

In Re Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board  
January 10, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD  
PUBLIC MEETING  
January 10, 2024  
4:11 p.m.

-----X

HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/  
100 Church Street, 10th Floor  
New York, New York 10007

B E F O R E:  
ARVA RICE - INTERIM CHAIR  
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ. - EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

COURT REPORTER:  
Sabrina Brown Stewart

1 PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

2 =====

- 3 1. Call to Order
- 4 2. Remarks from the Chair
- 5 3. Remarks from the Executive Director
- 6 4. Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
- 7 5. Public Comment
- 8 6. Old Business
- 9 7. New Business
- 10 8. Adjourn to Executive Session

11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 =====

- 3 1. Arva Rice - Interim Chair
- 4 2. Pat Smith - Board Member
- 5 3. June Northern - Board Member
- 6 4. Herman Merritt - Board Member
- 7 5. Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq. - Board Member
- 8 6. Kevin Jemmott - Board Member
- 9 7. AU Hogan - Board Member
- 10 8. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member
- 11 9. John Siegal - Board Member

12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PRESENTERS:  
JAHl ROSE - Director of Outreach  
New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board

1 S P E A K E R S:

2 Ace Sutherland - Director of Community Organizing,  
3 Equality New York

4 Christopher Dunn - Legal Director, NYCLU

5 Jeffrey Omura - Volunteer Advisory member,  
6 Equality New York

7 Susan Hadley - Vocal-NY, Civil Right Union Leader

8 Michael Meyers - President, New York Civil Rights  
9 Coalition

10 Shawn - Civilian

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Good evening, everyone.  
2 For those utilizing ASL interpretation  
3 services, our two interpreters today are  
4 Craig Ridgway and Alli. The display names on  
5 the screen are ASL Interpreter Craig Ridgway  
6 and ASL Interpreter, SignNexus, Alli. The  
7 CART services, if you would like to utilize  
8 those, are going to be in the chat, and  
9 instructions of how to pin videos will also  
10 be found there.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIR RICE: Good evening and welcome.  
13 My name is Arva Rice. I use she/her  
14 pronouns, and I am the Interim Chair of the  
15 Civilian Complaint Review Board. I would  
16 like to call the January Public Board Meeting  
17 to order.

18 Will the Board please introduce  
19 themselves, starting out on this side  
20 (indicating).

21 MR. SMITH: Pat Smith, designated by  
22 the Mayor.

23 MS. NORTHERN: June Northern, Brooklyn,  
24 appointed by the Mayor.

25 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City

1 Council designee from Brooklyn.

2 MR. DARCHE: Jon Darche, Executive  
3 Director.

4 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Charlane Brown, NYPD  
5 designee.

6 MR. JEMMOTT: Good evening. Kevin  
7 Jemmott, the Mayor appointment from Queens.

8 MR. HOGAN: Good evening. AU Hogan,  
9 City Council designee from Queens.

10 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

11 And I believe we have a number of  
12 members that are also joining us online.

13 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon. Joseph  
14 Puma, and I'm the City Council designee from  
15 Manhattan. And I go by he/him pronouns.

16 MR. DARCHE: Joe, unmute.

17 MR. SIEGAL: It's John Siegal, one of  
18 the mayoral appointees appearing virtually  
19 and will be off camera.

20 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, John.

21 Do we need Joseph Puma to reintroduce  
22 himself? I don't believe we heard him, for  
23 the record.

24 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon. Joseph  
25 Puma, I go by he/him pronouns. And I'm the

1 City Council designee from Manhattan.

2 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Appreciate  
3 that.

4 I would like to -- we'll table the  
5 approval of the December Board Meeting  
6 minutes until next month.

7 Okay. Last year, the PBA sued the CCRB  
8 with the hope of restricting our  
9 investigative powers. Last week, a court  
10 sided with the CCRB. Judge Arlene Bluth  
11 ruled that the Board had the power to include  
12 misuse of body-worn cameras as an abuse of  
13 authority. Judge Bluth also determined that  
14 the CCRB could change the language we use  
15 regarding full investigations, to make those  
16 results clearer and more transparent to the  
17 public.

18 As a reminder, we changed "exonerated"  
19 to "within NYPD guidelines," and  
20 "unsubstantiated" to "unable to determine."  
21 The Judge did, however, rule that we continue  
22 to use more specific terminology when  
23 describing why we had to close complaints  
24 without full investigations. We are pleased  
25 that the Courts have once again upheld the

1 City Charter, defended the CCRB's rights, and  
2 strengthened oversight.

3 As the police unions work to undermine  
4 the CCRB's authority, we rely on elected  
5 officials more than ever to strengthen police  
6 oversight. The Agency's number one  
7 legislative priorities for the last several  
8 years has been to be exempt from sealing  
9 statutes. Sealing statutes make it harder  
10 for the CCRB to hold officers accountable for  
11 misconduct. If evidence is sealed, it  
12 creates significant delays or impediments to  
13 investigations.

