

# LAND USE COMMITTEE / PUBLIC HEARING

## MEETING MINUTES

December 4, 2013

### Committee Members Present

Wayne Benjamin, Chair  
Anita Barberis, Asst. Chair  
James Berlin  
Dulce Bueno  
Tamara Rivera  
Jason Miller  
Steve Simon

### Committee Members Absent

Isaiah Bing

### Board Members Present

Elizabeth Lehman  
Edith Prentiss

### Public Member Present

Vivian Ducat

### Public Member Absent

Staff: Ebenezer Smith

**Guests:** Nathaniel Montgomery- South Bronx Overall Economic Development Corporation (SoBro), Victor Body Lawson- Body Lawson Architects, Jeffrey Chester- Gonzalez, Saggio & Harlan LLP, Movimiento Misionero Mundial, Inc. – Pastor Ismael Trinidad, Kenia Polanco, Christopher A. Matos, Stueben Proctor, Denis Kolasinke, Sefkya Vucetoric, Roy Isaacs, Theodore Jefferson, Rajin Hill, Fermin Iglesias, G. Perez, Rita Gorman, Maximo Collado, Osi Kamindir, D. Gordon, Jeffrey Oppenheimer, 99 Hillside Avenue, M. Meagher, M. Domenech, Christopher Pellot, Patrick John McMahon, Tiara Shirley, Harry Mikedos, Paul McGrath, Mike Gross, Bill Crandell, Tyron Dalton, Ulysses Lawrence, Michael Wade, Conroi Rollins, Pastor Willie Lopez-Manhattan Bible Church

- 
1. The Meeting was called to order at 7:15 PM. Land Use Committee (“Land Use” or the “Committee”) Chair Wayne Benjamin began the meeting by welcoming committee members, board members, public members and guests. The Chairman announced the agenda stating that Committee is hosting a Public Hearing to consider application number 227-13-BZ (the “Application”) submitted to the Board of Standards and Appeals (“BSA”) in September 2013 by the South Bronx Overall Economic Development Corporation (“SoBro”) for a proposed project (the “Project”) located at 1769 Fort George Hill. Mr. Benjamin proceeded to explain that the Project does not conform to zoning and requires multiple zoning variances in order to be constructed. He also explained the public hearing process and stated the Committee’s decision on the Application is not official until the full board votes at the General Meeting of the Board to be held on Tuesday, December 17, 2013.
  2. Nathaniel Montgomery, Vice President of SoBro explained the property is a narrow crescent shape vacant parcel on Fort George Avenue that slopes steeply downward towards Dyckman Street. The site is adjacent to the uptown platform and track of the IRT #1 subway, is approximately 21,686 square feet, is zoned R7-2 and is currently used for parking. Mr. Montgomery stated that

SoBro purchased the site from Movimiento Misionero Mundial, Inc. (the “Church”) in 2007. He also stated that it is virtually impossible to develop anything on the site given physical challenges and current zoning regulations. . The below chart summarizes what can be built as-of-right on the site to SoBro’s proposal for the Project.

	Zoning Regulation “As of Right”	SoBro Proposal
F.A.R.	4.0	7.26
Stories	7 stories	12 Floors
Total Building Height	80’-0”	146’-1”
Total Buildable Square Feet	81,584	148,255
Rear Yard	20 feet	10 feet
Units	68	125
Parking	63	44
Community Space	n/a	Church

Victor Body Lawson of Body Lawson Architects (the “Architect”) made a Power Point presentation to the Committee regarding the details of the Project. The presentation included renderings of the building interior and exterior, a stacking plan, floor plans, shadow studies and images of the neighborhood context. SoBro proposes to redevelop the site as a 12-story, 148,225 square foot building containing 125 units of housing, approximately 10,000 square feet of space for the Church and 44 parking spaces. The Project’s development costs are estimated at \$48 million.

Following the comments made by SoBro and the Architect, Chairman Benjamin, Committee members and members of the Public posed various questions concerning the Project. Key questions and responses are outlined below.

- What is the unit and affordability breakdown for the Project? (*see chart*)

Units	40% AMI (20% of Units)	\$ per mo.	60% AMI (32% of Units)	\$ per mo.	100% AMI (29% of Units)	\$ per mo.	130% AMI (19% of Units)	\$ per mo.
Studio	10	\$474	5	\$751	5	\$1,000	2	\$1,350
1 bedroom	10	\$511	20	\$808	10	\$1,300	11	\$1,750
2 bedroom	10	\$623	10	\$979	6	\$1,600	10	\$2,100
3 bedroom	10	\$715	5	\$1,127	5	\$1,900	1	\$2,500

- Has SoBro secured funding for the project? *No, it has not finalized financial funding*
- Is it possible to consider an ADA compliant ramp that would allow people to gain access to the Dyckman Street Station heading Northbound? *No firm commitment was made but it was indicated that the matter would be considered.*
- How are the contractors chosen for the project? Will consideration be given to local businesses and residents? *All construction contracts will be handled through a bid process, “everyone has the opportunity to be part of the project”*

- Will the project be constructed with union labor? *No clear answer was provided; reference made to the open bid process.*
- Is there a plan for M/WBE participation? *No clear answer was provided.*
- Why does the unit distribution contain so many small units?
- Will the units be permanently affordable? *No, units are expected to be affordable for up to 50 years, depending of requirements of regulatory agreement of financing, which is expected to be provided HPD and/or HDC.*

Pastor Trinidad commented on the Church's programs and stated that the Church expects to operate an 80 to 85-slot day care facility out of its new space. The Committee asked if public funding for the day care slots has been approved or allocated and was advised that it has not.

Jeffrey Chester, legal counsel to SoBro for the BSA application also commented on the project, the BSA application and the requested zoning variances.

After further discussion a motion was made by Jim Berlin and seconded by Anita Barberis to NOT support the Application for zoning variances submitted to the Board of Standard and Appeals for the Project as it is currently proposed. **The motion passed based on the following votes.**

	<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>
Committee Members:	7	0	1
Board Members:	0	0	0
Members of the Public:	2	0	0

After listening to the results of the vote, Mr. Chester requested that the Committee detail in its resolution why it did not support the Application.

3. The Meeting adjourned at 9:20 PM.

Respectfully submitted by Jason Miller and Wayne Benjamin

**Community Board 12 Licensing Committee**

*Minutes, December 11, 2013*

**Committee Members Present:** Aldemar Diaz (Chair); Shah Ally; Anina Young; Angela Sanchez; Michael Diaz

**Committee Members Excused:** Edith Prentiss

**Committee Members Absent:** Rolando Cespedes, Maceo Raysor, Ulises Noboa

**CB12 Members Present:** Richard Lewis

**CB12 Staff Members Present:**

**Community Members Present:**

---

**A. Welcome and Opening Remarks:** Aldemar Diaz, Committee Chair

**B. State Liquor Authority Renewal Licenses:**

*On-Premises Liquor License*

1. Hallacas Corp. dba Juniors Taco - 253-257 Sherman Avenue, (at the corner of Isham Street.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Maria Taveras
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Mexican Fast Food
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	7 days a week, 2pm-2am, Last call at 1am
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	12 tables/ 24 chairs/2couches
<b>Music</b>	ipod
<b>Security Cameras</b>	4 (3 inside, 1 outside)
<b>Security Personnel</b>	None
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes
<b>Employees</b>	4
<b>Capacity</b>	40
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	1
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	A
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	No objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	Council member Rodriguez does not oppose application
<b>Stipulations</b>	None
<b>Notes</b>	
<b>Committee Vote</b>	5/0/0

2. International Drink Group Inc. dba Buddha Beer Bar - 4476 Broadway, (bet. Fairview Ave & W. 192nd St.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	<b>No vote taken. This applicant appeared in error, as the Committee voted to renew this license in October 2013.</b>
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	
<b>Music</b>	
<b>Security Cameras</b>	
<b>Security Personnel</b>	
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	
<b>Employees</b>	
<b>Capacity</b>	
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	
<b>Community Comments</b>	
<b>Stipulations</b>	
<b>Notes</b>	
<b>Committee Vote</b>	

***Restaurant Wine License***

3. La Caridad Restaurant #2 - 2092 Amsterdam Avenue, (bet. W. 163rd & W. 164th Streets.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	<b>No vote taken. This license will not expire until 2014.</b>
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	
<b>Music</b>	
<b>Security Cameras</b>	
<b>Security Personnel</b>	
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	
<b>Employees</b>	
<b>Capacity</b>	
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	
<b>Community Comments</b>	
<b>Stipulations</b>	
<b>Notes</b>	
<b>Committee Vote</b>	

