



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD No. 4

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036

tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512

www.ManhattanCB4.org

JEAN-DANIEL NOLAND

Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.

District Manager

DRAFT MINUTES

PUBLIC MEETING

DATE: Wednesday, February 4, 2008

TIME: Public hearings begin at 6:30 p.m., meeting to follow

PLACE: Fulton Center Auditorium, 119 Ninth Avenue (17th/18th)

PUBLIC HEARINGS

NONE SCHEDULED.

JD Noland opens the meeting at 6:45 pm.

PUBLIC SESSION

John Weis announces sign-up to speak.

Carl Caster: Spoke (again) of doctors ignoring and abusing parking spaces in the environs of Roosevelt-St. Luke's Hospital (58th-59th Streets 9th to 10th Avenues). Doctors parking illegally. Residents get parking tickets but not doctors. Why? He suggests that CB4 invite the president of the hospital to come answer/discuss this issue. Why should doctors continually take the spaces that other New Yorkers need? Christine Berthet asked if he had spoken with his Precinct's Community Affairs department. He was not satisfied and repeated that CB4 should take action.

Kit Cowan is president of the Whitby co-op association, the apartments on W. 45th Street. He spoke on behalf of those apartment owners whose back apartments face the Bourbon Street restaurant/bar. He said that the size of the now finished patio is huge – much larger than others on 46th Street, and that if Bourbon Street is permitted to use that big space it will set an extremely bad precedent. Not appropriate; too large and massive. No attempts at noise abatement will suffice. He gave the board a copy of a letter from Marilyn Rockafellow, president of the Block Association; requesting that CB4 deny Bourbon Street use of the patio. "This is a serious quality of life issue."

Philip J. Yolk of 450 West 17th Street, spoke for himself and fellow residents of Tenth Avenue about noise of late night cabs and the parks department's crane at a construction site for months – stationary – creating a bottleneck. No enforcement of anti-honking. Can anyone write tickets for this noise nuisance? It goes on 24/7. Christine Berthet suggested they speak with their 10th Precinct Community Council/NYPD.

Courtney Dunne of the Hudson Guild spoke of their new senior citizen art exhibit. Also, a free lecture by Dr. Cohn on the important link between art and aging will be at St. Peter's Church in the Citicorp Center. This Sunday (Feb 8) there will be a Salsa dance for seniors at 2:00.

Richard Simms of 325 West 45th Street spoke against the Bourbon Street bar's patio/terrace. His flat overlooks the terrace/. He resents economic needs of a business taking precedence over those of homeowners. The sale price of his flat will go 'way down with such a noisy neighbor. Bourbon Street's promise of no music after ten at night is hollow. Quality of life will be thoroughly compromised. 8 tables in a 200 customer restaurant won't make owners much \$ and encroaches too much on neighbor's space.

Doug Freedman, also of 325 West 45th. His flat directly abuts Bourbon Street's terrace, which is made of terra cotta. None of suggested noise abatement will filter the loud music. Same non-policing from adjacent restaurant Maison Seville.

Sophie Khan, representing “Partners in Reading”, an after school program offered at the Hudson Guild. There are two sites for K-8, one on 25th Street for K-5 and the Lab School goes from 5th-8th grade. There is safe pickup for little ones. And on Saturdays from 11-3:00 there is ‘A Safe Place’ for readers at the Guild. David Pincus, chair of CB4’s Theatre Task Force said that there are more off-off Broadway theatres in CB4 than in any other NYC area. 30% of those theatres have been lost since 2008. CBs 1, 2, 3 and 5 are joining CB4 in presenting a public forum at the Players Club February 17th - 5:00 to discuss such current issue. He encouraged everyone interested in the future of small theatres to attend. Various panelists and guests will speak. Free admission.

Janet Haviland and Sarah Corning requested a street closing permit for “Science Projects for Kids of All Ages” on 24th Street at Penn South. (Agenda Item #35) May 17th.

Allison Tupper, chair of the 46th Street Block Association spoke out against the terrace at the Bourbon Street Bar, principally because of the noise level. “Sound bounces. Please do not permit this outside space.” She also spoke on the Studio City/PS 51 site and said she hopes we can do better than the current plan. “Keep it low. Public land and private builders can work together. We need a better affordable housing plan there than 80-20.”

