

THE CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 3 59 East 4th Street - New York, NY 10003 Phone: (212) 533-5300 - Fax: (212) 533-3659 www.cb3manhattan.org - info@cb3manhattan.org

Dominic Pisciotta, Board Chair

Susan Stetzer, District Manager

February 2011 Full Board Minutes

Meeting of Community Board #3 held on February 22, 2011 at 6:30pm at PS 20, 166 Essex Street. Meeting called to order by Gigi Li 6:45 PM.

Public Session:

- Jim Power aka Mosaic Man spoke of his contribution to the East Village and Lower East Side with the construction of his Mosaic Path. He's building a light bulb-focused public art project.
- Eileen Ryan from the Henry Street Settlement youth employment program spoke of the details of enrollment of youth in the program. Applications and information will be available outside the meeting.
- Andrew Coamey spoke on the SLA policy document. He attended a recent CB3 Executive Committee meeting and read a prepared statement that was distributed and is available. He feels all applications should be handled as new.
- Kurt Cavanaugh from the East Village Community Coalition believes that all SLA applications should be handled as new.
- Sean Chittle spoke of the SLA transfer policy. He compared the "never expiring" licenses in the East Village to the 99-year lease held by Larry Silverstein. He believes CB3 should be in compliance with the other 58 CBs.
- Dina Magnes spoke in support of Sean Chittle.
- Marcello Paglionifo of the Pasta Bar Caffe Corporation spoke of the need for support for license for businesses like his which are in compliance.
- Meri Micara asks CB3 support to eliminate the transfer policy as they are transferred to the highest bidder, and no other business has such a feature.
- Jill Ackerman of the 12th Street Block Association lauded the Transportation Bill of Rights. She thanks everyone who worked on the SLA document. She believes there is a missed opportunity in dealing with the transfer issue. Other CBs and the SLA treat each application as new.
- Judith Zaborowski of the East 9th Street Block Association, representing 65 people, is against the transfer policy as a gesture of respect for neighbors who survived many difficulties in the community.
- Kate Puls of East 9th Street reiterates that all licenses should be treated as new.
- Dale Goodson of East 12 Street is against the existing transfer policy.
- Rob Hollander, a neighborhood resident since the 1970s, is speechless about the policy that guarantees a license to a bar-owner. Every business has risks. How can CB3 remove that risk for this one type of business? The flourishing of bars in the neighborhood is inherently too controversial to allow for this.
- Ezell Turner spoke of the lack of security cameras at Baruch Houses, which might have contributed to a rape, and the need for a block party to bring people together, as some older residents are not feeling welcomed by the police.

Public Officials:

Mayor Michael Bloomberg, Lolita Jackson & Pauline Yu: No report.

Public Advocate Bill de Blasio, Phil Jones: No report.

Comptroller John Lui, Sandra Ung: No report.

Borough President Scott Stringer, Alec Schierenbeck: He is the Community Liaison. The BP recently gave his State of the Borough Address. The theme was calling for a new partnership between the city and its people. People no longer say the city is ungovernable. Basic competence in NYC's government has taken place, but there is a tendency for it to be top-down, rather than democratic processes like the CB3 public meeting. He thinks after the blizzard and Cathy Black problems, maybe he will be turning around. The District Attorney is creating the first Family Justice Center as a place where survivors of domestic violence can apply for assistance while their dependents are taken care of in the same facility. The BP has been working on nutrition and food policy and announced the Veggie Van to give people access to basic nutritious fresh food. It will go around the borough. He is expanding the Youth Bucks program, \$2 coupons put in the hands of youth to redeem for healthy snacks. It should expand from 2000 to 4000 children. 1/23 there is a Town Hall "What's Next for World Trade Center Development?" at 120 Warren Street at 6:30.

Congressmember Jerrold Nadler, Daniel Weisfeld: No report.

Congressmember Nydia Velazquez, Iris Quinones: No report.

Congressmember Carolyn Maloney, Brice Peyre: He spoke of a measure which stripped services from Planned Parenthood, although most of their services have nothing to do with abortion. The Republican leadership say they are interested in creating jobs, but this initiative belies that. This fight will continue in the Senate. Coops and condos will be able to get federal backing for mortgages under a bill she fought for. She supports President Obama's call for free elections in Egypt. She calls for the eligibility of deductions for breast-feeding equipment. The first tunnel of the 2nd Avenue subway was completed. Her full newsletter is available in the lobby. A question was asked about whether she supported renewal of the Patriot Act. Victor Montesinos will find out and report back.

Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver, Zach Bommer: He hopes everyone had a happy Lunar New Year. Assemblyman Silver attended the parade. Cuts to the M22 bus line negatively affect a particularly underserved area of the Lower East Side. He wrote to and spoke with the MTA Chair to reverse these cuts. The intercity buses aka Chinatown buses are unregulated and can park, load and unload wherever they want. Some are not good locations. A bill being put together will allow the city to regulate them. The newsletter is available.

Assemblymember Deborah J. Glick, Lisa Parson: The focus of last month and this month is fighting back against the Governor's cuts to SUNY and CUNY. They haven't had an increase in the last 4 years. Cuts to senior centers are also being resisted. The newsletter is available.

Assemblymember Brian Kavanagh, Leslie Peña: The office is working on maintaining rent regulation. A public hearing was held on the topic. He supports the East Side Action Plan for rapid transit. An issue not in the report is gun safety. Community outreach and the introduction of bills are features of this. The newsletter is available. People are welcome to call or email the office, also the Housing Hot Line.

State Senator Daniel L. Squadron, Rosemarie Diaz: He is working on the Chinatown buses bill also. Senator Squadron supported Ed Koch's call for Albany reform. The next community forum will be held in Brooklyn Sunday March 13 at St. Francis College. Flyers are available. Information is on the website. The district office is now at 250 Broadway, suite 2011.

State Senator Thomas K. Duane, John Bartos: No report.

