



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 3
59 East 4th Street - New York, NY 10003
Phone (212) 533-5300
www.cb3manhattan.org - info@cb3manhattan.org

Alysha Lewis-Coleman, Board Chair

Susan Stetzer, District Manager

District Needs Statement for Fiscal Year 2020

Introduction

Community Board 3 Manhattan (CB 3) spans the East Village, Lower East Side, and part of Chinatown. It is bounded by 14th Street to the north, the East River to the east, the Brooklyn Bridge to the south, and Fourth Avenue and the Bowery to the west, extending to Baxter and Pearl Streets south of Canal Street. This community is filled with a diversity of cultures, religions, incomes, and languages. Its character comes from its heritage as a historic and present day first stop for many immigrants. Community District 3 (CD 3) is one of the largest board districts and one of the most densely populated in New York City, with approximately 164,063 residents. Our residents are very proud of their historic and diverse neighborhood, however, the very characteristics that make this district unique also make it a challenging place to plan and ensure services for all residents and businesses.

A Changing District

CD 3 is changing in many ways, and a number of those changes have exacerbated existing challenges as well presented new ones. Income disparity in CD 3 continues to increase annually, and CD 3 now has the second highest gap between the lowest- and highest-income households out of all districts in New York City.¹ Luxury housing continues to be proposed in the district although many people within our community continue to live on the edge of homelessness and economic survival. An estimated 26% of residents in CD 3, as well as approximately 36% of children under the age of 18 and 34% of seniors, are living below poverty level.²

This income inequality is tied to the escalating rate of gentrification in the district. When we look at gentrification indicators, we see rising incomes, changing racial composition, shifting commercial activity, and displacement of original residents. Median asking rents in CD 3 have increased by 20% since 2010, while incomes have largely stagnated.³ At the same time rent regulated units continue to be lost in the area.⁴ Since 2010, the percentage of Asian residents in

¹ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

² U.S. Census Bureau. American Community Survey 2012-2016.

³ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

⁴ NYC HPD. (2018). *Selected Initial Findings of the 2017 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey*. <<http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/hpd/downloads/pdf/about/2017-hvs-initial-findings.pdf>>

the district has decreased by more than 4%⁵ and families throughout the district have been displaced from their homes because they cannot afford increasing rents.

Proposals are in the pipeline for more than 3,000 units of new market-rate housing in the district, and an ever-growing number of bars, restaurants, and hotels continue to proliferate as other small businesses and arts organizations struggle to remain in place. All of this puts strain on the already overburdened and aging transportation infrastructure in the area, effecting system performance as well as increasing congestion and jeopardizing the safety of our streets and sidewalks

The transformation of the district from one with significant retail diversity to an increasingly nightlife- and hotel-oriented district has resulted in a sustained loss of independent businesses, and an increasingly challenging commercial real estate and small business environment. This has resulted in a staggering amount of quality of life concerns and complaints throughout the area, and impacts small businesses, residents, and the large number of artists, arts organizations, and cultural organizations that are so meaningful to the community. Community-based organizations that provide essential services for residents continue to struggle to provide more services and fund themselves with fewer resources, while healthcare and social service providers face similar challenges and the community is left to grapple with service reductions.

These changes are happening in the context of a coastal community still recovering from Superstorm Sandy in 2012 and the area is increasingly vulnerable to broad climate change impacts as well as acute extreme weather scenarios that effect the waterfront. The maintenance and viability of the many beloved and essential parks in the district remains a challenge, and their role as a crucial community resource only grows in the face of these environmental issues.

Preventing the displacement of long-time residents and commercial tenants is a community priority. CB 3 has worked to maintain the livability of the area and improve quality of life for community members, focusing on the retention of its affordable housing stock and local businesses, its community-based organizations and arts institutions, and protecting the many community assets that may be threatened in the future, while also meeting the diverse and varied needs of newcomers as the neighborhood changes.

Housing and Land Use

Significant governmental action is necessary to curb the alarming change in the community's profile from a diverse and historically important immigrant community— where modern public housing was born and low-income people from every corner of the world were able to gain a foothold— to a neighborhood that is increasingly unaffordable and socially stratified.

- In 2017, Community District 3 (CD 3) had the second highest income disparity— the gap between our lowest income and highest income residents—in New York City.⁶

⁵ U.S. Census Bureau. American Community Survey 2012-2016.

⁶ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

- Median asking rents in CD 3 increased by 20% between 2010 and 2017, while growing by only 4% across the rest of the city.⁷
- Between 2010 and 2016, median renter income in CD 3 decreased by 6.8%.⁸
- CD 3 saw a 15% increase in the poverty rate between 2010 and 2016, while citywide poverty rates decreased over the same period.⁹
- Since 2010, the number of severely rent-burdened households in CD 3 increased by 6% while remaining stable throughout New York City as a whole.¹⁰
- Thirty-six percent of low-income renter households in CD 3 are spending upwards of half their monthly income on housing.¹¹
- The Association for Neighborhood & Housing Development (ANHD) ranks CD 3 as having the second-highest risk factor for the loss of affordable housing and residential displacement amongst Manhattan Community Districts.¹²

Without action, the crisis of affordability and growing inequality in CD 3 will worsen due to:

- The expected completion of 1,300 confirmed new luxury units at One Manhattan Square¹³ and Essex Crossing¹⁴ and the proposal for 2,775 new residential units to be built in the Two Bridges Large Scale Residential Development (LSRD)¹⁵;
- The proposed federal cut-backs in subsidized housing and rent vouchers¹⁶, as well as rent increases for New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) developments¹⁷; and
- The continued loss of rent regulated apartments through vacancy decontrol, the expiration of project-based Section 8 housing vouchers, and the termination of affordable regulatory agreements (such as Mitchell-Lama) due to the growing pressure on residents to buy out of these programs.

CB 3 calls for all of the following actions to slow the growth of gentrification, limit residential displacement, and ensure that long-term residents can remain in decent affordable housing in the district:

- 1) Increase the Stock of Subsidized Affordable Housing
- 2) Preserve the Affordability of Existing Mitchell-Lama and HDHC Buildings

⁷ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

⁸ NYU Furman Center's CoreData.nyc. (2018).

⁹ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² ANHD. (2018). *How is Affordable Housing Threatened In Your Neighborhood?* <https://anhd.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/2018-Risk-Chart_FINAL.pdf>

¹³ Warkerkar, Tanay. Curbed New York. (2018). "Extell's One Manhattan Square Has Some Stunning NYC Views." <<https://ny.curbed.com/2017/10/4/16412494/lower-east-side-one-manhattan-square-views>>

¹⁴ Essex Crossing. <https://essexcrossingnyc.com/media/Essex_Crossing_FAQs_and_FST_Guide_English.pdf>

¹⁵ Two Bridges EIS. <<http://www.twobridgeseis.com/>>

¹⁶ U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. (2017). *Trump Administration Proposes 2018 HUD Budget*. <https://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/press/press_releases_media_advisories/2017/HUDNo_17-041>.

¹⁷ NYCHA. (2018). "Secretary Carson's Proposed Rent Reform for Low-Income New Yorkers." <<http://www1.nyc.gov/site/nycha/about/press/pr-2018/proposed-rent-increase-2018.page>>

- 3) Reverse the Trend of Deregulating Rent Controlled and Stabilized Apartments
- 4) Upgrade Enforcement of Housing and Building Codes
- 5) Provide Adequate Funding to Community-Based Organizations That Provide Legal Services and Anti-Displacement Support for Residents
- 6) Partner with Community Land Trusts and Not-for-Profit Housing Providers
- 7) Support Environmental Resiliency in Housing
- 8) Increase Funding for Supportive Housing for Individuals Living with HIV/AIDS
- 9) Maintain the Viability of New York City Housing Authority Properties and Monitor New Programs
- 10) Ensure a Unit-Type Mix That is Appropriate for CD 3 Residents

Increase the Stock of the Subsidized Affordable Housing

Over the last decade there has been a dramatic reduction in funding available for the construction and renovation of affordable housing. The current Administration in Washington has proposed a HUD budget that will drastically cut most federal contributions to affordable housing.¹⁸ CD 3 was once a prime beneficiary of subsidized low-and moderate-income housing but the rate of this production has slowed, despite the planned 500 units of affordable housing in the Seward Park Urban Renewal Area (SPURA). In fact, many former SPURA site tenants did not meet the income requirements of the new housing.

The majority of affordable housing being built in the district is attached to proportionally larger amounts of new market-rate housing, and most of these “affordable” units do not meet the needs of the low-income residents and seniors living on fixed incomes. Of the nearly 800 units of affordable housing financed by HPD in CD 3 between 2014 and 2018,¹⁹ over 35 percent were targeted at households earning up to \$75,120 per year, despite the median household income in the district being just \$42,014.²⁰

There is also a mismatch between the large numbers of people applying for affordable housing and the limited supply of affordable housing units available in CD 3. In one example, Essex Crossing Site 5 received over 2,000 applications for just 104 available units in 2017.²¹

In light of this situation, CB 3 calls on the City to increase the stock of the subsidized affordable housing in the district by:

- Concentrating financing for the construction of new low-income multi-family housing at affordability levels appropriate for current neighborhood incomes

¹⁸ U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. (2017). *Trump Administration Proposes 2018 HUD Budget*. <https://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/press/press_releases_media_advisories/2017/HUDNo_17-041>.

