1	CITY OF NEW YORK
2	2012-2013
3	REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
4	PUBLIC MEETING
5	CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
6	August 24, 2012
7	1:00 P.M.
8	
9	IN ATTENDANCE:
10	FRANK PADAVAN
11	ROXANNE J. PERSAUD
12	THOMAS V. OGNIBENE
13	BENITO ROMANO
14	ROBERT W. HART
15	GLORIA CARVAJAL WOLFE
16	JUSTIN YU
17	MADELINE PROVENZANO
18	OSCAR ODOM, III
19	JAMILA PONTON BRAGG
20	JOHN ROBERT
21	LINDA LIN
22	SCOTT CERULLO
23	
24	
25	

1	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: Good afternoon. This is
2	the first stated meeting of the New York City
3	Districting Commission. Welcome to Commission
4	members. The purpose of this meeting is to,
5	among other things, take stock of what we have
6	heard in our first-phase, five public hearings at
7	the various boroughs and to adopt some procedural
8	and policy matters, hear from the staff and
9	direct the staff on the publication of a
10	preliminary district plan.
11	Notice of this meeting and of future
12	meetings have been posted on our website,
13	www.nyc/gov/districting. This is an open
14	meeting, open to the public, but no testimony
15	will be taken from the public today, as
16	previously announced at each of our public
17	hearings.
18	The first items on our agenda, which has
19	previously been distributed is the adoption of
20	the minutes of our July 17th meeting. Has
21	everyone had an opportunity to receive and review
22	the minutes?
23	(A chorus of aye's.)
24	Do I hear a motion to adopt the minutes?
25	MS. PERSAUD: I make a motion.

1	MS. PROVENZANO: Second.
2	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: Motion has been made and
3	seconded. Are there any questions about the
4	minutes, inclusions, corrections, deletions?
5	(Silence.)
6	All in favor of the motion indicate by
7	raising your hands.
8	(Commissioners comply.)
9	The minutes are adopted.
10	The next items on the agenda is for the
11	Commission to adopt a media policy. It's
12	included in your package. Are there any
13	questions or discussions that we would like to
14	entertain regarding our media relations protocol
15	which is included in your package?
16	(Silence.)
17	Do I hear a motion to adopt the media
18	policy?
19	MR. ODOM: Motion to adopt.
20	MR. OGNIBENE: Second.
21	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: Motion has been made and
22	seconded.
23	MR. YU: And second.
24	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: All in favor, please
25	indicate by raising your hands.

Τ	(Commissioners comply.)
2	The motion is carried.
3	We are going to be having a training at our
4	next meeting on September 4th on the conflicts of
5	interest board General Counsel Wayne Hawley.
6	This is just to advise you that it's important
7	that we attend the next meeting to get this
8	training. It's important for every City
9	official, even volunteers.
10	That brings us to our executive director's
11	report. The executive director will now address.
12	MR. HUM: Thank you so much, Mr. Chair, for
13	the opportunity to update the Commission on staff
14	activities, and particularly, my activities since
15	I have been appointed executive director on July
16	17.
17	First off, in addition to the initial
18	appointments made on the 17th, with regards to
19	Thaddeus Hackworth as General Counsel and Alan
20	Gartner as deputy executive director, I have also
21	made additional staff appointments. By now, most
22	of you know some of these individuals, but I want
23	to introduce them formally for the record and to
24	the public as well.
25	First off, as director of community

outreach, I have appointed Jonathan Ettricks.

Our public affairs manager is Shirley Limongi,

who is right there, Brian Flynn as our director

of operations, and finally, for director of IT

services, I have appointed David Cheng. He is

not here today. He is actually back in the

office making sure that our software is running

properly.

Speaking of software, one of the charges that you have provided me on the 17th was to make any and all pertinent purchases of software to do our work as a Commission, namely for map and also for data analysis. I am happy to report that we have purchased Maptitude software, the desktop version, and I will report a little later on for our online version.

For those of you who don't know, Maptitude is a redirecting software that is made by a company called Caliper. Caliper has been, and in particular, Maptitude, has been a software used by the states of California, Idaho, Arizona, Montana and in the cities of Los Angeles, Portland, Oregon, among other cities and states that these entities that chosen to do their redistricting.

L	We are currently working with Caliper and
2	the Department of Information Technology to
3	install an online version of Maptitude that the
1	public can use to draw its own maps in the
5	comfort of their own home. It would be an
5	interactive, user-friendly software that we are
7	hoping to launch in the next couple of weeks.

Additionally, I would like to note that the online software that will be available for the public, again, free of charge, will also contain all the same sources of information, i.e. U.S. census data, that the Commission will be using to draw the district maps.

I also want to note that online version will allow the user to save his or her map and submit it to the Commission for its consideration. As we receive maps and as we receive testimony, we will make it available for the Commission. And additionally, all the testimony that we have received thus far is available on our website.

As you have noted, Mr. Chair, in your remarks, the public hearings, the website, nyc.gov/districting is the practical repository for all materials that the Commission is receiving. I also want to make note that, at our

have created a resource room for the public. It will be open after the Labor Day weekend and the resource room will be equipped with three computer terminals that are loaded with the Maptitude software that will allow the public to come in, via appointment, to help them draw their own maps for submission to the Commission. The resource room will be staffed by a member of the technical services group to help any member of the public draw their maps and also navigate the software.

We are in the midst of making arrangements to have the resource room open past 5:00 to accommodate the working schedules of busy New Yorkers throughout the city.

And additionally, just for your edification, we will be having a training for Maptitude by Caliper next week on Wednesday and Thursday, the 29th and the 30th. Members of the Commission, you are more than invited to come and join the staff in the training that we will receive from Caliper.

I also invite to you please come visit us at 253 Broadway, 7th floor and take a look at the

1	resource room and also take a look at some of the
2	maps you have produced already as a result of the
3	public hearings. Specifically, we have created
4	maps, City Council District maps that have
5	overlays of community boards, senate districts,
6	assembly districts and congressional districts
7	and we have dedicated a particular room for all
8	five boroughs. Please come down and take a look
9	at some of the work that the technical services
10	has performed.
11	The only thing I ask is that, if you do plan
12	to come, please coordinate with Jonathan
13	Ettricks, because I want to make sure that there
14	is personnel on hand to walk you through the
15	software and also walk you through the maps that
16	we have produced the overlays. I want to, if
17	there is any questions on the mapping software, I
18	will move on to my next topic.
19	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: Just a technical question.
20	If we create maps ourselves, members of the
21	Commission, will we have the ability to save it
22	so that we don't have to go back and recreate it
23	a second time?
24	MR. HUM: I believe so, that we do, yes,
25	yes. You, the Commission, will have an account

1	via online software. Any other questions?
2	(Silence.)
3	I will move on to the next topic, which is
4	the use of prison population data. Included in
5	your packets is a memo that was written by our
6	General Counsel, Thaddeus Hackworth, dated
7	August 13th. There has been much discussion at
8	the public hearings and also in the meetings that
9	I have had personally with regards to the use of
10	prison population data.
11	As the memo notes, have been made available
12	to the public today, as the memo notes, the
13	Commission is required to use prison-adjusted
14	population for amendments made to the Municipal
15	Home Rule Law. So, the outcome of this is that
16	this will effectively add 21,000 persons to the
17	official U.S. Census count that we will be using.
18	These figures have already been included in
19	all the materials that have been handed out to
20	the public. So, during the last five public
21	hearings, we have had maps of each borough with
22	the population count for each council district.
23	Those already include prison population.
24	Just a point of clarification, the prison
25	population only includes State prisoners

1	currently in Department of Correction custody.
2	We are not including federal prisoners. We are
3	not including City prisoners, per the bill that
4	was passed in Albany two years ago.
5	There is also some question as to, there is
6	effectively 30,000 New Yorkers who are serving
7	time upstate. What happened to the other 9,000?
8	The difference between the 21,000 and 30,000
9	really is a function of whether the prisoner had
10	given a homeless address or given a correct
11	address.
12	So, it's impossible the Department of
13	Correction to have given LATFOR addresses to
14	reintegrate those individuals back into their
15	home districts. For those individuals who said
16	they were homeless or gave bad addresses or gave
17	false addresses, there was no way to reach them
18	in their home districts. That is the difference
19	between 30,000 and 21,000. If there is any other
20	questions on that, I will move on to my next
21	topic.
22	(Silence.)
23	I want to report on the external meetings
24	that I have had since my time, with my
25	appointment, roughly in the past five weeks or

