

**Community Board 12, Manhattan
General Meeting**

**Isabella Geriatric Center
515 Audubon Ave
April 23, 2019 - 6:30 pm**

Board Members Present: Mary Anderson; Glennis Aquino; Wayne Benjamin; James Berlin; Tanya Bonner; Eleazar Bueno; Daryl Cochrane; Robin Cruz; Waldys Cruz; Gerard Dengel; Katherine Diaz; Domingo Estevez; Gabriela Estrella; Sara Fisher; Fe Florimon; Barbara Frazier; Mitchell Glenn; Bianca Guerrero; Danielle Jettoo; Osi Kaminer; Elizabeth Lehmann; Richard R. Lewis; Matthew Levy; Elizabeth Lorris Ritter; Maria Luna; Jay Mazur; Nicholas Martinez; Noquel Matos; Isidro Medina; Rud Morales; Ayisha Ogilvie; Bruce Robertson; Steve Simon; Christopher Ventura; Curtis Young

Board Members Absent: Richard Allman; Francisco Alvarez; Fern Hertzberg; Yosef Kalinsky; Francisco Lopez; Ariel Miranda; Jonathan Nunez-Frometa;

Board Members Absent - Excused: Naysha Diaz; Deborah Nabavian; Karen Taylor;

Staff: Ebenezer Smith; Paola Garcia

Call to Order: Chair Richard Lewis calls the meeting to order at 6:55 pm. He welcomes everyone. Quorum is attained. Agenda is adopted. Last month's minutes adopted.

Chair's Report: Richard Lewis' report covered the following topics:

- Listing of the many meetings, with a review of some, on the Chair's April schedule, including mention of upcoming events.
- Recounting of a meeting of all Manhattan Community Board representatives to discuss topics that the 2019 Charter Revision commission should consider.
- Review of a public hearing on the planned homeless shelter at Audubon Avenue and 179 Street. The chair recounted some of the discussion at that event, which resulted in the development of a resolution at the Executive Committee meeting April 15th that will be voted on later tonight.
- Mention of the new OMNY payment system for mass transit, which will be rolling out soon to busses and subways in the City.

Parliamentarian's Report – Jim Berlin spoke once again about some of the rules that govern our meetings:

- He gave us a brief review of some of Robert's Rules on how to efficiently and effectively run a meeting, regarding the length of time allotted to speakers' questions and responses to those questions.
- Questions from members were posed to Mr. Berlin regarding the length of time allocated to various speaker roles in our meetings.
- Further member questions concerned speech length and speaker tracking at Public Hearings.
- Discussion ensued on how to focus Jim Berlin's parliamentary mentoring sessions and perhaps move them to another time.

Special Presentation – The Chair honored the following former CB12 board and staff members, and handed out certificates of appreciation to:

- Ely Silvestre
- Fern Hertzberg
- Anita Barberis
- Mary O'Shaughnessy

Mary and Ely were present to accept their awards, and gave brief thank you speeches.

District Manager's Report: Ebenezer Smith's report covered the following topics:

- The Comptroller's audit of the office's books has been completed successfully.

- Resumes are being received to fill Ely's position, but interviewing has not yet begun.
- A review of the District Manager's meetings and other events during April, and other local news updates.
- The 33rd Precinct has a new Commander, Charles Baker.

The Chair provides notice:

As per our Bylaws, one Month Notice to all members is required to change our bylaws. Therefore, the Chair gave notice that the following resolution will be voted on at next month's General Meeting: a bylaw change to limit the public speaking session to two minutes for each speaker and to further limit the total length of the public session to forty five minutes or less.

Liz Ritter read the Resolution aloud.

Pubic Speakers Session:

Pharein Griffith –Organizing for outreach on the 2020 Census. She is asking us to be ambassadors to get everyone to participate in the census next year.

Arelia Taveras – representing Floridita (Resolution 5). She is asking for support for the restaurant, despite the Licensing Committee's negative resolution. A review of a fight that occurred in the restaurant was recounted, highlighting differences between the story told at the committee meeting and what she claimed was the truth. The restaurant has been at this location 9 years and the license renewal has never been denied. The establishment keeps lights on in a dark area and the community safe.

Sonia Henriquez – owner of Floridita. She reviewed the violations issued against the restaurant and remarked that they were swiftly corrected. They were all relatively minor and should not be considered reasons to vote against the license renewal.

