

2
3 April XX, 2016

4
5 Margaret Forgione
6 Manhattan Borough Commissioner
7 NYC Department of Transportation
8 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor
9 New York, NY 10038

10
11 MTA New York City Transit
12 Veronique Hakim
13 President
14 2 Broadway
15 New York, NY 10004

16
17 **Re: M23 Select Bus Service Proposal**

18
19 Dear XXXX,

20
21 Manhattan Community Board 4 appreciates being consulted during the design phase of
22 the proposed Select Bus Service on 23rd Street. We generally support the project with the
23 recommendations enumerated below. It is our understanding that DOT and MTA will
24 come back to the board to respond to our comments and propose a final design before
25 implementing the new service during the summer.

26
27 Select Bus Service (SBS) is installed on nine routes in New York City including the
28 M34A in Community District 4 (CD4) district. SBS Travel time is faster by up to 23% on
29 Avenues, and a safer street design leads to up to 20% reduction in overall crashes.

30
31 The current M23 corridor serves 15,000 daily passengers, residents in areas far from the
32 subway, and an additional 28 express buses. The line connects with 9 subway/rail lines
33 and 14 bus routes. However buses on the current route are not moving during 51% of
34 their travel time – they are either loading passengers at bus stops or stopped in traffic. In
35 CD4 the segments between 7th and 9th Avenues are the slowest, but not as slow as the
36 segments from Broadway to 1st Avenue where speeds of less than 4 mph affect the whole
37 route.

38
39 DOT and MTA have engaged in an extensive public outreach at bus stops and through
40 crowdsourcing, and surveyed all the businesses along the route.

41
42 While the M23 route will remain river to river, the SBS enhancements would be applied
43 only from 1st to 10th Avenue where the current speed is particularly slow. On those
44 segments the M23 SBS service would replace the current M23 and offer the following
45 features:

- 46
- Camera enforced offset bus lanes for faster service and preserved loading area.

- 47 • Fare Collection on sidewalk for faster boarding on all doors
- 48 • Better passenger stops with passenger information
- 49 • Safer pedestrian treatments
- 50 • Updated curb regulations for more efficient deliveries on the route

51

52 The specific design proposed in CD4 is as follows:

- 53 • From 10th to 8th Avenues, one offset exclusive bus lane going eastbound.
- 54 • Left turn restricted from eastbound 23rd Street to northbound 8th Avenue (not
55 enough room to accommodate a turn bay). This is in addition to left turns already
56 barred westbound on 7th and 9th Avenues and eastbound on 6th Avenue.
- 57 • From 8th to 7th Avenues, one offset exclusive bus lane going eastbound and one
58 curbside shared bus lane going westbound along the north side curb (street is too
59 narrow to accommodate more lanes). The westbound shared bus lane will be open
60 to traffic / deliveries 18 hours a day, except for 7-10 AM and 4- 7 PM peak hours
- 61 • From 7th to 6th Avenues, two offset exclusive bus lanes going eastbound and
62 westbound.

63

64 **Historical Data:**

65 We are pleased to hear that cameras enforcement is in place on the 34th Street corridor
66 and that approximately 550 summonses per month have been issued since the beginning
67 of the program (2010).

68 Before the next presentation, CB4 requests that the statistics related to speed and safety
69 on the 34th corridor before and after the installation of the SBS service be provided.

70

71 **Loading Regulations:** CB4 reviewed DOT’s suggested changes in loading regulations
72 and recommends the following based on DOT suggestions further amended by
73 community comments:

- 74 • 10th to 9th Avenues
 - 75 ○ North curb: No standing at peak hours, otherwise metered commercial
76 loading (18 hours a day)
 - 77 ○ North curb: 100’ turning bay before 10th Avenue
 - 78 ○ South curb: no change
 - 79 ○ South curb: 100’ turning bay before 9th Avenue
- 80 • 9th to 8th Avenues
 - 81 ○ North curb: add a no standing restriction at peak hours – no change during
82 week end and other periods (18 hours a day)
 - 83 ○ South curb: add a metered loading zone near 8th Avenue (replacing no
84 parking)
- 85 • 8th to 7th Avenues
 - 86 ○ North curb: extend no standing during peak hours to the full block and
87 maintain metered loading regulation for the rest of the day (18 hours)
 - 88 ○ North curb: 100’ turning bay before 8th Avenue
 - 89 ○ South curb: Restore metered loading for full day.
 - 90 ○ South curb: 100’ turning bay before 7th Avenue
- 91 • 7th to 6th Avenues
 - 92 ○ North Curb – Loss of 15’ of loading Close to 6th Avenue

93 ○ South Curb - Restore metered loading for full day.

94

95 CB4 also recommended that the maximum time allowed by the loading regulation be
96 shortened from the current 3 hours to 1 hour. We believe the current regulation
97 encourages parking instead of loading and contributes to the double-parking issues. We
98 urge DOT to perform a pilot in our district and publish the results.

