Community Board 12, Manhattan General Meeting December 18, 2018 Alianza Dominicana Triangle Building 530 W. 166th Street, Second floor 6:30 P.M.

Board Members Present: Richard Allman; Shahabuddeen Ally; Francisco Alvarez; Mary Anderson; Glennis Aquino; Wayne Benjamin; James Berlin; Tanya Bonner; Eleazar Bueno; Daryl Cochrane; Robin Cruz; Waldys Cruz; Gerard Dengel; Katherine Diaz; Domingo Estevez; Gabriela Estrella; Fe Florimon; Barbara Frazier; Mitchell Glenn; Bianca Guerrero; Fern Hertzberg; Danielle Jettoo; Osi Kaminer; Elizabeth Lehmann; Richard R. Lewis; Matthew Levy; Elizabeth Lorris Ritter; Francisco Lopez; Nicholas Martinez; Noquel Matos; Isidro Medina; Ariel Miranda; Rud Morales; Deborah Nabavian; Jonathan Nunez-Frometa; Ayisha Ogilvie; Mary O'Shaughnessy; Bruce Robertson; Edgar Roman; Steve Simon; Christopher Ventura; Curtis Young

Board Members Absent: Sara Fisher; Yosef Kalinsky; Maria Luna; Jay Mazur; Jonathan Reyes; Luis Tapia; Karen Taylor;

Board Members Absent - Excused: Naysha Diaz;

Staff: Ebenezer Smith; Paola Garcia; Ely Silvestre

<u>Call To Order</u>: Chair Shah Ally called the meeting to order at 6:47 pm. He welcomes everyone. Quorum is attained. Agenda is adopted. Last month's minutes adopted.

Chairman's Report: Shah Ally's report covered the following topics:

- The Chair Invites Sergeant Shevitz and Officer Batz of the NYPD Transit Bureau to speak. They discussed:
 - The 168 Street 1 train impending closure.
 - Phone snatching is on the rise.
 - Stay awake while riding the subway.
- The Chair invites John Greenfield of Yeshiva University up to speak. He mentioned:
 - December is basketball season. He offered the assembled a reminder none needed that last year the Maccabees made the NCAAs.
 - He listed upcoming events.
 - He offered congratulations to Chair Ally on his election to the judicial bench.
- Tonight is the Chair's last meeting as Chair and he will be resigning from the board shortly.
 - He invited his wife Alicia and son Ryan up to join him in saying goodbye.
- He invited up Councilmember Ydanis Rodriguez to say a few words. The Councilman covered the following topics:
 - Congratulations to Chair Ally on a successful tenure.
 - He listed upcoming events.
 - The Anchor Park Project renovation of Highbridge Park groundbreaking is Thursday December 20.
 - A commercial tenant's rights bill sponsored by the Councilman is making progress in getting through the council and becoming law.
 - A bill to transfer control of Hart's Island, containing the largest cemetery in the country, to the Parks Dept., is moving forward.
- He invited up Councilmember Mark Levine for a few words. The Councilman covered the following topics:
 - Congratulations to Chair Ally on a successful tenure.
 - The Council Health Committee passed a bill to support the state Single Payer Health System plan.
 - Reacting to the deal to bring Amazon's "HQ2" to Long Island City, the Council is putting pressure on Amazon and the Mayor to learn the details and tilt the benefits of the project toward the residents of the city.

- There's a bill currently being negotiated in the Council to create a law to force landlords to provide a rent history to every new rent stabilized tenant. Councilman Levine supports this measure.
- After the District Manager's report, Councilmember Levine returned to the lectern to present Chair Ally with a proclamation from the City Council praising his 3 year tenure as CB12 Chair. Chair Ally expressed his appreciation.

<u>District Manager's Report</u>: Ebenezer Smith's report covered the following topics:

- Thanks to Paola and Ely for running the office so well while the DM was on vacation.
- He listed upcoming events.

Pubic Speakers Session:

Neile Weissman – GW Bridge Bike Lanes. The Port Authority's bike lane plans are inadequate and need to be changed. The plans currently include signs to ask riders to dismount when traveling over the bridge, which is clearly inadequate.