14 The CCRB sometimes has to file motions  
15 to access basic evidence of a case. In one  
16 example, the case investigating the killing  
17 of Delrawn Small, the case was delayed by a  
18 year and a half, as we awaited a judge's  
19 ruling. When that judge ruled in our favor,  
20 the PBA appealed. The case is still pending.  
21 Mr. Small's family has waited nearly  
22 eight years to see the officer who killed  
23 their son held to account. This is  
24 unacceptable. We hope legislators in Albany  
25 will act to pass legislation that exempts the



1 CCRB from sealing statutes.

2 As we announced this last month, the  
3 budget crisis in New York City is greatly  
4 affecting the CCRB's ability to keep up with  
5 the rising number of cases. Executive  
6 Director Jon Darche will now give us an  
7 update on this.

8 Jon.

9 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chair Rice.

10 Earlier, I forgot to give my pronouns.  
11 I use he/him pronouns.

12 Last month, we announced that due to  
13 the 15 percent budget cuts the Office of  
14 Management and Budget ordered, the CCRB will  
15 not be able to investigate all complaints  
16 within our jurisdiction. So far, the Agency  
17 closed 245 complaints and referred 30  
18 complaints to the NYPD. Going forward, the  
19 Agency will report on investigations closed  
20 in this manner. This is a last resort. We  
21 hope the Mayor and City Council fully fund  
22 the CCRB, so we can investigate every case  
23 within our jurisdiction and help ensure the  
24 safety of each and every New Yorker.

25 We still encourage all New Yorkers to

1 continue to file complaints if they  
2 experience misconduct, as we are still  
3 investigating thousands of cases. If our  
4 budget is restored quickly, we hope to reopen  
5 the closed complaints. We have updated our  
6 website and outreach presentations to include  
7 this information. We also updated our  
8 website to make it easier to view past board  
9 meetings. All of our board meetings are  
10 recorded and posted online within a few days.  
11 We have just added all of our past board  
12 meeting videos to YouTube and linked them to  
13 our website, to make it easier for the public  
14 to find.

15 Our office is open to walk-in  
16 complainants, but it is also possible to file  
17 complaints online at [nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint](https://nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint),  
18 by telephone at 1(800)341-2272, or by calling  
19 3-1-1. If anyone wishes to file a complaint  
20 right now, we have two investigators on hand  
21 ready to take any new complaints; Jillian  
22 Bevens and Emma Stydakar, as well as one of  
23 our CAU staff members, Ivonne Torres.

24 Some ground rules for today's meeting  
25 -- and I actually think I saw a third

1 investigator, Rob Bryan here.

2 Thank you, Rob, for coming.

3 Some ground rules for this afternoon.

4 We will here from folks who are online first  
5 before going to the people who are here in  
6 person and wish to comment. Regardless of  
7 whether you are joining online or are here in  
8 person, please keep your comments to four  
9 minutes. If you are joining online and want  
10 to participate, please use the  
11 raise-your-hand function.

12 I want to thank our staff for their  
13 hard work, and thanks again to the members of  
14 the public for participating in tonight's  
15 meeting.

16 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much, Jon.

17 Does anyone have any question of our  
18 executive director?

19 (No response).

20 CHAIR RICE: Does anyone have any  
21 questions?

22 (No response).

23 CHAIR RICE: All right. Terrific.

24 We're going to ask for a presentation from  
25 our Director of Outreach, Mr. Jahi Rose.

1 MR. ROSE: Thank you very much, Chair  
2 Rice.

3 My name is Jahi Rose. I am the Director  
4 of Outreach for the Civilian Complaint Review  
5 Board, and I go by he/him pronouns. I just  
6 want to provide a brief update of the Agency  
7 and provide, hopefully, some fun updates and  
8 information.

9 The Civilian Complaint Review Board is  
10 the nation's largest independent oversight  
11 entity over the largest police force in the  
12 country. The CCRB investigates, mediates,  
13 and prosecutes complaints of misconduct  
14 alleged against members of the NYPD. The  
15 Agency is governed by a 15-member board, many  
16 of those that you've met today on the dais or  
17 online. There are five that are appointed by  
18 the New York City Mayor, five are appointed  
19 by the New York City Council, three  
20 designated by the Police Commissioner, and  
21 one appointed by the Public Advocate, and the  
22 Chair is jointly appointed by the Mayor and  
23 the New York City Council.