Tamara Gitmeyer, an actress and mother of a student at PS 51. She said that PS 51 parents are heavily, actively involved in the plan. They have been fighting for a new school to replace the decrepit old one for ten years. The proposed towers are too high, creating a completely shaded playground. “Don’t block out the sun.” They want the school to be Pre-k-5. School now is so overcrowded that pupils are taking classes in the stairwells.

Lucas Shapiro, community organizer with HCC (Housing Conservation Coordinators), explained their missions and their law clinics, immigration clinic and free legal assistance. All are welcome – by appointment. He thanked all our state electeds for the pro-tenant bills passed Monday in the Assembly. Now they face the Senate in Albany.

Manhattan District Attorney’s rep introduced their summer internship program for 14-17 year olds interested in the law. \$100 weekly stipend for 9:00 – 5:00 five days a week. March 27 is the deadline to apply.

Catherine Consuelo Johnson – a Mom from PS 51, and president of the PTA. She thanked CB4 for its letter (Item #17) and is thrilled to be working with CB4. She emphasized that the parents want PS51 to be Pre-K through 5th grade, and that the Pre-K is crucial to the neighborhood. Private Pre-K is very expensive. She said of the Hess gas station management’s response to their request for mitigation of dangerous traffic – that 18 months ago was Hess’s last letter, and it was insulting. There is not enough enforcement of drivers entering and exiting the Hess station – no respect for kids or anyone else walking by.

Kathleen McGee Treat, chair of the Hell’s Kitchen Neighborhood Association (HKNA) spoke vehemently against the terrace for Bourbon Street, repeating that such a use would present a terribly bad precedent. ‘Give bar owners an inch and they’ll take a mile. They do NOT police themselves. Will need constant watching and complaining from neighbors. She then expressed gratitude to CB4 from everyone in Hell’s Kitchen for protecting us from another Trump City scenario on 11th Avenue.

Lisa Wager, representing FIT, spoke on the new exhibition at the FIT museum. Kam Mac, a faculty member, won the competition to design the Lunar New Year stamp for the US Post Office this year; the Year of the Ox. Professor Mac is an immigrant from China.

JD Noland closed the public session, admonishing CB4 members regarding Item #37 – that it is a QUIK-PARKing lot. He then asked for a motion to adopt minutes from the last meeting. Any objections? Anna found typos in Items #17 and #18 (PS 51 site and school) and then the minutes were adopted as amended.

MEETING AGENDA

Public Session	John Weis
Adoption of Agenda	Jean-Daniel Noland
Adoption of Last Month's Minutes	
Reports	
Manhattan Borough President	Angelica Crane
Local Elected Officials	Various
District Manager	Robert J. Benfatto, Jr.
Chair	Jean-Daniel Noland
Committee Reports	Jean-Daniel Noland
Committee Letters & Resolutions (letters and resolutions, see reverse)	Jean-Daniel Noland
Old Business	Jean-Daniel Noland
New Business	
Adjournment	

Elected Reports

Angelica Crane community liaison from Borough President Scott Stringer's office:

- 1) On January 8 Scott made the Port Authority offer public inspection of its records and performance statistics on its airports, bridges, etc. The Port Authority will publish an annual report. The first quarter of 2009 is on the PA website.
- 2) In January the BP testified before City Planning on the Hudson yards. Construction must not threaten the High Line. Building must conform to the neighborhood.
- 3) She announced that applications for membership to community boards for 2009 is now closed.
- 4) Speaker Quinn, Congressperson Jerry Nadler, Senator Tom Duane and Assembly member Gottfried are hosting a February 25 forum on schools.

Colin Casey, community liaison for State Senator Tom Duane offered h\the senator's congratulations to CB4 on its recent meeting on 11th Avenue , and for working so well with the Dept of City Planning. He also congratulated CB4 for its Landmarks/Chelsea Historic District. He then informed everyone of the newly discovered underground railroad site at 329 West 29th Street . Preserving this building is important as it is one of the very few New York City links to the abolitionist movement. He told the gathering: "We're gonna win that one."

Corey (?), new community liaison from Assembly member Dick Gottfried's office told everyone of the packet of materials on the back tables.