Dr. Gary Altheim – Growth and Development Services (GDS). This is a program that was started in 2002. It provides free support to emotionally challenged youth, and is based at the 168 Street Armory. He has asked CB12 a number of times for help with GDS's social justice initiatives and to better our community. So far, he claims, the board has done nothing.

Kelsey DePalo – Principal, Washington Heights Success Academy charter school. She spoke about Resolution A and how the school has partnered with city agencies to address traffic concerns around the school. She invites people to attend the next CB12 Public Safety committee meeting to learn more.

Paul Hintersteiner - Happy holidays to all!

Alberto Aquino – Director of Youth Programs for the Armory Foundation. He spoke to publicize programs that run at the Armory. He is available to answer questions about the program and to get people involved.

Jama Toung – A parent of students at Washington Heights Success Academy. Speaking as a parent she is comfortable with the level of safety around the school during arrival and pickup times.

Daryl Cochrane – NYC Commission on Human Rights. Listed an upcoming event.

Fern Hertzberg – Executive Director of ARC XVI Fort Washington Senior Center. The center signed a lease to move into 516 West 181 Street in March. The landlord will be funding much of the construction work. She thanks the Board for support provided in making this transition happen.

Ronald Edelstein – Resolution 15. He is the landlord at 1 Nagle Avenue, and is speaking in support of the new Latin Jazz club Rican that will be moving into this space.

Keily Concepcion – Resolutions 9 and 10. She supports this establishment (Taboga) and noted that a barber shop is being added.

Vanessa Guerrero – Resolutions 9 and 10. Speaking in Spanish, and as an employee of Taboga, she is here to support the establishment.

Diana Vazquez – Resolutions 9 and 10. As an employee of Taboga, she supports these resolutions. She spoke in support of working families in our community.

Graham Ciraulo – regarding tonight's CB12 elections, he asks all candidates to pledge not to be frightened by what he considers to be the intimidator tactics of elected officials.

Reimy Soto Mateo –He speaks in support of resolutions 9 and 10.

Donna Leary – Lives near Washington Heights Success Academy on Ft Washington Avenue. The school may be safe, but the neighborhood is very adversely affected. Double and triple parking occurs during drop off and pickup periods. A petition with over 200 signatures is submitted to show community concern about this situation.

Unidentified - Lives near Washington Heights Success Academy, complained about the congestion and danger caused by illegal parking at the school.

Liz Evans – Washington Heights Corner Project. The Corner Project organization is a long-time presence in our community, working successfully to reduce drug overdoses. She asks for community support to help continue their efforts.

Coach Dave Crenshaw – He speaks in praise and remembrance of former CB12 member Obie Bing. Coach also discussed the successes of the Armory Youth Programs.

Timothy Harrell – Civilian Complaint Review Board. The NYC CCRB is the nation's largest independent oversight agency of the largest police force in the country. It investigates incidents of complaints against the NYPD. The CCRB will be holding meetings in our neighborhood. Please get involved.

Sara Fisher – Friends of Inwood Hill Park. She spoke on the upcoming Mulchfest 2019.

Angelina Fernandez – Executive Director, Northern Manhattan Coalition for Immigrant Rights. She spoke on NMCIR's programs and asked for support. Nmcir.org.

Tribute to Chair Shah Ally:

- Matthew Levy, Chair of this section of the meeting, invites up Betty Lehmann and Richard Allman to speak about the legacy of Chair Shah Ally.
- Richard Allman then invites up District Manager Ebenezer Smith to speak.
 - o He provides an appreciation of the Chair's management of the office, and his trust in the staff.
 - He hands the Chair a gift.
- Betty Lehmann goes to the mic to invite up the Executive Committee for a last photographic opportunity with Shah Ally.
- Debbie Nabavian hands Chair Ally a gift from the Executive Committee, for his new dog Fido.
- Richard Allman invites up Laurie Tobias Cohen, from the office of Congressman Adriano Espaillat.
 - Ms. Cohen reads a proclamation drafted by the Congressman's office which discussed the Chair's professional career and celebrates his tenure as CB12 Chair.
- Rosie Mendez of Borough President Gale Brewer's office is invited up to give tribute. Colleague Natalie Espino then adds warm comments, as well.
- Councilmember Ydanis Rodriguez speaks in tribute to Chair Ally.
- State Senator-elect Robert Jackson is invited up. He congratulates Chair Ally.
- Richard Allman speaks on behalf of Assemblywoman Carmen DelaRosa in praising Chair Ally, and hands him a proclamation from the Assemblywoman.
- Betty Lehmann invites all present to enjoy a special thank you cake from noted local bakeshop Carrot Top in the Chair's honor.

 \sim

Nominating Committee: Matthew Levy, Chair, opened the General Election portion of the meeting. He first explained the ground rules for the election:

- Candidates will have 3 minutes to speak.
- A question period will follow. Questions for candidates must have been submitted in advance of this meeting to the nominating committee. Both board members and the public were invited to submit questions.
- Each board member will receive a ballot with their name on it. Every ballot must be signed to be counted.
- Winners must receive votes from half of board members present plus one. A runoff may occur if no one gains a winning number of votes.
- Blank ballots are negative votes.
- Voting is public. Anyone can inspect the ballots at the community board office beginning the day after the vote.
- Speeches given by the candidates will not be recounted here.
- The candidates list:
 - Treasurer
 - Gerard Dengel
 - Sara Fisher
 - Assistant Secretary
 - Betty Lehmann
 - Secretary
 - Mitchell Glenn
 - o 2nd Vice Chair
 - Isidro Medina
 - Domingo Estevez
 - Daryl Cochrane
 - 1st Vice Chair
 - Eleazar Bueno
 - **Chair**
 - Richard Lewis
 - Elizabeth Lorris Ritter
- Questions for the candidates, with their answers in brief:
 - o Treasurer:
 - What are the duties of the office?
 - Sara Fisher to make sure that money is spent well. Learn from what other community boards are doing better. We must challenge each other to do more, whether treasurer or not.
 - Gerard Dengel there are budgets to be managed. Best practices must be applied to expenditures. I will assist Ebenezer and the staff.
 - How will you create greater transparency on how funds are used?
 - Gerard have open conversations with staff to learn about budget challenges. Invite others to participate board members and others.
 - Sara I will publicize the budget in the community, and also make it available in translation.
 - Secretary and Assistant Secretary
 - What are the duties of the office?
 - Betty Lehmann to take notes and to support the Secretary.
 - Mitch Glenn to take notes and to support the Assistant Secretary.
 - 2nd Vice Chair:
 - What are the duties of the office?
 - Isidro Medina to take over for the 1st Vice Chair when not available.
 - Daryl Cochrane the same. Also, to advocate for all board members with the community.

- Domingo Estevez Hold board members accountable for their roles. Support the 1st
 Vice Chair and the Chair.
- What do you see your role as related to the chair and the board as a whole?
 - Isidro I will begin by sitting with the Chair to establish a relationship. Will seek to promote members, which does not happen often enough.
 - Daryl to act as an advocate for the board members. To learn about underserved communities and bring their needs to the attention of the board.
 - Domingo in agreement with the prior speakers. Work to create initiatives with stakeholders on the board and in the community.
- 1st Vice Chair
 - What are the duties of the office?
 - Eleazar Bueno to take over when the Chair is not available.
 - What do you see your role as related to the chair and the board as a whole?
 - Eleazar Being the voice for the small businessman.
- o Chair -
 - What are the duties of the office?
 - Liz Ritter to be the CEO, the cheerleader, to represent the community and the Board. And to be collegial.
 - Richard Lewis agreed. And to go to several meetings within the community and with City Agencies. Getting things done for the board in an efficient way.
 - Are you able to put aside biases and remain objective in dealings with the elected officials?
 - Richard I have no connections to elected officials. I do have relations to community-based organizations.
 - Liz I have good relationships with our elected officials but have at times clashed with them. I do not think I will have trouble dealing with the elected officials in working for the community.
 - Do you feel a person's temperament is important in dealing with the Board?
 - Liz you know I'm not always placid. I am always honest and fair. I try to be my best self but perhaps am not always successful. Respecting fellow colleagues is important.
 - Richard honest and fair is my hallmark and my life. You can depend on me to support you and as chair I will protect you.
 - How can you assure us that meetings will be run in a fair and efficient way?
 - Richard we have to work toward fair and efficient meetings.
 - Liz I have experience running contentious meetings successfully and will thus be able to do so in the future.
 - Public education is in crisis, yet we work independently of the CDC District 6 office. How would you change this process?
 - Liz I have 2 children who went to public schools here. There is much to do around oversight and support of the CDC and I look forward to working closely with the CDC.
 - Richard a former high school teacher, I am aware of the complexities of the school system. I recommend that we avoid tampering too much with this system, because who will deal with it when the system fails.
- The voting begins. There is a pause in the meeting.
 Vote Results:

Position	Candidate	Vote Totals
Treasurer		
	Gerard Dengel	26
	Sara Fisher	18
Assistant Secretary		
	Betty Lehmann	44
Secretary		
	Mitchell Glenn	44

2 nd Vice Chair		
	Isidro Medina	26
	Domingo Estevez	15
	Daryl Cochrane	eliminated for run off
1 st Vice Chair		
	Eleazar Bueno	44
Chair		
	Richard Lewis	29
	Elizabeth Lorris Ritter	15

Government Officials:

Natalie Espino, Community Liaison to the Borough President

- Community Board 12 membership is now at full capacity (50).
- Community Board applications are out. Please be sure to reapply if your 2 year term is up in April.
- Listed upcoming events.
- BP cultural grant applications now being accepted.
- The BP Office is always available to help tenants whose landlord is not providing heat or hot water.
- With the impending closing of the 168 Street 1 train station, the BP is advocating for full shuttle bus service between 168 Street and the 1 train 157 Street and 181 Street stations.

Laurie Tobias Cohen, Community Liaison in Congressman Adriano Espaillat's office

• Ms. Tobias spoke briefly during the tribute to Chair Ally section of the meeting. See above.

Richard Allman, Office of NYS Assembly member Carmen de la Rosa

• Mr. Allman spoke briefly during the tribute to Chair Ally section of the meeting. See above.

Manuel Belliard, Councilman Mark Levine

• He is always appreciated for his brevity at our meetings.

Orlando Ovalles - Office of NYS Assembly member Carmen de la Rosa

- Listed past and upcoming events and bills that the Assembly member is advocating for in Albany.
- The Assemblyperson wanted to be here for our year end meeting, but is extremely busy.

Darlene Bruce of Assemblyman Al Taylor's office

- A special citation is presented to Chair Ally from the Assemblyman to celebrate his tenure at CB12.
- Two other proclamations are handed to Chair Ally.
 - o In memory of former CB12 member Obie Bing
 - o In memory of former CB12 member Pamela Palangue North

Assemblyman Al Taylor

- The Assembly Member expresses appreciation for the tenure of Chair Ally.
- Wishes all a Happy holidays.

Carlos Rodriguez – State Controller Tom DiNapoli's Office.

- He speaks about the New York Able program, for every family with a member who has a disability. About the program:
 - It encourages and assists individuals and families to save private funds in accounts in the program to support individuals with disabilities to maintain health, independence and quality of life.

- o It is intended to supplement, but not supplant, benefits provided through Medicaid, SSI, SSDI, private insurance and other sources.
- It is exempt from tax on its earnings and distributions, provided the funds are used to pay for qualified disability expenses.
- o For more information see https://osc.state.ny.us/savings/able.htm

Committee Reports:

Land Use - Chair Wayne Benjamin discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Parks & Cultural Affairs – Chair Liz Ritter discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Traffic & Transportation, Chair Debbie Nabavian discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

- 1/5/19 is the day that the shutdown of the 168 Street 1 train station begins.
- Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Public Safety: Chair Richard Lewis discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

• Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Health & Environment: Chair Steve Simon discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Business Development: Chair Eleazar Bueno discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Housing & Human Services: –Chair Ayisha Ogilvie discussed the following in review of the work of the Committee this past month:

- Review of the January meeting agenda.
- She thanks Barbara Frazier for her help as Assistant Chair.
- Refer to the committee minutes for details.