99

100 In the absence of bus loading sidewalk extensions that are the norm on 34th street – CB4
101 recommends that the bus stop area on the street along the curbside be painted in the same
102 dark red paint as the bus lane, and be enforced by cameras to dissuade vehicles from
103 parking there.

104

105 **Improved Bus Flow:** Our experience shows frequent vehicle back up from the right
106 turns in the 34th Street bus lane. CB4 recommends that on 23rd Street, a right turn bay be
107 created for each intersection so that the cars turning and yielding to pedestrians not
108 accumulate and obstruct the bus right of way. The vehicles would cross over the bus lane
109 to the turn bay approximately 100' before the intersection.

110

111 The community also observed that there are often multiple buses laying over for extended
112 period of times at the West side terminus. CB4 recommends that the MTA audit this
113 location and correct this situation prior to implementation.

114

115 **Improved Safety:** As a result of most of the left turn movements being restricted on the
116 corridor, many more eastbound vehicles are expected to make a left turn northbound at
117 10th Avenue. CB4 requests that a turn bay and a split phase be installed with a red arrow
118 and a trailing green arrow.

119 This area is teeming with visitors to the High line and to the Gallery district. It is critical
120 that their safety not be compromised by the design of the corridor.

121

122 While CB4 is very pleased that all the key Vision Zero intersections are being addressed
123 in this plan, the NYC Vision Zero report and action plan indicates that only 15% of the
124 crashes occur at intersections. The blocks between 10th and 6th Avenue are all
125 exceedingly long with 800' between crosswalks. The city has installed midblock
126 crosswalks on many of the long blocks including between 5th and 6th Avenues on 23rd
127 Street. CB4 requests that DOT study midblock crashes on the corridor and install mid
128 blocks pedestrian crossings on each block between 10th and 6th Avenues as warranted.
129 Such crossings would be equipped of a stop sign that would help reduce speed in this
130 mostly residential area.

131

132 **Improved Commuter experience:**

133 We were disappointed to hear that bus shelters and bus clocks will not be installed at each
134 stop. We urge you to do so and/or to install city benches.

135

136 We continue to hear negative comments on the fare collection system. We were pleased
137 to hear that the MTA has issued an RFP to convert to a contactless payment system that
138 will accept credit cards as well.

139 In the interim we urge you to locate the payment appliances as close as possible to the
140 curb with the user interface facing the buildings. This configuration uses much less space
141 on sidewalks that are already too narrow for the volume of pedestrians and provides a
142 much more comfortable experience for the users.

143
144 Residents near the 10th Avenue Eastbound stop have experience large queues of
145 commuters due in part to the presence of the highline and many new residential buildings
146 one block west. There is no stop on that block which used to be dedicated to
147 manufacturing. We ask MTA to consider installing an Eastbound stop near the middle of
148 the 11th to 10th Avenue block to service this new population.

149
150 Our Penn South citizens, of which very many are seniors, were not pleased that in the
151 name of improved service the west bound stop at 5th Avenue will be removed, making the
152 connection with the M5 very difficult. It seems that all the other planned enhancements
153 should generate sufficient speed improvements that reduction in service is not necessary
154 to achieve the goal.

155
156 CB4 appreciates being consulted and look forward to review the final design including
157 our suggestions.

158
159 .
160

DRAFT

161 *Transportation Planning Committee*

Item # 02

162

163 May XX 2016

164

165 Margaret Forgione

166 Manhattan Borough Commissioner

167 NYC Department of Transportation

168 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor

169 New York, NY 10038

170 **RE:** Street Seat at 431 W 37th Street (in front of Brooklyn Fare)

171 Dear Ms. Forgione,

172 Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) supports the application for a Street Seat at this
173 location in front of Brooklyn Fare, a food market in Hell's Kitchen, between 9th and 10th
174 Avenue replacing one parking space.

175 Street Seats is a program of New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) to
176 increase the number of public seating areas for pedestrians when there is not enough
177 sidewalk space to provide such. Walking improves markedly health and longevity. It is
178 proven that older adults walk more if there is seating available at regular intervals.

179 Street seats are installed in the parking lane. Each installation consists of a raised
180 platform flushed with the curb for ADA access, planters, and seating, in conformance
181 with the DOT's design parameters for Street Seats. It is to be paid for, insured, and
182 maintained by the applicant, Brooklyn Fare. It would be removed to storage each year
183 during the winter months of November 15th to April 15th.

184 This application is for a 20 feet long Street Seat, using one on-street parking space in
185 front of the store. The site had previously been favorably vetted by the Hudson Yards /
186 Hell's Kitchen Alliance, the newly formed Business Improvement District for this
187 neighborhood.