24 The CCRB can accept complaints of  
25 allegations of misconduct where it relates to

1 force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and  
2 offensive language. FADO is a helpful  
3 reminder.

4 Just a brief update: On September 9,  
5 2023, the Office of Management and Budget  
6 announced citywide budget cuts. As a result,  
7 the CCRB will no longer be able to fully  
8 investigate certain cases within its  
9 jurisdiction. After careful consideration,  
10 effective January 1, 2024, the CCRB suspended  
11 investigating: For failure to provide RTKA  
12 or Right to Know Act cards with no other  
13 allegations; refusal to provide name and  
14 shield number with no other allegations;  
15 discourteous words or actions with no other  
16 allegations; threats with no action with no  
17 other allegations; refusal to process  
18 civilian complaints with no other  
19 allegations; property seizures with no other  
20 allegations; forcible removal to the hospital  
21 with no other allegations; untruthful  
22 statements with no other allegations; any  
23 complaint that has only the above referenced  
24 allegations, we will also be unable to  
25 investigate.

1                   The CCRB will resume investigating  
2                   these cases once the City allocates  
3                   sufficient funding to do so. If the  
4                   complaint contains one of the above  
5                   allegations, in addition to another  
6                   allegation that falls within the CCRB's  
7                   jurisdiction, every allegation of the  
8                   complaint will still be investigated.

9                   There are various ways to file  
10                  complaints with the Civilian Complaint Review  
11                  Board. One of the easier ways, as previously  
12                  mentioned, is by going to the CCRB's website;  
13                  that's [nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint](https://nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint) or you could  
14                  call the CCRB's hotline at 1(800)341-CCRB;  
15                  that's 1(800)341-2272. Remember, if you see  
16                  footage of misconduct on social media or in  
17                  news media, you could feel free to file a  
18                  complaint, even if you were not there in  
19                  person. The typical handle for the CCRB is  
20                  CCRB\_NYC.

21                  Other ways to file complaints include  
22                  calling 3-1-1. You could also visit the  
23                  CCRB's headquarters at 100 Church Street on  
24                  the 10th Floor in Lower Manhattan. You could  
25                  direct message the CCRB on Instagram and

1           Twitter or X. You could also send a letter  
2           to the CCRB. You could also file a complaint  
3           at a local precinct, even if it was not the  
4           precinct where the interaction took place.  
5           Officers are required to accept CCRB  
6           complaints at any precinct. They could also  
7           provide you with a complaint form and a  
8           postage-free envelope.

9                         So, 2023 for the Civilian Complaint  
10           Review Board's outreach team was definitely  
11           interesting. The CCRB was able to engage  
12           58,398 New Yorkers during the course of 1,265  
13           events. We did that by partnering with 312  
14           organizations throughout the five boroughs.  
15           We were able to do language access events,  
16           totaling a number of 337. We distributed  
17           5,800 pieces of material in various languages  
18           to New Yorkers throughout the five boroughs.  
19           We connected with youth in a number of 149  
20           events, totaling to 3,700 young people that  
21           we connected with throughout the year. We  
22           also connected with New York City Housing  
23           Authority residents in 89 different occasions  
24           and still connected with 3,700 NYCHA  
25           residents. The CCRB has an initiative called

1 CCRB Cares, which I will explain shortly, and  
2 we were able to do 466 CCRB Care hours.

3 We did this by connecting with  
4 New Yorkers through workshops tabling, staff  
5 trainings, and flyer distribution. They  
6 would also do initiatives called the  
7 Barbershop and Salon Series, CCRB Block by  
8 Block, CCRB Cares, and CCRB Courtside. This  
9 year, the Agency had annual events. Some  
10 folks from Harlem would appreciate this:  
11 CCRB Courtside at the Rucker, where we were  
12 able to gauge thousands of young people that  
13 come to watch the historic New York City  
14 Harlem basketball, street basketball game at  
15 Rucker Park.

16 We did our fifth annual Week of  
17 Awareness. We were able to engage hundreds  
18 of New Yorkers throughout the City of  
19 New York regarding bias-based policing and  
20 racial profiling. In addition to that, we  
21 were able to do our Youth Advisory Council  
22 Fifth Annual Speak Up, Speak Out, an  
23 international conversation about police  
24 misconduct.

25 The different means of outreach that we



1 did in order to gauge those over 50,000  
2 New Yorkers were, one, the CCRB Barbershop  
3 and Salon Series, which we did in Queens,  
4 Brooklyn, and Staten Island. We did CCRB  
5 Block by Block, where we walked neighborhoods  
6 and canvassed neighborhoods with members of  
7 the public. We did a revolving initiative  
8 with Downtown Goddard, where we gauged those  
9 who were experiencing street homelessness.  
10 We also did CCRB Canvassing with Bronx SOS,  
11 Save Our Streets, and we did Occupy the  
12 Corner with our East Flatbush Village, where  
13 we gauged members of the East Flatbush  
14 community.