Councilmember Margaret Chin, Patricia Olan: She supports the Chinatown bus legislation. It will assign pickup and dropoff sites. She introduced a bill to enforce an escrow requirement for landlords to support the costs of relocating tenants due to the vacating of apartments. The newsletter is available. If you know of anyone without insurance, there are vouchers in the district office from the Department of Health that will allow families to receive free flu shots. She is planning a Town Hall for 2/28. The community will be informed.

Councilmember Rosie Mendez, Michelle Berger, Community Liaison: Flu vouchers are also available at her office on 14th Street. Rosie voted "No" on the smoking ban in parks. It passed, but she didn't believe it was enforceable or could be applied in an even-handed manner. She feared it would target youth and people of color. The application process for discretionary funds is on the Council's website this year. Flyers are available.

Members Present at First Vote:

David Adams	[P]	Linda Jones	[P]	Dominic Pisciotta	[A]
Julia Andino	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Barden Prisant	[P]
Jimmy Cheng	[P]	Meghan Joye	[P]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Joel Kaplan	[P]	Joyce Ravitz	[P]
Andrea Diaz	[A]	Carol Kostik	[P]	Lois M. Regan	[P]
Harvey Epstein	[A]	John Leo	[P]	Janet Riesel	[P]
Morris Faitelewicz	[A]	Ricky Leung	[P]	Richard F. Ropiak	[P]
Flora Ferng	[P]	Sam Leung	[P]	Susan Scheer	[P]
Beth From	[P]	Gigi Li	[P]	David Silversmith	[A]
Rabbi Y. S. Ginzberg	[P]	Bernard Marti	[P]	Nancy Sparrow-Bartow	[P]
Gloria Goldenberg	[P]	Bernice McCallum	[A]	Mary Spink	[P]
Jan Hanvik	[P]	David McWater	[A]	Elinor Tatum	[A]
Herman F. Hewitt	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[P]	Rodney Washington	[A]
Simon Huang	[P]	Maria Muentes	[A]	Samuel Wilkenfeld	[A]
Bonnie Hulkower	[A]	Chiun Ng	[P]	Justin Yu	[P]
Carolyn Jeffers	[P]	Ariel Palitz	[P]	Thomas Yu	[A]
Anne K. Johnson	[P]	Thomas Parker	[P]		

Minutes:

Minutes of December 2010 were approved, as is.

Board Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Dominic Pisciotta: Gigi Li read the report. Meghan Joye has been appointed Co-Chair of the Economic Development Committee. She will no longer serve as Secretary. The Executive Board will appoint a replacement as soon as possible.

District Manager's Report:

The Department of Educaiton has reversed its policy of allowing Community Boards to hold meetings in schools without charge. Along with our budget cut caused by unfunded raises of \$8,000, this would prevent the CB from holding full board meetings in schools. We are very fortunate that District One Community Education Council has agreed to co-sponsor our board meetings so that we will not be charged. The charge for the remainder of this school year would have been around \$2000.

The CEC will have a public meeting March 6. The public is invited to hear about education issues. It would be great if someone also attended from CB 3 to thank them.

The new interactive 311 map is available at nyc.gov. You can focus on a zip code or an area to monitor areas of complaints.

There are vouchers for free flu shots, for people without insurance. The shots are available at chain drug stores until 4/15.

The Borough President is convening a meeting of the Go Green Lower East Side Steering Committee 2/23 at 9:30 AM.

Committee Reports:

Executive Committee: No report.

Ariel Palitz spoke from the audience on a purported "gag order" on an 11th hour back door decision to bring the SLA issue to a vote at tonight's meeting.

Susan Stetzer sent information to the Conflict of Interest Board

David Crane read an email from the Conflict of Interest deputy director concerning this issue.

Gigi Li pointed out that the motion is on the top of page 7. It will be pulled so we can go through the rest of the agenda to be able to attend to this issue in depth.

Anne Johnson asked if we will vote on all issues, except the SLA issue. She would like to pull Item 7 from the SLA Committee also.

Alix Militano has stipulations on everything except # 13 so that will be a denial. All other stipulations were received.

1. RESOLUTION IN SUPPORT OF PRESERVING NYS RENT REGULATION LAWS (Emergency Tenant Protection Act of 1974)

VOTE:

WHEREAS, all middle-class New Yorkers and especially rent-regulated tenants have been hard hit by the 2008 recession and its continuing aftermath; and

WHEREAS, New York City continues to lose affordable rent regulated units; and

WHEREAS, provisions of the rent regulation laws have eroded tenant rights and protections over the past two decades; and

WHEREAS, Community Board 3 supports the right of hard working middle-class New Yorkers to live and raise a family in their home communities; and

WHEREAS, New York City resident on fixed incomes should be able to continue to live in their home communities; and

WHEREAS, New Yorkers should never have to suffer housing discrimination, harassment, or unsafe living conditions; and

WHEREAS, a recent analysis on rent regulation published by the Citizens Budget Commission concluded that 49.2 percent of Manhattan residents living in rent-regulated units would experience rent increases of fifty percent or more if rent regulation laws are allowed to sunset later this year; and

WHEREAS, the expiration of the New York State Rent Regulation Laws on June 15, 2011 without

extension would be a disaster for millions of New York City residents; so

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 3 strongly supports the renewal and

strengthening of New York State Rent Laws in anticipation of their sunset on June 15, 2011. This item was pulled at the request of Gloria Goldenberg. She felt there were gratuitous criticisms of landlords. The language came from the Borough President, therefore, Alec Schierenbeck spoke. He didn't read the

> language that way, but stated that it is based on fair enforcement of New York landlord-tenant laws. Gigi Li: CB3's vote empowers Dominic to vote for it or against it at the District Board meeting, as is, but since the language came from the Borough President's office, THIS motion can't be changed and still be voted on by Dominic. If we were to pass an edited resolution, Dominic would have to abstain from this vote at the Borough Board meeting.

A separate roll call vote was held on this motion. The motion passed.

