



# THE CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 3

59 East 4th Street - New York, NY 10003

Phone (212) 533-5300

[www.cb3manhattan.org](http://www.cb3manhattan.org) - [info@cb3manhattan.org](mailto:info@cb3manhattan.org)

Jamie Rogers, Board Chair

Susan Stetzer, District Manager

October 2017 Full Board Minutes

Meeting of Community Board 3 held on Wednesday, November 1, 2017 at 6:30pm at PS 20, 166 Essex Street.

Public Session:

**K Webster** – Speaking on "Neighbors to save Rivington House" campaign.

**Jeff Lawrence** – Supporting SLA item #2 regarding Laughing Buddha Comedy. He claims it is the only comedy club on the Lower East Side.

**Ben Landy** – Supporting the Eastville Comedy Club at 20 Ave A.

**Marko Elgart** - Supporting the Eastville Comedy Club at 20 Ave A.

**Kathy Suach** – Supporting the Eastville Comedy Club at 20 Ave A.

**Elissa Sampson** – Is against the SLA item #2. Resident of LES and urban geographer.

**Bob Kriezel** – Is against the SLA item #2.

**Rev. James Cascione** – Is against the SLA item #2. Representing MHR Church; Safety Committee of Manhattan Together. Believes the location of the comedy club is within a residential area and should not add to the saturation of bars in the neighborhood.

**Jenika Mccrayer** – Representing DOHMH and ThriveNYC. Shared information relating to mental health and wellness. There is a hotline to deal with the street homelessness.

**Blaze Jones-Yellah** – Provided updates on the Peer Ambassador program at the Lowline.

**Alberto Mercado** – Supporting ADA Entrances – Delancey/Essex Street train station. Has been advocating for a long time. Mayor and Governor, MTA chairman has allotted largest investment in MTA history of a combined \$21 billion, State has provided \$8 billion and City has provided \$2 billion. As of June 30th 2017 Governor has provided an additional \$1 billion. Squadron has announced that it will take until 2018 before the work for an entrance can be created.

**Vaylateena Jones** – Supporting the 3rd & 4th ave rezoning item to be placed on the December Land Use committee in a manner where a resolution can be proposed and voted up/down.

**Kathleen Wakeham** – Advocates that the Tech Hub must come with 3rd and 4th ave Re-zoning protection. Believes the tech hub without zoning protections will lead to overdevelopment and destruction of the neighborhood. Believes this will protect affordable housing.

**John Senter** – Supports zoning protections for 3rd and 4th ave corridors on 14th st to Astor Place. Asking for CB3 to stand with the residents to support the zoning protections.

**Tom Birchard** – Supporting zoning protections for 3rd and 4th ave Rezoning.

**Rebecca Perrin** – GVSHP.

**Harry Bubbins** – Supporting modest zoning protections for 3rd and 4th avenues, now. Is not advocating to stop the Tech Hub, but is to ensure the possibility for affordable housing is maintained. Other cities affected by tech hub like San Francisco and Cambridge have led to overdevelopment in their neighborhoods. Believes this will not torpedo the tech hub but will have a chance for affordable housing.

**Rosemarie Figueroa Hameed** – A representative of "We The People" regarding Safety. Does not feel safe with the current Mayor, City Council.

**Carol Puttre – Czyn** – Supporting the restoration of the front façade of 84 Second Avenue but against the proposed alteration of the rear façade of the property.

**Richard Duane** – Against the proposed alteration of the rear façade of the property.

**Gaby Hoffman** – Against the proposed alteration plan of the back façade of the property to extend the building by 20 feet. Believes this will lead to 2 large terraces and one boring wall for residents to look at.

**David Mulkins** – Against the proposed alteration of the back façade of the property. Began by applauding the land use committee for supporting. There is a large green space that will be destroyed if the proposed alteration takes place. It will affect the view of 180 windows.

**Sokhi Wagner** – Against the 84 Second Avenue alterations. Over 100 years the green space has been around. The green space has been a historical part of the building.

**Vaylateena Jones** – Registered nurse representing CB3 at WTC to bring awareness regarding two 9/11 programs for the Lower East Side being explained at the Manhattan Borough President Office on December 6th. One program is for those below Houston and those near Canal Street.

**Steven Granzel** – Announcement of Hunter College LES Dwellers Study of LES Business Environment.

**Katy Stokes** – Opposing proposal to open a pedestrian pathway on the former Stanton Street. Co-President of the PTA committee for NEST+M.

**Grace Mak** – In support of the rezoning of the Waterfront on behalf of TUFF-LES and Two Bridges Tower TA. Mark Richardson – In support of rezoning of the waterfront on behalf of TUFF-LES and Two Bridges Tower TA. In support of the Chinatown Rezoning plan.

**Aaron Gonzalez** – In support of the rezoning of the waterfront on behalf of TUFF-LES and Two Bridges Tower TA.

**Arnette Scott** – In support of the rezoning of the Waterfront. Claims third party insurance companies will be compensated from Federal funding.

**Peng Zhao** – In support of passing the rezoning application on the Waterfront on behalf of CAAV. Construction of new towers would place more residents in potential harms way since another storm is forecasted to hit the waterfront within 10-25 years.

**Hok Lam** – Is advocating for the 8 Tuxedo Liquor license upgrade. Is against SLA item #21.

**Eddy Bucknham** – Is advocating for the 8 Tuxedo Liquor License upgrade. Is against SLA item #21.

**Mei-Lum** – Is advocating to deny the application of the 8 Tuxedo Liquor license. A rep from TCC block association nearby the 8 Tuxedo location. Claims lots of noise, build up of Uber cars nearby the property disrupting the quality of life. TCC members have observed patrons carrying 8 Tuxedo food outside of the property. Is in support of SLA item #21.

**Wellington Chen** – Representative of Chinatown Partnership. Is against SLA item #21.

**Laura Sewell** – Executive Director of EVCC. Announcement of a rally at Cityhall steps for Mon Nov 6th 12pm celebrating Armando Perez Birthday. Reiterated Mayor's promise to restore El Charas building.

**Ryan Gillam** – Executive Director of FABNYC. It is a mailing list for artists and cultural workers.

Public Officials:

Mayor Bill de Blasio, Paola Ruiz:

Public Advocate Letitia James, Adam Chen:

Comptroller Scott Stringer, Michael Stinson: Update on the comptroller office.

Borough President Gale Brewer, Afraz Khan: State office for the Aging has taken out money from 5 neighborhood NORCS- the office advocated to bring funding back to the NORCS development, the State office did. Announcement to apply for CB3 in November.

Congressmember Nydia Velazquez, Iris Quinones: Thank you announcement for those who contributed to Puerto Rico relief

Congressmember Carolyn Maloney, Victor Montesinos:

Assemblymember Yuh-Line Niou, Rebecca Ou: Addressed excessive construction noises in the Two Bridges area. CEC1 to increase district 1 diversity plan. Knickerbocker village will receive grant funding for Hurricane Sandy relief.

Assemblymember Deborah J. Glick, Charlie Anderson: Update on Assemblymember Deborah Glick.

Assemblymember Brian Kavanagh, Venus Galarza-Mullins: Oct 2nd DOB opened family resource center in District 1 with an aim to increase diversity within schools in District 1. Also opened Saturdays 9am-12pm. NYCHA is processing Domestic violence victims for emergency transfers. 1 866 Vote ny6 to verify polling site locations.

State Senator Brad M. Hoylman, Caroline Wekselbaum: Provided update on State Senator Brad Hoylman.

Councilmember Margaret Chin: Shared the hundreds of units of affordable housing at Essex Street Crossing. Funding for resiliency on the waterfront allocated. Councilwoman and Manhattan Borough President codified

that transparency is always involved when deciding lifting deed restrictions. Passed legislation for zoning which allows ULURP and community involvement with developers and as of right developments.