15 CCRB Cares is an initiative where the  
16 CCRB puts our sweat equity into communities  
17 to build trust and also provide information  
18 about our agency by volunteering with  
19 community members. As we do so, we provide  
20 information about our agency, build trust,  
21 and individuals know that we are there for  
22 them to provide resources that they need  
23 beyond the Agency's ability and capacity to  
24 accept complaints and investigate complaints.  
25 We volunteered with the New York City Parks

1 Department in the Borough of the Bronx and  
2 local food pantries citywide.

3 If you would like to request a CCRB  
4 presentation, feel free to reach out to  
5 our -- the CCRB's Outreach Unit at  
6 outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov. You could also feel  
7 free to connect with us on social media at  
8 Twitter, also known as X, and Instagram.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Thank you so  
11 much for that comprehensive report.

12 Do any of our board members have any  
13 questions of Mr. Rose?

14 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Going down that  
15 comprehensive list of events with NYCHA, was  
16 it 86 developments or 86 different events in  
17 some of the same developments?

18 MR. ROSE: It's 86 different events.  
19 Some of them did relapse, so they could have  
20 been tenant associations, it could have been  
21 community street fairs, but we engaged 86  
22 different times throughout the NYCHA  
23 developments in the City of New York.

24 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Thank you for  
25 clarifying.

1 MR. HOGAN: First of all, I'm from  
2 Queens and I appreciate what you did in  
3 Harlem at Rucker. All right?

4 (Laughter).

5 MR. HOGAN: So, Jahi, with budgets, how  
6 is that going to affect all that you did,  
7 this good work that we did during 2023? How  
8 are the budget cuts going to affect that, if  
9 at all?

10 MR. ROSE: So far, I think that might  
11 be a question better suited for the executive  
12 director. But on our end, we haven't made  
13 any changes to the way that we do outreach or  
14 the revolving programs that we've been doing  
15 so far.

16 MR. HOGAN: Okay. So, thank you.  
17 Jon?

18 CHAIR RICE: Jon.

19 MR. DARCHE: So, we had planned to add  
20 another outreach coordinator. That plan is  
21 on hold right now. There are going to be  
22 difficulties in printing more material, so a  
23 lot of the things that we distributed, we are  
24 not going to be able to distribute. And a  
25 lot of the work will depend on Jahi and his

1 team, and you know how committed the outreach  
2 folks are. So, I'm still hopeful we will be  
3 able to reach New Yorkers where they are, but  
4 also the money for public education through  
5 advertising, whether it was online or on TV,  
6 radio, or print, it's just not there, so we  
7 won't be doing that.

8 MR. SMITH: You would reach out through  
9 the community boards, 52 community boards in  
10 the City, the meeting once a month, these are  
11 the community leaders?

12 MR. ROSE: That's correct. So, yes,  
13 all of our coordinators attend at least one  
14 to two community board meetings annually.  
15 And then, we also connect with the community  
16 boards when they're ready to do public and  
17 community events. Some of those partners  
18 that are listed in the slide definitely are  
19 community board partners.

20 MR. SMITH: How did you make out with  
21 the Vladeck Houses? I have some -- you and I  
22 shared a contact there.

23 MR. ROSE: Yes. I didn't get a  
24 response. I didn't get a response yet.

25 MR. SMITH: Oh. You didn't get a

1 response?

2 MR. ROSE: No.

3 MR. SMITH: I had that problem, too.

4 (Laughter).

5 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Just one other  
6 question.

7 Out of these, what you call the  
8 unconventional events, if you had a bigger  
9 budget, are there any of those that you would  
10 repeat or want to expand, like the  
11 barbershop, beauty salon, or any of those you  
12 saw were most effective that you would like  
13 to expand in the upcoming year?

14 MR. ROSE: I believe the -- when it  
15 comes to like CCRB Courtside, I think what we  
16 would love to do is be able to at least  
17 invest something into the actual sports  
18 activity itself, to become a genuine partner.  
19 So, a lot of times they like what we do and  
20 they allow us a table, they allow us to be  
21 kind of a part of the event. But without a  
22 genuine tangible buy-in to be able to offer  
23 something to the program, we're still kind of  
24 a vendor sitting there sometimes, unless we  
25 have like baked in relationships with them.

1           So, I think a larger budget would allow us to  
2           do a little bit more of our CCRB Courtside  
3           initiative.