1	so. As you know, the Department of Justice
2	submission looks very closely as to how much
3	community outreach the Commission has done,
4	particularly including what the staff has done
5	regarding the public and including the community
6	in the process of drawing the district maps.
7	All in all, in the past five weeks, I have
8	met with 16 interest advocacy and good government
9	groups, and I will give you a lifting of them:
10	The Asian American Coalition on Redistricting and
11	Democracy, otherwise known as AACORD, Israel
12	America, Asian Americans for Equality, otherwise
13	known as AAFE, the Asian American Legal Defense
14	and Education Fund, also known as AALDEF, the
15	Black, Latino and Asian Caucus of New York City
16	Council, Borough Park Jewish Community Council,
17	Brennan Center at NYU Law School, Center for Law
18	and Social Justice as Medgar Evers College,
19	Citizens Union, Common Cause New York, Education
20	Center for Russian Jewry, the Jewish Community
21	Relations Council, former districting
22	commissioner John Flatow, council of New York,
23	the NAACP, and finally, Taking Our Seat.
24	This list is not exhaustive of all the
25	groups that I have reached out to. Obviously,

1	these are the groups that I have actually met
2	with. There's another list of folks and groups
3	that I have reached out to that I have yet to
4	either receive a response from, or we are still
5	in the midst of corresponding our schedules to
6	meet. Hopefully, I will conclude that by the
7	time of our next report to the Commission
8	meeting.
9	Also, be aware that any materials that I
10	have received during these meetings I upload onto
11	the Commission's password-secure site. As you
12	know, we have backed up all the materials that we
13	have received from the public hearings onto
14	another server for the Commission and it's
15	protected by a password. You will be receiving
16	an e-mail with the password and the site.
17	I have also uploaded those materials there
18	for your perusal. And certainly, if there is any
19	question in regard to those meetings, please give
20	me a call as to those meetings. Any other
21	questions? Sure.
22	MS. BRAGG: Could you detail a little bit
23	more your plan going forward to community
24	outreach?
25	MR. HUM: Sure. After Labor Day, we will be

1	creating a speakers bureau in the staff and we
2	will be alerting all community groups. Again,
3	our e-mail list is 5,500 individuals, groups,
4	organizations across the city, in addition to a
5	list of around 50,000 that we have received.
6	These are 50,000 e-mails that have expressed
7	interest in following us.
8	So, we are going to do an e-mail blast right
9	after the Labor Day weekend informing the
10	formation of a speakers bureau. What a speakers
11	bureau is, is basically everyone on staff is
12	going to be on call, if you will, to make
13	presentations about the districting process and
14	the districting Commission.
15	So, if any group, let's say, in Queens or in
16	Brooklyn, we will go out and we will travel to
17	their meetings, to their board meetings, whatever
18	it may be, to talk about the districting process
19	and how they can get involved. If there are any
20	other questions, I will move on to my next topic.
21	(Silence.)
22	It's not on the agenda, but it's an add-on.
23	It is just an announcement of a seminar series
24	that we will be holding for the commissioners.
25	They are, of course, they are not mandatory, but

they are certainly helpful with regard to the work ahead of you. And the seminar series is focused on redistricting, law and also on New York.

The first seminar will be given on

September 20th and at this point, we are looking

for a location. But if all else fails, we will

have it over at our office at 253 Broadway. And

it is a seminar given on the Voting Rights Act

given by Gerry Herbert, former Department of

Justice official who worked in the Voting Rights

Section of the Department of Justice and has a

very clear and concise understanding of the

Voting Rights Act and the current trends and the

Department of Justice has been experiencing with

regard to submissions to the Department.

There will be at least two other developments to the seminar series. One will be given by our very own Thaddeus Hackworth on the City charter and districting. And finally, we will have a seminar given by John Mollenkopf on trends in the City, almost an addendum, if you will, to Joe Salvo's presentation that we had at the 17th.

It digs a little deeper into the demographic

1	trends that the City has been experiencing over
2	the past ten years. If there is any other
3	question, I will move on to my final topic.
4	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: This is not a question,
5	it's an observation. For those on the Commission
6	who have received but not have yet completed
7	reading the ABA booklet on redistricting law, I
8	highly recommend it. It's a very readable piece.
9	It compresses lots of law into a very simple
10	narrative that is easy to follow.
11	It also, you can't help but be struck by how
12	complex the subject is after reading it. It
13	would be a very good way to prepare for the
14	seminar by Mr. Herbert, who I have had the
15	privilege of meeting, and he knows the subject
16	extremely well and it will be a very enjoyable
17	session, I am sure.
18	MR. HUM: Those books will be districted to
19	the Commission. I have already put an order in
20	and we are hoping they will be delivered.
21	I will move on to my final topic of
22	discussion, which is a report of the first round
23	of public hearings. As you all know, last night
24	concluded the first round of the public hearings
25	for the districting process. And all in all,

over 350 individuals attended the hearings throughout the five boroughs and we had testimony from over 130 witnesses at the five hearings.

I will go over some of the major themes that I heard and the staff has heard throughout the five hearings. And I will start with, sort of what we heard throughout the five boroughs, and particularly from some of the good government groups and the Voting Right Act observers. They wanted transparency in the process, access to data and mapping software that the Commission has, observation of the prison gerrymandering bill.

And they also wanted to make sure that the hearings and also the meetings are accessible to all individuals, i.e. through webcasting, which we are webcasting today over our website.

Additionally, they were asking the deviations in population between districts be no more than one to two percent, and also asking for increasing diversity among the Commission staff.

Additionally, we also heard that there was a request that, in the districting process, that there be co-terminality with entities such as community boards and police precincts, and that

really triggered our staff to create the maps I

just talked about with regard to the overlays.

Some of the borough-based concerns I will go over. And I will make note that a contingent of Asian-American interest groups under the umbrella of AACORD attended three out of the five hearings with particular focus on Richmond Hill, South Ozone Park and Ozone Park. Also in Queens, the Flushing and Bayside areas of Queens, Sunset Park, Bensonhurst areas in Brooklyn, and Chinatown/Lower East Side neighborhoods of Manhattan were particular areas of concern from the group.

Other borough-based concerns included keeping Upper West Side together as defined by 96th to 125th Street, keeping Greenwich Village together, addressing the undercount in the Park Hill and Stapleton areas of Staten Island, excluding single-family homeowners from Flushing, Community District 20 and keeping the Bay Leaf Park Houses within one district in Queens, and finally, as we heard last night, that we observe the racial characteristics of Council District 16 in the Bronx.

25 I am sure there are other observations, but

L	those are some of the highlights I took away and
2	my staff took away from those public hearings.
3	If there are any other questions, that concludes
1	my report.

CHAIRMAN ROMANO: My impression from the public hearings is that we haven't heard nearly enough from interested persons so far. There are many more views out there that ought to be shared with the Commission that we ought to be taking into consideration.

In part because of that, I thought it would be advisable for the Commission, because the Commission's composition is such that we come from different boroughs and we spent most of our lives living in boroughs other than the ones we are hearing a lot about in these Commission hearings, so we have an expertise, personal expertise in a very narrow subset of issues.

I thought it would be advisable to exercise the authority under our bylaws to create subcommittees with the expectation that a smaller group of Commission members with some more intimate knowledge and maybe even personal experience with the boroughs involved would, given the process of drilling down further into

the data and into the views of community
representatives and start to develop proposals
that the rest of the Commission can consider.

The subcommittees are not going to be authorized to make decisions for the Commission. Their function is primarily to take front-line responsibility for examining the important, and identifying the important issues in each borough, developing proposals to address those issues and having those proposals presented to the rest of the Commission for the Commission as a whole to adopt.

With that in mind, I have decided to create the following subcommittees: For the Bronx,
Madeline Provenzano, John Robert, Marc Wurzel;
for Manhattan, Jamila Ponton Bragg, Justin Yu and Gloria Wolfe; for Brooklyn, Oscar Odom, Roxanne
Persaud and Robert Hart; Queens, Linda Lin, Tom
Ognibene, Frank Padavan; and Staten Island, Scott
Cerullo and Kamillah Hanks. And I will serve as
ex officio member of all the subcommittees.

My personal impression of the hearings is as well that we need more information. We are only beginning to come to grips with sort of a global sense of what people are feeling, but we need

much more information about the nature and the contours of the various neighborhoods, where people feel they have communities of interest that they share with others.