Councilmember Rosie Mendez: Passed Mary Spink Way. November 15th there will be an unveiling of the sign for the first Les Mis magazine with Gloria Steinway. Mayoral Townhall meeting announced the requiring of the building El Charas. Advocated for a rezoning from 3rd to 5th avenue. Visioning Session for a local park. Memorial of the 2nd avenue explosion.

Members Present at First Vote:

David Adams	[P]	Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Jeremy Markman	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Debra Glass	[P]	Chad Marlow	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Herman F. Hewitt	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Nancy Ortiz	[P]
Karen Blatt	[A]	Linda Jones	[P]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[A]
Lisa Burriss	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Joyce Ravitz	[P]
Alan van Capelle	[A]	Marnie Ann Joyce	[A]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Meghan Joye	[P]	James Rogers	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Richard F. Ropiak	[P]
MyPhuong Chung	[P]	Carol Kostik	[A]	Robin Schatell	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Mae Lee	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[A]
Enrique Cruz	[P]	Veronica Leventhal	[A]	Clint Smeltzer	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Nancy Sparrow-Bartow	[P]
Dean Diongson	[P]	Gigi Li	[P]	Josephine Velez	[P]
Wilda Escarfuller	[A]	Luis Lopez	[P]	Rodney Washington	[A]
Shirley Fennessey	[A]	Mei Lum	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
David Ford	[P]	Robert Magliaro	[A]		

Minutes:

Minutes of July 2017 were approved, as is.

**36 YES 0 NO 3 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

Board Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Jamie Rogers

Announcement of attendance tardiness for community board members below 2/3 present.

Announcement made regarding Puerto Rico relief support by Damaris Reyes.

Announcement of Bylaws Taskforce convening December 2017.

Thank you to the office for overseeing the expense report by all committees.

District Manager's Report:

District Manager Susan Stetzer

Announced one polling place change. The 3rd Street Men's Shelter sideyard construction is almost complete,.

This was supported by CB 3 and includes a green house for herbs that will be used in culinary training program.

There will not be a Parks committee meeting this month, and please note that Economic Development and Land Use committees will be having a joint committee.

Request for help in finding space for City Santa to use to collect and wrap gifts for families and children in shelters and children of wounded warriors.

Please call 311 and has for Homeless Outreach when you see homeless people on street. Although various agencies can respond, this is the only way the people will get on case management for repeat engagement to encourage services and shelter.

Announcement of polling site changes.

Committee Reports:

**Executive Committee**

- FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities

**VOTE:** To approve the ranking of Expense and Capital budget priorities as amended by the executive committee.

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Personnel Committee**

- Consider candidates for Assistant District Manager

**VOTE:** To approve the personnel taskforce recommendation for first and second choice candidates for Assistant District Manager.

Announcement of new personnel ranking process.

**38 YES 0 NO 2 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**SLA & DCA Licensing Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes approved by committee

**Applications within Saturated Areas**

2. Eastville Comedy Club Inc, 20 Ave A @ E 2nd St (op/removal from 85 E 4th St)

**THIS MOTION DID NOT PASS**

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

To deny the application for the removal of a full on-premises liquor license for Eastville Comedy Club Inc., doing business as Eastville Comedy Club, from its current location at 85 East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, to the premises located at 20 Avenue A, at the corner of Avenue A and East 2nd Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a comedy club with a certificate of occupancy of seventy-four (74) people, with one (1) scheduled show weekdays and two (2) scheduled shows weekends, and will serve alcohol only to ticketholders,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 6:00 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 5) it will have sound equipment to amplify comedians, promoted events, scheduled performances and events at which a cover fee will be charged, but will not have DJs or recorded or live music,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 7) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 8) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 9) it will not have unlimited drink specials,
- 10) it will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints

Community Board 3 is approving this application for a full on-premises liquor license although this location is in an area with numerous full on-premises liquor licenses because 1) this applicant has operated an existing comedy club in this neighborhood for approximately ten (10) years and has held a full on-premises liquor license at that location since January of 2011, and is now seeking to operate the same business at this new location, 2) it will host limited shows or performances within limited hours of operation in that it intends to host one (1) to two (2) shows per night with no show ending later than 11:30 P.M., 3) it is intending to have an interior waiting area to minimize the number of people waiting outside, and 4) this applicant furnished fifteen (15) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application.

**THIS MOTION DID NOT PASS**

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, Eastville Comedy Club Inc. is seeking to remove its full on-premises liquor license for its comedy club, doing business as Eastville Comedy Club, in the premises located at 85 East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, to 20 Avenue A, at the corner of East 2nd Street and Avenue A; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a comedy club serving snacks, with a certificate of occupancy of seventy-five (75) people, forty-six (46) tables and sixty-nine (69) seats, a ten (10) foot by seven (7) foot bar, hours of operation of 6:00 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays, amplified comedians, scheduled performances, promoted events and events with cover fees, a security guard on the weekends and anticipated wait lines outside; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant was first heard by Community Board 3 for a full on-premises liquor license at 85 East 4th Street in February of 2008, and denied for a tavern wine license unless the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations that it would 1) make substantial efforts to

minimize crowds on East 4th Street by assigning employees to regulate waiting patrons on the sidewalk or directing them to an interior holding area, 2) maintain a closed façade, 3) operate a comedy club with one (1) to two (2) scheduled performances per night on weekdays and one (1) to three (3) scheduled performances per night on weekends, 4) employ a security guard or door person to monitor the door and control congestion on the sidewalk during all hours of operation, 5) serve alcohol during scheduled performances only and only to ticket holders, and 6) not apply for an upgrade of its license for at least a period of two (2) years; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant was then denied a change in class of its tavern wine license to a full on-premises liquor license by Community Board 3 in March of 2009; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant was then denied a change in class of its tavern wine license to a full on-premises liquor license by Community Board 3 in November of 2010, unless the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations that it would 1) make substantial efforts to minimize crowds on East 4th Street by assigning employees to regulate waiting patrons on the sidewalk or directing them to an interior holding area, 2) maintain a closed façade, 3) operate a comedy club with one (1) to two (2) scheduled performances per night on weekdays and one (1) to three (3) scheduled performances per night on weekends, 4) employ a security guard or door person to monitor the door and control congestion on the sidewalk during all hours of operation, 5) serve alcohol during scheduled performances only and only to ticket holders, and 6) not apply for an upgrade of its license for at least a period of two (2) years; and

**WHEREAS**, East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, has been designated an arts block by the City of New York which encourages the addition of arts venues to the street, while 20 Avenue A is located on a residentially zoned street with a commercial overlay, has not been previously licensed, never housed an eating and drinking or nightlife venue and was previously operated as a baby furniture store and bank; and

**WHEREAS**, this location is within five hundred (500) feet of twelve (12) full on-premises liquor licenses per LAMP, six (6) of which are located on Avenue A between East Houston Street and East 2nd Street; and

**WHEREAS**, this location is within one block of another comedy club, to wit the Upright Citizen's Brigade, located at 153 East 3rd Street, with an entrance on Avenue A, between East 3rd Street and East 4th Street; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant furnished insufficient evidence of support for its application, in that it provided fifteen (15) petition signatures from area residents on its behalf; and

**WHEREAS**, a resident living within a block of this location spoke in opposition to this application, stating that 1) this business is currently located on a street which has been designated as an arts block by the city and is seeking to move its business to a residential block with a commercial overlay, to a location which has never been licensed and within the same block as six (6) licensed businesses, one of which on the opposite corner has three (3) licensed stories, and all which have caused incredible noise and vehicular and pedestrian congestion to this block of Avenue A, 2) its business plan includes outdoor wait lines in an area which cannot absorb more people outside, 3) the applicant has failed to provide evidence of community outreach from the residential apartments around the location and located directly across the street at First Houses, and 4) there is no public benefit in adding a comedy club to a saturated area and within one block of an existing comedy club; and

**WHEREAS**, notwithstanding that the applicant has been operating an arts related business since the beginning of 2008 and its full on-premises liquor license was issued by the SLA on January 25, 2011, any community benefit in the removal of the full on-premises liquor license of this applicant is outweighed by the detrimental impact and lack of public benefit in the addition of another full on-premises liquor license to an area with so many full on-premises liquor licenses within such a small area, as well as significant vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion and late night noise; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a removal of the full on-premises liquor license of Eastville Comedy Club Inc. for its comedy club doing business as Eastville Comedy Club at the premises currently located at 85 East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, to 20 Avenue A, at the corner of East 2nd Street and Avenue A.