2. Request to Co-sponsor Town Hall meeting with DA's office

- **VOTE:** Community Board 3 will co-sponsor with the Manhattan District Attorney's office a Lower East Side Town Hall meeting in April. The meeting will be scheduled for a weekday evening from 6:30 to 8:30 and will introduce the District Attorney's office to the community. This Town Hall is for outreach to explain how the DA's office can work with and help the community.
 - 3. Request for letters of support for the Clemente Soto Velez Cultural and Educational Center and the Asian-American Arts Centre

VOTE: Community Board 3 will write letters of support for the applications of the Clemente Soto Velez Cultural and Educational Center and the Asian-American Arts Centre for support from the Community and Cultural Enhancement Fund of the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation.

Letter #1

Lower Manhattan Development Corporation 1 Liberty Plaza 20th Floor New York NY 10006 Attn: Angela Rossi, Lower Manhattan Community and Cultural Enhancement Program

Memo re: Letter of Support from Community Board 3 for the Clemente Soto Velez Cultural & Educational Center's Application to the Lower Manhattan Community and Cultural Enhancement Program

Community Board 3 supports the request of the above-named for a Capital: Construction project in the amount of \$500,000. This project for the renovation of portions of the CSV Center, is primarily design and planning for a code renovation. The project goals are to provide access to and safe egress from all spaces on the first floor and basement levels. This project will preserve the Center's vibrant and public-minded ground floor programs, long among the foremost Puerto Rican and Latino cultural centers on the Lower East Side and in the City as a whole. It will also provide the Lower East Side with a revitalized facility that will be a highly visible cultural beacon accessible to community members and visitors from around the region and around the world, strongly impacting Lower Manhattan's revitalization.

Community Board 3 supports this application due to the applicant's extremely high importance to the cultural, educational, and economic vitality of the community. CSV management and resident artists and companies have constantly shown a willingness to share their artistic and physical resources with the community. In an era of gentrification and the blurring of the Lower East Side's identity as a multicultural welcoming place for people from all parts of the world, CSV remains a welcoming place, supporting and presenting an extreme diversity of cultural forms and traditions, often at no cost and always at highly subsidized rates. The Center welcomes approximately 75,000 visitors per year, providing a benefit in financial terms to the surrounding community, while maintaining its role as one of the few determinedly multicultural centers in the City, and one of the most important cultural centers overall."

Sincerely,

Letter #2

Lower Manhattan Development Corporation 1 Liberty Plaza 20th Floor New York NY 10006 Attn: Angela Rossi, Lower Manhattan Community and Cultural Enhancement Program

Memo re: Letter of Support from Community Board 3 for the Clemente Soto Velez Cultural & Educational Center's Application to the Lower Manhattan Community and Cultural Enhancement Program

Community Board 3 supports the request of the above-named for a Program: Service project in the amount of \$120,000. "Windows on the Lower East Side" is a collaborative marketing effort to create an array of print and on-line marketing tools to make CSV and the Lower East Side cultural hubs for a vastly changing neighborhood., building audiences collaboratively from among the under-served long-time residents of the neighborhood with those more newly arrived, improving quality of life, and building sustainability collaboratively.

Community Board 3 supports this application due to the applicant's extremely high importance to the cultural, educational, and economic vitality of the community. CSV management and resident artists and companies have constantly shown a willingness to share their artistic and physical resources with the community. In an era of gentrification and the blurring of the Lower East Side's identity as a multicultural welcoming place for people from all parts of the world, CSV remains a welcoming place, supporting and presenting an extreme diversity of cultural forms and traditions, often at no cost and always at highly subsidized rates. The Center welcomes approximately 75,000 visitors per year, providing a benefit in financial terms to the surrounding community, while maintaining its role as one of the few determinedly multicultural centers in the City, and one of the most important cultural centers overall.

Sincerely,

(Executive Committee)

40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV (Excluding Item 1) MOTION PASSED Item 1: 39 YES 1 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

SLA & DCA Licensing Committee

Motion to transfer licenses.

Meghan Joye: An owner-operator without violations who wants to sell the business will have the right to grant a temporary license to the buyer. This reiterates what the SLA already does. The grandfather clause doesn't automatically grant a license. If someone spent 20 years building a bar, they can't sell the business if they can't transfer the license.

David Crane: Recommends we amend the language to the language in a handout he prepared. Ariel Palitz: The three bar owners on the board didn't know about this change until arriving at this meeting. She believes it's a waste of time to vote on something which will be appealed. She asked for postponement of the vote.

Alex Militano: This is a recommendation only. The Conflicts of Interest Policy is called upon if bar-owners vote against this recommendation. She supports David Crane's amendment. Practice can be different from policy. CB3's website explains the difference between a transfer and a new license. There is a belief that a transfer is another asset that is bought or sold like any other asset. She can't find anywhere in the law that this is so. It's like a driver's license. You can buy a truck but the driver must get his/her own driver's license. CB3 doesn't have a written policy at this point. CB3 is phasing out the inappropriate way that it was approving licenses. David Adams: Advises that the buyer be scrutinized more stringently.

Meghan Joye: A transfer i.e. the grandfathering is approved only when the buyer and seller are comparable i.e. restaurant-to-restaurant, and neither party has a serious complaint or violation history. This procedure doesn't allow small businesses to maintain their value.

Susan Stetzer: "The Truth Behind Transfer Licenses" is on the website. She read from it. MOST bar owners are responsible. It's the number of people going between bars and the noise they make that get the complaints. She polled other community boards. CB1 waives its Right of Review because they want to attract more nightlife. Other CBs treat all transfers as new, and bars are still being bought and sold.

Carol Kostic: Has been on the SLA Committee for about a year. The big issue is consistency. The grey area as to whether all transfers are seen as new or as transfers is what causes the problems. She supports David Crane's compromise.

Richard Ropiak: What is the reason for CB3 to transfer licenses whereas no other CB does?

Anne Johnson: Made a motion to send this back to the SLA committee. Meghan Joye: Seconded.

Hand vote. "Yes" to postpone. 12. "No" to not postpone.

David Crane: Someone has owned a restaurant for 10 years. It has a good reputation. So does the buyer. What stipulations could be attached to the grandfather clause?

Gigi Li: She is not on the SLA Committee. All board members were invited to contribute over 5 months. It has been on the CB3 website for at least 2 months. It was already postponed from December. As a CB member, it is everyone's responsibility to read and comment on such issues. She urges a vote tonight.