¹⁹ NYC HPD. (2018). “*Housing New York Units by Building*.” <<http://hpd.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=192d198f84e04b8896e6b9cad8760f22>>.

²⁰ NYU Furman Center’s CoreData.nyc. (2018). *Median Household Income. 2012-2016 American Community Survey*.

²¹ Hobbs, Allegra. DNA Info. (2017). “*Thousands Line Up to Apply for Essex Crossing Affordable Housing*.” <https://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/20170430/chinatown/thousands-line-up-for-affordable-housing-help-essex-crossing-aafe/>

through HPD’s Extremely Low & Low-Income Affordability (ELLA) program.

- Requiring any development receiving city-subsidy and/or being constructed on city-owned land to adhere, at minimum, to the affordability and set-aside requirements outlined in Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) Option 1.²²
- Identifying any illegal Single Room Occupancy (SRO) units and converting them into legal and permanently affordable micro-housing units.
- Increasing funding for the construction of new supportive housing and affordable senior housing through the concentration of HPD Supportive Housing Loan Program (SHLP) and Senior Affordable Rental Apartments (SARA) financing in the district.

Preserve the Affordability of Existing Mitchell-Lama and HDFC Buildings

CD 3 has historically been a neighborhood where affordable housing has been welcomed and supported by government, community organizations, and local residents. The district is home to 25 NYCHA complexes, six Mitchell-Lama developments, a large concentration of small limited equity cooperatives—also known as Housing Development Fund Cooperatives (HDFCs), and the largest residential community land trust (CLT) in New York City.

Because of escalating operating costs, the lack of affordable refinancing options, and the intense pressure from gentrification induced property value escalation, both Mitchell-Lama and HDFC cooperative apartments are now being converted to market-rate housing or being lost to foreclosure at an alarming rate.²³

The City must take strong action to avert these trends in order to assure that these important affordable housing resources survive in CD 3, including:

- Expanding outreach and extending additional financing via HDC’s Mitchell-Lama Reinvestment program to the remaining Mitchell-Lama’s in CD 3 to ensure their long-term affordability.
- Tightening the existing rules regarding conversion of Mitchell-Lama’s and HDFCs to discourage privatization and the loss of long-term affordability requirements.
- Having HPD commit to stronger and clearer resale restrictions including sales price caps on HDFCs to ensure their long-term deep affordability, and develop new regulatory agreements that provide long-term tax abatements to the HDFCs.

Reverse the Trend of Deregulating Rent Controlled and Stabilized Apartments

In 2017, there was estimated to be 988,193 rent stabilized and rent controlled units remaining in New York City, down from 1,025,214 in 2011.²⁴ That is a loss of over 37,000 units. The

²² NYC HPD. (2018). *Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) Fact Sheet*.
<<http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/housing/downloads/pdf/mih-fact-sheet.pdf>>

²³ Savitch-Lew, Abigail. City Limits. (2016). “*Tough Fight to Keep Mitchell-Lamas from Going Private.*”
<<https://citylimits.org/2016/05/10/tough-fight-to-keep-mitchell-lamas-from-going-private/>>

²⁴ NYC HPD. (2018). *Selected Initial Findings of the 2017 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey*.
<<http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/hpd/downloads/pdf/about/2017-hvs-initial-findings.pdf>>

continued loss of this housing stock has a profound effect on our community. While some rent regulated units lose their status legally, the immense pressure to vacate and deregulate units in gentrifying neighborhoods like CD 3 has encouraged tenant harassment and the manipulation of the major capital improvements/individual apartment improvements rules. This threatens both the quality of life and safety of residents in rent regulated units, as well as the overall affordability of the district. Therefore, CB 3 calls on the City to:

- Include CD 3 in the recently approved Certification of New Harassment (CONH) pilot program, as CD 3 is at higher risk for the loss of affordable housing than all participating Manhattan community districts.²⁵
- Increase funding for and expand the efforts of the Mayor's Public Engagement Unit's Rent Freeze Team efforts to encourage full participation of eligible residents in the Senior Citizen (SCRIE) and Disability Rent Increase Exemption (DRIE) programs.
- Enhance existing property tax benefits and develop new incentives for private landlords to keep units under rent control/stabilization and offset the overwhelming pressure from the market to deregulate.
- Encourage the Rent Guidelines Board to reinstate the rent freeze.
- Advocate for the repeal of vacancy decontrol in New York State.

Upgrade Enforcement of Housing and Building Codes

Between 2010 and 2017, nearly 2,800 new housing units were constructed in CD 3²⁶, and large-scale construction projects ranging from One Manhattan Square, Essex Crossing, NextGen NYCHA infill at LaGuardia Houses, and proposed development in the Two Bridges LSRD will add several thousand more units to the neighborhood in the coming years. In addition, serious housing code violations in the district have increased by over 30 percent in the past year²⁷ and federal cutbacks in Community Development Block Grant funding, which has long been used to support HPD and DOB building inspection and code enforcement, will diminish essential services that are necessary to maintain the primarily older existing housing stock in the district. Both the large scale and increasing frequency of this new construction, plus the ongoing maintenance needs of the existing housing stock, necessitates the full utilization of all available governmental monitoring and enforcement tools to assure that existing housing is maintained adequately, and that new development does not threaten the safety and quality of life of current residents or force any existing tenants from their homes. Therefore, CB 3 asks that:

- HPD and DOB vigorously enforce the Housing, Building and Zoning Codes in CD 3, particularly during periods of unprecedented large-scale development in the neighborhood
- HPD ensure that residential structures are adequately maintained and safety standards are met at all times, and that threats to children's health from asthma triggers, lead, and vermin are eradicated.

²⁵ ANHD. (2018). *How is Affordable Housing Threatened In Your Neighborhood?* <https://anhd.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/2018-Risk-Chart_FINAL.pdf>

²⁶ Furman Center CoreData.nyc. (2018). *Units Authorized by New Residential Building Permits. New York City Department of Buildings.*

²⁷ Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017.* <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

- DOB ensure that buildings are not overdeveloped beyond the legal limits and that fire safety regulations are not side-stepped when additions are built on occupied tenement buildings.
- The City follow up on Environmental Control Board (ECB) and DOB violations to ensure that all violations, including those overseen by the ECB, are corrected and the fines are not merely absorbed by developers as part of their cost of doing business.
- As the recently approved Stand for Tenant Safety legislative package is rolled out, further investment be made in monitoring and compliance to ensure that the new laws are effective in curbing tenant harassment and protecting residents' safety. This includes funding additional staff and training at DOB, HPD, DOH, and 311 to ensure proper enforcement and effectiveness of the legislation.
- Stronger legislation be enacted to address disruptive renovation in occupied buildings, which is often used in tandem with buyout offers and harassment aimed at making tenants leave rather than suffer through a disruption of essential services and unsafe and unhealthy conditions.

Provide Adequate Funding to Community-Based Organizations That Provide Legal Services and Anti-Displacement Support for Residents

Several organizations in CD 3 provide essential services to tenants who are dealing with the termination of basic services, egregious building code violations, and frivolous evictions as development pressure in the neighborhood continues to grow. Without the work of these community-based organizations, harassment of rent-regulated tenants would go largely unchecked and the threat of residential displacement would increase throughout the district. While CD 3 supports the City's initiative to provide free legal services for tenants brought to housing court, we ask that in addition, the City:

- Increase funding for community-based organizations in CD 3 that provide the first line of defense to prevent evictions with "Know Your Rights campaigns" and offer direct support and technical assistance to local tenant associations. Legal service groups such as Urban Justice Center and Manhattan Legal Services will only work with organized tenant groups, many of which are brought to them by housing groups in CD 3 such as Cooper Square Committee, CAAAV, GOLES and AAFE. A modest investment in the staffing capacity of these groups would have a large payoff in terms of preserving affordable housing and protecting tenants.

Partner With Community Land Trusts and Not-for-Profit Housing Providers

Community Land Trusts (CLTs) are increasingly recognized by affordable housing policy makers as an effective mechanism for permanently preserving affordable housing. In CD 3, the Cooper Square Community Land Trust, formed in 1994, is an example of the potential of this unique model. The Cooper Square CLT owns the land under the Cooper Square Mutual Housing Association's 21 cooperative buildings, containing 328 housing units and 22 storefronts. The community land trust separates the ownership of land from the housing and retail on top of it and ensures that the properties are not resold at a profit through 99-year affordable ground leases with the Cooper Square Mutual Housing Association, ultimately limiting speculation on the value of the property.