**THIS MOTION PASSED**

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board #3 Recommendation To Deny-Stipulations Not Received**

**WHEREAS**, Eastville Comedy Club Inc. is seeking to remove its full on-premises liquor license for its comedy club, doing business as Eastville Comedy Club, in the premises located at 85 East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, to 20 Avenue A, at the corner of East 2nd Street and Avenue A; and

**WHEREAS**, at its Community Board 3 committee hearing, the applicant had agreed to all enumerated stipulations with the exception of not having wait lines outside; and

**WHEREAS**, at its full board hearing, Community Board 3 moved to approve this applicant with the additional stipulation that it would have no wait lines outside, although this location is in an area with numerous full on-premises liquor licenses, because 1) this applicant has operated an existing comedy club in this neighborhood for approximately ten (10) years and has held a full on-premises liquor license at that location since January of 2011, and is now seeking to operate the same business at this new location, 2) it will host limited shows or performances within limited hours of operation in that it intends to host one (1) to two (2) shows per night with no show ending later than 11:30 P.M., 3) this applicant furnished fifteen (15) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant will not sign the proposed stipulations; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for the removal of a full on-premises liquor license for Eastville Comedy Club Inc., doing business as Eastville Comedy Club, from its current location at 85 East 4th Street, between Second Avenue and Cooper Square, to the premises located at 20 Avenue A, at the corner of Avenue A and East 2nd Street, because the applicant will not agree to make as conditions of its license the following stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a comedy club with a certificate of occupancy of seventy-four (74) people, with one (1) scheduled show weekdays and two (2) scheduled shows weekends, and will serve alcohol only to ticketholders,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 6:00 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 5) it will have sound equipment to amplify comedians, promoted events, scheduled performances and events at which a cover fee will be charged, but will not have DJs or recorded or live music,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board #3,
- 7) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 8) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 9) it will not have unlimited drink specials,
- 10) it will not have wait lines outside and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

Discussion on this item took place by Chair of SLA committee and members.

David Crane took a motion to deny the application.

Vote was taken on this item.

Motion was denied.

Enrique motioned to approve application as is.

Meghan motioned to add an amendment to limit waiting lines for the applicant to 15 mins.

Hand vote taken. Recalled. Motion re proposed as no waiting lines.

Hand vote taken. Motion approved. Stipulation added. Vote to approve Enrique's motion approved.

3. Lucky One Enterprise Inc, 20 St Marks Pl (op)  
withdrawn

**Alterations**

4. The Fern (AGN Restaurant LLC), 166 1st Ave btwn E 10th & E 11th Sts (op/alt/reconfig cellar and 1st fl seating, eliminate 1st fl server station, increase length of basement bar, replace food prep station with office)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Approve**

To approve the application for an alteration of the full on-premises liquor license for AGN Restaurant LLC, doing business as The Fern, for the premises located at 166 First Avenue, between East 10th Street and East 11th Street, to wit changing seating on the first floor from thirteen (13) tables and thirty-five (35) seats to nineteen (19) tables and forty-seven (47) seats and in the cellar from eight (8) tables and twenty-six (26) seats to nine (9) tables and twenty (20) seats, changing the cellar bar from six (6) feet and three (3) stools to twelve (12) feet and six (6) stools and replacing the cellar food prep station with office space.

**New Liquor License Applications**

5. Paloma Rocket (Clinton Craft LLC), 77 2nd Ave btwn E 4th & E 5th Sts (removal from 7 Clinton St/upgrade to op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, Clinton Craft LLC is seeking to remove its wine beer license for its tavern and retail beer store currently located at 7 Clinton Street, between East Houston Street and Stanton Street, to 77 Second Avenue, north storefront, a/k/a 79 Second Avenue, between East 4th Street and East 5th Street; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant is also seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license once at the premises located at 77 Second Avenue, between East 4th Street and East 5th Street; and

**WHEREAS**, the wine beer license for this applicant at 7 Clinton Street was administratively approved by Community Board 3 in November of 2014, provided that the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations that it would 1) operate a beer store and wine bar, with a kitchen open and serving food during all hours of operation, 2) have hours of operation of 12:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. all days, 3) not commercially operate any outdoor areas, 4) close any front or rear façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night or during any amplified performances, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, 5) play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee would be charged, 6) not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3, 7) not seek a change in class to a full on-premises liquor license without first obtaining the approval of Community Board 3, 8) conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and 9) provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant began operating its business on March 31, 2016; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant was then denied an alteration to extend its operating hours by Community Board 3 in June of 2016, unless the applicant agreed to make as an amended condition of its license, with all other stipulations remaining the same, the stipulation that its hours of operation would be 6:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 2:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays; and

**WHEREAS**, 79 Second Avenue has long been operated as a vegetarian Indian restaurant and Community Board 3 most recently denied an application for a restaurant wine license for this location to Triangle Four Corp., with a proposed business name of Heart of India, in April of 2010, unless the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations that it would 1) operate as a full-service Indian restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) have hours of operation 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 11:00 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays 3) close any façade windows at 10:00 P.M. every night, 4) play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have DJs, live music, promoted events or events at which a cover fee would be charged, and 5) designate an employee or employees whose responsibilities would include monitoring the sidewalk in front of the business to deter noise and congestion from patrons; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant has now stated that it is seeking to operate a "sports bar" with no listed certificate of occupancy, self-serve and retail beer, twelve (12) tables and forty-eight (48) seats, a sidewalk café of four (4) to five (5) tables, hours of operation of 2:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Mondays through Wednesdays and 2:00 P.M. to 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Saturdays, a twenty (20) foot bar with twelve (12) stools, a kitchen open all hours serving a limited menu with "Indian flavors," four (4) televisions and recorded background; and

**WHEREAS**, although this applicant has averred that this location is within five hundred (500) feet of twelve (12) full on-premises liquor licenses, this location is within five hundred (500) feet of thirty-two

(32) full on-premises liquor licenses and two (2) pending full on-premises liquor licenses per LAMP; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated an inadequate public benefit for approving a full on-premises liquor license for its business in that it stated that it has stated that it is seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license to be able to compete with the numerous business with full on-premises liquor licenses surrounding 77 Second Avenue; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant is seeking to occupy a storefront directly across the street from a house of worship, to wit Iglesia Alianza Cristiana y Misionera, located at 76 Second Avenue, between East 4th Street and East 5th Street, and is contending that the SLA must have made a determination that this location is not used primarily as a house of worship given the nearby six (6) businesses with full on-premises liquor licenses; and

**WHEREAS**, a review of the questionnaires by the four (4) businesses whose applications for full on-premises liquor licenses were heard by Community Board 3 indicated that three (3) of those applicants represented that they were not within two hundred (200) feet of a house of worship and its proximity was not part of the community board discussions of their applications and one applicant represented to the community board that the SLA had made a determination that its premises had been continuously licensed prior to the existence of the church; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant furnished no documentation from area residents in support of its application, in that it provided no petitions or letters in support of its application, and no residents appeared on its behalf; and