Mary Spink: The tumult at the last SLA meeting caused a questionable clarity about the voting at the committee because people heard and understood different things.

Lois Regon: How would Alex change the language that is before us now.

Alex Militano: She would eliminate the underlined phrasing on page 12.

Hand call vote to cut off debate on whether or not to postpone. It passed.

Motion for David Crane's amendment. "Yes" is to phase out automatic transfers, and the striking out of the underlining on pages 4 and 12.

Gigi Li: The vote on the floor is for the amendment. Roll call vote. The amendment passed. David Crane: We vote on the whole policy, as amended. Final roll call vote. The policy passed. Renewal with Complaint History

1. Superdive (Rapture Café & Books LLC), 200 Ave A (op)

VOTE: To deny the renewal of the full on-premise liquor license for Rapture Café & Books LLC, doing business as Superdive, for the premise located at 200 Avenue A, because 1) the present method of operation as a bar closing at 4:00 A.M. is not consistent with the stipulations this applicant agreed to with Community Board #3, which provided that it would operate as a bookstore with the service of alcohol incidental to that operation, reserve the majority of its layout for book shelves, not have DJs or live musicians, close its backyard at 9:00 P.M. every night and close no later than 2:00 A.M. every night, in that as soon as this applicant began operating as Rapture Café & Books, it immediately violated the aforementioned stipulations by hosting scheduled live performances and closing at 4:00 A.M., 2) it then closed, filed an endorsement with the New York State Liquor Authority without notice to the community board and reopened as a bar, doing business as Superdive, with keg service and unlimited drink specials, which is also inconsistent with the agreed upon method of operation in its stipulations, 3) in the time it has been operating as both Rapture Café & Books and as Superdive there have been numerous resident complaints of loud music late at night, as well as unruly and loud crowds of patrons blocking the sidewalks to 311, the community board, the New York State Liquor Authority and the police, including from twelve (12) residents who submitted letters in opposition to this renewal (appended hereto), as well as twelve (12) residents, a representative of the East Village Community Coalition and a representative of the North Avenue A Neighborhood Association, all of whom appeared before Community Board #3 in opposition to this renewal, 4) the applicant was asked to appear before the community board in 2009 to address complaints but failed to appear despite the community board staff speaking with him directly and has again failed to appear to respond to complaints despite the district manager speaking with him directly, 5) the applicant operated the basement illegally, contrary to its certificate of occupancy, for which it was vacated by the Department of Buildings on February 26, 2010, filed alteration plans to conform the basement to its illegal use and altered the premise before notifying the New York State Liquor Authority and Community Board #3 in 2010 and for which it was denied in January of 2011, and has now failed an audit of those plans with the Department of Buildings, and 6) it has not been in continuous operation for at least one (1) year and opens only for infrequent private parties and holidays

Applications within Resolution Areas

2. Snack Dragon, 164 Orchard St (wb)

VOTE: WHEREAS, Snack Dragon is applying for a beer wine license for 164 Orchard Street, between Stanton and Rivington Streets, a location which has not been previously licensed and which was previously operated as a clothing store; and

WHEREAS, this applicant is seeking to serve beer and wine at a "takeout taco stand with seating;" and WHEREAS, this location is within five hundred (500) feet of eleven (11) licensed premises, five (5) of which are on the block where the applicant is applying; and

WHEREAS, notwithstanding that the applicant furnished one hundred fourteen (114) petition resident signatures from area residents in support of its application, Orchard Street is presently overwhelmed by nighttime licensed establishments of all types, as well as incredible vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion attendant to the volume of nighttime businesses; and

WHEREAS, Orchard Street is one of the worst areas in the 7th Precinct in terms of degraded quality of life as a result of so many licensed establishments within close proximity to each other, overwhelming pedestrian and vehicular traffic, patrons congregating in the street, late night horn honking from the increased presence of taxis and noise emanating from the businesses and its patrons; and

WHEREAS, as a result of these persistent conditions and at the request of the 7th Precinct and Community Board #3 the Department of Transportation has eliminated weekend nighttime parking on one side of Orchard Street between Houston and Delancey Streets in an effort to alleviate congestion and minimize late night noise; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has failed to demonstrate the public benefit derived from the approval of the sale of beer and wine on its premise; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board #3 moves to deny a beer wine license for Snack Dragon, 164 Orchard Street

3. Goodfellas Brick Oven Pizza (FRKK Inc) 144 Orchard St (wb)

VOTE: WHEREAS, FRKK Inc. is applying for a beer wine license for 144 Orchard Street, on the corner of Orchard and Rivington Streets, a location which has not been previously licensed; and WHEREAS, this applicant is seeking to serve beer and wine at an Italian restaurant pizzeria; and WHEREAS, by the applicants own estimation, this location is within two hundred fifty (250) feet of eleven (11) licensed premises; and

WHEREAS, notwithstanding the applicants history operating the same business in Staten Island, Orchard Street is presently overwhelmed by nighttime licensed establishments of all types, as well as incredible vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion attendant to the volume of nighttime businesses; and

WHEREAS, Orchard Street is one of the worst areas in the 7th Precinct in terms of degraded quality of life as a result of so many licensed establishments within close proximity to each other, overwhelming pedestrian and vehicular traffic, patrons congregating in the street, late night horn honking from the increased presence of taxis and noise emanating from the businesses and its patrons; and WHEREAS, as a result of these persistent conditions and at the request of the 7th Precinct and Community Board #3, the Department of Transportation has eliminated weekend nighttime parking on one side of Orchard Street between Houston and Delancey Streets in an effort to alleviate congestion and minimize late night noise; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has failed to demonstrate the public benefit derived from the approval of the sale of beer and wine on this premise and furnished only nineteen (19) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board #3 moves to deny a beer wine license for FRKK Inc., 144 Orchard Street

