HOTEL MANSFIELD (NOW THE MANSFIELD HOTEL), 12 West 44th Street (aka 12-14 West 44th Street), Manhattan
Built 1901-02; Architects: Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen

Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 47

On March 27, 2012, the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel) and the proposed designation of the related Landmark Site (Item No. 2). The hearing was duly advertised according to the provisions of law. One witness, a representative of the Historic Districts Council, spoke in favor of the designation.

Summary
The Hotel Mansfield is a 12-story, red-brick and limestone Beaux-Arts style hotel located on the same prestigious Midtown block as the New York Yacht Club, the former Yale Club, the Harvard Club, the former Mechanics’ and Tradesmen’s Institute, the New York Bar Association, and the Algonquin Hotel (which are all individually designated New York City Landmarks). Completed in 1902 to the designs of Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen, the hotel originally boasted 14 large and well-appointed residential suites on the 2nd to 12th floors, plus two penthouse suites. The Hotel Mansfield was an early example of the apartment hotel type that catered to well-to-do single men and childless couples, who resided in these buildings on a semi-permanent or even permanent basis, taking advantage of the services on offer such as common dining rooms, maid and laundry services, valets, and even private physicians. The building’s residents included a number of people working in the arts, theater, business, and the professions, such as the architect William Mitchell Kendall from the offices of McKim, Mead & White; James B. Ford, the president of the U.S. Rubber Company; and the abstract expressionist artist Vincent Pepi. Along with the private clubs, hotels, and institutions that opened on the block in the last decade of the 19th century, the Hotel Mansfield signaled the area’s status as a highly desirable and fashionable district for wealthy New Yorkers and visitors alike. The architects Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen designed the Hotel Mansfield in the Beaux-Arts architectural style, in part, because of the style’s residential associations and flamboyance, which helped to set the hotel apart from other building types, such as office or commercial buildings. The Hotel Mansfield, which is a significant surviving example of the ornate, early-twentieth-century, Beaux-arts-style hotel building in New York, features several hallmarks of that style, including a two-story rusticated limestone base; vertical ranks of copper-clad oriel s; bold and over-scaled ornament such as quoins, cartouches, garlands, and swags; and a heavy balcony supported on paired modillions beneath a copper cornice decorated with anthemia. The hotel is crowned by a curving mansard roof with three large segmental-arch dormers. Now known as the Mansfield Hotel, the building remains an imposing presence on West 44th Street.
FINDINGS AND DESIGNATION

Development of West 44th Street near the Hotel Mansfield

In the 1870s, West 44th Street between 5th and 6th Avenues was dominated by the Sixth Avenue Railroad Depot, a slaughterhouse, and stables for the stagecoach lines, as well as small, private stables. Large cattle yards were located nearby, east of 5th Avenue. By the late 1880s, however, the area was being rapidly developed with clubs, institutions, and residential hotels. The street’s first club, the Berkeley Athletic Club (1887-88, demolished), was located at No. 23. Other early developments included the Berkeley School (later General Society of Mechanics and Tradesmen) (1890, Lamb & Rich; 1903-05, Ralph S. Townsend), No. 20; Harvard Club (1893-94, McKim, Mead & White), No. 27; St. Nicholas Club (1893-94, George E. Wood; demolished), No. 7; Association of the Bar of the City of New York (1895-96, Cyrus L.W. Eidlitz), No. 42; Delmonico’s restaurant (1897, James Brown Lord; demolished), Fifth Avenue and West 44th Street; and New York Yacht Club (1899-1900, Warren & Wetmore), No. 37. These developments, coupled with plans for a new Grand Central Station, made the Hotel Mansfield’s address a prime location. A number of other hotels and clubs were developed in the area at about the same time as the Hotel Mansfield in 1901-02. These included the Yale Club of New York City (1900-01, Tracy & Swartwout), No. 30-32; Lambs Club (1904-05, McKim, Mead & White), No. 128; the Iroquois (1903, Harry B. Mulliken), an apartment hotel, No. 49-53; Algonquin Hotel (1902, Goldwin Starrett), No. 59-61; City Club (1902-04, Lord & Hewlett), No. 55-57; Alpha Delta Phi Club (1905-07, Louis Brown and Palmer & Hornbostel), No. 136; and Phi Gamma Delta Club, No. 44 (after 1908 at No. 34).2

Theaters were also moving uptown to the Times Square area. In 1905, the old Sixth Avenue Railroad Depot was replaced by the Hippodrome, advertised as the “world’s largest playhouse.”3 It was joined by a number of other theaters on West 44th Street; among them were the Belasco Theater (1907, George Keister), No. 111-121, the Little Theater (now Helen Hayes Theater) (1912, Ingalls & Hoffman), No. 238; the Schubert Theater (1912-13, Henry B. Herts), No. 221-233; and the Broadhurst Theater (1917-18, Herbert J. Krapp), No. 235-243, all designated New York City Landmarks.