City Council member Gale Brewer spoke of the Council hearings beginning after March 9th on state and federal decisions coming before the City – due at the end of June. She sits on the Budget committee and Finance. February 24th the Council will address the necessity for public education on the bedbug epidemic. Affordable housing budget is now being discussed in Albany . Illegal hotels are still a frustrating, bi9tter issue – horrible decision made recently b y an appellate court judge\ last week...this means losing affordable housing to tourists. She testified in favor of keeping our bus service intact.

Greg from Linda Rosenthal's office, spoke of Linda's participation in the January 14 MTA pubic hearing at the Hilton. Linda wants NO raise for Access-A-Ride, let alone a raise of \$3 a ride - from \$2 to \$5! She will work to employ the Ravich Commission's advice/plan. On Feb 2 the State Assembly passed Bill #2005 repealing anti-tenant, pro-landlord Vacancy Decontrol. The Senate must now pass the bill, which will help to maintain New York 's middle class.

Melanie LaRocca, community rep for Speaker/City Council member Christine Quinn told us of a January 15th sexual assault/abuse of a 12 year old girl in Chelsea . The perpetrator is still at large.

Pauline Yu introduced herself. She is the Mayor's Community Liaison for the west side.

Sondra DuKay, from City Comptroller Bill Thompson's office testified that he spoke against MTA's cuts and said that the Comptroller's reports on Yankee Stadium financing are now available to the public. The City contributed \$350 million to the stadium's overruns. This report is also available online, as is his audit of the Dept of Building's unpaid fines. The Mayor must address how to collect the \$225 million owed the City by scofflaws.

District Manager's Report

Bob Benfatto, District Manager of CB4, spoke on the upcoming public forum on February 12, on Waterfront Parks and the preservation of Chelsea. On Feb 11th CB4's Land Use committee will address the Region CORE Tunnel's ULURP as well as 11th Avenue Rezoning follow-up at John Jay College. The Landmarks committee meets the third Tuesday of the month. Housing meets the third Thursday of each month. CB4's web site will convert/upgrade. The Mayor's preliminary budget will be reviewed in February. On March 4 the public is invited to discuss the budget at Roosevelt Hospital .

COMMITTEE REPORTS – LETTERS & RESOLUTIONS

JD Noland's main business announcements included committee reports:

3 forums have been completed on the proposed rezoning of 11th Avenue and he asks Anna Levin to summarize: Anna thought the last meeting went well. She spoke of two years' work on the Hudson Yards, which may not happen because Related has not come up with the \$ for the MTA. Viz the Railyards (then City Council member) Chris Quinn got Daniel Doctoroff and Commissioner Amanda Burden to agree to rezone 43rd – 55th Streets on 11th Avenue; some of which is now zoned for manufacturing. CB4 and City Planning will be co-applicants for the new zoning – a good thing. Without the co-application the plan will not go forward. We are “in” and want the process to go forward. Anna believes that “We fundamentally got what we wanted. The east side of 11th Avenue is to be residential with some permanent affordable housing and a 120 foot cap. These were early wins from Hudson Yards negotiations. We wanted a mirror image, the same on the west side of 11th Avenue . We wanted nightlife restrictions but couldn't get those. We also wanted tenant harassment protections – but that was a no go. This last is a political issue that we must take up with Christine Quinn. Anna suggested that CB4 and CB5 get together on a nightlife consensus. “The City will rezone the garment center soon, which will directly affect CB5. And we will do our best to continue working on a positive future for 11th Avenue .”

JD Noland congratulated the Land Use committee on its hard and successful work. He announced a public forum on February 12 addressing Pier 57 (17th Street).

Ed Kirkland added that the Hudson River Trust hopes to raise funds by leasing this pier.

The Durst family, the Related Companies and a Korean developer have made proposals to build on the pier. Some plans for the pier are park-like, some more commercial, which is well to fund long-term maintenance. Traffic patterns will change. The working group includes electeds and other community boards. The February 12 public hearing will choose which proposal will win. 5:30 here at the Fulton Center .

February 25th – the City Department of Education and CBs 2, 4 and 5 and the Borough President and all electeds will hold a forum on schools in Chelsea and the Village. 6:30 pm. Site to be determined.

Small Business Task Force: Tony Juliano introduced it. John Owens is co-chair. Their mission is to help independent businesses survive. They meet the fourth Tuesday of the month at CB4 offices – 6:30 pm. Tony believes that it is necessary to reconfigure street fairs which often hurt small local businesses. Come to the Feb 24th meeting. The Borough President will present his report on Mom and Pop businesses.

