

Housing & Human Services Committee, Manhattan CB12 – June 2019

Committee Members Present: Ayisha Ogilvie (Chair), Ariel Miranda, Naysha Diaz, Carolina Charles

Committee Members Absent: Barbara Frazier (Asst. Chair), Waldys Cruz, Jay Mazur

Board Members Present: Richard Lewis

Public Members Present: Marshall Vanderpool

Public Attendees: Nancy Preston, Cheryl Pahaham, Cliff Elkind, Andrew Garcia

Opening/Update – Chair, Ayisha Ogilvie

1. MIH Affordable Housing Fund Developer Contributions

- Ayisha shared with committee result of forwarding MIH matter to Executive committee. Due to parliamentary procedure being used to push matter to EC Ayisha expressed that her hands were tied. However, EC took the position that while this is a matter of importance it is the responsibility of the HHS committee and not the EC. Ultimately upon further discussion with the Board Chair, Richard Lewis it was settled that the matter of concern - the fee structure of the tiers by district for the Developer Contributions to the Housing Funds – are not the focus of the HPD request for comment on the proposed rules. Therefore the May 24th time limit would not apply and the matter could be returned to the HHS committee for review.
- Ayisha expressed the concern that Fee Tier as set seems to set CB12's district at a disadvantage considering the following:
 1. There are 5 tiers of which CB12 falls in the 4th tier. The 4th tier requires a contribution of \$320 per Sq. Ft.
 2. The 4th tier is \$50 more than the 5th tier which requires a contribution of \$270 per sq. Ft.
 3. Tiers 1, 2 & 3 however are significantly more costly to developers as they are priced \$1,100 (\$780 more), \$740 (\$430 more) & \$575 (\$255 more) respectively.
- Ayisha pointed out that this Fee Tier makes it significantly less expensive to build in the CB12 District using the Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Program. It is her feeling that were MIH yielding more housing that is "affordable" to the average resident within the CB12 community this would be a great thing. However, considering that MIH is only yielding a sliver of housing affordable to people in our community – this simply incentivizes developers to bring more luxury units which are not affordable to our district.
- Committee reviewed information on how the Fee Tier is devised in Section 41-24 of Chapter 41 of title 28 of the Rules of the City of New York
- Community member expressed that CB12 is disadvantaged in comparison to other more affluent communities as to how quickly/easily we can gather funds to bring a lawsuit against the City when measures are enacted that may be to the detriment of residents/community.
- Committee decided by consensus that we would like to hear directly from HPD as to exactly the methodology of how the Fee Tier is determined and what the historic outcomes related to the Housing Fund are.
- Chair will reach out to HPD and any other relevant agencies to appear in the Fall to speak to the matter

2. Rent Guidelines Board (Final Resolution)

- Committee reviewed finalized resolution with language which was suggested in previous meeting and which was taken from previous RGB resolutions.
- Draft of RGB resolution was given to all members present at the May General for review along with the instruction that any comments or suggestions can be emailed. As of the date of the June Committee meeting no responses were received. Board Staff was instructed to forward a reminder email to board members.

- Ariel Miranda suggested the addition of language stating that annual rent increases shouldn't exceed 1.5 times the Consumer Price Index in accordance with the bill (S6242) introduced by Senator Julia Salazar being strongly considered in the Albany legislature. Based on that committee determined that the max suggested increase on a 2 year should not exceed 3.3% this year. The high end of the proposed range exceeds this by 0.45%.
Vote: 4 Committee Members, 1 Public Member, 4 Community Members (No opposed, No abstentions)

3. Guide to Structuring Tenant Organizations

Presentation given by Cheryl Pahaham & Nancy Preston of Northern Manhattan Community Land Trust (NMCLT)

- Ayisha expressed the importance of creating tenant organizations in our district so as to help CB12 be more aware of the impacts residents are experience where Housing is concerned. She talked about how often matters go unreported and residents go without the resources or tools that can help them. One such example is the case of the residential building which the 215th street location of Carrot Top was located. The building went without gas for over a year and members of CB12 found out only a month before Carrot Top was to leave the premises due to the impact. The street at 215th Street was renamed in honor of Carrot Tops founder Renee Mancino previously after her passing. This lack of oversight is something that needs to be addressed and creating Tenant Organizations is a vital step in that process. For that reason NMCLT was invited to share what they had learned about best practices.
- 2 documents were shared with the Committee and reviewed:
 - a. Tenant Organizing Manual <http://bit.ly/2WXBtgF>
 - b. Organize a Tenant Association (NMCLT)
- Cheryl & Nancy shared how these tools are helping them in building the following and leadership for NMCLT and that they intend to continue to do so as the progress toward the goal of establishing a community land trust.
- Some discussion was had about best practices as shown in the materials: i.e.: approaching neighbors in person & one-on-one to garner interest, recruit members and understand issues they may be facing.

4. New Federal Rules on Trans Genders in Shelters

- Board Member Daryl Cochrane reached out to Ayisha requesting that the committee review the New Federal Rules on Trans Genders in Shelters where the goal is to make it easier for Shelter providers to discriminate and create barriers for trans genders to be housed in shelters receiving federal funding. Email was read to committee suggesting possible resolution
- New Federal Rules on Trans Genders in Shelters
<https://www.reginfo.gov/public/do/eAgendaViewRule?pubId=201904&RIN=2506-AC53>
- Upon review Naysha Diaz informed committee that NYC created special protections setting Trans genders as protected class.
- Committee debated as to whether this rule change would pose any threat to Transgender individuals located in NYC. Based on how the rule is worded committee reached consensus that any the protections that have been implemented already serve the purpose of restricting targeting as is set out in the rule and that any person attempting to target transgender individuals would have to seek remedy by challenging NYC law in higher courts.

5. Protections and Support for Immigrants

Presentation given by Andrew Garcia of New Sanctuary Coalition

- Andrew Garcia appeared before the committee based on the arrangement by Denise Rickles a CB12 community member who works with New Sanctuary Coalition. The Coalition is a key

organization advocating for, supporting and providing legal assistance to refugees, undocumented immigrants and released detainees. NSC also provides trainings to community members that want to get involved.

- NCS primary goal in reaching out to CB12 is related to the impending threat coming from the Federal government that individuals from the aforementioned populations will be sent to sanctuary cities en masse. In fact groups have already been sent to NYC and neighboring states recently.
- Some individuals in this circumstance are dropped in the middle of nowhere with no knowledge of where they are and with nowhere to go.
- Considering that these threats are continuous NCS believes it is an urgent necessity to build a coalition of human services CBO's/Agencies and community members that can develop a plan of action in the event something like this were to take place in the near future.
- Ariel Miranda suggested a resolution asking for an emergency fund be created to allow for expeditious planning and future access to resources in regards to the above stated goal. The resolution passed unanimously.

6. New Business

None discussed.

7. Adjournment