4. Bijaru Coffee Shop Restaurant - 4032 10th Avenue, (at the corner of W. 215th Street.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Maria Conlon – David Hernandez
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Restaurant – Spanish food
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	Mon – Thurs 5am – 12am and Fri & Sun 5am -2 am
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	4 tables/16 chairs/5 counter stools
<b>Music</b>	Juke box/ipod
<b>Security Cameras</b>	6 cameras
<b>Security Personnel</b>	None
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes – Ramp for front entrance
<b>Employees</b>	6
<b>Capacity</b>	30
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	1
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	No objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	
<b>Stipulations</b>	
<b>Notes</b>	(1) Application for renewal for restaurant wine and beer license; (2) Business is in the process of corporate name change; (3) Owner provided new lease; (4) Committee to contact precinct regarding corporate change. (5) 1) council member Rodriguez has no objection to the renewal and (2) Council member Rodriguez reserves opinion on corporate name change.  <b>UPDATE: An application for a license renewal (not a corporate change) was submitted to the Board sometime in November, but was not scheduled for consideration by the Licensing Committee until December. In the interim, the 30-day Community Board input period expired and the SLA approved the application. Therefore, no vote is required and the corresponding resolution has been withdrawn from the General Meeting agenda.</b>
<b>Committee Vote</b>	Two resolutions: (1) renewal 3/1/1 and (2) corporate name change: 1/1/3

*Eating Place Beer License*

5. Elsa La Reina Del Chicharron - 4840 Broadway, (at the corner of Academy Street.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Elsa Mejia
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Restaurant – Latin food
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	9a -10pm. Last call is 10pm. Alcohol starts at noon
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	9 chairs
<b>Music</b>	CDs

<b>Security Cameras</b>	8 -
<b>Security Personnel</b>	None
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	No
<b>Employees</b>	8
<b>Capacity</b>	25
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	1
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	A
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	No objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	None
<b>Stipulations</b>	None
<b>Notes</b>	
<b>Committee Vote</b>	5/0/0

***Corporate Change License***

6. A&J Lounge LLC. dba Uptown Social - 186 Dyckman Street, (at the corner of Vermilyea Avenue.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Yamil Martinez – Representative
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Sports Bar – American Food
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	5pm – 2am Mon – Thurs and 5pm -4am Friday & Sat. Last all is 3:30a on Frid and Sat. Mon-Thurs. is 1”;30a
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	75 seats
<b>Music</b>	Ipod
<b>Security Cameras</b>	14 ( 2 outside and 12 inside)
<b>Security Personnel</b>	4, Thurs. – Sun (all NYS licensed)
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes
<b>Employees</b>	20
<b>Capacity</b>	75
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	Entrance and side door
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	C
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	No objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	(1) Community member voices concerns regarding noise. Noted that business has been open later than 2am on Mon – Thurs. (2) resident ask for proper sound proofing of the establishment
<b>Stipulations</b>	None
<b>Notes</b>	(1) Applicant requests a corporate change. One of the principals is being removed. License is under Alex Ramos. He will be removed. Erica Blass will remain on the license solely. (2) Method of operation remains the same.
<b>Committee Vote</b>	3/1/1

**C. State Liquor Authority New Licenses:**

***On-Premise Liquor License***

7. Sugary Goddess dba Arka Lounge - 4488 Broadway, (at the corner of W. 192nd Street.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Christina Perez
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Lounge – Latin Cuisine
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	Mon. – Sun. from 4pm to 4am.
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	74 chairs and 21 tables
<b>Music</b>	DJ and live music. Live music on the weekends starting at 9pm (for events)
<b>Security Cameras</b>	20 cameras – placed throughout the premises. 2 outside and 18 inside.
<b>Security Personnel</b>	4-5, licensed by NYS. Working Friday through Sunday
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes
<b>Employees</b>	17
<b>Capacity</b>	74
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	2 fire exits, located at the front of the business
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	Pending
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	34 <sup>th</sup> precinct – no objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	(1) Resident wants to know what business owner will do for noise control?
<b>Stipulations</b>	None
<b>Notes</b>	(1) New owner is buying name and method of operation; (2) Council Member Rodriguez wants to meet with owner prior to the general meeting.
<b>Committee Vote</b>	5/0/0

***Restaurant Wine License***

8. La Barca Restaurant Inc. - 3892 Broadway, (bet. W. 162nd & W. 163rd Streets.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	Aureliano Olivares
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Restaurant – Spanish food
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	7 days a week – 24 hours. Alcohol from noon to 2am
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	6 tables/12 chairs/8 benches
<b>Music</b>	Ipod
<b>Security Cameras</b>	5 in restaurant and 8 total
<b>Security Personnel</b>	None
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes
<b>Employees</b>	4
<b>Capacity</b>	20
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	1 in front
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	A

<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	33 <sup>rd</sup> Pct. – Would like to meet with owner prior to recommendation
<b>Community Comments</b>	
<b>Stipulations</b>	(1) Owner to meet with precinct prior to General Meeting and meet with Council Member Rodriguez prior to General meeting
<b>Notes</b>	(1) Precinct wants to meet the business owners prior; (2)
<b>Committee Vote</b>	5/0/0

9. Wahi-Diner LLC. dba Wahi Diner - 3915 Broadway, (bet. W. 163rd & W. 164th Streets.)

<b>Owner/Representative</b>	George Kalabrezos [646-429-9400] hectoraesq@gmail.com
<b>Type of Establishment</b>	Restaurant – general diner food serving alcohol from 12p to 4am. Last call 2am.
<b>Hours of Operation</b>	7 days a week
<b>Tables/Chairs</b>	74 seats & 20 tables
<b>Music</b>	None
<b>Security Cameras</b>	16 cameras – throughout store and outdoors. 12 inside/4 outside
<b>Security Personnel</b>	None
<b>ADA Compliant?</b>	Yes
<b>Employees</b>	20
<b>Capacity</b>	74
<b>Emergency Exits</b>	3 (front and each side) 2 on Broadway and 1 on 164th
<b>Restaurant Letter Grade</b>	A
<b>33<sup>rd</sup>/34<sup>th</sup> Precinct</b>	33 <sup>rd</sup> – no objection
<b>Community Comments</b>	
<b>Stipulations</b>	(1) Meet with Council Member Rodriguez prior to General meeting; (2) Owner is to provide TIPS training for employees to prevent underage drinking; (3) Owner not to utilize outdoor café w/o applying for and receiving proper permit
<b>Notes</b>	(1) Diner has been in the community for 30 years. Known as George's Diner. Has been known as WaHi since February; (2) Concerns were raised that owner placed tables and chairs on the sidewalk without a proper license; (3)
<b>Committee Vote</b>	5/0/0

10. Yudy Restaurant Inc. - 1626 St. Nicholas Avenue, (bet. W. 191st & W. 192nd Streets.)

Owner/Representative	No vote; no appearance by owner or representative.
Type of Establishment	
Hours of Operation	
Tables/Chairs	
Music	
Security Cameras	
Security Personnel	
ADA Compliant?	
Employees	
Capacity	
Emergency Exits	
Restaurant Letter Grade	
33 <sup>rd</sup> /34 <sup>th</sup> Precinct	
Community Comments	
Stipulations	
Notes	
Committee Vote	

**D. New Business/Adjournment**

1. Anina Young – want to get to new applicants before construction of business has started. Concern is that if the business were denied license, the owner would have wasted money on construction. The difficulty would be in getting the business owners to come in prior to starting construction.
  
2. Suggestion that owners agree to comply with City’s regulation on noise allowance. Committee suggesting having owners sign a Stipulation regarding compliance with regulations.

**Community Board 12 Manhattan**  
**Minutes for the Housing and Human Services Committee Meeting (Corrected)**  
**December 5th, 2013 at the New Board's Offices**  
**Office Conference Area – 530 West 166<sup>th</sup> Street – 6<sup>th</sup> Floor**

**Committee Members Present (5):** Richard Lewis [Chair], Alyce Smith, Lorena Jimenez-Castro, and. Jay Mazur. Christina Burgess [Public Member].