For most of us, it was difficult following some of the statements because we were not clear what neighborhoods people were talking about. We generally, of course, knew what borough they were talking about and we knew, of course, sometimes they would not think to mention the councilmanic district they were talking about, but often as they talked, as most people talk and think in terms of their neighborhoods and their precincts and their local institutions. And so, I think we need to understand that better before we go very much further.

Does anyone else have any impressions or views about the hearings that we just went through that they would like to share with the rest of us?

MS. BRAGG: I wanted to say, I agree with what Benito said. We need a lot of information from the different boroughs and the neighborhoods. It was great to hear kind of the communities that Mr. Hum already highlighted in

1	Queens and the Bronx and Manhattan, but there
2	were a couple others, I think the 28th District
3	in Brooklyn was also kind of highlighted in
4	Brooklyn in Queens, not in Brooklyn, in
5	Queens, 28th District in Queens was highlighted.
6	There was some concerns about 19, 20 and 21
7	in Queens as well. But it was also, as much as
8	we heard about certain districts, we didn't hear
9	anything about some districts at all. And so,
10	not having that information is we have got to
11	have a lot more information about what is going
12	on.
13	Also, we appreciate everyone's suggestions
14	about how they want neighborhoods grouped and
15	community interest groups together, and we do
16	appreciate that. But we also have to take into
17	account how grouping of certain neighborhoods
18	together will affect other neighborhoods.

And so, as we play through this process, it will be interesting to see how the preferences will affect other districts as well. So, it will be interesting as we go through this process, we are looking forward to that, and moving the map lines and seeing what that means.

MR. ODOM: I would just like to echo my

1	colleague's remarks. The other things I was
2	going to point to is, it's good that the people
3	that did show up provided some valuable
4	information or be involved with certain
5	neighborhoods. So, that was helpful for us, the
6	presentations that did exist.
7	But also stated, we needed more
8	participation for other people could come out to
9	express their concerns so this will give us a
10	better idea or understanding what is actually
11	taking place or how the community feels, so to
12	speak, across the community, because
13	presentations were there, but also we were
14	missing some people's other input, because some
15	people spoke about other districts that they had
16	no concern about, really, but they spoke about
17	other districts. So, to hear people who actually
18	live in certain areas, that would help out, too.
19	MR. OGNIBENE: Yeah. I would like to
20	suggest this for the people and for our staff.
21	Many people have a conceptual idea of what a
22	district should be to meet their goals and

Many people have a conceptual idea of what a district should be to meet their goals and criteria. The problem is, from our point of view, it doesn't satisfy the legal obligations that we have.

1	And what I would like to see for those who
2	showed up at our meetings, I know there was a
3	large contingent from Flushing in Queens, we are
4	all familiar with, a large community from
5	Richmond Hill.

If we can invite them to come down to the district headquarters where we have the mapping software, give them some instruction, it will be easier for us, if instead of them showing up with an atlas and a generic map, if they would then try to meet the criteria, in other words, in terms of population, et cetera, as you know, and to map it out, rather than using borders that they are comfortable with like a highway, and to do it a little different, and if they can be taught to do it that way, it will make it a lot easier for us to make decisions.

So, for the people out there, if you want to come up with an idea for a district that you think serves your needs, get in touch with the Districting Commission, go down, get some instruction with the mapping. The last time I was on the staff, we actually sat there with them and helped them draw up a district.

And then when you come in and testify, it

makes it a lot easier for us to understand
exactly what your approach is. But also keep in
mind that when you design a district, this is
like a puzzle. You are also affecting other
districts, too. So, the one that you may draw
may not be the one that you get, but it gives us
a much better idea towards helping you draw a
district.

CHAIRMAN ROMANO: In applying the criteria that we are legally obligated to apply, we start in some ways with the easiest, and that makes logical sense, the principal of one man/one vote, which ultimately, effectively requires that there be population deviations that are minimal between districts.

And it occurred to us that maybe one of the reasons we didn't get more community participation at our public hearings was that they didn't have a map that we were proposing to criticize or comment or react to. I think what we should do is direct the staff to start with a preliminary map that reflects the population requirements that we have to meet.

It's a baseline. We know that that will not be the final map, but we know that, to the extent

we deviate too far from these population numbers, we are at risk of violating the one man/one vote, and therefore violating our oath and requirements of law. I don't want to suggest that it's simple to do this, but we are going to have to do it, in any event as a starting point.

And then when we have that map, see what it looks like and see how the rest of the criteria are affected, we will then have a more logical way to proceed through our tiered system of trying to satisfy all these things at once. And some of the criteria, there is tension between them. They don't all flow in logical sequence. But we know we have to start with this because we are required to.

Does anyone have any objection to starting that way? It will be the beginning, as they say, of a conversation that we will have about what the districts look like and it will give us a baseline. Does the staff need any further discretion or guidelines on how to proceed?

MR. HUM: No. Given the creation of the committees to dig a little deeper with regard to the borough-based issues, we certainly start with that directive, adjust the population and we will

1	take it from there.
2	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: One of the things we might
3	consider once we have that map and can take it
4	around to the various boroughs and get people's
5	reactions to it is, while that's going on, the
6	subcommittees can work with staff to develop more
7	detailed data from the boroughs.
8	And we should start planning for meetings
9	with subcommittees and reports from the
10	subcommittees to the Commission probably in
11	September and early October to see how those, how
12	the preliminary maps should be refined.
13	MR. HUM: Yes. And just with regard to the
14	charter mandates, we certainly do intend to have
15	the preliminary map available by September 4th
16	for the next stated Commission meetings.
17	I intend that, given the fact that next week
18	is the week before Labor Day, be rest assured
19	that the staff has been given firm instructions
20	not to leave town until we are all in agreement
21	with regard to the next map for the next
22	Commission meeting.
23	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: We know this map is going
24	to be preliminary. We know that the final
25	plan of one thing I am absolutely certain is

this preliminary plan will not be the map, the ultimate map. But to get from the preliminary plan to the ultimate map, we are going to have to be -- our subcommittees and the Commission as a whole is going to have to be much more steeped in the data and the details.

And we will have to have identified areas where we think the other criteria are not met by the preliminary map, that is to say, we are effectively diluting voting power, minorities or the districts are not contiguous or impact or any of the other criteria. So, those issues have to be identified through our subcommittees for the rest of the Commission.

MS. BRAGG: And I hope we will have this preliminary map, as the subcommittees and the public, particularly those who presented on those communities that have been named a couple of times, if that doesn't meet the interests that were highlighted or doesn't meet the concerns, then, you know, the subcommittees are going to have to present reasonable solutions go through our criteria.

We challenge the public to give us a reasonable solution as well. This is going to be

1	a huge puzzle and a big mess, sometimes. But it
2	is going to be, you know, a really good exercise,
3	starting with this population map, preliminary
4	map and going from there. So, the subcommittees
5	and the public can work with this as our starting
6	point.
7	MR. HUM: Just to be clear, we will start
8	with the current City Council lines as they exist
9	and then adjust for the population. Is that the
10	directive?
11	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: Just say that one more
12	time.
13	MR. HUM: Just to be clear, we will start
14	with the current City Council lines as they are
15	right now, and then adjust for the population
16	from there?
17	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: That's correct. Take the
18	current lines, adjust them for the population in
19	accordance with the Census as amended by prison
20	population.
21	MR. HUM: We will do that.
22	MR. ROBERT: Okay. I just have a question
23	about the subcommittees. I imagine that, is each
24	subcommittees going to have a chair? How do we
25	decide when we are meeting? Do we meet among

1	ourselves? How does that work?
2	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: They are small enough; you
3	could select a chair. They are small enough so I
4	thought you could function collaboratively. And
5	it just occurred to me, it's whenever you are
6	ready, and I am hoping the subcommittees will
7	interact directly with the staff and the staff
8	will get you what you need.
9	I suspect the, all the subcommittees are
10	going to be asking for similar information from
11	the staff, in terms of mapping software and
12	access to mapping software and some of the Census
13	track data, access to our consultants who can
14	give you detailed data about the voting records
15	and voting trends and that sort of thing, all of
16	which may be relevant once you start looking at
17	the borough beneath the level of the population.
18	MR. YU: As a subcommittee member, can we
19	sit in on other subcommittees' meetings?
20	CHAIRMAN ROMANO: I should have said that.
21	Every member is free to attend every subcommittee
22	meeting. This is just a way of organizing our
23	work. It is open to everyone.
24	If there are any other questions about the
25	preliminary map, is there any other business that

