



CITY OF NEW YORK
**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
 BOARD No. 4**
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor
 New York, NY 10036
 tel: 212-736-4536
 fax: 212-947-9512
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	Wednesday, November 2, 2016
Meeting Time	6:30 p.m.
Meeting Location	Fulton Center Auditorium 119 Ninth Avenue (17/18 Street)
Meeting Audio Recording	LINK

DELORES RUBIN
 Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
 District Manager

November 2016 Full Board Meeting Minutes

Presentation	
NYC Business Solutions	<p>Vivek Varajaman is the Center Director of NYC Business Solutions Lower Manhattan Center, located at 70 John Street, 2nd Floor. NYC Business Solutions is a NY City government initiative. He gave an overview of and promoted NYC Business Solutions' services. The Center's hours are M-F, 9am to 5pm. Walk ins, calls and emails are welcome.</p> <p>NYC Business Solutions offers 9 core services to all small business owners: business courses, legal assistance, financing assistance, navigating government, recruitment, training grants, selling to government, MWBE certification. For more info, check out: http://www.nyc.gov/html/sbs/nycbiz/html/summary/summary.shtml</p> <p>On December 6, from 3-5pm, at the CB4 office (330 West 42nd Street, Suite 2601), CB4 and NYC Business Solutions will host one-on-one consultations and discuss free services offered by City of New York to entrepreneurs of all sectors and stages. Interested persons should make appointments to secure a place, walk-ins are welcome based on availability.</p>
Jamestown Chelsea Market	<p>Michael Phillips, President of Jamestown, provided an update on Jamestown's community outreach programs. Jamestown's rezoning agreement calls for 75% of the interior of Chelsea Market to be food related. In the past three years, Jamestown has increased the number of food businesses from 25 to 50. 100% of new retailers in 2016 are food related. Jamestown has made tremendous effort to increase ethnic cuisines and push for presence of raw meat and fresh seafood retailers. A lower concourse is being created at Chelsea Market to focus on grocery options to make it easier for local community members to shop. There will also be additional entrances on both W15th and W16th Streets to make access easier. Jamestown has made culinary scholarships available to CB4 community members via Fulton Houses, Corlears School, Hudson Guild. Jamestown has also focused on wellness in schools by educating staff and students on nutrition in schools. Jamestown has been very active at PS 11 and Hudson River Park. Jamestown has contributed over \$125,000 over three years in the wellness in schools effort. To date, Jamestown has contributed over \$600,000 to the community to build a Tech-Up lab in partnership with Google at Fulton Houses on W17th Street @9th Avenue, managed by the Hudson Guild. At least 120 teens have been through the Jamestown Tech-Up program and have become more prepared for the 21st century job market. Jamestown welcomes feedback on quality of the program. Funding in 2017 for the program is</p>

	<p>expected to exceed \$200,000. In response to CB4 members’ questions, Mr. Phillips said that there is a third floor space earmarked for community programs in association with the High Line Park anticipated for 2017 or 2018. Jamestown has a summer internship program for residents of Fulton Houses. Jamestown also has a leadership program for minority women working their way up in culinary industry that comes with mentorship and scholarship program to help place women in high-end restaurants to promote their opportunity.</p>
--	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Public Hearing	
-----------------------	--

Budget Task Force	<p>Statement of district needs and budget requests for FY 2018</p> <p>Lowell Kern, Chair of Budget Task Force, explained that the hearing concerns CB4’s statement of district needs and budget requests for FY 2018. No one signed up to speak at this hearing. Hearing closed without further community input.</p>
-------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Public Session	
-----------------------	--

