



# THE CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 3

59 East 4th Street - New York, NY 10003

Phone (212) 533-5300

[www.cb3manhattan.org](http://www.cb3manhattan.org) - [mn03@cb.nyc.gov](mailto:mn03@cb.nyc.gov)

Alysha Lewis-Coleman, Board Chair

Susan Stetzer, District Manager

March 2021 Full Board Minutes

Meeting of Community Board 3 held on Tuesday, March 23, 2021 at 6:30pm via Zoom

## Public Session:

Michelle KupperSmith: On behalf of East Village Neighbors Mutual Aid group responsible for community fridge on e 12th street, is now managing a vaccine scheduling system to help people receive appointments through the State and City systems. The website and hotline is shared:

Vaylateena Jones: Provided update from Lower East Side Power Partnership (LESPP). Shared a report that detailed vaccinations have been made to white residents over all other nonwhite residents. LESPP is advocating for more community-based organizations to do COVID outreach, testing and vaccinations.

Michael Marino: Provided a public apology to a fellow board member.

Eric Diaz: On behalf of Vision Urbana, Inc. provided update on the Vision Urbana Vaccine pod located at 266 East Broadway NY NY 10002 which has vaccinated over 800 seniors and essential workers on the Lower East Side as of Tuesday March 23rd and is on course to providing more than 1,100 vaccinations by Friday March 26th. The pod is slated to end according to the NYC DOH by this Friday. An appeal for encouraging emails to the DOH and other advocates to keep the pod open was made until at least the remaining couple of hundred registered residents are vaccinated.Z

Campbell Munn: Local resident is voicing a complaint against a curb side management among other transportation issues near his residency and wants some follow up to resolve some of these complaints.

Kyle Kelly: Parks update that includes an event taking place at Little Flower playground. Invites the public to reach out to him directly via phone or email.

Sarah Batchu: Chief of Staff for Lower East Side Girls of New York. Announced center for well-being and happiness. It will provide free programming to all community members regardless of age and gender. Online classes have begun.

## Public Officials:

Mayor Bill de Blasio, Andrew Kunkes:

Not present

Public Advocate Jumaane Williams, Phillip Ellison:

Not present

Comptroller Scott Stringer, Luke Wolf:

Provided Comptroller report. Survey of 1200 NYC residents revealed lack of daycare available for particularly female employees during the pandemic. Developed a plan to overhaul peaceful protests in NYC.

Borough President Gale Brewer, Brian Lewis:

3pm on Tuesday (every Tuesday) will meet to discuss future on an array of issues including vaccines, housing, transportation, etc; This weekly Tuesday gathering will inform us as residents for all incoming resources and funding. Support made available to educate religious institutions to learn Land Use to avoid developers' attempting to purchase their real estate.

Congressmember Nydia Velazquez, Lingxia Ye:

Provided Congressman report.

Congressmember Carolyn Maloney, Victor Montesinos:

Provided Congressman report.

Assemblymember Yuh-Line Niou, Shivani Gonzalez:

Provided Assembly member report.

Assemblymember Deborah J. Glick, Charlie Anderson:

Provided Assembly member report.

Assemblymember Harvey Epstein, Aura Olavarria:

Provided update on impeachment of Governor Cuomo – “It is going to take awhile”. Budget update. Legalization of cannabis is underway. Provided landlord and tenant rent support bill update.

State Senator Brian Kavanagh, Chantel Cabrera:

Provided Senator report.

State Senator Brad M. Hoylman, Caroline Wekselbaum:

Senator Hoylman is committed to banning ghost guns” (disassembled and not traceable, even downloaded from internet). Legislation to create a long haul COVID registry. It’s modeled from the 9/11 registry where folks can be voluntarily tracked to provide services to them. “COVID long haulers” have a series of issues that can last for weeks and months. Senator will host a Forum on Sunday March 28th with Peter Marks who approves all the vaccines on the FDA to address questions including the new COVID variants. The senator helped provide a pop up site to Campos Plaza and schedule over 1,000 residents with appointments. An additional forum on rank choice voting will take place this Wednesday (tomorrow).

Councilmember Margaret Chin, Kana Ervin:

Provided Councilmember report.

Councilmember Carlina Rivera, Isabelle Chandler:

Provided Councilmember report.

Members Present at First Vote:

David Adams	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Tareake Ramos	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Linda Jones	[P]	Paul Rangel	[A]
Jesse Beck	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Tatiana Jorio	[P]	Richard Ropiak	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Thomas Rosa	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Olympia Kazi	[P]	Robin Schatell	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Joseph Kerns	[A]	Heidi Schmidt	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Michelle Koppersmith	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[P]
Felicia Cruickshank	[A]	Mae Lee	[P]	Anisha Steephen	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Wendy Lee	[A]	Sandra Strother	[P]
Alistair Economakis	[A]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Josephine Velez	[P]
Shirley Fennessey	[A]	David Louie	[P]	Troy Velez	[P]
Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Ellen Luo	[A]	Rodney Washington	[P]
Debra Glass	[A]	Michael Marino	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
Andrea Gordillo	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[A]	Jacky Wong	[P]
Herman Hewitt	[A]	Michael Perles	[P]	Ricky Wong	[P]

Minutes:

Minutes of January 2021 were approved, as is.

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

Special Election for Treasurer

Two candidates Sandra Strother and David Crane. David Crane elected Treasurer.