4. To Be Determined, 175 Ludlow St (wb)

VOTE: WHEREAS, a corporation to be determined with a principal of Maurizio Crescenzo, has applied for a beer wine license to operate an Italian restaurant at 175 Ludlow Street, a location between Houston and Stanton Streets which has been unlicensed for at least two (2) years; and

WHEREAS, Ludlow Street is an extremely old, narrow street, historically comprised of low-rise tenements and small-scale manufacturing and retail; and

WHEREAS, notwithstanding that the applicant furnished one hundred twenty-four (124) petition signatures from area residents in support of its application, Ludlow Street is presently overwhelmed by nighttime licensed establishments of all types, as well as incredible vehicular and pedestrian traffic congestion attendant to the volume of these businesses; and

WHEREAS, there are seventeen (17) liquor licensed establishments on Ludlow Street between Houston and Rivington Streets, as well as between twenty-three (23) and thirty (30) licensed establishments within five hundred (500) of this location, the majority of which provide some food service; and

WHEREAS, Ludlow Street may be the single worst area in the 7th precinct in terms of degraded quality of life as a result of so many licensed establishments within close proximity to each other, overwhelming pedestrian and vehicular traffic, patrons congregating in the street itself, late night horn honking and overwhelming noise emanating from businesses and from patrons as they move between businesses; and

WHEREAS, as a result of these persistent detrimental conditions and at the request of the 7th Precinct and Community Board #3, the Department of Transportation has eliminated weekend nighttime parking on the west side of Ludlow Street, between Houston and Delancey Streets, to alleviate the existing pedestrian and traffic congestion and to minimize noise; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board #3 moves to deny the beer wine license for a corporation to be determined with a principal of Maurizio Crescenzo, 175 Ludlow Street

5. Castleblade, Inc, 17 Clinton St (alt/wb/expand to next door)

This applicant withdrew.

NO VOTE NECESSARY

6. Taco Joint Inc, 119 St Marks Pl (wb) East Storefront

VOTE: To deny the application for a beer wine license for Taco Joint Inc., located at 119 St. Marks Place, east storefront, between First Avenue and Avenue A, because 1) this location was previously unlicensed, having been operated as a clothing shop, 2) there has been demonstrated consistent opposition to the addition of any other liquor licenses on this block of St. Mark's Place, 3) there are already fifteen (15) liquor license on this single block, 4) the numerous existing nighttime establishments have resulted in significant noise and vehicular and pedestrian traffic, as well as a request by the previous commanding officers of said precinct that no new liquor licenses be issued on this street, and 5) the applicant has failed to demonstrate the public benefit derived from the approval of the sale of beer and wine at this premise

7. Pastabar Café Corp, 127 Ave C (up/op) (aka 343 E 8th St)

VOTE: to send the application back to Committee.

This item was pulled at the request of Anne Johnson. She spoke in favor of a full liquor license. This is in her neighborhood. He is in the business of serving food. It is one of the few places where people of a certain age can hold and hear conversations. He is willing to support community groups. Carolyn Ratcliffe spoke in support of the owner's support of the community garden and providing refreshments to neighborhood children involved in community/arts activities. Alex Militano: This is the third time the applicant was asked to state community benefit, and he stated the community benefit as serving after-dinner drinks. The resolution speaks to the issue

of density of full liquor licenses in the neighborhood. This is within a resolution area. Alex is getting the same answer all three times to her request for an upgrade to the "community benefit" issue.

Anne Johnson: Moves to send the application back to the SLA Committee to try to get the owner to agree to stipulations regarding community benefit, as discussed by Carolyn Ratcliffe and Anne Johnson. Jan Hanvik seconded. Susan Stetzer: The agenda is already out so it can't be added to the full board agenda nor, per Alex, to the SLA Committee as it requires time to notify applicants of their appearance date.

The motion passed with 26 Yes and 15 No.

Sidewalk Café Applications

8. Ninth Ward (Church and Louis Inc), 180 2nd Ave

VOTE: To approve the application for a sidewalk café permit for eight (8) tables and sixteen (16) seats, for Church and Louis Inc., doing business as Ninth Ward, 180 Second Avenue, because the applicant has signed a change agreement which will become part of its DCA license that 1) the café will consist of eight (8) tables with sixteen (16) seats, and 2) its hours of operation will be from 4:00 P.M. to 9:00 P.M. Mondays through Thursdays, 4:00 P.M. to 10:00 P.M. Fridays and Saturdays and 1:00 P.M. to 9:00 P.M. Sundays

Alterations/Transfers/Upgrades

9. To Be Determined, 103 2nd Ave (trans/op) (Vandaag)

This applicant withdrew.

NO VOTE NECESSARY

10. Spur Tree (Symtic 10 Ten LLC) 76 Orchard St (trans/wb)

This applicant withdrew.

NO VOTE NECESSARY

11. 40 Mulberry Restaurant Inc, 40 Mulberry St (alt/op/request to add portable karaoke machine)

VOTE: to deny the alteration of the full on-premise liquor license for 40 Mulberry Restaurant Inc., 40 Mulberry Street, to wit adding a portable karaoke machine in the basement dining room, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service Asian Italian fusion restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 12:00 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Mondays through Fridays and 5:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Saturdays, 3) it will maintain a closed fixed facade, and 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, except that it may maintain and use a portable karaoke machine in its basement dining room only

12. Rivington Wine and Cheese Inc, 155 Rivington St (alt/op/increase seating)

VOTE: to approve the alteration of the full on-premise liquor license for Rivington Wine & Cheese Inc., doing business as Rivington Wine & Cheese, 155 Rivington Street, to wit eliminating an office in the rear of the business, moving the bathrooms to the back wall of the business and adding an L-shaped bench, consisting of four (4) to six (6) seats, in front of the bathrooms

13. Ashton Thai Place Inc, 244 E 13th St (trans/wb) (Zabbi City)

VOTE: to deny the transfer of a beer wine license to Ashton Thai Place Inc., with a business name of Ashton Thai Place, for the existing business Zabbi City, located at 244 East 13th Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service Thai restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing and with alcohol service at tables only, 2) its hours of operation will be from 11:30 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Mondays through Thursdays, 12:00 P.M. to 11:30 P.M. Fridays and Saturdays and 12:00 P.M. to 11:00 P.M. Sundays, and 3) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music