Susan Lahn	<p>Ms. Lahn purchased her home in the special Clinton district because it is a neighborhood like West Village/UWS with shops and without large buildings. Ms. Lahn is concerned about the empty storefronts on 9th Avenue. Perhaps due to the high rents demanded by landlords, many local small service businesses have closed (ie. fish store, grocery store, shoemaker, supermarket, toy store). Ms. Lahn suggested that there are too many restaurants and bars. Ms. Lahn’s point is that commercial rents are too high; and only bars can afford the high rent. Ms. Lahn said that we cannot have a neighborhood that is intended for homes and affordable housing to be so heavily focused on liquor licensed businesses.</p>
------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Anita McDonagh	<p>Ms. McDonagh spoke on behalf of Silvette Sein, a resident who lives above Rise Bar at 859 9th Avenue. She quoted from a Nov 1 email from Ms. Sein: “I managed to get Ted Arenas (owner of Rise Bar) last night and asked him to lower the music...” Ms. Sein felt intimidated by Mr. Arenas as he has been harassing her. “If Rise has made any effort to quiet down and be a part of the community ...then I can potentially begin to side with their claims. As it stands, Rise wants to be a nightclub. They have managed to disrupt our daily lives constantly, not just with noise, but with crowds and lines, waiting to get into their establishment, lingering outside and smoking. I have attached an image. I could clearly hear the show last night, called 311, but they finally ended it at 2:30am.” Ms. McDonagh agreed with Ms. Sein that Rise is not a neighborhood bar, but a nightclub pretending to be a lounge. From Rise Bar’s information on Yelp, they allow dancing and singing, which the operators say they do not. Ms. McDonagh does not support Rise Bar’s pending application for later closing hours.</p>
----------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Wayne Kawadler	<p>Mr. Kawadler is the Director of Community Outreach at Lenox Health Greenwich Village, located at 30 7th Avenue (btw W12th and W13th) and told the community of Lenox Health’s services. Halloween weekend is usually their busiest and the facility’s Emergency Room is glad to be available to keep the community safe. There are also 4 November dates when free flu shots will be offered: November 8 Tuesday 1-4pm; November 12 Saturday 10am-1pm; November 14 Monday 1-4pm; November 17 Thursday 4-7pm (see flyer in the back).</p>
----------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Grace Tursi	Ms. Tursi spoke about the new Northwell Health Imaging Center at Lenox Health Greenwich Village, which opened on July 6, 2016 at 200 West 13 th Street (@7 th Avenue), 5 th Floor. The facility is open Monday to Saturday. Their imaging services include: MRI, CT, Ultrasound, X-Ray, bone density, full range of biopsies and therapeutic procedures, breast imaging, mammography, 3D tomosynthesis, breast ultrasound, breast MRI etc. The Center combines the skill of fellowship-trained, subspecialized radiologists (from Lenox Hospital) with advance imaging techniques and equipment. We are providing 3D mammography for breast cancer awareness month. Walk ins are available and there is no cost as long as there is insurance authorization. Anyone is welcome to tour the facilities.
Inge Ivchenko	Ms. Ivchenko, a member of CB4's ACES Committee, spoke on behalf of David Nolan and Noreen Bray of the David Nolan Art Gallery, located at W29th btw 10 and 11 th Avenues. The Gallery has been at this location for over 8 years. Ms. Ivchenko read a prepared statement from the gallery owners: "In the last 18 months, the construction activity on the block has increased to such extreme levels that it makes it difficult to operate a business. The gallery is now situated in an active construction zone. There are currently no less than 6 construction and/or demolition sites [on the block]. The construction has significantly decreased the foot traffic that the gallery has received, which is a vital component of our success. Due to frequent street closings, crane activity, loud and disruptive construction noise, debris across all the sites, and chronic littering site in front of 517 W 29 th Street. People do not visit our gallery. ... Jesse Bodine has reached out to all the relevant agencies but the problem has persisted."
Linda Ashley	Ms. Ashley spoke on behalf of the West 44th Street Better Block Association. She thanked the Board for its good work. She urged members to vote "Yes" on Item #8 and Item #12. She also spoke about Pier 84. She has sent a petition to MBP Gale Brewer seeking to keep original vendor, PD O'Hurley's in the space. She feels like having a local small business in the space will keep it special and original and is an asset for the neighborhood. The HRT RFP outlined a plan for food trucks on Pier 84, which Ms. Ashley does not agree with.
Kevin Callaghan	Mr. Callaghan is a resident at 350 W 57 th Street, Park Vandome. He spoke in opposition to Rise Bar's application to extend its hours. He questioned why the Hell's Kitchen community needs another bar to operate until 4am. Mr. Callaghan said he thinks allowing this application will set a terrible precedent for the community. Mr. Callaghan is concerned that at the committee meeting, the applicant suggested that they are suffering economically. To the Board Members who plans to vote Yes, Mr. Callaghan wishes for them to stand up and state why we think they have an economic hardship and be allowed to stay open until 4am.
Jonathan Kirkland	Mr. Kirkland has lived in NYC for 8 years, and in Hell's Kitchen for 5. He spoke in support of Rise Bar's application. He said that Rise is different from all other gay bars; the sense of community that Rise offers is second to none. In response to Mr. Callaghan's point, Mr. Kirkland does not think its fair for Rise to not be able to compete with other establishments who are open until 4. When he goes out, Mr. Kirkland definitely takes into consideration whether he can stay out until 2am or 4am. When my friends go to Rise Bar and leave at 2am, they are also going home and not contributing to sales in the neighborhood.
Josh Babigan	Mr. Babigan seconded Mr. Kirkland's observations about Rise Bar in support of its application to extend until 4am. Mr. Babigan also suggested that for those who work at Rise Bar on a tip basis. Closing at 2am means they lose two hours of hourly wage and two hours worth of tip. Mr. Babigan asked the board members to please keep this in mind when they vote.
Manuel Franjo	Mr. Franjo lives on 56 btw 9 th and 10 th Aves and spoke in support of Rise Bar. Mr. Franjo said that