Board Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Alysha Lewis-Coleman

District Manager's Report:

District Manager Susan Stetzer

Committee Reports:

**Executive Committee**

no votes necessary

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Health, Seniors, & Human Services / Youth, Education, & Human Rights Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections) approved by committee
2. Mt Sinai Beth Israel Hospital: updates on Behavioral Health Center and 14th St Facility & Main Campus no vote necessary
3. Parent Resource Fair planning update no vote necessary
4. Committee goals for the year no vote necessary
5. CAB/CEC reports no vote necessary
6. Vote to adjourn approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**SLA & DCA Licensing Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections) approved by committee

**New Liquor License Applications**

2. Pulqueria (Blue Agave NY Inc), 11 Doyers St (op) DISCUSSION:

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

**WHEREAS**, Blue Agave Ny Inc. doing business as Pulqueria, is seeking a full on-premises liquor license, in the premises located at 11 Doyers Street, between Bowery and Pell Street, New York, New York; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for an establishment with a certificate of occupancy of 30 people, 12 tables and 24 seats with one bar counter with no seats, hours of operation of 12:00 P.M to 12:00 A.M Sunday to Thursday and 12:00 P.M to 2:00 A.M Friday to Saturday, with a full kitchen serving Mexican food during all hours of operation, will have no televisions and a curator will play ambient background music without subwoofers; and

**WHEREAS**, there are 4 full on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the applicant and 6 full on-premises liquor licenses per the SLA LAMP map; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant has never previously been a license holder but the incoming general manager managed and cooked at the location for at least 10 years; and

**WHEREAS**, this location has operated since 2011 with a full-on premises license; and

**WHEREAS**, there were no commercial 311 complaints at this location with any action by NYPD necessary since 2018; and

**WHEREAS**, two residents of Doyers Street and another local resident spoke in opposition to the application and;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for Blue Agave Ny Inc., for the premises located at 11 Doyers Street, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees to the following signed notarized stipulations that:

- 1) it will operate as a full-service restaurant, with Mexican food being served all hours,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 12:00 P.M to 12:00 A.M Sunday to Thursday and 12:00 P.M to 2:00 A.M Friday to Saturday
- 3) it will have a closed fixed façade with no open doors or windows except my entrance doors will close at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances or during unamplified live performances or televised sports, and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music without subwoofers, and a curator will play ambient background music without subwoofers and will not have any DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged and ensure that sound from the premises is not audible in any of the surrounding apartments which will be arranged with a sound engineer,
- 5) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board 3,

- 6) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 7) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 8) It may have "happy hours" until 8:00 P.M. each night
- 9) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside and a staff member designated and accountable for crowd management, and a designated area for smoking,
- 10) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 11) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

3. Entity to be Formed, 103 1st Ave (op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

**WHEREAS**, Sidney's Five LLC doing business as Sidney's Five, is seeking a full on-premises liquor license, in the premises located at 103 1st Avenue, between East 6th Street and East 7th Street New York, New York; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for an establishment with a certificate of occupancy of 74 people, 20 tables and 63 seats with one L-shaped bar with 15 seats, hours of operation of 11:00 AM – 2:00AM all days, seafood focused menu with a full kitchen serving food during all hours of operation, recorded ambient background music, and

**WHEREAS**, there are 28 full on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the applicant and the SLA LAMP map; and

**WHEREAS**, there were no commercial 311 calls with action necessary by the NYPD since 2018, and

**WHEREAS**, one applicant has never previously been a license holder but was the head bartender at a licensed location, Union Square Café, for two and a half years and one applicant has never previously been a license holder but has worked in the food business for at least 5 years; and

**WHEREAS**, the premises were previously licensed with a full-on premises liquor license since at least 2014; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant indicated that there were issues with the previous operator hosting live music events and disturbing residential tenants of the premises, but the applicant informed the tenants that there would no longer be live music in the establishment and two spoke at the meeting in support of the application as a result; and

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for Sidney's Five LLC, for the premises located at 103 1st Avenue, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees to the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a full-service seafood restaurant serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 11:00 A.M. – 2:00 A.M. all days,
- 3) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances or during unamplified live performances or televised sports, and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 5) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 6) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 7) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 8) it may have "happy hours" until 6:00 P.M. each night
- 9) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside,
- 10) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 11) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

4. The Long Pour (949 Grand Bar LLC), 155 2nd Ave (op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

**WHEREAS**, 949 Grand Bar LLC doing business as The Long Pour is seeking a full on-premises liquor license, in the premises located at 155 2nd Avenue between East 9th Street and East 10th Street, New York, New York; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for an establishment with a certificate of occupancy of 74 people, three tables and seven counters with 23 seats with one bar with 17 stools, hours of operation of 8:00 A.M. – 4:00 A.M. Monday through Saturday and 10:00 A.M. – 4:00 A.M. Sunday, bar food made in a food prep area, serving food during all hours of operation, with no more than eight televisions, ambient background music and

**WHEREAS**, there are 23 full on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the applicant and the SLA LAMP map; and

**WHEREAS**, this location was previously licensed with a full-on premises liquor license; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has never previously been a license holder but has worked in this business for 20 years, and was the bar manager at nearby establishment The Bull McCabes since 2013 and before that a bartender since; and

**WHEREAS**, there were zero commercial 311 complaints at this location with action necessary by NYPD since 2018; and

**WHEREAS**, eight residential tenants of the premises and 98 other local residents signed a petition in support of the application and a CB3 public member spoke at the meeting in support of the application; and