**WHEREAS**, three representatives of the East 5th Street Block Association spoke in opposition to this application, stating that 1) the applicant is proposing to be located directly across the street from an active church and within five hundred (500) feet of more than thirty (30) full on-premises liquor licenses and there is no public benefit in the approval of a full on-premises liquor license for this applicant given that the existing business appears to be mainly a beer bar of which there are several within one block, 2) it is seeking to operate as a tavern of which there are many within two blocks and replace what has traditionally been a location with a full-service Indian restaurant, 3) the introduction of a self-serve venue in an area with so many liquor licenses is inappropriate, 4) people will not patronize this business for its limited menu of food with Indian flavors given the numerous full-service Indian restaurants within two blocks, and 5) the applicant has only been operating a business with a wine beer for a short period of time at its present location; and

**WHEREAS**, given the intention of the applicant to operate a sport bar with a limited menu and self-serve alcohol in an area with so many licensed businesses, Community Board 3 is unwilling to approve the removal of its wine beer license and simultaneous change in class of its license to a full on-premises liquor license; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a removal of the wine beer license of Clinton Craft LLC for its tavern and retail beer store doing business as Paloma Rocket at the premises currently located at 7 Clinton Street, between East Houston Street and Stanton Street, to 77 Second Avenue, north storefront, a/k/a 79 Second Avenue, between East 4th Street and East 5th Street; and

**THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the simultaneous application for a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for Clinton Craft LLC, doing business as Paloma Rocket, once at the premises located at 77 Second Avenue, north storefront, a/k/a 79 Second Avenue, between East 4th Street and East 5th Street.

6. Scarr Pizza (Scarr Pizza LLC), 22A Orchard Street btwn Canal & Hester Sts (upgrade to op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, Scarr Pizza LLC, doing business as Scarr Pizza, is seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for its pizzeria located at 22A Orchard Street, between Canal Street and Hester Street; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant is also seeking to extend its closing times Fridays and Saturdays, have happy hours and add private parties; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a pizzeria with four (4) tables and sixteen (16) seats, a fifteen (15) foot bar with eight (8) stools, a pizza kitchen open all hours, hours of operation of 11:30 A.M. to 11:00



P.M. Sundays, 11:30 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. Mondays through Thursdays and 11:30 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays, recorded background music, private parties ten (10) times per year, no soundproofing and happy hours to 8:00 P.M. each night; and

**WHEREAS**, an application for a wine beer license for this applicant was administratively approved by Community Board 3 in September of 2015, provided that the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations that it would 1) operate a full-service pizzeria restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) have hours of operation of 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. all days, 3) not commercially operate any outdoor areas, 4) close any front or rear façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, 5) play recorded background music and not have DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any events at which a cover fee would be charged, 6) not apply for an alteration without first appearing before Community Board 3, 7) not host pub crawls or party buses, 8) not have happy hours, and 9) not have wait lines outside; and

**WHEREAS**, the wine beer license for this applicant was issued by the SLA on March 10, 2016; and

**WHEREAS**, this location is previously unlicensed and is located within five hundred (500) feet of twelve (12) full on-premises liquor licenses and two (2) pending full on-premises liquor licenses; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated that the public benefit for approving a full on-premises liquor license is that it is responding to requests from patrons for cocktails; and

**WHEREAS**, notwithstanding that the applicant has been operating its business for one and a half (1½) years and furnished seventy (70) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application and that the Orchard Street Block Association submitted a letter in support of this application, given the small size of this establishment and its limited menu of appetizers, pizza and submarine sandwiches, any public benefit in the granting of a full on-premises liquor license is outweighed by the lack of community benefit in adding another full on-premises liquor license to this area; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for Scarr Pizza LLC, doing business as Scarr Pizza, for the premises located at 22A Orchard Street, between Canal Street and Hester Street.

7. The Immigrant Tap Room (Immigrant Tap Room Inc), 341 E 9th St btwn 1st & 2nd Aves (upgrade to op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

To deny the application for a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for Immigrant Tap Room Inc., doing business as The Immigrant Tap Room, for the premises located at 341 East 9th Street, west storefront, between First Avenue and Second Avenue, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a tavern, serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 6:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 2:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays,
- 3) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 4) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 5) it will install additional soundproofing, if necessary,
- 6) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have live music, DJs, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 7) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 8) it may have "happy hours" to 6:30 P.M.,
- 9) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 10) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 11) it will not have wait lines and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 12) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 13) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints

Community Board 3 is approving this application for a change in class to a full on-premises liquor license although this is a location in an area with numerous full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location and on a residentially zoned street, because 1) the applicant has

been operating this business without complaints for more than four (4) years and has operated the east side storefront as a wine bar and tavern without complaints for seven (7) years, and 2) it provided substantial support for its application, in that it furnished eighty-six (86) petition signatures and one (1) letter from area residents and three (3) residents appeared in support of its application.

8. Pinks Cantina (Pinks Cantina LLC), 203 Chrystie St (wb)  
withdrawn

9. Tang Hotpot (Tang Hospitality Group LLC), 135 Bowery btwn Grand & Broome Sts (wb)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

To deny the application for a wine beer license for Tang Hospitality Group LLC, with the proposed business name of Tang Hotpot, for the premises located at 135 Bowery, between Grand Street and Broome Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a full-service Chinese restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food to within half an hour of closing,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 12:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 12:00 P.M. to 2:30 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 5) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 7) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 8) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 9) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 10) it will insure that there are no wait lines outside and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

10. Cheese Grille (188 Allen St Inc), 188 Allen St btwn E Houston & Stanton Sts (op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, 188 Allen Street Inc., doing business as Cheese Grille, is seeking a full on-premises liquor license for its restaurant located at 188 Allen Street, between East Houston Street and Stanton Street; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a grilled cheese restaurant in a shallow storefront with four (4) tables and counter seating, thirty-six (36) seats, a six (6) foot bar with no stools, hours of operation of 11:00 A.M. to 10:00 P.M. Sundays, 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. Mondays through Thursdays and 11:00 A.M. to 3:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays, a kitchen open all hours, an open façade, one (1) television and recorded background music; and

**WHEREAS**, there are thirty-nine (39) full on-premises liquor licenses, six of which are located on the same block as this location, and four (4) pending full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated an insufficient public benefit for approving a full on-premises liquor license for its business, in that it stated that it has managed the business for three and a half (3½) years but has no experience owning a business with a full on-premises liquor license; and

**WHEREAS**, Maradona Inc., the previous applicant for this location was approved a wine beer license without stipulations by Community Board 3 in January of 2004; and

**WHEREAS**, the wine beer license for the previous applicant was issued by the SLA on April 1, 2004; and

**WHEREAS**, the previous applicant sustained charges before the SLA on June 5, 2006, for sales to minors on November 5, 2005 and January 1, 2006, and entered into a conditional no contest plea on June 29, 2007, for locked exists on January 15, 2006; and

**WHEREAS**, the previous applicant for this location was then denied a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license by Community Board 3 in January of 2009, because of a nuisance abatement for numerous underage sales, police violations, a lack of public benefit in approving a full on-premises liquor license and numerous existing full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of the location, five (5) of which were on the same block; and

**WHEREAS**, the previous applicant subsequently shut its business and reopened on or about July of 2014 as the present business, Cheese Grille; and

**WHEREAS**, notwithstanding that the applicant has been managing this business for three and a half (3½) years and furnished one hundred two (102) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application, the LES Dwellers, a local residents association, submitted a statement in opposition to this application, citing the bad operating history of the present licensee, the lack of community benefit in approving a full on-premises liquor license for a small grilled cheese store, the numerous full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location, the significant vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion and late night noise and the poor prospect the applicant is to hold a full on-premises liquor license given that it has hosted live amplified music in its business on at least two (2) occasions and has mounted speakers on the outside of its façade to play music outdoors although this area is plagued by noise and crowds; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant conceded that it had hosted live amplified musical performances although it stated that it did this early in its management history and it stated that it did not know that it was not legal to mount speakers on the outside façade of the business; and

**WHEREAS**, given the small size of this establishment and its limited menu of grilled cheese sandwiches, tater tots and macaroni and cheese, there is no community benefit in granting it a full on-premises liquor license and the approval of this application would result in a lack of community benefit in the addition of another full on-premises liquor license to an area with so many full on-premises liquor licenses within such a small area, as well as significant vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion and late night noise; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a full on-premises liquor license for 188 Allen Street Inc., doing business as Cheese Grille, for the premises located at 188 Allen Street, between East Houston Street and Stanton Street.