	<p>he does not go to many bars in general. The opening of Rise Bar is a big release for him and he gets to see a lot of his friends, which he doesn't get to do often. It is disappointing that patrons have to leave at 2am. It is not fair for them [Rise Bar] and the community who goes to Rise Bar because a few people oppose the later hours. Rise Bar's business suffers as a result. If the community wishes to address the issues going on the block, Mr. Franjo pointed out that there are two public high schools on the block on W56th and there are drug dealers, break ins, street harassment, and a murder. There is no police presence on W56th. The problem is not Rise Bar.</p>
Emmanuel X. Ramirez	<p>Mr. Ramirez echoed the sentiments of the few in support of Rise Bar who spoke before him. Mr. Ramirez has lived in New York for 40 years. Moved to W57th btw 8th and 9th in August. Mr. Ramirez said that he chose to live in this area because of the bars and restaurants and supports Rise Bar's 4am close.</p>
Chris Costello	<p>Mr. Costello lives at 400 W 56th Street – the residential building where Rise Bar is. Mr. Costello is opposed to a 4am close for Rise Bar. Mr. Costello said that the building has had problems with the sound traveling from Rise Bar to the apartments since the bar opened. It is affecting apartments on the third and fourth floor. Mr. Costello pointed out that the building is residential, with a nightclub on the ground floor. He said that there is a PA system in the space with subwoofers for dancing. If one looks at Rise's website/FB page, one will see that they advertise for open-mic nights, karaoke, and there are piano performances. The Southside of Mr. Costello's building is affected by the sound; the Northside is affected by the foot traffic in the alleyway. Mr. Costello is also thankful to the Board for the document that the office prepared regarding other activities in the building that may be criminal.</p>
Christopher Mederes	<p>Mr. Mederes is a bartender at Rise Bar and spoke in support of the Rise Bar application. Mr. Mederes recently moved into Apartment 1F, the apartment directly above the bar – “my floor is their ceiling.” Mr. Mederes noted that the noise is not noticeable and the sound has not been an issue for Rise. The two extended hours would make a difference for Mr. Mederes' income.</p>
Michael Collins	<p>Mr. Collins spoke in support of Rise Bar staying open until 4am. Mr. Collins said that Rise Bar is a beautifully decorated space that NYC and Hell's Kitchen would want to have. The outside is always kept clean and sidewalk is immaculate. Mr. Collins said as a business owner, Rise Bar is the type of business that the community should have and want.</p>
Phillip Wiehurst	<p>Mr. Wiehurst has been a resident of Hell's Kitchen for 10 years. He echoed the gentlemen who spoke before him. He is in support of Rise Bar staying open until 4am. He said that he does not think it is a hindrance to the community at all and it actually helps the community, especially those who work and live in Hell's Kitchen.</p>
Nick Rubertas	<p>Mr. Rubertas is the audio engineer for Rise Bar and the units above. He spoke in support of Rise Bar's extending hours application. Mr. Rubertas designed the sound equipment in the space and he stated that NY State law requires that the sound levels be under 42db and Rise Bar is at 38db. Rise Bar makes sure that they are within the legal limit and Mr. Rubertas said he has more problems with garbage trucks and fire trucks in the area when he is working there than the noise from Rise.</p>
Benjamin Savitsky	<p>Mr. Savitsky from the law firm of Bernstein Redo P.C. spoke on behalf of the firm's client Rise Bar. Mr. Savitsky provided some background and explained that the pending SLA application from Rise Bar includes a plan to change the closing hours on Thursdays, Fridays and Saturdays from 2am to 4am. This application was before the Board in 2014 and Rise Bar received approval for 4am close on weekends from both BLP Committee and the full board at the time. Subsequently, MBP Brewer sent</p>