**Committee Members Absent\* (1): Unexcused Absences (Total):** Ayisha Oglivie (1)

**Guests (2):** Victor Bach, Community Service Society and Bernal Hall (NYCHA).

**Public (1):** O. Wanaka

**Staff:** Paola M. Garcia.

\*Ellen Kackmann has been re-assigned to the Traffic and Transportation Committee due to work related matters that conflict with attending the HHS Committee's stated monthly meetings. The total members serving the committee are now seven (7).

---

**Welcome, Opening Remarks, and the Agenda.** Richard Lewis as Chair called the meeting to order at 7:15pm. Board Members introduced themselves as did the public and guests assembled. A quorum was present during the entire meeting. Topics for tonight's agenda were outlined. The chair gave some recent housing news and updates: The results of the HHS Committee's rankings of the capital and expense budget presented by the chair at the public hearing for full board ranking and public comments were released and discussed. The HHS Committee did very well and a heads up for a job well done to board members and public is in order for recognizing the importance of our items. **Affordable Housing and Day Care Centers were ranked #1 and #2 as the board's capital items for FY2015.** This also was the same ranking for FY2014. A new item calling for "**sufficient funding for CBO's in CB12M that provide for legal and or administrative assistance, advocacy, and intervention for CB12M residents**" was ranked as the board's #1 expense item for FY2015. All of the committee's eight items were ranked above the cut off save one which missed it by one place. There were 40 capital items and 25 expense items ranked and approved along with five continuing support items.

The chair attended several meetings: The 33<sup>rd</sup> annual Housing Conference of the Council of New York Cooperatives and Condominiums (CNYC) held on November 17<sup>th</sup> at Baruch College. The chair also attended affordable housing sessions, property tax sessions, and a large town hall meeting at Talking Transitions that ran from November 6<sup>th</sup> to November 23<sup>rd</sup> "Talking Transition is an open conversation about the future of New York City. Over these two weeks, New Yorkers can come together online, in the streets, and in a pop-up aluminum/steel truss glass tent on Canal Street to help shape the transition to a new mayor." For information and the entire schedule visit: <http://talkingtransitionnyc.com/>, The series can also be viewed on Livestream © <http://new.livestream.com/talkingtransition/NYC>

The chair also attended the Superintendent Technical Association's (STA) meeting on December 2<sup>nd</sup>. This organization is a superintendent's trade, professional, and non union group. This group consists of some 200 members, mostly from NYC. It provides facilities management information and training, similar to 1132BJ.(New website <http://nycsta.com> Old website - <http://www.superstechnicalassociation.org> ) We need supers in our area to become more involved in certifications, job training, and greater mobility as well as networking with other supers and facility managers in NYC. So HHS Committee will be providing as much information we receive on these matters. Their current meeting was on security - primarily access control systems for a building's front entrance doors, elevators, and special amenity rooms (gymnasiums or fitness centers). These systems involve the use of key fobs, some video intercoms, and or electromagnetic front

door locks. The latter must be fail safe and fail secure to meet code when power is lost. That is residents must be able to safely leave if the power fails or is interrupted and the building must still be secure on the outside as well see: <http://sdcsecurity.wordpress.com/2009/05/06/what-is-the-difference-between-failsafe-and-failsecure-electric-locks> An example of a key fob access control system is the security system we use to enter the building and elevators for the new CB12M Offices. Key fob systems can be electronically coded and controlled by simple personal computers. They generate reports on access and egress and can be time limited or space limited. They are all coded to readers or sensors for authentication. Finally, the chair did not attend the annual ISC Security Expo at Javits this year.

Documents for committee discussion and vote on the resolution on Tax Incentives for Video Surveillance in Residential Buildings were re-circulated." For this meeting on NYCHA and the "Future of Public Housing" new source materials listed below and selected by the chair were distributed.

- NYU Furman Center's report "The #NYChousing series" - Issue #7 "Should the next mayor support the New York City Housing Authority's plan to lease its undeveloped land for the construction of market rate rental housing?" <http://furmancenter.org/nychousing/10issues>
- "NYCHA Completes Installation of CCTV at Dyckman, Begins Installation at Marble Hill." *NYCHA Journal page 8* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/nycha/downloads/pdf/j13nove.pdf>
- "Housing Affordability": Workbook Article from the Town Meeting at Talking Transitions – November 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2013.

**NOTE:** The panelist from the Community Service Society (CSS) distributed copies of a document: "NYC Housing Alliance Preserve Public Housing" A special flyer announcing tonight's meeting was prepared and e-blasted.

### Introduction.

In New York City some 500,000 residents live in some kind of public housing. This includes some 178,911 apartments in 334 developments. There are three large NYCHA properties in CB12M (Bethune Gardens, Thurgood Marshall and the Dyckman Houses). There are also some smaller properties such as 99 Fort Washington Avenue, the Washington Rehab Center, and other holdings. For nearly twenty five (25) years there have been significant financial cutbacks from the federal government to New York City's Housing Authority (NYCHA). However, unlike other major US cities that also received these cutbacks New York City has made a continuous commitment to support its existing public housing stock. There have been no widespread housing demolitions or mass resident displacements and relocations through Section 8 vouchers or other programs.. However, with these continuous and now significant budget shortfalls, even from the city and state, New York City's public housing stock has fallen into serious disrepair that threatens its long term viability given the critical and strategic challenges to managing and maintaining these aging structures - many that have outlived their useful life.

NYCHA has seen since 2002 a reduction of \$700 million dollars in its federal operating budget. And if new revenue is not generated NYCHA projects a \$13 billion dollar capital investment shortfall through 2017. NYCHA has suggested land leasing (Infills) as one major solution. Others, including a December 4<sup>th</sup> report by the NYC Independent Budget Office have recommended some 93 tax code changes needed to provide relief. See <http://www.ibo.nyc.ny.us/iboreports/options2013.pdf> So given this overview we began tonight's topic: "The Future of Public Housing" with two expert and distinguished panelists:

## Panel Discussions' by Victor Bach (Community Service Society) and Bernel Hall (NYCHA).

The mission of the Community Service Society of New York, a long time and prominent CBO is to "identify problems which create a permanent poverty class in New York City, and to advocate the systemic changes required to eliminate such problems. CSS will focus on enabling, empowering and promoting opportunities for poor families and individuals to develop their full potential, to contribute to society, and to realize social, economic and political opportunities." Mr. Bach is the organization's Senior Housing Policy Analyst and has been with them since 1983.

*Mr. Bach directs CSS housing policy research and advocacy, and provides technical assistance to resident and community groups. His current work focuses on the preservation of the city's affordable housing resources, particularly public housing and Section 8 housing vouchers, on rent burden trends among low-income New Yorkers, and on the role of HUD funding, under Section 3, in promoting job and training opportunities. He holds a Ph.D. in urban planning from M.I.T. Prior to joining CSS, he was at the Brookings Institution and on the faculties of the New School for Social Research and the LBJ School of Public Affairs*

Bernel Hall is Senior Portfolio Manager at NYCHA. Mr. Hall is also a part-time lecturer at New York University's Schack Institute of Real Estate where he teaches real estate financial modeling in Excel and commercial real estate risk and portfolio management. Mr. Hall possesses ten years of real estate investment and lending experience with Bank of America, UBS Investment Bank and Goldman Sachs' Urban Investment Group.

### Some Keypoints made by Mr. Bernel Hall:

- Given some twenty five year ago that the federal government was no longer funding public housing authorities (PHA's) nationwide there were only three basic options left for strategic planning related to distressed properties:
  - Residential displacement, demolition and rebuilding mixed income housing with HOPE VI program. See [http://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/program\\_offices/public\\_indian\\_housing/programs/ph/hope6/about](http://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/program_offices/public_indian_housing/programs/ph/hope6/about)
  - Voucher programs such as Section 8 to move PHA residents out.
  - Sustain public housing authorities with limited city and state funds.
- NYC chose the last option with no displacement or demotion. Other municipalities, such as Chicago, Philadelphia, Detroit, Newark, Atlanta, Portland and Seattle displaced residents, issued vouchers, and demolished its public housing.
- The assumptions of the HOPE VI Program were to give developers an incentive to develop in centrally located neighborhoods rather than poor communities. Other tax incentives have been offered to encourage them. See "The Biggest Urban Renewal Flub: Chicago's Robert Taylor Houses <http://chicago.curbed.com/archives/2011/11/30/the-biggest-urban-renewal-flubs.php> and Chicago's Cabrini-Green Housing Project <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cabrini%E2%80%93Green>
- Another problem with the traditional funding and rules from HUD is that you can't use Public Housing funds or subsidies to pay for debt service. So it's a deficit type of funding where only Section 8 money can be used.
- NYCHA has recently completed a new HOPE VI Project in Brownsville and another is planned in the Rockaways.
- Many NYCHA properties are over 70 years old and have exceeded their projected useful life. Others are in better shape.
- There are some 40,000 NYCHA households making at least \$100,000 per year who would not qualify for an initial entry into a NYCHA property. There is now a 2 ½ year wait list to get into a NYCHA property. There are some 140,000 people on this wait list. Homeless individuals/families coming

out of a shelter system are not eligible based on a decision by Mayor Bloomberg in 2005. Everyone who is NYCHA eligible deserves the same opportunity that those current \$100,000 income holders once had. There are plenty of other options for them, but they don't move out despite "ceilings in rent" caps from the 1980's. NYCHA believes they don't have to move out, but should stay in the community they live in.