11. VYSK Inc, 173 Rivington St (op)  
withdrawn

12. Resolution regarding consideration of both business and resident needs by nightlife taskforce  
tabled to next meeting (see old business)

**Applications within Saturated Areas**

13. Iberia Discover Georgia Inc, 154 Orchard St btwn Stanton & Rivington Sts (upgrade to op)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, Iberia Discover Georgia Inc., doing business as Red Compass, is again seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for its restaurant located at 154 Orchard Street, between Rivington Street and Stanton Street; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a Georgian restaurant with a certificate of occupancy of forty-nine (49) people, twenty-one (21) tables and forty-two (42) seats with nine (9) tables and eighteen (18) seats and a fifteen (15) foot bar with seven (7) stools in a partially enclosed backyard, hours of operation of 11:00 A.M. to 11:00 P.M. all days, a kitchen open all hours, two (2) monitors, open windows and recorded background music; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant was initially heard by Community Board 3 in August of 2015, for a full on-premises liquor license for this location and an unlicensed adjacent storefront and withdrew its application after hearing community and community board concerns about its lack of community outreach and experience in an area with so many licensed businesses; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant then applied to Community Board 3 for a wine beer license in September of 2015, and was administratively approved with stipulations to 1) operate a full-service Georgian restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food during all hours of operation, 2) have hours of operation of 11:00 A.M. to 11:00 P.M. all days, 3) not commercially operate any outdoor areas, 4) close any front or rear façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night or during any amplified performances, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, 5) play

ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee would be charged, 6) not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3, 7) not seek a change in class to a full on-premises liquor license without first obtaining the approval of Community Board 3, 8) not host pub crawls or party buses, 9) not have happy hours, 10) not have wait lines outside, 11) conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and 12) provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints; and

**WHEREAS**, the wine beer license for this applicant was then issued by the SLA on December 18, 2015, and the applicant began operating its business in January of 2016; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant was then denied a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license and an alteration to add live music by Community Board 3 in August of 2016, because 1) it had been operating its business for only seven (7) months, 2) it conceded that it was operating its business inconsistent from its stipulations by already hosting live music performances, 3) it failed to articulate a community benefit, 4) although the applicant counted only four (4) full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of its business, there were at least thirty (30) full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of its business, and 5) there was community opposition to the approval of its application; and

**WHEREAS**, there are forty-three (43) full on-premises liquor licenses and two (2) pending full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location per LAMP; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has failed to articulate a sufficient community or public benefit for the approval of a full on-premises liquor license, in that the applicant stated that it has been a good operator and good neighbor and has operated its business without complaints; and

**WHEREAS**, it appears that the applicant has continued to operate its business inconsistent from its stipulations and method of operation by hosting live music performances because, although the applicant stated that it has not had live music since August of 2016, it maintains a piano in its premises and YELP reviews of June 9, 2017, August 17, 2017 and September 8, 2017, reflect that there is a regular live piano player; and

**WHEREAS**, although the applicant signed stipulations which became conditions of its license which included averring that it would not commercially operate any outdoor areas, the majority of its business is located within a partially enclosed structure in the backyard; and

**WHEREAS**, notwithstanding that the applicant furnished one hundred fourteen (114) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application, there is community opposition to the approval of this application from the LES Dwellers, a local residents association, given that the applicant has only been operating its business since January of 2016, given the number of full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location and given the significant vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion and late night noise as a result of the existence of so many licensed businesses within so small an area; and

**WHEREAS**, given the short operating history of this applicant and the continued concern that it is operating contrary to its stipulations, there is no community benefit in the granting of a full on-premises liquor license in an area with so many full on-premises liquor licenses, as well as the significant vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion and late night noise; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 again moves to deny the application for a change in class of a wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for Iberia Discover Georgia Inc., doing business as Red Compass, for the premises located at 154 Orchard Street, between Rivington Street and Stanton Street.

14. Entity to be formed by Jeremiah Stone, 175 Orchard St (op)  
withdrawn

**Sidewalk Cafe Application**

15. Serafina Ludlow Corp, 98 Rivington St @ Ludlow St (alt/increase from 8 tables to 20, 16 chairs to 40)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Approve With Change Order—Change Order Attached**

To approve the application for the modification of an unenclosed sidewalk café permit for Serafina Ludlow Corp., doing business as Serafina Restaurant, for the premises located at 98 Rivington Street,

at the corner of Ludlow Street and Rivington Street, because the applicant has signed a change agreement which will become part of its DCA license that

- 1) its café will consist of sixteen (16) tables and thirty-two (32) seats, with four (4) tables and eight (8) seats located against the façade of the building on the Rivington Street side of the business and twelve (12) tables and twenty-four (24) seats located against the façade of the building on the Ludlow Street side of the business,
- 2) its wait service aisles will be located between the tables and accessed through the business façade,
- 3) its hours of operation will be 9:00 A.M. to 10:00 P.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 9:00 A.M. to 11:00 P.M. Fridays and Saturdays, and
- 4) it will have awning extended over all of the outdoor seating during all hours of operation of the sidewalk cafe.

#### **Alterations**

16. La Caverna Ristorante (122-124 Rivington Corp), 122-124 Rivington St (op/alt/expand from basement to ground fl and mezzanine/add dancing)  
withdrawn
17. La Gamelle (241 Bowery Corp), 241 Bowery (op/alt/change method of operation add live music)  
withdrawn

#### **New Liquor License Applications**

18. Greyhound (J&J V2 LLC), 67 2nd Ave (aka 84 E 4th St) (op)  
withdrawn
19. SVL NYC LLC, Essex St (Essex Crossing Site 1, Essex St midblock btwn Broome & Delancey) (op)  
withdrawn
20. Les Crepes & Taqueria (Oli and Aurel LLC), 25 Essex St @ Hester St (wb)

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached**

To deny the application for a wine beer license for Oli and Aurel LLC, doing business as Les Crepes & Taqueria, for the premises located at 25 Essex Street, between at the corner of Essex Street and Hester Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as a full-service Mexican restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 11:00 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. Sundays, 11:00 A.M. to 3:00 A.M. Mondays through Thursdays and 11:00 A.M. to 4:30 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays, but will serve alcohol only from 11:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. each day,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will close any front or rear façade entrance doors at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing and will otherwise have a closed fixed facade with no open doors or windows,
- 5) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 7) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 8) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 9) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 10) it will insure that there are no wait lines outside and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