Hotel Architecture4

Hotels played an important role in the life of the city throughout the 19th and 20th centuries. For many years the Astor House, built in 1836 by Isaiah Rogers, located on Broadway between Barclay and Vesey Streets, was the city’s most renowned hotel.5 As the population moved northward, so did the hotel district. By 1859, the Fifth Avenue Hotel, called the "first modern New York Hotel,"6 opened on Madison Square, offering its patrons amenities such as New York's first passenger elevator and luxuriously decorated interiors. During the course of the 19th century, hotels became increasingly larger and more luxurious. Perhaps the ultimate in 19th century hotel splendor was architect Henry J. Hardenbergh’s Waldorf Hotel and Astoria Hotel (which functioned as one hotel), and had 1,300 bedrooms and 40 public rooms, all lavishly and individually decorated.

The Waldorf and Astoria complex, however, was not the only grand hotel built in the late 19th century. Fostered by economic prosperity, the large luxury hotels of this period became the venue for public life, supplying halls for promenading, dining rooms to be seen in, and private rooms in which to entertain and be entertained.7 Improvements in transportation during the late 19th century made travel between and within cities easier, and people began to travel for pleasure
as well as business. By the early 20th century, the tendency was observed to "include within the walls of the building all the possible comforts of modern life, facilities which formerly could be found only outside of the hotel walls. Telephones, Turkish baths, private nurses, physicians..." in addition to laundry, maids, valets, barbers, hairdressers, and shoe shine boys. A large staff was required to supply such services, which in turn necessitated a building that was large enough to make the whole enterprise financially sound.

The Waldorf and Astoria Hotels’ warm-colored brick, elaborate ornament, and strong roofline provided a stylistic exemplar for other hotels. The architects of the Hotel Mansfield were influenced by Hardenbergh’s influential hotel designs. In 1905, the architectural critic A. C. David proclaimed that the large, new American hotels were "in a different class architecturally from any similar buildings which have preceded them." These tall buildings were constructed with steel-frames, like skyscrapers, but were created "in such a manner that it would be distinguished from the office-building and suggest some relation to domestic life." David praised the use of warm materials, especially brick, and admired the strong roof lines. The Hotel Mansfield is one of the more exuberant manifestations of the fascination that American architects had with Parisian architecture in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

**Apartment Hotels**

During the 1880s, apartment hotels catering to those who maintained residences outside the city and could not afford, or did not desire, to maintain a city residence, began to be constructed in New York City. These hotels provided suites of rooms that were serviced by the hotel staff; thus, guests did not need servants. By 1905, it was estimated that there were almost 100 such establishments in "in the central part of Manhattan."

Apartment hotels were intended to house permanent and transient, but long term, tenants as well as small families, in suites and single rooms, furnished or unfurnished. All lacked kitchen facilities and, instead, the apartment hotel employed full-service staffs and provided ground floor breakfast rooms and restaurants. The first wave of apartment hotel construction occurred between 1889 and 1895. Apartment hotels became so numerous that they sparked a backlash among New York’s social establishment, who disdained as vulgar the idea of unrelated people living under one roof.

A second wave of apartment hotel construction followed the passage of the new building code in 1899 and the Tenement House Law in 1901. The Hotel Mansfield was built during this period. Under the Tenement House Law, apartment hotels were classified as hotels rather than tenement apartments. Therefore, apartment hotel construction was exempt from the stringent tenement house law and regulated only by the more flexible building code, as applied to commercial buildings. As a consequence, apartment hotels could be less fireproof, taller, cover a larger portion of the lot, and contain more units than apartment houses, giving builders a better financial return.