There has been encouraging movement by the City towards incorporating CLTs into its affordable housing plans in response to strong community interest in this model. CB 3 supports these initiatives and calls on the City to do the following:

- Continue to fund organizations interested in exploring the CLT model, both in the formation and capacity building stage, and those in the expansion stage.
- Issue request for proposals that require the formation of CLTs when dispensing city-owned land and city-owned buildings in CD 3, and have HPD require partnership agreements between affordable housing developers and CLTs in their financing terms.
- Re-establish the previously existing DAMP/MHA Program to support both rental and non-profit cooperative ownership and facilitate CLT formation around buildings the City has foreclosed on.
- Provide for adequate capital funding streams and offer expanded tax incentives to qualified, responsible CLTs and not-for-profit housing organizations that provide housing for families at or below 30% of AMI and maintain permanent resale restrictions and regulatory agreements.

Support Environmental Resiliency in Housing

In CD 3, over 19,000 dwelling units are located within the 2015 FEMA-identified floodplain—and over 27,000 units are located within the 2050 floodplain²⁸. Because of this acute risk and the large concentration of publicly subsidized and not-for-profit affordable housing in the district, there is a need to pioneer environmentally green retrofitting and resiliency practices in CD 3. These interventions can be both environmentally beneficial and cost-effective for property owners. The City needs to provide greater incentives to low- and moderate-income housing providers to take proactive steps to become environmentally resilient, including:

- Having HPD fund a significant resiliency program that would allow community organizations and housing groups to train low-income housing providers and HDFC co-op boards on strategies to make their buildings more resilient.
- Conducting energy audits to identify candidates for retrofits that reduce waste in lighting, heating, ventilation, and air conditioning systems.
- Providing capital funding and tax incentives to replace older HVAC systems in affordable housing and all publically-owned properties.
- Increasing funding for the Green Housing Preservation Loan Program (GHPLP) that assists low-income housing providers in reducing energy costs, which accounts for 25% of operating costs of residential buildings.
- Funding the expansion of outreach and education among low-income housing providers and HDFC co-op boards about loan and tax abatement opportunities for green infrastructure upgrades.
- Requiring the elevation of boilers in basements or relocation of boilers to the roof, the relocation of electrical circuit panels, gas and electric meters to higher elevations, and the dry flood proofing of basements in HPD loan programs that support the upgrading

²⁸ NYC Department of City Planning. *Manhattan CD 3 Community Profile*. <<https://communityprofiles.planning.nyc.gov/manhattan/3>>.

or replacing of HVAC and electrical systems.

Increase Funding for Supportive Housing for Individuals Living with HIV/AIDS

In 2016, the HIV/AIDS Services Administration (HASA) program expanded its supportive housing initiatives. Now, all New York City residents with HIV or AIDS who meet financial need requirements are eligible for the HASA supportive housing program. This eligibility expansion guarantees a rental subsidy to low-income people living with HIV regardless of whether they are HIV-positive or have an AIDS diagnosis, and has a significant impact on addressing the number of HIV-positive people who are homeless.

- CB 3 calls on the New York City Human Resources Administration (HRA) to increase funding for the HASA supportive housing program in order to address needs within the community district.

Maintain Viability of New York City Housing Authority Properties and Monitor New Programs

The New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) owns and manages over 14,000 units of low-income housing in CD 3 and the preservation of these apartments as viable, secure, publicly-owned housing is vital to ensure that our community remains diverse and economically integrated.

Changes in agency leadership, new federal monitoring, uncertain funding from HUD, and proposals for increasing public-private partnerships through NextGen NYCHA and the Rental Assistance Demonstration (RAD) program underscores the fragile condition of NYCHA funding in CD 3. The latest reports show \$31.8 billion of capital and repair needs over the next five years, double NYCHA's 2011 report of \$16 billion²⁹. Along with these staggering physical needs, residents also report ongoing safety concerns. Therefore, CB 3 requests:

- Additional Police Service Areas and improved lighting at NYCHA properties.
- The removal of administrative barriers to facilitate transfers and applications.
- Increased community engagement from the City with regard to the aforementioned new proposals, in order to understand how they would benefit public housing and public housing residents in our community district.

Ensure a Unit-Type Mix that is Appropriate for CD 3 Residents

CD 3 has seen an increasing trend of building conversions that divide existing apartments into smaller units to increase bedroom counts and cater toward single professionals. In some instances, these conversions have resulted in evictions. Additionally, demographics in CD 3 suggest a need for more intergenerational senior housing and unit types that support families. Therefore, CB 3 asks that:

²⁹ Sally Goldenberg. "At \$31.8B, NYCHA's unmet capital needs dwarf government allocations." *Politico*. (July 2018). <<https://www.politico.com/states/new-york/city-hall/story/2018/07/01/at-318b-nychas-unmet-capital-needs-dwarf-government-allocations-495925>>

- HPD prioritize a mix of unit types that better reflects the existing community’s housing needs when financing rehabilitation and new residential development in the district.

Landmarks

CD 3 is rich in buildings of historic, cultural, and architectural significance. The Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) should expedite designation of historic districts and individual landmarks in a community whose character is rapidly changing under the onslaught of new development.

Potential Historic Districts in need of full Commission consideration are:

- The Lower East Side Historic District north of Grand Street, south of Delancey Street, east of Essex Street and west of Forsyth Street (long under consideration)
- Extension of the East Village/Lower East Side Historic District
- Extension of the East 10th Street Historic District to include the area surrounding Tompkins Square
- A Chinatown Historic District
- Shtiebel Row (East Broadway between Clinton Street and Montgomery Street)
- Al Smith Historic District (St. James Place to Madison Street, James Street to Catherine Street)
- Bowery Historic District

Potential Individual Landmarks long on the CB 3 Landmarks Committee list include:

- James R. Whiting House (22 East Broadway)
- 206 Bowery House
- Congregation Chasam Sopher (8-10 Clinton Street)

In CD 3, emphasis also needs to be given to designation of buildings of historical and cultural significance, including buildings on the Bowery.

In addition, meticulous regulation of the currently designated Landmarks and Historic Districts requires strict application of the law, including that against “demolition by neglect.” For example:

- The recent loss of Beth Hamedrash Hagodol (60 Norfolk Street) to a devastating fire followed many years of neglect, leaving the building unoccupied and gradually collapsing.
- 605 East 9th Street, PS 64 (aka CHARAS/El Bohio) has been neglected and intentionally damaged by the owner (removal of white stone facing on the East 10th Street side of the building and failure to properly protect exposed brickwork on dormers and façade where stonework removed).

Given the onerous deadlines between calendaring and designation imposed upon LPC, CB 3 requests that LPC be given an increased budget and additional staff in order to handle both the proposed designations described above and the regulatory workload, which increases as each new Landmark or Historic District is designated.

Transportation

Accessibility and Safety

Accessibility and pedestrian safety are a CB 3 priority, especially with more than 8.5% of residents in the area reporting ambulatory difficulty.³⁰ Therefore, CB 3 asks for:

- Improved accessibility of bus stops, which is necessary for seniors and people with disabilities. There are complaints to the community board and observations of bus stops being used as loading zones, which render the stops inaccessible for those in wheelchairs and walkers.
- Adequate staffing of traffic enforcement to monitor noncompliant use of bus stops.
- All bus stops to have benches, particularly to accommodate seniors and people with ambulatory disabilities, and shelters where possible. The DOT franchise division should audit stops and implement complete installation of benches.³¹
- Pedestrian safety improvements and traffic calming measures at several wide corridors with high traffic volumes, including Essex Street, Canal Street, and East Houston Street. As can be seen in the Vision Zero interactive crash map, these corridors have significant numbers of traffic crashes involving injuries to pedestrians.³² These corridors and some of their intersections were identified as priorities in DOT's 2015 Manhattan Pedestrian Safety Action Plan.³³

Curbside Management

Local businesses need adequate loading/unloading zones for commercial delivery. Curbside parking regulations need to balance competing demands of pedestrians, businesses, and motorists. Lack of loading zones make it impossible for businesses to comply with rules, therefore:

- Commercial delivery needs must be considered by DOT when assigning on-street bus stop locations through the intercity bus permit system. Existing truck loading zones should not be eliminated if this threatens continued operation of existing businesses.

Deliveries to residences has grown exponentially because of online purchasing, but there has been no planning to mitigate this. We are seeing narrow streets blocked by second lane

³⁰ U.S. Census Bureau. American Community Survey 2012-2016.

³¹ Rich, M. (2015). Community Accessibility Study for Seniors and People with Mobility Disabilities. <<http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/fellowship/Community%20Accessibility%20Study%20for%20Seniors%20and%20People%20with%20Mobility%20Disabilities.pdf>>

³² Vision Zero View. (2017). Traffic Crashes. <<https://www.nycvzv.info/>>

³³ Viola, R, Hostetter, S, Riscica, V, Kay, A, and Peck, H. Manhattan Pedestrian Safety Action Plan. New York City Department of Transportation, January 2015.

unloading, sidewalks and access to businesses blocked by cartons from major online vendors such as Amazon, and a lack of available space for unloading. Ticketing for double-parking is not a productive use of NYPD resources and is not an adequate deterrent, therefore:

- DOT needs to work with communities and other agencies such as police and MTA to develop a plan to allow traffic to move and access to sidewalks as online vendor deliveries grow.