1	the Commission, any Commission member would like
2	to raise?
3	(Silence.)
4	There being no further business, we stand
5	adjourned until September 4th.
6	(Whereupon, at 1:40 p.m., the above matter
7	was concluded.)
8	
9	I, JOSHUA B. EDWARDS, RPR, a Notary Public
10	for and within the State of New York, do hereby
11	certify that the above is a correct transcription
12	of my stenographic notes.
13	Joshua B Edwards
14	
15	JOSHUA B. EDWARDS, RPR
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

accommodate [1] - 7:15 are there [2] - 3:3, 3:12 Brian [1] - 5:3 accordance [1] - 28:19 areas [6] - 17:9, 17:10, brings [1] - 4:10 125th [1] - 17:16 17:12, 17:18, 22:18, 27:7 Broadway [3] - 7:1, 7:25, account [2] - 8:25, 21:17 130 [1] - 16:3 Arizona [1] - 5:21 14:8 Act [3] - 14:9, 14:14, 16:9 13th [1] - 9:7 arrangements [1] - 7:13 Bronx [3] - 17:24, 19:14, activities [2] - 4:14 **16** [2] - 11:8, 17:23 **Asian** [5] - 11:10, 11:12, 21:1 add [2] - 9:16, 13:22 17_[1] - 4:16 add-on [1] - 13:22 11:13, 11:15, 17:5 Brooklyn [6] - 13:16, 17:10, 17th [4] - 2:20, 4:18, 5:10, addendum [1] - 14:22 Asian-American [1] - 17:5 19:17, 21:3, 21:4 14:24 addition [2] - 4:17, 13:4 asking [3] - 16:18, 16:20, bureau [3] - 13:1, 13:10, 19[1] - 21:6 additional [1] - 4:21 29:10 13:11 1:00 [1] - 1:7 assembly [1] - 8:6 business [2] - 29:25, 30:4 additionally [5] - 6:8, 6:19, 1:40 [1] - 30:6 busy [1] - 7:15 7:17, 16:18, 16:22 assured [1] - 26:18 **bylaws** [1] - 18:20 atlas [1] - 23:10 address [4] - 4:11, 10:10, 2 attend [2] - 4:7, 29:21 10:11, 19:9 **ATTENDANCE** [1] - 1:9 C addresses [3] - 10:13, 10:16, **20** [2] - 17:20, 21:6 attended [2] - 16:1, 17:6 10:17 2012 [1] - 1:6 California [1] - 5:21 addressing [1] - 17:17 August [2] - 1:6, 9:7 **2012-2013** [1] - 1:2 Caliper [5] - 5:19, 6:1, 7:19, adjourned [1] - 30:5 authority [1] - 18:20 20th [1] - 14:6 7:23 adjust [4] - 25:25, 28:9, **authorized** [1] - 19:5 21 [1] - 21:6 call [2] - 12:20, 13:12 28:15, 28:18 available 151 - 6:9, 6:18. 21,000 [3] - 9:16, 10:8, 10:19 carried [1] - 4:2 adjusted [1] - 9:13 6:20, 9:11, 26:15 24 [1] - 1:6 **CARVAJAL** [1] - 1:15 adopt [6] - 2:7, 2:24, 3:11, aware [1] - 12:9 **253** [3] - 7:1, 7:25, 14:8 Caucus [1] - 11:15 3:17, 3:19, 19:12 aye's [1] - 2:23 28th [2] - 21:2, 21:5 census [1] - 6:12 adopted [1] - 3:9 29th [1] - 7:20 **Census** [3] - 9:17, 28:19, adoption [1] - 2:19 В 29:12 advisable [2] - 18:12, 18:19 backed [1] - 12:12 Center [3] - 11:17, 11:20 advise [1] - 4:6 based [3] - 17:3, 17:14, certify [1] - 30:11 **30,000** [3] - 10:6, 10:8, 10:19 advocacy [1] - 11:8 **CERULLO** [1] - 1:22 25:24 30th [1] - 7:20 affairs [1] - 5:2 Cerullo [1] - 19:20 baseline [2] - 24:24, 25:20 **350** [1] - 16:1 affect [2] - 21:18, 21:21 basically [1] - 13:11 cetera [1] - 23:12 affected [1] - 25:9 chair [4] - 4:12, 6:21, 28:24, Bay [1] - 17:20 affecting [1] - 24:4 4 Bayside [1] - 17:9 29:3 afternoon [1] - 2:1 4th [3] - 4:4, 26:15, 30:5 believe [1] - 8:24 **CHAIRMAN** [14] - 2:1, 3:2, agenda [3] - 2:18, 3:10, 3:21, 3:24, 8:19, 15:4, beneath [1] - 29:17 13:22 18:5, 24:9, 26:2, 26:23, 5 **BENITO** [1] - 1:13 agree [1] - 20:21 28:11, 28:17, 29:2, 29:20 Benito [1] - 20:22 agreement [1] - 26:20 **5,500** [1] - 13:3 challenge [1] - 27:24 Bensonhurst [1] - 17:10 Alan [1] - 4:19 **50,000** [2] - 13:5, 13:6 **CHAMBERS** [1] - 1:5 bill [2] - 10:3, 16:13 Albany [1] - 10:4 5:00 [1] - 7:14 characteristics [1] - 17:23 bit [1] - 12:22 alerting [1] - 13:2 charge [1] - 6:10 Black [1] - 11:15 allow [2] - 6:15, 7:6 7 charges [1] - 5:9 blast [1] - 13:8 amended [1] - 28:19 charter [2] - 14:20, 26:14 board [2] - 4:5, 13:17 7th [2] - 7:1, 7:25 amendments [1] - 9:14 Cheng [1] - 5:5 boards [2] - 8:5, 16:25 America [1] - 11:12 Chinatown/Lower [1] booklet [1] - 15:7 9 American [3] - 11:10, 11:13, 17:11 books [1] - 15:18 9,000 [1] - 10:7 chorus [1] - 2:23 borders [1] - 23:13 Americans [1] - 11:12 96th [1] - 17:16 chosen [1] - 5:24 borough [7] - 9:21, 17:3, analysis [1] - 5:13 cities [2] - 5:22, 5:23 17:14, 19:8, 20:8, 25:24, Angeles [1] - 5:22 Citizens [1] - 11:19 Α 29:17 announced [1] - 2:16 Borough [1] - 11:16 city [2] - 7:16, 13:4 **AACORD** [2] - 11:11, 17:6 announcement [1] - 13:23 borough-based [3] - 17:3, **CITY** [2] - 1:1, 1:5 **AAFE** [1] - 11:13 apply [1] - 24:10 17:14, 25:24 City [10] - 2:2, 4:8, 8:4, 10:3, **AALDEF** [1] - 11:14 applying [1] - 24:9 11:15, 14:20, 14:22, 15:1, boroughs [10] - 2:7, 8:8, **ABA**[1] - 15:7 appointed [3] - 4:15, 5:1, 5:5 28:8, 28:14 16:2, 16:7, 18:14, 18:15, appointment [2] - 7:7, 10:25 ability [1] - 8:21 clarification [1] - 9:24 18:24, 20:23, 26:4, 26:7 **absolutely** [1] - 26:25 appointments [2] - 4:18, clear [4] - 14:13, 20:6, 28:7, BRAGG [4] - 1:19, 12:22, access [3] - 16:10, 29:12, 4:21 28:13 20:21, 27:15 appreciate [2] - 21:13, 21:16 29:13 co[1] - 16:24 Bragg [1] - 19:16 approach [1] - 24:2 accessible [1] - 16:15 Brennan [1] - 11:17 co-terminality [1] - 16:24