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for 949 Grand Bar LLC, for the premises located at 155 2nd Avenue, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees to the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a bar, with bar food made in a food prep area served during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 8:00 A.M. – 4:00 A.M. Monday through Saturday and 10:00 A.M. – 4:00 A.M. Sunday,
- 3) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances or during unamplified live performances or televised sports, and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 5) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 6) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 7) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 8) it may have "happy hours" until 07:00 P.M. each night
- 9) will have a staff person responsible for ensuring no loitering, noise or crowds outside
- 10) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 11) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

5. Joey Roses LLC, 174 Rivington St (op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

**WHEREAS**, Joey Roses LLC, is seeking a full on-premises liquor license, in the premises located at 174 Rivington Street, between Clinton Street and Attorney Street, New York, New York; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for an establishment with a Letter of No Objection of 74 people, seven tables and 16 seats with one 21-foot L-shape bar with seven seats, hours of operation of Sunday to Wednesday 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. and Thursday to Saturday 11:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M, comfort food in a food preparation area, serving food during all hours of operation, no televisions, ambient background music, and

**WHEREAS**, there are 11 full on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the applicant and the SLA LAMP map; and

**WHEREAS**, this location was most recently licensed with a full on-premises liquor license for Cool Bar Inc. doing business as Alaska Bar since 2019 and previously had operators that disregarded their stipulations and congregating of patrons outside the establishment and the adjacent storefronts; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant was previously licensed at two other premises at 239 3rd Avenue, 4738 Vernon Boulevard and is currently licensed at 114 East 16th Street, none of which had commercial 311 complaints since 2018; and

**WHEREAS**, there have been two commercial 311 complaints at this location with NYPD action necessary since 2018; and

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for Joey Roses LLC, for the premises located at 174 Rivington Street, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees to the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a comfort food restaurant serving food prepared in a food preparation area during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be Sunday to Wednesday 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. and Thursday to Saturday 11:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M.,
- 3) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances or during unamplified live performances or televised sports, and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 4) it will play ambient background music only not audible in the surrounding residences, consisting of recorded music, and will not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 5) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 6) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 7) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 8) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 9) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside and a staff member designated and accountable for crowd management,
- 10) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 11) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

6. Uno Nove Otto Corp, 198 Allen St (op)  
withdrawn

7. Lao Austin LLC, 503-505 E 12th St (op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

**WHEREAS**, Lao-Austin LLC doing business, is seeking a full on-premises liquor license, in the premises located at 503-505 East 12th Street between Avenue A and Avenue B, New York, New York; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for an establishment with a certificate of occupancy of 74 people indoors and 19 people in the contiguous backyard, 29 tables and 74 seats with one L-shaped bar with 16 seats with hours of operation of Sunday-Wednesday 10:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. and Thurs-Saturday 10:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M., Laotian food, a full kitchen serving food during all hours of operation, no televisions, ambient background music, and

**WHEREAS**, there are three full on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the applicant and eight on-premises liquor licenses within 500 feet per the SLA LAMP map; and

**WHEREAS**, the NYC Department of Buildings informed CB3 that Lao-Austin LLC is not permitted to use the backyard as an extension of the restaurant as the Certificate of Occupancy is expired. The Department of Buildings has additionally informed CB3 that the business would need to cure any existing violations and obtain a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy before using the backyard. This is required for both use of the backyard permanently and also for immediate use under Executive Order 202.38 issued June 6, 2020 by Governor Andrew Cuomo which allows for establishments licensed by the State Liquor Authority to expand premises to otherwise unlicensed contiguous private space under the control of the establishment and Executive Order 126 issued June 18, 2020 by Mayor Bill DeBlasio which directed the Department of Transportation to administer an "Open Restaurants Program;" and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has operated Khe-Yo at 157 Duane Street, New York, NY with a full on-premises liquor license since 2013 with no SLA reports or action within the past three years; and

**WHEREAS**, this location has a history of backyard noise issues, including noise emanating from an outdoor walk in fridge, and when the backyard was used commercially it created issues for many residents who were in attendance at the March 2021 CB3 SLA meeting, and

**WHEREAS**, there were eight commercial 311 complaints at this location with action by NYPD necessary since 2018; and

**WHEREAS**, the North Avenue A block association, four residents from the adjacent building at 507 East 12th Street, two residents whose apartments overlook the backyard at 503-505 East 12th Street, and five neighborhood residents spoke at the meeting in opposition to this application and made it clear that any commercial use of the backyard would be extremely detrimental to their quality of life; and

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for Lao-Austin LLC, for the premises located at 503-505 East 12th Street, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees to the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a full-service Laotian restaurant serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be Sunday-Wednesday 10:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. and Thurs-Saturday 10:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M.,
- 3) will have a closed fixed façade with no open doors or windows except my entrance door will close by 10:00 P.M. or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, or during unamplified live performances or televised sports,
- 4) it will play ambient background music consisting of recorded music, and will not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 5) it will not use the backyard for any commercial purposes, staff will not be allowed to smoke in the backyard, and the back door will always be closed, and it will not have any equipment in its backyard that emanates sound audible to the surrounding residents,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 7) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 8) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 9) it will not have "happy hours"
- 10) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