188 The applicant presented signatures of many neighbors who support this installation. As a
189 condition of this approval, Brooklyn Fare has agreed not to install storm enclosures that
190 exceed the 18" sidewalk projection permitted by law.

191 CB4 enthusiastically endorses this implementation of the DOT's Street Seat program. It
192 is at a well-suited location, a welcoming waypoint in an increasingly residential
193 neighborhood and streetscape of Hudson Yards.

194

195 Sincerely

196

197

198 *Transportation Planning Committee*

Item #03

199

200 May XX 2016

201

202 Margaret Forgione

203 Manhattan Borough Commissioner

204 NYC Department of Transportation

205 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor

206 New York, NY 10038

207 **RE: Street Seat at 511 West 20th Street (in front of Underline)**

208 Dear Ms. Forgione,

209 Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) supports the application for a Street Seat at this
210 location in front of the Underline, a café in Chelsea located under the High Line between
211 10th and 11th Avenues replacing one parking space.

212 Street Seats is a program of New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) to
213 increase the number of public seating areas for pedestrians when there is not enough
214 sidewalk space to provide such. Walking improves markedly health and longevity. It is
215 proven that older adults walk more if there is seating available at regular intervals.

216 Street seats are installed in the parking lane. Each installation consists of a raised
217 platform flushed with the curb for ADA access, planters, and seating, in conformance
218 with the DOT's design parameters for Street Seats. It is to be paid for, insured, and
219 maintained by the applicant. It would be removed to storage each year during the winter
220 months of November 15th to April 15th.

221 This application is for a 20 feet long Street Seat, using one on-street parking space in
222 front of the store.

223 The applicant presented signatures of many neighbors who support this installation.

224 CB4 enthusiastically endorses this implementation of the DOT's Street Seat program. It
225 is at a well-suited location, a welcoming waypoint in the Gallery District.

226

227 Sincerely

228

229

230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275



DELORES RUBIN
Chair

Jesse Bodine
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR
330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Item #04

April 25, 2016

Alba Pico, First Deputy Commissioner
Special Application Unit
Department of Consumer Affairs
42 Broadway 5th Floor
New York N.Y. 10004

Re: Newsstand Application for SEC W. 34 St. & Hudson Blvd.

Dear Deputy Commissioner Pico,

While Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) is inclined to support this applicant's efforts to find a suitable location for a newsstand in the environs of the Hudson Yards 7 Train Station at W 34th Street and Hudson Boulevard, we are concerned that the proposed location in the application will soon be subject to significant obstacles from planned construction.

Though the sidewalk at the requested location is sufficiently wide, and will eventually make a suitable location, there are plans to perform major plumbing and electrical upgrades to 516 West 34th Street. As the Related Company's letter attached attests. It is anticipated that these upgrades will require the opening of the sidewalk and possibly the creation of vaults. We are therefore concerned that this work will interfere with access to the proposed Newsstand and/or otherwise inhibit its operation.

We would be happy to work with the applicant to find a suitable location, which won't be subject to disruptions from planned construction.

Thank you for your consideration.

276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289

Sincerely,



Delores Rubin

Chair



Christine Berthet

Co-Chair, Transportation
Planning Committee



Ernest Modarelli

Co-Chair, Transportation
Planning Committee

Cc Hudson Yards/Hell's Kitchen Alliance

DRAFT

291

292 May 4, 2016

293

294 Ms. Margaret Forgione

295 Manhattan Borough Commissioner

296 NYC Department of Transportation

297 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor

298 New York, NY 10038

299

300 **Re: Bike Corral at 710-712 Ninth Ave**

301 Dear Commissioner Forgione:

302 Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) supports the installation of a bike corral (bicycle
303 racks located in parking lane in lieu of a parking space with signage and a protected area
304 around it) for 20 bicycles on Ninth Avenue. The requested bike corral location is:

- 305
- The East side of Ninth Avenue between W 48th and W 49th streets in the general
306 vicinity of 710-712 Ninth Ave.
 - The current curbside regulation is Three Hour Metered Parking Commercial
307 Vehicles Only, Others No Standing 7AM to 7PM Except Sunday and Two Hour
308 Metered Parking 7PM-11PM Except Sunday.
 - The establishment Istanbul Kebab House has accepted to maintain the corral
309 although the public will be able to park there.
- 310
- 311

312 CB4 is also requesting that the bicycles racks currently installed on these sidewalks be
313 removed and NYC Department of Transportation coordinate enforcement of illegal
314 bicycle parking and sidewalk obstructions with NYPD & DSNY following the
315 installation of the bicycle corral.

316

317 CB4 was one of the early adopter of the bike corral concept, which is consistent with the
318 city's efforts to increase bicycle usage and while reclaiming space for pedestrian use and
319 reducing occurrence of riding on the sidewalk, by further separating bicycles from
320 pedestrians.