14. Heartbreak Café (Christos Restaurant LLC), 29 E 2nd St (alt/wb/extend to proposed sidewalk café)

VOTE: To deny the alteration of the beer wine license for Christos Restaurant LLC, doing business as Heartbreak Cafe, 92 East 2nd Street, to wit extending its full on-premise liquor license to a proposed sidewalk cafe, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service German Swiss restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 11:00 A.M. to 1:00 A.M. Mondays through Thursdays, 11:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays and 12:30 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Sundays, 3) it will close any façade doors and windows, specifically its accordion doors, at 10:00 P.M. every night, 4) it will maintain its primary entrance on East 2nd Street to alleviate congestion on Second Avenue and only use its Second Avenue entrance for staff to access its sidewalk café, 5) its sidewalk café will consist of eight (8) tables with thirty-two (32) seats on the Second Avenue side of the business only and will close its café no later than 11:00 P.M. every night, 6) it will designate an employee to address patron crowds and noise on the sidewalk, and 7) it will not seek to upgrade its license

15. Kuidouraku (141 Ebenezer & Song Inc), 141 1st Ave (trans/wb)

VOTE: To deny the transfer of a full on-premise liquor license to 141 Ebenezer & Song Inc., with a proposed business name of Kuidouraku, for the existing business Panasian Restaurant, located at 141 First Avenue, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service Japanese restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 12:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M.

Sundays through Thursdays and 12:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays, and 3) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music

16. The Beagle, 162 Ave A (trans/op) (Orologio)

VOTE: given that the existing business has operated without incident for sixteen (16) years and the present applicant is seeking to transfer the full on-premise liquor license from said business for a new business with the same method of operation as a restaurant, Community Board #3 moves to deny the transfer of a full on-premise liquor license to a corporation to be determined, with principal Matthew Paul Piacentini, and a proposed business name of The Beagle, for the existing business Orologio, located at 162 Avenue A, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service new American European restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) it will close any façade doors and windows at 10:00 P.M. every night, and 3) its hours of operation will be 5:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Sundays through Wednesdays and 5:00 P.M. to 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Saturdays, 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have live music or DJs, 5) it will not seek to operate a sidewalk café until it has been open for at least one (1) year, and 6) it will hire security Thursdays through Saturdays based upon the volume of its business and designate security or employees to oversee the door and front of the business in order to keep sidewalks clear and minimize noise from patrons in front of the business

17. 161 Restaurant Corp, 161 Ludlow St (trans/op) (Imperial Tavern)

This applicant withdrew.

NO VOTE NECESSARY

New Liquor License Applications

18. Momofuku Milk Bar (EV Milk LLC), 251 E 13th St (op)

VOTE: to deny the application for a full on-premise liquor license for EV Milk LLC, with a proposed business name of Momofuku Milk Bar, 251 East 13th Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a café and bakery, serving food during all hours of operation, 2) its hours of operation will be from 9:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. all days, 3) it will maintain a closed fixed facade, 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and 4) its license will be used to include two (2) types of beer on its menu and other alcohol only for baking in its desserts and pastries. They are using alcohol other than beer in their desserts, but won't put it on the menu

19. One Mile House, 10-12 Delancey St (op)

VOTE: to deny the application for a full on-premise liquor license for One Mile House Inc., with a proposed business name of One Mile House, 10-12 Delancey Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a tavern restaurant serving a full menu which will include daily lunch service and serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 12:00 P.M. to 4:00 A.M. all days, 3) it will maintain a closed fixed facade, 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and not have DJs or live music, 5) it will operate its back yard with dining only for no more than eighteen (18) people and will completely close its backyard to customers and staff by 9:00 P.M. every night, 6) it will extend an awning over its backyard during its hours of operation, and 7) it will post its contact information in Chinese within its building for easy access by building residents. They agreed no bar or standing area in backyard, dining only

20. Family Recipe (Family Recipe Inc), 231 Eldridge St (wb),

VOTE: to deny the application for a beer wine license for Family Recipe Inc., with a proposed business name of Family Recipe, 231 Eldridge Street, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service Japanese restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 6:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Sundays through Thursdays and 6:00 P.M. to 1:00 A.M. Fridays and Saturdays with the allowance that its opening hours may be extended to include brunch service, 3) it will maintain a closed fixed facade, and 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music

21. Marry The Ketchup Inc, 95 1st Ave (wb)

- VOTE: to deny the application for a beer wine license for Marry The Ketchup Inc., 95 First Avenue,
 - unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service American seafood restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 12:00 P.M. to 12:00 A.M. Mondays through Wednesdays and 11:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Sundays, 3) it will close any façade doors or windows at 10:00 P.M. every night, and 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music
- 22. Wyndham Garden Hotel Chinatown (Wyndham Hotel Management Inc and 93 Bowery Holdings LLC), 93 Bowery (op)

This applicant withdrew. NO VOTE NECESSARY

23. 228 Rest Corp, 232 1st Ave (op)

This applicant withdrew. NO VOTE NECESSARY **24. 56 Burger Fondue LLC, 56 3rd Ave (op)** This applicant withdrew. NO VOTE NECESSARY

25. One East Broadway Restaurant (One East Broadway Restaurant Inc) 1 E B'way, 1st Fl (wb)

VOTE: to deny the application for a beer wine license for One East Broadway Restaurant Inc., doing business as One East Broadway Restaurant, 1 East Broadway, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulation that 1) it will operate as a full-service Chinese restaurant, serving food to within one (1) hour of closing, 2) its hours of operation will be from 11:00 A.M. to 10:30 P.M. Mondays through Fridays and 11:30 A.M. to 10:30 P.M. Saturdays and Sundays, 3) it will maintain a closed fixed facade, and 4) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music

(SLA & DCA Licensing Committee)

40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV (Excluding Items 7 & 12) MOTION PASSED Item 7: 26 YES 15 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED Item 12: 39 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED

Policy Meeting of the SLA & DCA Licensing

VOTE 1: David Crane moved to amend the SLA Committee Policy Review to restore the draft recommendations for "transfer licenses" that were presented at the December full board.

