



**THE CITY OF NEW YORK 2012-2013 DISTRICTING COMMISSION**

**253 Broadway, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10007**

**PUBLIC MEETING**

**Wednesday, January 23, 2013  
6:12 p.m. to 7:54 p.m.**

**John Jay College of Criminal Justice  
New York, New York**

**Attendees:**

*Districting Commission Members:*

Jamila Ponton Bragg  
Scott Cerullo  
Kamillah M. Hanks  
Linda Lin  
Oscar Odom III

Thomas V. Ognibene  
Frank Padavan  
Roxanne J. Persaud  
John Robert  
Benito Romano

Gloria Carvajal Wolfe  
Marc Wurzel  
Justin Yu

*Staff:*

Carl Hum, Executive Director  
City of New York 2012-2013 Districting Commission

**Minutes by:**

Jane Li

Chair Benito Romano began the meeting by welcoming Commission Members and stating that the main objective of the meeting was for the Commission to discuss their findings from the third round of public hearings and direct the staff to address certain areas of interest in the December 4<sup>th</sup> version of the plan.

The first order of business was to consider and adopt the official minutes of the Public Meeting held on December 4, 2012. Commissioner Frank Padavan made a motion to adopt the minutes. Commissioner Oscar Odom III seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission Members.

The next order of business was a county-by-county briefing by Executive Director Carl Hum on the major themes expressed in the oral testimony at the public hearings and the written testimony submitted online and via mail. Mr. Hum provided a summary of the public testimony received about the proposed Manhattan County districts. The Chair made a motion directing the staff to attempt to make modifications to certain areas in the revised plan and provide recommendations on other issues. Specifically, the motion was to instruct staff:

- (1) not to significantly alter the boundaries between Chinatown and the Lower East Side, in Districts 1 and 2, consistent with the advice given to the Commission provided by counsel;
- (2) for Districts 1 and 2, to attempt to unite the Gouverneur and Vladeck Houses into one district;
- (3) for District 2, to attempt to restore the blocks between 34th Street to 35th Street and Lexington Avenue to Third Avenue and between Pitt Street to Norfolk Street and Houston Street to Stanton Street into the district, and unite the Baruch Houses in the district;
- (4) for District 5, to attempt to include the blocks between Lexington Avenue to Second Avenue and 79th Street to 81st Street in the district;
- (5) for District 6, to attempt to include Harborview Terrace and 10 West End Avenue in the district;
- (6) for District 7, to attempt to include all of the areas of Hamilton Heights and Sugar Hill in the district;
- (7) for District 8, to attempt to include Randall's Island, Mount Sinai Hospital, and other identified landmarks in the district whenever possible;
- (8) to attempt to include all of Manhattan Valley into a single district and keep housing developments together whenever possible; and
- (9) to provide a recommendation on the placement of Bellevue Hospital between Districts 2 and 4.

Commissioner Marc Wurzel requested that the motion be amended to include an instruction to staff to provide a recommendation on the placement of Central Park. The Chair accepted the

amendment. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wurzel and was unanimously approved by the Commission Members.

Next, Mr. Hum provided a summary of the public testimony received about the proposed Bronx County districts. The Chair made a motion directing the staff to attempt to make modifications to certain areas of the revised plan and provide recommendations on other issues. Specifically, the motion was to instruct staff:

- (1) to continue to maintain District 8 at an approximately 50/50 population split, so that the number of districts in New York County is approximately 9.5 and the number of districts in Bronx County is approximately 8.5;
- (2) for District 15, to attempt to include Parkside Houses in the district;
- (3) to attempt to keep Pelham Parkway North within a single district;
- (4) to attempt to minimize the split of the Van Nest neighborhood; and
- (5) to provide a recommendation on the placement of “the Hub” and Yankee Stadium.

Commissioner John Robert seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission Members.

Mr. Hum then provided a summary of the public testimony received about the proposed Queens County districts. The Chair made a motion directing the staff to attempt to make modifications to certain areas of the revised plan and provide recommendations on other issues. Specifically, the motion was to instruct staff:

- (1) for District 19, to attempt to unify the Broadway-Flushing neighborhood and the area surrounding Mitchell-Linden Housing into the district;
- (2) for District 21, to attempt to include LeFrak City in the district;
- (3) for District 27, to attempt to unite the homes on the south side of Francis Lewis Boulevard on 121st Avenue with the rest of Cambria Heights;
- (4) to attempt to unite the Brulene Cooperatives into a single district;
- (5) to attempt to unite the neighborhoods of Briarwood and Jamaica Hills into a single district;
- (6) for Districts 19 and 23, to provide a recommendation concerning the boundary between the districts;
- (7) for District 28, to provide a recommendation concerning placement of the landmarks identified by the South-Asian community including John Adams High School, Jama Masjid, Thirumuti Temple, and the United Hindu Cultural Council Senior Center;
- (8) for Districts 31 and 32, to provide a recommendation concerning the unification of Dayton Tower Co-ops in the Rockaways spanning from Beach 81st Street to Beach 74th Street;
- (9) to provide a recommendation concerning the unification of Woodhaven into one district; and

- (10) to request that the Commission's expert, Dr. Lisa Handley, be available at the Commission's next meeting to discuss the impact of the changes in District 28 and the minority groups' ability to elect candidates of their choice.

During discussion on the motion, in response to a question from Commissioner Jamila Ponton Bragg, Mr. Hum provided statistics on the breakdown of the voting-age population for proposed District 28. Commissioner Thomas V. Ognibene opined that if Woodhaven is to be united in one district, it would be best united in District 30 as District 32 is struggling to recover from Hurricane Sandy. Commissioner Frank Padavan discussed Districts 19 and 23, expressing that in his opinion Bayside and Oakland Gardens are distinct communities, and recommending that Oakland Gardens remain in District 23. Commissioner Linda Lin opined that Oakland Gardens is part of Bayside. Following discussion, the motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas V. Ognibene and unanimously approved by the Commission Members.

Mr. Hum continued his briefing by providing a summary of the public testimony received about the proposed Kings County districts. The Chair made a motion directing the staff to attempt to make modifications to certain areas in the revised plan and provide recommendations on other issues. Specifically, the motion was to instruct staff:

- (1) for Districts 34 and 37, to attempt to move the Hope Gardens building back into District 34;
- (2) for District 47, to attempt to include more of the neighborhood of Bensonhurst in the district;
- (3) for District 48, to attempt to include more of the orthodox Jewish population in the district without comprising the ability to elect minority-preferred candidates in Districts 45 and 46;
- (4) to provide a recommendation concerning the placement of Bay Ridge Towers in District 43 from District 38, if the other changes to the plan allow for such inclusion; and
- (5) to request that the Commission's expert, Dr. Lisa Handley, be available at the Commission's next meeting to discuss minority groups' opportunity to elect candidates of their choice in District 46.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Oscar Odom III and unanimously approved by the Commission Members.

Mr. Hum then discussed the public testimony received about the proposed Richmond County districts. The Chair made a motion to instruct the staff to provide a recommendation on uniting Saint Teresa's Church and its parish into District 50. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas V. Ognibene. During discussion on the motion, Commissioner Kamillah M. Hanks opined that the motion was unnecessary given the satisfaction with the district lines as they were in the revised plan. The Chair then withdrew the motion.

With all business concluded, the Chair made a motion to adjourn until the Commission's next public meeting on February 6, 2013. The meeting was adjourned at 7:54 p.m.