321

322 Neighborhood residents have indicated that on the East side of Ninth Avenue between
323 48th and 49th streets, sometimes as many as 20 bicycles are congregated along the
324 sidewalk, obstructing the walkway on narrow sidewalks already very congested. Given
325 that several restaurants on the block utilize delivery bikes and many residents and visitors
326 use personal bicycles CB4 is pleased that the Istanbul Kebab house has submitted an
327 application to DOT indicating their willingness to maintain the bike corral for public use.

328

329 In supporting this location, we were mindful of the following considerations:

330

331

- The proposed Bicycle Corral is located adjacent to a bicycle lane;

- 332 ● The location was chosen because it is in the middle of the block or
333 closest to the highest concentration of bike users.

- 334 ● The business at the address fronting the bicycle corral agrees to
335 maintain the space and signed a maintenance agreement with DOT or a local
336 organization as required by the DOT.

- 337 ● Notification of the location of a proposed Bicycle Corral, and removal
338 of parking was posted at least one week in advance of the public hearing on that
339 location;

- 340 ● The current use and regulations on the parking lane

- 341 ● Residents and/or Community Board members have noted crowded and
342 problematic bicycle parking along the sidewalk.

- 343 ● The DOT will install signage and protection from traffic for the corral
344 As always, we appreciate your assistance and consideration.

345 The Istanbul Kebab House submitted a Bicycle Corral application to NYC DOT on
346 October 26th 2015 however NYC DDC's ongoing Water Main Project (MED-609(599))
347 has occupied the Ninth Ave street bed for several years and delayed several bicycle
348 Corrals.

349
350 With the completion of DDC work along Ninth Ave and the return of pedestrian refuge
351 islands in mid-March Community Board 4 looks forward to the installation of the Bicycle
352 Corral at 710/712 Ninth Ave as well as the previously approved Corrals at 766 & 790
353 Ninth Ave. Community Board 4 looks forward to hearing from NYCDOT on a timeline
354 for installation.
355

356 Sincerely,

357
358 Delores Rubin, Chair
359

360 Ernest Modarelli Co-Chair, Transportation

361 Planning Committee

362 Christine Berthet Co-Chair, Transportation

363 Planning Committee

364
365

367

368 May 4, 2016

369

370 Ms. Margaret Forgione

371 Manhattan Borough Commissioner

372 NYC Department of Transportation

373 59 Maiden Lane, 35th Floor

374 New York, NY 10038

375

376 **Re: Bike Corral at 892 Ninth Ave**

377 Dear Commissioner Forgione:

378 Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) supports the installation of a bike corral (bicycle
379 racks located in parking lane in lieu of a parking space with signage and a protected area
380 around it) for 20 bicycles on Ninth Avenue. The requested bike corral location is:

- 381
- 382 • The East side of Ninth Avenue between W 57th and W 58th streets in the general
vicinity of 892 Ninth Ave.
 - 383 • The establishment ASK Standard Inc. dba Bike Rental Central Park has accepted
384 to maintain the corral although the public will be able to park there.

385 CB4 is also requesting that the bicycles racks currently installed on these sidewalks be
386 removed and NYC Department of Transportation coordinate enforcement of illegal
387 bicycle parking and sidewalk obstructions with NYPD & DSNY following the
388 installation of the bicycle corral.

389

390 CB4 was one of the early adopter of the bike corral concept, which is consistent with the
391 city's efforts to increase bicycle usage and while reclaiming space for pedestrian use and
392 reducing occurrence of riding on the sidewalk, by further separating bicycles from
393 pedestrians.

394

395 Neighborhood residents have indicated that on the East side of Ninth Avenue between
396 57th and 58th streets, sometimes as many as 15 bicycles are congregated along the
397 sidewalk, obstructing the walkway on narrow sidewalks already very congested. Given
398 that several restaurants on the block utilize delivery bikes and many residents and visitors
399 use personal bicycles CB4 is pleased that the Bike Rental Central Park has submitted an
400 application to DOT indicating their willingness to maintain the bike corral for public use.

401

402 In supporting this location, we were mindful of the following considerations:

403

404

405

406

- The proposed Bicycle Corral is located adjacent to a bicycle lane;
- the location was chosen because it is in the middle of the block or
closest to the highest concentration of bike users.

407 ● the business at the address fronting the bicycle corral agrees to maintain
408 the space and signed a maintenance agreement with DOT or a local organization
409 as required by the DOT.

410 ● Notification of the location of a proposed Bicycle Corral, and removal
411 of parking was posted at least one week in advance of the public hearing on that
412 location;

413 ● The current use and regulations on the parking lane

414 ● Residents and/or Community Board members have noted crowded and
415 problematic bicycle parking along the sidewalk.

416 ● The DOT will install signage and protection from traffic for the corral
417 As always; we appreciate your assistance and consideration.