"I want to preface the specific language changes I am proposing by succinctly stating my intent---and that is to give the Board a clear choice through a Yes or No vote whether the practice of automatic support for "transfer licenses" should be phased out---or whether automatic support for these transfers should be our permanent policy.

The language changes in the Policy Review document I am proposing are as follows:

First, read the sentence that starts on page 11 and continues on page 12. I move to strike the new phrases that were added to the top 2 lines on page 12:

"attached to the business location,"

"located at an address"

";" (a stray punctuation mark)

This would return this key sentence of the Transfer Policy Recommendations to read as follows:

It is our recommendation that the committee develops a

"grandfathered" policy whereas for any business that has been

established before this time, the transfer to the new applicant

will be allowed as long as they maintain the current

stipulations and operations...

The second language change I am proposing is in the Executive Summary, to strike the following language from the 3rd bullet on Page 4":

"attached to the business location not the licensee"

VOTE 2: To pass the SLA policies, as amended to include the amendment that the grandfather clause gets attached to the location and not licensee and as well as to include the definition of public benefit conscientious businesses as a stabilizing force. (The revised document –Revised SLA Policy Review—can be read at: <u>http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/html/home/home.shtml</u>)

(Policy Meeting of the SLA & DCA Licensing) VOTE 1: 36 YES 0 NO 3 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED VOTE 2: 37 YES 0 NO 3 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED

Arts & Cultural Affairs Task Force

- 1. Arts in Education Forum
- no vote necessary 2. Art in Empty Storefronts
- no vote necessary
- 3. Convocation of all Manhattan Arts Committee of Task Force chairs no vote necessary

Economic Development Committee

Orchard Street Market, 4/17-9/25, Orchard St (E Houston-Delancey Sts)

no vote necessary (withdrawn)

Land Use, Zoning, Public & Private Housing Committee

No vote necessary.

1. BSA 297-09-BZ: 180 Ludlow St, a time extension pursuant to vested right (time extension to proceed)

At its February monthly meeting, Community Board #3 passed the following motion:

Whereas the property at 180 Ludlow Street is already developed; and

Whereas the applicants have come before the Community Board on many occasions; so

Therefore be it resolved that

(1) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner, the selected hotel operator, CB3, and the Lower East Side Employment Network to ensure that (a) local residents receive priority in the employee selection process, (b) that employees be given a living wage commensurate with employees at other local hotels, and (c) that appropriate and effective job fair and job training opportunities be made available to prospective employees. Furthermore, the developer/owner and hotel operator agree that no fewer than 20% of the full and part-time employees in aggregate at any one time be qualified referrals from the Network.

- (2) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner and hotel operator that there be no nightclub in the hotel, with the definition of "nightclub" to be resolved by agreement between the developer/owner and hotel operator and CB3. A bar serving hotel patrons is acceptable under this provision.
- (3) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner and CB3 requiring that every effort be made to utilize local CB3 residents in the construction of the building as appropriate.
- (4) If the above three stipulations are met, CB3 supports the application BSA 297-09-BZ
- 2. BSA 307-08-BZY: 163 Orchard St, extend time to complete foundations for the construction of an 11-story transient hotel building

Whereas the foundations for the building are in place; and

Whereas the original permit was issued prior to the Lower East Side rezoning; so

Therefore be it resolved that

(1) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner, the selected hotel operator, CB3, and the Lower East Side Employment Network to ensure that (a) local residents receive priority in the employee selection process, (b) that employees be given a living wage commensurate with employees at other local hotels, and (c) that appropriate and effective job fair and job training opportunities be made available to prospective employees. Furthermore, the developer/owner and hotel operator agree that no fewer than 20% of the full and part-time employees in aggregate at any one time be qualified referrals from the Network.

- (2) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner and hotel operator that there be no nightclub in the hotel, with the definition of "nightclub" to be resolved by agreement between the developer/owner and hotel operator and CB3. A bar serving hotel patrons is acceptable under this provision.
- (3) There be signed stipulations between the developer/owner and CB3 requiring that every effort be made to utilize local CB3 residents in the construction of the building as appropriate.
- (4) If the above three stipulations are met, CB3 supports the application BSA 307-08-BZY

this went back to committee and we dealt with them again this month.

All the above items were not voted on, but were referred back to committee.

Human Services, Health, Disability, & Seniors Committee

No report.

 Dept of Aging presentation: overview of senior programs and priorities in CB3 no vote necessary

Youth & Education Committee

No report.

- Proposed co-location of Girls Preparatory Charter School with East Side Community School at 420-1 East 11th St
 - no vote necessary

Transportation & Public Safety Committee

David Crane: New taxi design should consider taxis that are accessible to all.

1. Transit Rider Bill of Rights (proposed Manhattan Borough Board Resolution)

VOTE: Transit Rider Bill of Rights

WHEREAS, the vast majority of New Yorkers have built their lives around the city's transit system, and

WHEREAS, with every bus and subway cut and every canceled line, the everyday experience of millions of New Yorkers changes for the worse, and

WHEREAS, with the decision of Albany lawmakers to cut \$160 million from the MTA, riders have faced the loss of 2 subway lines, 38 bus routes, cuts to service citywide and another fare hike in 2011,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, the Manhattan Borough Board believes that New York City's Transit Riding Public has the right to:

- Reliable travel throughout the five boroughs in an affordable and efficient manner by bus or by train.
- Fare hikes that are only enacted as a last resort when all other funding options have been exhausted, as well as stable funding for the MTA from the State and City, in good times and bad, that does not increase the current proportion of the budget borne by riders.
- Accurate real-time information and clear announcements about when trains and buses will arrive before swiping a MetroCard, or upon arrival at a bus stop.
- Well-lit and safe subway and bus facilities with MTA employees on hand to provide information and respond in case of emergency.
- Clean, regularly maintained MTA facilities including subway stations, subway cars, buses and bus stops.
- A more accessible transit system, with level boarding for buses and working elevators and escalators within all subway stations.
- Helpful, courteous service from station agents, bus drivers and other MTA employees to be matched by respect and courtesy from the riding public.
- The official prioritization of operating, maintaining and improving the existing train and bus network.
- Transparent and easily-used lines of communication between riders/MTA with mechanisms in place to address rider concerns and complaints.
- A minimum of one transit worker and one transit rider as voting members of the MTA Board of Directors.
- 2. Update on long distance bus permitting effort

VOTE: CB3 appreciates that Speaker Silver and Senator Squadron have introduced legislation (S. 2977 and A. 4578) to address the growing intercity bus industry. CB3 supports this proposal, which will help give clear guidance to legitimate intercity bus companies and improve the health, safety and welfare of the public and neighborhood residents. The proposal would authorize New York City to pass a local law to regulate intercity passenger bus service through a permit system.