- There is some \$30 billion dollars in deferred maintain on NYCHA Properties. These estimates are based on \$100,000 per unit. While NYC placement of buildings have changed, some due to zoning and other codes NYCHA buildings are all set off from the streets with open spaces.
- NYCHA's communication could be better given the sea of controversy generated in the Daily News over Land use headlines and other residents public complaints and lawsuits on repairs. But as is the case with many large corporations there is mismanagement, incompetence and shakiness.
- While there may be other sources of revenue the proposed land lease or infill program offers the best chance to get these needed revenues. It has been blown way out of proportion with the term 'luxury housing' in a poor man's paradise.
- NYCHA had many "consultations" with residents and their resident councils as required by law on the Infill/Land lease programs. No other public housing project is involved in the ULURP process and it appears such attempts in that direction was an effort by others to seek or take control away from NYCHA.
- There were many roundtable discussions with resident councils, tenants, and legislators again as required by law.
- There is a "Plan NYCHA: A Roadmap for Preservation" that explains the directions and timetables for this agency "While Plan NYCHA will continuously evolve, it has **ten core critical imperatives** that NYCHA and its stakeholders will champion over the next five years and beyond" See: <http://www.nyc.gov/html/nycha/html/about/plannycha.shtml>
- NYCHA would support more ground up strategies from the community to help address these funding strategies the public should use that leverage to make these issues known to the new Mayor who plays a significant role in budget damson making.
- The new Mayor has soften his position on Infills and suggested it needs to be modified.

#### Some Keypoints made by Mr. Victor Bach:

- Victor Bach countered some of the keypoints and claims made by Bernal Hall and at times put them into a better or sharper context as it relates to affordable housing and supported others
- NYCHA has done more than its share to avoid displacement and demotion than other municipalities have done. NYCHA has done a valiant job of preserving all of its units, despite deferred maintained and dwindling financial support from Washington, the city and the state. The all backed away from needed subsidies and left NYCHA a hole in its budget.
- NYCHA has a few bonds for public housing subsidies that are debt service eligible. Detroit used its HOPE VI Program to build units where real estate markets were strong.
- The city provides subsidies to Yankee Stadium, Madison Square Garden, museums, and luxury housing.
- NYCHA has to pay \$75 Million dollars a year to the NYPD – no private property pays this amount for public safety in neighborhoods. NYCHA pays \$23million dollars in property taxes.
- There is also the issue of funds from Battery City Park, Battery City Park was original y planned to be built for middle income families. Due to the cost of the pylons in the Hudson River amid other costs that plan changed to building an upscale community and commercial

enterprises. If this plan proved successful the revenue was to go to help other neighborhoods. Now billions of dollars go into the city's general fund. So how can we expect another type of land lease project to do the right thing?

- He agrees since the federal government is hopeless for adding additional revenue to NYCHA, some form of land lease is a better option - again if it's done properly and with safeguards.
- For some recommendations on what specific steps that could be taken to solve the fiscal crisis in NYCHA, Mr. Bach presented an eight page letter and document to NYCHA from a group called the "NYC Alliance to Preserve Public Housing". A few of these recommendations are:
  - NYCHA should call a halt to its current Infill Plan and set up a meaningful community planning process,
  - NYCHHA must agree to comply with ULURP.
  - NYCHA must comply with HUD Section 18 disposition regulations if it moves forward with its current Infill plans.
  - NYCHA must expedite the allocation of HUD Tenant Participation activity funds to target Regional Councils.
  - NYCHA Infill Plans must retain existing community services
  - NYCHA must hold public hearings on all Section 18 disposition proposal
- Mr. Bach suggests that CB12M become a member of this alliance as have several other community boards and the Borough President elect, Ms. Gale Brewer.
- He also suggested a model resolution was needed on this entire NYCHA matter so as to build from the ground up greeter support by all the community board, as the City Council and housing advocates have done. He will be sending City Council Reso 964 to be used as a template.

#### Q&A

***The Dyckman Houses appear to be in good shape from the outside, but inside there is a difference – so what the difference between a rehab and patched up work that is often shoddy and does not last?***

Since many of the units or buildings have exceeded their useful life the choice is either new construction or rehab. New construction is far more costly than rehab work. With the limited amount of funding even for partial rehab work can be shoddy and may need constant repair.

***The public's impression is that NYCHA has more money than it claims?***

Cuts have been made. NYCHA's workforce is down to 11,000 from 20,000. This may have also resulted in hiring low level management staff and contributed to mismanagement, laxities in audits of rehab work, and or incompetence.

***How would a current NYCHA resident qualify for any of the land lease projects, for example in the Douglas Houses?***

NYCHA is asking any developer to set aside 20% of the units as follows: First, any Douglas Houses residents are eligible, next any NYCHA resident is eligible, and lastly individuals or families living in the surrounding Community Districts. NYCHA has been successful in the past with these type of set asides where there are different tiers that stratifies incomes. For example, in the Randolph Houses NYCHA used the following formulas: 10 to 30 % of AMI; 30 to 40% AMI and 40 to 50% AMI.

***In terms of NYCHA leadership for the past 25 years why has there not been more noise about these fiscal problems prior to the Daily News @ leaks on Infills and Luxury housing to bail out decades of underfunding?***

NYCHA could have done better of communication. They have connected with residences and their councils as required by law before this became a problem. They had roundtable discussions with PowerPoint presentations. **Note:** Mr. Bach was critical of this process, including the PowerPoint presentations that residents did not understand. NYCHA has released "Plan NYCHA". But, everyone should remember that the NYCHA Boards is appointed by the mayor and serves at the pleasure of the mayor. NYCHA has a governmental relations agency for these purposes. What could have been done is for the residences to take direct action and some of them have had success with lawsuits. In this regard, the question is what should the public stakeholders who vote do from the ground up and to the Mayor's Office and other electives?

***Does the "Move to Work" as a recommendation by the Affordable Housing Alliance mean that after you reach a certain income you have to move out of NYCHA housing?***

No. It is amendable and flexible with other conditions not related to AMI.

#### **Committee discussion.**

The committee discussed the following talking points on creating a resolution on tax benefits for state of art video surveillance in residential buildings

- What are the benefits of video surveillance in public spaces in residential buildings?
- What are some problems with video surveillance in public spaces in residential buildings?
- Why do landlords and property managers need tax incentives to install these systems?
- Why would tenants favor these systems?
- Why would tenants not favor these systems?
- What safeguards do we need for rent protection, privacy invasions, and misuse of these systems?
- How should the NYPD, FDNY or emergency responders be involved?
- Should this system be used with the NYC Trespass Affidavit Program or access control systems in building entrances and or elevators?
- Should these systems be integrated into some kind of citywide security initiative or should we pursue this matter as a pilot or demo program in our community?
- What kind of staff training will be needed?
- Should there be a cap on landlord, property owners/manager expenditures for this system and audits pre and post installations?
- Should we eliminate video surveillance in residential buildings altogether and reduce the number of systems now in use?
- Would this effort of surveillance elimination increase or decrease the resources of the NYPD and other first responders?
- Other talking points.