418 The Bike Rental Central Park submitted a Bicycle Corral application to NYC DOT in
419 April 2016.

420
421 Community Board 4 looks forward to the installation of the Bicycle Corral at 892 Ninth
422 Ave and to hearing from NYCDOT on a timeline for installation.
423

424 Sincerely,

425
426 Delores Rubin, Chair
427

428 Ernest Modarelli Co-Chair, Transportation

429 Planning Committee

430 Christine Berthet Co-Chair, Transportation

431 Planning Committee

432
433

434 *Transportation Planning Committee*

Item # 07

435

436 Commissioner Margaret Forgione

437 Department of Transportation

438 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor

439 New York, NY 10038

440

441 **Re: Intercity bus stop – 355 West 33rd Street**

442

443 Dear Commissioner Forgione,

444

445 We appreciate the opportunity to review the application for a bus stop for a maximum of

446 23 pick-ups and 12-drop offs per weekday at 355 West 33rd Street, for Monroe Bus

447 Company. Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) recommends that the bus stop at this

448 location be approved subject to the permit including the following stipulations:

449

450

1. The location is 93' long accommodating 2 buses at a time.

451

2. The applicant has agreed to revise his schedule to ensure that there is never more than two buses arriving or departing at the same time. Such revised schedule should be attached to the permit. The Schedule should also be revised so that there is at least 5 minutes delay between buses using the same space

452

453

454

455

3. The applicant has agreed that he will not use 9th Avenue or any other location in the vicinity to load or pick up its passengers

456

457

4. The applicant has agreed that he will instruct the drivers to cut off the bus engines during the loading and unloading, and post prominent signs in the drivers 'cab reminding them not to idle.

458

459

460

5. The applicant has agreed to direct his passengers to line up against the wall and preserve 8' of pedestrian right of way for the public to navigate through the stop.

461

462

463

464 *Transportation Planning Committee*

Item # 08

465

466 May XX 2016

467

468 Margaret Forgione

469 Manhattan Borough Commissioner

470 Department of Transportation

471 59 Maiden Lane, 37th Floor

472 New York, NY 10038

473

474 **Re: Truck signage on West 22nd Street**

475

476 Dear Commissioner Forgione,

477

478 Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) requests the assistance of the Department of
479 Transportation to resolve the escalating truck traffic problem on our residential streets.

480 We request that a “ No Trucks Except Local Deliveries” sign be installed at the
481 approaches of West 22nd Street and 10th Avenue.

482

483 In recent months the volume of construction trucks has increased markedly on this
484 residential street. The trucks start using the street – which is not a truck route – as early as
485 6 a.m. and this continues uninterrupted until late at night.

486

487 The Clement Clarke Moore Park is located on that block. Its playground is a destination
488 for a large number of children in the neighborhood who travel the street to reach the park.

489

490 We appreciate an expeditious solution to this unsafe situation.

491

492

493

494

496

497 May 4, 2016

498

499 Chairman John Degnan

500 The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

501 4 World Trade Center

502 150 Greenwich Street – 22nd Floor

503 New York, NY 10006

504

505 Re PABT Community Town Hall

506 Metro Baptist Church

507 Hell's Kitchen South, April 18th, 2016

508

509 Dear Chair Degnan,

510

511 Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) would like to thank the Port Authority of New
512 York and New Jersey (PANYNJ) for its presentation at the Community Town Hall on
513 April 18th on the current state of the Port Authority Bus Terminal (PABT) and the Port
514 Authority's plan to build a new bus terminal.

515

516 The Community Town Hall at the Metro Baptist Church on West 40th Street in
517 Manhattan was sponsored by MCB4, Congressman Jerold Nadler, New York State
518 Senator Brad Hoylman, New York State Senator Adriano Espaillat, New York
519 Representative Linda Rosenthal, New York State Representative Richard Gottfried, New
520 York City Public Advocate Letitia James, Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer,
521 and New York City Council Member Cory Johnson.

522

523 At the Town Hall representatives from the Port Authority reported on recent
524 improvements of "customer experience" in the concourse of the terminal; improvements
525 to circulation in the terminal and wait time within the vicinity of the terminal; and the
526 Port Authority's International Design + Deliverability Competition ("Competition") to
527 select a "conceptual design" for a new bus terminal.

528

529 As the district's elected representatives, Senator Hoylman, Representative Rosenthal,
530 Representative Gottfried, Borough President Brewer, and Council Member Johnson all
531 expressed dismay on any PANYNJ preliminary concept plan for a new bus terminal that
532 would expropriate private properties west of Ninth Avenue in Hell's Kitchen South.