4                     And then, also, when it comes to  
5           giveaways, some of our giveaways are helpful  
6           for the Block by Blocks, especially when  
7           we're doing street canvassing for those  
8           experiencing homelessness.

9                     MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Thank you.

10                    MR. DARCHE: Jahi, your team hits every  
11           community board at least once during the  
12           year, though, correct?

13                    MR. ROSE: That's correct.

14                    MS. NORTHERN: So, then what's the plan  
15           for 2024?

16                    MR. ROSE: So, what we would like to do  
17           for 2024, while maintaining our numbers, is  
18           expand our outreach as much as possible, to  
19           be able to use some of the relationships that  
20           we built in 2023, some of those hard  
21           relationships where they really depend on us  
22           to be able to expand that, to be able to  
23           reach more New Yorkers. We've developed a  
24           very good relationship with programs like  
25           Transfer High Schools, who literally see us

1 as an avenue for their students whenever they  
2 have issues. We also have a very good  
3 relationship with Generation Citizen, so  
4 those we want to be able to use that, to be  
5 able to amplify their voices and be able to  
6 use that to gain more access to more  
7 programs, in addition to Pathways to  
8 Graduation, who also gave us an avenue to get  
9 access to those that were not necessarily  
10 abundant in English. So, some of our Week of  
11 Awareness was catering to those students that  
12 literally just arrived a couple of months  
13 ago, but want to get their education.

14 CHAIR RICE: Anything else from board  
15 members for Mr. Rose, including those who are  
16 online?

17 (No response).

18 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you again for  
19 the terrific presentation, and the work of  
20 your staff is greatly appreciated.

21 Okay. We're going to go into the  
22 public comment portion of the meeting. We  
23 will begin with those joining us virtually  
24 who would like to make a comment, followed by  
25 those who are joining us in person. For

1 those joining virtually, please use the  
2 raise-your-hand feature, and we please ask  
3 that you keep your comments to four minutes.

4 Yojaira, would you please call on the  
5 first person.

6 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair.

7 First, we'll be hearing from Ace  
8 Sutherland, followed by Jeffrey Omura.

9 MX. SUTHERLAND: My name is Ace  
10 Sutherland. My pronouns are they/them. I'm  
11 currently the Director of Community Organizing  
12 at Equality New York. I'm going to go a  
13 little bit slower just to be good with  
14 accessibility.

15 We are the largest advocacy  
16 organization rooted in queer and trans  
17 liberation, and we have been beginning our  
18 work to see how we can help change things  
19 from the state advocacy level. We're working  
20 specifically with Jeffrey Omura, who's a  
21 member of our advisory council, and Catherine  
22 Buccello, who's the owner of the Bodega  
23 Lounge newly open in Brooklyn as of October.

24 So, I just wanted to say thank you all  
25 for this opportunity. Thank you for the time



1 to allow us to even speak, and I'm really  
2 excited to see how we can continue to work  
3 together on the betterment of all New York  
4 City individuals from the state advocacy  
5 standpoint; that's all I have.

6 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Ace, for your  
7 comments. Appreciate them.

8 Yojaira, Mr. Omura is next?

9 MS. ALVAREZ: Correct.

10 Go ahead Jeffrey. You can unmute and  
11 have your camera on.

12 (No response).

13 MS. ALVAREZ: Jeffrey, there might be  
14 some technical difficulties. We'll circle  
15 back. We'll hear from Chris Dunn next, and  
16 we'll try Jeffrey one more time.

17 MR. DUNN: I'm unmuted.

18 Can you hear me now, Arva?

19 CHAIR RICE: I can hear you.

20 MR. DUNN: Great. Good afternoon to  
21 you and Jon and everybody else.

22 I wanted to raise a question about the  
23 monthly statistical report which you posted,  
24 which now has the year-end figures for 2023,  
25 and there are lots of things in there that

1 are concerning. But the perhaps most  
2 dramatic thing is the sharp increase in  
3 complaints in 2023. And it appears there,  
4 approximately, is a 65 percent increase in  
5 complaint for the two years of the Adams  
6 Administration. I know there's been a lot of  
7 discussion about the impact of the proposed  
8 budget cuts on the Agency, which, of course,  
9 take on greater import in the face of a  
10 rising level of complaints. But the thing I  
11 want to focus on is what this dramatic  
12 increase reflects about police misconduct.

13 And, Arva, I don't want to put anyone  
14 on the spot, but I would be very interested  
15 in hearing what the Board is thinking about  
16 this steep increase in complaints that are  
17 coming, and what that may mean about what has  
18 to happen in terms of what the Board is doing  
19 with the Police Department.