After discussing these points and offering items to be incorporated in the resolution. The committee voted 4-0-0 in favor of a resolution calling for "Tax Incentives for Video Surveillance in Residential Buildings"

Meeting adjourned at 9:45PM

Respectfully submitted by,

Richard Lewis, Chair HHS Committee

December 5th, 2013

**Manhattan Community Board 12**  
**Housing and Human Services Committee – December 5<sup>th</sup>, 2013**

**RESOLUTION IN SUPPORT OF PROVIDING PROPERTY TAX INCENTIVES FOR A PILOT VIDEO SURVEILLANCE PROGRAM  
FOR RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS IN COMMUNITY DISTRICT 12.**

**Whereas**, video surveillance (traditionally known as CCTV) has become an everyday and ever present reality for several decades in the public spaces of our streets, commercial enterprises, other spaces of mass assembly, some private homes only to be enhanced post 9/11 with other security measures and technologies, and

**Whereas**, these electronic devices bundled with alarms, access control systems, long distance monitoring and other offsite security systems, agents and programs have been shown to deter criminal events and some unlawful activities, such as quality of life crimes and at the very least have provided evidence and forensics for successful arrests, prosecutions, convictions and sentencing where witness are reluctant to testify, and

**Whereas**, the Office of the Manhattan District Attorney, the command structure of our local NYPD precincts, several other stakeholders such as property owners and managers, tenants, and security firms have at several recent local public hearings all supported a much wider distribution of video surveillance systems in more residential buildings in our community given now their very low cost and the increasing number of complaints over quality of life matters and the sale and distribution of narcotics in and around their buildings, and

**Whereas**, too many of these same property owners and managers despite their support and the volume of these complaints have often placed video surveillance at a lower priority or at the bottom of the list given limited financial resources weighed against other building priorities such as the cost of fuel, electricity, maintenance, taxes, or capital expenses for a new roof, boiler replacement, plumbing costs, weatherization, energy conversions and keeping their property operating to code, and

**Whereas**, some individuals may voice concern that too much video surveillance might intrude into their privacy or violate Fourth Amendment protections, neither the ACLU, the NYCLU, or the US Supreme Court have taken a legal position against the deployment of video surveillance in residential buildings other than agreeing that despite advances in technology there is no privacy intrusion of individuals in a public space - although unauthorized audio recordings or several types of warrantless searches by law enforcement are still illegal, and

**Whereas**, many protections against privacy intrusion also exist in the NYS Penal Codes Section 250 video surveillance by a landlord or property owner cannot be done inside one's apartment without tenant consent, and

**Whereas**, NYCHA Dyckman Houses has recently completed the installation of video surveillance systems as a result of nearly \$500,000 of discretionary funding from the local councilman, and

**Whereas**, a Brooklyn neighborhood in Boro Park with low crime receive a \$1 million dollar grant last year from New York State Legislature for video surveillance there should be no reason that CD12 with a much higher crime rate should not to request similar treatment,

**Therefore Be It Resolve** that Community Board 12 Manhattan requests a special tax incentive to encourage participation in a pilot residential building video surveillance program in CD12 that would deferred the cost, installation, and maintenance of state of art video systems in public spaces with a cap of \$1,000 per property for buildings currently without video surveillance systems and qualified outside audits be performed that are certified to insure system functionality , and

**Resolve** that property owners and their agents, staff or assigns who take advantage of these incentive are restricted from imposing MCI's on rent regulated tenants or violating intrusions in private spaces, and be it further

**Resolve** that \$1 million dollars or more be allocated for this initiative and this resolution be communicated to our local electives and the city and state legislative leaders in January, 2014.

**[Committee vote: 4-0-0]**

**Respectfully submitted, Richard Lewis – Chair HHS Committee – December 5<sup>th</sup> 2013**

Community Board 12  
Public Safety Meeting  
December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2013

Present – Committee Members

Luis Tejada, Chair  
Mike Jimenez, ex-Chair  
Rud Morales, Assistant Chair  
Liliana Saneaux  
Dr. Michael Mowatt-Wynn

Absent Committee Members

Pamela Palanque North  
Chris O'Sullivan

CB12 Members Attending

George Fernandez  
Richard Lewis

Guests: Laura Whitehorn, Mary Anderson, Irene Shulman and Katherine Taveras

Agency-

Captain Pichardo – 33<sup>rd</sup> Precinct  
Inspector Buzzetti – 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct  
Christian Perez – Comm. Affairs 34<sup>th</sup>

**Mike Jimenez, former Public Safety Chair** call meeting to order at 7:09 p.m.

As you know I was Chair for close to a year and I have had other things going on so I am going to be stepping down as chair of public safety and Luis Tejada will be the new appointed chair as of today so I leave you in good hands and along with him and the other members of the committee we'll keep moving forward and continue doing the good work that the committee has been doing and I'll be around every now and then, but going forward Luis is your man.

**Luis Tejada, newly appointed Public Safety Chairs say's welcome!**

Thank you. I'm a little anxious but hopefully I should be able to work this out in a few minutes. I just want to say something about myself. It is an honor to serve as the chairman of the public safety committee. As a lifelong resident of northern Manhattan and a local educator and administrator, I understand the safety issues that we face on a daily basis. I look forward to working with our local precinct, community members and institutions as we improve the quality of life in northern Manhattan. Feel free to contact me with suggestions and recommendations as we move forward in improving the community poll. Thank you

The introduction of the committee members proceeded as follows:

Liliana Saneaux  
Ruth Morales  
Mike Jimenez  
Luis Tejada  
Michael Mordwayne

Everybody is a little anxious.

Ruth Morales is the newly appointed Asst. Chair and you'll be working with Luis. She's a little shy but she'll be your asst. Can I say anything? You can hi to the community and tell them a little bit about yourself.

Hello everyone besides living here for the last 18 years I am pretty much involved with anything to do with the community, especially community events, which I do a lot of them trying to get involved what is the night life the hospitality industry. We are trying to get involved in this area specifically to understand what are the issues with quality life that the community has and that is pretty much affecting everyone. I have a 7-year-old daughter; she'll be 8 in January so basically one of the best reasons that I got involved with the community is because of her; because I am trying to provide a better neighborhood for her. Pretty much hello everyone

Thank you, Ruth.

I guess I am going to open up with old business. There are a few items that I'd like to discuss. If I bring something up was already been covered please let me know. I am trying to just go by the minutes but one of areas that keeps popping up thorough is the Pill Mill. Do you know anything about that? I know we are waiting for the representative from the 33<sup>rd</sup>. And bam there he is! Captain Pichardo you always have perfect timing! Thank you for coming. One of the items we were discussing when you walked in was the pill mill. Do we have any updates on what is going on, what is the current status?

For those that do not know when referencing the pill mill we are talking about doctors' clinic. In fact classifying it as a pill mill is probably a little off. They are not really distributing pills out of the place they are not being sold out of the place pills are not being sold out on that street. What is being done is that prescriptions are being issued and thus of course people are getting pills filling those prescriptions outside of Washington Heights, various states up and down the East Coast, the island, upstate and so forth. Some of the residents on that street had a meeting with our Chief Department Phillip Banks III. That was an issue that came up. I think he relayed with confidence that the investigation was moving forward at a pace that all the people that were involved in this investigation are happy with. And sometimes like with anything else, he may have a little more weight to deal with the higher ups in certain agencies (federal and state) than I do, so it's pretty good that he was involved because like I mentioned at the other public safety meeting that things were moving along in a really great direction it helps to have someone else a little higher than me (in this case one of the bosses the second in command after Kelly) saying the same thing.

He is confident everyone here he was appreciate of all the residents of 162<sup>nd</sup> street and their patience but with his added support being more involved and that some issues have been brought to light as confident as he was with everybody in the law enforcement aspect and what was being done he said let's see if anything can be done. The fact of the matter is that neither he nor I know if anything can be done, because sometimes these things take time but it's on my radar. And if it's important to him, it's important to a whole lot of people is the bottom line. It's going well and I think we should see results, I'm almost (I don't want to say 100%) cause you never know but definitely not this month but in the very near future we should see some very good progress.

Dr. Michael Mowatt added one thing. One of my positions is that of president of the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct and I was there when the chief spoke. The chief was very kind and he invited the residents within the community to come down to 1PP to meet with him to discuss it so that he would have firsthand knowledge about the situation. Prior to that he had no knowledge of that he had little or no information concerning this and he wanted to know the dimension or the scope of the problems were. So I think as the captain rightfully said with the support of someone way up there we are going to see rapid change in the scene.