The third wave of apartment hotel construction, driven by economic prosperity in the 1920s, ended with the Great Depression. The passage of the Multiple Dwelling Act of 1929 altered height and bulk restrictions and permitted “skyscraper” apartment buildings for the first time, which eliminated the economic advantages of apartment hotels. This law, combined with rising labor costs and the onset of the Great Depression, effectively marked the end of the apartment hotels, most of which have now been converted to conventional apartment buildings or hotels.
The Beaux Arts Style

Named for the famous architectural school, the Ecole des Beaux Arts in Paris, the Beaux Arts style of architecture was brought to this country by the Americans who studied there. It became popular in the United States at the end of the 19th century and in the early 20th century as American tastes demanded more classical designs, encouraged by the architecture and planning displayed at the World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893. By the 20th century, the organization and specific order suggested by classical ideas were important, but architects and their clients were often content to get their ornamental inspiration from multiple sources, and were sometimes interested in applying a lavish amount of decoration to a building in order to suggest the erudition of the owner and designer. Often moving toward a degree of baroque classicism, buildings in this style usually featured a rusticated stone base, heavy brackets, columns, balconies, and an elaborate mansard roof with embellished dormer windows.

The Hotel Mansfield uses classical ideas of symmetry in its façade arrangement, with a central entrance enhanced by giant, decorated brackets supporting a large hood topped by balustrade. The upper façade is divided into three major bays with vertical ranks of copper-clad oriel and quoins providing vertical emphasis. The façade is divided by cornices into a base, mid-section, and finishing element. The base of the building, in typical Beaux Arts style fashion, is faced with rusticated stone, while the third through the eighth stories form a main body faced in red brick. The ninth story is transition, faced partially in brick as well as stone, and is topped by the main projecting limestone cornice with its paired brackets and large dentils. The tenth story is hardly visible above the cornice, but is also a transitional level rising to the elaborate mansard roof and segmentally arched dormers above a copper cornice decorated with anthemia. The façade is given special emphasis by several bold and oversized ornamental features, including elaborate cartouches above the main entrance and at the base of the central oriel, and cartouches with heads at the bases of the side oriel, as well as an assortment of swags, garlands, and wreaths at the lower and upper parts of the facade. These carved stone elements are out of scale with the rest of the building, but are designed to make it an eye-catching statement on its narrow, side street location.

The Architects: Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen

Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen was a successor firm to that originally established by James Renwick, designer of Grace Church (a designated New York City Landmark), St. Patrick’s Cathedral (a designated New York City Landmark), and the original Smithsonian building and the Renwick Gallery in Washington, D.C., among many others. James Renwick began taking partners in 1858, and in 1883, his wife’s distant cousin, J. Lawrence Aspinwall, became a partner after many years of working there as draftsman. Renwick’s nephew, William W. Renwick, became a junior partner in 1890. After the death of the elder Renwick in 1895 until 1904, the firm became Renwick, Aspinwall & (Walter T.) Owen with Aspinwall as senior partner. In 1905, the firm became Renwick, Aspinwall & Tucker until Aspinwall’s retirement in 1925. From 1926 until 1940, the firm continued as Renwick, Aspinwall and Guard.

Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen are recognized for their design of the Colonial Revival style buildings located in the New York City Farm Colony-Seaview Hospital Historic District on Staten Island, as well as for a 1904-05 addition to James Renwick, Jr.’s Smallpox Hospital on Roosevelt Island, which is an individually designated New York City Landmark, and for a townhouse in the Metropolitan Museum Historic District.
J. Lawrence Aspinwall (1854-1936) was born in New York City and studied at several private schools. He eventually studied under L. Colian (or Collan), a French architect and engineer residing in New York, and then entered the firm of James Renwick in 1875. He is given the attribution for the designs of the second Stock Exchange Building, the American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children and that for the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, as well as several apartment houses and hospitals. He worked closely with James Renwick on many details of Grace Church and St. Patrick’s Cathedral. He was a Fellow of the American Institute of Architects and a member of the New York Architectural League.

William Whetton Renwick (1864-1933) was born in Lenox, Massachusetts and graduated from the Stevens Institute of Technology in 1885, studying mechanical engineering. He also studied sculpture and painting in Paris and Rome. The younger Renwick participated in the design and decoration of several churches and in his later private practice he specialized in ecclesiastical architecture and decoration. Among his major commissions were St. Aloysius Church (1902-04, 209-217 West 132nd Street, Manhattan), All Saints Roman Catholic Church School (1902-04, 52 East 130th Street, Manhattan), and the Cathedral of Saints Peter and Paul, Indianapolis, Indiana (1905-07). He is credited with developing the process of “fresco relief” which utilizes both sculpture and painting.

Very little is known about Walter Tallant Owen (1864-1902), who was born in Boston Massachusetts. His father was a physician. The earliest date that Owen was known to have been living in the New York area was in 1894, the year before he joined the Renwick firm.