Bus Management

The intercity bus permit system has not been effective because there is not a means to enforce compliance and collect violations. There are frequent complaints of intercity buses laying over and picking up and discharging passengers illegally in MTA bus stops. This results in buses not being able to discharge and pick up passengers at the curb. Disabled passengers are therefore unable to board or disembark. CB 3 has received many complaints that bus companies illegally loading and unloading interferes with businesses at the location. This is generally because of large crowds blocking sidewalks and entrances to businesses and sidewalk cafes. Most of the buses are registered in other states. It appears that bus companies have realized there is not effective enforcement and stopped applying for permitted stops. The City and State have been meeting to resolve this issue and are currently looking at amended legislation. CB 3 asks:

- Full staffing of traffic enforcement agents at a level that is necessary to enforce the types of violations that are within City jurisdiction.

Public Transportation

CD 3 is underserved by public transportation, though fewer than 9% of workers in the district use a car to commute to work.³⁴ Despite CD 3 being the third most densely populated community district in New York City, many residents are poorly served by the subway system and 11% live more than ½ mile from the nearest subway stop.³⁵ Therefore:

- There is a need for more east/west bus service south of 8th Street. The ease of East/West travel has been diminished by the elimination of the Grand Street Bus in the early 1980's and by the limited number of M14A buses.
- The City should take strong, creative measures in CD 3 to reduce traffic congestion, which contributes to a vicious cycle of reduced ridership and reduced service. The MTA/NYCT will reduce service after ridership on a bus route drops below a certain threshold. Service cuts have a severely negative impact on vulnerable populations, including the elderly and disabled, who rely on public transportation.

Rodents

CD 3 is the core rat reduction neighborhood in Manhattan. The program included \$32 million mostly going to city agencies and is funded for 5-years. Bulk school pickup has been implemented. NYCHA will be getting compactors and new cement pads to seal cellar spaces. Sanitation is doing additional pickups in CD 3. Since this rat reduction program has started, the

³⁴ Furman Center. (2018). State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017.

³⁵ Ibid.

rat indexing failure rate has declined from 8.7% to 7.6% and down from a 2016 high of 13.4% failure rate.³⁶

Environment

CD 3's overabundance of impervious land cover increases the effects of extreme heat, and exacerbates other environmental impacts by making it harder to manage stormwater, neutralize airborne and waterborne pollutants, and dampen light and noise pollution. The City and State need to prioritize programs that mitigate additional environmental impacts from heavy traffic and development burdens in CD 3, including:

- A green infrastructure build out of street trees, rain gardens, bioswales, park forestry, and blue and green roofs to manage our burden of airborne particulate material, polluted runoff, stormwater flooding, and light and noise pollution.
- The inclusion of CB 3 in future planning for the Mayor's new "Cool Neighborhoods NYC" program³⁷, which will "help mitigate the threat to public health from the urban heat island effect exacerbated during summer months."
- The City, DOT, and MTA should take steps to study and mitigate the noise, runoff, and exhaust from subways and vehicles using our bridges and other heavy traffic corridors.

Noise

Noise is the number one complaint in CD 3. In the past this was primarily commercial noise complaints from bars followed by after-hours construction noise. Residential noise from rooftop amenities has become a new source of noise complaints, especially in the new developments in the East Village. The 9th precinct community council meetings often see residents complaining year after year about these problems. Police sometimes have trouble gaining access and have limited recourse legally. This appears to be a new problem that must be addressed legislatively.

Economic Development/Business Diversity

There has been a sustained loss of independent "mom-and-pop" stores in CD 3 due to exponentially increasing costs of doing business and increased competition from chains, destination bars and restaurants.³⁸ As the local economy becomes more and more homogenous, and the availability of local goods and services continues to decrease, residents must increasingly leave our community or shop online in order to affordably meet their basic needs.

³⁶ NYC DOH. *Rat Index*. <<https://www1.nyc.gov/site/doh/data/health-tools/rat-maps-and-data-rat-indexing.page>>

³⁷ *Cool Neighborhoods NYC*. <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/orr/pdf/Cool_Neighborhoods_NYC_Report_FINAL.pdf>

³⁸ DeStefano, M. (2012). Preserving Retail Diversity in Community Board 3. <<http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/fellowship/Preserving%20Retail%20Diversity%20in%20Community%20Board%203.pdf>>.

Chain stores have altered the character of the Lower East Side by shifting purchasing power to mass-market retailers and constructing facades out of place with the rest of the community.³⁹

In 2017, ZIP code 10003 registered 162 chain stores, the second highest total in Manhattan.⁴⁰ Additionally, ZIP code 10009 has seen an 8% increase from 2015 to 2016 in the number of chain stores opened there, following a 20% increase the previous year.⁴¹ Retail stores that do survive in our community are threatened by rising costs of rents, utilities and taxes – identified as major challenges to small business survival in several CB 3-initiated surveys of local businesses. Property taxes have risen dramatically over the last nine years as well, and they are largely passed on to businesses by property owners creating a rent burden that the businesses cannot sustain, leading to a continued cycle of storefront vacancies, suppressed daytime foot traffic and nightlife business proliferation in the district. The effect of property taxes is also endangering Off- and Off-Off Broadway theaters, as smaller, local theaters are often not-for-profit and renting space.

Merchant Organizing and Opportunities for City Support

CD 3 is represented by the following Business Improvement Districts (BIDs):

- The Chinatown BID: Broome to Worth Street and from Allen to Rutgers;
- The LES Partnership: Orchard Street and currently seeking to expand to include a large section of the Lower East Side with Houston Street as its northern border;
- The Village Alliance: 8th Street and some surrounding blocks;
- The Union Square Partnership: 14th Street and the Union Square area; and
- East Village Independent Merchants Association (EVIMA): a newly formed merchant-led organization helping businesses and residents in the East Village.

Despite the presence of these organizations, many merchants are still under-supported in a substantial portion of the District. As our community continues to gentrify and remains burdened by a high cost of doing business, CB 3 has identified several ways that the City can help us grow and strengthen our local economy:

- Provide Support for Merchant Organizations – Continue financial support for our local community-based organizations and BIDs
- Consideration of a Special District – There is a need for a Special District in CD 3 that recognizes and preserves the historic and unique character of the neighborhood and uses a variety of zoning requirements to facilitate a diverse mix of affordable and appropriate retail and service providers that meets local needs, supports independently-owned businesses and levels the competitive field of operation.
- Disaster Response – The 2015 gas explosion tragedy on 2nd Avenue, in addition to

³⁹ East Village Community Coalition. (2015). Preserving Local, Independent Retail. <http://evccnyc.org/wpcontent/uploads/2015/06/2015_Preserving_LocalInd_Retail.pdf>.

⁴⁰ González-Rivera, C. (2017). State of the Chains. Center for an Urban Future. <https://nycfuture.org/pdf/CUF_State_of_the_Chains_2017.pdf>

⁴¹ Ibid.

Hurricane Irene and Superstorm Sandy before it, illustrated the need for well-developed disaster response plans for impacted businesses. SBS was incredibly helpful and responsive following this tragedy, but additional resources should be identified and set aside for future need. These should include a well-funded small business disaster fund, increased staffing at SBS, and the continued availability of low interest loans.

Parks/Recreation

CD 3, like most community districts in New York City, is underserved in terms of open space, with less than the City-recommended 2.5 acres of open space per 1000 residents.⁴²

- Citywide the median open space ratio is 1.5 acres per 1,000 residents⁴³ – CD 3 is slightly below that average at 1.2 acres per 1,000 residents.⁴⁴
- While 99% of residential units in CD 3 are located within ¼ mile of a park⁴⁵, not all parks are easily accessible or maintained at an acceptable level.
- Open space is not evenly distributed throughout the district, with the area west of Avenue A and Chinatown lacking adequate open space.

Parks Buildings

There are numerous Parks Department buildings in the district that are underutilized for the benefit of the community. These spaces are either completely closed or are used as store houses for citywide Parks operations. Our local park houses should not bear this disproportionate burden for other neighborhoods. These buildings would be better used as community facilities that could serve as neighborhood safe anchors thus increasing park safety.