I just wanted to add some information here. I was reading an article from the FDA where it was a big article on painkillers. And the article made reference to that the FDA was changing the whole thing on prescriptions where they are taking them from category III to category II thereby making it harder for individuals to obtain painkillers. Individuals, as I was reading, could no longer have doctors call in this level of category drugs into a pharmacy; they had to write a script and the person would have to bring it in. There was a limit as to the number of scripts that they are going to be able to write. The FDA is cracking down on the painkillers, which is a good thing for the community, but it's going to be rough on the people that really do need them because of their illness. According to the article, doctors are going to be afraid to write these scripts because they feel that they are going to be targeted as drug dealers because they are giving so many scripts and the restrictions are having them pull away from them. When did you see this article? Was it the NY Daily News or NY Post? That's interesting because there is going to be an article coming out this week in the NY Times as well. It's interesting everyone should google that article because it seems that this is the direction that everyone is going in. I just wanted to share that.

Any comments?

To follow up with the motorcycles – it's not as bad but it's still an issue along the Hudson, Inspector. Someone emailed us this morning; they were looking to see what the issue is so I guess it goes for both places. When the cold weather hits it'll drop down significantly. We did a lot of work over the summer in addressing this. We hope that ultimately that with the culture changes that people are not so eager to come over here to see and be seen and engage in the reckless behavior and that they are aware that we are going to more strictly enforcement than there has been in the past. In a way it's like swatting flies; there's going to be motorcycles here but we feel that there's been a reduction in numbers and it'll continue in the future. I just wanted to bring it up because of the email. (woman) Henry Hudson Parkway I didn't email it, but I am aware of it. I just wanted to bring it up so that you guys could keep an eye out for it at the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct. Absolutely, as you know with at least with the 178<sup>th</sup> street incident, there are parts of that investigation from the police department component that are still moving forward. This is a first so I'll definitely take a look at it. I'd like to reiterate like the inspector that it's one of those seasonal things that happen. But tomorrow it's supposed to be in the 60's so folks wait for a nice day it's always something. As long as I've been a part of this department that aspect of policing did not require an incident for us to be reactive. We were proactive before any of this happened. It's always on our radars.

To echo what the what Inspector Bazzeti or Officer Pabay had emailed that the way the community can help is if we know where they are stashing the bikes we can alert the precinct, the community affairs dept. Or if you see where they are grouping at a particular time or a particular gas station that's good information for them because they can attack it that way. Because it poses a threat for civilians if they start chasing bikes around on sidewalks, it becomes a bigger problem than injuries come.

Over 100 bikes were confiscated during the summer. When you confiscate them what is the policy? Some of them, I'm sure are repeat offenders, so what do you do? Most of the time it's for safekeeping so they get them back – the registered owner will get them back. If

it is not properly insured, registered or safely equipped the can get it back. But like in the 178<sup>th</sup> street incident where they were confiscations as arrest evidence it makes it very difficult for them to get it back. But we operate within the scope of the law. We can't say something that is not true. We take it for safekeeping; it's difficult for them to get it back they won't get it back immediately. We try and send it to the auto pound in Queens or Brooklyn and they have to go out there to take care of. Like I said this is about getting to the goal of changing the culture. Have them think - I might get a summons or I might get my bike taken or I may have to go to Brooklyn or Queens or worse find someone who is a licensed motorcyclist to go pick it up.

### 33<sup>rd</sup> Precinct Report

Captain Pichardo apologized for being late. He was tied up with a missing 5-year-old child case and he was happy to report that the child was found. When such sensitive case arises the NYPD assigns all available resources to try to solve as quickly as possible. That is why Inspector Buzzetti and I were late. Mike Jimenez, ex-chair, said that you guys deserve a round of applause. This is not the first time it has happened, over the summer we had 2 cases and the police department dropped everything and the same day, within hours the cases were resolved.

Captain Pichardo wished that everyone had a Happy Thanksgiving and for the coming up holiday season, he wishes that everyone has a happy and healthy one. The captain will be out working late hours on the 31<sup>st</sup> making sure that everything goes well.

Recap of the last 30 days. We are going through a very good stretch of crime. We are down 4%. Let me tell that equates to 4 crimes. A caution about percentages whether they are high or low, you could be up 150 % in reality, you are only up 2 crimes. So I never go by that, what I go by the actual type of crime that is happening. We are down in murders, rapes, robberies and all the violent crimes. We had some issues with people in same households involved in disputes, so we saw an increase in domestic violence, confined to household in apartments. Again, we did some outreach with a PTA at a near school: a domestic violence conference with one of the local community center at the precinct. We are always looking for ways to bring awareness in terms of that. Theft of Auto is not even an issue in the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct. Like I always say, one of my number one issues the category of Grand Larceny is the un-attended property where you turn around or go hail a cab and you leave your bag with a laptop or your purse in a restaurant and it disappears. That is the category that we saw a slight increase. Our burglary, we had a specific area from 170<sup>th</sup> to 174<sup>th</sup>, between Audubon Ave. and as far as Fort Washington Ave., where in a span of two weeks we had about 8 different burgerlies. And not just because of the work of the Police Dept., but probably more important, the residents and victims left the crime scene undisturbed and pointed to the police items out of order, items that didn't belong to them and other evidence left behind. Evidence left behind at a window, led the detectives to two individuals who were arrested and the burglaries in that specific area stop. I cannot say that these two individuals were responsible for all the burglaries, but they were responsible for 3.

On Friday night, on 156<sup>th</sup> Street, between Amsterdam and Broadway, we had a shooting where an individual was shot, transported to the hospital and subsequently, he died. It originated from inside a building, inside an apartment; a fight broke out, spilled out into the streets where the individual was shot in the street about 10:30 p.m. A very, very intense investigation, I felt bad for some of the tenants trying to get back into their apartment and because of the investigation, access to their apartment was delayed until we were able to secure the crime scene. There was so much potential evidence in the hallway coming out of the building. We could see on video, where these individuals touched walls, windows and doors that we just could not compromised the crime scenes. We collected a lot of good forensic evidence; no one has been arrested yet. One thing that I will say, this was not a random murder, as far as the preliminary investigation goes; it was a targeted individual by two or three suspects. I had a meeting with some of the local residents just to assure everyone that this was not a random incident. Hopefully in the near future, the detectives might be able to share good news with us. There are a lot promising leads that have attain positive results for the investigation.

The last thing that I want to talk about is cell phones. There is a new operating system that I least for iPhones OS7 that just came out. This software is designed to make the iPhone or the Apple gadget un-useable in case it was stolen or lost. Captain Pichardo is asking our help to spread the word about this update that could potentially eliminate the theft of electronic devices. This update was collaboration between Apple and the NYPD. The captain is not aware if Androids phone have these features.

Richard Lewis asked Captain Pichardo his position on the use of video surveillance and would it had help the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct solve the murder at 156<sup>th</sup> street? The captain stated that use of video it a powerful tool to fight crime. There are videos surveillance of the murder that are aiding the investigation of the murder. We are always pushing property owner and landlords to participate with DA's initiatives to install video surveillance equipment.

Mike Jimenez asked Captain Pichardo about a kindle stolen from an elderly woman at 156<sup>th</sup> Street? There are some concerns in that area about robberies. A photo was provided to the precinct, has anyone been arrested? Captain Pichardo reported that it was a woman in her late 70's. The robbery was not in 156<sup>th</sup> street; it was further up, 161<sup>st</sup> Street via Fort Washington. She had a kindle in her hands, and a young man walked by, and I often speak at CB, Precinct Council meetings, about been aware of your surroundings and

this was probably one of these cases. A young man was passing by and just snatched the kindle. There were buildings with cameras that we were able to get videos but an arrest has not been made. The victim is not able to provide a description of the suspect because it just happened so fast. But that doesn't stop us. We take all crime seriously. We are looking from different angles and looking at the possibility that there was a car involved. There is not rash of robberies in 156<sup>th</sup> Street. The corridor from Amsterdam to Broadway, we are aware of different issues, pills been involved, marijuana sales, but robberies as a whole in 156<sup>th</sup> street absolutely not.

Irene Shulman asked how did the precinct classified the case of the deer found in 159<sup>th</sup> Street and Amsterdam Ave in a garbage can? It all intense of purpose the deer might have been struck by a vehicle somewhere because the injuries that we saw were not consistent with been shot and was probably dropped there. It took about 13 minutes to remove the deer, there is no deer in Washington Heights, we strongly believe that it was a road kill and the deer was dropped there. Our concern was that there is a school nearby and it was at 8:30 a.m. so we expedited the clean up.