Jacob Morris – Chair of the Harlem Historical Society. Here to speak on Ft Tryon Park. William Tryon, for whom the park was named, was the ringleader of a plot to kill George Washington in 1776. He believes that the park should be renamed and would like to get on the Parks and Cultural Affairs Committee meeting agenda to discuss this topic.

Alberto Aquino – Representing the Armory Foundation. He offers announcements on events at the Armory. He listed the many quality colleges that accept Armory program participants.

RJ Petterson – Organizer of the campaign to save the Allen Psychiatric Unit. NY Presbyterian wants to close the sorely needed unit and replace it with an orthopedic clinic. The fear is stated that the destination for people denied service at the closed unit will end up at Rikers. He mentions upcoming events to publicize the issue.

Alex Minier – Bike New York. He mentions the Five Boro Bike Tour on May 5 and covers some of the road closings for the event. As background, Bike New York takes the revenue from the Five Boro Bike Tour and uses it on bike education.

Dan Cohen – He is standing for election in the fall for the 69th Assembly district. A member of Community Board 9, he tells us about his skills and experience that will make him a capable Assemblyman. He works for the non-profit Housing Partnership.

Val Orselli– Chair of the Cooper Square Community Land Trust. He announces an upcoming Town Hall Meeting regarding the replacement of closed Church buildings and other religion owned property with luxury housing near Cooper Square and in other parts of Manhattan. He supports the building of low-income housing on these properties, and asks us to attend the Town Hall meeting.

Denise Cunniff – Lives near Boxers (Resolution 12). She speaks against the request of this establishment to serve alcohol until 4am (from the current 2am), pointing out the noise that emanates from the nightclub all night long. The request to serve alcohol until 4am is in withdrawn Resolution 13. Regarding the sidewalk café application (Resolution 12), she is against this as well.

Dave Crenshaw– Dreamers. Coach thanks the community board for the hard work that it does. He then lists upcoming events and, in contrast to the limitations on speaking at Community Board meetings, he offers us the opportunity to talk for as long as we want at these events.

Sara Fisher –Speaking for Friends of Inwood Hill Park, Sally announces the 4th annual Earth Day Festival and also describes other upcoming events. She talks about successful past events. For example, 2500 lbs. of litter were cleaned up at last year’s Riverkeeper Festival.

William Arroyo – Traveling to our meeting from the Lower East Side (Loisaida), he invites us to the May 6th Town hall meeting at Cooper Square mentioned by Val Orselli (above). He tells us that religious properties are being de-sanctified and sold to the highest bidder. He maintains that these properties must be used for community-oriented purposes.