Concerns of the Aging and **Youth and Education** Committees – Chairs Mary Anderson and Fe Florimon appear together, and make the following points:

- Happy holidays.
- They recount a joint event and entertainment program at Isabella that occurred last month. They offer thanks to Isabella for use of the space and for support of the program.

Resolution Reports:

Resolution A - Resolution regarding Traffic & Safety Conditions Associated with Student Drop-Off & Pick-Up Procedures at the Washington Heights Success Academy.

Richard Lewis, Chair, Public Safety, and Debbie Nabavian, Chair, Traffic & Transportation, begin the discussion:

- The resolution is sponsored jointly because this issue is both an enforcement (Public Safety) and Traffic and Transportation issue.
- The Washington Heights Success Academy is a charter school that's been open less than 5 years.
- The school is based at the former Mother Cabrini location on Fort Washington Avenue and 190th Street.
- Grades K-4 attend school there. Originally, the school was represented as being for older children.
- Complaints have grown as the school has increased in size to 500. And it will grow larger.
- The problem is that students arrive in cars, completely blocking the street and creating unsafe conditions and inconvenience for local residents.
- The school is a charter school, and thus has both public and private funding sources.
- The resolution asks that the school cover the costs of managing the safety and congestion issues caused by the school during drop-off and pickup periods. The cost should not be borne by city taxpayers.
- A conversation ensues:
 - o Liz Ritter recommends a vote in favor.
 - Ayisha Oglivie points to the parallel discussion a few months back on the Haven Avenue Plaza, where these car related issues were dismissed.
 - Steve Simon suggested that the DOE should be involved in this issue. Chair Nabavian accepted this recommendation as a friendly amendment.
 - Danielle Jettoo suggests, with Shah Ally's help, that the resolution should state that the school should reimburse the costs of NYPD efforts in managing these problems.
 - Chair Ally suggests that the school has a history of not be communicative with the neighborhood residents.

Resolution B - Resolution regarding Termination of Concession Agreements with Manhattan River Group LLC at La Marina, and Revocation of its SLA Liquor License.

Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Chair, Parks & Cultural Affairs, begins the discussion:

- She states that everyone present is aware of the tangled history of this establishment.
- The resolution calls for terminating La Marina's concession agreement and revoking their liquor license.
- Comments:
 - Sara Fisher disagrees on the existence in the resolution of references to La Marina's preferential treatment of non-profit organizations.
 - o Barbara Frazier suggests a friendly amendment that will be incorporated.
 - Ayisha Oglivie suggests stronger language about the need to provide public bathrooms in any future concession agreement.

Licensing Committee Resolutions

Chair Isidro Medina opened the discussion. Highlights of the discussion follow:

- Agenda item 15 is being changed to Objection from no objection. Proper documentation agreed to at the meeting was not submitted before the general meeting.
- Steve Simon notes a typo in the last whereas in Resolution 5. The NYPD did not have an objection, and the resolution will be corrected. He also noted an issue in the minutes based on the applicant's submissions that seemed incorrect. This, in the end, did not influence the committee for various reasons accounted for by committee member Gerard Dengel.