	<p>a letter in objection to the SLA before the 2014 hearing and the hours were reduced to 2am seven days a week as a result. Rise Bar has been in operation for 1 year and there was a stipulation in 2014 that the operator can return to extend its hours at a later time, hence this application is being sought. Rise Bar is back here again with lots of strong community support, and also political support from MBP Gale Brewer (who has changed her mind), State Senator Brad Hoylman and City Councilmember Corey Johnson. Mr. Savitsky asked that the full board to please support BLP's recommendation to recommend approval of the application.</p>
Tyler Gomes	<p>Mr. Gomes has lived in Hell's Kitchen for about 8 years. Mr. Gomes said that he is in support of Rise Bar's application and he very proud of Rise Bar because they have seen the Bar from the beginning and its efforts to fight for survival. Mr. Gomes said that Rise Bar is beautiful and he has taken his mother there to bond with her. Mr. Gomes has shared his gay life with his mother at Rise; and he is here today on his own behalf and also on behalf of his mother who encouraged him to come to CB4 and speak up in support of Rise Bar's application.</p>
Marco Pernini	<p>Mr. Pernini lives in Hell's Kitchen and in support of Rise Bar's application. Mr. Pernini said that he doesn't go to bars except for Rise. In his opinion, Rise is stylish, friendly and is the only bar where he feels comfortable in. Rise treats their customers well. The only thing that he does not like is that Rise is not currently open until 4am. Extending its hours will be good for economy and for the staff who works there.</p>
Simba El-Asha	<p>Mr. El-Asha is the Head of Security of Rise Bar and is in support of Rise Bar closing at 4am. He has been in the bar business since 1997. Mr. El-Asha said that Rise is the "most easy bar to work for" because the clientele is sophisticated and we have the resource to treat everyone with dignity and respect.</p>
Brett Rieben	<p>Mr. Rieben spoke in support of Rise Bar's application. Mr. Rieben comes from a small town where it is not okay to be gay. When he moved to New York, he found Rise to be an amazing place where he feels accepted.</p>
Ted Arenas	<p>Mr. Arenas is the owner of Rise Bar. He said that this application for later weekend hours is not just about the financial disadvantage that Rise suffers in the Hell's Kitchen neighborhood, it also has to do with Rise's customers' wishes and the customers are part of the community. Rise's customers want to know why Rise has to close at 2am on Fridays and Saturdays. Rise has collected over 1000 signatures from the community/neighborhood in support of later hours. Today, Rise also brought as much support as it can. As far as working with the community, Rise has had some sound issues, which they have worked hard to address with the building owners and the sound levels are in fact under the legal limit. Rise believes that their customers are a part of the community and Mr. Arenas hopes that the application will be approved by the full board.</p>
Sarah Desmond	<p>Ms. Desmond is the Executive Director of Housing Conservation Coordinators announced that on Saturday, November 19, HCC and Westside Neighborhood Alliance and Gotham Riverside Block Project are hosting the all-day 11th Annual Westside Tenants' Conference at Fordham Law School (Fordham University School of Law at Lincoln Center, 150 W. 62nd Street at Columbus Ave.) from 930am to 4pm. There will be 10 workshops throughout the day on issues of tenants' rights, senior benefits, forum with CB4 reps, panel on illegal hotels. Event is free and serves free breakfast and lunch and neighbors are encouraged to attend.</p>