533

534 **A NEW TERMINAL IN THE HEART OF HELL'S KITCHEN**

535

536 The 65-year old Port Authority Bus Terminal faces, according to the Port Authority,
537 "structural limitations that complicate its day-to-day operations." Moreover, the Port
538 Authority estimates that by 2040, peak-hour passenger traffic will increase by 35% to
539 51% and peak-hour bus traffic by 25% to 39%. In order to meet this estimated increase in
540 bus traffic, the Board of PANYNJ launched an international competition seeking

541 conceptual designs for a new bus terminal in midtown Manhattan, just "west of Ninth
542 Avenue." The Port Authority Board emphasized that no terminal would be built in New
543 Jersey.

544
545 At the Community Town Hall presentation on April 18th, PABT representatives stated
546 that the Port Authority was "at the very beginning" of the process to build a new terminal,
547 adding that it would likely defer to New York City land use procedures, specifically, its
548 Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP), in selecting the site for a new terminal.

549
550 According to the Port Authority the design concepts submitted will be "informed by a
551 Trans-Hudson Commuting Capacity Study, and by input from commuters, residents and
552 businesses in the vicinity of the bus terminal, as well as civic organizations and other
553 stakeholders."

554
555 Following the Port Authority presentation, the Chair of Manhattan Community Board 4
556 presented a brief slideshow introduction to some of the residents, businesses, and
557 institutions in the Hell's Kitchen South area where a new terminal might be built. The
558 slideshow also showed photos of the devastation in Hell's Kitchen South wrought by the
559 Port Authority's construction of the Lincoln Tunnel, the bus terminal, and the terminal
560 access ramps.

561
562 At the public session which followed, the Port Authority team was informed — robustly
563 at times — by input from the very residents, businesses, and civic organizations upon
564 whose neighborhood a new bus terminal would profoundly, and irrevocably, impact.

565
566 **THE COMMUNITY RESPONDS**

567
568 Over 250 members of the Hell's Kitchen community attended the Town Hall meeting,
569 filling the Metro Baptist Church to standing room only. At the public session following
570 the Port Authority presentation, members of the community, residents, business owners,
571 and workers, from 34th Street to 57th Street, spoke, often with passion, of their concerns
572 about the proposed expansion. These speakers made it amply clear that the properties the
573 Port Authority may consider acquiring for a new bus terminal are not just "real estate"
574 but are the homes and businesses of "real people." They made comments about the
575 current operation of the terminal and raised questions about the feasibility — and wisdom
576 — of constructing a new terminal in the middle of a residential district in midtown
577 Manhattan, in the heart of a residential community, on land where their homes stood,
578 homes in which some had lived for generations.

579
580 One speaker urged the Port Authority Board of Governors and the Competition designers
581 to come to the area, to see first-hand a bustling community, to imagine it as their home,
582 their neighborhood, their community — and then to contemplate its obliteration by the
583 erection of a massive bus terminal.

584
585 The comments, queries, and concerns clustered around the following categories:
586

587 **1. Displacement, Demolition, Destruction**

588

589 ***Zoning Restrictions***

590 The first speaker pointed out that the area immediately west of Ninth Avenue under
591 consideration for a new bus terminal is governed by the Special Hudson Yards District
592 (SHYD) and that its Hell's Kitchen Subdistrict has specific restrictions against
593 demolition. The speaker noted that MCB4, the New York City Department of City
594 Planning, and our council member, who at that time was Speaker of the New York City
595 Council, spent years in negotiations to achieve the special district and the restrictions
596 against demolition. Dismantling this hard-won zoning — zoning carefully crafted to
597 ensure a vibrant and balanced development of the far west side of Manhattan — might
598 seriously derail the City's vital and ongoing efforts to encourage and integrate
599 commercial and residential development in the area.

600

601 Another speaker pointed out that the area under consideration for a new bus terminal is
602 now zoned residential as a result of the same City efforts — in contrast with the present
603 location of the bus terminal on Eighth Avenue, which is zoned commercial.

604

605 ***Displacement of Residents***

606 The Port Authority statement that it will try to "minimize" the use of private land for a
607 new terminal, did not appear to reassure the community. Almost 300 apartments, many of
608 which are affordable, rent-regulated homes occupied by long-term low and moderate
609 income residents, lie west of Ninth Avenue, in the area threatened by a new terminal.
610 Many of the apartments are occupied by families who have lived in the area for
611 generations. The daughter of one of the speakers, the audience was informed, was the
612 sixth-generation of her family to live in the neighborhood. Losing an apartment though
613 condemnation would be more than losing a home: it would be losing a community which
614 had sustained her family for generations.

615

616 A number of people who spoke were in the twenties and thirties and had lived in the
617 neighborhood all their lives. Others had raised their children, some, their grandchildren,
618 in the apartments they occupied. Many shopped, worked, and worshiped in the
619 neighborhood.