- CD 3 has numerous "Park House" buildings and comfort stations that are not completely available for community use. We believe these buildings should be renovated and re-opened for community use. According to a 596 Acres Study⁴⁶ the following properties are under-utilized in the district:
 - Sara D. Roosevelt (SDR) Park: Stanton Building (Used by Parks workers; funds have been earmarked for bathroom reopening)
 - SDR Park: Hester St. Building (Used by Parks workers)
 - Allen Street Mall Comfort Station (Completely closed; RFPs for food vendor in progress, which would open bathrooms)

⁴² NYC Mayor's Office of Sustainability. (2016). City Environmental Quality Review. http://www.nyc.gov/html/oec/html/ceqr/open_space_maps_manhattan.shtml

⁴³ NYC Mayor's Office of Environmental Coordination. (2014). CEQR Open Space. http://www.nyc.gov/html/oec/downloads/pdf/2014_ceqr_tm/07_Open_Space_2014.pdf

⁴⁴ New Yorkers For Parks. *Open Space Index*. http://www.ny4p.org/client-uploads/pdf/OSI/NY4P_Open_Space_Index.pdf

⁴⁵ Furman Center. (2018). State of New York City's Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017. http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full.pdf

⁴⁶ Living Lots NYC. https://livinglotsnyc.org/media/files/LESmap_7.27.16_FINAL.pdf

- Seward Park "Park House" Building (Bathrooms are open, the rest of the space is closed to the community)
 - LaGuardia Houses Playground Building (Completely closed)
 - Corlears Hook Park Building (Building and bathrooms are completely closed)
 - Baruch Houses Bathhouse (Completely closed)
 - East River Park Building (Bathrooms are open; the rest of the building is closed to the community)
 - Tompkins Square Park Building (Bathrooms are open; the rest of the building is closed to the community)
- The Stanton Street Park House in SDR Park was a community center until the 1970s and must be returned to community use. Three out of four Parks buildings in SDR Park are used for citywide Parks maintenance or communication centers. This inequitable distribution of resources does not allow CD 3 to meet its needs for community space and programming, especially in this very densely used park straddling the Lower East Side and Chinatown.
 - The abandoned bathhouse in the LaGuardia Houses playground is not operational and reconstruction has been found to be not financially viable. This building should be demolished and use of the space should be returned to the community.

Comfort Stations

For the use of all in the community, comfort stations in CD 3 parks, recreational fields, playgrounds and park buildings with park programming are badly needed:

- All comfort stations must be opened, secured and maintained.
- Funding is still needed for comfort stations in parks throughout CD 3 including Baruch Playground, SDR Park, Columbus Park, Tompkins Square Park, and the East River Park.
- Underground water pipe access to the existing comfort station in East River Park must also be repaired to ensure reliable supply of water to the facility.

Recreational Use

The lack of park space is exacerbated by a lack of recreational sports fields. While CB 3 does not seek to exclude outside groups from our parks, the Board had taken the following positions:

- Priority access to recreational sports fields should be given to not-for-profit organizations serving the youth of CD 3.
- NYC Parks must revisit the policy of grandfathering sports field permits to certain organizations.
- Fields must be maintained to optimize use. This includes providing drainage so that fields can be used after rain and snow.

Rodents in Parks and Community Gardens

Department of Health rat indexing shows that CD 3 has one of the highest rat failure rates in the City. The implementation of the Neighborhood Rat Reduction program last year has started showing success in lowering the number of rat failures, and there has been a 1.1% decrease in the last year. However:

- Structural holes, overall disrepair, and lack of maintenance resulting in garbage overflow, especially in SDR Park, results in continuing rodent problems in the district that must be addressed.

Tompkins Square Park Events

Tompkins Square Park is the only park in NYC with a concert area in close proximity to residents. In FY 2018, there were a large number of noise complaints filed with 311 throughout the year in residences immediately adjacent to the park.⁴⁷

- There is a need for increased interagency coordination and planning on this issue, as well as appropriate staffing and decibel readings at the park.

Wireless Access

CD 3 residents would benefit greatly from free wireless access in all public parks, such as the networks currently available in Tompkins Square Park and Hamilton Fish Park, which allow all in the community to use their laptops and other devices in parks.

Maintenance

CB 3 members have routinely observed parks, playgrounds, plazas, greenstreets, and street trees with plantings not being properly and regularly maintained or mowed. Therefore CB 3 requests:

- Adequate staffing of Parks mobile maintenance staff.
- More frequent cleaning of playgrounds in parks, as well as standalone park playgrounds during the weekends and on summer weekdays, especially in all spray showers and water fountains, to maintain safety and sanitation.

Community Gardens

CD 3 has one of the highest concentrations of Greenthumb gardens in New York City and the densest distribution of gardens in the city.⁴⁸ It is essential our community gardens are protected. Currently gardens can still be sold as they are not legally Parks property. CB 3 supports:

- The creation of a new Special Purpose “Community Garden District” that would offer a measure of protection, as would a new protected NYC zoning designation of “Community Garden.”

Since all community gardens have the same maintenance and resource needs as public parks, CB 3 requests that:

⁴⁷ New York City 311 Service Requests. (2017). NYC Open Data. <<https://opendata.cityofnewyork.us/>>

⁴⁸ <<https://greenthumb.nycgovparks.org/gardensearch.html>>

- All gardens under NYC Parks jurisdiction receive funding through Greenthumb and be provided with adequate infrastructure, such as available water spigots, ongoing topsoil renewal, wrought iron fencing, and electricity/solar lighting where applicable.

Keeping the gardens well-lit is a public safety need. The increase in illicit drug use, as reported by area gardeners, makes garden lighting especially relevant. Therefore:

- For these safety reasons, an additional PEP Officer should be hired to specifically patrol the community gardens in CD 3.

Waterfront

Pier 42 has received funding for the first phase of rehabilitation, but at least \$50-60 million more is still needed.

- CB 3 strongly urges and expects that the relevant City agencies will raise the necessary funding, fast track, and complete this improvement and stabilization, so that Pier 42 will never be lost as a crucial amenity to this community.

New York City Libraries

A study conducted by the Center for an Urban Future found that across the city, although library visits, book circulation and program attendance have consistently increased in the past decade, our libraries are open fewer hours than the state's largest counties and trail behind cities throughout the nation.⁴⁹ CD 3 has five branches of the New York Public Library (NYPL) system: Chatham Square, Hamilton Fish, Ottendorfer, Seward Park, and Tompkins Square.⁵⁰ The branches in CD 3 have amongst the highest numbers of visits in the NYPL system visits during FY18:

Manhattan Community Board 3		
Branch	Visits	Program Attendance
Chatham Square Branch	261,909	44,215
Hamilton Fish Park Branch	151,309	16,687
Ottendorfer Branch	130,183	24,791
Seward Park Branch	293,177	64,675
Tompkins Square Branch	138,459	27,168
Totals	975,037	177,536

⁴⁹ Giles, D. (2015). Library Funding is Behind the Times. Center for an Urban Future. <<https://nycfuture.org/data/info/library-funding-is-behind-the-times>>

⁵⁰ New York Public Library. (2017). NYPL Statistics for Fiscal Year 2017 in Community Board 3

- The arts and cultural programming along with English for Speakers of Other Languages in CD 3 are extremely important to many residents, particularly families with children and seniors, who cannot otherwise afford access to commercial alternatives.
- In FY20 the three systems require significant capital and expense funding to support the needs of our branches in CD 3 and across the city.

Arts & Cultural Affairs

CD 3 has a large concentration of artists and arts organizations, large and small, professional and community-based, experimental and culturally specific. In CD 3, the arts serve as an important means of preservation and exploration of our exceptionally diverse community cultures, have a proven positive impact on the local economy, and have a direct impact on psychological and physical well-being of the residents of the neighborhood. Accessible arts and cultural programming are key elements for civic dialogue and empowerment of our most vulnerable populations.

In the face of intensifying gentrification and the growth of exclusive, private cultural amenities in the district, neighborhood art venues, libraries, community gardens and parks have continued to provide local, often low-cost, access to cultural programming, and CB 3 advocates for arts and culture to be integrated into all facets of city planning in the district. In light of this, CB 3 asks that:

- Per the recommendations of the CreateNYC Cultural Plan, the Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA) direct funding to organizations in CD 3 that promote and encourage diversity and inclusion in the cultural workforce, and to organizations that increase language access for communications and cultural programming to reach broader, more inclusive audiences, and programs which support the cultural life of low income communities and marginalized groups. In CD 3, this would include funding for Latinx and People of Color (POC) residents, artists, people with disabilities and cultural workers, with particular focus on those in Chinatown and Loisaida.
- The Department of Small Business Services (SBS) directly fund a program that subsidizes long-term leases for working artists, arts organizations and small arts businesses to ensure they are not negatively impacted by increasing and unsustainable commercial rents. This could include making financial incentives available to property owners who provide lower-cost rental space to arts and cultural organizations and to avoid vacant storefronts that can blight a block.
- The Department of City Planning (DCP) compel developers to fund public participation in the design process of publically-funded projects, and that the Department of Transportation (DOT) and the New York City Economic Development Corporation (EDC) continue funding public participation in project design.

- City Hall move forward with the 2017 stated interest in reacquiring the CHARAS/El Bohio non-profit community and cultural center.⁵¹ A restored CHARAS/El Bohio can serve as a much needed axis for a local web of organizations, stakeholders and leaders that reflect the values of the communities they serve.
- The Mayor’s Office of Media and Entertainment fund a neighborhood-level trilingual (English, Spanish, Chinese) data and communication platform for the many cultural spaces and projects located in our districts to share information on programs and learning opportunities, and DCLA contribute funding to local arts organizations for trilingual communications.
- DCLA, the Mayor’s Office of Recovery and Resiliency (ORR), and the New York City Emergency Management Department (OEM) fund arts and cultural organizations to directly participate in resiliency planning in CD 3, as outlined in the CreateNYC Cultural Plan.
- The City informs and consults with the CB 3 Arts and Culture Subcommittee regarding any and all new cultural/community spaces in publicly subsidized developments in the District.