(Transportation & Public Safety Committee) 40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Environment Committee

no meeting scheduled

Con Edison Task Force

The committee passed two motions. The next funding round will seek proposals for projects that directly affect health and the environment. The next deadline is April 15.

1. Review funding guidelines

VOTE: WHEREAS the majority of Con Edison Settlement Fund projects funded to date have not directly and primarily funded air quality, health and/or quality of life improvements for residents living near the Con Ed plant, but have funded educational, outreach and/or research projects in which the other benefits were secondary and diffuse; and

WHEREAS the projects funded have been valuable, air quality, health and quality of life improvements were the focal points of the Settlement Fund stipulations; therefore RESOLVED: the "Guidelines to Submit Proposals for Community Board 3 Consolidated Edison Settlement Funds" will be amended to add the following bullet point to the section labeled "What are we looking for:"

- For the 2011 funding cycle, CB3 is seeking proposals that primarily seek to ameliorate air quality, health and/or quality of life problems in the vicinity of the Con Ed plant. Proposals that are primarily educational, research or outreach in nature are not being sought.
- 2. Establish schedule for next application and proposal review cycle
- **VOTE**: RESOLVED: The next funding cycle for Con Ed Settlement Fund proposals shall be added to the funding guidelines published on the CB3 website and shall be as follows: (1) applications due to CB3 office on Friday, April 15, 2011; (2) preliminary review will take place at May Task Force meeting; (3) final review and vote on any resolutions for full Board action will take place at June Task Force meeting; and (4) full CB3 vote on resolutions, if any, is anticipated for July 2011 full board meeting.

(Con Edison Task Force) 40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Parks, Recreation, Cultural Affairs, Landmarks, & Waterfront Committee

No report.

1. The Friends of Gulick Park: community ideas and desires for Gulick Park and plans for a community-based design charrette

no vote necessary

Block Party Application

- 2. La Guardia Houses Farmers Market, 4/11-11/18, Madison St (Clinton-Rutgers Sts) no vote necessary
- 3. Festival of Ideas for New City's StreetFest, 5/7, Bowery (E Houston-Spring Sts) & Stanton St (Bowery-Chrystie Sts) & Rivington St (Bowery-Chrystie Sts)

VOTE: To approve the block party application of Festival of Ideas for New City's StreetFest for 5/7 at Bowery (E Houston-Spring Sts) & Stanton St (Bowery-Chrystie Sts) & Rivington St (Bowery-Chrystie Sts).

- 25th Anniversary of the Lower East Side People's Federal Credit Union, 5/7, E 3rd St (Aves B-C)
 VOTE: To approve the block party application of 25th Anniversary of the Lower East Side People's Federal Credit Union for 5/7 at E 3rd St (Aves B-C).
- 5. Oldtimers Stickball, 5/7, 6/11, 7/16, 8/13, 9/3, Rutgers St (Madison-Cherry St) no vote necessary
- 6. Annual Children's Day Block Party, 6/5, Henry St (Pike-Rutgers Sts) no vote necessary
- Festival of Young Artists, 6/11, E 4th St (2nd Ave-Bowery)
 VOTE: To approve the block party application of Festival of Young Artists for 6/11 at E 4th St (2nd Ave-Bowery).
- 8. Chinatown Holiday Caroling Festival, 12/23, Mott St (Pell-Bayard Sts) no vote necessary

(Parks, Recreation, Cultural Affairs, Landmarks, & Waterfront Committee) 40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

The board voted on everything except the SLA transfer policy, SLA # 7, and the Executive Committee's motion on housing regulations.

Wielinders Fresent at	Lust vote.				
David Adams	[P]	Rabbi Y. S. Ginzberg	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]
Julia Andino	[P]	Gloria Goldenberg	[P]	Meghan Joye	[P]
Jimmy Cheng	[P]	Jan Hanvik	[P]	Joel Kaplan	[P]
David Crane	[P]	Herman F. Hewitt	[P]	Carol Kostik	[P]
Andrea Diaz	[A]	Simon Huang	[P]	John Leo	[P]
Harvey Epstein	[A]	Bonnie Hulkower	[P]	Ricky Leung	[P]
Morris Faitelewicz	[P]	Carolyn Jeffers	[P]	Sam Leung	[P]
Flora Ferng	[P]	Anne K. Johnson	[P]	Gigi Li	[P]
Beth From	[P]	Linda Jones	[P]	Bernard Marti	[P]

Members Present at Last Vote:

Bernice McCallum	[P]	Barden Prisant	[P]	Nancy Sparrow-Bartow [P]	
David McWater	[A]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[P]	Mary Spink	[P]
Alexandra Militano	[P]	Joyce Ravitz	[P]	Elinor Tatum	[P]
Maria Muentes	[A]	Lois M. Regan	[P]	Rodney Washington	[A]
Chiun Ng	[P]	Janet Riesel	[P]	Samuel Wilkenfeld	[A]
Ariel Palitz	[P]	Richard F. Ropiak	[P]	Justin Yu	[P]
Thomas Parker	[P]	Susan Scheer	[P]	Thomas Yu	[A]
Dominic Pisciotta	[A]	David Silversmith	[A]		

Meeting Adjourned 9:40 PM.