620

621 No one spoke in favor of losing their home.

622

623 ***Loss of Businesses***

624 Many speakers brought up their daily trips to the reasonably-priced stores located in the
625 affected area and noted that Starbucks and Jamba Juice in the current bus terminal were
626 not businesses providing valuable services they could afford. A number of businesses on
627 that stretch on Ninth Avenue provides affordable fresh food to many of the hundreds of
628 seniors residing at Manhattan Plaza and in the larger Hell's Kitchen neighborhood.

629

630 ***Loss of Community Institutions***

631 Some of the institutions whose buildings would be demolished if private land were
632 acquired for a new bus terminal provide services not just for the immediate neighborhood

633 but for a wider community. One speaker reminded the attendees that the Farm Project on
634 the roof of the Metro Baptist Church provides fresh vegetables to the food pantry in the
635 basement of the church which serves over 800 people a month. The Farm Project had just
636 been recognized by a national organization and awarded a \$5,000 grant for its work.

637

638 Another speaker referred to the head start program that welcomed her children when all
639 the other programs were full or too expensive. The Pastor of Metro Baptist showed how
640 the Church helped the Port Authority by taking in many young people who come to the
641 city by bus for the first time and need guidance to stay on "the right path."

642

643 A catholic nun from the Dwelling Place — a transitional women's shelter on West 40th
644 Street, founded in 1977 — spoke about her concern about the poor, the vulnerable getting
645 pushed out "as so often happens" in the name of "progress." A woman who "graduated"
646 from the shelter spoke about how the Dwelling Place turned her life around so that now
647 she is healthy, has a permanent home and a steady job.

648

649 A speaker from the Damayan Migrant Workers Association which serves Filipino
650 migrant workers, explained how grateful she was that the Metro Baptist Church has been
651 giving their non-profit organization space since 2000.

652

653 Speaking last, the pastor of Metro Baptist Church, in a moving speech about how the
654 church provides services to the most vulnerable people of midtown including patrons of
655 the Port Authority Bus Terminal, pointed out that the church sees people from the
656 terminal at the beginning or the tail end of their dream, arriving in the city or leaving the
657 city. The church helps the arrivals with food, clothing, and toiletries and assists the
658 departing with money for a ticket home. The loss of the assistance Metro Baptist has
659 provided over the years, and continues to provide, to our vulnerable citizens and visitors
660 to the bus terminal — would be an irredeemable blow to the midtown community.

661

662 **2. Traffic and Infrastructure**

663

664 *Lincoln Tunnel*

665 A number of speakers questioned the logic of building a new terminal without improving
666 old infrastructure. The Lincoln Tunnel, which opened in 1937 — when you could still
667 buy a Pierce Arrow — is now one of the country's busiest roadways, with over 120,000
668 cars passing through every day and 1,700 buses every morning. The width of each tunnel
669 roadway is 21 feet and 6 inches, narrower than most of the streets in Hell's Kitchen.
670 During rush hours today it is backed up with traffic. How will it then accommodate an
671 estimated increase in car and bus traffic by 2040?

672

673 *More Rail, Less Traffic*

674 One speaker, to thunderous applause, pointed out that logical urban planning would move
675 the bus terminal to the Meadowlands Sports Complex and then build a light rail into
676 Manhattan.

677

678 *Midtown Congestion*

679 A resident questioned how a new terminal, ostensibly built to accommodate increased
680 bus traffic, would make a dent in the already choked traffic conditions on Ninth Avenue
681 during rush hours. Wouldn't a new terminal make the situation worse?
682

683 **3. Current PABT Operations**

684

685 *Commuter vs. Community Experience*

686 A presenter from the PABT spoke of the retail improvements PABT had made to enhance
687 the "customer experience," by adding a Starbucks and a Jamba Juice to the first level. A
688 speaker pointed out that while those retailers may enhance the "commuter experience"
689 chain store outlets were antithetical to the character of the neighborhood.
690

690

691 *A Bad Neighbor*

692 No one at the Town Hall expressed neighborly feeling towards the current PABT. "The
693 Port Authority is a horrible neighbor," said a business owner. "The back end of Ninth
694 Avenue is their dumping ground." Another speaker complained about buses lining her
695 street, with their engines running and their odors coming into her home.
696

696

697 A resident who lives close to the PABT agreed it had been a bad neighbor for years,
698 adding: "If you want to make people feel better about you, be better neighbors. Don't be
699 the guy who leaves his car jacked up in the front yard."
700

700

701 **CONCLUSION**

702

703 The response from nearly every member of the community at the Town Hall was clear:
704 people live, work, and worship here; demolishing their homes and institutions would be a
705 devastating blow to their lives and their neighborhood.
706

706

707 The position of MCB4 is equally clear: Hell's Kitchen South is an essential part of the
708 larger Hell's Kitchen community. It must not be demolished. This Board believes it is
709 crucial to preserve the homes, businesses and institutions in this area to maintain our
710 neighborhood character. We call on the Port Authority Board to reexamine the feasibility
711 of building a new terminal in our residential district and encourage it to continue to
712 improve its relationship with the community.
713