Coalition [1] - 11:10 collaboratively [1] - 29:4 colleague's [1] - 22:1 College [1] - 11:18 comfort [1] - 6:5 comfortable [1] - 23:14 comment [1] - 24:20 **COMMISSION** [1] - 1:3 Commission [38] - 2:3, 3:11, 4:13, 5:12, 6:12, 6:16, 6:18, 6:24, 7:8, 7:20, 8:21, 8:25, 9:13, 11:3, 12:7, 12:14, 13:14, 15:5, 15:19, 16:11, 16:21, 18:9, 18:12, 18:16, 18:22, 19:3, 19:5, 19:11, 23:21, 26:10, 26:16, 26:22, 27:4, 27:14, 30:1 Commission's [2] - 12:11, 18:13 commissioner [1] - 11:22 **Commissioners** [2] - 3:8, 4:1 commissioners [1] - 13:24 committees [1] - 25:23 Common [1] - 11:19 communities [3] - 20:3, 20:25, 27:18 Community [3] - 11:16, 11:20, 17:20 community [13] - 4:25, 8:5, 11:3, 11:5, 12:23, 13:2, 16:25, 19:1, 21:15, 22:11, 22:12, 23:4, 24:17 company [1] - 5:19 **completed** [1] - 15:6 complex [1] - 15:12 comply [2] - 3:8, 4:1 **composition** [1] - 18:13 **compresses** [1] - 15:9 computer [1] - 7:5 conceptual [1] - 22:21 concern [2] - 17:12, 22:16 concerns [5] - 17:3, 17:14, 21:6, 22:9, 27:20 concise [1] - 14:13 conclude [1] - 12:6 concluded [2] - 15:24, 30:7 concludes [1] - 18:3 conflicts [1] - 4:4 congressional [1] - 8:6 **consider** [2] - 19:3, 26:3 consideration [2] - 6:16, 18:10 **consultants** [1] - 29:13 contain [1] - 6:10 contiguous [1] - 27:11 contingent [2] - 17:4, 23:3 contours [1] - 20:2 conversation [1] - 25:18 coordinate [1] - 8:12

Correction [2] - 10:1, 10:13 corrections [1] - 3:4 corresponding [1] - 12:5 **COUNCIL** [1] - 1:5 council [2] - 9:22, 11:22 Council [7] - 8:4, 11:16, 11:21, 17:23, 28:8, 28:14 councilmanic [1] - 20:10 Counsel [3] - 4:5, 4:19, 9:6 count [2] - 9:17, 9:22 **couple** [3] - 6:7, 21:2, 27:18 course [3] - 13:25, 20:8, 20:9 create [4] - 8:20, 17:1, 18:20, 19:13 created [2] - 7:2, 8:3 creating [1] - 13:1 creation [1] - 25:22 criteria [8] - 22:23, 23:11, 24:9, 25:8, 25:12, 27:8, 27:12, 27:23 criticize [1] - 24:20 current [4] - 14:14, 28:8, 28:14, 28:18 currently [2] - 6:1, 10:1

D

data [10] - 5:13, 6:12, 9:4,

custody [1] - 10:1

9:10, 16:11, 19:1, 26:7, 27:6, 29:13, 29:14 dated [1] - 9:6 **David** [1] - 5:5 Day [4] - 7:3, 12:25, 13:9, 26:18 decide [1] - 28:25 decided [1] - 19:13 decisions [2] - 19:5, 23:17 dedicated [1] - 8:7 deeper [2] - 14:25, 25:23 **Defense** [1] - 11:13 defined [1] - 17:15 deletions [1] - 3:4 delivered [1] - 15:20 **Democracy** [1] - 11:11 demographic [1] - 14:25 Department [8] - 6:2, 10:1, 10:12, 11:1, 14:10, 14:12, 14:15, 14:16 deputy [1] - 4:20 design [1] - 24:3 desktop [1] - 5:14 detail [1] - 12:22 detailed [2] - 26:7, 29:14 details [1] - 27:6 develop [2] - 19:2, 26:6

developing [1] - 19:9

deviate [1] - 25:1

developments [1] - 14:18

deviations [2] - 16:19, 24:14

difference [2] - 10:8, 10:18 difficult [1] - 20:5 dig [1] - 25:23 digs [1] - 14:25 diluting [1] - 27:10 direct [2] - 2:9, 24:21 directive [2] - 25:25, 28:10 director [6] - 4:11, 4:15, 4:20, 4:25, 5:3, 5:4 director's [1] - 4:10 discretion [1] - 25:21 discussion [2] - 9:7, 15:22 discussions [1] - 3:13 distributed [1] - 2:19 District [5] - 8:4, 17:20, 17:23, 21:2, 21:5 district [12] - 2:10, 6:13, 9:22, 11:6, 17:21, 20:11, 22:22, 23:7, 23:19, 23:24, 24:3, 24:8 districted [1] - 15:18 **Districting** [2] - 2:3, 23:21 districting [7] - 11:21, 13:13, 13:14, 13:18, 14:20, 15:25, 16:23 districts [15] - 8:5, 8:6, 10:15, 10:18, 16:19, 21:8, 21:9, 21:21, 22:15, 22:17, 24:5, 24:15, 25:19, 27:11 diversity [1] - 16:21 does that [1] - 29:1 doesn't [3] - 22:24, 27:19,

Е

draw [7] - 6:4, 6:13, 7:7,

drawing [1] - 11:6

drilling [1] - 18:25

7:11, 23:24, 24:5, 24:7

27:20

e-mail [3] - 12:16, 13:3, 13:8 e-mails [1] - 13:6 early [1] - 26:11 easier [3] - 23:9, 23:17, 24:1 easiest [1] - 24:11 East [1] - 17:11 easy [1] - 15:10 echo [1] - 21:25 edification [1] - 7:17 Education [2] - 11:14, 11:19 **EDWARDS** [2] - 30:9, 30:15 **effectively** [4] - 9:16, 10:6, 24:13, 27:10 enjoyable [1] - 15:16 entertain [1] - 3:14 entities [2] - 5:24, 16:24 Equality [1] - 11:12 equipped [1] - 7:4 et [1] - 23:12

Ettricks [2] - 5:1, 8:13

event [1] - 25:6 Evers [1] - 11:18 everyone's [1] - 21:13 **ex** [1] - 19:21 exactly [1] - 24:2 examining [1] - 19:7 excluding [1] - 17:19 executive [4] - 4:10, 4:11, 4:15, 4:20 exercise [2] - 18:19, 28:2 exhaustive [1] - 11:24 exist [2] - 22:6, 28:8 expectation [1] - 18:21 **experience** [1] - 18:24 experiencing [2] - 14:15, 15:1 expertise [2] - 18:17, 18:18 express [1] - 22:9 expressed [1] - 13:6 extent [1] - 24:25 external [1] - 10:23 extremely [1] - 15:16

F

fact [1] - 26:17 fails [1] - 14:7 false [1] - 10:17 familiar [1] - 23:4 family [1] - 17:19 favor [2] - 3:6, 3:24 federal [1] - 10:2 feel [1] - 20:3 feeling [1] - 19:25 feels [1] - 22:11 figures [1] - 9:18 **final** [4] - 15:3, 15:21, 24:25, 26:24 firm [1] - 26:19 first [8] - 2:2, 2:6, 2:18, 4:17, 4:25, 14:5, 15:22, 15:24 first-phase [1] - 2:6 five [10] - 2:6, 8:8, 9:20, 10:25, 11:7, 16:2, 16:3, 16:6, 16:7, 17:6 Flatow [1] - 11:22 floor [2] - 7:1, 7:25 flow [1] - 25:13 Flushing [3] - 17:9, 17:19, 23:3 Flynn [1] - 5:3 focus [1] - 17:7 focused [1] - 14:3 folks [1] - 12:2 follow [1] - 15:10 following [3] - 13:7, 19:14, 20:5 formally [1] - 4:23 formation [1] - 13:10

former [2] - 11:21, 14:10

forward [2] - 12:23, 21:23
Frank [1] - 19:19
FRANK [1] - 1:10
free [2] - 6:10, 29:21
friendly [1] - 6:6
front [1] - 19:6
front-line [1] - 19:6
function [3] - 10:9, 19:6,
29:4
Fund [1] - 11:14
future [1] - 2:11

G

Gartner [1] - 4:20 gave [2] - 10:16 generic [1] - 23:10 Gerry [1] - 14:10 gerrymandering [1] - 16:12 give [7] - 11:9, 12:19, 22:9, 23:8, 25:19, 27:24, 29:14 given [12] - 10:10, 10:13, 14:5, 14:9, 14:10, 14:19, 14:21, 18:25, 25:22, 26:17, 26:19 gives [1] - 24:6 global [1] - 19:24 GLORIA [1] - 1:15 Gloria [1] - 19:17 goals [1] - 22:22 government [2] - 11:8, 16:8 great [1] - 20:24 Greenwich [1] - 17:16 grips [1] - 19:24 group [4] - 7:10, 13:15, 17:13, 18:22 grouped [1] - 21:14 grouping [1] - 21:17 groups [9] - 11:9, 11:25, 12:1, 12:2, 13:2, 13:3, 16:9, 17:5, 21:15 guidelines [1] - 25:21