21. Chinese Tuxedo (8 Tuxedos Inc), 5 Doyers St btwn Pell St & Bowery (upgrade to op)

**THIS MOTION DID NOT PASS**

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 Recommendation To Deny**

**WHEREAS**, 8 Tuxedos Inc., doing business as Chinese Tuxedo, is seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for its restaurant located at 5 Doyers Street a/k/a 5-7 Doyers Street, between Pell Street and Bowery; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a restaurant with a certificate of occupancy of at least two hundred (200) people, forty-five (45) tables and one hundred sixty-two (162) seats with twenty-five (25) tables and one hundred two (102) seats and a twelve (12) foot bar with ten (10) stools on the ground floor and an additional forty-five (45) seats in the basement, hours of operation of 6:00 P.M.

to 1:00 A.M. all days, a kitchen open all hours, open façade doors and recorded background music; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated that its basement is used only for private events and the bar with nineteen (19) stools depicted in the diagrams it furnished is a counter for sitting and dining; and

**WHEREAS**, this applicant was denied a full on-premises license by Community Board 3 in April of 2015, because 1) the location had never housed a licensed business, 2) Doyers Street is a horseshoe one-lane alley with a street bed that is fourteen (feet) wide and a sidewalk that is only five (5) feet wide at its widest point and which is no more than one hundred (100) feet long from Pell Street to Bowery, 3) the street already had three (3) licensed businesses, with two (2) full on-premises liquor licenses and one (1) wine beer license, and was already overrun with patrons loitering on the sidewalk and cars idling in the street, honking horns and blocking through traffic most nights, 3) there were five (5) full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location per the applicant, 4) neither principal had any experience operating a licensed business in the area, 5) the applicant failed to furnish any vehicle or pedestrian traffic plan to address the addition of its patrons to this street, 6) there was community opposition to the approval of this license, and 7) there was no apparent public benefit to the approval of a Cantonese restaurant in an area with similar restaurants with no or wine beer licenses; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant then applied for a wine beer license to the SLA without notice to the community board and the SLA sent the applicant back to the community board for review of its wine beer application; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant was then denied a wine beer license by Community Board 3 in October of 2015, unless the applicant agreed to make as conditions of its license stipulations to 1) operate a full-service Melbournian Chinese and Cantonese restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food during all hours of operation, 2) have hours of operation of 10:00 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. all days, 3) not commercially operate any outdoor areas,, 4) install soundproofing consistent with the recommendations of an acoustic engineer, 5) close any front or rear façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, 6) play recorded background music and not have DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any events at which a cover fee would be charged, 7) not apply for an alteration without first appearing before Community Board 3, 8) not seek a change in class of its liquor license to a full on-premises liquor license without first obtaining the approval of Community Board 3 and not appear before Community Board 3 for such an application until it had been operating its business at least eighteen (18) months, 9) not have happy hours, 10) not host pub crawls or party buses, and 11) insure that there were no wait lines and designate an employee responsible to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk, 12) conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and 13) provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints; and

**WHEREAS**, the wine beer license was issued by the SLA on November 2, 2016, and this business has been operating for almost one (1) year; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated that the public benefit for approving a full on-premises liquor license is that it has created a well-regarded sought-after restaurant without complaints and it wants to expand its cocktail program to include alcohol for its patrons and growing business and so that it will have an on-premises designation before it is considered for Zagat and Michelin ratings; and

**WHEREAS**, this location is previously unlicensed, located within five hundred (500) feet of three (3) full on-premises liquor licenses and is adjacent to three (3) licensed businesses, two (2) of which have full on-premises liquor licenses; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant furnished approximately fifty (50) petition signatures from area residents and a letter from a resident of the building in support of its application and two (2) residents, including another building resident, spoke in support of this business as a rare restaurant in the Chinatown community and spoke of the principals as fine business owners; and

**WHEREAS**, another building resident and representatives of the Chinatown Core Block Association spoke in opposition to this application and submitted a letter from a third building resident in opposition to this application because 1) this restaurant has become a destination location with celebrity events in this small alley, 2) there are complaints of loud music emanating from the business and into residential apartments, its façade being open past 11:30 P.M., loud patrons on the sidewalk

and livery cars backed up onto Pell Street, and 3) the applicant had agreed prior to appearing before the community board in October of 2015 that it would not seek a change in class of its wine beer license without first operating its business for eighteen (18) months; and

**WHEREAS**, given its concern in adding a full on-premises liquor license to a small and already overburdened Doyers Street and given that the applicant has only been operating its business for almost one (1) year and stipulated before Community Board 3 in October of 2015 that it would not seek a change in class of its liquor license to a full on-premises liquor license without first operating its business at least eighteen (18) months; now

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for 8 Tuxedos Inc., for premises located at 5 Doyers Street a/k/a 5-7 Doyers Street, between Pell Street and Bowery.

**THIS MOTION PASSED**

**VOTE: TITLE: Community Board 3 recommendation to deny unless stipulations agreed to-stipulations attached**

**WHEREAS**, 8 Tuxedos Inc., doing business as Chinese Tuxedo, for its restaurant located at 5 Doyers Street a/k/a 5-7 Doyers Street, between Pell Street and Bowery, is seeking a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license; and

**WHEREAS**, this is an application for a restaurant with a certificate of occupancy of at least two hundred (200) people, forty-five (45) tables and one hundred sixty-two (162) seats, with twenty-five (25) tables and one hundred two (102) seats and a twelve (12) foot bar with ten (10) stools on the ground floor and an additional forty-five (45) seats in the basement, hours of operation of 6:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. all days, a kitchen open all hours, open façade doors and recorded background music; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated that its basement is used only for private events and the bar with nineteen (19) stools depicted in the diagrams it furnished is a counter for sitting and dining; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant has stated that the public benefit for approving a full on-premises liquor license is that it has created a well-regarded sought-after restaurant without complaints and it wants to expand its cocktail program to include alcohol for its patrons and growing business and so that it will have an on-premises designation before it is considered for Zagat and Michelin ratings; and

**WHEREAS**, this location is previously unlicensed, located within five hundred (500) feet of three (3) full on-premises liquor licenses and is adjacent to three (3) licensed businesses, two (2) of which have full on-premises liquor licenses; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant furnished approximately fifty (50) petition signatures from area residents and a letter from a resident of the building in support of its application and two (2) residents, including another building resident, spoke in support of this business as a rare restaurant in the Chinatown community and spoke of the principals as fine business owners; so

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 3 moves to deny the application for a change in class of its wine beer license to a full on-premises liquor license for 8 Tuxedos Inc., for the premises located at 5 Doyers Street a/k/a 5-7 Doyers Street, between Pell Street and Bowery, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations, which are the same as the existing stipulations, that

- 1) it will operate as a full-service Melbournian Chinese and Cantonese restaurant, with a kitchen open and serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 10:00 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. all days,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will install soundproofing consistent with the recommendations of an acoustic engineer,
- 5) it will close any front or rear façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night or during any amplified performances, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances,
- 6) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have live music, DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 7) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation without first appearing before Community Board 3,
- 8) it will not have "happy hours,"

- 9) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 10) it will insure that there are no wait lines and will designate an employee responsible to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk, and
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

Gigi Li motioned to vote no on this item

Discussion on this item occurred.

Vote taken. Motion to vote no on this item was approved.

Motion to approve an upgrade to full op with licensees existing stipulations.