Lisa Wager	Ms. Wager is the Director of Government and Community Affairs at the Fashion Institute of Technology/SUNY on W27th Street btw 7 th and 8 th Avenues with residence hall on W31st btw 9 th Avenue and Dyer. She first wished to thank the electeds' offices for offering free flu shots to the community. She also told the community about FIT's public programming. This week, 60 illustration majors and alumni have returned to FIT to create original outdoor art and the created work will be up until end of the year as the annual temporary art display on the exterior walls of the Design Center, which fronts on 7 th Avenue and wraps around onto W28th Street. The student illustrators are chalking and painting the walls. The current exhibition in the downstairs gallery (open to public from Tuesdays to Saturdays) is Proust's Muse, the Countess Greffulhe, which is on display until January 7, 2017. The upstairs gallery is showing fashion by black fashion designers and over 60 garments are being shown. Finally, the Hot Topics courses introduced each semester are still available. There are over 210 non-credit intensive classes available. They range from single classes, to certificate programs, to customized corporate training sessions, hand-on courses covering brand management, computer technology, CAD, photoshop, aspects of fashion... Classes start at \$45 for single class, as low as \$9 per class.
Silvette Sein	Ms. Sein lives in the building right above Rise Bar and she spoke in opposition to Rise Bar's extension of hours to 4am. She said that she has spent the past calendar year working with Rise Bar on sound issues. There are lots of issues with lines and patrons singing and speaking loudly and screaming in the streets. She has a long work day, but needs to sleep. The music travels up the building and goes into her apartment and affects her ability to function. She supports the community and understands 2am but does not support 4am close.
Sean Hood	Mr. Hood lives directly above Rise Bar and spoke in support of Rise Bar's application. Mr. Hood said that the noise from Rise Bar has not been an issue for him; he sleeps soundly every night. He can hear the cars on the street. He said that he believes Rise is a beneficial addition to the community.
Alex []	Alex recently moved to Hell's Kitchen and spoke in support of Rise Bar's application. Alex feels like he has a great community at Rise Bar. He said that he does not feel like adding one more bar to 4am closing would make a drastic change to the neighborhood's late night culture.
Paul Eickel	Mr. Eickel has lived at 57 th and 9 th for more than 30 years. Mr. Eickel spoke on behalf of residents in the almost 600 units in his apartment building and all the residents in our neighborhood and declared that the community does not need another 4am closing if we want to avoid people on the streets in the early hours of the morning and therefore is opposed to Rise Bar's pending application. Mr. Eickel said that "the real community is the community: the people who live there are the community." Mr. Eickel said that he is happy that people have found an establishment that have a community of their desire, however, the longer Rise Bar patrons drink, the more disruptive they will be on the street in the neighborhood. He declared that a 4am closing does not benefit the neighborhood.