JD asks for consensus to take Items #17 and #18 from land use first, no objection.

Items # 17 and # 18 – Studio City/PS 51 (City owned block from 44th – 45th Streets between 10th and 11th Avenues). Promised off-site housing from Hudson Yards is 600 units of permanent affordable housing and an entirely new school with 630 seats. The latest plan crams lots of development into a tight space. When HPD said that there would be a 44 story tower the community went ballistic. The compromise is that the 11th Avenue tower will be 31 stories, not 44. Draft scope of environmental study was last Friday – then comes the ULURP. The Land use committee wants the best possible school – this is paramount! So Item #18 is a letter to the School Construction Authority and to the Department of Education to get the ball running on the school first – Pre-K through the 5th grade.

John asked what was meant in Item #17 by adaptive reuse? Ann explained that the new school will be built while the old school still stands and houses the students. The 100 year old building will remain and that the developer is open to any suggestions that will make a profit for them.

Robert Trentlyon – re Lines 204-207 of Item #17 – said that we should always deal with shadow on every real estate site. Open access to the sun and sky is crucial. Anna agreed and said that is always taken in to consideration; and that her committee will most certainly see to it that the developer does not overlook the shading of the school and playground.

Christine Berthet asked if the old school could possibly be used for a community facility? Anna referred her to line 71.

Joe Restuccia, also a member of the Land Use committee added that DOT will relocate the taxi stand on 44th Street between 10th and 11th Avenues. The schoolyard's shadow is created by the school. The roof of the school could be used for recreation, as well.

Martin Treat referred to Item #17 line 43: insert "stepped" tower - Line #110. Line 156 "should not be a precedent" – Agreed and amended.

Millie Glaberman asked if the new school's windows open? Anna said that she will ask for 'operable' windows.

JD Noland: All in favor? Item letters #17 & #18 pass unanimous.

Executive Committee (EXEC)

Item 1: Letter to DCA/DCP re enclosed sidewalk café (New): Greek Kitchen – 885 Tenth Avenue (@58th) JD led a discussion among the membership of Item #1 Application for a new enclosed sidewalk cafe through executive committee. He explained that CB4 wrote a letter to City Planning on ULURP grounds opposing these enclosures in general; but, except for a tree, it looks as though this one has a right to build. A general question was asked: When does a sidewalk café become a DOB issue? A: Once City Planning agrees to it. Christine B: - Lines 103 and 104 to confirm that if clearance doesn't work, we withdraw approval. The West Bank's outside café is inside the building line.

Martin T: - Sidewalk cafes (Line 44) make it clear that side walk cafes can be removed but enclosed spaces are permanent. Non ULURP vote passed with several in opposition.

Item 2: Letter to DCA re unenclosed sidewalk Café (New): BM Cafe d/b/a Hummus Kitchen - 768 Ninth Ave. (51/52). Chuck Spence: Address listed is incorrect. Fixed. And – delivery bikes are competing with sidewalk café space. Bicycles need to be dealt with. He suggested that a maximum of two bikes be stored within the sidewalk café's space. The restaurant owner's representative agreed. All members agreed but for Millie - opposed. Jay Marcus suggested that the owner present drawings as well. Passed.

Item 3: Letter of support for a new middle school in Chelsea. Howard Smith of the Quality of Life Committee spoke of a mentoring program for middle school students who want to take the SATs to enter college. He also spoke of dedicating funds to a new public middle school in Chelsea. Line #25 – Millie emphasized 'public'. Bob T moves to table the decision on a public middle school. Too early and the stipulations are much too vague. Wait for the coming educational forum. Too soon to send the committee letter. JD responded that the intent was deliberately vague and that the letter has been sent. Bob thought that a strategic mistake. Ed Kirkland seconded the motion to postpone the motion indefinitely. "Don't we need more detail?" But all members were opposed to his motion. The letter passed by majority.

Item 4: Letter of support for a Preservation League of NYS award to the restoration by CHDC of "The Flats", technically The Emerson, in the CURA. Ed Kirkland explained that there was no forum at the Landmarks Committee. Deadline is Feb 12 for a letter recommending a preservation award be given to Joe Restuccia. Passed unanimously.

