	36	36	37	37	37	37	37	26	0	35	0	
Ab / N	13	0	0	1	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9	0	0	0	
E / A	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	1	0	
PNE	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Charles S. Bayor	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	A	Y	
Mathew Bergman	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	B	Y	
Andrea Bernard	A																								
Christine Berthet	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	L	Y	
Gwen Billig	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	L	Y	
Yoni Boksor	A																								
Liam Buckley	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Lee Compton	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Angel Cortes	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Dale Corvino	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Judith Dahill	A																								
Barbara Davis	A																								
Maarten de Kadt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Sarah Desmond	A																								
Pete Diaz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Tina DeFelicantonio	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Lily Fan	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Brett Firfer	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
David Holowka	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Frank Holozubiec	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Inge Ivchenko	A																								
Lowell Kern	A																								
Burt Lazarin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Christopher LeBron	P	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	T	Y	
Jeffrey LeFrancois	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Bruce MacAffer	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Betty Mackintosh	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Walter Mankoff	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Morgan McLean	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Ambur Nicosia	A																								
Michael Noble	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	B	Y	
J.D. Noland	A																								
Austin Ochoa	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Maria Ortiz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Allen Oster	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Oscar Paqoada	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Brad Pascarella	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Rhonda Patillo	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
Joseph Reigadas	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	T	Y	
Joe Restuccia	A																								
Delores Rubin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T	Y	
Yvonna Russell	A																								
John Sharp	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	B	Y	
Didi Skaff	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Brian Sokal	A																								
David Solnick	A																								
Ken Stewart	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	
Martin Treat	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	E	Y	
James Wallace	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	D	Y	
David Warren	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	D	Y	