20 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Mr. Dunn, for  
21 that question. And we know that there's been  
22 a -- obviously, we just released a report  
23 about the increase in complaints. We have  
24 some theories on that, but those have not  
25 been fully -- you know, fully proven at this

1 point. So, I wanted to hear if any of the  
2 other members of the Board wanted to speak on  
3 that, or else I'll turn it over to Jon.

4 (No response).

5 CHAIR RICE: Okay.

6 MR. DARCHE: I just don't have a firm  
7 answer on why there's an increase. There has  
8 been an expansion in the CCRB's jurisdiction,  
9 so that could result in an increase in  
10 complaints. But there are other reasons that  
11 we just don't know, so it's something that our  
12 Policy Unit is digging into. What we do know  
13 is that the Agency needs help in resources to  
14 adequately investigate, mediate, and prosecute  
15 allegations of misconduct.

16 MR. DUNN: Well, Jon, I'd certainly be  
17 interested in seeing some analysis about the  
18 extent to which some of this is attributable  
19 to increases in the jurisdiction of the CCRB,  
20 and I am not somebody who tends to assign  
21 much weight to year-to-year changes in  
22 complaint numbers because after all,  
23 complaints are just complaints. But these  
24 increases are so dramatic that something is  
25 going on, and I think the obvious suggestion

1 something is going on in the street that is  
2 different than what we have seen recently,  
3 for board members who may not have looked  
4 very closely at these numbers, this marks a  
5 ten-year high. Since 2012, there has been a  
6 steady decline in complaints with some small  
7 fluctuations. Last year -- 2022, there was  
8 an uptick to be sure, but last year, the  
9 complaints really exploded. I think it is  
10 something like over a 50 percent increase in  
11 complaints from 2022 to 2023, and that's not  
12 a change that we have seen in a very long  
13 time.

14 So, Jon, I appreciate that the policy  
15 unit is looking at this. I think that's  
16 right, but I think the Board has got to start  
17 confronting this quite quickly because,  
18 again, these numbers are so significant that  
19 it feels to me like there's got to be some  
20 conversation with the Department. I mean, we  
21 know the Department is being more aggressive  
22 in terms of its tactics, and that is fine.  
23 The issue here is not they're being -- or  
24 energetic about enforcing the law, the  
25 concern, of course, is what they are doing is

1 being very aggressive in terms of flouting  
2 the law and abusing people and misusing their  
3 authority. And at the risk of repeating  
4 myself, these increases are so dramatic that  
5 something real is going on, and I really hope  
6 the Board is going to spend some serious time  
7 trying to get to the bottom of that and  
8 talking to the Department. The Police  
9 Department reps who are on the Board, you  
10 folks are the ones who are most connected to  
11 the Department. Something needs to be  
12 happening here.

13 Thank you, Arva.

14 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much,  
15 Mr. Dunn. And as Jon mentioned, we are going  
16 to do that analysis because it's an increase  
17 in complaints, but we also need to know where  
18 the increases are coming from and in what  
19 category. So, we'll take a deeper dive and  
20 we'll definitely talk more about that in the  
21 future.

22 Next, was there anyone else who was  
23 holding? Did Mr. Omura -- is he able to join  
24 us?

25 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes. We'll try Jeffrey

1 one more time, followed by Michael Meyers.

2 MR. OMURA: This is Jeffrey Omura.  
3 Sorry about the technical difficulties. I'm  
4 a volunteer advisory member of Equality  
5 New York, and we're looking at ways to  
6 empower the CCRB because we're big fans of  
7 what you all do. And we're looking forward  
8 to getting to know you all and hopefully make  
9 your job easier and build a better and safer  
10 New York for all of us.

11 Thank you all so much.

12 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. Thank  
13 you for your comments.

14 Yojaira, is Mr. Meyers on the line?

15 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes.

16 Mr. Meyers, can you hear us?

17 (No response).

18 MS. ALVAREZ: There may be some  
19 technical issues with Michael Meyers. We'll  
20 circle back.

21 Next, we'll be hearing from Susan  
22 Hadley.

23 CHAIR RICE: Take yourself off mute.

24 MS. HADLEY: Can you hear me?

25 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes, we can hear you now,

1 Susan.

2 MS. HADLEY: Oh. You can hear me now.  
3 I'm sorry. I was speaking the whole time.

4 Hi. I'm a Vocal New York Civil Rights  
5 Union Leader.

6 I wanted to know, what do you think  
7 about the "How Many Stops Act," do you think  
8 that would make your life easier?