**Items not heard at Committee**

8. Taisho Inc, 9 St Marks Pl (op/corp change)  
administratively approved
9. Udon St Marks (Muneshige Inc), 11 St Marks Pl (wb)  
administratively approved
10. 25 B Group Rest Ave LLC, 25 Ave B (op/corp change)  
administratively approved
11. Bedlam Bar (Ajaccio Inc), 40 Ave C (op/corp change)  
administratively approved
12. Azasu (Azasu Inc), 49 Clinton St (op/alt/add sushi counter with 10 seats and reconfigure floor plans)  
administratively approved
13. Plado (Germat of NY Inc), 192 2nd Ave (wb/corp change)  
administratively approved
14. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding SLA items 4, 5, 7)**

**37 YES 1 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (SLA items 4, 5, 7)**

**Joint Arts & Cultural Affairs Subcommittee and Landmarks Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections)  
approved by committee

2. Proposal to combine Arts Subcommittee and Landmarks Committee into one committee  
no vote necessary
3. Village Preservation: Request for support for landmarks designation of 88 East 10th Street

**VOTE: TITLE: To support reconsideration by the Landmarks Preservation Commission of the Request for Evaluation submitted by Village Preservation regarding 88 East 10th Street**

**WHEREAS**, 88 East 10th Street was built in 1844 by Peter Stuyvesant, a direct descendant of the last Dutch Governor of New Amsterdam; and

**WHEREAS**, in the twentieth century it was the home and studio of artist Willem de Kooning from 1952 until 1959, becoming the place where de Kooning would complete some of his most important work; and

**WHEREAS**, the African American sculptor Selma Hortense Burke lived and worked at 88 East 10th Street from 1944 to 1949, completing "The Four Freedoms," which was used as a model for the image of FDR on the U.S. dime coin; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, Community Board 3 urges the Landmarks Preservation Commission to reconsider the request for evaluation for 10 East 88th Street submitted by Village Preservation.

4. Village Preservation: Overview of current issues and projects  
no vote necessary
5. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Land Use, Zoning, Public & Private Housing**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections)  
approved by committee
2. Comments/Recommendations on the "Planning Together" Comprehensive Planning framework and legislation (NYC Council Int 2186)

**VOTE: TITLE: Comments on the "Planning Together" Comprehensive Planning framework and legislation (NYC Council Int 2186)**

**WHEREAS**, New York City Council Speaker Corey Johnson has released a report titled "Planning Together: A New Comprehensive Planning Framework for New York City" and New York City Council Intro 2186-2020 has been introduced in the Council, which would amend local law to require a comprehensive long-term plan for the City of New York; and

**WHEREAS**, the bill would create a ten-year comprehensive planning cycle connecting budget, land use, and strategic planning processes. The cycle would include a review of City conditions, including racial and socio-economic disparities, access to opportunity, displacement risk, short- and long- term risks, impacts of prior development and budget decisions, and current and projected infrastructure needs. A Citywide Goals Statement would set targets for housing, jobs, open space, resiliency infrastructure, City facilities, schools, transportation, public utilities, and other infrastructure. The plan would include: (1) strategic policies for achieving Citywide goals; (2) an analysis of the Zoning Resolution and recommended changes; (3) District Level Targets to distribute growth, infrastructure, amenities, and services equitably; (4) Community District land use scenarios; and (5) Community District budget needs; and

**WHEREAS**, the comprehensive planning framework outlined in Int. 2186-2020 aims to address fragmented planning processes and lack of agency coordination, tie planning goals to capital budget and infrastructure projects, address piecemeal zoning that has exacerbated socio-economic and racial inequality, and provide long-term proactive planning opportunities at the Community District and neighborhood level; and

**WHEREAS**, CB 3 has long supported community-based planning initiatives, including: being a member of the Community-Based Planning Task Force organized by the Municipal Art Society beginning in 2000; convening a CB 3 197-a Plan Task Force in 2005; approving the East Village/Lower East Side Rezoning in 2008 after years of work; helping steward and ultimately approving the Seward Park Urban Renewal Area a/k/a Essex Crossing deal in 2012; participating as a voting member of the Chinatown Working Group (CWG) and supporting Option 1 of the CWG plan for Subdistrict D as well as the plan for Subdistrict F in 2015; being a co-applicant on the Special Lower East Side and Chinatown Waterfront District rezoning proposal, a community-led rezoning proposal for the Two Bridges



waterfront; participating in the Inclusive City framework working group in 2017; and designing and approving a community-led zoning framework for an East Village Special Enhanced Commercial District in 2020, amongst other efforts; and

**WHEREAS**, some of these community-based planning initiatives have been successful and all have been challenging, often because of lack of resources or because they did not fit with Mayoral agencies' visions for these neighborhoods;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, CB 3 acknowledges the importance of comprehensive planning and the intention of this plan to address the impacts of City planning policy on racial and economic inequality, but we need an improved version of this bill as it does not fully address the process problems we currently have and the unfair planning outcomes they create; and

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, CB 3 submits the following comments on Intro 2186-2020, requiring a comprehensive long-term plan:

- 1) The scope of the proposal is mammoth and would require a level of study that exceeds the City's current resources to accomplish it. The Mayor's Office of Long-Term Planning & Sustainability (OLTPS) would need to take on a huge scope of activities that are currently undertaken by other agencies and this level of coordination and reallocation of responsibility would undoubtedly cause conflict and disruption. Additionally, the timeline of accomplishing a new citywide comprehensive plan, especially completing the first phase which is the Conditions of the City Report by 2023, seems ambitious.
- 2) The goal of creating district-level targets that "prioritize growth in neighborhoods with high access to opportunity and low risk for displacement" is not clear. This language should be changed to "prioritize the correction of historically discriminatory and unequal planning outcomes," establishing a topline goal of affirmatively reducing racial and economic inequality across community districts. This would not preclude targeting growth opportunities in wealthy, white neighborhoods and dismantling exclusionary zoning, but would also prioritize resource allocation to historically disinvested neighborhoods.
- 3) It is not clear how the Long-Term Planning Steering Committee would be more attuned to neighborhood-based concerns than the City Planning Commission, given that the composition of these bodies would be very similar. Both are largely representing citywide, government representatives. The Long-Term Planning Steering Committee must have a requirement for diverse community-based representation.
- 4) The provision for eliminating mandatory City Council review of certain ULURP actions that are consistent with the Final Long-Term Plan is a dangerous provision that could undercut the opportunity of communities to exert what limited power they have. If the CPC determines that a specific ULURP item is consistent with the Plan and the item is not "called up", it seems like the ULURP review by the CB and the BP becomes a useless exercise.
- 5) The proposal calls for the Draft 10-Year Capital Strategy document to include three district level targets that community boards, Borough Presidents and others will have an opportunity to react to, but ultimately the final target is adopted by the Steering Committee and incorporated into the Final Long-term plan and the City Council will adopt the land use scenario. They may or may not be the same ones preferred by the community.
- 6) The level of detail that would be included in these district level targets is not specified. The comprehensive plan must require sub-district level analyses in the Conditions of the City reports and the creation of district-level targets to account for the range of conditions and needs within very diverse Community Districts like CD 3.
- 7) The comprehensive plan should require that NYCHA's building portfolio and land assets be included in all assessment and planning analysis, documentation, and goal setting.
- 8) A Generic Environmental Impact Statement, which according to the proposal would reduce developers' CEQR compliance obligations for projects that were consistent with the Final Long-Term Plan, would not provide the level of in-depth review now required for a specific project. This is of concern because such short cutting might avoid a thorough analysis of a specific proposal which otherwise might result in recommended remediation actions that would be of benefit to the community.
- 9) The plan must more clearly define what meaningful community participation looks like, including expressly stating how language accessibility will be ensured and how technological divides will be bridged in outreach efforts.
- 10) The plan should require targeted community engagement and informational outreach beyond the currently mandated Borough hearing. NYCHA residents must have proactive targeted engagement and have required representation in all community planning processes, including mandatory appointments of NYCHA residents on the Borough Steering Committees.

- 11) We should start creating the long-term plan as outlined in an amended bill with the intention of scaling up if the data shows this process is possible, keeping it separate from the current planning approval processes, then evaluate the results of that initial process before incorporating them into a new planning approval process and comprehensive plan.
  - 12) There must be clearer, stronger incentives and/or penalties to ensure that actual zoning changes and development patterns are consistent with goals identified in the comprehensive plan.
  - 13) The comprehensive plan should include baselined budgetary commitments for Community Boards to have sufficient and sustained resources to participate effectively in the 10-year planning cycle. This must include funding for land use staff and the option to hire independent consultants and planning firms as needed.
  - 14) There must be mandatory Community Board representation on the Borough Steering Committees, with proportional representation depending on the size of the borough and number of Community Boards.
  - 15) There should be a required public hearing at each Community Board during the 150-day period between the submission of the draft comprehensive long-term plan and the submission of recommended preferred land use scenarios to the speaker of the city council, unless Community Boards choose to waive their hearing.
3. Two Bridges Update  
no vote necessary
  4. Committee goals for the year  
no vote necessary
  5. Report from Public Housing & Section 8 Housing Subcommittee

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 requests the Comptroller to work with OMB to provide funding for Bracetti Plaza façade work**

**WHEREAS**, a sidewalk shed was installed at Bracetti Plaza in 2015 to comply with façade work in accordance with Local Law 11; and

**WHEREAS**, Local Law 11 requires that buildings taller than six stories have exterior walls inspected and repaired every five years; and

**WHEREAS**, façade work in compliance with Local Law 11 is generally not eligible for capital funds, and

**WHEREAS**, NYCHA cannot afford to fund this work with its operations (expense) budget in compliance with Local Law 11; and

**WHEREAS**, because NYCHA cannot fund this work, the scaffolding must stay up indefinitely, until inspection and repairs are completed; and

**WHEREAS**, the scaffolding that has remained installed since 2015 without any façade work completed has become associated with various quality of life and safety concerns, including a recent murder case, and

**WHEREAS**, scaffolding has costs to maintain that drains NYCHA's budget further making it harder to do the eventual work; and

**WHEREAS**, building conditions deteriorate further and neighborhood conditions suffer when this work cannot be completed; and

**WHEREAS**, current expense funds are required for day-to-day operations and management of the building, so there is no resource available for larger, costlier façade work; and

**WHEREAS**, it is possible to use capital funds funded through municipal bond sales, which is regulated by the Comptroller;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, that Community Board 3 supports the sale of bonds for this façade work and requests that the Comptroller approve the sale of bonds for Bracetti Plaza façade work in compliance with Local Law 11; and

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that Community Board 3 asks the Comptroller to work with Office of Management and Budget to allow the use of capital funds for Local Law 11 repair work.

6. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

**Transportation, Public Safety, & Environment**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections) approved by committee
2. PSA 4 & 9th Precinct: public safety issues in the Avenue C/3rd St area  
no vote necessary
3. Planning for Outdoor Dining in Chinatown Core  
no vote necessary
4. Transportation Alternatives: request for support for Fix Canal - need for safety and traffic calming measures

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 recommendations for implementation of safety and traffic calming measures on Canal Street**

**Whereas** Canal St. has long been a severely dangerous thoroughfare threatening the safety and well-being of pedestrians, bicyclists and motorists alike, and its hazardous conditions continue to grow: from 2016 to 2020, at least 2,567 reported crashes occurred on Canal Street between Hudson St. and the Manhattan Bridge - almost 2 per day that injured at least 54 cyclists (killing one), 109 pedestrians (killing one) and 229 motor vehicle occupants (killing one); and

**Whereas** conditions on Canal St. not only endanger people's lives, but also interfere with the safe and effective conduct of business: the congested streets hinder deliveries to businesses, often leading to double-parking that blocks sidewalks and intersections, while crowded sidewalks limit space allocated to street vendors, and create an environment that is inhospitable to foot traffic and outdoor dining; and

**Whereas** with curb-to-curb street widths up to almost 100 ft. wide (dimensions more akin to a superhighway than a city street), Canal St. creates a vast chasm between its north and south sidewalks, thwarting people's safe crossing from one side of the street to the other and impeding connections and cohesiveness between Manhattan's most walkable and historic communities; and

**Whereas** as many as seven lanes operate on segments of Canal St. (e.g., the east end of the street (near Bowery/Mott/Elizabeth) has left turn/center medians + three travel lanes in each direction, and btw. Broadway and W. Broadway there are three lanes in each direction + a parking lane that is No Standing during rush hour, in both cases adding up to seven lanes). Many of these lanes are as wide as 12 or 13 ft., some even up to 15 ft., unnecessarily excessive widths (outside of DOT regulations and) not needed to accommodate even the widest trucks; and

**Whereas** pedestrian density on Canal Street's sidewalks is so intense that pedestrians are often forced to walk in the street where they risk being hit by oncoming traffic. Although pedestrian volumes are three times those of motor vehicles, 90% of street space goes to the vehicles; and

**Whereas** the heavy snarled flow of vehicular traffic on Canal does not allow for the orderly progression of vehicles, stopping movement at intersections and crosswalks by blocking vehicular passage and turning movements, while also obstructing and endangering pedestrians crossing the street. Gridlock often prevents drivers traveling east on Canal from moving across the street's many lanes to reach turning points heading north, such as at West Broadway, Greene, Centre, Mulberry and Elizabeth Streets., with drivers often ending up in Brooklyn; and

**Whereas** the previous CATS II 10- year study determined that left turns should be banned at the intersections of Canal Street and Greenwich Street, West Broadway, Greene Street, Centre Street, Mulberry Street, Elizabeth Street, Mott Street, Baxter Street, Lafayette Street, Broadway, and Varick Street; and

**Whereas** bicycling in NYC increased by 116% between 2008-2018, and 34% between 2013-2018. While bicycling figures on Canal St. itself are not available, counts on the Manhattan Bridge which leads into and extends from Canal St. show an average increase in daily bicycle volumes from 6,008 in 2019 to 7,093 by Oct. 2020, all indicating the increased need for safe and accessible bicycle facilities on Canal St.; and

**Whereas** after almost 35 years, 2-way tolling on the Verrazzano-Narrows Bridge was reinstated on 12/01/2020, removing the impetus for vehicles to skirt an expensive one-way double toll that led New Jersey-bound motorists and truckers to take a long, alternate route over the toll-free Manhattan Bridge and through Canal Street to the westbound toll-free Holland Tunnel, exacerbating traffic congestion on Canal. These new conditions call for a fresh look at Canal St.; and

**Whereas** congestion pricing is now expected to go into effect, with its potential for eliminating toll-free travel on the Manhattan Bridge, merits a new look at Canal St. as well; and

**Whereas** the Manhattan Bridge currently has 1 bike lane, 1 walkway, 4 train lines, 0 bus lanes, 2 car traffic lanes outbound and 5 car traffic lanes inbound; and

