

FY 2021 Borough Budget Consultations

Manhattan - Economic Development Corporation

Meeting Date 9/7/2018

AGENDA ITEM 1 : General Agency Funding Discussion

The purpose of holding the Borough Budget Consultations is to provide Community Boards with important information to assist in drafting their statement of District Needs and Budget Priorities for the upcoming fiscal year. As you know, Community Board Members are volunteers who may not be familiar with the budget process and how agencies' programs are funded. At the same time, Community Board members are very knowledgeable about local service needs.

This year's Manhattan agendas have three sections:

I. Agencies begin the consultation with a presentation of their goals, funding decision process, and highlights of their funding needs.

II. Then, the agenda continues with Community Boards asking about specific program funding.

III. Lastly, the agendas include Boards' requests on district-specific budget questions. We request that the agency respond in writing, but have any further discussions on these items with the Community Boards outside of the consultation.

For the first section, please present on the four topics below for 10-15 minutes at the beginning of our Consultation. Also, please provide written responses or even a PowerPoint presentation that we can use to fully and accurately educate our Board Members.

1. What are your priorities and operational goals for FY20 and projected priorities and operational goals for FY21?
2. What are the current proposed FY20 and FY21 service and operational goals and proposed funding?
3. Which programs is the agency adding, dropping, or changing for FY20 and projected for FY21?
4. What are your benchmarks for new and existing programs and what are your benchmarks/key performance indicators for measuring success?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

#1) EDC funds are not tax levied funds. EDC handles construction, infrastructure, etc all over the city. For FY21, EDC can't say if there are any major operational goal changes. Dock NYC is the arm of EDC that manages certain aspects of EDC's waterfront and operate leases and contracts with operators. Dock NYC generates revenue from managing these piers, which goes back into maintenance for these piers.

Wil Fisher (AVP, EDC): Launched new initiatives and by working with operators and NYPD to curtail illegal ticket selling in downtown Manhattan.

#2) EDC focuses on tax-exemption category, looking at economic opportunity (through the IDA program) by reducing burden of taxes for businesses operating within the city. EDC launched ASTEP program which helps reduce taxes for small businesses engaging in purchase transactions. EDC also incentives supermarkets to allocate space for fresh produce by offering tax incentives. EDC also has a loan program for MWBE.

#3) Charlie Samboy (VP, EDC): Onus is on business to take part in programs such as ASTEP. Looking at Fresh Map to see where food desserts are in NYC.

#4) City has allocated money to bolster job creation in multiple sectors, especially life sciences and cyber security. Within the last two weeks, EDC signed a lease with a partner in Israel re: cyber security investment, training, and job creation. EDC has launched job incubators.

Wil Fisher (AVP, EDC): Making sure there are investments where needs are for certain industries.

Waheera Mardah (SPM, EDC): started GIS camp in Inwood in order to encourage young people to learn and use tech to help their communities.

#5) Helga Neyerffer (AVP, EDC): Going to create a whole new ferry route to Staten Island (through west side of Manhattan), Coney Island, etc to make sure all five boroughs will be accessible. Costs as a result of new ferry systems will go down as ridership increases, subsidies can only help so much in the meantime.

Wil Fisher (AVP, EDC): There is an ongoing feasibility study re: a gondola between Lower Manhattan and Governors Island.

#6) ConstructNYC gives microloans through public-private partnerships to organizations and folks.

Waheera Mardah (SPM, EDC): HireNYC helps increase access for job seekers and to help publicize job opportunities.

#7) EDC helps fund program to remove graffiti. 311 helps with graffiti removal. Sometimes EDC has to get permission from property owner before proceeding to remove graffiti, and in some cases the businesses there are not the property owner.

Charlie Samboy (VP, EDC): EDC usually gets private property graffiti removal requests.

#8) Working on Manhattan Greenway project with community boards, but portions of the esplanade need funding. Other Greenway projects are in the process, but need funding, especially south of 53rd Street, thus the project is being implemented section by section. If there's a funding gap, EDC would appreciate community board support to help move initiatives forward.

NOTES:

Charlie Samboy (VP, EDC): Will send written responses to borough budget consultation questions to community boards soon.

Susan Stezter (CB3): Community Board 3 is mainly eating and drinking establishments. Charlie Samboy: Can look into diversifying businesses for certain community boards.

Charlie Samboy (VP, EDC): Can explore areas where there's a need for public intervention, work spaces, and job incubators. Already doing so with life sciences and cyber security.

Lucian Reynolds (DM, CB1): Community boards can be helpful in terms of getting property owner contact information to help with graffiti removal.