Captain Pichardo stuck around to the end, just in case anything else pops up? He wished a happy and safe holiday season and to please help the police department protect their electronic devices. Please guard your valuables. Last week we had our 7<sup>th</sup> case of unattended car theft. Captain Pichardo encourages the community to take advantage of Operation ID. Bring your phones, computers, electronic gadgets to the local precinct and it would be engraved with your information or in case people don't want the engraving, serial numbers from the device will recorded and entered into a data base in case if it is ever stolen or missing. Since the beginning of this year, the 33<sup>rd</sup> Precinct has done 6 schools. We worked with the PTA, Principals, Teachers, Parents and students and brought Operation ID to the school free of charge. If anyone is interested to learn more about the program, just contact the Precinct.

#### 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct Report

Inspector Buzzetti didn't want to repeat a lot of what Captain Pichardo already reported. Our crime statistics are mirror image of the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct. For the past month we are 22 %. We are implementing all the strategies that Captain Pichardo said. One of the significant things that we saw was some burglary of nightclubs and restaurants. It might had hit the paper about a month ago. About a week ago, we arrested four guys and one of them had a crow bar, in the back of his jacket. We arrested them for having the crow bar, couple had warrants, and it turns out by comparing videos from some of the breakings. We were able to tie them to one of the breakings. Do we think they did the others? Probably.

We are looking at videotapes to see if we could tie them to the other crimes. We will follow up with continuous crime prevention strategies with nightclub owners with whom with have regular meetings with.

Another thing that the Inspector knows that hit the paper and concerns the community, were two adult approaching children in parks. As a Police I would tell you that it is not illegal for an adult to talk with children and ask them for their phone, where they live, etc. But as a parent that is concerning, it raises a flag. We looked a bit further into these incidents. There were two separate adults. We identified both. One of them, we found people that said that he exposed himself so we arrested him. He has a court date coming up December 19. The second guy committed no crime and since moved from the neighborhood. But we had a discussion with him; his action caused some concerns to parents.

Another concerning thing that was a concern to the neighborhood, which we were in the Daily News today, graffiti. Not only at 911 Memorial, Good Sheppard Church and other locations within the Precinct and it happened the day before Thanksgiving. Somebody was burglarizing the Dunkin Donuts on Broadway and was arrested in the act of doing the graffiti. At the time we didn't know he had done other graffiti not yet reported. He was arraigned and released. We contacted him and he came to the precinct. We currently are holding him in our cell at the precinct waiting to be charge with more vandalism. It was graffiti tag not a hate crime.

Another thing that the Inspector want to addressed was the 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct Council situation. Today, the former Precinct Council President George Espinal was removed. He is officially no longer the President of the Precinct Council. It is not alleged, he is removed. This was done according to community precinct council guidelines, and sanctioned by the NYPD. He is also been directed to not to utilize a couple Internet domain websites, the twitter page, a Facebook page and the 34<sup>th</sup> dot org page. In effect not to use the NYPD name. The next Precinct council meeting will be held Dec. 18<sup>th</sup> at the Precinct. There is no public session but the Inspector will be at the meeting to answer any questions. At the meeting the Inspector will discuss future operation of the council and how we are planning to move forward.

Mike Jimenez commended the Inspector on the great Job the precinct has done. It was noted that the 34<sup>th</sup> precinct had one murder case this year.

George Fernandez commented on the re-deployment of beat cops around the Dyckman area. Was this a result of the murder around 204<sup>th</sup> street around the Post Office? Inspector Buzzetti said no. It was as result of moving resources around between the 33<sup>rd</sup> and the 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct impact zones. We had a 4 other incidents in the same block, but I'm not going to say that was why we send the beat cops

up there. It was overall the amount of crime in that area and has been shut down. After New Year, it will be reassess and might move the operation to some other part of the precinct. George Fernandez complemented the work that 34<sup>th</sup> is doing.

Irene Shulman asked the Inspector if the murderer has been caught? A body has been recovered from the Hudson River and we are investigating to see if this individual is perpetrator. We have to make positive identification. The Inspector clarified another question about the upcoming Precinct Council meeting. Also, the precinct is hosting a children's party. Information about the event is forthcoming.

George Fernandez asked about the attempted rape of a woman around Seaman Car Service. The precinct has little information on this incident. The victim was grabbed from behind, the assailant said some disturbing things, and she was able to pull away and ran home without looking back. We know is a male, heavy Hispanic guy. Where do we go from there? We continue to work all leads but a case like that is very hard to solve. There was no picture from Seaman Car service as it was previously reported.

Some issues were brought up about curbing dogs. We continue to see irresponsible pet owners not picking up after their dogs. A campaign to raise awareness is been plan by CB.

### 33<sup>rd</sup> Precinct Council

We would like to invite everyone to our Holiday Party on Dec. 18<sup>th</sup> at 6:00 p.m. at the Jumel Mansion. Also, this celebration will serve as an award ceremony. Michael Mowatt commended Captain Pichardo on the great job that he is doing leading the 33<sup>rd</sup> precinct. The only major concern that we had was the Pill Mill that was addressed by Captain Pichardo.

### New Business

Christian Perez, Comm. Affairs 34<sup>th</sup>, reminded everyone about the upcoming Precinct Council meeting on Dec. 18<sup>th</sup> at 7p.m. at the 34<sup>th</sup> and the Children's Party at St. Elizabeth's Auditorium on Dec. 21<sup>st</sup>.

Irene Shulman suggested inviting the NYFD to attend one of our meetings to discuss fire awareness. Chairman will include NYFD in the upcoming Comm. Forum around safety. We are looking forward in collaborating with all community agencies interested in participating in this forum.

Gloria Vanderpool from the Aging Comm. asked me to come and talk about a program, my name is Gloria Whitethorn and I have lived in this community for about 12 years. I worked with a program Release Aging People in Prison (RAPP). There is a huge crisis, the number of incarnated people have risen in the last 20 years. However, NYS has taken measure to try to reduce the number of people incarcerated. The number has fallen by 20 % in the last 11 years. However, the number of people 55 or older has risen by 55 %, not because people are committing the crime. People that received sentences at a young age and are now part of this new 55plus generation in our jail systems. The percentage for this population returning to jail is less than .5 % as compared to 40 % for the rest of people been release from prison.

The reason that this is a Public Safety issue is because the enormous amount of money that we spend to keep people incarcerated. The Dept. of Correction is talking about opening some Geriatrics units at great expense for people that present no threat to public safety. We want the community to raise our voices and to send a message loud and clear to our Parole Board to look at their policy how to better meet the needs of the state and make modification to the Rockefeller laws and take in consideration that this elderly population posses no threat to the community. Resources could be better use to help education, housing and other agencies providing essential services to our community. A resolution supporting this program was discussed at the Aging Comm. and will be brought to the full board by the Aging Comm. or/and supported by Public Safety Comm. Richard Lewis, Chair from the Housing comm., expressed interest in supporting this initiative. Comm. chairs will discuss the best way to introduce and support a resolution in favor of RAPP.

Meeting adjourned at 8:24 p.m.

# CB12M-Youth and Education Committee

December 9, 2013

**Location: 530 West 166<sup>th</sup> Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, New York, NY 10032**

**Committee Members Present:** Fe Florimón, Chair; Chris Smith, Asst. Chair; Alyce Smith;

**Committee Members Absent:** Lorena Jimenez Castro; Manny De los Santos; Maria Luna; Ayisha Oglivie;

**Public Members:** Shaun Abreu, Student at Columbia University

**CB12 Members Present:** Marceo C. Raysor

**Community Members:** Mary Anderson; Laura Barbieri, Attorney; Obed Fulcar, Teacher/MS 319; Al Kurland, Police Athletic League Inc; Mery Melendez, Parent; Jacob Morris-Harlem Historical Society; Laura Katz- KIPP; Jan Ransom, NY Daily News; Joe Rogers TEN; Lamarr Wonble-Dream Director/The Future Project

The Chair Fe Florimón opened the meeting at 7:18PM.

Chair introduced Members of the Committee and numerous special Members of the Community who were in attendance.

## **Open issues- Agenda Part I:** *Fort Washington Public Library – Available space reported*

Mr. Jacob Morris accompanied by his guest Attorney Laura Barbieri, came to present the committee the idea of a possible “Teen Center” on the unoccupied space on the 3rd floor of the Fort Washington Public Library branch located in Washington Heights.