**Whereas** Chinatown's business and restaurant community has been severely impacted by the COVID pandemic; so

**Therefore, be it resolved** that Community Board 3 Manhattan (CB 3) supports the creation of a plan to address the many traffic problems on Canal St. and formulate solutions to them that ensure safe passage and access for pedestrians, accommodation for vehicles of different types that reduce their negative impacts, and street improvements to facilitate the conduct of business and build community life; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB3 asks DOT or other agencies involved in the creation of this plan to perform extensive outreach to gather input and involvement from potentially affected stakeholders in the surrounding community before design work begins; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 also urges DOT to include as part of a Canal St. improvement plan easy-to-implement immediate improvements to provide swift improvements , using applications such as paint, markings, bollards, delineators and planters, as well as more permanent, built improvements to be accomplished in the long term; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB3 greatly encourages DOT to seriously consider removing one or more lanes of traffic and reducing traffic lanes to 10-10.5 ft. widths (which can easily accommodate a large truck) in order to provide more sidewalk space; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 strongly recommends that DOT design and implement a suitable protected bike lane on Canal or another nearby westbound cross street to serve the growing number of bicyclists who use Canal St. for crosstown travel, and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 advises DOT to carefully examine the potential for employing additional means of improvement already proven to be effective in promoting pedestrian safety and creating an equitable and workable balance of street space between pedestrians and vehicular modes, such as neckdowns to shorten crossing distances, pedestrian priority traffic signals like Leading Pedestrian Intervals (LPIs) or split phasing, simplified intersections (some with vehicular left turn bans where appropriate), curbside reform, including increased commercial loading zones and designated space for street vendors, and pedestrian safety islands; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 advises DOT to expand the "Gateway to Chinatown" pedestrian plaza at Walker street by allocating additional space currently being occupied by cars and parking; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 advises DOT to reduce the five car travel lanes that feed into Manhattan over the Manhattan Bridge to make space for buses, bicycles and/or pedestrians; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 advises DOT to improve the Manhattan Bridge Plaza with treatments such as seating, greenery, outdoor dining, a bus station, bike lanes and/or walking space; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB 3 advises DOT to reallocate car space (travel and/or parking lanes) on Canal Street adjacent to Chrystie Street to provide more people-friendly spaces such as greenery, bird-friendly trees, a protected bike lane, street seating, public art; and

**Be it further resolved** that CB3 support the timely implementation of the plan as soon as possible, including the creation of a timeline that establishes the start and completion dates of the plan and times for reporting back to the community and receiving input.

5. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding Transportation item 4)**

**37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED (Transportation item 4)**

**Economic Development Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections) approved by committee
2. Manhattan Chamber of Commerce: Presentation on Small Business Resource Network  
no vote necessary
3. CM Powers: Open for Business plan  
no vote necessary
4. Continued discussion of advocacy for small business recovery plan

**VOTE: TITLE: CB 3 support for Small Business Industry Recovery**

**WHEREAS**, the survival of small businesses is critical to the City's economic recovery by providing jobs, paying taxes, supporting local needs and attracting tourism; and

**WHEREAS**, federal dollars have been helpful in temporarily supporting some small businesses' financial needs, City and State programs can further support recovery efforts many of which have been outlined in the "Open for Business Plan" sponsored by the Manhattan Chamber of Commerce, Councilmember Keith Powers and the NYC Hospitality Alliance and "Save Main Street" sponsored by Comptroller Stringer's office; and

**WHEREAS**, we are highlighting the following recommendations from each report which we believe are necessary for small business recovery:

**Establish Cure Periods Before Issuing Fines**

The City relies on fines as a source of revenue, but small businesses need a reprieve from unnecessary and costly fines in order to financially recover. In cases where violations do not pose any imminent danger to the public, businesses owners should be allowed a "cure period" in order to fix the problem before being fined. The first step should be a Notice of Violation that clearly states the noncompliance and how to cure it. The Mayor should convene Small Business Services (SBS), Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA), Department of Sanitation (DSNY), Department of Buildings (DOB), Department of Health (DOHMH), and other agencies to establish a grace period on fines and fees and the City Council should pass legislation to reform these fines and fees.

**Use Procurement Power to Provide Products and Services to Small Business at a Discount**

New York City has tremendous procurement authority, including the ability to negotiate better prices than small businesses on essential services, including software programs or various supplies, but does not put this purchasing power to use on behalf of the small businesses. Other countries, like Singapore, have modeled this program successfully. The Mayor's Office and Economic Development Corporation (EDC) should create a pilot program to utilize economies of scale for procurement and make certain products available to small businesses and Minority and Women Business Enterprises (MWBES)'s at a lower price point.

**Cap Third-Party Delivery Fees Beyond State of Emergency**

Predatory practices by third-party delivery apps such as Seamless, Grubhub and others have long hurt the restaurant industry. Many of these third-party delivery apps routinely charge restaurants as much as 30% on delivery commissions. In response to such practices City Council passed legislation in May 2020 to prohibit third party delivery apps from charging restaurants more than 15% per order for delivery and more than 5% per order for all other fees during states of emergency when on-premises dining is restricted from operating at maximum indoor occupancy, plus an additional 90 days thereafter. This legislation has been instrumental in keeping restaurants forced to provide delivery only afloat. The cap should be extended by 120 days to allow for 4 extra months for restaurants to recover from COVID without excessive fees.

**Extend Commercial Tenant Eviction Moratorium and Personal Liability Legislation**

The current eviction moratorium for commercial tenants expires on May 1st, 2021 and most small businesses are a long way from recovery. The City Council's recently passed legislation to temporarily prohibit the enforcement of personal liability provisions in commercial leases for COVID-impacted tenants is set to expire on March 31st, 2021. Both pieces of legislation have been critical to keeping small businesses tenants in their commercial spaces until it is safe to fully operate again. The Mayor and City Council should urge the Governor and State Legislature should extend the eviction moratorium through an executive order or state legislation for commercial tenants by one year. City Council should amend Local Law 55 of 2020 to extend personal liability protections by an additional 180 days beginning on April 1st, 2021.