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives

State Assembly Member Richard Gottfried	A/M Gottfried discussed his legislative work relating to illegal hotels. In October, Governor Cuomo finally signed the AIRBNB bill sponsored by A/M Linda Rosenthal and S/S Liz Kreuger, which imposes fines on tenants or apartment owners who solicit or advertise an apartment as an illegal hotel.
------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

	<p>The Illegal Hotel Law A/M Gottfried sponsored in 2010 makes it clear that renting out a residential apartment for short-term transient use is against the law. The law is hard to enforce, because the violations all happen behind closed doors. This new law to impose fines for soliciting and advertising is therefore very important to strengthen the 2010 law. The new law has certain exceptions: it is allowable to sublet a portion of an occupied apartment and if an owner is renting a apartment in one/two family dwelling. Airbnb was heavily lobbying (with TV commercials) against the signing of this bill and has since filed a lawsuit. The City and State are looking to settle the suit narrowly. A recent federal law protects internet service carrier from being responsible for people breaking the law using the carrier. As a result, the State and City are agreeing to not hold Airbnb liable but will apply the law against the renting hosts who are in violation of the new law.</p> <p>A/M Gottfried also encouraged all in attendance to vote early on November 8 when there are shorter lines. He advised that if a person has moved or does not know where their assigned polling station is, his newsletter will provide the website where your polling place is and who is on the ballot.</p> <p>Please read about other issues that A/M Gottfried has been working on in his monthly newsletter.</p>
--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Board Reports & Business	
Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	November meeting agenda was adopted unanimously with removal of Items 10 and 19 (tabled). October 2016 minutes were approved unanimously.
District Manager Report	<p>Mr. Bodine had a busy month of October. He provided highlights of meetings attended by him on behalf of the Board in month of October.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At the Restaurant Row Working Group meeting, new information kiosk on W46th Street was discussed. • He had a meeting with Fresh Direct, which is now running a new one-hour delivery service (all bicycle, no car deliveries) headquartered at 630 W52nd Street. • Mr. Bodine continue to work with C/M Johnson’s office and residents of Park Vandome and the Sheffield, regarding Balsey Park and upgrades to the area. • Site visit with 10th Precinct and business owners regarding congestion on W39th Street and 11th Avenue. There was a discussion about rush hour traffic and Mr. Bodine will be working with the parties to submit requests for signaling and lane changes to hopefully relieve traffic. • Mr. Bodine attended the BP’s homeless forum. • Mr. Bodine provided testimony on behalf of CB4 at City Council Committee on Consumer Affairs regarding proposed changes to street vending permits and enforcement. • Mr. Bodine organized and ran the construction coordination meeting for 615 10th Avenue on W44th Street on the same block as PS51 and Beacon School. <p>Board Business:</p> <p>Office is closed on Tuesday Nov 8 for Election Day, Nov 11 for Veteran’s Day, Nov 24 for Thanksgiving.</p>
Board Chair Report	Ms. Rubin reported meetings regarding the Block 675 site with Georgetown developers and several meetings about Port Authority bus terminal and a working group meeting re PA. There

	<p>was a meeting about the U-Haul site and will be discussed at the Chelsea Land Use Committee.</p> <p>Howard Smith (a long time public member of CB4)'s wife passed away recently. CB4 will send a letter of condolences to the family on behalf of the Board.</p>
Nomination Report	<p>Chair of Nominating Committee, Christine Berthet, reported that all officer positions are NOT in contention and re-election of the current officers will take place at December full board meeting. The floor was opened for nomination and none were made.</p>
Special Report	<p>Lee Compton, Co-Chair of Chelsea Land Use Committee, attended the public hearing on Moynihan Station on the same evening.</p> <p>There were only 4 speakers:</p> <p>(1) Representative of MBP Brewer and SS Hoylman</p> <p>(2) Acting Deputy Chief of Infrastructure Amtrak</p> <p>(3) Executive VP of LIR</p> <p>(4) Tim Gill, who spoke as private citizen but is also former President of Moynihan Station Development Corp</p> <p>Mr. Compton spoke to Michael Evans, current President of the Development Corp. about the ability for Moynihan Station to move traffic out of Penn Station. The estimates are that 30,000 commuters will be moved from Penn Station to Moynihan daily. And regarding the relocation of MSG, Mr. Evans said that much discussed MSG move will likely not happen, in his opinion. Mr. Compton will be writing a letter on behalf of CB4 on the subject.</p>