Business Licenses & Permits Committee (BLP)

Item 5: Letter to SLA re CDDF Restaurant Inc. – Bourbon Street Bar & Grill – 346 W. 46th Street. Chuck Spence asked for a vote on Bourbon Street bar's terrace. 6 in favor of denial, 3 opposed – further discussion: Subsequent to the original application of June, 2007 – Christine's two friendly amendments – the number of liquor serving establishments in the area and the venue's volume: restaurant row (W46St) very crowded and Bourbon Streets current 1240 patrons is an increase over the original. John Doswell – Let's go for denial. Tony wants patio to go through viz supporting small business and the owners have shown themselves

willing to compromise. The public seemed equally divided, pro and con. The alternative to denial is that the establishment using an expanded terrace for all hours without stipulations and not serve liquor. Smoking, talking until 4am rather than a 10 pm closing serving liquor which can be stipulated on the liquor license. Corey Johnson comments that the application is for 43 patrons on the terrace. He says a denial would not significantly hurt Bourbon Street's business. Corey says owner is not willing to compromise or work with his neighbors.

Line #52 is pointed out – If the SLA does grant a license CB4 can demand stipulations. Corey recommends denial. Paul Seres said that although he is normally pro-nightlife he wants the community to understand that they must be vigilant. Owner has 'right of use' for his terrace. SLA commissioner Boyle (a hard liner) is now gone from the SLA. Paul thinks our recommendation for denial will return to bite us. It's a no win situation because non-drinking patrons will still be there making noise.

Michael Mazier spoke as a 45th Street resident against the liquor license for the terrace saying the above was a specious argument. He bemoaned the fact that the law does not protect residents from bars and their attendant ills. Walter Mankoff: Has the SLA denied a permit in the past? Chuck, the SLA has agreed twice before with our recommendation on Bourbon Street and had denied a mezzanine café license in the past. Jay Marcus agrees with Tony. The bar owner should be permitted to serve diners on his terrace. Chuck: But the owner did not do his leg-work on mitigating noise.

Brett Firfer – What about noise while children are trying to sleep? Is it definitely legal?

Chuck: Yes. Joe: This is not a business committee issue. Owner has heard the neighborhood's concerns. He knows the SLA. He constructed the terrace anyway. If no denial we're setting ourselves up for disaster. Noise ECHOES off brick walls. The owner of Bourbon Street will incrementally get what he wants. A sucker punch. Vote as is.

JD: CB4 has a backyard policy and it is not now in play. Also – if the business is not doing well why would he want to expand?

Joe calls the question. All in favor of Item #5 with amendments: Large majority, pass.

Item 6: Letter to SLA re SHNY Restaurant Group LLC a/b/a Southern Hospitality– 765 Sixth Ave (25/26) Chuck, a club now to be a restaurant – non-controversial. West 26th Street Block Association came in late asking that the French doors close at 9 rather than at 10 pm. Not agreed. Corey – Items #6, #8, #10 and #12 – re the pledge "Restaurant will not apply in future for a cabaret license" – changed to not applying 'now'. Paul – suggestion? Ed suggests a uniform style for all CB4 writing.

Pete Diaz: Lines #38/39: "Occasional DJs – Need stronger language to control DJ noise. Protect neighbor's peace and quiet. Chuck – change to "background music". Pete: Why would a restaurant need a DJ?

Joe – for private parties. Unanimous with amendments.

Chuck asked that Items #7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15 and 16 be bundled together.

Item #7 – Board member(?) Lines 19-21 What is XXX? (Total capacity) She thought the language unclear regarding the sidewalk café. The applicant wants a sidewalk café cleared (SLA and DCA). Pete – Is it a hotel? Item #12? Chuck – Yes. Approved once but the original application did not go for it. The new developer applies. Serving alcohol until when? 4AM. All in favor. None opposed.

Item 7: Letter to SLA re Simple Kitchen LLC – 361 W. 17th Street, Pass Unanimous.

Item 8: Letter to SLA re 523 9th Avenue Inc. d/b/a Hell's Kitchen – 523 Ninth Avenue (39th/40th)

Item #8 – Applicant wants ratification of work at entrance and an open bar downstairs.

Tony – Line #18 – (am – 4Am seven days a week should not be a stip.

Line #20 – Total capacity and no use of second floor should be another bullet.