Human Services

CD 3 is an economically and racially diverse district, therefore it is imperative that initiatives to address the human services needs discussed below are culturally and linguistically appropriate to effectively serve this district's residents.

Youth Services

CD 3 is home to more than 23,000 children under 18 years of age.⁵² Approximately 36% of the population under 18 years earns income below the poverty level and roughly 35% of family households with related children under 18 are living below the poverty line.⁵³ Over 30% of households in the district received public assistance or food stamps/SNAP.⁵⁴ 28.4% of households residing within CD 3 have a household income of \$20,000 or less.⁵⁵ Many of these families rely on community-based programs such as Beacon community centers during after-school hours and on weekends and holidays. Families and youth are in need of intervention services and support system programming. Community centers, afterschool programs, and employment opportunities are necessary to positively engage youth. Therefore, CB 3 requests the following:

⁵¹ Alonzo, Lever and Lincoln Anderson. “City is interested in reacquiring old P.S. 64, mayor tells town hall.” *The Villager*. (October 2017). <<http://thevillager.com/2017/10/13/city-interested-in-reacquiring-old-p-s-64-mayor-tells-town-hall/>>

⁵² U.S. Census Bureau. 2012-2016 American Community Survey.

⁵³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*

⁵⁵ NYU Furman Center. (2018). State of New York City’s Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017.

Ensure Stable and Consistent Access to COMPASS and SONYC Programming

COMPASS elementary school-level afterschool programs remain in high demand. Continuing expansion of funding for this program is needed. While approximately \$8 million was baselined in FY19, another \$7 million came from one-year City Council funding. SONYC Summer programs for middle school students are also funded on a year-to-year basis. The success of universal middle school COMPASS programming can be expanded by ensuring that all high quality elementary, middle, and high school programs operate on a stable and consistent basis. The 25% of CD 3 youth living below the poverty level⁵⁶ depend on consistent services and programs to succeed.

- Due to this need and the programs' successes, CB 3 recommends that these programs be baselined for FY20.

Increase Youth Employment & Job Training Opportunities

Older youth, especially at risk youth, need employment and job training opportunities offered by the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) and the Young Adult Internship Program (YAIP), which helps produce positive outcomes, such as higher lifetime earnings and higher high school attendance and graduation rates. While the number of SYEP jobs continues to increase, thousands of youth are still turned away because of insufficient number of slots. This year, the baseline level of funding was \$68.7 million for 70,000 jobs and 1-year funding of \$10.3 million was added to allow for 5,000 new slots and to cover the cost of the minimum wage increase that went into effect January 1, 2018, and 46% of applicants were accepted. The minimum wage will increase again in January 2019, therefore:

- This program should continue to receive baseline funding, be funded at its maximum level and take into account increased cost of participant salaries

Additionally, Work, Learn, Grow is a year-round youth employment program, currently funded on a one-year basis.

- This program should be expanded and baselined for consistent programming and to ensure contracting non-profits can adequately plan and staff to serve our youth.

Provide Services for Youth Aging Out of Foster Care

According to the Children's Aid Society, teens often exit the foster care system "without the knowledge, skills, experience, attitudes, habits and relationships that will enable them to be productive and connected members of society." In 2016, CD 3 was the third highest Community District of origin in Manhattan for foster care placements.⁵⁷ While the majority of placements in CD 3 are at or below age 5, 13% of CD 3's placements previously aged out of care.⁵⁸ Therefore:

- Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD) programs for these youth

⁵⁶ U.S. Census Bureau. 2012-2016 American Community Survey.

⁵⁷ New York City Administration for Children's Services. (2017). Child Welfare Indicators Annual Report 2016. < <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/acs/pdf/data-analysis/2017/AnnualReport2016.pdf>>

⁵⁸ 2013 ACS Community Snapshot Report.

must be maintained and expanded to help them make a successful transition from foster care to independence and adulthood.

Support LGBTQ, Runaway Homeless, and Adjudicated Youth Programs

Expansion of services that offer safe spaces for LGBTQ youth, like Project Speak Out Loud (Project S.O.L) is needed. DYCD programs for LGBTQ, runaway homeless youth and adjudicated youth should be maintained and expanded. Funding for organizations that provide these services in CD 3 such as Safe Horizon and the Door should be increased.

Cornerstone Programs

CD 3 currently has four Cornerstone Programs at NYCHA-based Community Centers. They provide engaging, high-quality, year-round programs for adults and young people that enhance skills and promote social interaction, community engagement, and physical activity. These four programs are run by Chinatown YMCA, Henry Street Settlement, University Settlement, and the Grand Street Settlement.

- The University Settlement program at Campos needs capital funding to be able to continue serving youth and their families.

Education

CD 3 is home to 40 public schools (28 in Community School District 1 (CSD1) and 12 in Community School District 2 (CSD2)). There are 28 elementary or middle schools, 8 high schools, 4 transfer schools. In addition to these schools, there are 5 charter schools. There are 15,184 students in these 40 schools. Demographically⁵⁹:

- 33% identify as Hispanic or Latino, 33.82% as Asian or Pacific Islander/Other, 16% as Black or African-American, and 16.6% as White.
- 40% live at or below the poverty level
- 12% are English Language Learners.
- 18% are students with disabilities.
- 15% live in temporary housing.
- Citywide, 8% of students are homeless at some point in the year. In CD 3, the average is 17%.
- 85% of homeless students with disabilities in CD 3 are identified late.
- In CSD1, homeless students are highly segregated into two schools – PS 188 and PS 15, where over 40% of the student population is homeless.

CB 3 has identified the following priority education issues: the needs of homeless students, especially those with special needs, and the need for a construction of a new school at Essex Crossing.

⁵⁹ NYC Department of Education. “School Quality Guide - Online Edition”.

Homeless Students

Homeless children in CD 3 require comprehensive coordination of services to reduce students learning loss as they change schools. We are requesting that:

- Service providers work together to ensure comprehensive support between NYCDOE Family Assistants, Shelters, DHS and outside agencies to prevent gaps in service and prevent duplications of intake and attendance.

Need for a New School

CD 3 is in need of a new public school facility, as exemplified by:

- 85% of CSD1 schools that share a building with one or more schools resulting in inadequate access to gym, arts and enrichment, science labs, and acceptable hours for school lunch. 16% of schools share a gym and/or yard space with three or more schools and almost ¼ of these schools share gym facilities between two schools. This lack of access is further exacerbated due to 35% of gym facilities being used for multiple purposes, creating “cafegymalobatoriums.”⁶⁰
- The NYC DOE mandates 120 minutes of physical education per week. Students in CD 3 do not have equal access to physical education and activity due to inadequate space.
- Inadequate, aging buildings that were not initially designed for today’s students. Middle and high school students often learn in classrooms designed for elementary school students.
- The lack of technology infrastructure in all of these aging buildings, which prevents CD 3 children from access to 21st Century College and Career Ready skills. With the advent of updated state testing moving to an online format, these aging buildings will limit student’s abilities to compete in this new online testing format.
- The need for families with multiple children to have a single drop off and will prevent hardship for working families and ensure students arrive at school safely and on time, which a new K-8 school on the western side of the district would allow for.

For students in our community to meet the goals of NYC DOE’s “Equity and Excellence for All” agenda,⁶¹ they must have adequate opportunities to move throughout their day and adequate access to technology. A new school facility will provide the students of CSD1 with a state-of-the-art building and provide existing schools with necessary use of space. In consultation with the New York City School Construction Authority (SCA), a parcel of City-owned land that can accommodate a footprint of 75,000 square feet (on Site 5 of Essex Crossing) has been reserved for a school until 2023.⁶²

- Given the rapid approach of the 2023 deadline, CB 3 urges DOE take advantage of this time-sensitive opportunity and fund construction of a new school in the 2019 five-year Capital Plan

⁶⁰ Community School District 1 Gym Survey <<https://cecd1.org/gym-survey/>>

⁶¹ <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/schools/equityandexcellence/default.htm>

⁶² Essex Crossing School Position Paper, Manhattan CB3, <[http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/planning/CB%203%20Essex%20Crossing%20School%20Position%20Paper%20\(FINAL%206.11.14\).pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/planning/CB%203%20Essex%20Crossing%20School%20Position%20Paper%20(FINAL%206.11.14).pdf)>

Health

Health Care Needs and Services

CD 3 is a federally designated health professional shortage area in the fields of primary care, dental care, and mental health.⁶³ CD 3 healthcare facilities, which include a vital network of community based health clinics, serve a disproportionately high number of uninsured and Medicaid patients. Healthcare providers and residents have expressed strong concern for the future over continued waning health services and financial support from local and state government.