н

Hackworth [3] - 4:19, 9:6, 14:19

HALL [1] - 1:5
hand [1] - 8:14
handed [1] - 9:19
hands [2] - 3:7, 3:25
Hanks [1] - 19:20
happy [1] - 5:13
HART [1] - 1:14
Hart [1] - 19:18
haven't [1] - 18:6
Hawley [1] - 4:5
headquarters [1] - 23:7
hear [6] - 2:8, 2:24, 3:17, 20:24, 21:8, 22:17

heard [8] - 2:6, 16:5, 16:7, 16:22, 17:22, 18:6, 21:8 hearing [1] - 18:16 hearings [20] - 2:6, 2:17, 6:22, 8:3, 9:8, 9:21, 12:13, 15:23, 15:24, 16:1, 16:3, 16:6, 16:15, 17:6, 18:2, 18:6, 18:17, 19:22, 20:18, 24:18 help [4] - 7:7, 7:10, 15:11, 22:18 helped [1] - 23:24 helpful [2] - 14:1, 22:5 helping [1] - 24:7 Herbert [2] - 14:10, 15:14 hereby [1] - 30:10 highlighted [4] - 20:25, 21:3, 21:5, 27:20 highlights [1] - 18:1 highly [1] - 15:8 highway [1] - 23:14 Hill [3] - 17:7, 17:18, 23:5 holding [1] - 13:24 Home [1] - 9:15 home [3] - 6:5, 10:15, 10:18 homeless [2] - 10:10, 10:16 homeowners [1] - 17:19 hope [1] - 27:15 hopefully [1] - 12:6 hoping [3] - 6:7, 15:20, 29:6 Houses [1] - 17:21 how do [1] - 28:24 huge [1] - 28:1 **HUM** [9] - 4:12, 8:24, 12:25, 15:18, 25:22, 26:13, 28:7, 28:13, 28:21

1

Hum [1] - 20:25

i.e [2] - 6:11, 16:16 Idaho [1] - 5:21 idea [4] - 22:10, 22:21, 23:19, 24:7 identified [2] - 27:7, 27:13 identifying [1] - 19:8 III [1] - 1:18 imagine [1] - 28:23 impact [1] - 27:11 important [4] - 4:6, 4:8, 19:7, 19:8 **impossible** [1] - 10:12 impression [2] - 18:5, 19:22 **impressions** [1] - 20:17 IN [1] - 1:9 include [1] - 9:23 included [5] - 3:12, 3:15, 9:4, 9:18, 17:14 includes [1] - 9:25 inclusions [1] - 3:4

increasing [1] - 16:21 indicate [2] - 3:6, 3:25 individuals [6] - 4:22, 10:14, 10:15, 13:3, 16:1, 16:16 **Information** [1] - 6:2 information [8] - 6:11, 19:23, 20:1, 20:22, 21:10, 21:11, 22:4, 29:10 informing [1] - 13:9 initial [1] - 4:17 input [1] - 22:14 install [1] - 6:3 **institutions** [1] - 20:14 instruction [2] - 23:8, 23:22 **instructions** [1] - 26:19 intend [2] - 26:14, 26:17 interact [1] - 29:7 interactive [1] - 6:6 interest [6] - 4:5, 11:8, 13:7, 17:5, 20:3, 21:15 interested [1] - 18:7 interesting [2] - 21:20, 21:22 interests [1] - 27:19 intimate [1] - 18:23 introduce [1] - 4:23 invite [2] - 7:24, 23:6 invited [1] - 7:21 involved [3] - 13:19, 18:24, is that [4] - 8:11, 9:15, 18:6, 28:9 is there [1] - 29:25 is this [1] - 26:25 Island [2] - 17:18, 19:19 Israel [1] - 11:11 issues [5] - 18:18, 19:8, 19:9, 25:24, 27:12 IT [1] - 5:4

J

items [2] - 2:18, 3:10

Jamila [1] - 19:16

JAMILA [1] - 1:19
Jewish [2] - 11:16, 11:20
Jewry [1] - 11:20
Joe [1] - 14:23
John [3] - 11:22, 14:21, 19:15
JOHN [1] - 1:20
join [1] - 7:21
Jonathan [2] - 5:1, 8:12
JOSHUA [2] - 30:9, 30:15
July [2] - 2:20, 4:15
Justice [5] - 11:1, 11:18, 14:11, 14:12, 14:15
JUSTIN [1] - 1:16
Justin [1] - 19:16

Κ

Kamillah [1] - 19:20 keep [1] - 24:2 keeping [3] - 17:15, 17:16, 17:20 knowledge [1] - 18:23

1

Labor [4] - 7:3, 12:25, 13:9, 26:18 large [2] - 23:3, 23:4 last [4] - 9:20, 15:23, 17:22, 23:22 **LATFOR** [1] - 10:13 Latino [1] - 11:15 launch [1] - 6:7 law [4] - 14:3, 15:7, 15:9, 25:4 Law [3] - 9:15, 11:17 Leaf [1] - 17:20 leave [1] - 26:20 legal [1] - 22:24 Legal [1] - 11:13 legally [1] - 24:10 let's [1] - 13:15 level [1] - 29:17 lifting [1] - 11:9 Limongi [1] - 5:2 Lin [1] - 19:18 LIN [1] - 1:21 Linda [1] - 19:18 LINDA [1] - 1:21 line [1] - 19:6 lines [4] - 21:24, 28:8, 28:14, 28:18 list [4] - 11:24, 12:2, 13:3, 13:5 live [1] - 22:18 lives [1] - 18:15 living [1] - 18:15 loaded [1] - 7:5 local [1] - 20:14 located [1] - 7:1 location [1] - 14:7 logical [3] - 24:12, 25:9, 25:13 looks [2] - 11:2, 25:8 Los [1] - 5:22

М

lot [5] - 18:16, 20:22, 21:11,

23:16, 24:1

lots [1] - 15:9

MADELINE [1] - 1:17 Madeline [1] - 19:15 mail [3] - 12:16, 13:3, 13:8 mails [1] - 13:6

planning [1] - 26:8

okay [1] - 28:22

major [1] - 16:4 man/one [2] - 24:12, 25:2 manager [1] - 5:2 mandates [1] - 26:14 mandatory [1] - 13:25 Manhattan [3] - 17:12, 19:16, map [21] - 5:12, 6:15, 21:23, 23:10, 23:13, 24:19, 24:22, 24:25, 25:7, 26:3, 26:15, 26:21, 26:23, 27:1, 27:2, 27:3, 27:9, 27:16, 28:3, 28:4, 29:25 mapping [6] - 8:17, 16:11, 23:7, 23:22, 29:11, 29:12 maps [14] - 6:4, 6:13, 6:17, 7:8, 7:11, 8:2, 8:4, 8:15, 8:20, 9:21, 11:6, 17:1, 26:12 Maptitude [6] - 5:14, 5:17, 5:20, 6:3, 7:6, 7:18 Marc [1] - 19:15 materials [5] - 6:24, 9:19, 12:9, 12:12, 12:17 matter [1] - 30:6 matters [1] - 2:8 means [1] - 21:24 Medgar [1] - 11:18 media [3] - 3:11, 3:14, 3:17 meet [7] - 12:6, 22:22, 23:11, 24:23, 27:19, 27:20, 28:25 **MEETING** [1] - 1:4 meeting [12] - 2:2, 2:4, 2:11, 2:14, 2:20, 4:4, 4:7, 12:8, 15:15, 26:22, 28:25, 29:22 meetings [13] - 2:12, 9:8, 10:23, 12:10, 12:19, 12:20, 13:17, 16:15, 23:2, 26:8, 26:16, 29:19 member [6] - 7:9, 7:10, 19:21, 29:18, 29:21, 30:1 members [4] - 2:4, 7:20, 8:20, 18:22 memo [3] - 9:5, 9:11, 9:12 mention [1] - 20:10 mess [1] - 28:1 midst [2] - 7:13, 12:5 mind [2] - 19:13, 24:3 minimal [1] - 24:14 minorities [1] - 27:10 minutes [5] - 2:20, 2:22, 2:24, 3:4, 3:9 missing [1] - 22:14 Mollenkopf [1] - 14:21 Montana [1] - 5:22 motion [7] - 2:24, 2:25, 3:2,

moving [1] - 21:23
Mr [4] - 4:12, 6:21, 15:14, 20:25
MR [16] - 3:19, 3:20, 3:23, 4:12, 8:24, 12:25, 15:18, 21:25, 22:19, 25:22, 26:13, 28:7, 28:13, 28:21, 28:22, 29:18
MS [5] - 2:25, 3:1, 12:22, 20:21, 27:15