22. Hwa Yuan Szechuan (42 44 East Broadway Restaurant Inc), 42 44 E Broadway btwn Catherine & Market Sts (upgrade to op)  
withdrawn

#### **Old Business**

- Resolution regarding consideration of both business and resident needs by nightlife taskforce

**VOTE: TITLE: Request that representatives of Community Boards are included as members of the Nightlife Advisory Board and that the Nightlife Advisory Board balances the issues and interests of the community with the interests of nightlife establishments**

**WHEREAS**, the City Council and Mayor have established an Office of Nightlife and a Nightlife Advisory Board; and

**WHEREAS**, the Nightlife Advisory Board has been created to serve as a liaison between nightlife establishments and the City with respect to city policies and procedures which affect the nightlife industry and in that capacity will

- (a) conduct outreach to nightlife establishments and provide information and assistance to such establishments in relation to existing city policies and procedures for responding to complaints, violations and other enforcement actions; and
- (b) assist in the resolution of conditions at nightlife establishments that lead to enforcement actions; and

**WHEREAS**, Community Boards already serve as an intermediary or liaison between city agencies and the nightlife industry, though in a more comprehensive way that includes the community, and thus should be working together with the Nightlife Advisory Board to share information and resources and resolve issues with nightlife establishments; and

**WHEREAS**, the role of the Nightlife Advisory Board, as written, does not allow for consideration of community interests in addressing city policies and procedures nor does it allow for consideration of community impact in resolving complaints and violations against nightlife establishments; and

**WHEREAS**, the City Charter mandates the role of Community Boards to include municipal service delivery coordination and the resolution of complaints, which includes responding to the concerns of community groups and residents; and

**WHEREAS**, because of proximity and responsiveness of Community Boards, communities frequently work first with Community Boards in addressing complaints concerning nightlife establishments and, in turn, Community Boards routinely work with the police, State Liquor Authority, residents and businesses to successfully resolve issues that require action from an enforcement agency; and

**WHEREAS**, the State Liquor Authority is required by law to consult with community boards in the consideration of liquor license applications subject to the 500-Foot Rule; and

**WHEREAS**, to properly consult with the State Liquor Authority, Community Boards must be well-informed about the histories of nightlife establishments in their Districts, including complaints and concerns raised by community groups and residents with respect to those establishments; and

**WHEREAS**, Community Boards were not consulted or considered regarding the creation of the Nightlife Advisory Board, which so directly impacts Community Boards and the residential and business communities they speak for; and



**WHEREAS**, the current legislation creating the Nightlife Advisory Board fails to include representation from Community Boards, despite the fact that Community Boards already perform many of the functions of the Nightlife Advisory Board and despite the fact that the City Council heard testimony that Community Boards should be included on the Nightlife Advisory Board for the reasons stated herein; and

**WHEREAS**, Community Boards are the structure within the City of New York for communities to participate in the decision making process that affects their communities and, therefore, Community Boards are the natural vehicle for communities to be represented on the Nightlife Advisory Board; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, that Community Board 3 urges the City Council and Mayor to include representatives of Community Boards as members of the Nightlife Advisory Board; and

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that Community Board 3 urges the City Council and Mayor to mandate the Nightlife Advisory Board to balance the issues and interests of the community, including its residents and businesses, with the interests of nightlife establishments to ensure all are represented.

**Items not heard at Committee**

- 23. Cherrva (Bistro Uruguay Inc), 131 Essex St (wb/corp change)  
no vote necessary
- 24. Zen 6 (Zen6NY LLC), 328 E 6th St (wb)  
no vote necessary
- 25. C&B (Coffee and Breakfast LLC), 178 E 7th St (wb)  
no vote necessary
- 26. 88 Lan Zhou Handmade Noodle & Dumpling (88 Lan Zhou Handmade Noodle & Dumpling Inc), 40 Bowery (wb)  
no vote necessary
- 27. My Noodle Station Inc, 19 Eldridge St (b)  
no vote necessary
- 28. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding SLA items 2, 21)**  
**11 YES 24 NO 4 ABS 0 PNV THIS MOTION DID NOT PASS (deny SLA item 2)**  
**27 YES 12 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (support SLA item 2)**  
**5 YES 33 NO 1 ABS 0 PNV THIS MOTION DID NOT PASS (deny SLA item 21)**  
**26 YES 7 NO 7 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (approve SLA item 21)**

**Economic Development Committee**

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee
- 2. LESEN Update Presentation  
no vote necessary
- 3. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities  
**VOTE:** To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.
- 4. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Transportation, Public Safety, & Environment Committee**

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee
- 2. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities  
**VOTE:** To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.
- 3. Request for support to make Delancey Street subway station ADA accessible  
**VOTE: TITLE: Request for ADA Accessibility at Delancey/Essex Street Subway Station**

**WHEREAS**, the district encompassing Manhattan Community Board 3 continues to experience population growth; and

**WHEREAS**, the district has been historically underserved by public transportation, which is exacerbated by the fact that most of the subway stations in the vicinity are not ADA accessible and thus not an option for many residents; and

**WHEREAS**, CB 3 passed a resolution in 2004 requesting that the Delancey/Essex Street subway station be made accessible in preparation for the development of the Seward Park Urban Renewal Area (a/k/a Essex Crossing); and

**WHEREAS**, CB 3 reaffirms this resolution and expresses that the need to provide ADA accessibility at the Delancey/Essex Street subway station has grown even more urgent in light of the ongoing completion of development within the Seward Park Urban Renewal Area, which ultimately will include over 1,000 residential units as well as destination businesses and entertainment; and

**WHEREAS**, the Delancey/Essex Street subway station is the principal subway station for the high numbers of seniors who live in the area, including the Naturally Occurring Retirement Community (NORC) on nearby Grand Street; and

**WHEREAS**, the ongoing revitalization of the nearby waterfront area also makes the full accessibility of this station necessary so all members of our community are able to fully participate in the enjoyment of our public spaces; and

**WHEREAS**, although MTA is taking measures to honor a 1994 agreement to retrofit 100 subway stations to make them ADA accessible by 2020, only "key stations" are being considered and many of the 472 stations, including Delancey/Essex, have been excluded; and

**WHEREAS**, the "key stations" designation focuses only on metrics such as ridership volume, use of station to transfer to other subway lines or buses, and location of the station related to schools, hospitals, recreational facilities, airports, etc. and does not take into account the rapid development and changes of neighborhoods in New York City; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, Manhattan Community Board 3 requests that the MTA renovate the Delancey/Essex Street subway station so it becomes fully accessible to all the passengers, including those with limited mobility, who wish to use the station; and

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, Manhattan Community Board 3 calls on our elected officials to continue to advocate for the aforementioned station improvement.

4. Brief overview of Neighborhood Rat Reduction Plan  
no vote necessary
5. Continued discussion of link between alcohol outlet density and public health/safety  
no vote necessary
6. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Joint Parks Committee & Public Housing & Section 8 Subcommittee**

- DOH presentation: Neighborhood rat reduction initiative  
no vote necessary

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Parks, Recreation, Cultural Affairs, & Waterfront Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee
2. Parks Dept presentation on programming: Ideas, timeline, and application process of movie nights, recreation programming, It's My Park events, and other general public programming in CB3 parks  
no vote necessary
3. NYC Ferry Landing Update  
no vote necessary
4. Report from Arts & Cultural Affairs Subcommittee  
no vote necessary
5. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities  
**VOTE:** To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.
6. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Landmarks Committee**

1. Certificate of Appropriateness, Webster Hall, 125 East 11th St: addition of three new doors at street level within the historic façade to improve ingress and egress, provide accessibility for the disabled, and allow more efficient load-in and out of performers

**VOTE: TITLE: To approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for Webster Hall, 125 East 11th Street**

**WHEREAS**, Webster Hall and Annex, built 1886-87 and 1892, Charles Rentz, Jr. architect, was designated a Landmark in 2008; and

**WHEREAS**, the original structure is in the Queen Anne style and the annex is Renaissance Revival, both clad in red Philadelphia pressed brick with brownstone trim and effusively ornamented with red terra cotta; and

**WHEREAS**, throughout its history it has been one of Greenwich Village/East Village's leading public rental halls and social centers; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is to install three new doors, in one opening, at street level in the façade of Webster Hall in order to provide ADA access via a new elevator to all public levels, improve ingress/egress, and offer more efficient load-in and load-out of equipment for the performance acts; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, CB 3 approves the Certificate of Appropriateness, with the following recommendations:

- The applicant should consider façade restoration, including the windows above the new doorway, as part of the project
- The applicant and LPC staff should seek a solution that does not involve breaking a pier

2. Certificate of Appropriateness, 84 Second Ave: Exterior work includes façade restoration; storefront alteration; installation of new dormer at roof; elevator, stair and mechanical additions; and rear-yard additions

**VOTE: TITLE: To approve the requested modifications to the front façade of 84 Second Avenue, but to deny the modifications to the rear façade**

**WHEREAS**, 84 Second Avenue is a contributing building in the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District; and

**WHEREAS**, it is a Greek Revival row house built in 1841 (architect not determined), consisting of planar brick façade, molded galvanized-iron lintels, cornice with short attic-story windows, historic wood window frames, sashes, and casements; and

**WHEREAS**, much of the storefront extension remains intact from the time of the 1909 alterations; and

**WHEREAS**, the application includes façade restoration, storefront alteration, increase in the roof height of 18 inches, elevator, stair and mechanical additions, and rear-yard additions; and

**WHEREAS**, the plan is to replace the wooden windows on the upper levels in kind; and

**WHEREAS**, the brick façade is to be repaired, repointed, and painted; and

**WHEREAS**, for ADA compliance, it is necessary to shift the doors forward by two feet to gain width, preserving the shape of the chamfered storefront, but compromising the tile floors called out in the designation report; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is to raise the roof by about 18" to provide more headroom on the top floor; and

**WHEREAS**, the application is to extend the ground floor all the way back to the rear of the yard, to extend the upper floors in the rear by 12 feet, and to add balconies, violating the historic footprint of the building; and

**WHEREAS**, CB 3 believes that the footprint and rear façade of the building are reflective of the period of construction and that the entire building is landmarked as part of the district and as such is part of the public benefit of landmarking; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, CB 3 approves the changes to the front façade of the building, but urges LPC and the applicant to seek the least intrusive solution to changes to the two entrance doors; and

**THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, CB 3 does not approve the rear yard additions, finding them an egregious intrusion into the rear yard obliterating the rear façade of the Landmark.

3. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities  
no vote necessary

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

**Land Use, Zoning, Public & Private Housing Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee
2. Low Line update  
no vote necessary
3. Rezoning the Waterfront/Subdistrict D

**VOTE: TITLE: To support request for CB 3 to be a co-applicant for a rezoning proposal of the Lower East Side waterfront area**

**WHEREAS**, a community group comprised of waterfront Tuff-LES leaders, GOLES and CAAAV have requested CB 3 and the Borough President to be co-applicants with them for a proposed rezoning of the waterfront; and

**WHEREAS**, CB 3 resolved in 2015 to support Option 1 of the Chinatown Working Group (CWG) plan for Subdistrict D and reaffirmed that support in letters to DCP; and

**WHEREAS**, Council Member Chin and Borough President Brewer are in support of the proposed rezoning plan; and

**WHEREAS**, the buildings currently proposed for development on the waterfront are extremely out of scale and would greatly accelerate the housing affordability crisis our community is facing; and

**WHEREAS**, the 197-c Land Use Applicant can receive fee waivers if a Community Board,, other agency, or elected official is a co-applicant; and

**WHEREAS**, as a co-applicant, CB 3 would fully engage in dialogue with partner groups and city agencies; and

**WHEREAS**, the extensive outreach that the planners hired by CWG engaged in to get us to this point demonstrates broad community support and thorough study; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, CB 3 agrees to become a co-applicant in the waterfront rezoning application.

4. 3rd & 4th Avenue rezoning issues  
no vote necessary
5. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities  
**VOTE: To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.**
6. Report from Public Housing/Section 8 Subcommittee  
no vote necessary
7. Vote to adjourn  
approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding Land Use item 3)**

**39 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED (Land Use item 3)**

**Health, Seniors, & Human Services / Youth, Education, & Human Rights Committee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee
2. Modification of DYCD RFP to open new crisis shelter beds for homeless youth

**VOTE: TITLE: Support for modification of DYCD RFP to open new crisis shelter beds for homeless youth**

**WHEREAS**, there are nearly 4,000 homeless young men and women in New York City and only 505 crisis shelter or transitional independent living (TIL) beds for this population; and

**WHEREAS**, the overwhelming majority of these 505 beds are filled every night, meaning that homeless youth can wait days or even weeks for an available bed in a homeless youth crisis shelter or TIL program; and

**WHEREAS**, the vast majority of homeless youth reject the adult homeless shelter system because they feel unsafe, unwelcome or both, and feel safer sleeping on the subway or on the streets; and

**WHEREAS**, some homeless youth believe they have no choice but to engage in survival sex in order to find a place to sleep or food to eat; and

**WHEREAS**, the homeless youth crisis affects virtually every community in New York City, including Community Board 3; and

**WHEREAS**, the City of New York administers the homeless youth shelter system through the Department of Youth & Community Development (DYCD); and

**WHEREAS**, the City of New York recognized that addressing the city's homeless crisis includes increasing the capacity of crisis shelters and TIL programs to better respond to the need, and issued an RFP through DYCD in 2016 to add 700 new beds for homeless youth; and

**WHEREAS**, the RFP does not include capital start-up funding to allow providers to pay for needed renovations and other related expenses to convert existing buildings into shelter or TIL programs that meet the exacting criteria of State licensers; and

**WHEREAS**, only 50 new TIL program beds and no crisis shelter beds have been added to the existing census since the RFP was issued, which is profoundly disappointing given the overwhelming need among this population; and

**WHEREAS**, the winter is fast approaching and young people who sleep on our streets will face increased risk of frostbite and other significant health risks; so

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, Community Board 3 urges the City's DYCD to amend the existing RFP for crisis shelter beds and TIL programs for homeless youth to include capital start-up costs separate and apart from the offered bed rate and contract value to allow more providers to create desperately needed new capacity for this vulnerable population.

3. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities

**VOTE:** To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.

4. Vote to adjourn

approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

#### **Arts & Cultural Affairs Subcommittee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee

2. Finalize updates to Arts & Culture resource data file  
no vote necessary

3. Review People's Plan for Create NYC Cultural plan  
no vote necessary

4. Vote to adjourn

approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

#### **Public Housing & Section 8 Housing Subcommittee**

1. Approval of previous month's minutes  
approved by committee

2. FY'2019 Capital & Expense Priorities

**VOTE:** To approve FY'2019 Capital and Expense Priorities.

3. Vote to adjourn

approved by committee

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

Vote to adjourn

**40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED**

Members Present at Last Vote:

David Adams	[P]	Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Jeremy Markman	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Debra Glass	[P]	Chad Marlow	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Herman F. Hewitt	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Nancy Ortiz	[P]
Karen Blatt	[A]	Linda Jones	[P]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[A]
Lisa Burriss	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Joyce Ravitz	[P]
Alan van Capelle	[A]	Marnie Ann Joyce	[A]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Meghan Joye	[P]	James Rogers	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Richard F. Ropiak	[P]
MyPhuong Chung	[P]	Carol Kostik	[A]	Robin Schatell	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Mae Lee	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[A]
Enrique Cruz	[P]	Veronica Leventhal	[A]	Clint Smeltzer	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Nancy Sparrow-Bartow	[P]
Dean Diongson	[P]	Gigi Li	[P]	Josephine Velez	[P]
Wilda Escarfuller	[A]	Luis Lopez	[P]	Rodney Washington	[A]
Shirley Fennessey	[A]	Mei Lum	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
David Ford	[P]	Robert Magliaro	[A]		

Meeting Adjourned