- After suffering losses of hospital resources and nursing home/rehab beds, our community is in critical need of additional funding from the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to ensure services

CB 3 is also concerned about the changes taking place at Mount Sinai/Beth Israel. According to testimony heard from residents at the March 2018 *CB 3 Forum on Downsizing of Beth Israel*,⁶⁴ medical and hospital services need to be accessible, especially to our senior population and residents with mobility issues.

The Vital Role of Community Based Health Centers in Our Community

Thousands of CD 3 residents depend on community based health centers for their health care needs. The majority of patients served are either uninsured or on Medicaid or Medicare. These centers provide linguistically and culturally competent services. They have long standing relationships and strong roots within our community. Given the changes in hospital and medical services in CD 3, these centers will become more central to health care, and their sufficient funding and support is a priority.

⁶³Health Resources and Services Administration. (2017).

<<https://datawarehouse.hrsa.gov/Tools/MapTool.aspx?tl=HPSA>=State&cd=36&dp=PC,DC,MH>>

⁶⁴ *Request to Mount Sinai Beth Israel Hospital to maintain or restore crucial medical services within or serving Community District 3* (April 2018) <http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/minutes/minutes2018-04.pdf>

Community Based Health Care Centers in Community District 3

The Roberto Clemente Mental Health Clinic (RCC) has served the community for 35 years as a top Medical and mental health center with Health + Hospitals (HHC). RCC had been functioning at 50% capacity due to loss of key funding for physical plant renovations and staff replacements. As a result it provided 13,000 fewer patient visits last year. Major renovations have been completed and staff is beginning to be rehired. However, clinicians still are responsible for administrative tasks in addition to providing patient care. Funding from HHC is needed for the center to function at 100% capacity. Administrative positions remain vacant and the physical plant still lacks appropriate safety and privacy for the safe delivery of health and mental health services.

Betances has served the community for 48 years. It provides services such as primary care, family planning, HIV and AIDS care, prenatal OB/GYN care, and substance abuse care, and serves approximately 5,000 patients a year. The center has been unable to fund major repairs to the roof and flooring which are needed to continue functioning.

The Charles B Wang Community Health Center (CBWCHC) serves patients of all ages at two clinics in Chinatown and two clinics in Flushing. The Chinatown clinics include the 125 Walker Street site which houses the pediatrics and dental departments. Internal medicine and OB/GYN services are available at the 268 Canal Street site. Of the 58,000 patients served last year by CBWCHC, about 6,300 resided in CD 3. In addition to clinical services, CBWCHC also provides patient support services such as social work, health education, nutrition counseling, and care coordination. The facility at 125 Walker St. is in need of \$1 million in capital renovations that currently is not being funded.

Community Healthcare Network's most demanded services are adolescent, women and dental services. Their services are covered by Medicaid and serve a large number of patients identifying as transgender (between 800-900 per year). The facility is scheduled to move into the new Essex Street Crossing development and concerns remain that adequate space will not be available or affordable in the new site, ultimately resulting in displaced patients.

Community District 3 Health Risks

Diabetes

The rate of adult diabetes in CD 3 is 13.5%—nearly twice the rate of Manhattan overall.

- Funding for education and outreach to promote healthy eating and sugar intake management is needed

Mental Health

The adult psychiatric hospitalization rate in the Lower East Side and Chinatown is higher than New York City rates overall.⁶⁵

- CB 3 supports the continued availability of multilingual, convenient prevention and inpatient and outpatient mental health services that accept all insurances including Medicaid. This should include pediatric, adolescent support for affected households.

Cancer and Tobacco Use

China, the Dominican Republic, and Puerto Rico are three of the top four countries/regions of origin where smokers are from. In June 2018, New York City Department of Health launched a two-week advertising campaign aimed at getting Chinese males to quit smoking.

- The City must build on this campaign by funding smoking cessation programs with counseling and nicotine replacement therapy aimed at people from countries/regions without strong tobacco control policies and programs.

Unintentional Drug Overdose

In 2015, Latino New Yorkers had the largest increase in unintentional drug overdose deaths involving heroin and/or fentanyl⁶⁶ In 2016, Black New Yorkers had the largest increase in unintentional drug overdose deaths⁶⁷ This is of concern in CD 3 where 33 % of residents are Black or Latino.⁶⁸

- CB 3 recommends funding for programs that train and certify “recovery coaches” or “peer mentors.” These certified peers can deliver Medicaid reimbursable services in certain licensed settings.

Seniors

CD 3 needs critically important investments to help older residents live healthier lives and more fulfilling lives as they age in place. In CD 3:

- There are 24,736 residents over the age of 65;
- Another 10,000 residents are between ages 60-64. Together they make up nearly 22% of CD 3's population;
- Approximately 8,200 seniors—33%—live below the poverty line;

⁶⁵ NYC Department of Health. (2015). Community Health Profiles 2015 – Manhattan Community District 3.

⁶⁶ NYC Dept. of Health & Mental Hygiene. (2016). Unintentional Drug Poisoning (Overdose) Deaths Involving Heroin and/or Fentanyl in New York City, 2000–2015.

<<https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/epi/databrief74.pdf>>

⁶⁷ NYC Dept. of Health & Mental Hygiene, Unintentional Drug Poisoning (Overdose) Deaths in New York City, 2000 to 2016. <<http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/epi/databrief89.pdf>>

⁶⁸ U.S. Census Bureau. American Community Survey 2012-2016.

- 47% of seniors are living with a disability;
- 37% of seniors experience ambulatory difficulties; and
- 35% of seniors live alone.

(See *Appendix A* for detailed statistics)

Fifty-eight percent of CD 3 seniors are foreign born, with 26% speaking Spanish at home and 43% speaking Asian and Pacific Island languages at home. Therefore, CD 3 requires culturally and linguistically appropriate health and social services for its large senior population. In practice, seniors require care on a continuum that covers their diverse cultural, health and wellness needs, and there is no single correct approach that will effectively ensure their health and well-being. In CD 3 roughly 81% of the senior population has health insurance both private and public.⁶⁹

Senior Centers

Over 66% of senior center participants say their main reason for visiting their local senior center is for the opportunity to socialize and avoid isolation. According to the Department for the Aging (DFTA), in CD 3 there are 37 senior centers and each are particularly important as they are culturally sensitive to the needs of our diverse communities.

- Given the growing senior population, there is a need to maintain and expand the existing facilities and to address significant capital maintenance needs.

Naturally Occurring Retirement Community (NORCs)

In addition to senior centers, NORCs are also vital in CD 3. A NORC is a multi-age housing development or neighborhood that was not originally designed for seniors but now is home to a significant number of older persons. There are six NORCs in CD 3 that provide Supportive Services Programs to maximize and support the successful aging in place of older residents. Often, NORC residents can access health and social services in their own buildings, building complexes or locally within their neighborhoods. Both the City Council and DFTA recognize the need for NORCs in the community and are working to budget more NORC programs.

- CB 3 supports funding for NORC programs, as they are a model for bringing necessary care and support to seniors living in age-integrated buildings and neighborhoods.

Skilled Nursing and Rehabilitation Facilities

Between 2006 and 2016 the number of long-term care facility beds in Lower Manhattan decreased from 1,085 beds across eight facilities to 418 beds across three facilities. This includes the 219 beds lost when Rivington House was closed.⁷⁰ The largest remaining long-term care provider is Gouverneur Skilled Nursing Facility with 235 beds: 58 rehabilitation beds and 177 long term care beds.⁷¹

⁶⁹ NYC Health. (2016). *Community Health Survey*. <<https://a816-healthpsi.nyc.gov/epiquery/sasresults.jsp>>

⁷⁰ Hobbs, A. (2016). Lower Manhattan hit hardest by nursing home decline, stats show. *DNAInfo*. <<https://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/20161010/lower-east-side/nursing-care-facility-closures-department-of-healthdata-rivington-house>>.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*

Immigration

36.3% of residents living in CD 3 are foreign born.⁷² It is home to the largest concentration of Asian foreign-born residents in Manhattan with a growing base of Latino foreign-born residents (especially from the Dominican Republic).

Of the foreign born in CD 3:

- 53.7% are from China,
- 12% are from six different Spanish speaking countries (Dominican Republic, Mexico, Ecuador, Honduras, Colombia, Peru).
- The remainder are from more than 13 other countries.
- Approximately 30% are not proficient in English.⁷³
- In the last decade, 42% of all Chinese immigrants arriving in New York City, were admitted to the U.S. as asylees (people seeking or granted political asylum), or refugees.⁷⁴ In addition, there is a small but growing number of refugees or asylees from Central America and South America.

Local grassroots nonprofit organizations need to provide conveniently located services to immigrants regardless of their status. Therefore CB 3 asks for:

- Increased funding increased for “know your rights education” for immigrants and legal services, as this year there is a shortage of immigration legal services located within or near our community.

Homeless Population Services

For the past three years, CB 3 has experienced an increase in resident reports and complaints regarding street homeless. These complaints concern “travelers,” young homeless people who travel to destinations depending on the weather, and often include instances of drug use and aggression.