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Business and Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 01: Letter to SLA re 859 9 th Avenue (55/56) – Rise Bar NYC LLC	<p>Friendly Amendment was proposed to include a mention of Rise Bar's method of operation in letter to SLA. This amendment was voted on as Item 1(a) and the motion passed.</p> <p>Subsequently, after much debate by board members, roll call was taken on the application as Item 1(b).</p>	<p>1(a): MOTION PASSED (34 IN SUPPORT; 3 OPPOSE; 2 ABSTAIN; 1 PRESENT BUT NOT ELIGIBLE)</p> <p>1(b): MOTION PASSED (20 IN SUPPORT; 18 OPPOSE; 1 ABSTAIN; 1 PRESENT BUT NOT ELIGIBLE)</p>
Item 02: Letter to SLA re 826 10 th Avenue (54/55) – Catered by Pergola, LLC	Bundled with 3-7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 03: Letter to SLA re 400 W 42 nd Street (42/Dyer Ave) – Parm 42 West LLC	Bundled with 2, 4-7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 04: Letter to SLA re 228 W 18 th Street (7/8) – El Cocotero Inc.	Bundled with 2, 3, 5-7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 05: Letter to SLA re 85 10 th Avenue (15/16) – L’ Atelier NYC LLC	Bundled with 2-4, 6, 7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 06: Letter to SLA re 160 8 th Avenue (17/18) – Entity to be formed by Thomas Kelly	Bundled with 2-5, 7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 07: Letter to SLA re 161 8 th Avenue (17/18) – 161 8 th Avenue Restaurant, LLC	Bundled with 2-7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Arts, Culture, Education, and Street Life Committee (ACES)		
Item 08: Letter to SAPO re Proposed changes to Street Event Rules – Ratified		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (C/HKLU)		
Item 09: Letter to CHDC re City-Owned Net Lease Buildings Comprehensive Development Plan/Clinton-Hell’s Kitchen Studios – 545 W 52 nd Street		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 10: Letter to Irish Arts Center re 726 11th Avenue – TABLED	-	-
Item 11: Letter to DCP re Billboard on Hudson Park and Boulevard – 518 W 39 th Street		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Waterfront, Parks & Environment Committee (WPE)		
Item 12: Letter to HRPT re Pier 84 Concession	Friendly amendment proposed and accepted.	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Transportation Committee (TRANS)		
Item 13: Letter to DOT re Alternative Locations for 37 th Street Bus Layover	Bundled with 14-17	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 14: Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Safety at 30 th Street and 10 th Avenue	Bundled with 13, 15-17	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 15: Letter to DOT re Safety Improvements to Manhattan Plaza – W42 and W43 Streets	Bundled with 13, 14, 16, 17	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 16: Letter to DOT re Taxi Layover Relocation at 39 th Street and 9 th Avenue	Bundled with 13-15, 17	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 17: Letter to City Council re Street Vending Legislation – 1303 - Ratified	Bundled with 13-16	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Housing, Health and Human Services Committee (HHHS)		
Item 18: Letter to DOB and HPD re Demo of 500 West 28 th Street (AKA 311 10 th Avenue)		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 19: Letter to HPD re asset cap for affordable housing changes to Housing Connect - TABLED	-	-
Item 20: Letter to HPD re Proposed Homeless Set-Asides	Friendly amendment proposed and accepted. Request for final draft of letter to be circulated was accepted.	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Executive Committee (EXEC)		
Item 21: Letter to Department of City Planning re MCB4 Statement of District Needs and Budget Request for Fiscal Year 2018	Budget Task Force members were thanked for their hard work on compiling statement.	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Meeting Resolution	
Adjournment	9:02 p.m. Meeting Adjourned
Next Meeting Date and Location	Wednesday, December 7 6:30pm Mount Sinai West, 1000 Tenth Avenue (58/59 Street)