Voting on the Resolutions:

Item #	<u>Resolutions</u>	<u>Voting:</u> <u>Y-N-Abst-</u> <u>Absent-NV</u>	<u>Result</u>
А	Resolution regarding Traffic & Safety Conditions Associated with Student Drop-Off & Pick-Up Procedures at the Washington Heights Success Academy.	42-0-0-0	Passed

В	Resolution regarding Termination of Concession Agreements with Manhattan River Group LLC at La Marina, and Revocation of its SLA Liquor License.	39-0-0-2-1	Passed
1	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Pipo Pool Inc. – 582 West 183 rd St. (at the corner of Saint Nicholas)	41-1-0-0-0	Passed
2	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: The Monkey Room Inc. dba Monkey Room – 589 Fort Washington Avenue, Store 1 (at the corner of W. 187 th St.)	40-1-1-0-0	Passed
3	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Euro el Tina Restaurant Lounge and Billiards Corp. – 500 W. 207 St. (at the corner of 10 th Avenue)	40-1-1-0-0	Passed
4	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Punto de Sabor Inc. – 1464 Saint Nicholas Avenue (btw W. 183 rd St. & W. 184 th St.)		Withdra wn
5	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Renewal of its On-Premise Liquor License to: Sol's Restaurant Corp. dba IL Sole Restaurant – 229-233 Dyckman St. (btw Broadway & Seaman Avenue)	38-3-1-0-0	Passed
6	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Corporate Change of its License to: Gabriel Xpress Rest. Corp. dba Caribe Restaurant – 1562 Saint Nicholas Avenue (at the corner of W. 188 th St.) Adding a Principal onto license	41-0-1-0-0	Passed
7	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to: Gabriel Xpress Rest. Corp. dba Caribe Restaurant – 1562 Saint Nicholas Avenue (at the corner of W. 188 th St.) To Include DJ, Karaoke and Live Music	37-4-1-0-0	Passed
8	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to: Sol's Restaurant Corp. dba IL Sole Restaurant – 229-233 Dyckman St. (btw Broadway & Seaman Avenue) To Include Live Music, DJ and Security Guard	36-5-1-0-0	Passed
9	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Method of Operation Change of its License to: Eat @ Sherman Creek Inc. dba Taboga – 421 W. 202 nd St. (btw 9 th & 10 th Avenues) Adding DJ, Live Acoustic Performance and Promoters	31-9-2-0-0	Passed
10	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Alteration of its License to: Eat @ Sherman Creek Inc. dba Taboga – 421 W. 202 nd St. (btw 9 th & 10 th Avenues) Relocate the Restroom, include a Barbershop within the Premises and add 2 Pool Tables	32-8-2-0-0	Passed
11	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA Alteration of its License to: Sol's Restaurant Corp. dba IL Sole Restaurant – 229-233 Dyckman St. (btw Broadway & Seaman Avenue) Relocate the Bar from the right side of Premise to the Left side	38-3-1-0-0	Passed
12	Resolution of No Objection to the DCA Renewal of its Unenclosed Sidewalk Café License to: 600 West 169 th St. Rest. Inc. dba Coogans – 4015 Broadway (at the corner of W. 169 th St.)	40-1-1-0-0	Passed
13	Resolution of No Objection to the NYC Department of Consumer Affairs New Unenclosed Sidewalk Café to: Boxers Washington Heights LLC. dba Boxers – 3820 Broadway (at the corner of W. 159 th St.)	35-6-1-0-0	Passed
14	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA New On-Premises Liquor License to: Barrel 79 LLC. dba TBD – 79 Audubon Avenue (btw W. 169 th St. W. 170 th St.)	39-2-1-0-0	Passed
15	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA New On-Premises Liquor License to: Rican dba Rican – 1 Nagle Avenue (at the corner of Hillside Avenue)	40-0-2-0-0	Passed
16	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA New On-Premises Liquor License to: El Mambi Steakhouse Corp. dba TBD – 4181 Broadway (at the corner of W. 177 th St.)	36-4-2-0-0	Passed
17	Resolution of No Objection to the SLA New On-Premises Liquor License to: Dos Mares Seafood & Lounge Corp. dba Dos Mares Restaurant & Lounge – 25 Sherman Ave, Store #2 (btw Sickles & Arden Sts.)	34-5-3-0-0	Passed

Motion to Adjourn- passed and seconded at 10:50 pm.

Respectfully submitted: Mitchell Glenn, Secretary Elizabeth (Betty) Lehmann, Assistant Secretary

December 18	3, 2018	3
-------------	---------	---