Ν

Municipal [1] - 9:14

NAACP [1] - 11:23

named [1] - 27:18

namely [1] - 5:12 narrative [1] - 15:10 narrow [1] - 18:18 nature [1] - 20:1 navigate [1] - 7:11 needs [1] - 23:20 neighborhoods [9] - 17:11, 20:2, 20:7, 20:13, 20:24, 21:14, 21:17, 21:18, 22:5 **NEW** [1] - 1:1 **night** [2] - 15:23, 17:22 Notary [1] - 30:9 **note** [4] - 6:8, 6:14, 6:25, 17:4 noted [1] - 6:21 **notes** [3] - 9:11, 9:12, 30:12 notice [1] - 2:11 numbers [1] - 25:1 nyc.gov/districting[1] - 6:23 NYU [1] - 11:17

0

oath [1] - 25:3

objection [1] - 25:16 obligated [1] - 24:10 obligations [1] - 22:24 observation [2] - 15:5, 16:12 observations [1] - 17:25 observe [1] - 17:22 observers [1] - 16:9 **obviously** [1] - 11:25 occurred [2] - 24:16, 29:5 October [1] - 26:11 **ODOM** [3] - 1:18, 3:19, 21:25 Odom [1] - 19:17 **OF** [1] - 1:1 office [2] - 5:7, 14:8 offices [1] - 7:1 official [3] - 4:9, 9:17, 14:11 officio [1] - 19:21 OGNIBENE [3] - 1:12, 3:20, Ognibene [1] - 19:19

ones [1] - 18:15 online [5] - 5:16, 6:3, 6:9, 6:14. 9:1 open [5] - 2:13, 2:14, 7:3, 7:14, 29:23 **operations** [1] - 5:4 opportunity [2] - 2:21, 4:13 order [1] - 15:19 Oregon [1] - 5:23 organizations [1] - 13:4 organizing [1] - 29:22 Oscar [1] - 19:17 OSCAR [1] - 1:18 ought [2] - 18:8, 18:9 ourselves [2] - 8:20, 29:1 outcome [1] - 9:15 outreach [3] - 5:1, 11:3, 12:24 overlays [3] - 8:5, 8:16, 17:2 Ozone [2] - 17:8

Ρ

package [2] - 3:12, 3:15

P.M [1] - 1:7

p.m [1] - 30:6

packets [1] - 9:5

Padavan [1] - 19:19

PADAVAN [1] - 1:10

Park [6] - 11:16, 17:8, 17:10, 17:17, 17:21 part [1] - 18:11 participation [2] - 22:8, 24:18 passed [1] - 10:4 password [3] - 12:11, 12:15, 12:16 password-secure [1] - 12:11 people [11] - 19:25, 20:3, 20:7, 20:12, 22:2, 22:8, 22:15, 22:17, 22:20, 22:21, 23:18 people's [2] - 22:14, 26:4 percent [1] - 16:20 performed [1] - 8:10 PERSAUD [2] - 1:11, 2:25 Persaud [1] - 19:18 personal [3] - 18:17, 18:23, 19:22 personally [1] - 9:9 personnel [1] - 8:14 persons [2] - 9:16, 18:7 pertinent [1] - 5:11 perusal [1] - 12:18 phase [1] - 2:6 piece [1] - 15:8 place [1] - 22:11 plan [6] - 2:10, 8:11, 12:23, 26:25, 27:1, 27:3

play [1] - 21:19 please [5] - 3:24, 7:24, 8:8, 8:12, 12:19 point [6] - 9:24, 14:6, 22:2, 22:23, 25:6, 28:6 police [1] - 16:25 policy [3] - 2:8, 3:11, 3:18 Ponton [1] - 19:16 PONTON [1] - 1:19 population [18] - 9:4, 9:10, 9:14, 9:22, 9:23, 9:25, 16:19, 23:12, 24:14, 24:22, 25:1, 25:25, 28:3, 28:9, 28:15, 28:18, 28:20, 29:17 Portland [1] - 5:23 posted [1] - 2:12 power [1] - 27:10 practical [1] - 6:23 precincts [2] - 16:25, 20:13 preferences [1] - 21:20 preliminary [11] - 2:10, 24:22, 26:12, 26:15, 26:24, 27:1, 27:2, 27:9, 27:16, 28:3, 29:25 prepare [1] - 15:13 present [1] - 27:22 presentation [1] - 14:23 presentations [3] - 13:13, 22:6, 22:13 presented [2] - 19:10, 27:17 previously [2] - 2:16, 2:19 primarily [1] - 19:6 principal [1] - 24:12 prison [7] - 9:4, 9:10, 9:13, 9:23, 9:24, 16:12, 28:19 prison-adjusted [1] - 9:13 prisoner [1] - 10:9 prisoners [3] - 9:25, 10:2, 10:3 privilege [1] - 15:15 problem [1] - 22:23 procedural [1] - 2:7 proceed [2] - 25:10, 25:21 process [9] - 11:6, 13:13, 13:18, 15:25, 16:10, 16:23, 18:25, 21:19, 21:22 produced [2] - 8:2, 8:16 properly [1] - 5:8 proposals [3] - 19:2, 19:9, 19:10 proposing [1] - 24:19 protected [1] - 12:15 protocol [1] - 3:14 **PROVENZANO** [2] - 1:17, **Provenzano** [1] - 19:15 provided [2] - 5:10, 22:3 Public [1] - 30:9

3:6, 3:17, 3:19, 4:2

13:20, 15:3, 15:21

move [6] - 8:18, 9:3, 10:20,

Motion [1] - 3:21

secure [1] - 12:11

PUBLIC [1] - 1:4 public [27] - 2:6, 2:14, 2:15, 2:16, 4:24, 5:2, 6:4, 6:10, 6:22, 7:2, 7:6, 7:11, 8:3, 9:8, 9:12, 9:20, 11:5, 12:13, 15:23, 15:24, 18:2, 18:6, 24:18, 27:17, 27:24, 28:5 publication [1] - 2:9

purchased [1] - 5:14 purchases [1] - 5:11 purpose [1] - 2:4 puzzle [2] - 24:4, 28:1

Q

Queens [11] - 13:15, 17:8, 17:9, 17:21, 19:18, 21:1, 21:4, 21:5, 21:7, 23:3 question [6] - 8:19, 10:5, 12:19, 15:3, 15:4, 28:22 questions [9] - 3:3, 3:13, 8:17, 9:1, 10:20, 12:21, 13:20, 18:3, 29:24

R

racial [1] - 17:23 raise [1] - 30:2 raising [2] - 3:7, 3:25 reach [1] - 10:17 react [1] - 24:20 reactions [1] - 26:5 readable [1] - 15:8 reading [2] - 15:7, 15:12 reasonable [2] - 27:22, 27:25 reasons [1] - 24:17 receive [5] - 2:21, 6:17, 7:22, 12:4 received [5] - 6:20, 12:10, 12:13, 13:5, 15:6 receiving [2] - 6:25, 12:15 recommend [1] - 15:8 record [1] - 4:23 records [1] - 29:14 recreate [1] - 8:22 redirecting [1] - 5:18 REDISTRICTING [1] - 1:3 redistricting [3] - 5:25, 14:3, 15:7 Redistricting [1] - 11:10 refined [1] - 26:12 reflects [1] - 24:22 regard [7] - 12:19, 14:1, 14:16, 17:2, 25:23, 26:13,

regarding [2] - 3:14, 11:5

regards [2] - 4:18, 9:9

reintegrate [1] - 10:14

relations [1] - 3:14

Relations [1] - 11:21 relevant [1] - 29:16 remarks [2] - 6:22, 22:1 report [7] - 4:11, 5:13, 5:15, 10:23, 12:7, 15:22, 18:4 reports [1] - 26:9 repository [1] - 6:23 representatives [1] - 19:2 request [1] - 16:23 required [2] - 9:13, 25:15 requirements [2] - 24:23, 25:3 requires [1] - 24:13 resource [5] - 7:2, 7:4, 7:9, 7:14. 8:1 response [1] - 12:4 responsibility [1] - 19:7 rest [6] - 19:3, 19:10, 20:20, 25:8, 26:18, 27:14 result [1] - 8:2 review [1] - 2:21 Richmond [2] - 17:7, 23:5 right [3] - 5:3, 13:8, 28:15 Right [1] - 16:9 **Rights** [3] - 14:9, 14:11, 14:14 risk [1] - 25:2 **ROBERT** [3] - 1:14, 1:20, Robert [2] - 19:15, 19:18 **ROMANO** [15] - 1:13, 2:1, 3:2, 3:21, 3:24, 8:19, 15:4, 18:5, 24:9, 26:2, 26:23, 28:11, 28:17, 29:2, 29:20 **room** [6] - 7:2, 7:4, 7:9, 7:14, 8:1, 8:7 roughly [1] - 10:25 round [2] - 15:22, 15:24 **ROXANNE** [1] - 1:11 Roxanne [1] - 19:17 **RPR** [2] - 30:9, 30:15 Rule [1] - 9:15