The Hotel Mansfield

In April 1901, John G. McCullough and Frederick B. Jennings purchased two lots on West 44th Street, just west of Fifth Avenue, upon which they would build the Hotel Mansfield during the course of the ensuing year. The men engaged the prominent architectural firm Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen to design a new apartment hotel in the then-popular Beaux Arts style. Permits for the demolition of the existing buildings and for the construction of the new building were soon filed, and construction began shortly thereafter and was complete in 1902.

John G. McCullough (c.1862-date of death not determined) was born in California and lived alternately at 88 Park Avenue in Manhattan and in Bennington, Vermont. A lawyer by profession, he was also a United States Army general and served as the governor of Vermont in 1902-04. Frederick B. Jennings (c.1856- date of death not determined) was born in Vermont and lived at 86 Park Avenue next door to Mr. McCullough in the early 20th century. Jennings, also a lawyer, was married to Laura Hall Jennings (c.1858-1939), a native of Bennington, who was active in the affairs of Bennington College. In 1930, she presented the college with a new 140 acre campus. The McCullough and Jennings families retained ownership of the Hotel Mansfield until 1940.

Over the years, a number of people in the arts, theater, business, and professions resided in the Hotel Mansfield, including the architect William Mitchell Kendall from the offices of McKim , Mead & White in the 1920s and 30s; James B. Ford, president of the U.S. Rubber Company, in the 1920s; Broadway actor and producer Charles Hopkins in the 1900s; artist Vincent Pepi, abstract expressionist, in the 1960s; theatrical producers H. Clay Blaney and Arthur Beckhard in the 40s and 50s; and French railroad magnate, Baron Hubert Lejeune, in the 1940s.

In 1995, the hotel underwent a major renovation, including removal of the storefront that was applied over the original first floor façade to the west of the main entryway. The upper
façade was cleaned and the copper-clad oriel windows were restored. Small bathroom windows were
inserted into the building’s midsection. Afterwards, the Hotel Mansfield became listed among a
growing number of “boutique hotels” that cater to tourists looking for inexpensive but well-
appointed hotels – a genre that was on the rise in the mid-1990s. Now known as the Mansfield
Hotel, the building is still in use as a hotel and remains an imposing presence on West 44th
Street.

Description

The Hotel Mansfield is a Beaux-Arts style is-story building, arranged in an H-plan with
two light courts, the west one being somewhat larger than the one on the east side of the
building. The building features a two-story rusticated limestone base; vertical ranks of copper-
clad oriel windows; bold and over-scaled ornament such as quoins, cartouches, garlands, and swags; and
a heavy balcony supported on paired modillions beneath a copper cornice decorated with
anthemia. The hotel is crowned by a curving mansard roof with three large segmental-arch
dormers.

Historic: Two-story rusticated base, round-arch entryway and fenestration at the first
story; beveled and molded main entryway jamb; large cartouche and scrolled brackets, wrapped
in garlands, at the main entryway; molded crown above the first story at the same level of the
floor of the second-story balcony; second-story balcony with balustrade and plinths; elaborate
ironwork at the end bays of the second story; recessed center bay at the second story in a curved
niche topped with carvings of an urn and swags; crown molding above the second story
supported the elaborately-decorated curved bases of the upper story oriel windows; mid-section of
building (third through half of the ninth story) clad in brick and framed by stone quoins;
elaborate iron railing at the center bay of the third story; angular oriel windows from the third through the
eighth stories featuring aedicules, paneled spandrels, and rope moldings; segmental fenestration
at the ninth story with grouped windows separated by paneled columns; giant, oversized cornice
above the ninth story with paired, scrolled brackets (wrapped in garlands), smaller brackets with
foliation, dentils, and compound molding with rams heads; elaborate metal railing on top of the
cornice; tenth story (partially visible) with paired fenestration, paneled columns and piers; stone
and copper crown above the tenth story decorated with masks, anthemia, and scrolled elements;
convex mansard roof (incorporating the eleventh and twelfth stories) with slate tile roofing,
copper flashing, stone end walls topped with cusps and scrolls, and organic copper elements at
the roofline; segmental dormers at the eleventh story with paired windows (sash replaced), eared
surrounds, rope molding labels with scrolled brackets, and cartouches surrounded with scrolled
ornamentation.

Alterations: Original first-story window converted to recessed, secondary entryway with
stone steps, brass railing, and hanging lamp; angled sign, plaque, replacement doors and transom
at the main entryway; replacement sash at the first story; louvered vent, replacement sash, and
flagpoles at the second story; non-historic bracketed lamps on the second-story crown; non-
historic sash at the building’s mid section; small, non-historic windows next to the east bays
from the third through the ninth stories; non-historic up lighting on the oriel window bays; one of
the giant brackets at the cornice cut back for small window.