Donald Smith – Lives near Boxers. He lives directly across the street on 159 Street and Broadway. The noise that radiates from that nightclub is outrageous. This must be stopped. Boxers claims that they are benefitting the community, but they are not. Residents are being awakened at all hours of the night by this establishment.

~~~~~

**Government Officials:**

**Natalie Espino**, Community Liaison to the Borough President (BP), covers the following topics:

- Community Board appointments will be announced and sent out in coming days.
- She notes that the BP’s office runs training sessions for Manhattan Community Board members.
- The BP’s office funds various community benefit initiatives. This year, among other worthy programs, there will be money available for Census 2020 awareness.
- The BP supports a Council bill establishing a database carrying information on empty storefronts in the city. The BP believes that this information made readily available will help to reduce the empty storefront problem.
- Ms. Espino mentions but the BP does not take a position on the homeless shelter being built on Audubon Avenue.

**Laurie Tobias Cohen**, Community Liaison in Congressman Adriano Espaillat’s office, covers the following topics:

- A brief review of the Congressman’s current legislative efforts.
- She notes that the Congressman supports HR1585, a bill re-authorizing laws against sexual harassment.
- A list of the various caucuses that the Congressman sits on.

**Robert Jackson**, State Senator, covered the following topics:

- In the coming session, there will be an effort to roll back the laws that have been decimating the rent stabilized housing stock in NY State.
- The Senator is a strong supporter of toughened environmental laws. The state comptroller says that there is \$190mm for this effort.
- The senator is fighting to restore state payments to NYC totaling \$4b to be used for education.

**Angela Fernandez**, soon to be NYS Commissioner on Human Rights, covered the following topics:

- The Human Rights Law in NY State is 75 years old, one of the oldest on the books. An overview is given of the many areas that these laws cover, and the powers of the office to enforce these laws.
- Everyone is invited to visit the Human Rights office if they feel that their rights are being abrogated.

**Maria De La Cruz**, Uptown representative for Comptroller Scott Stringer’s office.

- She announces that the Comptroller provides support to minority and women owned businesses to get contracts with the city.

**Kiana Diaz**, Constituent Liaison for Councilman Ydanis Rodriguez, covered the following topics:

- She lists upcoming events, including a detailed mention of the “Car Free Day” in honor of Earth Day on April 27th.

**Joselinne Minaya**, representing the Manhattan District Attorney’s office, discusses the following topics:

- The DA strongly supports eliminating the backlog of untested rape kits and is working toward that goal, including contributing \$38mm to the effort. Evaluation of these rape kits have resulted in many convictions. The DA also supports the elimination of the statute of limitations on sex crimes.
- A reminder that April is sexual assault awareness month.

**Manuel Belliard**, Councilman Mark Levine, covered the following topics:

- In his usual efficient manner, he lists upcoming events.

.....  
**Committee Reports:** - refer to the minutes unless otherwise noted

**Parks and Cultural Affairs** – Chair Liz Ritter. Corrected minutes from this month’s committee meeting will go onto the website. La Marina will probably be a topic at the next meeting.

**Business Development:** Chair Eleazar Bueno. Since November we’ve lost 11 businesses south of 181 Street. Review of upcoming agenda for the next committee meeting. The Census Bureau will appear at that meeting.

**Land Use** – All present were referred to the committee minutes for details.

**Traffic & Transportation**, Interim Chair Nicholas Martinez briefly discussed the work of the Committee this past month and asked us to refer to the minutes.

**Housing & Human Services:** –Chair Ayisha Ogilvie spoke briefly. She mentioned that Waldys Cruz just got married. This caused a stir. The upcoming April meeting will review rent reform and tenant protections for non-profit landlord tenants.

**Public Safety:**

**Health & Environment:**

**Concerns of the Aging:**

**Youth and Education**

.....  
**Resolution Reports:**

**Resolution A** - Supporting the Proposed Board of Standard & Appeals Rule Change

Land Use Committee: Wayne Benjamin, Chair, begins the discussion:

- This was a time sensitive resolution that was voted on by the Executive Committee.
- The resolution supports increasing the transparency of the conduct of BSA commissioners.

**Resolution B** - Affirming Support for the Proposed Designation of the Park Terrace West – West 217th Historic District  
Land Use Committee: Wayne Benjamin, Chair, begins the discussion:

- This was a time sensitive resolution that was voted on by the Executive Committee.
- In this resolution CB12 restated our support for the historic district to make sure that the Councilman was clear on where we stand.

**Resolution C:** In Opposition to the Dept of Homeless Services' Plan for a Men's Homeless Shelter at 286 Audubon Avenue, with recommendations for a more suitable homeless shelter at this location

Executive Committee: Richard Lewis, CB12 Chair, begins the discussion:

- This was designed and approved by the Executive Committee because it, too, is time sensitive. Sally Fisher takes issue with these Executive Committee resolutions. She feels that there has not been enough open conversation in committee on these topics.
- The resolution supports a homeless shelter at this location but for a different population than the one that the Department of Homeless Services (DHS) proposes for this site.
- Liz Ritter states that she is for more services for the homeless and will therefore vote against this resolution.
- There is a discussion of the process for designating homeless sites and various people point out where errors were made by both DHS and the community in reaching this point of unrest and frustration.
- Much personal insight is shared regarding the homeless crisis, the performance of DHS in alleviating the crisis and to the various sections of the resolution.