713

714 And in the spirit of the October 22,2015 Port Authority Board resolution directing the
715 Board and staff to "solicit substation public and stakeholder input" we urge the Port
716 Authority Board to provide to the competitors MCB4's letters about the proposals for a
717 new terminal and to direct the competitors to meet early on with the community in order
718 to gain insight on the deliverability of their design.
719

719

720 We look forward to working with you to ensure that the selected design takes the
721 appropriate measures to help us achieve this goal.
722

722

723 Thank you,
724

724

725 Executive Committee
726
727 cc Congressman Jerold Nadler
728 State Senator Brad Holyman
729 State Senator Adriano Espaillat
730 New York State Representative Linda Rosenthal
731 New State Representative Richard Gottfried
732 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer
733 New York City Council Member Corey Johnson
734 Pastor Tiffany Henkel, Metro Baptist Church
735 Joe Restuccia, CHDC

736
737
738

739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770

DRAFT

772

773 May 4, 2016

774

775 Electeds

776

777

778

779 **Re PABT Community Town Hall**

780 **Metro Baptist Church, West 40th Street**

781 **April 18, 2016**

782

783 Dear Congressman Jerold Nadler, State Senator Brad Holyman, State Senator Adriano
784 Espallat, New York State Representative Linda Rosenthal, New State Representative
785 Richard Gottfried, Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer, New York City Council
786 Member Corey Johnson:

787

788 Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) would like to thank you for your sponsorship
789 and participation at the Community Town Hall on the Port Authority Bus Terminal
790 (PABT) at the Metro Baptist Church on West 40th Street on April 18, 2016. We
791 appreciate you lending your names, your ears, and your voices to the issues raised by the
792 Port Authority's Design + Deliverability Competition to select a "conceptual design" for a
793 new bus terminal.

794

795 It is very clear from the Town Hall meeting that our community is deeply concerned
796 about the Port Authority's proposals to build a new bus terminal west of Ninth Avenue
797 and that the community will be strongly opposed to the loss of businesses and residences
798 to make way for a new terminal. In light of the unified outcry from the over 250
799 residents, business owners, workers, and representatives of community institutions who
800 attended the Community Town Hall, MCB4 urges all of our elected officials to work
801 together to strategize on how to protect the Hell's Kitchen South neighborhood.

802

803 The MCB4 slide show presentation at the Town Hall focused primarily on the Hell's
804 Kitchen South area and highlighted some of the people, businesses, and institutions of a
805 vibrant, residential neighborhood. The primary alarm raised by the proposal to build a
806 new bus terminal is that it would require the demolition of the heart of Hell's Kitchen
807 South, potentially resulting in the loss of, among other invaluable assets:

808

809 • over 280 apartments;

810 • nearly 30 businesses and stores;

811 • buildings dating back to 1879, an integral part of the neighborhood's historic fabric;

812 • a vital community church with a congregation of over 100 members;

813 • a food pantry that serves over 800 people each month; and,

814 • a Head Start program that serves 40 families.

815

816 This impact alone is severe, but MCB4 recognizes that the effect of a new Port Authority
817 Bus Terminal would be felt district-wide. As stated on the Port Authority website, the
818 PABT “is not only the nation's largest bus terminal, it's also the world's busiest.” As a
819 significant piece of the transportation infrastructure for the North East, the redesign of
820 this facility must be viewed within a wider regional lens. The community has spoken
821 with one voice. An equally unified voice from all of you, our City, State, and Federal
822 elected officials is critical.

823

824 MCB4 urges our elected representatives to:

825

826 • Take a stand against the demolition of any property within the Hell's Kitchen
827 Subdistrict of the Hudson Yards Special District.

828

829 • Devise a coordinated strategy that reflects the interests of the community to deal with
830 any Port Authority expansion.

831

832 • Work with the Port Authority to explore alternative sites including a New Jersey
833 terminal with the possibility of completing the Gateway project and expanding the MTA
834 number 7 line into New Jersey.

835

836 • Convince the Port Authority that respondents from the Design + Deliverability
837 Competition meet with MCB4 leadership.

838

839 • Require that an in-depth study be conducted of the potential health risks associated with
840 the potential air pollution associated with idling buses within our district for extended
841 periods of time.

842

843 • Lobby our position at the next Port Authority Board meeting on May 26, 2016.

844

845 Once again, MCB4 appreciates the strong support from all of our elected officials. We
846 want to work with you to put the convictions expressed in words at the Community Town
847 Hall into actions that result in preserving a vibrant and vital New York City
848 neighborhood.

849

850 Sincerely,

851

852 Executive Committee

853

854 cc Chairman John Degnan, The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

855 Pastor Tiffany Henkel, Metro Baptist Church

856 Joe Restuccia, CHDC

857

858

859

860