- Manhattan Outreach Consortium (MOC) workers and NYPD confirm that traditional outreach is not successful with this population. There have not been any pilot programs to try new approaches, such as shelters where people could keep their pets with them or outreach based on services such as harm reduction.

The Department of Homeless Service’s (DHS) Hope Count for Manhattan in winter 2017-2018 saw a 5 percent decrease. One change that has been observed in CD 3 as reported and confirmed by MOC and NYPD, is that the street homeless are more dispersed throughout the community and in many community parks than in past years, including Tompkins Square Park, several areas within SDR Park, and Columbus Park. In addition, outreach workers report commonly seeing shelter residents in parks during the day.

⁷² Furman Center. (2018). *State of New York City’s Housing and Neighborhoods in 2017*. <http://furmancenter.org/files/sotc/SOC_2017_Full_1JUN2018.pdf>

⁷³ NYC Department of City Planning. (2013). *The Newest New Yorkers*.

<https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/planning/download/pdf/data-maps/nyc-population/nny2013/nny_2013.pdf>.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

Shelters and Supportive Housing

CD 3 is home to over 15 shelters among the highest in the City. Most of these facilities are absorbed into the community without notice.

Shelters

- While some shelters provide necessary beds, they are in very old buildings that do not adequately provide safe and dignified housing. NYPD reports that adult men do not want to accept beds in shelters as they do not feel safe. We also have reports from outreach workers that adult men wait until there is a safe haven bed available rather than accept a bed in an adult men's shelter.
- Project Renewal Third Street Men's Shelter is a large shelter that needs more effective security for the safety of both shelter residents and neighbors. DHS peace officers are still urgently needed for this facility. After a police car was assigned to this block, NYPD reported decrease in calls and incidents, though lack of funding for overtime ended this program. However, the nature of a large facility requires the continued protection of DHS peace officers.
- Catherine Street Shelter has changed from an adult family shelter to a single women's shelter to meet this growing need. Several floors are also planned to be converted to mental health beds staffed by a contractor to meet this increasing need. Walkthroughs of this shelter show that this old school building is inadequate for use as a shelter. People are housed in classrooms without nearby toilets and no running water in the rooms.

Supportive Housing

- There is a need for more supportive housing in CD 3. In the last fiscal year, MOC reports placing 193 clients into permanent housing and the retention rate is 91% after one year.
- CB 3 also supports additional efforts to combat youth homelessness. According to Safe Horizon, there were over 2003 homeless youth (under 24 years old) in NYC in 2017 – over 1,000 of which accessed their “Streetwork” program.⁷⁵ However, these numbers are difficult to track and the organization suspects the actual number was much higher.
- Approximately 40% of homeless youth identify as LGBTQ, compared to 10% of the general youth population in the United States.⁷⁶ LGBTQ runaway and homeless youth face a unique set of challenges, from greater exposure to HIV/AIDS to being ostracized by their families and communities. Specialized outreach services are required to address these challenges. In FY 17, nearly \$28 million was included in the City budget to address youth homelessness.⁷⁷ CB 3 supports baselining of this funding and an expansion of programs to reach out to homeless youth, especially LGBTQ youth.

⁷⁵ Stewart, D. “Re: Request for Updated Statistics.” Message to Community Board 3. 20 June 2017. E-mail.

⁷⁶ Safe Horizon. Homeless Youth Statistics. < <https://www.safehorizon.org/get-informed/homeless-youth-statistics-facts/>>

⁷⁷ The Council of the City of New York. (2017). Report to the Committee on Finance and the Committee on Youth Services on the Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget for Department of Youth and Community Development. <<http://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2017/03/260-DYCD-1.pdf>>

- Homeless youth identifying as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender are more likely to commit suicide than other youth.⁷⁸ In order for the City to identify and address problem, CB 3 supports the inclusion of sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression in the DHS's Homeless Outreach Population Estimate.

Nightlife and Licensing

CD 3, a primarily residential district, has the largest number of 311 commercial noise complaints year to year for any Community District in Manhattan, regularly registering more than 2,000 complaints in each of the past four years. However, this last fiscal year, for the first time, saw a decrease from 4,093 to 3,645 commercial noise complaints—a decrease of almost 11 percent.⁷⁹ Despite this modest decrease, the metamorphosis of CD 3 into a nightlife destination and growing hotel district has clearly increased quality-of-life complaints overall. Further, as can be seen in Figure 1, the complaints in the last year are all largely clustered around certain locations in the district.

Figure 1 – 311 Commercial Noise Complaints, FY2018



Source: City of New York (2018). 311 Service Request Map: July 2017 to July 2018. <<http://www1.nyc.gov/apps/311srmap/>>.

⁷⁸ Safe Horizon. Homeless Youth Statistics. <<https://www.safehorizon.org/get-informed/homeless-youth-statistics-facts/>>

⁷⁹ New York City 311 Service Requests. (2018). NYC Open Data. <<https://nycopendata.socrata.com/>>.

These complaints are difficult to resolve because no agency has sole jurisdiction over complaints such as noisy crowds on the street, lines outside businesses, overcrowding, and monitoring loud music. The New York State Liquor Authority (SLA), which issues licenses and has jurisdiction over compliance with the Alcohol Beverage Law, does not inspect businesses without complaints and believes that noise and other quality of life problems caused by the saturation of liquor licenses are not within the agency's jurisdiction, but must be enforced by the NYPD.⁸⁰ Large rowdy crowds, traffic congestion, and horn honking are a constant result of the saturation of bars, but as these conditions are not criminal there is very little the police can do in response to noisy, crowded streets and sidewalks.

CB 3 has several recommendations to mitigate the negative impacts of this nightlife proliferation:

- Strict adherence by the SLA to the 500-foot rule by not allowing new liquor licenses in saturated areas without a clear showing by the applicant of a public benefit.
- Utilize existing tools to address quality of life complaints that result from the oversaturation of eating and drinking establishments, such as: "6 in 60" legislation that was enacted in 2010 which allows police to refer noncompliant businesses to the SLA for such matters as violation of noise laws and failure to control unruly crowds.

Sidewalk Cafés

Sidewalk cafés enhance street vitality but also create congestion and noise by extending businesses to otherwise public sidewalks. Sidewalk cafés also push waiting patrons into smaller areas of public sidewalk, forcing pedestrians to navigate around patrons, often into the street. Permittees often illegally increase the footprint of their cafes and allow wait staff to serve customers from the sidewalk, which encroaches on public sidewalk space. Lack of Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA) staffing has resulted in the loss of much needed routine, night and weekend inspections for permit compliance and creates the necessity for residents to police their sidewalk cafes.

To address sidewalk café issues, CB 3 requests that:

- DCA create rules to distinguish between sidewalk cafes that are bars and those that are restaurants. This would allow communities to identify appropriate locations where sidewalk cafes will not conflict with residential living.
- DCA create rules for evaluating sidewalk cafe applications that would examine the clearance needed at the proposed location in relation to the existing sidewalk congestion, as well as the 8-foot sidewalk clearance, including locations near subway entrances or bus stops, to ensure sufficient sidewalk access for pedestrians and people in wheelchairs.
- DCA use creative methods, such as flex time and rotating shifts, to monitor and enforce existing sidewalk café regulations at times when violations are most often occurring,

⁸⁰ New York State Office of the State Comptroller. Division of State Government Accountability. (June 2017). *Responsiveness to Noise Complaints Related to New York City Nightlife Establishments*. <<https://www.osc.state.ny.us/audits/allaudits/093017/16s37.pdf>>.

such as on weekends and in the evenings.

- DCA consider earlier closing hours for sidewalk cafes in residential areas.

Appendix

Appendix A - Disability Status, Economic Profile, and Household Composition of Seniors in Community District 3 (2016)

Disability Status of the Non-Institutionalized Civilian Pop		
65 and Over	24,366	100%
With a Disability	11,335	46.50%
With a Hearing Difficulty	3,771	15.50%
With a Vision Difficulty	2,458	10.10%
With a Cognitive Difficulty	4,151	17.00%
With an Ambulatory Difficulty	9,084	37.30%
With a Self-Care Difficulty	4,076	16.70%
With an Independent Living Difficulty	6,717	27.60%
Economic Profile - Benefits		
Households with Social Security - Retirement	18,738	25.80%
Households with Retirement Income - Pension, etc.	7,080	9.80%
Households with Supplemental Security Income	8,624	11.90%
Households with Cash Public Assistance Income	3,716	5.10%
Households with SNAP/Food Stamps Benefits	17,790	24.50%
Household Composition		
Total persons 65 years and over	23,672	100.00%
In family households	13,824	58.40%
Householder	7,745	32.70%
Spouse	3,721	15.70%
Other relatives	2,137	9.00%
Nonrelatives	221	0.90%
In nonfamily households	9,076	38.30%
Householder	8,751	37.00%
Living alone	8,330	35.20%
Nonrelatives	325	1.40%
In group quarters	772	3.30%
Institutionalized	563	2.40%

Source: U.S. Census Bureau. American Community Survey 2012-2016.