EDC: Will have to get back to community boards regarding if there's an uptick or large increase in graffiti, perhaps it's due to increase awareness of the graffiti removal program, thus more people are using the program.

AGENDA ITEM 2 : Affordable Housing

1. What funds were allocated in FY20 for potential affordable housing projects on City-owned land as part of the Housing New York Plan?

2. What amount of this funding does EDC anticipate will be used for sites in Manhattan?
3. Will there be funding available for community engagement related to these projects in FY20?
4. Please provide a list of projects by community district.
5. What are the projected levels of funding in FY21?
6. Are capital subsidies available for the development of affordable housing? Can the subsidies be broken down by borough? If so, please list the amount of available subsidy by borough.

AGENCY RESPONSE:

Questions regarding affordable housing should be directed to HPD.

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

NOTES:

AGENDA ITEM 3 : Business Investment and Incentives for Diversity

1. What is the current budget for the NYC Food and Beverage and Manufacturers Growth Fund in FY20?
 - 1A. What is the forecasted budget for FY21?
2. What is the current budget for the Futureworks NYC in FY20? What is the forecasted budget for FY21?
 - 2A. Is this program's funding based solely on private monies?
3. What other programs are being applied by EDC to provide incentives for diverse business investments and entrepreneurship?
 - 3A. What is the funding for these programs in FY20 and planned for FY21?
4. What benchmarks do you use to measure the success of these programs?
 - 4A. How well did these programs perform in FY19 according to those benchmarks?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

NOTES:

AGENDA ITEM 4 : Incubators and Workspaces

1. What budgetary increases or decreases were made by the EDC between FY19 and FY20 for the development of Incubators and Workspaces in Manhattan? What is the budget forecast for FY21?

2. What benchmarks do you use to measure success?

3. What data have you collected regarding job growth as a result of EDC's investment in workspaces and incubators?

3A. Please list how many jobs have been created within the range of income brackets.

3B. How many firms that have exited the incubator or workspace programs stay in New York City with a long-term commercial lease?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

NOTES:

AGENDA ITEM 5 : EDC Transportation Systems

1. How much funding has the EDC added to the operating budget of the Citywide Ferry System from FY19 to FY20?

2. How many routes and landings are planned and what capital infrastructure funding is required in FY20 for additional routes?

3. What funding is being sought for FY21 and future years to support more routes along the east and west sides of Manhattan to other remote parts of the city?

3A. Does EDC have FY20 monies set aside for plans to study, design or implement Hudson River/West Side Ferry Service to community districts 7, 9, & 12?

4. What are the performance indicators that EDC tracks for the Citywide Ferry program?

4A. How does the EDC measure the effectiveness of the Citywide Ferry System when comparing the per rider subsidy with other transit modes such as buses or express buses?

4B. With the addition of new routes and the planned expansion to the West Side of Manhattan in the future, what does EDC forecast in terms of ridership and the effective subsidy per rider in FY21?

4C. Has the EDC budgeted any programs or initiatives to drive down the subsidized rider cost?

5. Does the EDC plan to spend any funds in FY21 to explore, convert, or procure drive technology that exceeds the Tier 4 emissions profile with the use of electric or hybrid technology?

6. Has EDC budgeted any funds towards the design, construction, real estate procurement, or consultant assistance for alternative transportation modes such as gondola lifts, aerial tramways, or the expansion of non-city owned modes such as the subway?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

1. How much funding has the EDC added to the operating budget of the Citywide Ferry System from FY19 to FY20??

Total NYC Ferry expenditures for FY19 have not yet been finalized as the fiscal year just closed; these figures will typically be available by October.

2. How many routes and landings are planned and what capital infrastructure funding is required in FY20 for additional routes?

In the next two years, two new routes (Coney Island route and the St. George route) and the extension of an existing route (Throgs Neck added to the Soundview route) are planned. This will add five landings to our ferry infrastructure.

The Mayor announced that this expansion would require \$100 million in capital funding over the coming years.

3. What funding is being sought for FY21 and future years to support more routes along the east and west sides of Manhattan to other remote parts of the city?

The Mayor announced the expansion of NYC Ferry as discussed in question 2, improving access in the Bronx, Coney Island, Staten Island and the West Side of Manhattan. These routes will launch between CY2020 and CY2021. The FY21 budget has not yet been determined but in the long term, the city expects subsidies to stabilize between \$7-8/trip.

3A. Does EDC have FY20 monies set aside for plans to study, design or implement Hudson River/West Side Ferry Service to community districts 7, 9, & 12?