Corey – What second floor? It's an illegal roof! "No usage of roof" should be the wording. Pass unanimous.

Item 9: Letter to SLA re Chelsea Market Deli d/b/a Friedman's– 75 Ninth Avenue (15th/16th), Pass.

Item 10: Letter to SLA re Time Square Comedy – 303 W. 42nd St a/k/a 300 W. 43rd Street, Pass.

Item 11: Letter to SLA re Centerplate (License at Jacob Javits Center) – 655 W. 34th Street, Pass.

Item 12: Letter to SLA re Four Points by Sheraton Midtown -Time Square West – 326 W. 40th Street, Pass.

Item 13: Letter to SLA re IM Operating LLC d/b/a Scores – 536 W. 28th Street. – Board member suggests re-writing stipulation to "dancing only by paid performers". Paul – Same owner of other gentlemen's clubs without problems. Pass.

Item 14: Letter to SLA re 539 West 21st St. Rest. LLC. – 539 West 21st Street, Pass.

Item 15: Letter to SLA re 161 W. 23rd St LLC – 161 W. 23rd Street, Pass.

Item 16: Letter to SLA re B-Bap Inc. – 830 Ninth Avenue (54th/55th), Pass.

Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee (C/HKLU)

Item 17: Letter to HPD re West 44th St. & Eleventh Avenue Rezoning (Studio City/PS51 Site)

Item 18: Letter to SCA and DOE re: new school building for PS 51

Transportation Planning Committee (TRANS)

Item 19: Letter to DOT re parking regulations - 509 West 34th Street. Christine Berthet, Co-Chair: two issues: Bus lane on the north side of 34th block, between 10 & 11th Ave., on far west side needs delivery space. But long-term buses use another portion of this bus lane. Thank you to Walter for finding that buses must be relocated. All in favor – no opposition.

Item 20: Letter to DOT re parking regulations - 54th Street and Tenth Avenue. Parking Regulations change north side of 54th Street . Businesses said that they need 300'. All in favor. None opposed.

Item 21: Letter to DOT re Pedestrian Walkway 23rd Street and Tenth Avenue. West side of tenth Avenue . High-Line construction is not progressing. Needs revision and monitoring. All in favor. None opposed.

Item 22: Letter to DOT re Traffic Flow on 42nd Street. Thanks to Martin for his research on parking on north side of 42nd Street between Dyer and 10th Avenue . “Only two moving lines going west. We’re trying to free up space without impeding deliveries to the Food Emporium. Need a sign saying ‘Turn Left to go West and North’.” All in favor of #22 – None opposed

Item 23: Letter to MTA re 14th Street Station Refurbishing 14th Street subway lines 1, 2 and 3. Seventh Avenue station needs major repair to make it safe. Line #32 – ceiling molding needs to be repaired or replaced. Pass unanimous.

Item 24: Letter to MTA re bus stop elimination 34th Street and Dyer Avenue Bus stop has been replaced on the sw corner of 10th Ave and 42nd. 1,100 feet is too much space between stops. Next one is the se corner or 9th Ave and 42nd. Reinstall this bus stop on Dyer. Unanimous.

Item 25: Letter to NYMTC re National Economic Recovery Legislation – The New York Metropolitan Transportation Council gathers transportation agencies from the entire region for federal funds. They ensure the funds are spent correctly. The fund study projects, etc. Their Transportation Implementation Plan goes before the Feds every two years. \$850 billion approved.

‘Shovel ready’ – what are criteria? Christine B was advised to put all neighborhood issues that the committee has been working on together. No new projects. Ranked by priority. Interim policy – February 6th is the deadline to be sent to NYMTIC, Jerry Nadler and our two senators.

Corey – Thanks to the transportation committee for its diligent work. It’s mostly Hell’s Kitchen related. #15 is one of the few Chelsea items. That street has been under construction for 6 years! Christine – this is the top one on our list to the Governor’s #1 Capital Budget Item. Couldn’t #15 and #18 be moved higher up?

Christine: #1 is also in Chelsea . The 15th Street project is very important. JD: Does numerical order matter?

Joe – It’s a neighborhood priority that mass transit issues should come first. Access to Region’s Core (ARC’s phase 2 is Penn Station). Joe: Tenth Avenue subway station for the #7 line: Put the money into the station or take the money away? Member: What about the proposed station at 33rd and 11th Avenue ? Do we want 10th Ave and 41st Street station completed first? Yes.