AS RECORDED BY: Lily Fan, Co-Secretary

VOTING KEY
 Y=Yes
 N=No
 A=Abstain
 PNE=Present, not eligible
 -- = No vote **ATTENDANCE KEY**
 P=Present
 Ab=Absent
 E=Excused

	ATTENDANCE	1a. Amended letter to SLA re Method of Operation for Rise Bar - 859 9th Avenue	1b. Letter to SLA re 859 9th Avenue (55/56) - Rise Bar NYC LLC	2. Letter to SLA re 826 10th Avenue (54/55) - Catered by Pergola, LLC	3. Letter to SLA re 400 W. 42nd Street (42/Dyer Ave) - Parm 42 West LLC	4. Letter to SLA re 228 W. 18th Street (7/8) - El Cocotero, Inc.	5. Letter to SLA re 85 10th Avenue (15/16) - L Atelier NYC LLC	6. Letter to SLA re 160 8th Avenue (17/18) - Entity to be formed by Thomas Kelly	7. Letter to SLA re 161 8th Avenue (17/18) - 161 8th Avenue Restaurant LLC	8. Letter to SAFO re Proposed changes to Street Event Rules - RATIFIED	9. Letter to CHDC re City-Owned Net Lease Buildings Comprehensive Development Plan/Clinton-Hell's Kitchen Studios - 545 W. 52nd Street	10. Letter to Irish Arts Center re 726 11th Avenue - TABLED	11. Letter to DCP re Billboard on Hudson Park and Boulevard - 518 W. 39th Street	12. Letter to HRPT re Pier 84 Concession	13. Letter to DOT re Alternative Locations for 37th Street Bus Layover	14. Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Safety at 30th Street and 10th Avenue	15. Letter to DOT re Safety Improvements to Manhattan Plaza - W42 and W43 Streets	16. Letter to DOT re Taxi Layover Relocation at 39th Street and 9th Avenue	17. Letter to City Council re Street Vending Legislation - 1303 - RATIFIED	18. Letter to DOB and HPD re Demo of 500 West 28th Street (AKA 311 10th Ave)	19. Letter to HPD re Asset cap for affordable housing changes to Housing Connect	20. Letter to HPD re Proposed Homeless Set-Asides	21. Letter to Department of City Planning re MCB4 Statement of District Needs and Budget Request for Fiscal Year 2018
P / Y	40	22	20	40	38	40	40	40	40	38	35	4	38	38	38	38	39	38	38	17	38	37	
Ab / N	8	2	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
E / A	1	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
PNE	0	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Charles S. Bayor	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Mathew Bergman	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Andrea Bernard	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Christine Berthet	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Gwen Billig	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Yoni Boksor	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Liam Buckley	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Lee Compton	P	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Angel Cortes	A																						
Dale Corvino	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Judith Dahill	E																						
Barbara Davis	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	--	PNE		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	--	--	--	
Maarten de Kadtt	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Sarah Desmond	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Pete Diaz	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Tina DeFelicantonio	A																						
Lily Fan	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Brett Firfer	A																						
David Holowka	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Frank Holozubiec	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Inge Ivchenko	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Lowell Kern	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Burt Lazarin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Christopher LeBron	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Jeffrey LeFrancois	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Bruce MacAffer	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Betty Mackintosh	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Walter Mankoff	A																						
Morgan McLean	P	PNE	PNE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Ambur Nicosia	A																						
Michael Noble	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
J.D. Noland	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Austin Ochoa	P	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Maria Ortiz	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Allen Oster	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Oscar Pagoada	A																						
Brad Pascarella	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Rhonda Patillo	A																						
Joseph Reigadas	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	--	--		--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	
Joe Restuccia	P	Y	N	Y	PNE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Delores Rubin	P	A	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
John Sharp	A																						
Didi Skaff	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Brian Sokal	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
David Solnick	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Ken Stewart	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Martin Treat	P	--	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
James Wallace	P	--	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
David Warren	P	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	

**T
A
B
L
E
D**

**T
A
B
L
E
D**