EDC most recently completed the 2018/19 Ferry Feasibility Study . This in-depth report built upon previous studies, with new data for ridership estimates, operational and travel time calculations, and neighborhood growth. Public outreach included an open call to recommend a site for study (with 3,500 public suggestions) and meetings with electeds and CB leaders. The planning team then took 35 selected study sites through a multi-stage screening process looking at operational and physical barriers, travel time competitiveness, ridership potential, and infrastructure needs and costs, among other factors. The study culminated in the announcement by Mayor de Blasio in the 2019 State of the City that NYC Ferry would be expanding.

EDC will continue to monitor the system and complete the current expansion before seeking out additional studies.

4. What are the performance indicators that EDC tracks for the Citywide Ferry program?

NYC Ferry quarterly data reports can be found at the link below:
<https://www.ferry.nyc/reports-statistics/>.

4A. How does the EDC measure the effectiveness of the Citywide Ferry System when comparing the per rider subsidy with other transit modes such as buses or express buses?

NYCF is a cost-effective option compared to other ferry services and city express bus services. Ferry infrastructure costs significantly less than other modes of transport such as new subway lines and train tunnels and will not impact existing modes of transit (as new bus services can). NYC Ferry also provides qualitative benefits that improve transit equity and spur economic growth in areas of the city that are historically underserved by the transit system. NYCF has been developing underutilized waterfronts and, bringing communities together in a way that develops new markets, expands travel choices beyond increasingly congested roadways, and enhances job access and opportunity for residents across the income spectrum.

4B. With the addition of new routes and the planned expansion to the West Side of Manhattan in the future, what does EDC forecast in terms of ridership and the effective subsidy per rider in FY21?

With the launching of new routes, ridership is expected to grow to 8-9 Million in FY21. After implementation years of the new service, when all routes are stabilized, we expect subsidies to be between \$7-8/trip.

4C. Has the EDC budgeted any programs or initiatives to drive down the subsidized rider cost?

Yes, by increasing ridership, purchasing the fleet, and based on negotiated contract payment schedules, EDC expects to reduce subsidized rider costs to \$7-8 per trip.

5. Does the EDC plan to spend any funds in FY21 to explore, convert, or procure drive technology that exceeds the

Tier 4 emissions profile with the use of electric or hybrid technology?

Currently, Tier 4 diesel engine standards are the strictest EPA emissions requirement. EDC is excited to be building some of the first ferry vessels that meet Tier 4 emission standards. We are currently exploring additional studies via the DOT funded Alternative Fuel Study to further limit our environmental impact.

6. Has EDC budgeted any funds towards the design, construction, real estate procurement, or consultant assistance for alternative transportation modes such as gondola lifts, aerial tramways, or the expansion of non-city owned modes such as the subway?

EDC is in the midst of a feasibility study to look at an aerial gondola system between lower Manhattan and Governors Island with support from a consultant team. There are no funds budgeted towards design or construction, nor has the feasibility study been concluded at this time.

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

NOTES:

AGENDA ITEM 6 : Training and Learning for Low Income

1. What budgetary changes were made between FY19 and FY20 for the FRESH program, ConstructNYC, and HireNYC? Has the EDC seen any need to eliminate, reduce, or expand any existing programs?
2. What indicators do you use to evaluate year over year performance?
3. What other programs are funded to link economic development projects to training and earning opportunities for low-income New Yorkers?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

MEETING NOTES:

COMMENTS:

NOTES:

AGENDA ITEM 7 : Graffiti Removal

EDC is responsible for graffiti removal.

1. What performance benchmarks does EDC use to judge the effectiveness of the program?
2. Was the program successful over the previous fiscal year?
3. Please describe the process and the funding for the program in FY20 and FY21.

AGENCY RESPONSE:

1. To gauge the effectiveness of the Graffiti Free NYC (GFNYC) program, NYCEDC measures the number of properties and square footage cleaned.
2. The program has indeed been successful, with more than 14,000 properties and more than 7,000,000 square feet cleaned citywide in FY19. Cases are typically identified through 311 by individuals and addressed thereafter.
3. The approximate program budget, which is typically determined in April of each year, is \$3.4 million for FY20. This funding is a combination of City funds and EDC self funds.

MEETING NOTES:**COMMENTS:****NOTES:****AGENDA ITEM 8 : Recommended Priorities for CB Support**

1. What budget priorities would EDC want community boards to support?

AGENCY RESPONSE:

NYCEDC appreciates Community Boards for the valuable forum they provide for public engagement at a local level. In the coming year, we look forward to further partnership in bringing new projects to life and maximizing the positive impact that existing projects make on the surrounding community.

MEETING NOTES:**COMMENTS:****NOTES:**