9 MR. DARCHE: So, one of the main tools  
10 the CCRB has is paperwork that we use to  
11 identify officers who are involved in  
12 encounters, but we haven't, as an agency,  
13 dealt with the issue of whether or not  
14 that -- how that legislation would impact the  
15 CCRB. But generally speaking, if the law is  
16 enacted, we would use the paperwork that it  
17 provided because any clues we can have to the  
18 identity of members of service in certain  
19 investigations will be helpful.

20 MS. HADLEY: Okay. Thank you for that.

21 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Susan.

22 We'll try Michael Meyers one more time.

23 CHAIR RICE: Hello. We can hear you,  
24 Mr. Meyers.

25 MR. MEYERS: Oh, good. Okay. Finally.

1 I'm Michael Meyers. I'm the president  
2 of the New York Civil Rights Coalition.  
3 First of all, I don't understand why we still  
4 don't have a quorum present, people in  
5 attendance at this meeting, to even adopt the  
6 minutes from the last meeting. If people  
7 cannot come to meetings, I urge them, we urge  
8 them, get off the Board. If you can't come  
9 to meetings and do your job, get off the  
10 Board. There are people waiting to replace  
11 you.

12 Secondly, I want to know from the  
13 Chair, are you still Interim Chair? Have you  
14 been appointed yet by the City Council and  
15 the so-called Mayor? I want an answer to  
16 that question. I don't know why we're taking  
17 so long. Thirdly, we've been -- "we,"  
18 meaning you. I shouldn't say we. You,  
19 meaning the CCRB, has been in the process of  
20 getting the Police Commissioner, the current  
21 one now -- I don't know how long he's going  
22 to be that, but he's the current one -- to a  
23 meeting of the CCRB.

24 Has he been invited to come to a public  
25 meeting of the CCRB, so the public can look



1 at him, listen to him, and so that he can  
2 hear us; has that been done yet?

3 Finally, I don't understand why we  
4 cannot have a CCRB that has a quorum and has  
5 members who are interested in following up on  
6 agendas and following up on the procedures  
7 that we have agreed to. I don't understand  
8 it. I get silence, crickets, from the board  
9 members. I don't understand why you people  
10 are there. You are not representing the  
11 public, you're just not. You're doing a  
12 pitiful job. I want to emphasize that. All  
13 of you, especially the public members,  
14 especially the people who represent the City  
15 Council, who represent the citizens of  
16 New York, and I'm furious about it.

17 So, I want to have some comment about  
18 whether or not you are there to do your jobs,  
19 to hold the police accountable, and all these  
20 meetings and publicity and public relations  
21 efforts are just that. I appreciate  
22 Mr. Rose's report, but when it comes down the  
23 bottom line, it's all PR, public relations.  
24 I want to have action. I want to see CCRB  
25 taking action. And if you don't have enough

1 money to investigate complaints, then maybe,  
2 maybe you ought to all as a board say, "We  
3 don't have enough money to do the job. We  
4 have to resign," and have the Mayor be  
5 accountable, have the Police Commissioner be  
6 accountable to the CCRB.

7 I am so sick of this cowardliness, this  
8 pusillanimous actions or miss -- no action on  
9 the part of the CCRB. I got a lot more to  
10 say, but I don't want to hold up the meeting  
11 any longer than I have to because I have a  
12 lot more to say, and I don't have the time to  
13 say it.

14 MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, I just want  
15 to point out to the people here and online  
16 that these board members considered 2,500  
17 full investigations this year. That's not  
18 just showing up to a board meeting once a  
19 month. They give huge amounts of their time  
20 to review extremely serious complicated  
21 complaints that oftentimes have large numbers  
22 of allegations and large amounts of evidence  
23 that they have to review. And so, the idea  
24 that they're not hardworking is untrue and  
25 unfair. And I understand they might not want

1 to say it, but if you look at our monthly  
2 report for January, in 2023, there were 2,581  
3 full investigations that this Board closed.  
4 And some of them are short investigations and  
5 some of them are long, complicated  
6 investigations. It is a huge amount of work,  
7 and I'm proud to work for them.

8 CHAIR RICE: I do really truly  
9 appreciate that. In regards to the quorum,  
10 we most times do have quorum. We have a  
11 couple of board members who are joining us  
12 online today, and we have a few who are out  
13 of town, but normally we do have quorum. I  
14 am still your interim chair. At any point  
15 that that changes, I will most certainly let  
16 you all know. We have not requested a  
17 meeting with the NY Police Commissioner at  
18 this point. And I believe that that  
19 concludes all the questions from Mr. Meyers  
20 today.

21 Yojaira, do you have any other people  
22 online who have questions?

23 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes. Next, we'll be  
24 hearing from Shawn.

25 MR. SHAWN: Can you hear me?

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes.