Site: Building is on the south side of West 44th Street, at the lot line, 250 feet west of
Fifth Avenue, fills most of its lot (There appears to be a small back yard).
NOTES


5. Not only was the building very large, but it was equipped with the latest facilities, including a bath and toilet on every floor.


7. This phenomenon continued well into the twentieth century.

8. In addition, hotels enhanced their sense of luxury by adding all the latest technological advancements, including electricity, elevators, telephones, and central heat.


12. Ibid.


16. Apartment hotels built during this period introduced “bootleg kitchens” – a true kitchenette – into their suites, which were intended to warm up food provided by room service. Under the law, however, the stoves were still not allowed in living units of apartment hotels, but the law was not strictly enforced. Many existing apartment hotels were retrofitted in this manner. The situation became a matter of public controversy.

17. This section was adapted from LPC, *Hotel Wolcott Designation Report* (LP-2423), (New York: City of New York, 2011), report prepared by Virginia Kurshan, Research Department.


19. Although Walter T. Owen died in 1902, citations of works executed by this partnership continue through 1904.

20. St. Aloysius Church and All Saints Roman Catholic Church School are designated New York City Landmarks.

FINDINGS AND DESIGNATION

On the basis of a careful consideration of the history, the architecture, and other features of the building and site, the Landmarks Preservation Commission finds that the Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel) has a special character, special historical and aesthetic interest, and value as part of the development, heritage, and cultural characteristics of New York City.

The Commission further finds that, among its important qualities, the Hotel Mansfield, complete in 1902, was an early example of the apartment hotel type that catered to well-to-do single men and childless couples who resided in these buildings on a semi-permanent or even permanent basis; that the hotel is located on the same prestigious Midtown block as the New York Yacht Club, the former Yale Club, the Harvard Club, the former Mechanics’ and Tradesmen’s Institute, the New York Bar Association, and the Algonquin Hotel; that along with the private clubs, hotels, and institutions that opened on that block in the last decade of the 19th century, the Hotel Mansfield signaled the area’s status as a highly desirable and fashionable district for wealthy New Yorkers and visitors alike; that its past residents included a number of people who worked in the arts, theater, business, and the professions, such as the architect William Mitchell Kendall from the offices of McKim, Mead & White; James B. Ford, the president of the U.S. Rubber Company; and the abstract expressionist artist Vincent Pepi; that Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen was one of the city’s major architectural firms that designed several individually designated landmarks and buildings in historic districts; that the firm’s design for the Hotel Mansfield reflects the popularity of the Beaux-Arts architectural style for luxury hotels at the turn of the 20th century, a style chosen in part for its residential associations and a flamboyance that set it apart from other building types; that the Hotel Mansfield features several hallmarks of that style, including a two-story rusticated limestone base; vertical ranks of copper-clad oriel; bold and over-scaled ornament such as quoins, cartouches, garlands, and swags; and a heavy balcony supported on paired modillions beneath a copper cornice decorated with anthemia; that the building, still in use as a hotel remains an imposing presence on West 44th Street, and that the elaborate brick and limestone facade of the Hotel Mansfield is a significant surviving example of the ornate, early-twentieth-century, Beaux-arts-style hotel building in New York.

Accordingly, pursuant to provisions of Chapter 74, Section 3020 of the Charter of the City of New York and Chapter 3 of Title 25 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission designates as a Landmark the Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel), and designates Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 47 as its Landmark Site.

Pablo E. Vengochea, Vice-Chair
Frederick Bland, Michael Goldblum, Margery Perlmutter,
Elizabeth Ryan, Roberta Washington, Commissioners
Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel)
12 West 44th Street (aka 12-14 West 44th Street), Manhattan
Block: 1259, Lot: 47
Photo: Christopher D. Brazee (2012)
Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel)
12 West 44th Street (aka 12-14 West 44th Street), Manhattan
Block: 1259, Lot: 47
Photo: LPC Staff (2009)

Hotel Mansfield (now the Mansfield Hotel)
12 West 44th Street (aka 12-14 West 44th Street), Manhattan
Block: 1259, Lot: 47
Photo: Christopher D. Brazee (2012)
HOTEL MANSFIELD (NOW THE MANSFIELD HOTEL) (LP-2517), 12 West 44th Street (aka 12-14 West 44th Street)
Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan, Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 47

Designated: June 12, 2012