Priorities – Christine: We request that ARC be fully funded before the subway stations.

Anna says she did not understand the letter. It needs a preamble stating that we are providing comments on NYMTIC’s requests. And as for the #7 subway...no Tenth venue station (promised) is a scandal. #3 ok – We want #7 station on 10th Avenue .

Christine: OK we will make it clearer. Joe: Priorities? 1) Regional Plan Tunnel – ARC

2) Mass transit for the City 3) Neighborhood improvements such as subway stations. Bob Benfatto – the City will get a lot of money for Bus Rapid Transit, Marine transportation, et al. All in favor (with amendments). None opposed.

Item #26 – Piers 92 and 94 (52nd and 54th Streets) At Clinton Cove Park Letter– an expanded convention center is proposed. The Transportation committee responded and now is responding to their requested

comments and ULURP. Essentially: EIS should be larger – more comprehensive - especially regarding pedestrian safety. A shuttle, too – with east/west routes other than 42nd Street . Christine said that she will re-write the letter. Martin – Shuttles run every 15 minutes; many to 42nd Street . Any alternative to shuttle buses? Christine – ‘Green’ shuttle buses have been suggested, and to expand existing convenience for commuters who take mass transit. Unanimous.

Quality of Life/Education, Libraries, and Cultural Affairs (QoL)

Howard Smith, Co-Chair, requests to bundle up Items #27, 28, 29, 30 and 31 as they are re-newels of Block associations 45th, 46th, 47th and 48th Street fairs. Wilma Velazquez comments that the precinct closes the street the Wednesday BEFORE the street fair. This causes a problem for residents with cars to park on 25th Street . Miguel said that he would speak again to the precinct about this problem. Corey: Address this in the letter, same as last year. Howard agreed. Walter – Clean up letter so it deals specifically with each street fair. JD – suggests that letter include CB’s concerns about closing the street for three days and blocking the left hand turn onto 9th Avenue for west-bound vehicles.

Item 27: Letter to SAPO re 10th Pct. Community Council – renewal, Pass, Miguel Acevedo abstain.

Item 28: Letter to SAPO re Folsom Street East – renewal, Pass.

Item 29: Letter to SAPO re 47th/48th Street Better Block Association – renewal, Pass.

Item 30: Letter to SAPO re Midtown North Pct. Community Council – renewal, Pass

Item 31: Letter to SAPO re 57th Street Greenmarket (Council on the Environment Inc.) – renewal, Pass

Howard: Please now bundle #32, 33 and 34. Earlier, committee had denied #34 because no one came to speak.

Item 32: Letter to DCA re Trois Canard Limited d/b/a Tello – 263 West 19th Street – renewal, Pass.

Item 33: Letter to DCA re 198 Eighth Ave. Rest. Corp. d/b/a Mare – 198 Eighth Ave (@ 20th) renewal, Pass

Item 34: Letter to DCA re Buckwheat & Alfalfa Inc. d/b/a The Rocking Horse Mexican Café – 182 Eighth Avenue (@ 20th) – renewal (ratification), Pass.

Waterfront and Parks Committee (WATER)

Item 35: Letter to DCP re Waterfront Zoning Proposal

Science/Adventure Kids Street Fair – only in the afternoon. All agreed. None opposed.

#36 – Self explanatory letter on waterfront text to City Planning – 39th Street is private property. CB4 is in favor of recommendations. Ed K: private space – not in or part of the Hudson river Park .

Bob Trentlyon – Recycling receptacles asked for, can we then ask for LED lighting and solar panels and re-use of water? Joe – City is only approving such green measures....none without.

Frank Eady – Could closing time (hours) be changed from dusk to dark (Line 39)? More specific. All in favor of Item #36. None opposed.

Housing Health, Human Services Committee (HH&HS), Landmarks Committee (LAND), Small Business Task Force (SBTF), Theater Task Force (THEATER)

No items to report

New Business (NewBus)

Need a letter regarding compressor noise in parking lot. It’s driving people in the west forties nuts. Letter must copy DOT and DCA. All in favor of Bob Benfatto writing that letter. None opposed. JD moves to adjourn: 9:45PM, second, unanimous.