2 MR. SHAWN: Okay. I have a question  
3 about the integrity of the Board. Here's the  
4 situation, and I'm not asking you guys to  
5 comment on these complaints. But there were  
6 two CCRB complaints -- well, I made several,  
7 but there were two CCRB complaints in  
8 particular that I want you guys to address.  
9 One was a decade ago and one was recently in  
10 2022, and you just gave me your findings  
11 about a week ago. And here's the situation:

12 In both situations, I was in the subway  
13 system recording police activity. In both  
14 situations, I was contacted by police for my  
15 recording and kicked out of the subway  
16 station, and in both cases force was used.  
17 Here's the difference in those two cases from  
18 recently and a decade ago. The one a decade  
19 ago made the major media. It made the news.  
20 It was considered high-profile by CCRB. And  
21 the findings in that case, they found the  
22 officer -- they substantiated the complaint  
23 against the officer for the use of force and  
24 everything, and surprisingly -- I have it in  
25 here from discovery because I sued -- that

1 CCRB even cited case law to say what the  
2 police did was wrong in approaching me for  
3 taking pictures in the subway system and  
4 kicking me out.

5 Now, contrast that to today, what you  
6 find in this case was that the facts are the  
7 same, virtually the same in both cases. In  
8 the first case, it involved one cop. In this  
9 case, it involved five cops. But in this  
10 case, you found that the use of force and  
11 everything was within NYPD guidelines and  
12 that -- and even in this case, an officer  
13 said to me, "Get the fuck out." You found  
14 that -- for the language, you found that that  
15 was in, within NYPD guidelines.

16 My question is, I'm trying to figure  
17 out what guidelines are you citing that this  
18 was within, so that I can begin the Monell  
19 claim, which I thank you for. And is  
20 discrepancy the difference between a decade  
21 ago and now? Is that an integrity issue with  
22 CCRB or competence issue with CCRB, that  
23 you're less competent today than you were  
24 yesterday, or you have less integrity today  
25 than you did yesterday? Or maybe was it that

1 the case from a decade ago, because it was  
2 high-profile, you actually did your job? I  
3 just want answers on that.

4 CHAIR RICE: I'm going to ask Jon to  
5 take that. There's some other options,  
6 though, in that there could be differences  
7 between the cases or differences in between  
8 the guidelines, but I'm going to go ahead and  
9 have our executive director respond.

10 MR. DARCHE: Shawn, thank you for  
11 participating. I think if you reach out to  
12 me or share your information with the folks  
13 online, I will have our FOIL people get you  
14 all the materials from the current  
15 investigation, so you can see why the Board  
16 made the determination it did. But these are  
17 very fact-specific investigations, and so if  
18 a few details are different from the  
19 incident, the recent incident and the  
20 incident from ten years ago, you could have  
21 very different results in the investigations.

22 And Madam Chair, earlier we heard from  
23 Ace and Jeffrey who are members of an  
24 organization that I had not really dealt with  
25 before, Jeffrey and Ace, from the Equality

1 New York. And so, I just wanted to thank  
2 them for joining and let them know that Jahi  
3 and I will be reaching out to meet with them  
4 and figure out how we can partner with them  
5 in the future.

6 CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, is there anyone  
7 else online with comments?

8 MS. ALVAREZ: No, that concludes the  
9 virtual portion, Chair.

10 CHAIR RICE: Okay. So, if there's  
11 anyone in the room who would like to make a  
12 comment, for those joining us in person and  
13 are interested in making a public comment, if  
14 you can line up behind the podium, we're also  
15 going to ask you to limit your comments to  
16 four minutes.

17 Anyone in the room who would like to  
18 make a comment this evening?

19 (No response).

20 CHAIR RICE: Okay. We will then move  
21 to old business.

22 Do we have any old business to come  
23 before the Board? Any old business?

24 (No response).

25 CHAIR RICE: Do we have any new

1 business to come before the Board?

2 (No response).

3 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing none, I'm  
4 going to move now that we break into  
5 Executive Session. The agenda for Executive  
6 Session is the executive director will  
7 discuss pending personnel actions, and the  
8 general counsel will update the Board on  
9 pending litigation. I would like to make a  
10 motion to conclude the January Board Meeting.

11 All those in favor?

12 (Chorus of ayes).

13 CHAIR RICE: All right. The meeting is  
14 concluded. Thank you so much.

15 (TIME ADJOURNED: 4:53 p.m.)  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a shorthand reporter within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify that the within is a true and accurate transcript of the statement taken on January 10, 2024.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or by marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 15th day of January, 2024.

*Sabrina Brown Stewart*  
Sabrina Brown Stewart