S

running [1] - 5:7

Russian [1] - 11:20

Salvo's [1] - 14:23 sat [1] - 23:23 satisfy [2] - 22:24, 25:11 save [2] - 6:15, 8:21 schedules [2] - 7:15, 12:5 School [1] - 11:17 Scott [1] - 19:19 SCOTT [1] - 1:22 Seat [1] - 11:23 second [4] - 3:1, 3:20, 3:23, 8:23 seconded [2] - 3:3, 3:22 Section [1] - 14:12

select [1] - 29:3 seminar [7] - 13:23, 14:2, 14:5, 14:9, 14:18, 14:21, 15:14 senate [1] - 8:5 sense [2] - 19:25, 24:12 September [5] - 4:4, 14:6, 26:11, 26:15, 30:5 sequence [1] - 25:13 series [3] - 13:23, 14:2, 14:18 serve [1] - 19:20 server [1] - 12:14 serves [1] - 23:20 services [3] - 5:5, 7:10, 8:9 **serving** [1] - 10:6 session [1] - 15:17 share [2] - 20:4, 20:19 shared [1] - 18:8 **Shirley** [1] - 5:2 show [1] - 22:3 **showing** [1] - 23:9 Silence [6] - 3:5, 3:16, 9:2, 10:22, 13:21, 30:3 **simple** [2] - 15:9, 25:4 single [1] - 17:19 single-family [1] - 17:19 sit [1] - 29:19 site [2] - 12:11, 12:16 smaller [1] - 18:21 Social [1] - 11:18 **software** [17] - 5:7, 5:9, 5:11, 5:14, 5:18, 5:20, 6:6, 6:9, 7:6, 7:12, 8:15, 8:17, 9:1, 16:11, 23:8, 29:11, 29:12 solution [1] - 27:25 solutions [1] - 27:22 sort [3] - 16:6, 19:24, 29:15 sources [1] - 6:11 South [1] - 17:7 speak [1] - 22:12 speakers [3] - 13:1, 13:10 speaking [1] - 5:9 specifically [1] - 8:3 spent [1] - 18:14 spoke [2] - 22:15, 22:16 staff [21] - 2:8, 2:9, 4:13, 4:21, 7:22, 11:4, 13:1, 13:11, 16:5, 16:21, 17:1, 18:2, 22:20, 23:23, 24:21, 25:20, 26:6, 26:19, 29:7, 29:11 staffed [1] - 7:9 stand [1] - 30:4

starting [4] - 25:6, 25:16, 28:3, 28:5 State [2] - 9:25, 30:10 stated [3] - 2:2, 22:7, 26:16 **statements** [1] - 20:6 Staten [2] - 17:18, 19:19 states [2] - 5:21, 5:23 steeped [1] - 27:5 stenographic [1] - 30:12 stock [1] - 2:5 Street [1] - 17:16 struck [1] - 15:11 **subcommittee** [2] - 29:18, 29:21 subcommittees [16] - 18:21, 19:4, 19:14, 19:21, 26:6, 26:9, 26:10, 27:4, 27:13, 27:16, 27:21, 28:4, 28:23, 28:24, 29:6, 29:9 subcommittees' [1] - 29:19 subject [2] - 15:12, 15:15 submission [2] - 7:8, 11:2 **submissions** [1] - 14:16 submit [1] - 6:15 subset [1] - 18:18 suggest [2] - 22:20, 25:4 suggestions [1] - 21:13 Sunset [1] - 17:9 suspect [1] - 29:9 system [1] - 25:10

Т

talk [2] - 13:18, 20:12 talked [2] - 17:2, 20:12 talking [3] - 20:7, 20:9, 20:11 taught [1] - 23:16 technical [3] - 7:10, 8:9, 8:19 **Technology** [1] - 6:2 ten [1] - 15:2 tension [1] - 25:12 terminality [1] - 16:24 terminals [1] - 7:5 terms [3] - 20:13, 23:12, 29:11 testify [1] - 23:25 testimony [4] - 2:14, 6:17, 6:19, 16:2 Thaddeus [3] - 4:19, 9:6, 14:19 thank [1] - 4:12 themes [1] - 16:4 there's [1] - 12:2 **THOMAS** [1] - 1:12 three [2] - 7:4, 17:6 Thursday [1] - 7:19 tiered [1] - 25:10 times [1] - 27:19 **Tom** [1] - 19:18 topic [6] - 8:18, 9:3, 10:21,

Stapleton [1] - 17:18

28:7, 28:13, 29:16

start [10] - 16:6, 19:2, 24:10,

24:21, 25:14, 25:24, 26:8,

13:20, 15:3, 15:21 touch [1] - 23:20 towards [1] - 24:7 town [1] - 26:20 track [1] - 29:13

training [4] - 4:3, 4:8, 7:18, 7:22

transcription [1] - 30:11 transparency [1] - 16:10 travel [1] - 13:16 trends [4] - 14:14, 14:22, 15:1, 29:15 triggered [1] - 17:1

U

U.S [2] - 6:11, 9:17 ultimate [2] - 27:2, 27:3 ultimately [1] - 24:13 umbrella [1] - 17:5 undercount [1] - 17:17 understand [2] - 20:15, 24:1 understanding [2] - 14:13, 22:10 **Union** [1] - 11:19 update [1] - 4:13 upload [1] - 12:10 uploaded [1] - 12:17 **Upper** [1] - 17:15 upstate [1] - 10:7 user [2] - 6:6, 6:15 user-friendly [1] - 6:6

V

valuable [1] - 22:3
version [4] - 5:15, 5:16, 6:3, 6:14
via [2] - 7:7, 9:1
view [1] - 22:24
views [3] - 18:8, 19:1, 20:18
Village [1] - 17:16
violating [2] - 25:2, 25:3
visit [1] - 7:24
volunteers [1] - 4:9
vote [2] - 24:12, 25:2
Voting [4] - 14:9, 14:11, 14:14, 16:9
voting [3] - 27:10, 29:14, 29:15

W

walk [2] - 8:14, 8:15 wanted [3] - 16:10, 16:14, 20:21 was that [1] - 24:18 Wayne [1] - 4:5 ways [1] - 24:11 webcasting [2] - 16:16,

16:17 website [4] - 2:12, 6:20, 6:22, 16:17 Wednesday [1] - 7:19 week [3] - 7:19, 26:17, 26:18 weekend [2] - 7:3, 13:9 weeks [3] - 6:7, 10:25, 11:7 welcome [1] - 2:3 West [1] - 17:15 what is [2] - 21:11, 22:10 when you [2] - 23:25, 24:3 whenever [1] - 29:5 Whereupon [1] - 30:6 who are [1] - 10:6 who is [1] - 5:3 witnesses [1] - 16:3 Wolfe [1] - 19:17 WOLFE [1] - 1:15 words [1] - 23:11 work [7] - 5:12, 8:9, 14:2, 26:6, 28:5, 29:1, 29:23 worked [1] - 14:11 working [2] - 6:1, 7:15 written [1] - 9:5 Wurzel [1] - 19:15 www.nyc/gov/districting [1] - 2:13

Υ

Yeah [1] - 22:19 years [2] - 10:4, 15:2 YORK [1] - 1:1 York [6] - 2:2, 11:15, 11:19, 11:22, 14:4, 30:10 Yorkers [2] - 7:16, 10:6 Yu [1] - 19:16 YU [3] - 1:16, 3:23, 29:18