**Extend Financial Assistance to Undocumented New Yorkers**

Many undocumented immigrants have been shut out of federal relief programs despite playing an essential role to the local and national economy. According to the Center for an Urban Future, 95% to 100% of undocumented New Yorkers have been unable to access any form of federal financial assistance and small business owners have themselves called for help in light of the important role that undocumented New Yorkers play in many industries, such as the hospitality industry. In 2020, the Mayor partnered with Open Society Foundations to provide one-time emergency payments to immigrant workers and their families, regardless of immigration status, during the pandemic. This fund was only able to provide one round of support due to resource limitations. As the pandemic has now extended over a year, The City must prioritize financial support to non-profit providers on the frontlines of helping undocumented workers to help them obtain new revenues as they become available and the Mayor should tap into additional private and foundation support to build financial support for undocumented workers who have been unable to receive unemployment or other financial assistance programs.

#### **Provide New Tax Incentives to Support Existing Business and Spur Entrepreneurship**

Small retail, restaurant, and personal services businesses have had to reconfigure their spaces for social distancing while also coping with a smaller customer base. Tax credits would allow them to recoup dollars spent on reconfiguring stores, installing safety equipment, outdoor seating, and any other expenses related to re-opening safely. The City should create refundable business income tax credits for small, independent, and locally owned businesses with annual revenue below \$5 million.

The City should also provide tax credits for aspiring entrepreneurs in retail corridors with persistently high vacancy rates. Small Business Services, working with the Department of Finance, could identify and map retail corridors and monitor vacancy rates. Business owners located in corridors with vacancy rates above a certain threshold could receive a credit against either the Commercial Rent Tax (in that area of Manhattan to which it applies) or the real property tax (requiring the landlord to calculate that share of rent attributable to retail space when the space is leased).

#### **Reduce the Red Tape to Open a Business**

Opening a business in New York City is a bureaucratic challenge that involves multiple city agencies and an extensive list of regulations and permitting procedures. To expedite and facilitate the launching of new businesses, all business owners should be assigned a Business Advocate to help navigate the City bureaucracy and provide assistance with construction permitting, health and safety inspections, among others. Business Advocates would serve as a personal representatives and case manager for all City interactions, speeding permitting, saving small businesses money, and doing away with costly, for profit expeditors. This corps of Business Advocates must be multilingual and should be placed within the Mayor's Office, rather than SBS, so that they have the authority to navigate the inter-agency nature of their job. In conjunction with this Business Advocate, the City should provide a single internet portal where business owners can find permitting and licensing requirements and submit necessary paperwork for all agencies and levels of government. More immediately, the City should waive permitting and inspection fees for businesses that take over a vacant space anytime within the next 10 months. This will incentivize businesses to act fast and begin to revive our commercial corridors.

#### **Preserve Neighborhood Institutions and Facilitate Small Business Succession**

Nearly half of business owners in the NYC metro area are over the age of 55 and nearing retirement. Even in normal times, many would simply close their business upon retirement, with little thought to succession and few prospective buyers. This natural evolution too often deprives communities of important sources of wealth creation, as businesses close and the jobs they supported disappear. Today, amidst the pandemic, these closures are likely to be accelerated, with many older business owners preferring to close their business rather than muddle through the challenging and uncertain months ahead. The City can avoid this outcome by supporting the preservation of important anchors of the community, and forestall the loss of existing jobs, customers, and suppliers, by launching a Re-Entrepreneurship program. RE-Entrepreneurship programs or Community Succession Plans allows older business owners to transition their businesses to community members seeking to be entrepreneurs.

Small Business Services can also partner with local chambers of commerce and BIDs to survey business-owners and encourage them to prepare succession plans. They can also develop an online marketplace and leverage their suite of financial and entrepreneurial services to assist with these business transfers. Special assistance should be provided to women and minority re-

entrepreneurs as well as CUNY MBAs, in order to ensure that our city's business owners reflect the diversity of our residents;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, Community Board 3 calls up on State and City elected officials and agencies to take up this package of recommendations as soon as possible to ensure our small businesses are able to survive the coming months and fully recover from the impacts of COVID-19 on the local economy.

5. Report from Arts & Culture Subcommittee  
no vote necessary
6. BID/CAB Reports  
no vote necessary
7. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, & Resiliency Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes and roll call (minutes are deemed approved if no objections)  
postponed to next month
2. Parks Manager Update  
no vote necessary
3. Public access at the PS 184 Trust for Public Land playground  
no vote necessary
4. Pier 36 - vessel operations & pier security  
no vote necessary
5. Pier 42 - Construction update and green roof design  
no vote necessary
6. BMCR - general update  
no vote necessary
7. Continued discussion of Committee goals  
no vote necessary
8. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

Vote to adjourn

**38 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Members Present at Last Vote:**

David Adams	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Tareake Ramos	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Linda Jones	[P]	Paul Rangel	[A]
Jesse Beck	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Tatiana Jorio	[P]	Richard Ropiak	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Thomas Rosa	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Olympia Kazi	[P]	Robin Schatell	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Joseph Kerns	[A]	Heidi Schmidt	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Michelle Koppersmith	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[P]
Felicia Cruickshank	[A]	Mae Lee	[P]	Anisha Steephen	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Wendy Lee	[A]	Sandra Strother	[P]
Alistair Economakis	[A]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Josephine Velez	[P]
Shirley Fennessey	[A]	David Louie	[P]	Troy Velez	[P]
Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Ellen Luo	[A]	Rodney Washington	[P]
Debra Glass	[A]	Michael Marino	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
Andrea Gordillo	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[A]	Jacky Wong	[P]
Herman Hewitt	[A]	Michael Perles	[P]	Ricky Wong	[P]

Meeting Adjourned