- After a considerable amount of time in discussion, a majority of the members present voted to end debate on this question.

**Resolution D:** On the U.S. Census 2020

Business Development Committee: Eleazar Bueno, Chair, and Tanya Bonner, Assistant Chair, begin the discussion:

- The resolution asks for support for census outreach and for \$40mm to support the effort.
- It also asks that the citizenship question be removed from the census questionnaire because existence of the question will suppress response and therefore lead to undercounting.

**Resolution E:** Calling upon the MTA to add ADA Compliant Accessibility to any Planned Subway Renovations

Traffic & Transportation: Nicholas Martinez, Interim Chair, begins the discussion:

- The resolution we were mistakenly handed in our packets was the draft version, which does not exactly match the final version.
- The spirit of the resolution is correct, however.
- The resolution is authored and sponsored jointly with the Concerns of the Aging Committee.
- Steve Simon advocates that the ongoing elevator replacement projects on the A train be expedited and be enhanced to make the stations accessible. This was accepted as a friendly amendment.

**Resolution F:** Establishing CB12M Support for a Proposed "Amsterdam Avenue Pedestrian Plaza" at 185th Street and Amsterdam Avenue

Traffic & Transportation: Nicholas Martinez, Interim Chair, begins the discussion:

- The resolution we were mistakenly handed in our packets was the draft version, which does not exactly match the final version.
- The spirit of the resolution is correct, however.

**Resolution G:** Recommending Improvements to Legislation for Rent Regulations & Enhanced Tenant Protections

Housing & Human Services: Ayisha Ogilvie, Chair, begins the discussion:

- Changes to the resolution subsequent to printing are presented and a review of the rest of the resolution is recounted.
- Liz Ritter proposes a friendly amendment to have landlords post a tenant bill of rights in any building covered by rent regulations. It is accepted.

**Resolution H:** Requesting that the Department of Homeless Services Provide Timely and Complete responses to inquiries made by CB12M

Housing & Human Services: Ayisha Ogilvie, Chair, begins the discussion:

- This was a reaction to the experience that we've had with DHS's homeless shelter project on Audubon Avenue.

**Resolution I:** Supporting the Renovation plan for Inwood Hill Park Baseball field #1

Parks & Cultural Affairs: Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Chair, begins the discussion:

- She discusses some of the details of the resolution, including the addition of a batting cage to protect the fence.

### **Licensing Committee Resolutions**

Chair Isidro Medina opened the discussion. Highlights follow:

- 4 of the 18 resolutions has been withdrawn.
- Domingo Estevez expresses a general concern that reports from the police among others can be misleading if an arrest results in a dismissal of charges.
- Rud Morales expresses support for Floridita (#5).
- A friendly amendment is accepted on the Boxers sidewalk café resolution (#12) from Steve Simon.
- Several members suggest that we take Resolution 5 back to committee because of conflicting accounts between the police and the proprietors. This idea is rejected. Gerard Dengel points out that testimony at meetings is just that, and everyone is expected to weigh the testimony for accuracy and vote accordingly. This becomes a point of contention, and the assembled discuss returning the resolution to committee. There was a vote on this motion, which was defeated.

### **Voting on the Resolutions:**

| <b><u>Item #</u></b> | <b><u>Resolutions</u></b>                                                                                                                                                                               | <b><u>Voting:<br/>Y-N-Abst-<br/>Absent-NV</u></b> | <b><u>Result</u></b>        |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| A                    | Supporting the Proposed Board of Standard & Appeals Rule Change                                                                                                                                         | 35-0-0-0-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| B                    | Affirming Support for the Proposed Designation of the Park Terrace West – West 217th Historic District                                                                                                  | 32-2-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| C                    | In Opposition to the Dept of Homeless Services' Plan for a Men's Homeless Shelter at 286 Audubon Avenue, with recommendations for a more suitable homeless shelter at this location                     | 26-6-0-3-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| D                    | On the U.S. Census 2020                                                                                                                                                                                 | 35-0-0-0-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| E                    | Calling upon the MTA to add ADA Compliant Accessibility to any Planned Subway Renovations                                                                                                               | 35-0-0-0-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| F                    | Establishing CB12M Support for a Proposed "Amsterdam Avenue Pedestrian Plaza" at 185th Street and Amsterdam Avenue                                                                                      | 33-1-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| G                    | Recommending Legislation Rent Regulations & Enhanced Tenant Protections                                                                                                                                 | 35-0-0-0-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| H                    | Requesting that the Department of Homeless Services Provide Timely and Complete responses to inquiries made by CB12M                                                                                    | 33-0-0-2-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| I                    | Supporting the Renovation plan for Inwood Hill Park Baseball field #1                                                                                                                                   | 34-0-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| 1                    | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Locksmith Wine Bar Inc. dba The Locksmith Wine Bar – 4463 Broadway (btw W.190th St. & W.192nd St.)                   | 33-1-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| 2                    | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: 839 W. 181 Food Inc. dba Le Cheile – 839 W.181st St. (At the corner of Cabrini Blvd.)                                | 33-1-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| 3                    | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Chipotle Mexican Grill of Colorado, LLC. dba Chipotle Mexican Grill – 4009 Broadway (btw W.168th St. & W. 169th St.) | 33-1-0-1-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| 4                    | Resolution of Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: International Food House Inc. dba Albert's Mofongo – 217 Dyckman St. aka 4762A & 4762B (at the corner of Broadway St.)  | 27-8-0-0-0                                        | <b><i>Passed</i></b>        |
| 5                    | Resolution of Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to:                                                                                                                         | 6-24-0-5-0                                        | <b><i>Flipped to No</i></b> |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |            |                       |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|-----------------------|
|    | Floridita Restaurant Uptown 2 Inc. – 3856 10th Avenue, Store 3&4 (At the corner of W. 206th Street)                                                                                                                                                                        |            | <b>Objecti<br/>on</b> |
| 6  | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to:<br>Mi Ranchito Mexican Restaurant Inc. – 1468 St. Nicholas Avenue (btw W. 183 & W. 184 Streets)                                                                                         | 33-1-0-1-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 7  | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its Restaurant Wine License to:<br>L'Fonda Inc. – 2023 Amsterdam Avenue (btw W.160th St. & W.161st)                                                                                                                       | 33-1-0-1-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 8  | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its Restaurant Wine License to:<br>AKV Restaurant Corp. dba Inwood Local Wine Bar & Beer Garden – 4957 Broadway (btw W. 207th & Isham Streets)                                                                            | 34-1-0-0-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 9  | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Corporate Change of License to:<br>Vida Café Inc. dba Mamajuana Café – 243-249 Dyckman Street (at the corner of Seaman Avenue) - Removing Officer                                                                                    | 32-1-0-2-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 10 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Class Change of its Restaurant Wine to On-Premise Liquor License:<br>Ceci Restaurant Inc. – 78 Sherman Avenue (btw Thayer & Dyckman Streets)                                                                                         | 30-5-0-0-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 11 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Class Change of its Restaurant Wine to On-Premise Liquor License:<br>Enjoy Kitchen & Grill Corp. dba Enjoy Kitchen & Bar – 582 W. 207th Street (at the corner of Vermilyea Avenue)                                                   | 25-7-0-3-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 12 | Resolution of Objection to the SLA Alteration of its License to:<br>Boxers Washington Heights LLC. dba Boxers – 3820 Broadway (At the corner of W. 158th St.) - Addition of the Sidewalk Café                                                                              | 30-4-0-1-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 13 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to:<br>Boxers Washington Heights LLC. dba Boxers – 3820 Broadway (At the corner of W. 158th St.) - To extend hours of Operation from 2—4AM on Sunday and Thursday<br>Application Withdrawn |            | <b>Withdr<br/>awn</b> |
| 14 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to:<br>151 Dyckman Corp. dba Lotus Café – 151 Dyckman Street (btw Sherman & Post Avenues)<br>To add DJ and Karaoke to its current operation<br>Application Withdrawn                       |            | <b>Withdr<br/>awn</b> |
| 15 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to:<br>Enjoy Kitchen & Grill Corp. dba Enjoy Kitchen & Bar – 582 W. 207th Street (at the corner of Vermilyea Avenue) - To add Security and Change Hours Thurs-Sun till 3AM                 | 30-4-0-1-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 16 | Resolution of No Objection to the SLA New On-Premises Liquor License to:<br>Café Bark, Inc. dba Café Bark – 833 W. 181st St. (At the corner of Cabrini Blvd.)                                                                                                              | 30-5-0-0-0 | <b>Passed</b>         |
| 17 | Resolution of Objection to the SLA Summer On-Premise Liquor License to:<br>Abisinias Café Lounge, Inc. dba Nava NYC – 377-381 Audubon Avenue (At the corner of W.184th St.)<br>Application Withdrawn                                                                       |            | <b>Withdr<br/>awn</b> |
| 18 | Resolution of Objection to the SLA New Eating Place Beer License to:<br>Rinconcito Vegano Corp. dba TBD – 1650 Saint Nicholas Avenue (At the corner of W. 193rd St.)<br>Application Withdrawn                                                                              |            | <b>Withdr<br/>awn</b> |

***Motion to Adjourn- passed and seconded at 11:08 pm.***

**Respectfully submitted:** Mitchell Glenn, Secretary  
Elizabeth (Betty) Lehmann, Assistant Secretary  
April 23, 2019