- ✓ The space capacity of the branch was discussed and pictures showing the vacant space were provided. According to Mr. Morris the space is ideal for a teen center similar to the NYPL Branch- *Harlem Grange Center*. To facilitate a visual connection to his ideal, the presenter provided literatures showing the architecture structure of this center.
- ✓ The financial aspect of the proposal was also part of the conversation. Like the Harlem Grange Center that was built with Foundation money along with matching gifts, the same financial concept can be implement to build the teen center at Fort Washington Branch. He also indicated that CM Rodriguez has expressed initial interest in assisting with financing the project.
- ✓ Members of the committee and public explored different dimensions of the project. Comments were overwhelmingly positive and suggested the need for youth involvement in a planning committee as well as connection with NYPL representatives. The chair indicated that the committee may consider a resolution at a later date when there was more substance.

*Mr. Obed Fulcar, Science Teacher at Middle School 319 and Representative of Polar Trec (Teachers & Researchers Exploring & Collaborating).*

- ✓ Mr. Fulcar came to present his science project and its mission. He will be embarking in an expedition trip to Antarctica, South Pole for two weeks from January 10 to 25, 2014. Upon his return Mr. Fulcar plans to share his experience with students and hope to get them motivated to learn the importance science, which to for him is very interesting and important subject. In the near future he plans to write a book based on his experience as well as to share more broadly in the community.

# CB12M-Youth and Education Committee

December 9, 2013

## Part II: Old/New Business by: *Christopher Smith, Assistant Chair*

- ✓ **Youth & Ed. Committee report on Saturday Meeting:** Ms. Florimon reported the outcome of the Scholarship event held on December 7, 2013. Presenters at the event include: Ms. Betty Lehmann, Director of Marketing, at Foundation Geriatric Center- representing the Edward McFadden Scholarship; Ms. Rachel A. Eisner, Financial Aid Officer, at Columbia University, and Mr. Guillermo Rivera, Senior Admissions Counselor at The City College of New York. She also expresses satisfaction with the participation of students and their parents.
- ✓ Discussed the written statement issued by PS 28 Wright Brothers School located on 155<sup>th</sup> Street at the request of CB12M's Youth and Education Committee. The objective is to conduct an investigation on the pending capital funds to fix the school's gym and auditorium. The committee leadership is continuing to work based on the committee's previous action. The broader issue of the lack of air conditioning in many of our district's schools.
- ✓ An update on the subject of co-location was provided. Attorney Laura Barbieri also a Representative for "Advocates for Justice" discussed about the filed and pending appeals for several schools in district six.
- ✓ Committee and finally approved by the full Board at their November general meeting.
- ✓ Mr. Smith also clarified the difference between the subject of co-location and charter schools. He also discusses the subject of common core and provided several meetings announcement including the appearance of Commission King in the city.
- ✓ Ms. Florimon spoke about the challenges many parents and students are facing in the community because of the lack of the English language. It was also mentioned the importance CMs' expertise and how they can help the community. Mr. Smith was asked to volunteer his career expertise and it was learned he provides Professional Mental Health Counseling; also practice spirituality -holistic approach as well other professional and related services.
- ✓ **Alyce Smith – After School:** Discussed students who are in grades without meeting the basic requirements of previous grades and discuss the Parents' frustration at not being able to help with schoolwork (Common Core)
- ✓ **Al Kurland:** Discussed resolution in Albany regarding fully vetted 16 & 17 years old serving on Community Boards.
- ✓ **Lamarr Wonble-Dream Director at "The Future Project"** spoke about the mission of his organization and express interest in building relationship with the community and the Youth Committee.
- ✓ It was also re-stated the passing of the recent resolution on co-location initiated by the Youth & Ed.

### **Announcements:**

- ✓ Training for "Teen on Board" will be held on December 12<sup>th</sup>- 6-8pm at IS52
- ✓ Monthly education film "Best Kept Secret" on Monday, December 16<sup>th</sup> from 5:30pm – 8:00pm, 2005 Amsterdam Avenue (between 159<sup>th</sup> and 160<sup>th</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Community Room
- ✓ Macio Raysor – Church on the Hill, Attorney Laurel Raysor (Mr. Raysor's sister) is sponsoring, a Community Law Project Fundraiser- Saturday, December 14<sup>th</sup> @ 101 W. 147<sup>th</sup> Street, Lenox Terrace
- ✓ Next Meeting for Y&E, January 4<sup>th</sup> & January 13<sup>th</sup>

- ✓ *There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 10:15 PM*

**Traffic and Transportation Committee Meeting**  
December 2<sup>nd</sup> 2013

**Attendance:**

Committee Members Present – Yosef Kalinsky, Anita Barberis, James Berlin, Ellen Kackman, Edith Prentiss, Maceo Raysor

Public Members Present: Emily Genser (TLC), Erika Leyva (TLC), Osi Karminer, Ben Simoff, Mary Anderson

Meeting began at 7:07pm

1) **5 Borough Taxi Plan** – presentation by Emily Genser ([gensere@tlc.nyc.gov](mailto:gensere@tlc.nyc.gov) , 212-676-1145)

- It is hard to hail a yellow taxi outside of midtown and lower Manhattan.
- TLC will sell 18,000 permits. All must be affiliated with a street hail livery base.
- At least 20%, or 3,600 of all permits sold must be restricted to wheelchair-accessible vehicles.
- As of 11/8/13 6,000 permits sold and 1,200 to restricted wheelchair-accessible vehicles.
- For pick up north of West 110<sup>th</sup> and East 96<sup>th</sup> Street (in Manhattan), Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island
- To date 1,558 vehicles are in service on the streets
- Boro Taxis can continue to provide pre-arranged service to dispatch calls from affiliated car services – but not below West 110<sup>th</sup> Street or East 96<sup>th</sup> Street.
- All Boro Taxis must be painted apple green, have a GPS unit, credit card reader, and a roof light
- All Boro Taxis are inspected twice a year
- Within CB12 there are 10 bases with SHL endorsements and 521 cars and 51 wheel chair accessible vehicles, 8 of which are already on the road and providing service
- Benefits of Boro Taxis:
  - Set fares based on meters or standard pricing
  - Greater safety and security – cars are inspected and insured
  - GPS allows greater reporting and finding of lost objects
  - Credit card reader
  - Wheelchair access to 20% of the fleet
  - [www.borotaxis.org](http://www.borotaxis.org) – website to suggest a location for a Boro Taxi stand - perhaps a place where livery car services currently wait to pick up passengers.

2) **Street co-naming for Guadalupe Rodriguez**

No representatives present from the public or CM Rodriguez office to support a street co-naming, so the item was tabled.

- 3) Josh Orzeck was not present but emailed a response to three outstanding DOT related questions:
- a. Broken sidewalk due to construction at Overlook & 186<sup>th</sup> Street and Broadway & 207<sup>th</sup> Street. DOT has asked for an inspector go to the listed sites to evaluate the sidewalk conditions and take appropriate measures – if warranted, they will instruct the contractor to make the walkway safe.
  - b. Request for pedestrian ramp at Overlook and 184<sup>th</sup> Street. As soon as the new Stop control went in at Overlook Avenue and West 184<sup>th</sup> Street, DOT asked for an inspection of the location for installation of a new ramp. This location will be completed under contract # HWP14TA, this coming year.
  - c. Every construction site where DOT stipulates a temporary installation of a pedestrian walk in the roadway has in their permit a requirement to meet NYCDOT specifications, which includes that the walkway must be “ramped at entry to sidewalk for handicapped accessibility.” Any temporary walkway where this is not done is in violation of their permit. When you see this condition, please contact 311 right away so a DOT inspector will go out there (don’t mention building construction because they may pass it to DOB and get lost in the shuffle.) If it’s during weekdays, write to Josh directly and he will have an inspector dispatched.
- 4) Future items to look into
- a. Request for a walkway on Nagle Avenue in front of the Y
  - b. Stop sign on Park Terrace East and 215<sup>th</sup> Street
  - c. David Thom’s greenstreet suggestion on 218<sup>th</sup> St and Broadway (need plaza sponsor – maybe reach out to Sandra Harris to get CU support on this)
  - d. Subways (for Marcus Book):
    - i. Dyckman/Broadway – stairs upkeep and cleaning
    - ii. Rerouting of the M100
    - iii. Elevator on the 1 Train and Dyckman
    - iv. Crosswalk at 190<sup>th</sup> and Bennett – entrance to the A train
    - v. Bus bunching and gaps
    - vi. M4 on Ft. Washington going north
    - vii. Bus Terminal – Port Authority

Meeting adjourned at 8:10pm